Adaptation to warming increases the strength of an algal-grazer interaction in naturally heated streams

Authors

C. -Elisa Schaum[1]*, Richard Ffrench-Constant[2], Chris Lowe[1,2], Jón S. Ólafsson[3], Daniel Padfield[1] & Gabriel Yvon-Durocher[1]*

Author affiliations

1 Environment and Sustainability Institute, University of Exeter, Penryn, Cornwall TR10 9EZ, UK

2 Centre for Ecology and Conservation, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Exeter, Penryn, Cornwall, TR10 9FE, U.K.

3. Marine and Freshwater Research Institute, Árleyni 22, 112 Reykjavik, Iceland.

* Corresponding authors: g.yvon-durocher@exeter.ac.uk, c.l.schaum@exeter.ac.uk

Author Contributions:
GYD conceived the experiment. GYD and ES supervised the experiment, analysed data, and all authors wrote the manuscript.

Data accessibility statement: All data will be made available as supporting information should the manuscript be accepted. R-Code for analysis will be available from the authors on request.

Keywords: Consumer-resource interactions, global warming, metabolism, thermal adaptation, interaction strength

Number of Figures: 3
List: Figure 1: Map and experimental set-up. 2. Thermal reaction norms of grazer metabolic rates. 3. Long and short-term effects of elevated temperature on interaction strength and metabolic rates.
Number of Tables: 2
List: 1. Physical and chemical characteristics of geothermal streams. 2. Parameter estimates and output of gnls models.
Number of cited references: 67

ABSTRACT

Trophic interactions are important determinants of the structure and functioning of

ecosystems. As the metabolism and consumption rates of ectotherms increase sharply with

rising temperature, there are currently major concerns that global warming will increase the

strength of trophic interactions, destabilizing food webs, and altering ecosystem structure and

function. We used geothermally warmed streams that span a ~10 ºC temperature gradient to

investigate the interplay between the thermal response of respiration, local adaptation, and

the interaction strength between the keystone gastropod grazer, the wandering snail *Radix*

balthica, and a common algal resource. Populations from a warm stream (~28ºC) had higher

maximal metabolic rates and optimal temperatures across all measurement temperatures than

those from a colder stream (~17ºC), suggesting local adaptation of metabolic rates. A

reciprocal transplant experiment demonstrated that the interaction strength between the

grazer and its resource were highest for both populations when transplanted into the warm

stream. In line with the thermal response curves for respiration, interaction strengths of the

warm-adapted grazers were higher than their cold-adapted counterparts in both the warm and

the cold stream. These findings suggest that warming can increase the strength of algal-grazer

interactions both through the thermodynamic effects of higher temperatures on physiological

rates and through correlated increases in *per capita* metabolism and consumption as

organisms adapt to warmer temperatures.

Keywords: Consumer-resource interactions, global warming, metabolism, thermal

adaptation, interaction strength

INTRODUCTION

The strength of consumer-resource interactions (e.g. the effect of a consumer on the

population density of its prey) play a critical role in shaping the stability of food webs (May

1973; Paine 1980; McCann *et al.* 1998; Otto *et al.* 2007). Grazing is an important class of

consumer-resource interaction, determining the flux of energy and materials from autotrophs

to heterotrophs. There are currently major concerns that global warming will increase the

impact of grazers on algal or plant communities because the ingestion and respiration rates of

heterotrophs tend to be more sensitive to rising temperatures than rates of photosynthesis and

growth in autotrophs (O'Connor 2009; Gilbert et al. 2014; West and Post 2016). Stronger

interactions have the potential to destabilise food webs and consequently, warming induced

increases in interaction strengths could have fundamental implications for ecosystem

structure and function. For example, elevated grazing rates in aquatic ecosystems, driven by

the mismatch in thermal sensitivity between autotrophs and heterotrophs, are a key driver of

projected declines in aquatic primary production over the 21st century in models of ocean

biogeochemistry (Laufkötter *et al.* 2015).

The effects of temperature on metabolic rates and traits associated with consumer-

resource interactions (e.g. consumption rates, handling times) often follow characteristic

unimodal thermal response curves, in which rates increase exponentially to an optimum and

decline rapidly thereafter (Dell *et al.* 2011, 2014; Englund *et al.* 2011; Rall *et al.* 2012;

Gilbert *et al.* 2014). Integrating thermal responses for metabolism and interaction-traits with

dynamical models of consumer-resource interactions offers a promising framework for

predicting food web responses to global warming (Vasseur and McCann 2005; Shurin et al.

2012; Binzer et al. 2016). However, thermal response curves are often evolutionarily flexible

(Angilletta *et al.* 2003; Kingsolver *et al.* 2004; Deutsch *et al.* 2008; Kingsolver and Huey

2008) and can shift as organisms adapt to novel thermal environments, meaning that rapid

evolution could modulate the effects of rising temperatures on the strength of species

interactions. For example, if thermal adaptation serves to down-regulate metabolic rates at

higher temperatures (Addo-Bediako *et al.* 2002), then rapid evolutionary responses to

warming could mitigate predicted increases in consumer-resource interaction strength. How

adaptation to warming affects rates of metabolism and in turn, the strength of consumer-

resource interactions, is largely unknown, limiting our ability to predict how trophic

interactions will change in response to warming in the long-term.

There is evidence from studies across naturally occurring thermal gradients over large

spatial scales, that local thermal adaptation can play an important role in shaping the strength

of species interactions (Barton 2011; De Block *et al*. 2012). While these studies provide

important insights into how consumer-resource interactions are shaped by evolution across

thermal gradients (Fukami and Wardle 2005), their usefulness for understanding the

mechanisms underlying responses to rapid climate warming might be limited, because other

factors, such as day length, light intensity and precipitation, tend to be confounded with

temperature along such broad scale spatial gradients. Furthermore, the timescales over which

local adaptation has occurred in such broad scale studies could be much longer than the rapid

evolutionary change required to keep pace with climate warming (Loarie *et al.* 2009;

Hoffmann and Sgrò 2011). Here, we focus on the *interplay* between the effects of local

thermal adaptation on metabolism and the strength of a keystone grazing interaction (the

gastropod *Radix balthica,* which grazes algal biofilms in streams) in naturally warmed

Icelandic geothermal streams spanning a gradient of 11ºC. Critically, temperature is the main

abiotic factor that varies among streams in the catchment and is not correlated with pH,

conductivity or inorganic nutrient concentrations (see Table 1), and the streams are thought to

have been subject to geothermal heating for at least the last century (O'Gorman *et al.* 2012).

This system therefore provides the opportunity to investigate the mechanisms that shape how

temperature and local adaptation influence species interactions in a natural system, where the

effects of confounding factors are minimised. Specifically, we ask (i) can the underlying

responses of metabolism to temperature explain the magnitude of the effects of warming on

the strength of algal-grazer interactions? (ii) Can local thermal adaptation dampen the direct

effects of warming on the strength of consumer-resource interactions?

113
114   **METHODS**
115
Study site

The streams are located North of the Icelandic Hveragerði valley, in the south east of the

Hengil high temperature geothermal field (N64° 0' 2.944" W21° 11' 17.451") and consist of a

catchment of 11 streams spanning a temperature gradient of approximately 20 ºC (see Figure

1 and SI Figure 1). Two streams, stream 5 (17.5 ºC ± 4.5 ºC, hereafter 'cold stream') and

stream 11A (28.3 ºC ± 1.3 ºC, hereafter 'warm stream'), were chosen for experiments due to

their close proximity, large temperature difference and the abundance of the keystone grazer,

Radix balthica. The grazer plays an important functional role geothermal stream ecosystems,

where grazer biomass as well as grazing rates are strongly influenced by temperature

(O'Gorman *et al.* 2012). The two streams are similar in all other measured physical and

chemical characteristics but differ in average temperature by 11 ºC (see Table 1), and hence

present an opportunity to investigate how the effects of warming and local adaptation interact

to shape the thermal dependence of consumer-resource interactions.

Grazer metabolism

To quantify whether local adaptation to the different thermal regimes in the two adjacent

streams resulted in divergence in metabolic traits of *R. balthica* we measured the acute

responses of respiration to a broad gradient in temperature. We collected 33 individuals of

similar weight and length from each stream, which were cleaned from any algal debris to

avoid carry-over of a food source into the tank or subsequent respiratory measurements on

the oxygen electrode. The snails were kept overnight in aerated tanks at the average stream

temperature of origin and in the absence of a food source to minimise any potential effects of

differences in food quantity or quality between streams. Respiration was quantified as the

rate of oxygen consumption in a Clark-Type oxygen electrode, measured between 4 – 44 ºC

in 4 ºC increments (11 temperatures in total). At each temperature, respiration was measured

for 3 individuals, and a different set of individuals was measured at each temperature (i.e.

each animal was only subjected to a single assay). Individuals were allowed 15 minutes at the

assay temperature prior to the measurements. The subsequent thermal responses of

respiration were quantified using a modification of the Sharpe-Schoolfield equation (see

Schoolfield *et al.* (1981) for the original equation):

$$\ln\big(b(T)\big) = E_a \left(\frac{1}{kT_c} - \frac{1}{kT}\right) + \ln\big(b(T_c)\big) + \alpha \ln(M_i) - \ln\left(1 + e^{E_h\left(\frac{1}{kT_h} - \frac{1}{kT}\right)}\right) \qquad (1)$$

where $b(T)$, is the *per capita* metabolic rate (µmol O$_2$ L^{-1} h^{-1}) at temperature T in Kelvin (K),

k is Boltzmann's constant (8.62×10^{-5} eV K^{-1}), E_a is an apparent activation energy (in eV) for

the metabolic process, ln ($b(T_c)$) is the rate of metabolism normalised to an arbitrary

reference temperature, T_c = 18 ºC, where no low or high temperature inactivation is

experienced. M_i is the mass (g) of an individual i, α is the allometric scaling exponent that

characterises the power-law relation of mass and metabolic rate (Brown *et al.* 2004). E_h

characterizes temperature-induced inactivation of enzyme kinetics above T_h where half the

enzymes are rendered non-functional. Differentiating equation (1) and solving for the global

maxima yields an expression for the optimum temperature

$$T_{opt} = \frac{E_h T_h}{E_h + kT_h \ln\left(\frac{E_h}{E_a} - 1\right)} \qquad (2)$$

Equation (1) differs from the Sharpe-Schoolfield equation (Sharpe & DeMichele 1977;

Schoolfield *et al.* 1981) in a number of ways. First, we account for the power law relation

between body mass and metabolic rate, M^{α} (Brown *et al.* 2004). Second, we exclude

parameters from Eq. (1) used to characterize low-temperature inactivation due to insufficient

data to quantify this phenomenon in our analysis. Second, rather than characterize

temperature effects below T_{opt} using the Eyring (1935) relation, $\left(\frac{T}{T_c}\right)e^{E_a\left(\frac{1}{kT_c}-\frac{1}{kT}\right)}$, we instead

use the simpler Boltzmann factor, $e^{E_a\left(\frac{1}{kT_c}-\frac{1}{kT}\right)}$. This simplification enables an explicit solution

for T_{opt} (Eq. 2) and facilitates more direct comparison with previous work on the temperature

dependence of metabolism using metabolic theory (e.g. Gillooly *et al* 2001; Savage *et al*

2004; Brown *et al* 2004; Allen *et al.* 2005).

The parameters, ln $b(T_c)$, α, E_a, E_h, T_h, and T_{opt}, in Eqs. (1) & (2) represent traits

characterising the metabolic thermal response that we expect to be under selection in *R.*

balthica inhabiting the hot and cold streams. We tested for differences in each of the

parameters between the populations of *R. balthica* by fitting the respiration data to Eq. (1)

using generalised non-linear least squares regression (within the 'gnls' function in the 'nlme'

package for R, package version 3.1-128) and including 'origin' as a two level factor (i.e.

'cold' and 'warm' stream). We tested for differences between populations for each parameter

by sequentially removing the effect of 'origin' on each parameter and comparing the Akaike

information criterion for small sample sizes (AICc) for all possible models (see SI Table 1

and SI Table 2) using the 'aictab' and 'modavg' functions from the AICcmodavg package

(package version 2.1-0). The model chosen for further exploration was that with the lowest

(AICc) value. Model averaging was carried out when models fell within 2 AICc units of each

other, and the conditional averages of the parameters were used for curve fitting and

interpretation (see also Table 2). The relative importance of the fixed factors in the averaged

model was determined using the sum of their relative weights.

Reciprocal transplant experiment

The reciprocal transplant experiments to assess the effects of temperature and local

adaptation on algal-grazer interactions were carried out by placing snails in microcosms

consisting of a tissue culture flask on which diatom biofilms had been established. Diatoms

of the genera, *Acnanthes, Nitzschia, Navicula*, and *Gomphonema* are common in streams

across the Hengill volcanic area (Guðmundsdóttir *et al.* 2012) were ordered from culture

collections (Culture collection of algae and protozoa and Sciento) and grown in the

laboratory in mixed assemblages to yield common resource for testing the effects of

temperature and local adaptation on grazing . The diatom assemblages were inoculated into

Corning plastic translucent flasks (maximum volume 1L) with 20 mL COMBO medium

(Kilham *et al.* 1998), and brought to a salinity of 5-10 (equivalent to approximately 5-10 g

salts/kg water) to match the slightly elevated salinity and conductivity found in these thermal

stream environments (Guðmundsdóttir *et al.* 2012). The flasks were turned onto their sides to

allow for a larger area of biofilm growth on the base (~ 60 cm^2 in total per flask) and

communities were left to grow for 14 days prior to the experiment. After 14 days all flasks

had substantial biofilm development on the base and were used as microcosms for the *in situ*

reciprocal transplant experiment. Analysis of control flasks (no grazer) showed that growth of

the diatom lawn *per se* did not differ significantly for flasks placed in hot or cold streams (SI

Figure 2). Thus, any changes to the biofilm biomass in the experiment can be attributed to the

per capita effects of the grazer.

The experiment consisted of 3 treatments (each with 6 replicate microcosms placed in

each of the 2 streams): (i) a control microcosm in which a biofilm was present and no *R.

balthica* were added, (ii) an 'origin' treatment in which *R. balthica* that were resident in the

stream were added to microcosms, and (iii) a 'transplanted' treatment in which *R. balthica*

that were from the adjacent stream were added to microcosms. *R. balthica* individuals were

collected from the 2 streams the day before the experiment and were starved for 24h in the

laboratory in aerated tanks at the average temperature of the stream of origin. There was no

significant difference in average snail weight between the two streams (see SI Figure 3).

Microcosms were assembled by adding 3 snails of similar body dimensions (0.35 ± 0.03 g of

R. balthica weight reported as blotted fresh weight throughout) and 100 mL of 0.4 μm

filtered water from the stream in which the microcosm was to be placed. This resulted in a

grazer density of 5 individuals m^{-2}, which was comparable to the average *in situ* density in

the streams (see SI Figure 4). This design was preferred to a set-up with each microcosm

holding a single grazer, which attempt to exclude the effects of mutual interference on

feeding behaviour (e.g. Lang et al. (2011), Skalski and Gilliam (2001),Rall *et al.* (2010);

Vucic-Pestic *et al.* (2011)), because (i) the experimental densities are representative of

natural conditions; and (ii) the consumption rates of a single individual were insufficient to

detect a significant change in algal biomass. The microcosms were submerged in each stream

and the snails were left to graze for 48 hours. We observed no grazer mortality over the

experimental period.

Interaction strength

At the end of the experiment, algal biomass in each of the microcosms was quantified via

methanol chlorophyll extraction (modified from Holm-Hansen & Riemann (1978)). Here, the

walls of the microcosms were scrubbed until all biofilm particles were in suspension. The

solution was filtered onto a 0.4μm GF/F filter, which was then ground in methanol for 5

minutes. The samples were centrifuged at 3500 rpm for 15 minutes and the absorbance of the

supernatant was measured at 632nm, 665nm, and 750nm. Total chlorophyll content in μg

mL^{-1} was then calculated as described in Holm-Hansen & Riemann (1978). The *per capita*

interaction strength in each microcosm was then estimated by calculating the dynamic index

(DI, see also Berlow *et al.* (1999; 2004) for a technically similar set-up):

$$DI = \frac{\ln\left(\frac{N}{D}\right)}{Yt} \tag{3}$$

where N is total chlorophyll (sum of Chl a + Chl c) content of control, D total chlorophyll in

the grazed microcosm, Y is the grazer biomass (g C), and t is time in hours. Snail blotted wet

weight was converted to carbon mass (in grams) using conversion factors that assume dry

weight to be 7.5% of the blotted wet weight (Ricciardi & Bourget 1998) and a carbon content

of 22% dry weight (Burgmer *et al.* 2010).

We carried out two analyses using the data from the reciprocal transplant experiment.

The first analysis, used a generalised linear model (GLM), with 'interaction strength' as the

response variable and 'origin' ('cold' or 'warm' stream) and 'transplant temperature' (17.5

and 28.3 ºC) as potentially interacting factors. We used this analysis to determine (i) whether

interaction strengths differed between snails that originated from the warm or cold streams

(e.g. a main effect of 'origin'); (ii) whether interaction strengths were temperature dependent

(e.g. a main effect of 'temperature'); and (iii) whether the temperature dependence of

interaction strength differed between the snails from the cold and warm streams (e.g.

interaction between 'origin' and 'temperature'). The design of the reciprocal transplant

experiment also enabled us to disentangle short-term temperature responses attributable to

acclimation (e.g. responses to the temperature in the 'transplanted' stream) from those

reflecting processes operating over longer, evolutionary time scales (e.g. adaptation to the

temperature in the stream of 'origin'). The second GLM included 'interaction strength' as the

response variable and 'timescale' ('short' or 'long') and 'transplant temperature' (17.5 and

28.3 ºC) as potentially interacting factors. Here, 'short-term' temperature responses were

characterised as the change in interaction strength between the stream of origin and the

transplant stream. By contrast, the 'long-term' temperature response was characterised as the

change in interaction strength comparing measurements made only when the snails were in

their stream of origin. We re-express the transplant temperature data as Boltzmann

temperatures $\left(\frac{1}{kT_c} - \frac{1}{kT}\right)$ so that the coefficients of the model yield activation energies in units

of eV (see E. (1)). In this analysis, a significant interaction between 'transplant temperature'

and 'timescale' would demonstrate that the temperature dependence of interaction strength

differs between the 'short-term' (E_{short}), and 'long-term' (E_{long}). We assume that E_{short}

captures rapid physiological plasticity (e.g. acclimation) in interaction strength in response to

a change in temperature and E_{long} captures both acclimation and adaptation (evolution).

Consequently, the component of the temperature sensitivity attributable to evolution is given

by $E_{evol} = E_{long} - E_{short}$.

RESULTS

Metabolic thermal response curves

The allometric scaling coefficient, α, and the apparent activation energy, E_a, were consistent

between the populations of *R. balthica* from the cold and warm streams (see Table 2 for

model comparison and estimated parameter values). The temperature normalised rate of

respiration, ln $b(T_c)$, and T_h (the temperature at which respiration was 50% inactivated) were

both higher in the population of *R. balthica* from the warm stream. Because the optimum

temperature, T_{opt}, depends strongly on T_h (see Eq. (2)), T_{opt} was higher in *R. balthica* from

the warmer stream (T_{opt} warm = 38.25 ± 0.6 ºC; T_{opt} cold = 33.05 ± 1.5 ºC). As ln $b(T_c)$ and

T_{opt} were both higher, the warm populations of *R. balthica* had elevated *per capita* metabolic

rates across the full range of measurement temperatures (Fig. 2).

Local adaptation of interaction strength

Interaction strength increased with elevated transplant temperature for the populations of *R.*

balthica from both the warm and the cold streams (Fig. 3; main effect of 'transplant

temperature' (GLM, $t_{1,21}=2.56$; $p<0.01$). Furthermore, interaction strengths were consistently

higher for the populations of *R. balthica* from the warm stream in both transplant

temperatures (Fig. 3; GLM main effect of 'origin' $t_{1,21} = 2.90$; $p <0.005$). These findings are

consistent with the higher respiration rates observed in the warm population (Fig. 2) and

highlight the association between metabolism and interaction strength.

Disentangling the effects of acclimation and adaptation on interaction strength

Our experimental design enabled us to compare temperature sensitivities that capture short-

term thermal acclimation (e.g. changes in interaction strength in response to the reciprocal

transplant) as well as the long-term temperature sensitivity, which also includes effects of

local adaptation (e.g. changes in rates between warm and cold populations quantified in the

stream of origin). We found that interaction strength increased with temperature in both the

short- and the long-term (Fig. 3). However, the magnitude of the temperature response was

significantly larger in the long-term (Fig. 3; interaction between 'transplant temperature' and

'timescale' on interaction strength; GLM $t_{1,18}= -2.19$; $p < 0.05$), where, the average E_{short} was

0.46 eV, while E_{long} was significantly higher at 0.99 eV. This divergence between the short-

and long-term temperature sensitivities implies a non-trivial contribution of evolution in

amplifying the effects of temperature on interaction strength *in situ*, with the contribution of

E_{evol} of 0.51 and 0.53 eV in the cold and warm adapted populations respectively.

DISCUSSION

Understanding how global warming will affect the strength of consumer-resource interactions

and the stability of aquatic food webs is a fundamental challenge in evolutionary ecology that

requires insight on the short-term effects of temperature on metabolism and interaction traits

as well as how these processes are modulated by evolution over longer time scales. There is

evidence from terrestrial (Rall *et al.* 2010; Vucic-Pestic *et al.* 2011; Barton 2011; Brose *et al.*

2012), freshwater (Kratina *et al.* 2012) and marine ecosystems (Sanford 1999), that warming

is likely to increase the strength of consumer-resource interactions, at least in the short-term,

owing to the exponential effects of temperature on the consumption rates of mobile

ectothermic consumers (Dell *et al.* 2014; Gilbert *et al.* 2014). What is less clear however, is

how rapid evolutionary adaptation to rising temperatures will modulate the direct effects of

warming on species interactions. Space-for-time substitutions across broad spatial scales

indicate that local adaptation to different thermal regimes can play an important role in

shaping species interactions, often compensating for the direct effects of temperature on

interaction traits (Barton 2011; De Block *et al.* 2012). Here, we build on this work by

investigating the effects of temperature and local adaptation on the interaction between the

gastropod grazer, *R. balthica,* and its algal resource. Our study contributes novel insights in a

number of ways. First, we explore patterns of local adaptation over a relatively small spatial

scale (m as opposed to km). The two streams in our experiment are separated by

approximately 500 m but differ in temperature by 11 ºC. Because dispersal, gene flow and

genetic divergence among populations in this species are strongly related to geographic

distance (Johansson *et al.* 2016), our study over a relatively small spatial scale, provides

insight into how closely related natural populations evolve in response to warming and is

therefore directly relevant for understanding adaptation to climate change (Richter-Boix *et al.*

2010; Keller *et al.* 2013; Merilä and Hendry 2014). Second, we quantified the effects of

temperature on both metabolic and consumption rates to determine the mechanisms

underpinning patterns of thermal adaptation and their influence on the strength of consumer-

resource interactions.

We found significant variation in the thermal response curves for respiration between

the populations of *R. balthica* from the warm and cold streams. The optimum temperature

(T_{opt}) for respiration was higher in the warm population (i.e. metabolic rates peaked at higher

temperatures). Furthermore, the inactivation energy (E_h) was lower in the warm population,

indicating that declines in the rate of respiration after the optimum (i.e. at high temperatures)

were less pronounced than in grazers from the cold stream, where metabolic rates peaked at

lower temperatures and declined markedly at temperatures above T_{opt}. These divergences in

metabolic traits suggest that the metabolism of the warm and cold populations of *R. balthica*

reflect local adaptation to the different thermal regimes in these streams. Whilst the higher

T_{opt} and lower E_h in the warm population were in line with expectations assuming local

thermal adaptation, we found no evidence that metabolic performance at high temperature

was traded-off against performance at low temperature. Instead, metabolic rates were higher

for *R. balthica* from the warm stream across all measurement temperatures. These results are

in broad agreement with the "hotter is better" hypothesis, which proposes that maximal

performance of organisms with higher optimal temperatures should be greater than those with

lower optimum temperatures because of the thermodynamic constraints imposed by high

temperatures on enzyme kinetics (Huey and Kingsolver 1993; Kingsolver *et al.* 2004;

Angilletta *et al.* 2010). Indeed maximal respiration rates in the population from the warm

stream were greater than those from the cool (warm stream: 8.26 ± 0.41 µmol O_2 L^{-1} h^{-1}, cool

stream: 7.3 ± 0.22 µmol O_2 L^{-1} h^{-1}). The lower E_h, (i.e. the steepness of the decline of the

thermal reaction norm past the optimum)*,* and higher ln $b(T_c)$, i.e. the rate of respiration

normalised to 18 ºC, in the warm population also meant that the thermal response curve for *R.*

balthica from the warm stream was broader. In agreement with previous work (e.g. on

bacteriophages, Knies *et al.(* 2009)), our data for the gastropod *R. balthica* indicate that

adaptation to higher temperatures resulted in both greater maximal metabolic performance

and a broader metabolic thermal reaction norm.

The general patterns observed in the metabolic traits were also reflected in the effects

of temperature on interaction strength. Interaction strength was higher for individuals placed

in the warm stream, irrespective of their stream of origin. These findings suggest that

elevated temperatures increase consumption rates though the effects of temperature on

respiratory physiology, but local adaptation to warmer environments also results in a

correlated increase in metabolism and interaction strength at low temperature. This may have

important wider implications for the effects of warming on the structure, functioning and

stability of aquatic food webs (Rall *et al.* 2010; O'Connor *et al.* 2011; Vucic-Pestic *et al.*

2011; Dell *et al.* 2014; Fussmann *et al.* 2014; Gilbert *et al.* 2014, Fussmann *et al.* 2017). If

adaptive responses to increasing temperature give rise to higher maximal rates of metabolism

and consumption as well as elevating rates at lower temperatures, then the effects of warming

on the strength of consumer-resource interactions in the long-term could be greater than

previously anticipated (Gilbert *et al.* 2014). Indeed, work on experimental warming of

aquatic ecosystems has shown that increases in the strength of top-down control can have

profound effects on community structure and ecosystem processes (Burgmer and Hillebrand

2011; Kratina *et al*. 2012; Yvon-Durocher *et al*. 2015). Elevated grazing rates at warmer

temperatures can have a wide range of impacts in aquatic systems, with evidence for both

increases (Yvon-Durocher *et al.* 2015) and decreases (Burgmer and Hillebrand 2011) in algal

species richness, biomass and productivity.

In our experiments, the thermal sensitivities of metabolic rates were much larger than

those of interaction strengths in the short-term (e.g. 0.96 and 0.45 eV respectively), in line

with findings in other invertebrate systems (Rall *et al.* 2010; Vucic-Pestic et al. 2011;

Fussmann et al. 2014). These findings suggest that rates of grazing and metabolism were

clearly linked, but became decoupled when individuals experience rapid changes in

temperature that depart substantially from those in their local environment. In the short-term,

if increases in metabolic demands with temperature are greater than those of consumption

rates (as found here), then less energy will be transferred from the resource to the consumer

(i.e. more is lost through respiration, see also Rall *et al.* 2010). If such imbalances are

maintained over long periods of time then starvation of the consumer can ultimately result in

a decline in top-down control on the resource (Fussman *et al.* 2014, Binzer *et al* .2016).

However, when consumers' feeding rates are more sensitive to temperature than metabolic

rates, interaction strengths can become amplified in warmer environemnts, leading to faster

resource depletion and eventually driving either the resource or the consumer to extinction

(Vasseur &McCann 2005). Long-term effects of temperature on interaction strengths have so

far only been explored using food web models, parameterised using temperature sensitivities

derived from short-term experiments (Vasseur &McCann 2005; Rall *et al.* 2010; Fussman *et*

al. 2014). Consequently, such analyses don't capture the capacity for thermal adaptation to

modulate *per capita* rates. Our results highlight substantial differences between the short- and

long-term effects of temperature on interaction strength; implying that thermal adaptation

plays an important role in maintaining the balance between metabolic and consumption rates

over the long-term.

We quantified the effects of local adaptation (evolution) on interaction strength by

comparing the short-and long-term effects of temperature in the reciprocal transplant

experiment. The short-term temperature response (E_{short}) captures the effects of physiological

plasticity over the 48h experiment. Conversely, the long-term response (E_{long}) also accounts

for processes operating over longer, evolutionary timescales. The E_{long} value was higher than

E_{short}, implying a significant role for evolution in shaping the effects of temperature on *in situ*

interaction strengths. Notably, the higher E_{long} was driven both by elevated grazing rates in

the warm populations in the warm stream and lower rates in the cold populations in the cold

stream. These results diverge from expectations based on the metabolic cold adaptation

hypothesis (Addo-Bediako *et al.* 2002) which would predict adaptation to higher

temperatures should dampen the acute effects of temperature on metabolic rates. On the

contrary, our results suggest that adaptation to warming amplified the effects of temperature

on metabolic as well as grazing rates. The lower interaction strengths in the population of *R.*

balthica locally adapted to the colder stream highlight that evolution can have unexpected

effects on species interactions. The evolutionary maintenance of lower than anticipated

grazing rates in the cold stream could be selected for since lower grazing rates might result in

greater food chain stability and/or stoichiometric homeostasis (Sterner & Elser 2002, Cross et

al. 2005; 2015) under the prevailing temperature regime. Thus, understanding the impacts of

environmental change on the strength of consumer-resource interactions over timescales that

are relevant to the rate of climate change (e.g. gradual warming over decades) will require an

appreciation both of the direct effects of rising temperatures on species interactions and the

reciprocal feedback between ecological and evolutionary dynamics (Fussmann *et al.* 2007;

Gravel *et al.* 2010; Loeuille 2010; Urban 2013; Barraclough 2015)

Conclusions

We used a natural geothermal temperature gradient to investigate how warming influences

the strength of algal-grazer interactions via the direct effects of temperature on metabolism

and consumption, and indirect feedbacks through evolutionary adaptation. Metabolic rates

and interaction strength increased with temperature in the same way for both the warm- and

cold-adapted populations of *R. balthica*, suggesting that rapid changes in temperature have a

consistent effect on interactions between mobile consumers and sessile resources, mediated

by the effects of temperature on consumer metabolic rates (Dell *et al.* 2014). However, the

warm-adapted populations had higher metabolic and grazing rates across all measurement

temperatures compared to their cold-adapted counterparts. These findings are consistent with

the 'hotter is better and broader' hypothesis (Huey and Kingsolver 1993; Knies *et al.* 2009;

Angilletta *et al.* 2010) (e.g. adaptation to warming gives rise to higher maximal metabolic

rates and broader thermal reaction norms). In consequence, our results suggest that warming

could increase the strength of algal-grazer interactions, which are often 'keystone'

interactions in aquatic systems, both via the thermodynamic effects of higher temperatures on

enzyme kinetics and through correlated increases in *per capita* metabolism and consumption

as organisms adapt to warmer temperatures.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest

Acknowledgments

The authors thank Eoin O'Gorman for comments on an earlier version of this manuscript.

This study was funded by a Leverhulme Trust research grant (RPG-2013-335), and an ERC

starting grant (ERC-StG 677278) awarded to GYD; and the University of Exeter.

References
Addo-Bediako, A., S. L. Chown, and K. J. Gaston. 2002. Thermal tolerance, climatic

variability, and latitude. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 267:739–

745.

Allen, A.P., Gillooly, J.F. & Brown, J.H. (2005). Linking the global carbon cycle to

individual metabolism. Funct. Ecol., 19, 202–213.

Angilletta, M. J., Jr, R. B. Huey, and M. R. Frazier. 2010. Thermodynamic Effects on

Organismal Performance: Is Hotter Better? Physiological and Biochemical Zoology 83:197–

206.

Angilletta, M. J., Jr, R. S. Wilson, C. A. Navas, and R. S. James. 2003. Tradeoffs and the

evolution of thermal reaction norms. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 18:234–240.

Barraclough, T. G. 2015. How Do Species Interactions Affect Evolutionary Dynamics Across

Whole Communities? Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 46:25–48.

Barton, B. T. 2011 Local adaptation to temperature conserves top-down control in a

grassland food web. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 278:3102–

3107.

Berlow, E. L., A. M. Neutel, J. E. Cohen, P. C. De Ruiter, B. Ebenman, M. Emmerson, J. W.

Fox, et al. 2004. Interaction strengths in food webs: issues and opportunities. Journal of

Animal Ecology 73:585–598.

Berlow, E. L., S. A. Navarrete, C. J. Briggs, M. E. Power, and B. A. Menge. 1999.

Quantifying Variation in the Strengths of Species Interactions. Ecology 80:2206.

Binzer, A., C. Guill, B. C. Rall, and U. Brose. 2016. Interactive effects of warming,

eutrophication and size structure: impacts on biodiversity and food-web structure. Global

Change Biology 22:220–227.

Brose, U., J. A. Dunne, J. M. Montoya, O. L. Petchey, F. D. Schneider, and U. Jacob. 2012.

Climate change in size-structured ecosystems. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal

Society B: Biological Sciences 367:2903–2912.

Burgmer, T., and H. Hillebrand. 2011. Temperature mean and variance alter phytoplankton

biomass and biodiversity in a long-term microcosm experiment. Oikos 120:922–933.

Burgmer, T., J. Reiss, S. A. Wickham, and H. Hillebrand. 2010. Effects of snail grazers and

light on the benthic microbial food web in periphyton communities. Aquatic Microbial

Ecology 61:163–178.

Cross, W. F., J. M. Hood, J. P. Benstead, A. D. Huryn, and D. Nelson. 2015. Interactions

between temperature and nutrients across levels of ecological organization. Global Change

Biology 21:1025–1040.

Cross, W. F., J. P. Benstead, P. C. FROST, and S. A. Thomas. 2005. Ecological

stoichiometry in freshwater benthic systems: recent progress and perspectives. Freshwater

Biology 50:1895–1912.

De Block, M., K. Pauwels, M. Van Den Broeck, L. DE Meester, and R. Stoks. 2012*a*. Local

genetic adaptation generates latitude-specific effects of warming on predator-prey

interactions. Global Change Biology 19:689–696.

Dell, A. I., S. Pawar, and V. M. Savage. 2011. Systematic variation in the temperature

dependence of physiological and ecological traits. Proceedings of the National Academy of

Sciences 108:10591–10596.

Dell, A. I., S. Pawar, and V. M. Savage. 2014. Temperature dependence of trophic

interactions are driven by asymmetry of species responses and foraging strategy. J Anim Ecol

83:70–84.

Deutsch, C. A., J. J. Tewksbury, R. B. Huey, K. S. Sheldon, C. K. Ghalambor, D. C. Haak,

and P. R. Martin. 2008. Impacts of climate warming on terrestrial ectotherms across latitude.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 105:6668–6672.

Englund, G., G. Öhlund, C. L. Hein, and S. Diehl. 2011. Temperature dependence of the

functional response. Ecology Letters 14:914–921.

Eyring (1935) J. them. Phys. 3, 107.

Fukami, T., and D. A. Wardle. 2005. Long-term ecological dynamics: reciprocal insights

from natural and anthropogenic gradients. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological

Sciences 272:2105–2115.

Fussmann, G. F., M. Loreau, and P. A. Abrams. 2007. Eco-evolutionary dynamics of

communities and ecosystems. Functional Ecology 21:465–477.

Fussmann, K. E., F. Schwarzmüller, U. Brose, A. Jousset, and B. C. Rall. 2014. Ecological

stability in response to warming. Nature Climate Change 4:206–210.

Fussmann, K.E., Rosenbaum, R., U. Brose, Rall, B. 2017 Interactive effects of shifting body

size and feeding adaptation drive interaction strengths of protist predators under warming

bioRxiv 101675; doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/101675

Gilbert, B., T. D. Tunney, K. S. McCann, J. P. DeLong, D. A. Vasseur, V. Savage, J. B.

Shurin, et al. 2014. A bioenergetic framework for the temperature dependence of trophic

interactions. (T. Wootton, ed.)Ecology Letters 17:902–914.

Gilchrist, G. W. 1995. Specialists and Generalists in Changing Environments. I. Fitness

Landscapes of Thermal SensitivityThe American Naturalist 146:252–270.

Gillooly, J.F., Brown, J.H., West, G.B., Savage, V.M. & Charnov, E.L.2001.

Effects of size and temperature on metabolic rate. Science, 293, 2248–2251.

Gravel, D., T. Bell, C. Barbera, T. Bouvier, T. Pommier, P. Venail, and N. Mouquet. 2010.

Experimental niche evolution alters the strength of the diversity-productivity relationship.

Nature 469:89–92.

Hoffmann, A. A., and C. M. Sgrò. 2011. Climate change and evolutionary adaptation. Nature

470:479–485.

Huey, R. B., and J. G. Kingsolver. 1993. Evolution of Resistance to High Temperature in

Ectotherms. The American Naturalist 142:S21–S46.

Johansson, M. P., M. Quintela, and A. Laurila. 2016. Genetic divergence and isolation by

thermal environment in geothermal populations of an aquatic invertebrate. Journal of

Evolutionary Biology 29 (9), 1701-1712

Keller, I., J. M. Alexander, R. Holderegger, and P. J. Edwards. 2013. Widespread phenotypic

and genetic divergence along altitudinal gradients in animals. Journal of Evolutionary

Biology 26:2527–2543.

Kingsolver, J. G., and R. B. Huey. 2008. Size, temperature, and fitness: three rules.

Evolutionary Ecology Research 10:251–268.

Kingsolver, J. G., G. J. Ragland, and J. G. Shlichta. 2004. Quantitative genetics of continuous

reaction norms: thermal sensitivity of caterpillar growth rates. Evolution.

Knies, J. L., J. G. Kingsolver, and C. L. Burch. 2009*a*. Hotter Is Better and Broader: Thermal

Sensitivity of Fitness in a Population of Bacteriophages. The American Naturalist 173:419–

430.

Knies, J. L., J. G. Kingsolver, and C. L. Burch. 2009*b*. Hotter is better and broader: thermal

sensitivity of fitness in a population of bacteriophages. The American Naturalist 173:419–

430.

Kratina, P., H. S. Greig, and P. L. Thompson. 2012. Warming modifies trophic cascades and

eutrophication in experimental freshwater communities. Ecology 93:1421–1430.

Lang, B., B. C. Rall, and U. Brose. 2011. Warming effects on consumption and intraspecific

interference competition depend on predator metabolism. Journal of Animal Ecology 81:516–

523.

Laufkötter, C., M. Vogt, N. Gruber, M. Aita-Noguchi, O. Aumont, L. Bopp, E. Buitenhuis, et

al. 2015. Drivers and uncertainties of future global marine primary production in marine

ecosystem models. Biogeosciences 12:6955–6984.

Levins, R. 1968. Evolution in changing environments: some theoretical explorations.

Loarie, S. R., P. B. Duffy, H. Hamilton, G. P. Asner, C. B. Field, and D. D. Ackerly. 2009.

The velocity of climate change. Nature 462:1052–1055.

Loeuille, N. 2010. Influence of evolution on the stability of ecological communities. Ecology

Letters 13:1536–1545.

Lynch, M., and W. Gabriel. 1987. Environmental tolerance. American Naturalist.

McCann, K., A. Hastings, and G. R. Huxel. 1998. Weak trophic interactions and the balance

of nature. Nature 395:794–798.

May, R.M. (1973). Qualitative stability in model ecosystems. *Ecology*, 54, 638–641

Merilä, J., and A. P. Hendry. 2014. Climate change, adaptation, and phenotypic plasticity: the

problem and the evidence. Evolutionary Applications 7:1–14.

O'Connor, M. I. 2009. Warming strengthens an herbivore–plant interaction. Ecology 90:388–

398.

O'Connor, M. I., B. Gilbert, and C. J. Brown. 2011. Theoretical predictions for how

temperature affects the dynamics of interacting herbivores and plants. The American

Naturalist 178:626–638.

OGorman, E. J., D. E. Pichler, G. Adams, J. P. Benstead, H. Cohen, N. Craig, W. F. Cross, et

al. 2012. Impacts of Warming on the Structure and Functioning of Aquatic Communities:

Individual- to Ecosystem-Level Responses. Advances in Ecological Research (1st ed., Vol.

47). Elsevier Ltd.

Otto, S. B., B. C. Rall, and U. Brose. 2007. Allometric degree distributions facilitate food-

web stability. Nature 450:1226–1229.

Paine, R. T. 1980. Food webs: linkage, interaction strength and community infrastructure.

Journal of Animal Ecology 49:666.

Rall, B. C., O. Vucic-Pestic, R. B. Ehnes, M. Emmerson, and U. Brose. 2010. Temperature,

predator-prey interaction strength and population stability. Global Change Biology 16:2145–

2157.

Rall, B. C., U. Brose, M. Hartvig, G. Kalinkat, F. Schwarzmuller, O. Vucic-Pestic, and O. L.

Petchey. 2012. Universal temperature and body-mass scaling of feeding rates. Philosophical

Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367:2923–2934.

Richter-Boix, A., C. Teplitsky, B. Rogell, and A. Laurila. 2010. Local selection modifies

phenotypic divergence among Rana temporariapopulations in the presence of gene flow.

Molecular Ecology 19:716–731.

Sanford, E. 1999. Regulation of keystone predation by small changes in ocean temperature.

Science 283:2095–2097.

Savage, V.M., Gillooly, J.F., Brown, J.H., West, G.B. & Charnov, E.L. 2004.

Effects of body size and temperature on population growth. Am. Nat., 163, 429–

441. Schoolfield, R. M., P. J. H. Sharpe, and C. E. Magnuson. 1981. Non-linear regression of

biological temperature-dependent rate models based on absolute reaction-rate theory. Journal

of Theoretical Biology 88:719–731.

Sharpe & DeMichele 1977

Sentis, A., J. Morisson, and D. S. Boukal. 2015. Thermal acclimation modulates the impacts

of temperature and enrichment on trophic interaction strengths and population dynamics.

Global Change Biology 21:3290–3298.

Shurin, J. B., J. L. Clasen, H. S. Greig, P. Kratina, and P. L. Thompson. 2012. Warming

shifts top-down and bottom-up control of pond food web structure and function.

Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 367:3008–3017.

Skalski, G. T., and J. F. Gilliam. 2001. Functional responses with predator interference:

viable alternatives to the holling type ii model Ecology 82:3083.

Sterner, R.W & Elser, J.J (2002) Ecological Stoichiometry:The Biology of Elements from

Molecules to the Biosphere, *Princeton University press*

Urban, M. C. 2013. Evolution mediates the effects of apex predation on aquatic food webs.

Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 280:20130859–20130859.

Vasseur, D. A., and K. S. McCann. 2005. A mechanistic approach for modeling temperature-

dependent consumer-resource dynamics. The American Naturalist 166:184–198.

Verges, A., P. D. Steinberg, M. E. Hay, A. G. B. Poore, A. H. Campbell, E. Ballesteros, K. L.

Heck, et al. 2014. The tropicalization of temperate marine ecosystems: climate-mediated

changes in herbivory and community phase shifts. Proceedings of the Royal Society B:

Biological Sciences 281:20140846–20140846.

Vergés, A., C. Doropoulos, H. A. Malcolm, M. Skye, M. Garcia-Pizá, E. M. Marzinelli, A.

H. Campbell, et al. 2016. Long-term empirical evidence of ocean warming leading to

tropicalization of fish communities, increased herbivory, and loss of kelp. Proceedings of the

National Academy of Sciences 113:13791–13796.

Vucic-Pestic, O., R. B. Ehnes, and B. C. Rall. 2011. Warming up the system: higher predator

feeding rates but lower energetic efficiencies. . Global Change Biology, 17: 1301–1310.

doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02329.x

West, D. C., and D. M. Post. 2016. Impacts of warming revealed by linking resource growth

rates with consumer functional responses. (S. Behmer, ed.)Journal of Animal Ecology

85:671–680.

Yvon-Durocher, G., A. P. Allen, M. Cellamare, M. Dossena, K. J. Gaston, M. Leitao, J. M.

Montoya, et al. 2015. Five Years of Experimental Warming Increases the Biodiversity and

Productivity of Phytoplankton. (S. A. Levin, ed.)PLoS Biology 13:e1002324–22.

Tables

Table 1. Physical and chemical characteristics of the streams. Temperature data were
collected over a 3-day period. All other parameters were collected on the first day of the day
of the experiment. Temperature displayed as means ± 1SD. All other data were collected for
correlation with temperature across the entire catchment area (all 11 streams), i.e. replication
was on the level of stream identity.

Parameter	Stream 5	Stream 11 A
Average Temperature (5 days)	17.5 ± 4.5	28.3 ± 1.3
pH	7.63	7.17
Conductivity	273.6	235.7
NO_2	0.22	0.24
NO_3	0.57	0.29
NH_4	0.17	0.19
PO_4	0.27	0.35

Table 2. Parameter estimates and output from the best fitting gnls model to the thermal
response curves of respiration rates. Differences in treatments are given in **bold.** Parameter
estimates are taken from the model along with their standard deviations (± 1SD). C = cold
stream. W = warm stream. See Supporting Information for details on model selection and
information on AICsc scores for all possible models. Here, the model average of the
conditional average output for the four best models (within 2 AICc units of each other) is
displayed.

Non-linear mixed model output for respiration rates (R)		
Treatment effect on	Estimate	± 1SD
E_a	C: 0.96	0.06
ln $R(T_c)$	**C: 6.833**	**0.18**
	W: 7.06	**0.13**
E_h	**C: 5.01**	**0.97**
	W: 3.16	**0.96**
T_h [K]	**C: 307.16 (34.01)**	**0.94**
(ºC)	**W: 314.15**	
	(41.00)	**1.69**
		0.78
α	0.36	0.03

641
642

Figure 1: Map and experimental set-up. Top panel: The catchment area, with streams used in this experiment indicated by black (for the
colder stream 5 with 17.5 ℃ ± 4.5 ℃) and red (for the warmer stream 11A with 28.3 ℃ ± 1.3 ℃) snail icons. **Lower panel**: Schematic
overview of experimental set-up for the grazing experiment.

Figure 2 Thermal response curves for respiration. Thermal response curves of respiration rates as a function of increasing temperature for
populations of the snail *Radix balthica* from the cold (black) and warm (red) stream. Lines are derived from fitting a modified Sharpe-Schoolfied
equation (see methods) to the rate data. Snails from the warm stream have higher temperature normalised metabolic rates ($\ln R(T_c)$) at all
measurement temperatures and have higher optimal temperatures (T_{opt}), than snails from the cold stream. The inactivation energy (E_h) is lower in
snails from the warm stream, resulting in a curve that is both broader and elevated in comparison to the thermal response curve of respiration for
snails from the cold stream.

Figure 3 Long-term and short-term effects of stream temperature on interaction strength and metabolic rates. Long-term and short-term
effects of temperature in interaction strength measured via the dynamic index. Populations originating from the warm stream have stronger
interaction strength indices in all environments and the highest dynamic index overall was found for snails from the warm stream in their
original environment. Interaction strength increased with temperature both in the short-term (E_{short}, dashed blue lines) and in the long-term (E_{long},
solid blue line), with E_{long} significantly greater than E_{short}. Black boxplots for snails from the colder stream, while red denotes snails from the
warmer stream.

Figure 1: Map and experimental set-up. Top panel: The catchment area, with streams used in this experiment indicated by black (for the colder stream 5 with 17.5 ºC ± 4.5 ºC) and red (for the warmer stream 11A with 28.3 ºC ± 1.3 ºC) snail icons. **Lower panel**: Schematic overview of experimental set-up for the grazing experiment.