

1 **Neanderthal Genomics Suggests a Pleistocene Time Frame for the First Epidemiologic**  
2 **Transition**

3 Charlotte J. Houldcroft<sup>1,2</sup> and Simon J. Underdown<sup>3\*</sup>

4 \*Corresponding author: [sunderdown@brookes.ac.uk](mailto:sunderdown@brookes.ac.uk)

5 Author affiliations:

6 1. UCL Institute of Child Health, Guilford St, London, WC1N 1EH, UK

7 2. Division of Biological Anthropology, University of Cambridge, Pembroke St,  
8 Cambridge, CB2 3QG, UK.

9 3. Human Origins and Palaeoenvironmental Research Group (HOPE), Department of  
10 Anthropology & Geography, Oxford Brookes University, Oxford OX3 0BP, UK

11

12 **Abstract – 147 words**

13 High quality Altai Neanderthal and Denisovan genomes are revealing which regions of  
14 archaic hominin DNA have persisted in the modern human genome. A number of these  
15 regions are associated with response to infection and immunity, with a suggestion that  
16 derived Neanderthal alleles found in modern Europeans and East Asians may be associated  
17 with autoimmunity. Independent sources of DNA-based evidence allow a re-evaluation of  
18 the nature and timing of the first epidemiologic transition. By combining skeletal,  
19 archaeological and genetic evidence we question whether the first epidemiologic transition  
20 in Eurasia was as tightly tied to the onset of the Holocene as has previously been assumed.  
21 There clear evidence to suggest that this transition began before the appearance of  
22 agriculture and occurred over a timescale of tens of thousands of years. The transfer of  
23 pathogens between human species may also have played a role in the extinction of the  
24 Neanderthals.

25

26 **WORDS 3918**

27 **Introduction**

28 Current models of infectious disease in the Pleistocene tell us little about the pathogens  
29 that would have infected Neanderthals (*Homo neanderthalensis*). If we consider the work of  
30 Cockburn<sup>1,2</sup>, Omran<sup>3</sup>, and Barrett<sup>4</sup>, who argue that infectious disease only started to  
31 seriously impact human groups after the development of agriculture during the Holocene,  
32 we must assume that Neanderthals lived in a time and place largely free of acute infectious  
33 disease. The current epidemiologic transition model associates most infectious diseases that  
34 cause significant mortality with changing living conditions connected with the rise of  
35 agriculture, increased sedentism and higher population densities. As Pleistocene hunter-  
36 gatherers, Neanderthals should not be at risk from the “pestilences” of Omran’s thesis.  
37 However, new genetic evidence has the potential to change our view of Neanderthal  
38 pathology, and perhaps even the model of the first epidemiologic transition.

39 Firstly, we must consider the current tools for studying infectious disease in the Pleistocene  
40 period. Before the advent of ancient DNA sequencing methods, researchers were limited to  
41 studying the skeletal pathologies of humans and Neanderthals from this period (fossilised  
42 evidence of bones responding to infection and inflammation). However, only a limited  
43 subset of infectious diseases leaves behind these lesions. The publication of high-quality  
44 Neanderthal and Denisovan genomes gives us a new opportunity to study Pleistocene  
45 infectious disease. Researchers from a range of disciplines interested in the evolution of the  
46 modern suite of infectious disease can also draw inferences from this new source of data. As  
47 a result of making comparisons between modern humans genomes, seeking genetic  
48 polymorphisms which vary in function or frequency between populations, and by also  
49 comparing human genomes with high-quality Denisovan and Neanderthal genomes, we are  
50 beginning to find evidence of introgressed Neanderthal and Denisovan alleles and  
51 haplotypes which have functions in immunity and the response to infection<sup>5-7</sup>. The  
52 persistence of these regions of DNA in some modern human genomes suggests they may  
53 have conveyed a selective advantage, increasing the fitness of anatomically modern humans  
54 (AMH) when dispersing into new environments. Through comparisons of genetic data with  
55 skeletal evidence of infection, it is increasingly to analyse which pathogens shaped the

56 evolution of modern humans and their closest relatives. Furthermore, ancient DNA  
57 technology now encompasses pathogen DNA, and in the future it may be possible to  
58 sequence pathogen DNA directly from Neanderthal remains – including pathogens that do  
59 not cause skeletal lesions. The genomes of extant human pathogens are shedding light on  
60 the antiquity of these infections in hominins.

61 We will discuss the evidence for infectious disease in Neanderthals, beginning with that of  
62 infection-related skeletal pathologies in the archaeological record, and then consider the  
63 role of infection in hominin evolution. We have synthesised current thinking on the  
64 chronology of emergence of notable European disease packages (Table 1). Finally, we will  
65 consider what implications this evidence has for the classical model of the first  
66 epidemiologic transition.

### 67 **The Neanderthal Fossil Record**

68 *Homo neanderthalensis* was a large bodied hominin that inhabited Eurasia widely from  
69 approximately 250,000 to 28,000 years ago<sup>8</sup>. Neanderthals occupied a hunter-gatherer  
70 subsistence niche, forming small bands of approximately 15-30 individuals<sup>8</sup>. Archaeological  
71 analysis suggests that while Neanderthal groups were relatively self-sufficient there was  
72 some level of exchange and transfer of materials<sup>9</sup> The Neanderthal fossil record of some 400  
73 individuals represents one of the largest collections of extinct hominin remains and is larger  
74 than that of contemporary Pleistocene *Homo sapiens* fossils. Genetic estimates for  
75 Neanderthal population size vary but agree that total numbers were small. Most studies  
76 suggest that the effective population size was between 3000-25000 (peaking around 50KYA  
77 before gradual decline)<sup>10-14</sup>. Bocquet-Appel & Degioanni<sup>15</sup> have suggested that the actual  
78 population could have theoretically reached 70,000 but agree that the effective population  
79 size would have been much smaller due to the impact of environmental and ecological  
80 pressures. Thus, the fossil record presents researchers with a broad sample of the whole  
81 population. Despite the breadth of skeletal material and the large number of pathological  
82 lesions described, the Neanderthals are still viewed as existing in a hunter-gatherer  
83 epidemiologic paradigm, an effect of the traditional approach of describing each fossil in  
84 relative isolation. Conversely, while systematic population level studies have shown that the  
85 Neanderthals sustained high levels of traumatic injury<sup>16,17</sup>, the same methods have largely

86 not been applied to infectious disease. When reviewed as a species there is evidence that  
87 along with traumatic injury the Neanderthals displayed a broad range of dental pathology  
88 and degenerative diseases as well as a large amount of non-specific infection<sup>18-21</sup>.

89 From the perspective of the current epidemiologic transition model, the Neanderthals' small  
90 group size and limited exchange networks suggests that they could not act as reservoirs for  
91 infectious diseases. Also, much has been made of the Neanderthals' apparent lack of  
92 cognitive and technological sophistication<sup>22</sup>. There is no logical reason to suppose infectious  
93 diseases were unknown to Neanderthal groups based on the fossil evidence. Indeed, the  
94 structure of Neanderthal groups would have made disease a potent factor in any  
95 demographic collapse related to extinction events<sup>23</sup>. As our understanding of Neanderthal  
96 biology and behaviour becomes more sophisticated we are presented with a hominin which  
97 was arguably every bit as intelligent and adaptive as *Homo sapiens*<sup>24-26</sup>. Their extinction and  
98 our survival potentially questions any innate superiority in *Homo sapiens*. Recent genetic  
99 analysis that suggests interbreeding further calls into question the real nature of the  
100 divisions traditionally drawn between the two alpha human hominins.

101

## 102 **Innate, adaptive and archaic immunity in hominin genomes**

103 2010 saw the publication of the draft Neanderthal genome sequence<sup>27</sup>, which revealed that  
104 humans living outside Africa have a small proportion of Neanderthal ancestry – ~2% of their  
105 genome<sup>28</sup>. Three Neanderthal genome sequences are available: a draft sequence from  
106 Vindija in Croatia, the composite sequence of DNA from bones from three different layers  
107 (inferred to be from different individuals), dating from between 38-45kya<sup>27</sup>; a low-coverage  
108 sequence of a Neanderthal found in Mezmaiskaya in the Caucasus, from a layer dated as 60-  
109 70kya; and a high-quality Neanderthal genome from the Altai region<sup>5</sup>, dated to 29-45kya.  
110 The data set is growing constantly, recently bolstered by a 49kya Neanderthal exome  
111 sequence (the ~1% of the genome which codes for proteins) from El Sidron in Spain, and a  
112 further 44kya exome from Neanderthal remains recovered from Vindija<sup>29</sup>. Comparisons of  
113 these genome and exome sequences (although taken from only a handful of individuals) to  
114 those of modern humans have identified several regions of genetic similarity between  
115 humans and Neanderthals that are thought to have arisen from admixture between these

116 two hominins. Approaches to identifying introgressed Neanderthal regions in the human  
117 genome which may be adaptive have looked for a range of different kinds of variation, from  
118 haplotype blocks hundreds of kilobases long, to single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs).

119 One such putatively introgressed region plays a role in innate immunity to viral infections. A  
120 haplotype containing *OAS1*, *OAS2*, *OAS3* of Neanderthal origin has been found in some  
121 modern human genomes<sup>30</sup>. These genes activate RNase L to degrade viral RNA. One  
122 Neanderthal derived SNP in *OAS2*, rs15895, is associated with response to tick-borne  
123 encephalitis virus disease in Europeans<sup>31</sup>. This is a disease found in forested areas of  
124 northern, central and eastern Europe, which would have formed a major part the  
125 Neanderthals' typical ecosystem<sup>8,32</sup>. Did this pathogen represent a particular selection  
126 pressure for AMH colonising Europe, unlike genetically adapted Neanderthals?

127 There is also evidence for Neanderthals contributing to the innate immune system in  
128 modern Papua New Guinea. A study by Mendez<sup>30</sup> found a haplotype carrying three genes  
129 (*STAT2*, *ERBB3*, *ESYT1*) to be absent in Africans, but present at variable frequencies outside  
130 Africa, peaking at 54% in Melanesians. The divergence time for the putatively introgressed  
131 Melanesian *STAT2* haplotype and the Neanderthal *STAT2* haplotype is 78kya, compared to a  
132 divergence time between the Human Reference Sequence haplotype and Neanderthal  
133 haplotype of 609kya. *STAT2* is involved in the interferon-alpha response to viral infections,  
134 including dengue<sup>33</sup>, influenza and measles<sup>34</sup>. It is of note that *STAT2* interacts with other  
135 putatively introgressed Neanderthal genes, discussed above: *OAS1-3*.

136 Sankararaman and colleagues<sup>7</sup> scanned the genomes of modern Europeans and Asians for  
137 evidence of individual SNPs that have introgressed from Neanderthals, a number of which  
138 have been associated with immunity and auto-immunity in modern humans. One of the  
139 most interesting results was a putative introgressed Neanderthal SNP in interleukin 18  
140 (*IL18*), a gene with a central role in the innate immune response and the development of  
141 bacterial sepsis. *IL18* expression is induced by products of both gram-positive and gram-  
142 negative bacteria. There is evidence for antagonistic pleiotropy in the role of *IL18* in human  
143 health and disease: IL18 induces interferon gamma, which can protect against infection; but  
144 increased IL18 cytokine signalling is also associated with allergic reaction and development  
145 of sepsis<sup>35</sup>. The introgressed *IL18* SNP rs1834481 is associated with decreased serum IL18

146 levels. If Neanderthals were particularly at risk from bacterial sepsis, this could have created  
147 a selection pressure for reduced *IL18* expression<sup>36</sup>.

148 A Neanderthal allele was also identified in *TNPO3*<sup>7</sup>, a gene associated with increased risk of  
149 systemic lupus erythematosus. There is some evidence to suggest that SLE may be triggered  
150 by an aberrant response to infection<sup>37</sup>. Further SNPs were identified which play a role in  
151 Crohn's disease, both to increase and decrease susceptibility to this auto-immune disease. A  
152 separate study of the same Altai genome by Vernot and Akey<sup>6</sup> identified a Neanderthal  
153 variant of *RNF34* in modern Asian and European genomes, a ring-finger protein with anti-  
154 apoptotic functions that interacts with tumour necrosis factor.

155 There are regions of the genome in which Neanderthal DNA does not persist, seemingly  
156 removed by purifying selection for disadvantageous phenotypes; the continued presence of  
157 genetic variants associated with immunity in some European and Asian genomes suggests  
158 that some Neanderthal haplotypes conferred a selective advantage to *Homo sapiens* during  
159 the colonisation of Europe and East Asia. However, individual studies of Neanderthal-human  
160 admixture use different methods to identify introgressed DNA, and subsequently identify  
161 different regions of the human genome as Neanderthal-derived. It is unclear whether this  
162 methodological diversity is a strength or a weakness of the field, as the false-positive rate is  
163 unknown.

164 It is also important to note that our interpretation of the function of these genetic variants,  
165 and our identification of immunity-related variants, relies upon our knowledge of the  
166 function of genes and polymorphisms within the human genome, which is incomplete – for  
167 example, there may be many more polymorphisms affecting susceptibility to viral, bacterial  
168 or fungal infection which we have not yet identified in modern humans, and therefore  
169 cannot identify in Neanderthal genetic data.

## 170 **Ancient pathogen genomics**

171 The work of Johannes Krause<sup>38</sup> and others<sup>39,40</sup> raises the tantalising possibility of being able  
172 to directly test ancient remains for evidence of infection by amplifying the DNA or RNA of  
173 the pathogens which infected them in life. As the horizon for amplifying ancient host DNA  
174 moves further back in time (most recently, the 400,000 year old mtDNA sequence from

175 Sima de los Huesos in Spain<sup>41</sup>), it is likely that amplifying ancient pathogen DNA from  
176 selected skeletal remains of Neanderthals and Denisovans will become possible. Ancient  
177 pathogen sequencing is even reaching into the mouths of Mesolithic and early Neolithic  
178 individuals, characterising the oral pathogens preserved in dental calculus<sup>42</sup>. Environmental  
179 contamination remains a significant issue in studies of ancient pathogen DNA, with careful  
180 use of nucleic extraction methods and well-chosen controls necessary for its prevention and  
181 identification<sup>43</sup>.

182

### 183 **Infectious disease in the Pleistocene**

184 The paradigm of the first epidemiologic transmission, the hypothesis that epidemic disease  
185 did not occur until the transition to agriculture, with larger, denser and more sedentary  
186 populations, has been essentially unchallenged since the 1970s. Our views of the infectious  
187 disease environment of the Pleistocene period are heavily influenced by skeletal data and  
188 studies of contemporary hunter-gatherers<sup>1</sup>. New genetic data – encompassing both hosts  
189 and pathogens – has the power to transform our view of the infectious disease landscape  
190 experienced by Neanderthals in Europe, and the AMH with whom they came into contact.  
191 The Pleistocene hominin environment cannot be thought of as free from infectious disease.  
192 It seems likely that the first epidemiologic transition, envisaged as part of the package of the  
193 Holocene farming lifestyle, may be fundamentally different in pace or scope than has  
194 previously been suggested.

195 **\*\*\*TABLE 1 HERE\*\*\***

### 196 **Challenging the Holocene epidemiologic transition**

197 In the genomes of Neanderthals we can clearly see evidence of the selection pressure  
198 exerted by infectious disease. The genome of a 7,000-year-old hunter-gatherer from La  
199 Brana in Spain shows similar signals of selection, for example carrying the non-functional  
200 form of gene *CASP12* (caspase-12). Functional *CASP12* is associated with an increased risk of  
201 bacterial sepsis, and the non-functional form is at or approaching fixation in non-African  
202 populations<sup>44</sup>. When considered alongside the reduced expression of Neanderthal *IL18* SNP  
203 found in some Europeans and Asians, it is clear that bacterial sepsis was a significant



204 selection pressure on archaic and AMH, long before the assumed arrival of zoonoses with  
205 the rise of agriculture in the Holocene.

206 Sequencing of the Neanderthal and Denisovan genomes has revealed a number of regions  
207 of putatively introgressed archaic DNA in modern European and Asian genomes, as  
208 discussed above, providing evidence that Neanderthals - and potentially other non-human  
209 hominins - experienced significant selection pressure to adapt to infectious disease; these  
210 same stretches of DNA may have been advantageous in protecting admixed AMH against  
211 the same pathogens.

212 Paleogenomics provide us with a counterpoint to the AMH skeletal evidence of increasing  
213 infectious disease in the Holocene, contributing to a view of Pleistocene Europe as riddled  
214 with infectious diseases and parasites. Studying the phylogenetic relationships of extant  
215 pathogens has led researchers to conclude that many infectious diseases have been co-  
216 evolving with humans and our ancestors for tens of thousands to millions of years.  
217 Furthermore, pathogens that were traditionally thought to be zoonoses acquired from herd  
218 animals may in fact be anthroponoses, pathogens humans passed to their animals during  
219 the rise of agriculture.

220 It is useful to consider which infectious diseases European Neanderthal populations may  
221 have experienced (Table 1). Pleistocene diseases include pathogens which are found in all  
222 primates, and are therefore likely to have co-speciated with Neanderthals (also known as  
223 heirloom pathogens); and also those pathogens that phylogenetic evidence suggest predate  
224 the Holocene, and are therefore potential Neanderthal pathogens. The same infectious  
225 diseases would have affected the first AMH in Europe. They are compared to the diseases  
226 associated with the transition to agriculture in the Holocene.

227 Certain pathogens are of particular interest to those studying infectious disease in  
228 Neanderthals (see Table 1). Kuhn and colleagues<sup>45</sup> speculate that a Pleistocene European  
229 rock shelter shows evidence of bedding being burned to eliminate parasites and pests. If  
230 Pleistocene European AMH were subject to parasites contaminating their bedding,  
231 Neanderthals must have been similarly burdened. There are significant tapeworm reservoirs  
232 in African primates that have ancient divergence dates from other species<sup>46</sup> and both  
233 Neanderthals and AMH were likely to have carried these parasites. The extent to which they

234 would have caused symptomatic disease is less clear: helminths are often thought to have  
235 been a significant source of infectious disease for early foragers, but modern subsistence  
236 farmers have higher helminth loads than modern foragers (with the caveat that modern  
237 hunter-gatherers/foragers and farmers are not a time capsule of the Pleistocene or  
238 Holocene disease landscape<sup>47</sup>).

239 *Brucella* may be a very ancient human pathogen, despite its modern associations with milk  
240 and pastoralism. Phylogenetic analysis of the *Brucella* genus suggests that the different  
241 species of *Brucella* diverged tens of thousands of years before the origin of pastoralism and  
242 has likely been endemic in wild animal populations for 80,000 – 300,000 years<sup>48</sup>. Brucellosis  
243 could therefore have been a disease of Neanderthals and AMH. There are skeletal reports of  
244 brucellosis in *Australopithecus africanus*, an order of magnitude earlier than the above  
245 estimates<sup>49</sup>. Oral pathogens would also have been a hazard for Neanderthals, not just  
246 Holocene farmers. There are reports of dental caries from *Homo heidelbergensis*<sup>50</sup>.  
247 Sequencing of Pleistocene dental calculus from AMH and Neanderthals would help  
248 researchers to understand the evolution of oral microenvironments during the Pleistocene.

249 It is therefore likely that Neanderthals were subject to a wide variety of infectious diseases,  
250 many of which do not leave skeletal lesions. These pathogens would have had the capacity  
251 to cause morbidity and mortality in a variety of settings: infections of dental carries and  
252 flesh wounds; childhood diseases (e.g. varicella zoster - chicken pox); gastrointestinal  
253 infections; sexually transmitted infections; progressive infections such as leprosy; and many  
254 chronic infections which would have been carried for life and only become symptomatic  
255 when other infections led to immune suppression, such as tuberculosis and hepatitis.

## 256 **Disease exchange**

257 There is as yet no evidence of infectious disease transmission between AMH and  
258 Neanderthals, but when considered in the light of the temporal and geographical overlap  
259 between the two species<sup>51</sup> and the evidence of admixture, it must have occurred. There is  
260 compelling evidence from Africa of pathogen exchange between humans and other  
261 hominins, preserved in the genome of Kaposi's sarcoma herpes virus (human herpesvirus 8).  
262 The K15 gene of KSHV has three highly divergent forms, P, M and N. P is most common, M is  
263 found at low frequencies worldwide, and N is rare and found solely in southern Africa<sup>52</sup>. It is

264 thought that the highly divergent M and N forms of K15 introgressed into human KSHV  
265 strains through recombination with another herpesvirus that has yet to be detected in  
266 modern humans. Based on the divergence dates of the different forms of K15, Hayward and  
267 Zong suggest that the M form diverged from the P form 200,000 years ago, and the N form  
268 500,000 years ago. The presence of these other K15 gene forms has arisen through contact  
269 with other hominin species who carried their own KSHV-like viruses which speciated with  
270 each hominin group. It was originally speculated that the M form of K15 may have  
271 originated in a Neanderthal herpesvirus<sup>53</sup>, but the detection of the M form in Africa - where  
272 Neanderthal DNA is not detected in living humans - suggests that there would have been  
273 one or more unknown hominin species who had contact with AMH in Africa and exchanged  
274 pathogen DNA with them. In a sense, the KSHV genome is a fossil record, preserving  
275 evidence of past pathogenic interactions between hominins.

276

277 *Helicobacter pylori* may be a pathogen which humans transmitted to Neanderthals. *H. pylori*  
278 made the out-of-Africa migration with modern humans, estimated to have first infected  
279 humans in Africa 88-116kya, and arriving in Europe after 52kya<sup>54</sup>. Chimpanzees do not  
280 harbour *H. pylori*, and there is evidence that some African hunter-gatherer groups, such as  
281 the Baka, did not acquire *H. pylori* until the last several hundred years, through contact with  
282 other groups<sup>55</sup>. The same process of pathogen transmission may have occurred between  
283 Neanderthals and AMH.

284

## 285 **Primates, hominins and zoonoses**

286 The close genetic relatedness of AMH and other hominins would only have made it easier  
287 for pathogens to jump from one species to another. In the Holocene, wild non-human  
288 primates have been the source of acute and chronic infectious diseases which have caused  
289 significant mortality: HIV, human T lymphotropic viruses (HTLVs), and vivax and falciparum  
290 malaria, for example<sup>56-60</sup>. This demonstrates the ability of infectious diseases to spread  
291 between species, through horizontal, vertical or vector-driven disease transmission routes.  
292 Humans migrating out of Africa would have been a significant reservoir of tropical diseases,

293 not all of which require vectors for transmission. Likewise, the native Neanderthal  
294 populations of Eurasia would have carried hominin-adapted local microbes and parasites.

### 295 **Inbreeding depression and Neanderthal immunity**

296 The complete genome sequence of a Neanderthal from the Altai mountains (dated 50,000  
297 B.P.) has also revealed a factor important to our understanding of infectious disease in  
298 Neanderthals: inbreeding. The parents of the Altai Neanderthal were as closely related as  
299 half-siblings or other similar relationships (e.g. double first cousins). This Neanderthal came  
300 from a small effective population, where genetic heterozygosity was low<sup>5</sup>. Infectious  
301 diseases would have become an increasingly important factor in Neanderthal mortality, as  
302 genetic variants increasing susceptibility to infection became more common in the  
303 population and the likelihood of infants being born with primary immune deficiencies  
304 increased<sup>61</sup>.

### 305 **Conclusion**

306 Analysing the genomes of archaic hominins provides evidence of pathogens acting as a  
307 population-level selection pressure, causing changes in genomes that were passed on to  
308 descendants and preserved in the genomes of modern Eurasians. Through sequencing  
309 ancient pathogen DNA, excavating fossilised parasites, and evidence that Neanderthals had  
310 genetic immunity to certain infectious diseases, we will be able to detect pathogens which  
311 were previously 'invisible' to paleopathology<sup>62</sup>. Skeletal evidence is no longer the sole  
312 source of evidence of individual or group-level pathology. Studying genetic data (from host  
313 and pathogen) may also point towards new skeletal markers of infection. Comparison of  
314 skeletal remains from hominins and hunter-gatherers from the geographical range of the  
315 Neanderthals may identify infectious diseases which exerted a significant selection pressure  
316 on the Neanderthal genome, and provide evidence of selection on appropriate genetic  
317 pathways within the growing collection of ancient human, Neanderthal and Denisovan  
318 genomes.

319 Paleogenomic data must inform our model of the first epidemiologic transition. The view of  
320 the Pleistocene infectious disease landscape is being radically altered by analysis of modern  
321 and ancient human genomes. Pleistocene hominins were under considerable selection

322 pressure due to infectious disease and the fingerprints of this selection are preserved in  
323 ancient and modern genomes. Selection pressure on Neanderthals and on AMH colonising  
324 the Neanderthal range must have been maintained over a period of time, or the mutations  
325 would have been lost from the modern human gene pool. Clearly, the Pleistocene in  
326 temperate regions was not free from acute or chronic infectious diseases and the selection  
327 pressures they exert.

328 Omran<sup>3</sup> considers parasitic diseases, tuberculosis, pneumonia (respiratory infection) and  
329 diarrhoeal diseases to be hallmarks of disease in the early agricultural era of the Holocene,  
330 dubbed “the age of pestilence and famine”. Anthropological and epidemiological data  
331 suggest that many acute infections require large, sedentary populations to be maintained,  
332 or an available pool of pastoral animals to act as intermediate hosts<sup>4</sup>, precluding the spread  
333 of many infectious diseases in the Pleistocene. In contrast, host and pathogen genetic data  
334 suggest a hypothesis of acute respiratory, soft tissue and diarrhoeal diseases having a pre-  
335 Holocene association with AMH and Neanderthals. Many of the pathogens thought to have  
336 originated in pastoral animals actually originated in humans, including tuberculosis,  
337 brucellosis, *Bordetella pertussis*, typhus and typhoid. Subsequently, a number of these  
338 infections have become anthroponoses, infections that humans have passed to ruminants  
339 and poultry during the transition to agriculture and the intensification of farming. Many of  
340 the infectious diseases previously thought to be hallmarks of the first epidemiologic  
341 transition (placed in the Holocene) have their roots in the Pleistocene. The rise of  
342 agriculture during the Holocene may have intensified their impact on modern human health  
343 and changed disease transmission dynamics, but it no longer makes sense to think of the  
344 transition as a change from health to pestilence. Infectious disease was entrenched in the  
345 Pleistocene landscape, and was an evident selection pressure for hominins in temperate and  
346 tropical latitudes. For the Neanderthal population of Eurasia, exposure to new human  
347 pathogens carried out of Africa may have been catastrophic.

348 The model of the first epidemiologic transition must continually develop to include new  
349 genetic data. We must also consider whether the first epidemiologic transition was a much  
350 longer process than previously envisaged, spanning both the Pleistocene and early Holocene  
351 epochs and several hominin species, not just *Homo sapiens*. The analysis of ancient  
352 genomes demonstrates that human behavioural patterns (in this case a shift to agricultural

353 subsistence) should not be used as an ecological proxy to explain shifting trends in the co-  
354 evolutionary relationship between pathogens and human populations.

## 355 References

- 356 1. Cockburn, A. *The Evolution and Eradication of Infectious Diseases*. 255 (Johns Hopkins  
357 Press, 1963).
- 358 2. Cockburn, T. A. Infectious Diseases in Ancient Populations. *Curr. Anthropol.* **12**, 45  
359 (1971).
- 360 3. Omran, A. R. The epidemiologic transition: a theory of the epidemiology of  
361 population change. 1971. *Milbank Q.* **83**, 731–57 (2005).
- 362 4. Barrett, R., Kuzawa, C. W., McDade, T. & Armelagos, G. J. EMERGING AND RE-  
363 EMERGING INFECTIOUS DISEASES: The Third Epidemiologic Transition. *Annu. Rev.*  
364 *Anthropol.* **27**, 247–271 (1998).
- 365 5. Prüfer, K. *et al.* The complete genome sequence of a Neanderthal from the Altai  
366 Mountains. *Nature* **505**, 43–9 (2014).
- 367 6. Vernot, B. & Akey, J. M. Resurrecting surviving Neandertal lineages from modern  
368 human genomes. *Science* **343**, 1017–21 (2014).
- 369 7. Sankararaman, S. *et al.* The genomic landscape of Neanderthal ancestry in present-  
370 day humans. *Nature advance on*, (2014).
- 371 8. Davies, R. & Underdown, S. The Neanderthals: a Social Synthesis. *Cambridge*  
372 *Archaeol. J.* **16**, 145 (2006).
- 373 9. HAYDEN, B. NEANDERTAL SOCIAL STRUCTURE? *Oxford J. Archaeol.* **31**, 1–26 (2012).
- 374 10. Bocquet-Appel, J.-P. & Demars, P.-Y. Population Kinetics in the Upper Palaeolithic in  
375 Western Europe. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* **27**, 551–570 (2000).
- 376 11. Green, R. E. *et al.* Analysis of one million base pairs of Neanderthal DNA. *Nature* **444**,  
377 330–6 (2006).
- 378 12. Green, R. E. *et al.* A complete Neandertal mitochondrial genome sequence  
379 determined by high-throughput sequencing. *Cell* **134**, 416–26 (2008).
- 380 13. Fabre, V., Condemi, S. & Degioanni, A. Genetic evidence of geographical groups  
381 among Neanderthals. *PLoS One* **4**, e5151 (2009).
- 382 14. Ghirotto, S., Tassi, F., Benazzo, A. & Barbujani, G. No evidence of Neandertal  
383 admixture in the mitochondrial genomes of early European modern humans and  
384 contemporary Europeans. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol.* **146**, 242–52 (2011).
- 385 15. Bocquet-Appel, J.-P. & Degioanni, A. Neanderthal Demographic Estimates. *Curr.*  
386 *Anthropol.* **54**, S202–S213 (2013).

- 387 16. Berger, T. D. & Trinkaus, E. Patterns of Trauma among the Neandertals. *J. Archaeol.*  
388 *Sci.* **22**, 841–852 (1995).
- 389 17. Underdown, S. A comparative approach to understanding neanderthal trauma.  
390 *Period. Biol.* **108**, 485–493 (2006).
- 391 18. Fennell, K. J. & Trinkaus, E. Bilateral Femoral and Tibial Periostitis in the La Ferrassie 1  
392 Neanderthal. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* **24**, 985–995 (1997).
- 393 19. Antón, S. C. Endocranial hyperostosis in Sangiran 2, Gibraltar 1, and Shanidar 5. *Am. J.*  
394 *Phys. Anthropol.* **102**, 111–22 (1997).
- 395 20. Ogilvie, M. D., Hilton, C. E. & Ogilvie, C. D. Lumbar anomalies in the Shanidar 3  
396 Neanderthal. *J. Hum. Evol.* **35**, 597–610 (1998).
- 397 21. Dудay, H. & Arensburg, B. La pathologie. *Le squelette moustérien Kebara* 179–193  
398 (1991).
- 399 22. Mellars, P. & French, J. C. Tenfold population increase in Western Europe at the  
400 Neanderthal-to-modern human transition. *Science* **333**, 623–7 (2011).
- 401 23. Underdown, S. A potential role for transmissible spongiform encephalopathies in  
402 Neanderthal extinction. *Med. Hypotheses* **71**, 4–7 (2008).
- 403 24. Soressi, M. *et al.* Neandertals made the first specialized bone tools in Europe. *Proc.*  
404 *Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **110**, 14186–90 (2013).
- 405 25. Lazuén, T. European Neanderthal stone hunting weapons reveal complex behaviour  
406 long before the appearance of modern humans. *J. Archaeol. Sci.* **39**, 2304–2311  
407 (2012).
- 408 26. Villa, P. & Roebroeks, W. Neanderthal demise: an archaeological analysis of the  
409 modern human superiority complex. *PLoS One* **9**, e96424 (2014).
- 410 27. Green, R. E. *et al.* A draft sequence of the Neanderthal genome. *Science* **328**, 710–22  
411 (2010).
- 412 28. Seguin-Orlando, A. *et al.* Genomic structure in Europeans dating back at least 36,200  
413 years. *Science (80-. )*. science.aaa0114– (2014). doi:10.1126/science.aaa0114
- 414 29. Castellano, S. *et al.* Patterns of coding variation in the complete exomes of three  
415 Neandertals. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **111**, 6666–71 (2014).
- 416 30. Mendez, F. L., Watkins, J. C. & Hammer, M. F. Neanderthal origin of genetic variation at  
417 the cluster of OAS immunity genes. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **30**, 798–801 (2013).



- 418 31. Barkhash, A. V *et al.* Variability in the 2'-5'-oligoadenylate synthetase gene cluster is  
419 associated with human predisposition to tick-borne encephalitis virus-induced  
420 disease. *J. Infect. Dis.* **202**, 1813–8 (2010).
- 421 32. Stewart, J. R. Neanderthals and modern humans. An ecological and evolutionary  
422 perspective. C. Finlayson. Publisher Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2004  
423 (265 pp.). ISBN: 0 521 82087 1. *J. Quat. Sci.* **21**, 206–207 (2006).
- 424 33. Mendez, F. L., Watkins, J. C. & Hammer, M. F. A haplotype at STAT2 Introgressed from  
425 neanderthals and serves as a candidate of positive selection in Papua New Guinea.  
426 *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* **91**, 265–74 (2012).
- 427 34. Chowdhury, F. Z. & Farrar, J. D. STAT2: A shape-shifting anti-viral super STAT. *JAK-*  
428 *STAT* **2**, e23633 (2013).
- 429 35. Dinarello, C. A. & Fantuzzi, G. Interleukin-18 and host defense against infection. *J.*  
430 *Infect. Dis.* **187 Suppl** , S370–84 (2003).
- 431 36. He, M. *et al.* Genome-wide association study identifies variants at the IL18-BCO2  
432 locus associated with interleukin-18 levels. *Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol.* **30**, 885–  
433 90 (2010).
- 434 37. Cooper, G. S. *et al.* Hormonal, environmental, and infectious risk factors for  
435 developing systemic lupus erythematosus. *Arthritis Rheum.* **41**, 1714–24 (1998).
- 436 38. Bos, K. I. *et al.* A draft genome of *Yersinia pestis* from victims of the Black Death.  
437 *Nature* **478**, 506–10 (2011).
- 438 39. Biagini, P. *et al.* Variola virus in a 300-year-old Siberian mummy. *N. Engl. J. Med.* **367**,  
439 2057–9 (2012).
- 440 40. Wagner, D. M. *et al.* *Yersinia pestis* and the plague of Justinian 541-543 AD: a  
441 genomic analysis. *Lancet Infect. Dis.* **14**, 319–26 (2014).
- 442 41. Meyer, M. *et al.* A mitochondrial genome sequence of a hominin from Sima de los  
443 Huesos. *Nature* **505**, 403–6 (2014).
- 444 42. Adler, C. J. *et al.* Sequencing ancient calcified dental plaque shows changes in oral  
445 microbiota with dietary shifts of the Neolithic and Industrial revolutions. *Nat. Genet.*  
446 **45**, 450–5, 455e1 (2013).
- 447 43. Campana, M. G., Robles García, N., Rühli, F. J. & Tuross, N. False positives complicate  
448 ancient pathogen identifications using high-throughput shotgun sequencing. *BMC*  
449 *Res. Notes* **7**, 111 (2014).
- 450 44. Xue, Y. *et al.* Spread of an inactive form of caspase-12 in humans is due to recent  
451 positive selection. *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* **78**, 659–70 (2006).

- 452 45. Kuhn, S. L. *et al.* The early Upper Paleolithic occupations at Uçağizli Cave (Hatay,  
453 Turkey). *J. Hum. Evol.* **56**, 87–113 (2009).
- 454 46. Ravasi, D. F., O’Riain, M. J., Davids, F. & Illing, N. Phylogenetic evidence that two  
455 distinct *Trichuris* genotypes infect both humans and non-human primates. *PLoS One*  
456 **7**, e44187 (2012).
- 457 47. London, D. & Hruschka, D. Helminths and human ancestral immune ecology: What is  
458 the evidence for high helminth loads among foragers? *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* **26**, 124–9
- 459 48. Foster, J. T. *et al.* Whole-genome-based phylogeny and divergence of the genus  
460 *Brucella*. *J. Bacteriol.* **191**, 2864–70 (2009).
- 461 49. D’Anastasio, R., Staniscia, T., Milia, M. L., Manzoli, L. & Capasso, L. Origin, evolution  
462 and paleoepidemiology of brucellosis. *Epidemiol. Infect.* **139**, 149–56 (2011).
- 463 50. Zanolli, C. & Mazurier, A. Endostructural characterization of the *H. heidelbergensis*  
464 dental remains from the early Middle Pleistocene site of Tighenif, Algeria.
- 465 51. Higham, T. *et al.* The timing and spatiotemporal patterning of Neanderthal  
466 disappearance. *Nature* **512**, 306–309 (2014).
- 467 52. Hayward, G. S. & Zong, J. C. Modern evolutionary history of the human KSHV genome.  
468 *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* **312**, 1–42 (2007).
- 469 53. Van Blerkom, L. M. Role of viruses in human evolution. *Am. J. Phys. Anthropol. Suppl*  
470 **37**, 14–46 (2003).
- 471 54. Moodley, Y. *et al.* Age of the association between *Helicobacter pylori* and man. *PLoS*  
472 *Pathog.* **8**, e1002693 (2012).
- 473 55. Nell, S. *et al.* Recent acquisition of *Helicobacter pylori* by Baka pygmies. *PLoS Genet.*  
474 **9**, e1003775 (2013).
- 475 56. Wolfe, N. D., Dunavan, C. P. & Diamond, J. Origins of major human infectious  
476 diseases. *Nature* **447**, 279–83 (2007).
- 477 57. Liu, W. *et al.* Origin of the human malaria parasite *Plasmodium falciparum* in gorillas.  
478 *Nature* **467**, 420–5 (2010).
- 479 58. Liu, W. *et al.* African origin of the malaria parasite *Plasmodium vivax*. *Nat. Commun.*  
480 **5**, 3346 (2014).
- 481 59. Trueba, G. & Dunthorn, M. Many neglected tropical diseases may have originated in  
482 the Paleolithic or before: new insights from genetics. *PLoS Negl. Trop. Dis.* **6**, e1393  
483 (2012).

- 484 60. Weiss, R. A. The Leeuwenhoek Lecture 2001. Animal origins of human infectious  
485 disease. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci.* **356**, 957–77 (2001).
- 486 61. Barbouche, M.-R. *et al.* Primary immunodeficiencies in highly consanguineous North  
487 African populations. *Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci.* **1238**, 42–52 (2011).
- 488 62. Wood, J., Milner, G. & Harpending, H. The osteological paradox: problems of inferring  
489 prehistoric health from skeletal samples. *Curr. Anthropol.* (1992).
- 490 63. Hoen, A. G. *et al.* Phylogeography of *Borrelia burgdorferi* in the eastern United States  
491 reflects multiple independent Lyme disease emergence events. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*  
492 *U. S. A.* **106**, 15013–8 (2009).
- 493 64. Margos, G. *et al.* MLST of housekeeping genes captures geographic population  
494 structure and suggests a European origin of *Borrelia burgdorferi*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*  
495 *U. S. A.* **105**, 8730–5 (2008).
- 496 65. Byun, R., Elbourne, L. D. H., Lan, R. & Reeves, P. R. Evolutionary Relationships of  
497 Pathogenic Clones of *Vibrio cholerae* by Sequence Analysis of Four Housekeeping  
498 Genes. *Infect. Immun.* **67**, 1116–1124 (1999).
- 499 66. Zink, A., Reischl, U., Wolf, H., Nerlich, A. G. & Miller, R. *Corynebacterium* in ancient  
500 Egypt. *Med. Hist.* **45**, 267–272 (2001).
- 501 67. Levett, P. N. Leptospirosis. *Clin. Microbiol. Rev.* **14**, 296–326 (2001).
- 502 68. Comas, I. *et al.* Out-of-Africa migration and Neolithic coexpansion of *Mycobacterium*  
503 tuberculosis with modern humans. *Nat. Genet.* **45**, 1176–82 (2013).
- 504 69. Saunders, N. J., Hood, D. W. & Moxon, E. R. Bacterial evolution: *Curr. Biol.* **9**, R180–  
505 R183 (1999).
- 506 70. Humphrey, L. T. *et al.* Earliest evidence for caries and exploitation of starchy plant  
507 foods in Pleistocene hunter-gatherers from Morocco. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*  
508 **111**, 954–9 (2014).
- 509 71. Diavatopoulos, D. A. *et al.* *Bordetella pertussis*, the causative agent of whooping  
510 cough, evolved from a distinct, human-associated lineage of *B. bronchiseptica*. *PLoS*  
511 *Pathog.* **1**, e45 (2005).
- 512 72. Kidgell, C. *et al.* *Salmonella typhi*, the causative agent of typhoid fever, is  
513 approximately 50,000 years old. *Infect. Genet. Evol.* **2**, 39–45 (2002).
- 514 73. Farlow, J. *et al.* *Francisella tularensis* in the United States - Volume 11, Number 12—  
515 December 2005 - Emerging Infectious Disease journal - CDC. *Emerging infectious*  
516 *diseases* (2005). at <[http://wwwnc.cdc.gov/eid/article/11/12/05-0728\\_article](http://wwwnc.cdc.gov/eid/article/11/12/05-0728_article)>

- 517 74. Woodford, M. H., Butynski, T. M. & Karesh, W. B. Habituating the great apes: the  
518 disease risks. *Oryx* **36**, 153–160 (2002).
- 519 75. Lovell, N. C., Jurmain, R. & Kilgore, L. Skeletal evidence of probable treponemal  
520 infection in free-ranging African apes. *Primates* **41**, 275–290 (2000).
- 521 76. Harper, K. N. *et al.* The sequence of the acidic repeat protein (arp) gene differentiates  
522 venereal from nonvenereal *Treponema pallidum* subspecies, and the gene has  
523 evolved under strong positive selection in the subspecies that causes syphilis. *FEMS*  
524 *Immunol. Med. Microbiol.* **53**, 322–32 (2008).
- 525 77. Boutellis, A., Abi-Rached, L. & Raoult, D. The origin and distribution of human lice in  
526 the world. *Infect. Genet. Evol.* **23**, 209–17 (2014).
- 527 78. Brooks, D. R. & Ferrao, A. L. The historical biogeography of co-evolution: emerging  
528 infectious diseases are evolutionary accidents waiting to happen. *J. Biogeogr.* **32**,  
529 1291–1299 (2005).
- 530 79. Carter, R. & Mendis, K. N. Evolutionary and Historical Aspects of the Burden of  
531 Malaria. *Clin. Microbiol. Rev.* **15**, 564–594 (2002).
- 532 80. Hoberg, E. P., Alkire, N. L., de Queiroz, A. & Jones, A. Out of Africa: origins of the  
533 *Taenia* tapeworms in humans. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* **268**, 781–7 (2001).
- 534 81. White, B. J., Collins, F. H. & Besansky, N. J. Evolution of *Anopheles gambiae* in  
535 Relation to Humans and Malaria. (2011). at  
536 <<http://www.annualreviews.org/doi/full/10.1146/annurev-ecolsys-102710-145028>>
- 537 82. Fares, M. A. & Holmes, E. C. A revised evolutionary history of hepatitis B virus (HBV).  
538 *J. Mol. Evol.* **54**, 807–14 (2002).
- 539 83. Van Hemert, F. J. *et al.* Protein X of hepatitis B virus: origin and structure similarity  
540 with the central domain of DNA glycosylase. *PLoS One* **6**, e23392 (2011).
- 541 84. Kapoor, A. *et al.* Characterization of a canine homolog of hepatitis C virus. *Proc. Natl.*  
542 *Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **108**, 11608–13 (2011).
- 543 85. Nakano, T. *et al.* New findings regarding the epidemic history and population  
544 dynamics of Japan-indigenous genotype 3 hepatitis E virus inferred by molecular  
545 evolution. *Liver Int.* **32**, 675–88 (2012).
- 546 86. Hemelaar, J. The origin and diversity of the HIV-1 pandemic. *Trends Mol. Med.* **18**,  
547 182–92 (2012).
- 548 87. Sharp, P. M. & Hahn, B. H. The evolution of HIV-1 and the origin of AIDS. *Philos. Trans.*  
549 *R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci.* **365**, 2487–94 (2010).

- 550 88. McGeoch, D. J., Rixon, F. J. & Davison, A. J. Topics in herpesvirus genomics and  
551 evolution. *Virus Res.* **117**, 90–104 (2006).
- 552 89. Otani, M. *et al.* Phylogeography of Human T-lymphotropic Virus Type 1 (HTLV-1)  
553 Lineages Endemic to Japan. *Trop. Med. Health* **40**, 117–24 (2012).
- 554 90. Bravo, I. G., de Sanjosé, S. & Gottschling, M. The clinical importance of understanding  
555 the evolution of papillomaviruses. *Trends Microbiol.* **18**, 432–8 (2010).
- 556 91. Zhong, S. *et al.* Distribution patterns of BK polyomavirus (BKV) subtypes and  
557 subgroups in American, European and Asian populations suggest co-migration of BKV  
558 and the human race. *J. Gen. Virol.* **90**, 144–52 (2009).
- 559 92. Albariño, C. G. *et al.* High diversity and ancient common ancestry of lymphocytic  
560 choriomeningitis virus. *Emerg. Infect. Dis.* **16**, 1093–100 (2010).
- 561 93. Delmas, O. *et al.* Genomic diversity and evolution of the lyssaviruses. *PLoS One* **3**,  
562 e2057 (2008).
- 563 94. Pomeroy, L. W., Bjørnstad, O. N. & Holmes, E. C. The evolutionary and  
564 epidemiological dynamics of the paramyxoviridae. *J. Mol. Evol.* **66**, 98–106 (2008).
- 565 95. Nyström, S. & Hammarström, P. Is the prevalent human prion protein 129M/V  
566 mutation a living fossil from a Paleolithic panzootic superprion pandemic? *Prion* **8**, 2–  
567 10 (2014).

568

#### 569 **Acknowledgements**

570 The authors would like to thank Professor Robert Foley for reading a draft of this paper.

#### 571 **Competing financial interests**

572 CJH and SJU declare no competing financial interests.

573 **Table 1: Comparison of European Pleistocene and Early Holocene Disease Packages.**

Pleistocene infectious disease	Ref	Holocene infectious disease	Ref
<b>Bacteria</b>			
Borrelia	63, 64	Cholera	65
Brucellosis	49, 48	Diphtheria	66
<i>Helicobacter pylori</i>	54	Leptospirosis	67
Mycobacterial infections (leprosy, TB)	68	<i>Neisseria gonorrhoea</i>	59,69
Oral pathogens (eg Streptococcus mutans)	70	Plague ( <i>Yersinia pestis</i> )	38
Pertussis	71		
Salmonella typhi (typhoid)	72		
Staphylococci	2		
Tularaemia	73		
Yaws	74–76		
<b>Parasites</b>			
Head and body lice	60,77	Helminths	47
Pinworms	78	Plasmodium vivax	79
Tapeworm	80	Plasmodium falciparum	81
Whipworm	46		
<b>Viruses</b>			
Adenoviruses	53	Caliciviridae (eg norovirus)	53
Coronaviridae	53	Hepatitis B, C & E	82–85
Hepatitis A	53	HIV	86,87
Herpesviridae (eg chickenpox)	88	HTLV	89
Papillomaviridae (eg HPV)	90	Influenza	53
Polyomaviridae (eg BK virus)	91	Lymphocytic chorionic meningitis	92
Rhabdoviridae (eg rabies)	93	Measles	94

		Mumps	94
<b><i>Other pathogens</i></b>			
Prion disease	95		

574

575