

# lme4qtl: linear mixed models with flexible covariance structure for genetic studies of related individuals

Andrey Ziyatdinov<sup>1\*</sup>, Miquel Vázquez-Santiago<sup>2,3</sup>, Helena Brunel<sup>2</sup>,  
Angel Martinez-Perez<sup>2</sup>, Hugues Aschard<sup>1,4</sup> and Jose Manuel Soria<sup>2</sup>

May 18, 2017

<sup>1</sup>Department of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts, United States of America

<sup>2</sup>Unitat de Genòmica de Malalties Complexes, Institut d'Investigació Biomèdica Sant Pau (IIB-Sant Pau), Barcelona, Spain

<sup>3</sup>Unitat d'Hemostàsia i Trombosi, Hospital de la Santa Creu i Sant Pau, Barcelona, Spain

<sup>4</sup>Centre de Bioinformatique, Biostatistique et Biologie Intégrative (C3BI), Institut Pasteur, Paris, France

**Keywords:** linear mixed models, covariance, related individuals, GWAS, lme4

## Abstract

**Summary:** Quantitative trait locus (QTL) mapping in genetic data often involves analysis of correlated observations, which need to be accounted for to avoid false association signals. This is commonly performed by modeling such correlations as random effects in linear mixed models (LMMs). The R package *lme4* is a well-established tool that implements major LMM features using sparse matrix methods; however, it is not fully adapted for QTL mapping association and linkage studies. In particular, two LMM features are lacking in the base version of *lme4*: the definition of random effects by custom covariance matrices; and parameter constraints, which are essential in advanced QTL models. Apart from applications in linkage studies of related individuals, such functionalities are of high interest for association studies in situations where multiple covariance matrices need to be modeled, a scenario not covered by many genome-wide association study (GWAS) software.

To address the aforementioned limitations, we developed a new R package *lme4qtl* as an extension of *lme4*. First, *lme4qtl* contributes new models for genetic studies within a single tool integrated with *lme4* and its companion packages. Second, *lme4qtl* offers a flexible framework for scenarios with multiple levels of relatedness and becomes efficient when covariance matrices are sparse. We showed the value of our package using real family-based data in the Genetic Analysis of Idiopathic Thrombophilia 2 (GAIT2) project.

**Availability and implementation:** *lme4qtl* is available at <https://github.com/variani/lme4qtl>.

**Contact:** ziyatdinov@hsph.harvard.edu

## 1 Introduction

Many genetic study designs induce correlations among observations, including, for example, family or cryptic relatedness, shared environments and repeated measurements. The standard statistical approach used in quantitative trait locus (QTL) mapping is linear mixed models (LMMs), which is able to effectively assess and estimate the contribution of an individual genetic locus in the presence of correlated

---

\*to whom correspondence should be addressed

observations [1, 2, 3, 4]. However, LMMs are known to be computationally expensive when applied in large-scale data. Indeed, the LMM approach has the cubic computational complexity on the sample size per test [3]. This is a major barrier in today's genome-wide association studies (GWAS), which consist in performing millions of tests in sample size of 10,000 or more individuals. Therefore, recent methodological developments have been focused on reduction in computational cost [4].

There has been a notable improvement in computation of LMMs with a single genetic random effect. Both population-based [3, 5, 6] and family-based methods [7] use an initial operation on eigendecomposition of the genetic covariance matrix to rotate the data, thereby removing its correlation structure. The computation time drops down to the quadratic complexity on the sample size per test. When LMMs have multiple random effects, the eigendecomposition trick is not applicable and computational speed up can be achieved by tuning the optimization algorithms, for instance, using sparse matrix methods [8] or incorporating Monte Carlo simulations [9].

However, the decrease in computation time comes at the expense of flexibility. In particular, most efficient LMM methods developed for GWAS assume a single random genetic effect in model specification and support simple study designs, for example, prohibiting the analysis of longitudinal panels. We have developed a new *lme4qtl* R package that unlocks the well-established *lme4* framework for QTL mapping analysis. We demonstrate the computational efficiency and versatility of our package through the analysis of real family-based data from the Genetic Analysis of Idiopathic Thrombophilia 2 (GAIT2) project [10]. More specifically, we first performed a standard GWAS, then showed an advanced model of gene-environment interaction [11], and finally estimated the influence of data sparsity on the computation time.

## 2 Methods

### 2.1 Linear mixed models

Consider the following polygenic linear model that describes an outcome  $y$ :

$$y = X\beta + Zu + e$$

where  $n$  is the number of individuals,  $y_{n \times 1}$  is vector of size  $n$ ,  $X_{n \times p}$  and  $Z_{n \times n}$  are incidence matrices,  $p$  is the number of fixed effects,  $\beta_{p \times 1}$  is a vector of fixed effects,  $u_{n \times 1}$  is a vector of a random polygenic effect, and  $e_{n \times 1}$  is a vector of the residuals errors. The random vectors  $u$  and  $e$  are assumed to be mutually uncorrelated and multivariate normally distributed,  $\mathcal{N}(0, G_{n \times n})$  and  $\mathcal{N}(0, R_{n \times n})$ . The covariance matrices are parametrized with a few scalar parameters such as  $G_{n \times n} = \sigma_g^2 A_{n \times n}$  and  $R_{n \times n} = \sigma_e^2 I_{n \times n}$ , where  $A$  is a genetic additive relationship matrix and  $I$  is the identity matrix. In a general case, the model is extended by adding more random effects, for instance, the dominance genetic or shared-environment components.

We have implemented three features in *lme4qtl* to adapt the mixed model framework of *lme4* for QTL mapping analysis. First, we introduce the positive-definite covariance matrix  $G$  into the random effect structure, as described in [12, 13]. Provided that random effects in *lme4* are specified solely by  $Z$  matrices, we represent  $G$  by its Cholesky decomposition  $LL^T$  and applied a substitution  $Z^* = ZL$ , which takes the  $G$  matrix off from the variance of the vector  $u$

$$\text{Var}(u) = ZGZ^T = ZLL^TZ^T = Z^*(Z^*)^T$$

Second, we address situations when  $G$  is positive semi-definite, which happen if genetic studies include twin pairs [1]. To define the  $Z^*$  substitution in this case, we use the eigendecomposition of  $G$ . Although  $G$  is not of full rank, we take advantage of *lme4'* special representation of covariance matrix in linear mixed model, which is robust to rank deficiency [14, p. 24-25].

Third, we extend the *lme4* interface with an option to specify restrictions on model parameters. Such functionality is necessary in advanced models, for example, for a trait measured in multiple environments (Supplementary Note 1).

## 2.2 Implementation of *lme4qtl*

As an extension of the *lme4* R package, *lme4qtl* adopts its features related to model specification, data representation and computation [14]. Briefly, models are specified by a single formula, where grouping factors defining random effects can be nested, partially or fully crossed. Also, underlying computation relies on sparse matrix methods and formulation of a penalized least squares problem, for which many optimizers with box constraints are available. While *lme4* fits linear and generalized linear mixed models by means of `lmer` and `glmer` functions, *lme4qtl* extends them in `relmatLmer` and `relmatGlmer` functions. The new interface has two main additional arguments: `relmat` for covariance matrices of random effects and `vcControl` for restrictions on variance component model parameters. Since the developed `relmatLmer` and `relmatGlmer` functions return output objects of the same class as `lmer` and `glmer`, these outputs can be further used in complement analyses implemented in companion packages of *lme4*, for example, *RLRsim* [15] and *lmerTest* [16] R packages for inference procedures.

## 2.3 Analysis of the GAIT2 data

The sample from the Genetic Analysis of Idiopathic Thrombophilia 2 (GAIT2) project consisted of 935 individuals from 35 extended families, recruited through a proband with idiopathic thrombophilia [10]. We conducted a genome-wide screening of activated partial thromboplastin time (APTT), which is a clinical test used to screen for coagulation-factor deficiencies [17]. The samples were genotyped with a combination of two chips, that resulted in 395,556 single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) after merging the data. We performed the same quality control pre-processing steps as in the original study: phenotypic values were log-transformed; two fixed effects, age and gender, and two random effects, genetic additive and shared house-hold, were included in the model; individuals with missing phenotype values were removed and all genotypes with a minimum allele frequency below 1% were filtered out, leaving 263,764 genotyped SNPs in 903 individuals available for GWAS. We compared the performances between our package and SOLAR [2, 18], one of the standard tool in family-based QTL mapping analysis.

## 3 Results

We considered three models for the analysis of APTT in the GAIT2 data, namely polygenic, association and gene-environment interaction.

Before conducting the analysis, we organized trait, age, gender, individual identifier `id`, house-hold identifier `hhid` variables and SNPs as a table `dat`. The additive genetic relatedness matrix was estimated using the pedigree information and stored in a matrix `mat`. A polygenic model `m1` was fitted to the data by the `relmatLmer` function as follows.

```
m1 <- relmatLmer(aptt ~ age + gender + (1|id) + (1|hhid), dat,
  relmat = list(id = mat))
```

The proportion of variance explained by the genetic effect (heritability) was 0.56, and its 95% confidence interval, estimated by profiling the deviance [14], was [0.45; 0.84].

We further tested whether the genetic effect was statistically significant by simulations of the restricted likelihood ratio statistic, as implemented in the `exactRLRT` function of the *RLRsim* R package [15]. The p-value of the test was below  $2.2 \times 10^{-16}$ .

For a single SNP named `rs1`, the `update` function created an association model `m2` from `m1` and the `anova` function then performed the likelihood ratio test.

```
m2 <- update(m1, . ~ . + rs1)
anova(m1, m2)
```

To automate the GWAS analysis, we created an example `assocLmer` function with several options such as different tests of association and parallel computation. By using the `assocLmer` function, we have replicated some loci previously known for APTT [17] (Supplementary Figure 1) applying the likelihood

ratio test and running the analysis in parallel on a desktop computer (2.8GHz quad-core Intel Core i5 processor, 8GB RAM).

The GWAS computation time of the association model with two random effects by *lme4qtl* was 7.6 hours. We performed the same analyses, using SOLAR, and observed a computation time 3 fold larger (25.1 hours, Supplementary Table 1). In additional experiments varying the number of fixed and random effects, the *lme4qtl* package was also several times faster than SOLAR (Supplementary Table 1, Supplementary Figure 2), owing to the efficient *lme4* implementation of sparse matrix methods. Note that when a model has a single random effect, SOLAR had a option to apply the eigendecomposition trick and substantially speed up the computation (3.8 hours), while this option has not been implemented in *lme4qtl* (6.6 hours).

We then considered an advanced model of gene-environment interaction, an extension of the polygenic model  $m_1$ , where the variance of genetic random effect is a function of environment (gender). Supplementary Notes 1 and 2 contain details on the model specification and numerical results obtained on the GAIT2 data.

We also evaluated how the *lme4qtl* computation time depends on the sparse structure of covariance matrices (Supplementary Figure 3). When artificially reducing sparsity of the genetic relatedness matrix in the GAIT2 data, we found that the time required to fit the polygenic model increases substantially: it becomes an order of magnitude greater once the sparsity changes from the GAIT2 level 0.98 to 0.60.

## 4 Discussion and Conclusions

We have extended the *lme4* R package, a well-established tool for linear mixed models, for application to QTL mapping. The new *lme4qtl* R package has adopted the *lme4*'s powerful features and contributes with two key building blocks in QTL mapping analysis, custom covariance matrices and restrictions on model parameters.

Of the many existing *lme4*-based R packages, the closest to *lme4qtl* is the *pedigreemm* R package [13]. Although this package does support analysis of related individuals, the relationships are coded using pedigree annotations rather than custom covariance matrices. Furthermore, the *pedigreemm* package uses the Cholesky decomposition, which is not feasible for positive semi-definite covariance matrices. Hence, to our knowledge, the *lme4qtl* R package is the most comprehensive extension of *lme4* to date for QTL mapping analysis.

Our package has also limitations. In particular, introducing covariance matrices in random effects implies that some of the statistical procedures implemented in *lme4* might not be applicable anymore. For instance, bootstrapping in the `update` function from *lme4* cannot be directly used for *lme4qtl* models. Furthermore, the residual errors in *lme4* models are only allowed to be independent and identically distributed, and *ad hoc* solutions need to be applied in more general cases, as we showed for the gene-environment interaction model. However, this restriction on the form of residual errors may be relaxed in the future *lme4* releases, according to its development plan on the official website [19]. Also, *lme4qtl* cannot compete with tools optimized for particular GWAS models with a single genetic random effect: *lme4qtl* allows for association models with multiple random effects. Last, *lme4qtl* is mostly applicable to datasets with sparse covariances, while its use in population-based studies may lead to a considerable overhead in computation time.

In conclusion, the *lme4qtl* R package enables QTL mapping models with a versatile structure of random effects and efficient computation for sparse covariances.

## 5 Acknowledgments

A.Z. thanks Donald Halstead for reading and providing feedback on early drafts of the manuscript.

## 6 Author contributions

A.Z., M.V.S. and H.B. conceived the study; A.Z. implemented the software; A.Z., M.V.S., H.B. and A.M.P analyzed the data; H.A. and J.M.S directed the study; A.Z. and H.A. drafted the manuscript; All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

## References

- [1] Michael Lynch, Bruce Walsh, et al. *Genetics and analysis of quantitative traits*, volume 1. Sinauer Sunderland, MA, 1998.
- [2] L Almasy and J Blangero. Multipoint quantitative-trait linkage analysis in general pedigrees. *American journal of human genetics*, 62(5):1198–211, May 1998.
- [3] Hyun Min Kang, Noah A Zaitlen, Claire M Wade, Andrew Kirby, David Heckerman, Mark J Daly, and Eleazar Eskin. Efficient control of population structure in model organism association mapping. *Genetics*, 178(3):1709–1723, 2008.
- [4] Jian Yang, Noah A Zaitlen, Michael E Goddard, Peter M Visscher, and Alkes L Price. Advantages and pitfalls in the application of mixed-model association methods. *Nature genetics*, 46(2):100–106, 2014.
- [5] Christoph Lippert, Jennifer Listgarten, Ying Liu, Carl M. Kadie, Robert I. Davidson, and David Heckerman. FaST linear mixed models for genome-wide association studies. *Nature Methods*, 8(10):833–837, 2011.
- [6] Xiang Zhou and Matthew Stephens. Genome-wide efficient mixed-model analysis for association studies. *Nature genetics*, 44(7):821–824, 2012.
- [7] John Blangero, Vincent P Diego, Thomas D Dyer, Marcio Almeida, Juan Peralta, Jack W Kent Jr, Jeff T Williams, Laura Almasy, and Harald HH Göring. A kernel of truth: statistical advances in polygenic variance component models for complex human pedigrees. *Advances in genetics*, 81:1, 2013.
- [8] Arthur R Gilmour, BJ Gogel, BR Cullis, R Thompson, D Butler, et al. Asreml user guide release 3.0. VSN International Ltd, Hemel Hempstead, UK, 2009.
- [9] Po-Ru Loh, Gaurav Bhatia, Alexander Gusev, Hilary K Finucane, Brendan K Bulik-Sullivan, Samuela J Pollack, Teresa R de Candia, Sang Hong Lee, Naomi R Wray, Kenneth S Kendler, et al. Contrasting genetic architectures of schizophrenia and other complex diseases using fast variance-components analysis. *Nature genetics*, 2015.
- [10] Laura Martin-Fernandez, Andrey Ziyatdinov, Marina Carrasco, Juan Antonio Millon, Angel Martinez-Perez, Noelia Vilalta, Helena Brunel, Montserrat Font, Anders Hamsten, Juan Carlos Souto, et al. Genetic determinants of thrombin generation and their relation to venous thrombosis: results from the GAIT-2 project". *PloS one*, 11(1):e0146922, 2016.
- [11] John Blangero. Statistical genetic approaches to human adaptability. *Human biology*, 81(5):523–546, 2009.
- [12] DA Harville and TP Callanan. Computational aspects of likelihood-based inference for variance components. In *Advances in statistical methods for genetic improvement of livestock*, pages 136–176. Springer, 1990.
- [13] AI Vazquez, DM Bates, GJM Rosa, D Gianola, and KA Weigel. Technical note: an r package for fitting generalized linear mixed models in animal breeding. *Journal of animal science*, 88(2):497–504, 2010.
- [14] Douglas Bates, Martin Mächler, Ben Bolker, and Steve Walker. Fitting linear mixed-effects models using lme4. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 67(1):1–48, 2015.

- [15] Fabian Scheipl, Sonja Greven, and Helmut Kuechenhoff. Size and power of tests for a zero random effect variance or polynomial regression in additive and linear mixed models. *Computational Statistics & Data Analysis*, 52(7):3283–3299, 2008.
- [16] Alexandra Kuznetsova, Per Bruun Brockhoff, and Rune Haubo Bojesen Christensen. *lmerTest: Tests in Linear Mixed Effects Models*, 2016. R package version 2.0-33.
- [17] Weihong Tang, Christine Schwienbacher, Lorna M Lopez, Yoav Ben-Shlomo, Tiphaine Oudot-Mellakh, Andrew D Johnson, Nilesch J Samani, Saonli Basu, Martin Gögele, Gail Davies, et al. Genetic associations for activated partial thromboplastin time and prothrombin time, their gene expression profiles, and risk of coronary artery disease. *The American Journal of Human Genetics*, 91(1):152–162, 2012.
- [18] Andrey Ziyatdinov, Helena Brunel, Angel Martinez-Perez, Alfonso Buil, Alexandre Perera, and Jose Manuel Soria. solarius: an r interface to SOLAR for variance component analysis in pedigrees. *Bioinformatics*, 32(12):1901–1902, 2016.
- [19] <https://github.com/lme4/lme4>. Last accessed 27 January 2017.