Quorum sensing integrates environmental cues, cell density and cell

history to control bacterial competence

Stefany Moreno-Gámez[1,2], Robin A. Sorg[1], Morten Kjos[1,3], Franz J. Weissing[2],

G. Sander van Doorn[2,5] and Jan-Willem Veening[1,4,5]

1. Molecular Genetics Group, Groningen Biomolecular Sciences and Biotechnology

Institute, Centre for Synthetic Biology, University of Groningen, Nijenborgh 7, 9747

AG Groningen, the Netherlands

2. Groningen Institute for Evolutionary Life Sciences, University of Groningen,

Groningen, P.O. Box 11103, 9700 CC, The Netherlands

3. Present address: Department of Chemistry, Biotechnology and Food Science,

Norwegian University of Life Sciences, N-1432 Ås, Norway

4. Department of Fundamental Microbiology, Faculty of Biology and Medicine,

University of Lausanne, Biophore Building, CH-1015 Lausanne, Switzerland

5. Co-senior author. Correspondence to G. Sander van Doorn: g.s.van.doorn@rug.nl,

tel: +31 (0)50 363 8097 and Jan-Willem Veening: Jan-Willem.Veening@unil.ch, tel:

+41 (0)21 6925625, Twitter: @JWVeening

Keywords: Quorum sensing, *Streptococcus pneumoniae*, antibiotics, competence,

transformation, bacterial stress response, mathematical modeling

Summary

Streptococcus pneumoniae becomes competent for genetic transformation when exposed to an autoinducer peptide named CSP. This peptide was originally described as a quorum-sensing (QS) signal, enabling individuals to regulate competence in response to population density. However, recent studies suggest that CSP may instead serve as a probe for sensing environmental cues, such as antibiotic stress or environmental diffusion. Here, we show that competence induction depends simultaneously on cell density, external pH, antibiotic-induced stress and cell history. Our experimental data is explained by a mathematical model where the environment and cell history modify how cells produce or sense CSP. Taken together, model and experiments indicate that autoinducer concentration can function as a reliable indicator of cell density across environmental conditions, while also incorporating information on environmental factors or cell history, allowing cells to integrate cues such as antibiotic stress into their QS response. This unifying perspective may also apply to other debated QS systems.

Introduction

Bacteria release small diffusible molecules in the extracellular medium known as autoinducers. These molecules induce the expression of particular functions including biofilm formation, luminescence and genetic competence as well as their own production [1,2]. The most prevalent functional interpretation of the production and response to autoinducers is known as quorum sensing (QS). According to this view, the concentration of autoinducer molecules is a proxy for cell density, allowing bacteria to regulate the expression of those phenotypes that are only beneficial when

expressed by many cells [1,2]. However, it is likely that the concentration of autoinducer

molecules does not only reflect cell density, but that it is also affected by

environmental factors, such as the diffusivity of the medium. In fact, alternative

hypotheses state that bacteria release autoinducers to sense these environmental factors

rather than to monitor cell density. The most well known hypothesis proposed by

Redfield (2002) is that the function of autoinducers is diffusion sensing, allowing cells

to avoid the secretion of costly molecules under conditions where they would quickly

diffuse away [3]. Evidence for the role of environmental diffusion on the concentration

of autoinducers comes from experiments showing that when diffusion is strongly

limited, a small group of cells (or even a single cell) can upregulate gene expression by

producing autoinducers [4–6]. Other potential roles suggested for autoinducer production

are sensing local cell density together with diffusion [7], the positioning of other cells

during biofilm formation [8] and temporal variations in pH [9].

We study pneumococcal competence, a system classically used as an example of

QS whose functional role has been recently debated in light of the previous

controversies. Competence is a transient physiological state that is developed by

Streptococcus pneumoniae, as well as other bacteria. Upon entry into competence,

pneumococci upregulate the expression of genes required for uptake of exogenous

DNA as well as bacteriocins and various genes involved in stress response [10]. In *S.*

pneumoniae, competence is regulated by an autoinducer molecule known as the

competence-stimulating peptide (CSP) in a two-component regulatory system formed

by the histidine kinase ComD and the response regulator ComE [11,12] (Figure 1).

Despite the detailed understanding of the regulatory network of competence induction,

little is known about why competence is controlled by an autoinducer peptide like

CSP. Although CSP has been classically thought to be a QS signal [13], competence can

be induced in response to environmental factors like pH, oxygen, phosphate and

antibiotic stress [14–17]. For instance, under our experimental conditions, competence

only naturally develops in alkaline growth medium with a pH > 7.4 (see below). Based

on this evidence and the finding that competence initiates at the same time in

pneumococcal cultures inoculated at different initial densities, it was suggested that

CSP acts as a timing device that allows cells to mount a timed response to

environmental stress independently of cell density [18,19]. Since then, this hypothesis has

established in the field as an alternative to the QS view of competence [16,20,21,19].

Recently, Prudhomme et al. (2016) renamed the timing device mechanism as a growth-

time dependent mechanism and proposed that a subpopulation of competent cells that

originates stochastically spreads the competent state to the rest of the population by

cell-cell contact [22]. Another alternative to QS is that pneumococcal competence is an

instance of diffusion sensing. This was suggested by Yang et al. (2010) based on the

observation that the quorum for competence induction is not fixed but decreases with

more restrictive diffusion [23].

Here, we study the regulation of pneumococcal competence by cell density and two

environmental factors, antibiotic stress and pH. Using both experiments and

mathematical modeling we study the combined action of these factors on competence

induction. We make predictions based on the model regarding the time and density at

which competence initiates under different combinations of inoculation densities, cell

histories and environmental conditions and show that they are confirmed by

experimental data. A common observation across environmental contexts is that the

concentration of CSP always increases with the number of cells, supporting the

functional interpretation of competence as a QS system; however, we also find that the

exact relationship between cell density and CSP concentration is determined by

environmental factors and cell history which modify the rate at which individual cells

produce or sense CSP. Based on these findings, we advocate to keep using the term

'quorum sensing' but with a broader meaning to acknowledge that in addition to cell

density, multiple factors regulate autoinducer production and detection. This

perspective emphasizes the importance of considering the natural context where

bacteria use QS when formulating hypotheses on the functional role of responding to

any particular biotic or abiotic factor through QS.

Results

A mathematical model of pneumococcal competence development

We developed a mathematical model of pneumococcal competence based on the

network of protein interactions known to regulate competence development (Figure 1)

during growth in a well-mixed liquid medium. Briefly, the precursor of CSP, ComC, is

cleaved and exported to the extracellular space by the membrane protein complex

ComAB [12,24]. Upon binding to CSP, ComD phosphorylates the response regulator

ComE, which in its phosphorylated form upregulates transcription of the operons

comAB, *comCDE* and *comX* [12,25,26]. The latter encodes the sigma factor ComX, which

controls transcription of genes required for uptake and processing of exogenous DNA

[10,27]. Our model uses ordinary differential equations (ODEs) and consists of two

components. At the population-level it keeps track of the population density and the

extracellular concentration of CSP; at the cell-level it keeps track of the intracellular

concentrations of the proteins involved in competence regulation (Figure 1). All the

cells export CSP to the medium at a rate determined by the intracellular concentrations

of ComC and ComAB. The concentration of CSP then feeds back into the intracellular

concentrations of all the proteins involved in competence since their transcription rates

depend on the ratio of ComE to ComE~P and thus on the rate at which ComD

phosphorylates ComE. The model uses changes in competence gene expression and/or

changes in the rate at which cells export CSP to simulate different environmental

scenarios (see below). A detailed description of the model and the choice of parameter

values is in the Supplementary Information.

We use the model to determine the effect of environmental factors and cell

history on the relationship between cell density and CSP concentration. Crucially, the

model assumes that all cells are homogeneous and that competence is only regulated

by CSP, whose production increases with cell density. We are interested in

determining whether these assumptions are sufficient to explain our experimental

results or if additional mechanisms need to be incorporated (e.g. density-independent

competence induction and stochastic induction of competence in a subpopulation of

cells [18,19,22]).

Competence is regulated by cell density and develops at a critical CSP

concentration

It has been reported that competence develops at a fixed time after inoculation from

acid to alkaline conditions (pH 6.8 → 7.9) regardless of the inoculum size [18,22]. This

observation has motivated the view that competence develops independently of cell

density and rather acts as a timed response at the single cell level to the pH shift

occurring at the moment of inoculation. We extended previous studies by exploring a

wider range of inoculation densities (OD_{595nm}: $10^{-1} - 10^{-7}$) (approximately $10^7 - 10^1$

cells/ml) and preculturing conditions. We used the encapsulated serotype 2 strain *S.*

pneumoniae D39 [28] and cells were washed before inoculation to remove CSP produced

during the preculture (note that we verified that CSP is actually present in the

supernatant of cultures of strain D39; see Figure S1). To monitor competence

development, the ComX-dependent promoter of the late competence gene *ssbB* was

fused to the firefly *luc* gene and inserted at the non-essential *bgaA* locus. Activation

and expression of *ssbB* is a good reporter for competence development since SsbB

expression strongly correlates with actual transformation with externally added DNA

(e.g. [16,29] and data not shown).

As shown in Figure 2a, and in contrast to Claverys *et al.* (2006)[18], we find that the

inoculation density does have an effect on the time of competence development, with

competence initiating later for lower inoculum sizes. For instance, for the lowest

inoculation density, competence initiates more than 4 hours later than for the highest

inoculation densities (Figures 2a and left panel of 2c). Importantly, the population

density at competence initiation is not constant but positively related to the inoculation

density (Figure 2c, right panel). Hence, the dependency of the time of competence

initiation on the inoculation density is not a consequence of competence developing at

a fixed critical cell density for every condition. Instead, our results are consistent with

the mathematical model, which predicts that competence develops when the CSP

concentration has reached a critical threshold. The model shows that competence will

start faster for higher inoculation densities because the CSP concentration reaches the

critical threshold for competence activation earlier if more cells are producing CSP

(Figure 2d, left panel). Moreover, the model shows that populations inoculated at low

densities initiate competence at a lower density than populations inoculated at high

densities consistent with the experimental data (right panels of Figures 2c and 2d).

This is because cells inoculated at low cell densities already had time to start

transcribing competence regulatory genes and accumulate some CSP once they

reached the same cell density of cultures freshly inoculated at a higher cell density

(Figure 2e). Thus, the critical CSP threshold is reached sooner for low-density

inoculated cultures. Notably, a common misconception in the field is that in a QS

system the critical concentration of autoinducer should always be attained at the same

fixed cell density [18,19,22,23].

It is well known that the pH of the medium affects competence development, with

natural competence being inhibited under acid conditions [14,30]. So far we have studied

competence with cells precultured in a non-permissive pH for competence

development (pH 6.8). These preculture conditions were reflected in the model

simulations by assuming that cells initially were in the competence-off state. We also

simulated the alternative scenario that cells are already competent at inoculation. For

this cell-history, the model predicts that the time of competence initiation is lower, but

only for high inoculation densities (Figure 2d, left panel, Figure S2). This happens

because when cells are competent initially and are inoculated at high density they can

produce enough CSP to remain competent. However, when inoculation density is low,

cells cannot produce enough CSP and initial competence switches off. The timing of

the subsequent competence initiation is then the same as if cells were not competent

when inoculated (Figure S3).

To verify the predicted effect of cell-history on the timing of competence initiation,

we controlled the competence state of cells at inoculation by manipulating the pH

during preculture. Specifically, we compared the time of competence initiation for

cells coming from a non-permissive (pH 6.8) and a permissive (pH 7.9) pH history for

competence development. For inoculation densities below OD_{595nm} 0.01, the pH of the

preculture did not have an effect on the timing of competence initiation (Figures 2b

and c). On the other hand, for inoculation densities above OD_{595nm} 0.01, there was a

time delay in competence initiation for cells with an acid history whereas cells with a

non-acid history were competent when inoculated and remained competent afterwards

as predicted by the model (Figures 2b and d). This suggests that when the inoculation

density is high, there are enough cells to take the CSP concentration above the

threshold for competence activation if they are already producing CSP – as is the case

of cells coming from a non-acid history. By contrast, if cells come from a non-

permissive pH for competence development, the machinery for CSP production needs

to be activated even for the high cell densities. This causes a delay in competence

initiation, which has been interpreted as evidence suggesting that competence acts as a

timing device independently of cell density [18,19].

To further corroborate the effect of cell density on competence, we studied

competence initiation at the single-cell level in populations inoculated at two different

densities. The *ssbB* promoter was fused to GFP and competence initiation was

followed using automated fluorescence time-lapse microscopy. In line with the results

from liquid cultures, we find that competence initiated earlier for the highest

inoculation density (Figure 3). Importantly, we observe little cell-to-cell variation in

the time of competence initiation and found no evidence of strong phenotypic

heterogeneity, as is for instance observed during competence development in *Bacillus*

subtilis (where less than 20% of the population enters the competent state) [31,32]. This

justifies the model assumption that the population of cells is homogeneous and argues

against the hypothesis that a competent subpopulation emerges before the entire

population becomes competent [22].

pH and competence development

In order to understand how environmental factors affect competence we quantified the effect of external pH on natural competence development. We studied competence at a fine-grained range of pH values from 6.8 to 9.0 and found a clear-cut value that separated permissive from non-permissive external pH values for natural competence development as reported before [14,29]. For our media this was pH 7.4 (Figure 4a). However, not only competence always developed at pH higher than 7.4 but the critical cell density for competence initiation decreased with increasing pH (Figure 4a and b). Therefore, pH does not relate to competence as a binary permissive/non-permissive condition but competence development is more efficient in more alkaline media. The data suggests that for non-permissive pH conditions the cell density at which competence would initiate is above the carrying capacity of the medium, which was also previously proposed by Chen and Morrison (1987)[14].

To test whether pH mainly affects CSP production or detection, we used a *comA*⁻ mutant that is unable to export CSP and therefore only develops competence in the presence of external CSP (Figure 1). We then performed experiments with medium at different initial pH values where we added various concentrations of synthetic CSP, using both the wild type and the *comA*⁻ mutant. We found that for the *comA*⁻ mutant competence was mainly dependent on the CSP concentration and only minor differences were found among media with different pH. For the wild type, in contrast, the minimum CSP concentration required for competence development varied with the pH (Figure S4). The finding that pH strongly affects competence initiation in the wild type but not in the *comA*⁻ mutant suggests that competence development is mediated mainly by pH-dependent CSP secretion rather than by pH-dependent CSP detection. As peptidase-containing ATP-binding cassette transporters such as ComAB require

ATP to transport substrates [33], it might be that the proton motive force influences its

activity. Therefore, we incorporated the effect of pH in our model by changing the rate

at which cells export CSP. In agreement with the experimental results, the modified

model confirms that the density of competence initiation decreases with the rate of

export of CSP and thus with higher pH. Also, the model predicts that for rates of CSP

export below a certain threshold competence does not develop any more since cells

never manage to accumulate enough CSP for competence to initiate (Figure 4c). Note

however that this is a simplification of the effect of pH in competence regulation since

pH might also affect ComD and/or the stability of CSP (as in other QS systems [9]) and

as our data suggest it might also be involved in the shutdown of competence (Figure

S4). However, regardless of the exact mechanism, as long as higher pH increases the

rate at which single cells produce and/or sense CSP, our model predicts that the density

at which the critical CSP concentration for competence activation is attained will

decrease with increasing pH.

Finally, we assessed the joint effect of pH and cell density on competence

regulation. We did this by studying competence initiation for cultures inoculated at

different cell densities in media with different pH both experimentally and using the

model. The model predicts that competence will initiate earlier both for higher

inoculation densities and more alkaline pH (Figure 5a left panel): While higher

inoculation densities mean that more cells will start producing CSP after inoculation,

higher pH increases the rate at which individual cells produce CSP. The experimental

data is consistent with this prediction (Figure 5b left panel). Therefore, the observation

that pH affects competence development is not conflicting with regulation by cell

density because the CSP concentration depends on both of these factors.

Induction of competence by antibiotics

The induction of pneumococcal competence is affected by the presence of certain classes of antibiotics [16,29], which has been considered additional evidence for the hypothesis that competence can be regulated independently of cell density [16,18]. We evaluated this claim by studying the role of HPUra and streptomycin on competence regulation. We chose these antibiotics since the mechanisms by which they induce competence at the molecular level have been elucidated to some extent: HPUra stalls replication forks during DNA replication while initiation of DNA replication continues, thereby increasing the copy number of genes near the origin of replication (*oriC*). As a consequence, it up-regulates transcription of *comAB, comCDE* and *comX* as these operons are located proximal to *oriC* [29]. Streptomycin causes mistranslation and is thought to regulate competence via the membrane protease HtrA which targets misfolded proteins and also represses competence possibly by degrading CSP [34] (also see Figure S5). By increasing the amount of misfolded proteins, streptomycin could reduce the rate at which CSP is degraded by HtrA leading to competence induction.

We reproduced the effect of HPUra and streptomycin on competence regulation in our model by increasing the transcription rate of *comAB, comCDE* and *comX* and by reducing the rate at which CSP degrades, respectively. Our model predicts that the presence of antibiotics lowers the pH threshold for competence development (Figure 5a) since antibiotics can counteract the effect of acidic pH to the point that cells can still accumulate enough CSP to become competent. They do this by increasing the rate at which single cells produce CSP (reducing the number of cells needed to reach the critical CSP concentration for competence initiation) or by increasing the rate at which they sense CSP (reducing the critical CSP concentration for competence initiation). Also, it predicts that for pH values where competence is already induced without

antibiotics, it will develop faster in the presence of antibiotics (Figure 5a). In

agreement with previous studies [16,29,34] and with the model predictions, we find that

antibiotics can induce competence at pH values that are repressive for natural

competence development (Figure 5b and c). We also find support for the second

prediction of the model since for permissive pH values for natural competence

development (above 7.4), competence is induced earlier in the presence of antibiotics

(Figure 5b and d). Remarkably, both the model and the experiments show that the

combined effect of pH and cell density in the presence of antibiotics remains the same

as when no antibiotics are added (compare left panel with middle and right panels in

Figures 5a and 5b): Competence induction still occurs earlier for high densities of

inoculation and more alkaline pH values. In the case of HPUra at pH 7.3 it is even

possible to see that competence does not develop for the highest inoculation density as

the population probably reaches carrying capacity before enough CSP is produced.

307   Bistable region for competence development and the role of cell history

An important feature of the competence regulatory network is the presence of a

positive feedback that couples CSP detection to CSP production (Figure 1). Signaling

systems that contain positive feedback loops often exhibit switch-like responses

resulting in the occurrence of alternative stable states [35]. We varied the strength of the

positive feedback loop in the model by changing the rate of CSP export and found that

the competence regulatory network exhibits bistability for a range of intermediate CSP

export rates. In this range, the model predicts the existence of two alternative states

where competence switches 'ON' or 'OFF' depending on the initial conditions (Figure

6a).

Since in the model the rate of CSP export is positively correlated to the pH, we

expected to find a region of pH values exhibiting similar bistability as an additional

experimental corroboration of the model. Indeed, we found support for the existence of

a bistable region at pH 7.4 where the wild type developed competence if CSP was

externally added in concentrations above 4 ng mL^{-1} (Figure 6b). Thus, whereas

competence always switched on for pH values above 7.4 regardless of the initial CSP

concentration, for pH 7.4 both 'ON' and 'OFF' states were observed depending on the

initial CSP concentration. Moreover, at pH 7.4 competence developed for CSP

concentrations that did not induce competence in the *comA*$^-$ mutant (Figure S4), which

indicates that CSP production in the wild type was kick-started by the initial addition

of CSP resulting in enough overall CSP for competence induction.

Bistable systems usually exhibit hysteresis. For this reason, we expected that at pH

7.4 where both the 'ON' and 'OFF' states are attainable, past cell history would

influence competence induction. From our previous experiments we determined that

cells coming from acid precultures inoculated at pH 7.4 do not develop competence at

any density of inoculation (Figure 5b left panel, second column). We then studied

whether there is history-dependence by inoculating cells coming from non-acid

precultures at pH 7.4. We found that cells coming from a non-acid preculture became

competent at densities above OD$_{595nm}$ 2.4 x 10^{-4}, which demonstrates that cell history

can influence competence development (Figure 6c). Past history has an effect on

competence because it determines the state of the machinery for CSP production,

which is 'OFF' when cells come from acid preculture but 'ON' when they come from

non-acid conditions. This explains why the effect of non-acid cell history appears from

a minimum inoculation density, since enough cells need to be inoculated in order for

them to produce the amount of CSP necessary for the system to remain 'ON' (Figure

6a inset). We then hypothesized that at pH 7.3 the critical inoculation density of cells

coming from non-acid history would have to be even higher than the one at pH 7.4 as

the model predicted that higher initial concentration of CSP would be necessary for the

system to remain 'ON' at lower pH. We confirmed this prediction experimentally by

showing that at pH 7.3 competence does not develop for an inoculation density of

OD_{595nm} 2.4 x 10^{-4} (as for pH 7.4) but from 7.4 x 10^{-4} upwards (Figure S6). Thus, our

results show that, as a consequence of the positive feedback involved in CSP

production, past cell history can determine whether competence is induced or not by

modifying the state of the machinery for CSP production and/or sensing.

Discussion

Recently, the view that bacteria use autoinducers as QS signals has been debated since

autoinducer concentration can change in response to the environment. Here, we show

experimentally that cell density, pH and antibiotic stress simultaneously regulate

competence development in *S. pneumoniae,* a system classically framed in the

paradigm of QS (Figures 2-5). Using a mathematical model we show that this occurs

because pH and antibiotics modify the rates at which single cells produce and sense

CSP and therefore the strength of the positive feedback loop coupling CSP detection to

CSP production (Figures 4 and 5). Importantly, this environmental dependency does

not override regulation by cell density but rather modulates the relationship between

the number of cells and the CSP concentration. Furthermore, we show that cell history

can also regulate competence development by modifying the status of the machinery to

produce and respond to CSP (Figure 6). Hysteresis in the competence response might

be particularly important in the natural niche of the pneumococcus, the human

nasopharynx. In particular it is consistent with the observation that there is constitutive

upregulation of competence in pneumococcal biofilms during nasopharyngeal

colonization[36]. In this context, once competence is triggered for the first time cells

would be primed to rapidly initiate another round of competence.

Why is competence controlled by CSP? Our results provide evidence against the

hypothesis that CSP is a timing device and in particular against the view that

competence can develop in a cell-density independent manner[18,19,22] (Figures 2 and 3).

Regarding the hypothesis that CSP is a probe to test diffusion [23], our findings suggest

that focusing on diffusion alone oversimplifies the information and functionality that

cells can gather through CSP production. We hypothesize that by releasing and

responding to CSP, bacteria can coordinate the development of competence and in

particular the expression of fratricins and bacteriocins, which are under the control of

the competent state. These proteins can lyse or inhibit the growth of surrounding cells

that are not competent, increasing the efficiency of genetic transformation and

mediating competition with other bacteria [37–40]. By coordinating competence

expression via CSP, an isogenic bacterial population can increase the total

concentration of secreted fratricins and bacteriocins, which likely translates into a

higher amount of lysed cells and therefore potential DNA donors. Importantly,

coordinating competence expression can also prevent the killing of clonal siblings

since immunity to these proteins comes with the competent state.

What is the relevance of the information carried by CSP? As shown by our model,

alkaline pH and antibiotic stress induce competence by increasing the rate at which

single cells produce and sense CSP. We expect this to be a general mechanism by

which sources of stress that are alleviated through competence induce this state (e.g.

mobile genetic elements as hypothesized by Croucher et al.[41]). Upregulating

competence in the presence of antibiotics can increase survival by activating the

expression of stress response genes [10,21], facilitating repair of damaged DNA and

mediating acquisition of resistance [21,42]. Our findings suggest that strategies to prevent

competence development in response to antibiotics can focus on counteracting the

effect of antibiotics on the rate at which cells produce or sense CSP. Regarding the

benefits of upregulating competence with alkaline pH, these are less clear and could be

an example of a non-adaptive response resulting from the inherent biochemical

properties of ComAB and possibly ComD.

General insights on QS

Our findings support the view that functional hypotheses stressing individual factors

like diffusion or population density underplay the complexity of information integrated

by QS systems [7,43–47]. Although the term 'quorum sensing' overemphasizes the role of

population density, we advocate for keeping it due to its widespread use and the fact

that density modifies autoinducer concentration in all autoinducer production systems.

Crucially, QS should be used in a broad sense that acknowledges that bacteria integrate

other factors in addition to population density into their QS responses. This view might

be very useful for other autoinducer production systems like competence in *Vibrio*

cholerae, where the synthesis of the autoinducer, CAI-1, depends on the intracellular

levels of cAMP-CRP and therefore might incorporate information on the metabolic

status of the cell [48,49]. Also in other systems, clear links between signal production,

quorum threshold and environmental conditions have been shown to affect QS [50–54].

Given that many biotic and abiotic factors can modify autoinducer concentrations

[55], future work should aim to study the relevance of such factors in the natural context

where bacteria secrete autoinducers. Such work is crucial to assess whether

upregulating QS in response to a particular factor provides a benefit for bacteria or is

merely a result of the biochemical properties of the QS regulatory network. An

interesting possibility is that, as in other biological systems [56], bacteria could perform

collective sensing of the environment through social interactions. In this context, by

secreting autoinducers cells could share individual estimates of environmental

conditions (e.g. antibiotic stress) for which upregulating QS is beneficial. Then,

autoinducer secretion would provide a way to get a more reliable estimate of the

environmental conditions by allowing a population to pool estimates made by

individual cells. Importantly, such a role for autoinducer secretion would explain the

dependency of QS on both cell density and the environment.

Methods

Bacterial strains and growth conditions

All pneumococcal strains used in this study are derivatives of the clinical isolate *S.*

pneumoniae D39 [28]. In order to monitor competence development all strains contain a

transcriptional fusion of the firefly *luc* and the *gfp* gene with the late competence gene

ssbB. See Table S1 for a list of the strains used and the Supplemental information for

details on the construction of the strains. *S. pneumoniae* was always grown in C+Y

complex medium [27] at 37ºC.

Density and luminescence assays

Cells were pre-cultured either in acid C+Y (pH 6.8) or in non-acid C+Y (pH 7.9) at 37ºC to an OD_{595nm} of 0.1. Right before inoculation, they were collected by centrifugation (8000 rpm for 3 minutes) and resuspended in fresh C+Y (pH 7.9). Luciferase assays were performed in 96-wells plates with a Tecan Infinite 200 PRO Illuminometer at 37ºC as described before [57]. Luciferin was added at a concentration of 0.5 mg/mL to monitor competence by means of luciferase activity. Optical density (OD_{595nm}) and luminescence (relative luminescence units [RLU]) were measured every 10 minutes. The time and density of competence initiation correspond to the first time point where the RLU signal is equal or above 200 units. RLU is used instead of RLU/OD because 1) when competence develops the rate at which the RLU signal increases is faster than the growth rate and 2) due to the very low inoculation densities used for Figure 2 the RLU/OD can be very high at the start (clearly before competence has developed). The value of 200 units was chosen because once this value is reached competence always developed. The effect of pH on competence development was studied by inoculating cells in C+Y at a range of pH values from 6.8 to 9. pH was adjusted by adding HCl and NaOH. The effect of antibiotics was studied by adding streptomycin (3 μg mL^{-1}) and HPUra (0.075 μg mL^{-1}) to C+Y.

Time-lapse fluorescence microscopy

Phase contrast and GFP images were obtained using a Deltavision Elite microscope (GE Healthcare, USA) with Trulight illumination for the GFP signal at 32% intensity output (filtered with a neutral density filter) and an exposure time of 0.3 sec. Time-lapse videos were recorded by taking images every 10 minutes. The polyacrylamide

gel used as semi-solid growth surface was prepared with C+Y (pH 7.9) and 10%

acrylamide. Cells were pre-cultured in acid C+Y (pH 6.8) and right before inoculation

on the slide they were resuspended in fresh C+Y (pH 7.9) as explained before.

Microscopy images were analyzed using MicrobeTracker [58].

Mathematical model

A mathematical model of the network of competence regulation (Figure 1) was

developed as a system of ODEs. The model incorporates the protein interactions

involved in sensing CSP via the two-component system formed by ComD and ComE

and exporting it via ComC and ComAB. Additionally, it explicitly models the

interaction of ComE and ComE~P with the gene promoters of *comAB*, *comCDE* and

comX. This is important since ComE~P binds these promoters as a dimer introducing

non-linearity into the system, which underlies the observed bistability. Population

growth is logistic and it is assumed that all the cells are homogeneous. See the

Supplemental information for the equations and further description.

Author Contributions

SMG, RAS, MK, GSvD, and JWV designed research; SMG, RAS and MK performed

experiments; SMG and GSvD developed the model; SM, RAS, MK, FJW, GSvD, and

JWV analyzed data; and SMG, FJW, GSvD and JWV wrote the paper.

Acknowledgments

We thank Martin Ackermann, Melanie Blokesch and two anonymous reviewers for helpful comments on an earlier version of this manuscript and Katrin Beilharz for the *htrA::ery* construct. SMG and GSvD were supported by Starting Independent Researcher Grant 309555 of the European Research Council and a VIDI fellowship (864.11.012) of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO). Work in the Veening lab is supported by the EMBO Young Investigator Program, a VIDI fellowship (864.12.001) and ERC starting grant 337399-PneumoCell.

References

1. Fuqua, W. C., Winans, S. C. & Greenberg, E. P. Quorum sensing in bacteria: the LuxR-LuxI family of cell density-responsive transcriptional regulators. *J. Bacteriol.* **176,** 269–275 (1994).

2. Waters, C. M. & Bassler, B. L. Quorum sensing: cell-to-cell communication in bacteria. *Annu. Rev. Cell Dev. Biol.* **21,** 319–346 (2005).

3. Redfield, R. J. Is quorum sensing a side effect of diffusion sensing? *Trends Microbiol* **10,** 365–370 (2002).

4. Dulla, G. & Lindow, S. E. Quorum size of *Pseudomonas syringae* is small and dictated by water availability on the leaf surface. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **105,** 3082–3087 (2008).

5. Boedicker, J. Q., Vincent, M. E. & Ismagilov, R. F. Microfluidic confinement of single cells of bacteria in small volumes initiates high-density behavior of quorum

sensing and growth and reveals its variability. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed Engl.* **48,**

5908–5911 (2009).

6. Carnes, E. C. *et al.* Confinement-induced quorum sensing of individual

Staphylococcus aureus bacteria. *Nat. Chem. Biol.* **6,** 41–45 (2010).

7. Hense, B. A. *et al.* Does efficiency sensing unify diffusion and quorum sensing?

Nat. Rev. Microbiol. **5,** 230–239 (2007).

8. Alberghini, S. *et al.* Consequences of relative cellular positioning on quorum

sensing and bacterial cell-to-cell communication. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* **292,** 149–

161 (2009).

9. Decho, A. W. *et al.* Autoinducers extracted from microbial mats reveal a surprising

diversity of N-acylhomoserine lactones (AHLs) and abundance changes that may

relate to diel pH. *Environ. Microbiol.* **11,** 409–420 (2009).

10. Peterson, S. N. *et al.* Identification of competence pheromone responsive genes in

Streptococcus pneumoniae by use of DNA microarrays. *Mol. Microbiol.* **51,** 1051–

1070 (2004).

11. Håvarstein, L. S., Coomaraswamy, G. & Morrison, D. A. An unmodified

heptadecapeptide pheromone induces competence for genetic transformation in

Streptococcus pneumoniae. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. **92,** 11140–11144

(1995).

12. Pestova, E. V., Håvarstein, L. S. & Morrison, D. A. Regulation of competence for

genetic transformation in *Streptococcus pneumoniae* by an auto-induced peptide

pheromone and a two-component regulatory system. *Mol. Microbiol.* **21,** 853–862

(1996).

13. Håvarstein, L. & Morrison, D. in *Cell-cell signaling in bacteria* 9–26 (ASM Press,

1999).

14. Chen, J. D. & Morrison, D. A. Modulation of competence for genetic

transformation in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *J. Gen. Microbiol.* **133,** 1959–1967

(1987).

15. Claverys, J.-P. & Havarstein, L. S. Extracellular-peptide control of competence for

genetic transformation in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *Front. Biosci. J. Virtual Libr.*

7, d1798-1814 (2002).

16. Prudhomme, M., Attaiech, L., Sanchez, G., Martin, B. & Claverys, J. P. Antibiotic

stress induces genetic transformability in the human pathogen *Streptococcus*

pneumoniae. *Science* **313,** 89–92 (2006).

17. Echenique, J. R., Chapuy-Regaud, S. & Trombe, M. C. Competence regulation by

oxygen in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*: involvement of ciaRH and comCDE. *Mol.*

Microbiol. **36,** 688–696 (2000).

18. Claverys, J.-P., Prudhomme, M. & Martin, B. Induction of competence regulons as

a general response to stress in gram-positive bacteria. *Annu. Rev. Microbiol.* **60,**

451–475 (2006).

19. Johnston, C., Martin, B., Fichant, G., Polard, P. & Claverys, J.-P. Bacterial

transformation: distribution, shared mechanisms and divergent control. *Nat. Rev.*

Microbiol. **12,** 181–196 (2014).

20. Johnsborg, O. & Havarstein, L. S. Regulation of natural genetic transformation and

acquisition of transforming DNA in *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *FEMS*

MicrobiolRev **33,** 627–642 (2009).

21. Engelmoer, D. J. P. & Rozen, D. E. Competence increases survival during stress in

Streptococcus pneumoniae. *Evol. Int. J. Org. Evol.* **65,** 3475–3485 (2011).

22. Prudhomme, M., Berge, M., Martin, B. & Polard, P. Pneumococcal Competence
Coordination Relies on a Cell-Contact Sensing Mechanism. *PLoS Genet.* **12,**
e1006113 (2016).

23. Yang, J., Evans, B. A. & Rozen, D. E. Signal diffusion and the mitigation of social
exploitation in pneumococcal competence signalling. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* **277,** 2991–
2999 (2010).

24. Hui, F. M., Zhou, L. & Morrison, D. A. Competence for genetic transformation in
Streptococcus pneumoniae: organization of a regulatory locus with homology to
two lactococcin A secretion genes. *Gene* **153,** 25–31 (1995).

25. Ween, O., Gaustad, P. & Håvarstein, L. S. Identification of DNA binding sites for
ComE, a key regulator of natural competence in *Streptococcus pneumoniae. Mol.*
Microbiol. **33,** 817–827 (1999).

26. Martin, B. *et al.* ComE/ComE~P interplay dictates activation or extinction status of
pneumococcal X-state (competence). *Mol. Microbiol.* **87,** 394–411 (2013).

27. Martin, B., Garcia, P., Castanie, M. P. & Claverys, J. P. The *recA* gene of
Streptococcus pneumoniae is part of a competence-induced operon and controls
lysogenic induction. *Mol Microbiol* **15,** 367–379 (1995).

28. Avery, A. T., MacLeod, C. M. & McCarty, M. Studies on the chemical nature of
the substance inducing transformation of pneumococcal types. Induction of
transformation by a desoxyribonucleic acid fraction isolated from Pneumococcus
type III. *J.Exp.Med.* **79,** 137–158 (1944).

29. Slager, J., Kjos, M., Attaiech, L. & Veening, J.-W. Antibiotic-induced replication
stress triggers bacterial competence by increasing gene dosage near the origin. *Cell*
157, 395–406 (2014).

30. Tomasz, A. & Mosser, J. L. On the nature of the pneumococcal activator
substance. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U A* **55,** (1966).

31. Maamar, H. & Dubnau, D. Bistability in the *Bacillus subtilis* K-state (competence)
system requires a positive feedback loop. *Mol.Microbiol.* **56,** 615–624 (2005).

32. Smits, W. K. *et al.* Stripping Bacillus: ComK auto-stimulation is responsible for
the bistable response in competence development. *Mol.Microbiol.* **56,** 604–614
(2005).

33. Lin, D. Y., Huang, S. & Chen, J. Crystal structures of a polypeptide processing and
secretion transporter. *Nature* **523,** 425–430 (2015).

34. Stevens, K. E., Chang, D., Zwack, E. E. & Sebert, M. E. Competence in
Streptococcus pneumoniae is regulated by the rate of ribosomal decoding errors.
mBio **2,** (2011).

35. Ferrell, J. E. Self-perpetuating states in signal transduction: positive feedback,
double-negative feedback and bistability. *CurrOpinCell Biol* **14,** 140–148 (2002).

36. Marks, L. R., Reddinger, R. M. & Hakansson, A. P. High levels of genetic
recombination during nasopharyngeal carriage and biofilm formation in
Streptococcus pneumoniae. *mBio* **3,** (2012).

37. Guiral, S., Mitchell, T. J., Martin, B. & Claverys, J. P. Competence-programmed
predation of noncompetent cells in the human pathogen *Streptococcus*
pneumoniae: genetic requirements. *Proc.Natl.Acad.Sci.U.S.A* **102,** 8710–8715
(2005).

38. Wei, H. & Håvarstein, L. S. Fratricide is essential for efficient gene transfer
between pneumococci in biofilms. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **78,** 5897–5905
(2012).

39. Kjos, M. *et al.* Expression of *Streptococcus pneumoniae* Bacteriocins Is Induced

by Antibiotics via Regulatory Interplay with the Competence System. *PLoS*

Pathog. **12,** e1005422 (2016).

40. Wholey, W.-Y., Kochan, T. J., Storck, D. N. & Dawid, S. Coordinated Bacteriocin

Expression and Competence in *Streptococcus pneumoniae* Contributes to Genetic

Adaptation through Neighbor Predation. *PLoS Pathog.* **12,** e1005413 (2016).

41. Croucher, N. J. *et al.* Horizontal DNA Transfer Mechanisms of Bacteria as

Weapons of Intragenomic Conflict. *PLoS Biol.* **14,** e1002394 (2016).

42. Cornick, J. E. & Bentley, S. D. Streptococcus pneumoniae: the evolution of

antimicrobial resistance to beta-lactams, fluoroquinolones and macrolides.

Microbes Infect. Inst. Pasteur **14,** 573–583 (2012).

43. Lazazzera, B. A. Quorum sensing and starvation: signals for entry into stationary

phase. *Curr.Opin.Microbiol.* **3,** 177–182 (2000).

44. Platt, T. G. & Fuqua, C. What's in a name? The semantics of quorum sensing.

Trends Microbiol. **18,** 383–387 (2010).

45. West, S. A., Winzer, K., Gardner, A. & Diggle, S. P. Quorum sensing and the

confusion about diffusion. *Trends Microbiol.* **20,** 586–594 (2012).

46. Williams, P. & Cámara, M. Quorum sensing and environmental adaptation in

Pseudomonas aeruginosa: a tale of regulatory networks and multifunctional signal

molecules. *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.* **12,** 182–191 (2009).

47. Hense, B. A. & Schuster, M. Core principles of bacterial autoinducer systems.

Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev. MMBR **79,** 153–169 (2015).

48. Liang, W., Pascual-Montano, A., Silva, A. J. & Benitez, J. A. The cyclic AMP

receptor protein modulates quorum sensing, motility and multiple genes that affect

intestinal colonization in *Vibrio cholerae*. *Microbiol. Read. Engl.* **153,** 2964–2975 (2007).

49. Suckow, G., Seitz, P. & Blokesch, M. Quorum sensing contributes to natural transformation of *Vibrio cholerae* in a species-specific manner. *J. Bacteriol.* **193,** 4914–4924 (2011).

50. Pai, A., Tanouchi, Y. & You, L. Optimality and robustness in quorum sensing (QS)-mediated regulation of a costly public good enzyme. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **109,** 19810–19815 (2012).

51. Lee, J. *et al.* A cell-cell communication signal integrates quorum sensing and stress response. *Nat. Chem. Biol.* **9,** 339–343 (2013).

52. Xavier, J. B., Kim, W. & Foster, K. R. A molecular mechanism that stabilizes cooperative secretions in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Mol. Microbiol.* **79,** 166–179 (2011).

53. van Delden, C., Comte, R. & Bally, A. M. Stringent response activates quorum sensing and modulates cell density-dependent gene expression in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *J. Bacteriol.* **183,** 5376–5384 (2001).

54. Dunlap, P. V. & Kuo, A. Cell density-dependent modulation of the *Vibrio fischeri* luminescence system in the absence of autoinducer and LuxR protein. *J. Bacteriol.* **174,** 2440–2448 (1992).

55. Boyer, M. & Wisniewski-Dyé, F. Cell-cell signalling in bacteria: not simply a matter of quorum. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* **70,** 1–19 (2009).

56. Berdahl, A., Torney, C. J., Ioannou, C. C., Faria, J. J. & Couzin, I. D. Emergent sensing of complex environments by mobile animal groups. *Science* **339,** 574–576 (2013).

57. Sorg, R. A., Kuipers, O. P. & Veening, J.-W. Gene Expression Platform for

Synthetic Biology in the Human Pathogen *Streptococcus pneumoniae*. *ACS Synth.*

Biol. **4,** 228–239 (2015).

58. Sliusarenko, O., Heinritz, J., Emonet, T. & Jacobs-Wagner, C. High-throughput,

subpixel precision analysis of bacterial morphogenesis and intracellular spatio-

temporal dynamics. *Mol Microbiol* **80,** 612–627 (2011).

59. Guiral, S., Hénard, V., Granadel, C., Martin, B. & Claverys, J.-P. Inhibition of

competence development in *Streptococcus pneumoniae* by increased basal-level

expression of the ComDE two-component regulatory system. *Microbiol. Read.*

Engl. **152,** 323–331 (2006).

Figures and Legends

Figure 1. Network of competence regulation in *S. pneumoniae*. ComC (C) binds the

membrane protein complex ComAB, and it is processed and exported as CSP to the

extracellular space. CSP binds to the histidine kinase ComD, which is located in the

membrane as a dimer. Upon CSP binding, ComD autophosphorylates and transfers the

phosphate group to the response regulator ComE [12,26]. The phosphorylated form of

ComE (ComE~P) dimerizes and activates transcription of *comAB, comCDE* and *comX*

by binding to their promoters [11,12]. Unphosphorylated ComE can also bind these

promoters, repressing their transcription [26,59]. Synthesis of the alternative sigma factor

ComX directs transcription of genes required for genetic transformation as well as

other functions [10,27]. Two key features of this network are the presence of a positive

feedback loop (since increasing CSP detection leads to increasing CSP production) and

of non-linearity (since ComE~P interacts with the gene promoters as a dimer).

Figure 2. Competence is regulated by cell density. (a,b) Growth curves (OD$_{595nm}$) and competence expression measured as relative luminescence units (RLU) expressed from the promoter of the late competence gene *ssbB* for populations inoculated at a range of densities and grown at pH 7.9 in C+Y medium. In **a**, cells were precultured under acid conditions (pH 6.8), while cells were precultured under non-acid conditions (pH 7.9) in **b**. Four replicates are shown for each of seven inoculation densities (OD$_{595nm}$): 0.1 (Green), 0.05 (Red), 0.01 (Blue), 10^{-3} (Purple), 10^{-4} (Light green), 10^{-5} (Yellow) and 10^{-6} (Brown). Competence does not develop in cells coming from acid preculture and inoculated at a density of 0.1. **c)** Effect of inoculation density on the time until competence initiation (left panel) and the population density at which competence was initiated (right panel). Competence initiation was defined as the time where the RLU signal exceeded 200 units. **d)** Predictions of the mathematical model concerning the effect of inoculation density on the timing of competence initiation (left panel) and the density at which competence initiates (right panel). In the model, competence initiation was defined as the time where the total concentration of ComX times the population density exceeds 2000 units. Non-acid preculture is simulated in the model by setting the initial amount of all proteins in the competence regulatory network to the value they attain when cells are competent. **e)** The model predicts that populations inoculated at lower densities will reach a threshold CSP concentration (dotted line) at a lower density than populations inoculated at higher densities. The effect of inoculation density on the time of competence development is also observed in an unencapsulated mutant (Figure S2).

Figure 3. The effect of initial cell density on the timing of competence development is also observed by time-lapse fluorescence microscopy. Phase contrast and GFP images of cultures started at two different inoculation densities. In **a** the slide containing C+Y medium at pH 7.8 was inoculated with 1.5 µL of cells pre-cultured to OD_{595} 0.1 at pH 6.8 whereas in **b** it was inoculated with 1.5 µL of a 1:25 dilution of the same preculture. The first images (t=0) were taken right after inoculation and the second ones correspond to the time point where the GFP signal per cell is maximum. Image analysis shows that competence starts after 15 min in cells directly inoculated from the pre-culture, whereas it takes 60 min for cells coming from the 1:25 dilution of the preculture. A typical outcome of such an experiment is shown. The error bars correspond to the standard error of the mean.

Figure 4. **Competence is upregulated by higher pH. a)** Effect of pH on growth
curves (left panel) and the dynamics of competence expression (middle panel).
Competence expression was quantified as relative luminescence units (RLU)
normalized by cell density. In the right panel, competence expression is plotted in
relation to cell density. All populations were grown at the indicated pH and inoculated
at a density of OD_{595nm} 0.002. Three replicates are shown for each pH. **b)** Effect of pH
on the population density at which competence was initiated (the density at which
RLU exceeded 200 units). Competence did not develop at pH 7.4 and below. **c)**
Predictions of the model on the effect of the rate of CSP export, r_e, and thus the pH, on
the density of competence initiation. Competence does not develop anymore below a
threshold rate of CSP export.

Figure 5. Competence is simultaneously regulated by cell density, pH and antibiotic stress. Predictions of the mathematical model (**a**) and experimental data (**b**) on the dependency of the time of competence initiation on inoculation density, pH and antibiotic stress. The x-axis in **a** corresponds to the rate of CSP export in the model, r_e, which is a proxy for pH. The color scales with the time of competence initiation with more intense red corresponding to faster development of competence. Black represents no competence development. In **b** each box corresponds to the average initiation time of three replicates. Both the model and the experimental data show that competence develops faster at higher pH and higher inoculation densities. **c**) Antibiotics induce competence at pH values that repress natural competence development. **d**) At pH values that are not repressive for competence development (pH > 7.4), competence develops faster in the presence of antibiotics. The stars indicate which conditions are plotted in **c** and **d**.

Figure 6. A bistable regime for competence development. a) Extracellular

concentration of CSP in response to the rate of CSP export. The model predicts the

existence of a region where competence always switches on regardless of the initial

conditions (which would correspond to pH > 7.4) and of a bistable region (bordered by

the dashed lines). In the latter, the initial conditions can either switch on or not CSP

production and subsequently competence development. (Inset) In particular, the model

predicts that in this region non-acid cell history can allow competence development if

enough cells are inoculated since they can produce enough CSP to remain competent.

The inoculation densities are 0.1 (Blue) and 0.01 (Brown) and both the number of

ComX molecules (solid line) and the CSP concentration (dashed line) are shown. **b**)

Growth curves and competence expression measured as RLU units normalized by

density for cells coming from acid preculture (pH 6.8) and inoculated in medium at pH

7.4 with different initial concentrations of CSP. Three replicates are shown per

treatment and all the cultures are inoculated at OD_{595} 0.002. **c**) Growth curves and

competence expression measured as RLU units normalized by density for cells coming

from non-acid preculture (pH 7.9) and inoculated in medium at pH 7.4 at different

initial densities. Three replicates are shown per inoculation density. Competence does

not develop for cells inoculated at the same densities but coming from acid preculture

(pH 6.8) (Figure 5b, left panel, second column).