

1 **High throughput amplicon sequencing to assess within- and between-host**
2 **genetic diversity in plant viruses**

3

4 Sylvain Piry^{1,2}, Catherine Wipf-Scheibel², Jean-François Martin³, Maxime Galan¹, and Karine
5 Berthier²

6

7 ¹ INRA, UMR CBGP, F-34988 Montferrier-sur-Lez, France

8 ² Pathologie Végétale, INRA, 84140 Montfavet, France

9 ³ Montpellier SupAgro, UMR CBGP, F-34988 Montferrier-sur-Lez, France

10 Corresponding author: Sylvain Piry, UMR CBGP, INRA, 34988, Montferrier-sur-Lez, France.

11 sylvain.piry@inra.fr

12

13 **Abstract** (163 words)

14 Molecular epidemiology approaches at the landscape scale require to study the genetic
15 diversity of viral populations from numerous hosts and to characterize mixed infections. In
16 such a context, high-throughput amplicon sequencing (HTAS) techniques create interesting
17 opportunities as they allow identifying distinct variants within a same host while
18 simultaneously genotyping a high number of samples. Validating variants produced by HTAS
19 may, however, remain difficult due to biases occurring at different steps of the data-
20 generating process (e.g. environmental contaminations and sequencing error). Here, we
21 focused on *Endive necrotic mosaic virus* (ENMV), a member of family *Potyviridae*, genus
22 *Potyvirus* to develop an HTAS approach and to characterize the genetic diversity at the intra-
23 and inter-host levels from 430 samples collected over an area of 1660 km² located in south-
24 eastern France. We demonstrated how it is possible, by incorporating various controls in the
25 experimental design and by performing independent sample replicates, to estimate potential
26 biases in HTAS results and to implement an automated and robust variant calling procedure.

27

28 **Keywords (3-6)**

29 High-throughput amplicon sequencing, plant virus, automated variant validation, genetic
30 diversity, mixed infections

31 **Highlights**

- 32
- 33 • High-throughput amplicon sequencing to assess plant virus genetic diversity
 - 34 • Estimating bias in high throughput amplicon sequencing results
 - 35 • Automated variant calling procedure for robust high throughput amplicon sequencing

35

36 **1. Introduction**

37 Understanding the emergence and spread of plant viral epidemics at the landscape scale is
38 crucial to develop sustainable control strategies. This goal has been facilitated during the
39 last decade by the development of molecular epidemiology approaches, which use virus
40 genetic data to identify host and vector species, characterize dispersal patterns and
41 determine transmission pathways (Picard et al. 2017). However, molecular epidemiology
42 studies at the landscape scale have raised some challenges. First, it generally requires
43 studying genetic diversity of viral populations from a high number of hosts in order to assess
44 virus population dynamics (e.g. variation in population size, dispersal) at large scale.
45 Second, genetic variation of viral populations has to be analyzed not only between hosts but
46 also within hosts. Indeed, wild and cultivated plants are often infected by multiple strains or
47 species of viruses. Within-host interactions between viral entities may have consequences in
48 epidemiology as well as in terms of pathogenicity and virulence evolution (Zhang et al. 2001;
49 Syller 2012; Alizon 2012; Alizon et al. 2013).

50 Mixed infections strongly limit the use of classical molecular techniques such as
51 direct Sanger sequencing of amplicons that provides unreadable sequences when several
52 viral variants infect a single host (i.e. presence of multiple peaks in sequence
53 chromatograms). To overcome this problem, mixed infected samples can be processed
54 using clone-based sequencing of the amplicons. However, it can become a very labor-
55 intensive and costly approach for landscape-scale studies that require a high number of
56 samples. As a result, it potentially biases the discovered diversity towards the most common
57 variants. High-throughput sequencing (HTS) methods are viable alternatives as they provide
58 a direct access to single molecule genetic resolution. However, although viruses have
59 relatively small genomes, a whole genome sequencing of all samples remains a costly
60 solution. In this context, high-throughput amplicon sequencing (HTAS) is an interesting
61 compromise as it allows identifying distinct viral genetic variants within a same host while
62 genotyping a high number of samples through *ad hoc* multiplexing techniques (Galan et al.

63 2010, 2012, 2016, Studholme et al. 2011; Kreisinger et al. 2017). Moreover, HTAS highly
64 reduces the bioinformatics analysis step as there is no assembly step and sequence data
65 can be easily processed with dedicated software such as |SE|S|AM|E| BARCODE (Megléc
66 et al. 2011; Piry et al. 2012).

67 To explore the potential of HTAS approaches for characterizing the genetic diversity
68 of plant virus populations at the intra- and inter-host levels over large spatial scales, we
69 focused on *Endive necrotic mosaic virus* (ENMV). There is a potential agronomic interest in
70 this virus as one of its strains, recently characterized in southern France (Desbiez et al.
71 2016), can cause severe symptoms on lettuce cultivars lacking the *Tu* gene that confers
72 resistance to *Turnip mosaic virus*. Previous work showed that this virus is an ideal candidate
73 for developing this methodology in a landscape epidemiology framework. First, a previous
74 sampling of 5,284 wild plants and weeds revealed that ENMV host range is probably quite
75 restricted with only 189 infected samples. Among those samples, 185 were Meadow Salsafy,
76 *Tragopogon pratensis* L. (see supplementary Table 1 in Desbiez et al. 2016). The
77 prevalence of the virus was high in *T. pratensis* (40%) as was the genetic diversity. Second,
78 the plants were often simultaneously infected by multiple variants as revealed by the
79 presence of multiple peaks in Sanger sequence chromatograms. In this work, we analyze
80 ENMV genetic diversity, including frequency of mixed infections from a large sampling of
81 Meadow Salsafy and emphasize the need for incorporating various controls at the different
82 steps of the data-generating process and for processing independent sample replicates in
83 order to estimate potential bias in HTAS results and define a robust variant calling
84 procedure.

85 **2. Materials and methods**

86 **2.1. Plant sampling and virus detection**

87 In 2015, 1,244 *T. pratensis* were sampled at the landscape scale over an area of 1660 km²
88 located in southeastern France near the city of Avignon (43.84°N, 4.87°E). One flower bud

89 was sampled from each plant using disposable gloves and directly stored in an individual
90 plastic bag with a built-in filter to avoid contamination between samples in the field as well as
91 during plant material grinding in the lab. A fraction of 350 μ L of plant extract was collected
92 for virus immuno-detection (150 μ l) and RNA extraction (200 μ l). Virus particles were detected
93 by double-antibody sandwich enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (DAS-ELISA) with an
94 ENMV-specific polyclonal antiserum (Desbiez et al. 2016). Virus detection was considered
95 as positive when absorbance measured at 405 nm (A_{405}) was at least twice that of healthy
96 controls (i.e. non-infected plants). A total of 430 plants were classified as positive to ENMV
97 and further analyzed.

98 **2.2. RNA extraction, cDNA synthesis and PCR assays**

99 Total RNA of infected plants was extracted using Tri-Reagent (Molecular Research Center,
100 Cincinnati, OH, USA) according to the manufacturer's recommendations. Extractions were
101 performed in series that included negative controls (i.e. healthy plants). Final RNA extracts
102 were suspended in 20 μ L of RNase-free water and a fraction was transferred into 96-well
103 plates. A robot pipetting device, dedicated to non-amplified nucleic acids, was used to
104 produce three replicates for each of the five sample plates. As recommended by Galan et al.
105 (2016), the 15 plates (five sample plates x three replicates) had specific designs in order to
106 integrate different types of negative controls for the different steps: two extraction controls
107 (i.e. healthy plants), one reverse transcription (RT) control (i.e. no RNA), one polymerase
108 chain reaction (PCR) control (i.e. no cDNA) and two empty controls, which were empty wells
109 (no RNA, no cDNA, no primers, no RT or PCR mix). For each plate, we also added an
110 "alien" positive control in two different wells. This "alien" was an artificial sequence
111 constructed from the RNA of an already characterized ENMV isolate (#7098 in Desbiez et al.
112 2016). It was constructed by using long forward and reverse primer sequences including
113 respectively the specific-ENMV forward and reverse primer sequence, a repeated motif of 10
114 bases to make it unique compared to sampled variants, and an internal forward or reverse

115 primer sequence (see Figures S1 and S2 of the Supplementary Material for details on the
116 construction of the alien variant, plate design and primer sequences).

117 Independent RTs were performed for each of the 15 plates to generate cDNA using
118 the ENMV-specific reverse primer. The robot pipetting device was used to transfer a fraction
119 of the produced cDNAs into new 96-well plates containing PCR mix and well-specific
120 combinations of forward and reverse tagged-primers in order to amplify a 439 bp target of
121 the ENMV coat protein (CP) coding region.

122 The presence of amplicons was systematically checked by agarose gel
123 electrophoresis using 3 μ l of amplified DNA, which was manipulated using a robot pipetting
124 device dedicated to amplified products. Each amplicon was normalized to 1.2ng. μ L⁻¹ using
125 the SequaPrep™ Normalization Plate Kit. Manufacturer specifications were followed with at
126 least 250ng amplicon per well (5 μ L) and a final elution volume of 20 μ L. The normalized
127 amplicons (25ng) were then pooled together at the PCR-plate level (i.e. 96 amplicons
128 including controls). All laboratory manipulations were conducted within dedicated rooms (e.g.
129 DNA-free room, pre- and post-PCR rooms) while wearing disposable gloves and using filter
130 tips, sterile hoods and virus-free consumables

131 **2.3. Illumina library preparation and sequencing**

132 The normalized amplicon pools were then used to construct Illumina libraries using the
133 Truseq nano DNA library prep kit (Illumina). The end-repair of amplicons pools (50 μ L of DNA
134 at 1.2ng. μ L⁻¹) and A-tailing steps were realized following manufacturer recommendations.
135 The ligation of Illumina adapters was done for each pool with a distinct indexed-adapter to
136 further filter sequencing reads by pool. The enrichment of adapter-ligated libraries was done
137 through 12 PCR cycles before a last Ampure® purification step (ratio beads/DNA volumes
138 equal to 0.8 to remove short fragments such as adapter dimers).

139 Each library profile was checked on an Agilent 2100 Bioanalyzer run using a DNA-
140 1000 chip to ensure for specific adapter ligation and enrichment. The libraries were

141 subsequently quantified using the Kapa library quantification kit (Kapa Biosystems),
142 normalized to 4nM and then all pooled together but one replicate for which we added 10
143 times the quantity of other libraries to assess the impact of fold-coverage on diversity
144 characterization. This library will be hereafter named the “10X library”. For MiSeq
145 sequencing, we distributed 12pM of the pooled libraries with 5% phiX on a paired-end run of
146 2*301 cycles.

147 **2.4. Sequence filtering**

148 Paired-end reads with at least 50 bp of overlap were merged with FLASH (Magoc & Salzberg
149 2011). The merged fastq reads were filtered based on quality and removed from the
150 analyses when any position displayed a quality score less than 30. The merged reads were
151 then converted and concatenated to multifasta files (one file for each library). Fasta files were
152 analyzed using |SE|S|AM|E| Barcode (Piry et al. 2012) in order to: i) sort out non-target
153 sequences based on the detection of tagged-primer sequences, ii) demultiplex and assign
154 sequences to samples using a length range constraint of 430-442 bases to allow for a
155 reasonable amount of length polymorphism of the targeted CP marker (expected length =
156 439 bp) and, iii) filter out singletons (i.e. sequences found only once in a single library) as
157 they are technical artifacts that artificially decrease the proportions of “true” variants.

158 **2.5. Sources of error**

159 Various sources of error may bias HTAS results and complicate the validation procedure of
160 variants (reviewed in Galan et al. 2016). Biases in HTAS experiments can be estimated by
161 including different negative and positive controls in plate design. In this work, we used post-
162 filtering data from the extraction, RT and PCR negative controls as well as from the “alien”
163 positive controls to estimate potential bias in ENMV HTAS results due to major sources of
164 error: i) contamination of extraction, RT or PCR reagents and to some extent cross-
165 contamination among samples when preparing the microplates, ii) error rate per base
166 resulting from the RT, PCR and sequencing processes combined altogether and, 3) incorrect

167 assignment, which refers to assignment of sequences to samples that can result from
168 switches among amplicons due to synthesis error in tags, cross-contaminations among
169 tagged-primers, sequencing errors of tags and production of mixed clusters during the
170 sequencing of multiplexed samples (Carlsen et al. 2012, Kircher et al. 2012, Esling et al.
171 2015, Galan et al. 2016).

172 Contamination becomes a real problem when the number of sequences representing
173 the contaminating variants reaches the threshold retained to validate a sequence as a true
174 variant in a sample. As long as contamination remains low, this threshold can be adapted in
175 order to reject the variants that cannot be distinguished from contaminations with
176 confidence. In this work, we estimated the level of contamination for each library by
177 considering the number of sequences of the most represented variant identified in the
178 extraction (healthy plants), RT and PCR negative controls, i.e. where, theoretically, no
179 sequence was expected. For cross-contamination among samples, as they can occur
180 randomly during the preparation of 96-well microplates, negative controls may not be
181 contaminated while real samples may be. In this case, comparing results between sample
182 replicates that have been processed independently is the safest way to distinguish true
183 variants from cross-contaminations.

184 Estimating how errors during the RT, PCR and sequencing processes can impact
185 HTAS results requires including in the plate design at least one well-known positive sample
186 for which i) only one sequence is expected (no mixed infection) and, ii) the expected
187 sequence cannot be cofounded with the samples being analyzed in order to easily discard
188 sequences resulting from cross-contamination in the computation of the error rate. In this
189 work, we used the “alien” positive control, which was constructed by PCR and included two
190 different artificial motifs, one at each end of the targeted marker. We first extracted all
191 sequences including the two primers and the two artificial motifs from all libraries. We
192 considered the 419 pb core region strictly included between the two artificial motifs to
193 determine the number of mismatches between the retrieved sequences and the expected

194 “alien” sequence using the Levenshtein distance (minimum number of changes required to
195 transform one sequence into another; Levenshtein 1966). The overall error rate was
196 calculated by summing the number of mismatches in all alignments and dividing the result by
197 the total length of the alignments (May et al. 2015).

198 Incorrect assignment events have the same consequences as cross-contaminations
199 as they can result in validating variants originating from other samples. To estimate the level
200 of incorrect assignment in the experiment, we first considered the number of sequences of
201 the most represented variant identified into the empty-well controls. As there were no
202 tagged-primers in these wells, any sequence found into these controls can only be the result
203 of an incorrect assignment. Second, we computed the number of sequences of the “alien”
204 positive control that were assigned to ENMV samples or other controls.

205 **2.6. Variant calling procedure**

206 Estimating HTAS biases due to contamination, error rate and incorrect assignments allows
207 determining whether sequence data are interpretable and, when combined with results from
208 independent replicates, to set thresholds for variant validation. Using this strategy, we
209 implemented an automated variant calling procedure based on three nested rules: 1) a
210 variant must be found in the three replicates regardless of its frequency, 2) the absolute
211 number of sequences of the variant must be greater or equal to five in at least two replicates
212 and, 3) in these two replicates, the contribution of this variant to the cumulative frequency
213 distribution, computed from all variants found in the sample, must be strictly greater than 5%.
214 To compute the cumulative frequency distribution, all variants identified in a sample were
215 ranked in decreasing order according to their number of sequences. The most abundant
216 variant was ranked 1 and constituted the first value of the cumulative distribution.
217 Subsequent variants were added up successively in decreasing abundance order. The
218 cumulative frequency rule complement the second one based on the absolute number of
219 sequences as it allows accounting for variability in sequencing depth between replicates

220 (when a given variant can be represented by a lower number of sequences while it still is the
221 predominant variant). The variant calling procedure was performed using *ad hoc* SQL
222 queries over the |SE|S|AM|E| Barcode database and the statistical software R v3.32 (R Core
223 Team 2015). Results of the implemented procedure for variant calling were visually checked
224 in |SE|S|AM|E| Barcode.

225 **3. Results**

226 Agarose gel electrophoresis confirmed that amplicons were obtained from all of the 430
227 samples identified as positive to ENMV by DAS-ELISA tests as well as for the “alien” positive
228 control. No amplicon was detectable on agarose gel from negative controls (extraction, RT,
229 PCR and empty-well controls). When excluding the library 7A which had a higher coverage
230 by design (10X library), the number of reads generated per library varied from 460,876 to
231 916,395 (mean=642,242; Table 1A) and 71% to 91% (mean=85%) of these reads provided
232 unambiguous merged sequences. Those sequences were kept for further analyses
233 (between 387,730 and 655,100 per library). For the 10X library 7A (88 samples), 5,312,229
234 reads were generated and 84% provided unambiguous merged sequences.

235 **3.1. Sequences filtering**

236 Samples were demultiplexed using the exact tag/primer sequence combinations as
237 identifiers. The observed range of sequence length was larger than expected (i.e. 439 bp)
238 due to aspecific co-amplifications (mainly plant ribosomal sequences). These sequences
239 were easily discarded from further analyses by filtering on sequence length considering a
240 range of 430-442 bp. Finally, singletons were also removed from the analyses. Although
241 these filtering rules drastically reduced the number of sequences retained for each library
242 (between 2.5% and 5.1%; Table 1A), they also increased the signal/noise ratio. When
243 excluding, the 10X library 7A, the mean number of sequences assigned to samples was
244 226.53 ± 44.17 (Table 1B). As expected, the mean number of sequences assigned to the

245 samples for the library 7A was ~10 folds greater (2,333.83 sequences) than for the two other
246 replicates (7B and 7C: 251.83 and 213.65 sequences, respectively).

247 **3.2. Sources of error**

248 *3.2.1 Contamination*

249 When characterizing the contaminants in negative controls, and excluding the 10X library
250 7A, we detected 6.43 variants on average (the most frequent one being represented by 1.43
251 sequences on average) for any extraction control. Those results were similar for other
252 controls with 6.85 variants (1.69 sequences for the most frequent one) for RT controls and
253 6.64 variants (1.71 sequences) for PCR controls (Table 2). The number of sequences for the
254 most abundant variants in negative controls of the 10X library 7A was still low with a
255 maximum of eight sequences in one replicate of a healthy plant control. Even when the
256 library 7A was considered, there was no case where a same variant was represented by five
257 or more sequences in two of the three replicates (rule 2 of the variant calling procedure).

258 *3.2.2. RT, PCR and sequencing error*

259 Overall, among the libraries, 15,925 sequences were identified as “alien” sequences based
260 on the presence of the exact sequence of primers and artificial motifs sequences. Most of
261 the mismatching sequences exhibited a few (1 to 3) nucleotide substitutions (Figure S3 of
262 the supplementary material). The error rate per base computed from mismatching
263 sequences was of 0.0011. For information purposes, when singletons were included in the
264 computation (dataset of 33,201 sequences), this estimate reached 0.0036, which is still in
265 agreement with the expectations from the literature on the Illumina sequencing technology,
266 e.g. 0.0021 from Shirmer et al. (2016).

267 Across the three replicates of the sample plates, the “alien” controls (two wells per
268 plate) displayed between 143 and 565 mutated variants (Table 3). None of these variants
269 complied with the three rules of the variant calling procedure. As expected, the mutated

270 variants of the “alien” sequence were almost 10 fold more represented in terms of number of
271 sequences in the 10X library 7A (Table 3). In all cases, only the original true variant was
272 validated by the automated procedure.

273 *3.2.3. Incorrect assignment*

274 When estimating incorrect assignment in empty-well controls, and excluding the 10X library
275 7A, we detected 6.57 variants on average with the most frequent variant being represented
276 by 1.32 sequences on average (Table 2). The number of sequences of the most represented
277 variants identified in the empty-wells controls of the 10X library 7A was still low with a
278 maximum of five sequences. Even when considering the 10X library 7A, there was no case
279 where the maximum number of sequences for a given variant was ≥ 5 in two of the three
280 replicates (rule 2 of the variant calling procedure).

281 Overall, the number of alien sequences incorrectly assigned to ENMV samples or
282 other controls in the libraries varied between five and 62 (in the 10X library), which
283 represented on average 2.15% of the alien sequences. Figure 1 shows, for each of the 15
284 plates, the number of alien sequences assigned to ENMV samples or other controls. There
285 was only one case (sample plates 7), for which the alien variant was found in the three
286 replicates of the same ENMV sample (well F4) and with a number of sequences ≥ 5 in two of
287 the three replicates: the 10X library 7A with 13 sequences and the library 7C with six
288 sequences. This matched the required rules 1 and 2 of the variant calling procedure. This
289 variant however was rejected by the third rule based on the variant cumulative frequency
290 distribution.

291 **3.3. Genetic diversity of ENMV**

292 Based on our automated variant calling procedure, we identified 754 variants from the 430
293 positive samples. When visually checking the results, we further validated two additional
294 variants in two different samples, which summed up to a total of 756 distinct variants. These
295 two cases corresponded to the absence of sequences in one of the three replicates that can

296 be due to manipulation errors. Sequences of the 756 validated variants were exported from
297 |SE|S|AM|E| Barcode as a fasta file for further analyses.

298 Overall, there were 217 polymorphic sites, out of 439, in the CP marker and the average
299 pairwise nucleotide diversity (Nei 1987) reached 0.061. Although not significant
300 ($p.value=0.813$), the Tajima's D statistic was negative (-0.31), which is consistent with the
301 presence of numerous rare variants. Up to 50% of the plants showed mixed infections, with
302 a maximum of six distinct variants identified within the same plant (mean = 2.68; Figure 2A).
303 We observed up to 44 substitutions between the variants infecting a same plant. The
304 distribution of the number of substitutions in these variants was clearly bimodal (Figure 2B).
305 The first mode corresponded to 49 variant pairs differing by only one substitution. Those are
306 unlikely artifacts because of the filtering procedure and independent replicates used. The
307 second mode of the distribution corresponded to 28 base changes between variants.
308 Moreover, out of the 571 pairs analyzed, 475 differed by at least 10 substitutions.

309 **4. Discussion**

310 In this work, we described a high-throughput amplicon sequencing approach allowing the
311 identification of genetic variants of a plant virus at both intra- and inter-host levels while
312 simultaneously genotyping 430 samples. As recommended by Galan et al. (2016), we
313 included various negative controls for the different steps of the data acquisition process:
314 RNA extracts from healthy plants, RT controls, PCR controls and empty-well controls. We
315 also included an "alien" positive control and conducted three independent replicates for the
316 RT, PCR and library construction for all samples. Controls and replicates proved highly
317 valuable to ensure data quality as they provided information to estimate potential bias in
318 HTAS results traceable to contamination, incorrect assignment events and RT-PCR-
319 sequencing errors. From these estimates, we were able to implement an automated calling
320 procedure to validate ENMV variants.

321 We based our variant calling procedure on three hierarchical rules. To meet the first one, a
322 variant must be present in the three replicates regardless of its frequency. As replicates are
323 processed independently, this rule is especially important to ensure that a variant identified
324 in a sample is not the outcome of a cross-contamination. When a variant is found in two of
325 the three replicates, results should be visually checked in order to make sure that its
326 absence in the third replicate is not caused by a manipulation error (i.e. no sequence
327 detected in the sample). The second rule implies that a variant must be represented by at
328 least 5 sequences in at least two of the three replicates. This abundance threshold was
329 based on our control-based estimates for contamination, RT-PCR-sequencing errors and
330 incorrect assignments. As such, it is specific to each particular experiment and would require
331 *ad hoc* assessment. Except for one case in the 10X library 7A, the abundance of the
332 unexpected variants found in controls never reached five sequences. In this study, setting
333 the abundance threshold (rule 2) to five sequences allowed to eliminate erroneous variants
334 without discarding true low-frequency variants. Finally, the third rule based on the cumulative
335 frequency was a conservative way to account for possible variability in sequencing depth
336 between replicates and, especially, situations where variants are represented by a low
337 number of sequences while they still are the predominant ones.

338 As stated above, these rules for variant validation were quite conservative and in
339 situations of mixed infection they can exclude biological variants that are under-represented
340 in a plant compared to the most frequent one(s). Considering the high level of genetic
341 diversity observed in the ENMV species and the purpose of the data, which aim at
342 deciphering the genetic structure of populations at the landscape scale, getting a low
343 percentage of false negatives was a better option than adding noise in the dataset. For other
344 studies that would be more interested in characterizing very precisely within-host genetic
345 diversity, increasing the sequencing depth per sample is likely to help in detecting more
346 variants. However, as already advocated for HTAS in general (Salter et al. 2014, Esling et al.

347 2015, Sengupta & Dick 2016, Galan et al. 2016), controls and replicates would keep primary
348 importance to adapt the rules used for validating variants as biological ones.

349 The HTAS approach developed in this work allowed us to unravel a high level of
350 genetic diversity within ENMV with 756 distinct CP variants obtained from 430 host plants.
351 Half of these plants exhibited mixed infections with up to six different variants infecting the
352 same host. The distribution of the number of substitutions differentiating the variants
353 infecting the same hosts was clearly bimodal with a first mode corresponding to one
354 substitution, a situation that is likely to result from the mutations occurring in a single initial
355 variant within an infected host, although independent events of transmission by vectors
356 cannot completely be ruled out. The second mode corresponded to 28 substitutions and
357 83% of the variant pairs analyzed were differentiated by more than 10 substitutions. These
358 cases are more likely to result from independent events of transmission by vectors than
359 intra-plant mutations.

360 The use of such a HTAS approach to estimate plant virus genetic diversity has
361 multiple applications including studies of spatial and temporal structure of virus populations
362 and epidemiological surveillance. Moreover, although we focused our use of the HTAS
363 approach in a single species context, it can be extended to multiple viruses to access viral
364 community diversity and within-host interactions between virus species that may have
365 consequences in epidemiology, pathogenicity and virulence evolution (Zhang et al. 2001;
366 Syller 2012; Alizon 2012; Alizon et al. 2013).

367

368

369 **Acknowledgements**

370 The authors are very grateful to J. Papaïx, T. Optiz and to the members of the virology team
371 of the plant pathology unit who enthusiastically provided help during field and laboratory
372 work (C. Desbiez, G. Girardot, P. Gognalons, A. Lauverney, B. Lederer, P. Millot, B. Moury,
373 K. Nozeran, A. Schoeny, V. Simon and E. Verdin). This work was funded by the Division for
374 Plant Health and Environment (SPE) of INRA through the AAP-SPE-2014 framework.

375 **References**

- 376 - Alizon, S. 2012. Parasite co-transmission and the evolutionary epidemiology of virulence.
377 *Evolution* 67-4, 921-933.
- 378 - Alizon, S., de Roode, J.C., Michalakis, Y. 2013. Multiple infections and the evolution of
379 virulence. *Ecol. Lett.* 16(4), 556-567.
- 380 - Carlsen, T., Aas, A.B., Lindner, D., Vralstad, T., Schumacher, T., Kauserud, H. 2012. Don't
381 make a mista(g)ke: is tag switching an overlooked source of error in amplicon
382 pyrosequencing studies? *Fungal Ecol.* 5, 747–749.
- 383 - Desbiez, C., Schoeny, A., Maisonneuve, B., Berthier, K., Bornard, I., Chandeysson, C.,
384 Fabre, F., Girardot, G., Gognalons, P., Lecoq, H., Lot, H., Millot, P., Nozeran, K., Simon, V.,
385 Tepfer, M., Verdin, E., Wipf-Scheibel, C., Moury, B. 2016. Molecular and biological
386 characterization of two potyviruses infecting lettuce in southeastern France. *Plant Pathol.*
387 DOI : 10.1111/ppa.12651.
- 388 - Esling, P., Lejzerowicz F., Pawlowski J. 2015. Accurate multiplexing for high-throughput
389 amplicon sequencing. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 43(5), 2513-2524.
- 390 - Galan, M., Guivier, E., Caraux, G., Charbonnel, N., Cosson, J-F. 2010. A 454 multiplex
391 sequencing method for rapid and reliable genotyping of highly polymorphic genes in large-
392 scale studies. *BMC Genomics*, 11: 296.
- 393 - Galan, M., Pagès, M., Cosson, J-F. 2012. Next-generation sequencing for rodent
394 barcoding: species identification from fresh, degraded and environmental samples.
395 *PLoSOne* 7(11): e48374. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0048374.
- 396 - Galan, M., Razzauti, M., Bard, E., Bernard, M., Brouat, C., Charbonnel, N., Dehne- Garcia,
397 A., Loiseau, A., Tatard, C., Tamisier, L., Vayssier-Taussat, Vignes, H., Cosson, J.-F. 2016.
398 16S rRNA amplicon sequencing for epidemiological surveys of bacteria in wildlife.
399 *mSystems*, 1 (4): e00032-16.

- 400 - Kircher, M., Sawyer, S. and Meyer, M. 2012. Double indexing overcomes inaccuracies in
401 multiplex sequencing on the Illumina platform. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 40, No.1, e3.
402 doi:10.1093/nar/gkr771.
- 403 - Kreisinger, J., Kropáčková, L., Petrželková, A., Adámková, M., Tomášek, O., Martin, J-F.,
404 Michálková, R., Albrecht, T. 2017. Temporal Stability and the Effect of Transgenerational
405 Transfer on Fecal Microbiota Structure in a Long Distance Migratory Bird. *Front. Microbiol.*
406 8(50). doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2017.00050.
- 407 - Levenshtein, V.I. 1965 Binary codes capable of correcting deletions, insertions, and
408 reversals, *Doklady Akademii Nauk SSSR*, 163(4):845-848, 1965 (Russian). English
409 translation in *Soviet Physics Doklady*, 10(8):707-710, 1966.
- 410 - Magoc, T., Salzberg S. 2011. FLASH: Fast length adjustment of short reads to improve
411 genome assemblies. *Bioinformatics* 27(21), 2957-63.
- 412 - May, A., Abeln, S., Buijs, M.J., Heringa, J., Crielaard, W., Brandt, B.W. 2015. NGS-eval:
413 NGS Error analysis and novel sequence VArant detection tool. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 43 (Web
414 Server issue):W301-W305. doi:10.1093/nar/gkv346.
- 415 - Meglécz, E., Piry, S., Desmarais, E., Galan, M., Gilles, A., Guivier, E., Pech, N., Martin, J-
416 F. 2011. SESAME (SEquence Sorter & Amplicon Explorer): Genotyping based on high-
417 throughput multiplex amplicon sequencing. *Bioinformatics* 27(2), 277-278.
- 418 - Picard, C., Dallot, S., Brunker, K., Berthier, K., Roumagnac P., Soubeyrand, S., Jacquot,
419 E., Thébaud, G. 2017. Exploiting Genetic Information to Trace Plant Virus Dispersal in
420 Landscapes. *Annu Rev. Phytopathol.* 55, DOI: 10.1146/annurev-phyto-080516-035616.
- 421 - Piry, S., Guivier, E., Realini, A., and Martin, J.-F. 2012. |SE|S|AM|E| Barcode: NGS-
422 oriented software for amplicon characterization – application to species and environmental
423 barcoding. *Mol. Ecol. Resour.* 12, 1151–1157.
- 424 - R Core Team (2015) R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing.
425 <http://www.R-project.org>

- 426 - Salter S.J., Cox, M.J., Turek, E.M., Calus, S.T., Cookson, W.O., Moffatt, M.F.,
427 Turner, P., Parkhill, J., Loman, N.J., and Walker, A.W. 2014. Reagent and labo-
428 ratory contamination can critically impact sequence-based microbiome
429 analyses. *BMC Biol.* 12:87. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12915-014-0087-z>.
- 430 - Schirmer, M., D'Amore, R., Ijaz, U.Z. , Hall, N. and Quince, C. 2016. Illumina error profiles:
431 resolving fine-scale variation in metagenomic sequencing data., *BMC Bioinformatics*. DOI:
432 10.1186/s12859-016-0976-y.
- 433 - Sengupta, A. and Dick, W.A. 2016. A priori considerations when conducting
434 high-throughput amplicon-based sequence analysis. *Agric. Environ. Lett.* 1:150010.
435 doi:10.2134/aer2015.11.0010
- 436 - Studholme, D.J., Glover, R.H., and Boonham, N. 2011. Application of high-throughput DNA
437 sequencing in Phytopathology. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 49:87-105.
- 438 - Syller, J. 2012. Facilitative and antagonistic interactions between plant viruses in mixed
439 infections. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 13(2), 204–216.
- 440 - Zhang, X.S., Holt, J., Colvin, J. 2001. Synergism between plant viruses: a mathematical
441 analysis of the epidemiological implications. *Plant Pathol.* 50, 732:746.
- 442

443

444 **Figure captions**

445 **Figure 1** – Visualization of incorrect assignment events through the mapping of the number
446 of alien sequences assigned to ENMV samples or other controls (in red) compared to the
447 number of sequences correctly assigned to the alien positive controls (in black) for each
448 library.

449 **Figure 2** – Diversity of infection cases: A) number of plants with single- and multi-infections
450 and, B) distributions of the number of substitutions between variants infecting a same plant.

451

452

453 **Tables**

454 **Table 1** - Details of sequencing results. For each library, the table 1A presents the number
 455 of: reads, merged sequences (contigs) obtained from these reads, sequences successfully
 456 assigned to samples (nbSeq.a) and sequences retained after discarding singletons and out
 457 of length range sequences (nbSeq.f). For each library, the Table 1B presents the average
 458 number of assigned sequences (nbSeq.s), distinct variants (nbVar.s) and sequences of the
 459 most represented variant per sample (nbSeqVar.s).

460 **A)**

library	reads	contigs	nbSeq.a	nbSeq.f
5A	524253	470690	71640	24186 (5.1%)
5B	460876	387730	51871	17033 (4.4%)
5C	554794	481457	80297	18290 (3.8%)
6A	605841	556466	88043	26310 (4.7%)
6B	631992	569123	84839	25610 (4.5%)
6C	710097	591229	111754	26922 (4.6%)
7A(10x)	5312229	4462438	601324	211619 (4.7%)
7B	739801	632709	85985	23205 (3.7%)
7C	916395	655100	107107	19988 (3.1%)
8A	547368	483311	71503	17272 (3.6%)
8B	580464	521476	77606	20576 (3.9%)
8C	711569	564517	105750	14254 (2.5%)
9A	715077	552125	85575	21313 (3.9%)
9B	553620	490911	67024	18066 (3.7%)
9C	739244	653614	101114	20815 (3.2%)

461 **B)**

library	nbSeq.s	nbVar.s	nbSeqVar.s
5A	270.20	41.14	164.90
5B	185.50	27.01	118.39
5C	200.38	32.68	117.74
6A	290.44	46.47	158.10
6B	280.09	43.47	161.05
6C	292.40	51.45	147.73
7A(10x)	2333.83	433.20	849.65
7B	251.83	37.25	129.92
7C	213.65	35.70	105.91
8A	190.23	29.10	104.10
8B	225.46	34.21	121.23
8C	149.11	22.20	78.89
9A	226.65	37.30	135.44
9B	194.30	28.04	123.03

462 **9C** 201.26 34.96 117.13

463 **Table 2** - Assessment of contamination and incorrect assignments. For each library and
 464 negative control (two healthy plants, one RT, one PCR and two empty-wells per plate) are
 465 provided the number of distinct variants (Nb.Var) and the number of sequences of the most

Control	Plate	Replicates						Nb.Seq
		A		B		C		
		Nb.Var	Nb.Seq	Nb.Var	Nb.Seq	Nb.Var	Nb.Seq	
Healthy_1	5	6	1	3	1	2	1	466
Healthy_2	5	3	1	4	1	7	1	467
Healthy_3	6	10	2	7	1	9	2	468
Healthy_4	6	6	3	5	5	6	1	469
Healthy_5	7	109	8	11	2	6	1	470
Healthy_6	7	99	6	9	1	12	1	471
Healthy_7	8	6	1	4	1	3	1	472
Healthy_8	8	9	2	12	1	3	1	473
Healthy_9	9	11	1	4	1	5	1	474
Healthy_10	9	7	2	7	2	3	1	475
PCR	5	7	2	10	3	6	1	476
PCR	6	14	3	7	2	4	1	477
PCR	7	53	2	3	1	2	1	478
PCR	8	11	1	8	2	5	1	479
PCR	9	7	4	2	1	7	1	480
RT	5	-	-	7	1	16	2	
RT	6	12	2	11	2	5	1	
RT	7	67	3	5	2	11	1	
RT	8	4	1	7	4	2	1	
RT	9	3	2	4	2	2	1	
Empty-well_1	5	3	1	10	1	6	1	
Empty-well_1	6	12	3	10	1	7	1	
Empty-well_1	7	97	5	5	1	5	1	
Empty-well_1	8	8	1	12	1	6	1	
Empty-well_1	9	9	1	9	1	5	2	
Empty-well_2	5	5	1	5	1	3	3	
Empty-well_2	6	3	1	9	2	2	1	
Empty-well_2	7	40	3	1	1	3	2	
Empty-well_2	8	11	2	8	1	12	2	
Empty-well_2	9	8	1	4	1	3	1	

481 **Table 3** – Impact of the RT, PCR and sequencing errors on variant validation. The three
 482 replicates of the alien controls (two per plate) were considered together to compute the total
 483 number of unexpected alien variants (nb.Var.err), the number of variants complying to the
 484 variant calling procedure rules: rule 1 (variant present in the three replicates), rule 2 (number
 485 of sequences of a variant ≥ 5 in at least two replicates) and rule 3 (variant cumulative
 486 frequency $> 5\%$) when applicable. NB: the number of alien mutated variants was significantly
 487 higher across the three replicates of the sample plate 7 as it included the 10X library 7A.

488

	Alien control 1	Alien control 2
Sample plates 5		
nb.Var.err	160	143
Rule 1	1	0
Rule 2	0	NA
Rule 3	NA	NA
Sample plates 6		
nb.Var.err	252	237
Rule 1	10	8
Rule 2	0	0
Rule 3	NA	NA
Sample plates 7		
nb.Var.err	503	565
Rule 1	30	66
Rule 2	0	2
Rule 3	NA	0
Sample plates 8		
nb.Var.err	263	158
Rule 1	14	5
Rule 2	0	0
Rule 3	NA	NA
Sample plates 9		
nb.Var.err	222	173
Rule 1	5	4
Rule 2	0	0
Rule 3	NA	NA

489

490 **Supplementary data**

491 **Figure S1** - Primers used to construct the “alien” positive control.

492 **Figure S2** – Example of plate design including samples (e.g. S2657), “alien” positive
493 controls and negative extraction (healthy plant), RT, PCR and empty-well controls. Wells are
494 characterized by a specific combination of tagged forward and reverse primers (5'-3'). A
495 tagged-primer includes: a pad that maximizes the nucleotide diversity in such a way that
496 distinct sequences are still well identified at the start of the sequencing process (in grey), a
497 tag (in yellow) and the ENMV-specific forward (TAYATACGAGCCTGYTGGGA) or reverse
498 (TCGCCATCCATCATCACCCA) primer. NB: all plates are designed with the same well-
499 specific combination of tagged-primers. The plate design was the same for the three
500 replicates of a sample plate but this design (position of the controls) varied among the five
501 sample plates.

502 **Figure S3** – Total number of mutated “alien” sequences over all plates as a function of the
503 number of substitutions observed.

504 **Figure S4** – Bar plot of the number of mutated “alien” sequences for each base along the
505 419 positions of the “alien” core sequence.





