HUMANS USE A LOCAL CODE FOR TACTILE PERCEPTION

Arindam Bhattacharjee^{1,2}, Christoph Braun^{3,4,5} and Cornelius Schwarz^{1,2}

- 1 Werner Reichardt Center for Integrative Neuroscience, Systems Neuroscience
- 2 Hertie Institute for Clinical Brain Research, Dept. Cognitive Neurology
- 3 MEG Center

Eberhard Karls University, Tübingen, Germany

- 4 Department of Psychology and Cognitive Science
- 5 Center for Mind/Brain Sciences

University of Trento, Italy

Running title: Local coding in tactile perception

With 29 text pages and 4 figures

Character counts (with blanks): Title 46, Total 37.823 Word counts: Abstract 237

Correspondence: cornelius.schwarz@uni-tuebingen.de (C. Schwarz)

Classification: Biological Sciences, Neuroscience, Psychological and Cognitive Sciences Keywords: human, fingertip, psychophysics, tactile system, tactile coding

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

1

1 Abstract

2 Humans are classically thought to use either spectral decomposition or averaging to identify 3 vibrotactile signals. These are general purpose 'global' codes that require integration of the 4 signal over long stretches of time. Natural vibrotactile signals, however, likely contain short 5 signature events that can be detected and used for inference of textures, instantaneously, 6 with minimal integration, suggesting a hitherto ignored 'local code'. Here, by employing 7 pulsatile stimuli and a change detection psychophysical task, we studied whether humans 8 make use of local cues. We compared three local cues based on instantaneous skin position 9 and its derivatives, as well as six global cues, calculated as summed powers (with 10 exponents 1,2, and 3) of velocity and acceleration. Deliberate manipulation of pulse width 11 and amplitude (local+global) as well as pulse frequency (global) allowed us to disentangle 12 local from global codes. The results singled out maximum velocity, an instantaneous code, 13 as a likely and dominant coding variable that humans rely on to perform the task. Comparing 14 stimuli containing versus lacking local cues, demonstrated that performances exclusively 15 using global cues are rather poor compared to situations where local ones are available as 16 well. Our results are in line with the notion that humans not only do use local cues but that 17 local cues may even play a dominant role in perception. Our results parallel previous results 18 in rodents, pointing to the possibility that quite similar coding strategies evolved in whisker 19 and finger tactile systems.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

2

20 Significance statement

21 The brain is believed to select coding symbols in sensory signals that would most efficiently 22 convey functionally relevant information about the world. For instance, the visual system is 23 widely believed to use spatially local features, like edge orientation, to delineate a visual 24 scene. For the tactile system only global, general purpose coding schemes have been 25 discussed so far. Based on the insight that moving contacts, characteristic for active touch, 26 feature short-lived stick-slip events, frictional movements that transfer fair amounts of texture 27 information, one should expect the brain to use a temporally local code, extracting and 28 instantaneously analyzing short snippets of skin movement. Here, we provide the first 29 analytical psychophysical evidence in humans that this indeed is the case.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

3

30 Introduction

31 A sensory signal can transmit information about the world using either local or global 32 variables. A classical dispute in vision research was between one view that early vision 33 essentially is a set of global linear filters (Campbell and Maffei, 1974) and an opposing view 34 that interpreted neurons as local feature detectors (Barlow, 1972; Hubel and Wiesel, 1968). In research on the tactile sense, local coding was rarely considered - at least for pure 35 36 temporal coding of texture (roughness). Global coding schemes like spectral decomposition and finding the 'best frequency', as well as signal averaging to come up with 'intensity', 37 38 dominated the thinking in tactile research of finger/hand related perception (LaMotte and 39 Mountcastle, 1975; Luna et al., 2005; Yoshioka et al., 2001). However, insight from tribology 40 and recent research in whisker-based sensation and perception raised the possibility that 41 vibrotactile signals contain local features (i.e. short-lasting events) that can be extracted and 42 these features contain large amounts of texture information (Schwarz, 2016) (Fig. 1A). In the 43 whisker system, evidence supporting local codes come firstly from biomechanical studies 44 describing prominent stick-slip movements (Oladazimi et al., 2018; Ritt et al., 2008; Wolfe et 45 al., 2008), secondly from neuronal coding on the ascending tactile pathway, revealing that neuronal spikes respond to local features in the tactile stimulus (Chagas et al., 2013; Jones 46 et al., 2004; Maravall et al., 2007; Petersen et al., 2008), and finally from perceptual studies 47 showing that pulsatile whisker deflections, devoid of local cues, are poorly discriminated 48 49 (Gerdjikov et al., 2018, 2010; Waiblinger et al., 2015a, 2015b). Evidence pointing to this 50 direction are also available in the fingertip system. Papillary ridges have been shown to 51 undergo complex shear during lateral movement (Delhaye et al., 2016), the sensory 52 consequences of which may reach perception (Barrea et al., 2018). Further, characteristics 53 of vibrotactile signals as well as skin deformation when tapping support the possibility that 54 tactile signals are processed and perceived instantaneously (Johansson and Birznieks, 55 2004; Lawrence et al., 2000; Pruszynski and Johansson, 2014; Weber et al., 2013).

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

56

57	Here we used psychophysics based on pulsatile fingertip skin indentation to demonstrate for
58	the first time, that humans use local codes. The experimental idea was that the change of
59	single pulses' waveform without changing pulse frequency is a manipulation of local and
60	global variables, whereas manipulation of pulse frequency without waveform changes is a
61	manipulation of global variables (Waiblinger et al., 2015a) alone. Our results strongly
62	indicate that humans do use a local code and may even use it as the dominant code in

63 addition to the classic global ones.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

5

64 Results

We established a Yes/No change detection task. In each trial two 500 ms long pulse trains, concatenated in a seamless way, were presented as vertical indentations to the left index fingertip of participants (Fig. 1BC). After experiencing a single presentation of such stimuli, participants indicated whether they perceived (Yes/No) a stimulus change in the middle of the stimulus presentation (Fig. 1C; black stimulus [4th from top]: correct response – No; all other exemplary stimuli: correct response - Yes).

71 Experiment1

72 Our first aim was to elucidate systematic performance deficits with deliberate manipulation of 73 pulse width and amplitude (as shown in the four upper stimuli of Fig. 1C). In this experiment 74 the pulse frequency of all the trials was kept constant at 90 Hz, and thus, did not provide any 75 cue of stimulus change. In principle, the local changes to pulse waveforms can bring about 76 changes in the global intensity variable as well. The amount of these possible changes. 77 however, depends very much on how intensity is defined. In the literature a variety of 78 intensity definitions have been used, such as linear integration ('mean speed'), or non-linear 79 integration ('power') of different kinematic derivatives (position, velocity, acceleration). In 80 fact, an accepted standard measure of intensity does not exist. Therefore, instead of using 81 one fixed intensity definition, we decided to use an array of them. Since in principle there are infinite ways of defining intensity - we opted for an array of definitions that firstly vary the 82 83 code's characteristics in a systematic way across the stimulus space; presumably, one of 84 the coding definitions would capture specific performance deficits in stimulus space related 85 to the sought-after unknown coding variable. Secondly, we incorporated a non-linear element (taking the signal to the power of >1 before summation) in the definition of intensity 86 87 that systematically varies the emphasis of local features within the vibrotactile signal. This 88 was done to address the possibility that local coding could be realized by a mathematical

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

6

integration with non-linear preprocessing as well (as opposed to the truly local,

90 instantaneous feature extraction that we portrayed above).

91 Intensity was thus defined as the sum (or equivalently as the mean) of the first and second 92 stimulus derivative (i.e. velocity and acceleration) taken to the powers 1, 2, or 3. This choice 93 satisfied the spread in stimulus space. Keeping each of those intensities constant (under the 94 assumption that only pulse amplitude and width are varied), yielded an array of so-called 95 'iso-lines' fanning out from the origin (no change) into relevant sections of the space 96 spanning possible stimulus changes (tagged 'stimulus space' for short throughout this 97 report; Fig 1D). To illustrate the stimulus space, the extreme stimulus changes (in the corners of the stimulus space) are marked with a star and the respective waveforms can be 98 99 looked up in panel C. Thick lines represent iso-lines that keep one of the local variables 100 constant (maximal pulse position, velocity, and acceleration, colored black, gray and pink, 101 respectively) while thin lines represent iso-lines of global variables (shades of green: 102 velocity-based; shades of blue: acceleration-based). It is important to note that two of the 103 local iso-lines overlapped with global ones ('maximum position' with 'mean speed', and 104 'maximum velocity' with 'mean absolute acceleration'). (These overlaps required extra 105 experiments to disentangle them - cf. experiment 2 below).

106 Moreover, our array of (global) intensities was designed to cover as well different degrees of 107 emphasis on local features. To visualize what that means we demonstrate an arbitrary signal 108 containing a shallow local feature in the upper left corner of figure 1E. The signal is 109 differentiated along rows, and is taken to increasing powers along columns. From this 110 demonstration one can easily appreciate that low derivative / low power signals (e.g. 111 speed = $|velocity|^1$) de-emphasize local features, whereas high derivative / high power 112 signals increasingly emphasize them (e.g. *absolute cubic acceleration* = $|acceleration|^3$). 113 Armed with this analytic stimulus design, we set out to measure psychophysical

Armed with this analytic stimulus design, we set out to measure psychophysical

114 performance of 10 participants on stimulus changes located on the iso-lines depicted in

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

7

115 figure 1D. The reference stimulus is located at the origin of the coordinate system spanning 116 changes in pulse amplitude and width (pulses of 40 µm amplitude and 5882 µs width). The 117 comparison stimulus (seamlessly concatenated to the reference stimulus) was picked in 118 each session from a different iso-line (15 equidistant pulse widths between 4167 (easy) and 119 5882 µm (difficult)). Each session comprised 840 trials with 50% no change stimuli 120 (comparison = reference = 5882 μ m) and 50% change stimuli (comparison \neq reference, i.e. 121 30 trials per 14 pulse widths). We refrained from testing global variables based on stimulus 122 'position' because the iso-lines for position-based intensities are located in a part of the 123 stimulus space where human ability of detection of change was superb whenever a stimulus 124 differed ever so slightly from the reference (in the second quadrant, where amplitude 125 increased and width decreased, Fig. 1D). This stimulus area, thus, provided little 126 experimental leverage to gain insights into the tactile codes used (the respective preliminary 127 experiments are not shown).

128 The typical performance of a single participant is shown in figure 2A. It can be seen that the 129 participant shows a remarkably well isolated deficiency centered on the iso-line of maximum velocity (gray). This observation generally held true in all ten participants. Comparing effect 130 131 sizes of the thresholds obtained from all ten participants on the maximum velocity iso-line 132 compared to all other iso-lines showed that the poorest performance was located around the 133 iso-line of maximum velocity (AUC comparing to 7 iso-lines in the order listed in Fig. 1D: 134 [0.98, 0.82, 0.53, 0.5, 0.83, 0.91, 0.90]; corresponding p values in t-tests were [0.015, 0.044, 135 0.624, ~, 0.357, 0.049, 0.055]; n=[10,9,9,~,9, 10, 10]). The best fit logistic functions to the 136 pooled data from ten participants and the respective thresholds are shown in Figure 2BC. It 137 is worth mentioning that in general the psychophysical test was subjectively described as 138 'demanding' by all participants. In fact one person failed on the task (producing no 139 psychometric fit passing p=0.5 in any of the sessions) and was excluded from all the 140 analyses. Two other persons dropped out after a few sessions without giving reasons for their decision. Reflecting the challenging nature of the task we observed a consistently high 141

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

8

false alarm rate of [0.12, 0.18, 0.16, 0.14, 0.09, 0.04, 0.07] on the 7 iso-lines as listed infigure 1D.

144 Experiment 2

So far an unambiguous conclusion about the role of local vs. global variables in mediating 145 146 the poor performance close to the maximum velocity iso-line cannot be reached because the 147 'maximum velocity' iso-line was congruent with that of the global variable 'mean absolute 148 acceleration'. To disentangle local from global variables, here we implemented the 149 procedure of experiment 1 with an additional manipulation of pulse frequency (pf; cf. the bottom two stimuli in Fig. 1C). Pure changes of pulse frequency (4th stimulus from the top in 150 151 Fig. 1C) do not affect instantaneous variables, because the pulse waveform is identical. 152 They do however change the iso-lines of all global variables, which shift downward toward 153 larger decrements in pulse amplitude to balance out the presence of additional pulses. The shift introduced by a change in pulse frequency $\Delta pf = 15 Hz$ is demonstrated by the move 154 155 from the blue $[\Delta pf = 0]$ to red $[\Delta pf = 15Hz]$ curves in Fig. 3A. The thick gray line is the 156 'maximum velocity' iso-line, which does not move when the Δpf cue is added.

157 Pulse frequency is a cue in itself - independent from the abovementioned instantaneous kinematics (local) and intensity (global). In fact, as mentioned above, frequency is the 158 159 second candidate variable, next to intensity, for global coding. Therefore, pulse frequency 160 would be expected to change the detection rate by itself; however, this effect should be the 161 same for all iso-lines. Our choice of $\Delta pf = 15 Hz$ (reference value 90 Hz, comparison value 162 105 Hz) balances a low perceptual effect (mean increment of the probability to report a 'change' 0.15, SD 0.08; as measured in experiment 3) with a large-enough shift of the iso-163 164 line to capture eventual differences in performance. Figure 3B demonstrates the 165 performance of the same participant as shown in figure 2A on stimuli from the three iso-lines 166 depicted in Fig. 3A. The effect of pure global stimuli (frequency and intensity) is reflected in 167 the difference between the blue and gray line. It shows a non-significant mean change in the

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

9

threshold from 1101 μ s (SD 194 μ s) ($\Delta pf = 0$) to 1272 μ s (SD 270 μ s) (t=-2.084, n=8, p=0.08; AUC=0.13). However, the performance on the shifted iso-line of ' Δpf + mean absolute acceleration' (red) is significantly improved to a mean change of threshold of 764 μ s (SD=368 μ s, t=2.868, n=8, p=0.024; AUC=0.99). Figure 3C shows the logistic fits for the pooled performance from all 9 participants. In summary, we found that poor performance was pegged to the local 'maximum velocity' iso-line, and did not move together with the global 'mean absolute acceleration' iso-line.

175 Experiment 3

176 The participants in experiment 2 were in addition tested on pulse trains that exclusively 177 changed in Δpf (cf. the gray stimulus in the schematic of Fig. 1C; only data from 8 of 9 persons are reported here as from the 9th we did not get any logistic fit that crossed a 178 179 probability of correct responses of 0.5). Figure 4A presents the logistic fit to the pooled trials of this population. The success of 8 out of 9 participants to detect pulse frequency changes 180 181 demonstrates that humans in principle are able to use global variables as a basis for their 182 decision. The drop out of one participant and the subjective difficulties observed in others, 183 however, raised the question, how well the successful participants were able to use them, 184 and how their performance compared to situations in which they had additional access to 185 local cues. To this end we scaled the performance on experiment 3 ($\Delta p f$ cue and respective 186 intensity cues, thick red lines in figure 4B) and those obtained in experiment 1 (intensity cues 187 and local cues, colored lines in figure 4B) to each of the 6 variants of intensity (one variable 188 per sub-panel). In the vast majority of these direct comparisons the performance measured 189 in experiment 1 was shifted to the left and showed far lower thresholds of respective 190 intensive variables as compared to the Δpf stimuli used in experiment 3. That is, generally, 191 the performance when only global cues were present was rather poor compared to the 192 performance with access to the same intensity variable and additional local ones. While this 193 held true for all almost all intensity variables, it was also clear that the definitions using 194 higher derivative and powers seem to fare better in this comparison. In the plot of 'mean

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

10

195 cubic absolute acceleration' (dark blue), two of the curves obtained in experiment 1 showed 196 even slightly higher thresholds than the ones obtained in experiment 3. This is summarized 197 in figure 4C, which plots the relative thresholds obtained in experiment 3 (red stars) and 198 experiment 1 (dots colored with respect to the global variable, same colors as in panel B) on 199 one and the same scale (note that abscissa scales in the sub-panels of Fig. 4B differ as they 200 are individually normalized to the highest value obtained in experiment 3). In summary, 201 relative thresholds yielded by different intensity variables are all similar, a fact that shows 202 that none of these variables stands out in its importance for perception. Moreover, the 203 perceptual effects of intensity variables, particularly the definitions based on lower 204 derivatives and power, are far inferior compared to local cues, as experiment 3 (changes in 205 intensity and pulse frequency) typically resulted in far higher thresholds than those obtained 206 in experiment 1 (changes in intensity and instantaneous kinematics). This was so, despite 207 the fact that participants might have additionally exploited pulse frequency cues from stimuli 208 in experiment 3, which were not present in experiment 1. Finally, it can be appreciated that 209 intensity definitions that are based on the higher kinematic derivative (i.e. acceleration) and 210 higher power (i.e. power of 3) achieved thresholds that are on par with local variables. This 211 chimes well with the fact that these higher order definitions of intensity are increasingly 212 dominated by local features (demonstrated in Fig. 1E). We interpret this match as indicating 213 that our array of intensity definitions exhausts the range of possible formulations that truly 214 represent global features.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

11

215 Discussion

216 In this study, we present novel psychophysical evidence that humans use local 217 instantaneous codes in addition to the classical integrative global codes for tactile 218 discrimination. Using manipulations of pulsatile skin-indentation stimuli, we found that taking 219 'maximum velocity' out of the pool of available cues led to poor performance on a Yes/No 220 psychophysical change detection task. Finally, performance on pulse frequency changes 221 (engaging exclusively global coding mechanisms), was found to be significantly inferior 222 when comparing them to performance on sets of stimuli that contained the same changes in 223 global parameters but in addition allowed access to local ones. This last finding speaks in 224 favor of the notion that humans not only use local codes, but that they may even rely on 225 them as the dominant source of information feeding tactile perceptual decisions.

ls it appropriate to use pulsatile stimuli to disentangle local from global coding?

227 Classically, sinewave stimuli have been used to disentangle 'intensity' (sine amplitude) from 228 'frequency' (sine frequency) (LaMotte and Mountcastle, 1975). This approach, however, only 229 allowed addressing global codes because changes in sine amplitude and/or frequency 230 would always concomitantly change the instantaneous signal value, i.e. local coding 231 variables. Thus, for the quest to find out whether local vs global codes are used, the usage 232 of simple sinusoidal stimuli is prohibitive. In order to investigate local features, stimuli need 233 to be manipulated locally in the time domain (Waiblinger et al., 2015a, 2015b). Pulsatile 234 stimuli are an attractive tool for this purpose as they are midway between sinusoids and 235 broad band stimuli featuring spectra that contain a perceptually important peak of power at 236 the base frequency (i.e. the pulse frequency) and allow for simple and systematic changes 237 of individual (local) pulses. Moreover, by introducing, eliminating, or shifting pulses around in 238 time one can easily introduce changes in global cues (frequency, intensity) while keeping 239 local ones (pulse waveform) identical (Gerdjikov et al., 2018). However, there are two major 240 problems with this strategy. Firstly, the success in isolating local changes hinges on the

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

12

241 definition of the global code. Certain changes of pulse waveforms may change one global 242 variable but not another. Part of the problem is that in the literature, intensity codes have 243 never been standardized – for instance many studies used signal power (squared sum, e.g. 244 Hipp et al., 2006), others used a simple sum of the absolute signal (e.g. Arabzadeh et al., 245 2003), etc. We addressed this problem by testing not only one possible intensity code but 246 defining a whole array of them. The iso-lines of our selection of intensity variables cover a 247 large part of the stimulus space (Fig. 1D). Additionally, our strategy to calculate intensity 248 based on different powers of the signal helps to formulate global codes that do or do not 249 emphasize local features (low vs. high derivatives/powers) (Fig. 1E). In fact, our intensity 250 variable that most strongly emphasizes local features, 'mean cubic absolute acceleration', 251 yields performance estimates that begin to match the ones obtained with true 252 (instantaneous) local codes (Fig. 4BC), indicating that our sample of intensity codes entirely covers the space spanned between (true) local coding, global coding with emphasis on local 253 254 features, and (true) global coding without that emphasis. This seems important because (in 255 principle) infinite other definitions of intensity are possible, which, however, are likely to be 256 close to one of our present definitions in terms of iso-line location and bias toward reporting 257 local features.

258 The second issue with pulsatile stimuli is their spectral composition. Any modification of 259 pulse waveform (as done in experiment 1) will keep the signal's base frequency but will 260 introduce wide ranging spectral changes at higher harmonics. It follows that what we call 261 'local coding' in the time domain relates to differences of spectral patterns at higher 262 harmonics, and therefore is 'global' in the frequency domain. From these consideration two 263 aspects are noteworthy: First, our terms 'local' and 'global' strictly pertain to the time domain, where a pulse is local and a single frequency (like the base frequency) is global. Second, 264 265 our results cannot be easily compared to studies that use definitions of 'frequency coding' based on more than single spectral elements(e.g. Manfredi et al., 2014), because frequency 266 267 coding defined that way may in fact involve a fair amount of local coding in the time domain.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

13

There are several hints that in primates and rodents the base frequency of a pulsatile code 268 269 plays a minor role for tactile perception. Rats show exactly the same performance in 270 detecting changes of pulsatile stimuli irrespective of whether intensity or pulse frequency is 271 changed (Waiblinger et al., 2015a). In rat primary somatosensory cortex spike counts relate 272 better to tactile discriminations than timing of spikes (Gerdjikov et al., 2018). Monkeys 273 perform frequency discrimination on pulsatile stimuli independent of the rhythmicity of pulses 274 (Salinas et al., 2000), and humans perceive frequency based on the longest gap between 275 bursts of pulses irrespective of the absolute number of pulses (at least in lower frequency 276 ranges; Birznieks and Vickery, 2017). Our experiments add to the view that spectral analysis 277 may play a rather inferior role in tactile perception. Our quantitative comparison of performance obtained with pure pulse frequency changes in comparison to stimuli 278 279 containing local cues (Fig. 4), demonstrated the inferiority of base frequency cues to 280 determine perception.

281 What is the functional advantage of a local code?

282 The search for local coding is motivated by the assumed presence of frictional movements in 283 objects that engage in moving contact (Schwarz, 2016). Moving contact is at the heart of 284 tactile processing, as palpation movements are indispensable for the perception of fine 285 textures (Hollins et al., 2001; Hollins and Risner, 2000; Skedung et al., 2013). Prototypical 286 expressions of frictional contact are stick-slip events - short lived elastic deformations of the 287 contacting materials coming about by sticking to surface elements, storing energy in elastic 288 deformation, and releasing them guickly into sudden slips when frictional force is overcome 289 by the driving movement of the contact (Schwarz, 2016). In the rodent vibrissa-based tactile 290 system, frictional slips have been shown to exist (Arabzadeh et al., 2005; Ritt et al., 2008; 291 Wolfe et al., 2008), and to encode texture information (Oladazimi et al., 2018; Wolfe et al., 292 2008). Primary sensory cortex in these animals has been shown to be selective for slip-293 based tactile inputs (Jadhav et al., 2009). Stick-slip events are short-lived and therefore local 294 in character, meaning that any tactile information they store is immediately available. An

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

14

295 efficient decoding system making use of stick-slip events is supposed to have evolved under 296 time-accuracy constraints, and thus, must be assumed to be local itself, i.e. make use of 297 tactile information immediately after the reception of slip-based tactile signals. In support of 298 this notion, manipulations of pulsatile whisker deflections in a psychophysical study, have 299 provided strong evidence in favor of local coding in rats' tactile system (Waiblinger et al., 300 2015a). In the fingertip system evidence about frictional movements is more scant, but by no 301 means negligible: Papillary ridges undergo complex shearing deformations at the onset of a 302 finger movement (Delhaye et al., 2016), and friction has been shown to be a determinant of 303 roughness estimation – most of all for the discrimination of microscopic surface elements 304 (Verrillo et al., 1999). Research on prehension has unearthed unequivocal evidence that 305 sudden slip movement does occur in the skin, and is readily detected by humans to adjust grip forces (Johansson and Westling, 1987). Finally, so-called rate hardness (an 306 307 instantaneous measure of change of force and speed when tapping surfaces) relates tightly 308 to hardness perception suggesting that it may be based on local elements of the tactile 309 signal as well (Han and Choi, 2010; Lawrence et al., 2000). On the anatomical level, the 310 presence of papillary ridges in glabrous skin, beset by saliently structured rows of ridge-311 associated Meissner corpuscles and Merkel cells (Cauna, 1954) has rarely been attempted 312 to be incorporated into a functional hypothesis (Gerling and Thomas, 2008). Biomechanical 313 generation of stick-slip in ridges, and specific reception of these by the mentioned rows of 314 ridge-associated receptors is a hypothesis that may help to unearth such functional links in 315 the future. Currently, these are mostly indirect evidences speaking in favor of local coding, 316 but due to lack of more detailed investigations it seems difficult to dismiss local coding as 317 playing a critical role in fine texture perception in primates (Schwarz, 2016). Nevertheless, 318 on the behavioral level, no evidence directly supporting this notion was available so far. Our 319 present results are the first to provide systematic observations that can begin to fill this gap 320 and demonstrate that kinematic features of vibrotactile signals represent a perceptually 321 powerful coding object.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

15

322 Methods

323 Participants

324 We recruited a total of 13 neurologically-healthy (self-reported) participants (age:20-35 325 years, median 27 years; 5 female). Two participants withdrew from the study without 326 providing any reason. Our participant recruitment advertisement discouraged all individuals 327 from participation if they were diagnosed with dyslexia (because it adversely affects tactile 328 acuity, (Grant et al., 1999; Laasonen et al., 2001), diabetes (which could result in peripheral 329 neuropathy and action potential conduction delays, (Hyllienmark et al., 1995), learning 330 disabilities, nervous system disorders, or had any calluses or injury to the left index fingertip (the tested finger). Based on questions modified from the Edinburgh Handedness Inventory 331 332 (Oldfield, 1971), we classified 12 participants as right handed. The study was approved by 333 our institutional research ethics board; all the participants signed the informed consent form 334 and were paid for their participation in the study.

335 To identify the stimulus feature that the participants used to perform the perceptual tasks, we 336 required the participants to perform well so that we could generate their psychometric 337 function for each task (see subsection perceptual task). If any participant performed poorly 338 on any task (session) and failed to generate a viable psychometric function for those tasks 339 (passing 50% correct), we ran them again on those specific tasks. Three participants 340 completed the study in a single attempt, 4 participants redid 1 out of 7 tasks, and 3 341 participants redid 2 out of 7 tasks. One participant was disgualified from the study because 342 total percent correct for all 7 sessions using stimuli from the 7 iso-lines in experiment 1 was less than 50%. The data of the disqualified participant and the participants who withdrew 343 344 from the study are not included in the results section of this study.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

16

345 Vibrotactile stimulation

We applied passive vibrotactile stimuli (i.e. no finger movement) to the distal pad of the left 346 347 index finger, using a plastic circular disc of 2.9 mm diameter attached to a galvomotor 348 (Cambridge Technology, Massachusetts; model 6220H). The galvomotor was driven by a 349 custom made amplifier, which reproduced highly precise displacements. We calibrated the 350 displacements of the galvomotor using a laser distance estimator that is sensitive to 351 displacements at the micron resolution. We used Matlab (Natick, USA) to generate the 352 stimulus waveform and control the galvomotor movement by passing voltage waveforms 353 through an analog output channel digitized at 40,000 samples per second at 12 bit resolution 354 via a National Instruments PCI-MIO-16E-1 I/O board.

Participants' arm rested on a platform which could be raised or lowered depending on the 355 356 participants' comfort. To prevent finger movements, the index finger was clamped in a finger 357 housing using a cleft as a rest for the finger nail - in addition to a double-sided tape that 358 affixed the plane of the fingernail to the ceiling of the housing. Once the testing finger was 359 securely positioned, we used a tri-axis micromanipulator to adjust and attach the galvomotor 360 to the distal pad of the left index finger such that the circular disc area was completely 361 covered by the fingertip skin. During the experiment only the testing region of the fingertip 362 touched the circular disc, we ensured that no other part of the galvomotor touched any part 363 of the participants' finger. We asked participants to trim the nail of their testing finger to 364 prevent any possibility of their nail touching any part of the stimulator. The arm platform as 365 well as the galvomotor platform were separate from each other and seated on an anti-slip 366 and anti-vibration mat. The depth of indentation was defined as the position in which during 367 very slow movement toward the skin the participants would first report touch-down. Using a 368 micromanipulator the galvomotor was then proceeded to the null position at a depth of 1 369 mm. From there the stimulus pulses further indented the skin.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

17

370 Pulsatile stimuli were constructed by using one period sinusoids (waveform of a sinusoid 371 extracted from one of its minima to the next) as done before (Gerdjikov et al., 2010). Two 372 manipulations were performed to change pulse width and amplitude. For pulse width, the 373 sinusoids used for this procedure ranged in frequency between 170 and 240 Hz in steps of 5 374 Hz, resulting in 15 pulse waveforms that varied in pulse width between 375 1°s°/°170°Hz°=°4167°µs and 1°s°/°240°Hz°=°5882 µs. The pulse amplitude ranged between 376 20 and 40 µm. A third manipulation left pulse waveform untouched but changed pulse 377 frequency, i.e. the inverse of interpulse intervals. Pulse frequency of the reference stimulus 378 was always 90 Hz. It changed in 5 Hz steps to values up to 135 Hz. The stimulus was a 379 seamless concatenation of two pulse trains both 500 ms in duration. The first, called 380 reference stimulus, was a train at a pulse frequency of 90 Hz, a pulse amplitude of 40 µm, 381 and a pulse width of 5.882 ms. The second train of pulses was either the same as the 382 reference stimulus (i.e. 'no change') or one that was altered into one or several of the above-383 mentioned manipulations (i.e. 'change')- see Figure 1C (the traces are to scale but for 384 purposes of visualization the traces contain only a few pulses pre- and post-change).

385 Perceptual tasks and psychophysics procedure

386 The participants were instructed to indicate in a Yes/No fashion their decision about the 387 absence or presence of the perceived stimulus change. This was done by pressing one of 388 two buttons (Yes/No) on a wireless presenter clicker with their right hand. The intertrial 389 interval started after the participant's response and lasted 5 s. After each block of 280 trials 390 (140 'no change' trials), the participants took a minimum of 2 minutes break in which they 391 were encouraged to stand up and walk around. Participants received feedback after each 392 trial which was delivered through wireless headphones. In addition, after each 280 trial-block 393 participants saw their performance as total percent correct for that block. During experiment 394 2 and 3, white noise was played out loud next to the tactile stimulator. Following the 395 completion of experiment 2, when asked, none of the participants was aware that the 396 pulsatile frequency (along with the pulse width and amplitude) of the target stimuli changed.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

18

397 Statistical analysis:

To each participant's performance (proportion reported "change") in each task, using the dedicated analysis software *psignifit* (Wichmann and Hill, 2001), we fitted a mixture model cumulative normal psychometric function of the following form:

$$P(x) = \gamma + (1 - \delta - \gamma)p(x)$$

401 where p(x) is the sigmoid modelled as cumulative gaussian – which includes the threshold 402 (i.e. the mean) and width (i.e. the SD) parameters, γ parameter is false alarm (lower asymptote), and δ parameter is the lapse rate (upper asymptote). The *psignifit* algorithm 403 404 computed the maximum likelihood of each psychometric function generated from the combination of each of the above-mentioned parameters. By marginalizing over the γ , δ , and 405 406 width parameters psignifit yielded a posterior probability density function (PDF) over the 407 threshold parameter(θ), i.e. where the psychometric functioned crossed 50% correct. For 408 each participant's point estimate of their performance on each iso-line, we chose the 409 stimulus value corresponding to the mode of the threshold PDF.

410 Next, to estimate the population mean for each iso-line, we implemented a Bayesian 411 Hierarchical analysis (see Tong et al., 2016). We represented the participants' threshold as 412 normally distributed over the whole stimulus range (pulse width from 5882 down to 4167°µs) 413 with unknown mean µ and standard deviation σ (ranging between 0.5 and 30). The 414 probability of a participant's data given (µ, σ) can be written as:

$$p(d_i|\mu,\sigma) = \int_{\substack{i=stimuli\\ 5.882-4.167\text{ms}}} p(d_i|\theta)p(\theta|\mu,\sigma)d\theta$$

Here, the first term in the integrand is proportional to the threshold PDF of each participant
(acquired from *psignifit*), because we assume a uniform prior over all possible values of θ

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

19

417 (i.e. 5882 to 4167° μ s). Thus, the likelihood of joint distribution of each (μ , σ) of complete

418 dataset 'D' including all 10 participants can be represented as:

$$p(D|\mu,\sigma) = \prod_{i=1}^{10} p(d_i|\mu,\sigma)$$

Finally, we marginalized over σ and obtained a PDF of the population mean; we report the mode of this distribution as the mean of the population along with the Bayesian 95% confidence interval.

422 Experiment 1: This experiment exclusively used changes in pulse waveform and set the pulse frequency to 90 Hz throughout. We tested each participant on stimuli changes drawn 423 424 from 7 iso-lines shown in Fig. 1D (seven sessions were performed, testing one iso-line per 425 session). A session contained 420 'change' and 420 'no change' stimuli. The iso-lines 426 contained stimuli from which we extracted 3 local (maximum position, velocity and 427 acceleration) and 6 global (intensity) variables. The terms are given in Fig. 1D (the 428 integration window was always the entire 500 ms stimulus, therefore we use sum and mean 429 of the variable inter-changeably). In two instances an iso-line was found to be congruent with 430 another ('maximum position' / 'mean absolute velocity' and 'maximum velocity' / 'mean 431 absolute acceleration'); hence, 7 iso-lines were tested. In one iso-line session the 432 presentation was three blocks of 280 trials each, which contained all 'change' stimuli (140) 433 and the same number of 'no change' stimuli trials in pseudorandom order. 434 Experiment 2: The aim here was to disentangle performance on the 'maximum velocity' iso-

line from that of the 'mean absolute acceleration' iso-line, using additional changes of pulse
frequency (Fig. 3A). The change in pulse frequency was set to 15 Hz (i.e. from 90 to 105
Hz), a value that was far sub-threshold for all participants (see results). Otherwise the
experimental conditions were as described for experiment 1.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

- 439 *Experiment 3:* Here stimulus changes were exclusively based on changes in pulse
- 440 frequency (Δpf) . There were 9 'change' stimuli and one 'no change' stimulus', yielding 540
- trials per session (30 trials per stimulus). Otherwise conditions were the same as for
- 442 experiment 1.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

21

443 Acknowledgements

- 444 This research was supported by a grant from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft
- 445 (SCHW577/14-1).

446 Author contributions statement

- 447 AB designed and conducted experiments, analyzed data and wrote the paper. CB designed
- the experiments and wrote the paper. CS designed the experiment, analyzed data, and
- wrote the paper.

450 **Competing financial interest statement**

451 No interests declared.

452 Data availability statement

- 453 The datasets generated during and/or analyzed during the current study are available from
- 454 the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

22

455 References

- 456 Arabzadeh E, Petersen RS, Diamond ME. 2003. Encoding of whisker vibration by rat barrel 457 cortex neurons: implications for texture discrimination. *J Neurosci* **23**:9146–9154.
- Arabzadeh E, Zorzin E, Diamond ME. 2005. Neuronal encoding of texture in the whisker
 sensory pathway. *PLoS Biol* **3**:e17.
- Barlow HB. 1972. Single units and sensation: a neuron doctrine for perceptual psychology?
 Perception 1:371–394.
- Barrea A, Delhaye BP, Lefèvre P, Thonnard JL. 2018. Perception of partial slips under
 tangential loading of the fingertip. *Sci Rep* 8:1–8. doi:10.1038/s41598-018-25226-w
- Birznieks I, Vickery RM. 2017. Spike Timing Matters in Novel Neuronal Code Involved in
 Vibrotactile Frequency Perception. *Curr Biol* 27:1485-1490.e2.
 doi:10.1016/j.cub.2017.04.011
- 467 Campbell FW, Maffei L. 1974. Contrast and spatial frequency. *Sci Am* 231:106–115.
 468 doi:10.1038/scientificamerican1174-106
- Cauna N. 1954. Nature and functions of the papillary ridges of the digital skin. *Anat Rec* **119**:449–468. doi:10.1002/ar.1091190405
- 471 Chagas AM, Theis L, Sengupta B, Stüttgen MC, Bethge M, Schwarz C. 2013. Functional
 472 analysis of ultra high information rates conveyed by rat vibrissal primary afferents. *Front* 473 *Neural Circuits* 7:190. doi:10.3389/fncir.2013.00190
- 474 Delhaye B, Barrea A, Edin BB, Lefèvre P, Thonnard J-L. 2016. Surface strain
 475 measurements of fingertip skin under shearing. *J R Soc Interface* 13:20150874.
 476 doi:10.1098/rsif.2015.0874
- 477 Gerdjikov T V, Bergner CG, Schwarz C. 2018. Global Tactile Coding in Rat Barrel Cortex in
 478 the Absence of Local Cues. *Cereb Cortex* 28:2015–2027. doi:doi:
 479 10.1093/cercor/bhx108
- 480 Gerdjikov T V, Bergner CG, Stüttgen MC, Waiblinger C, Schwarz C. 2010. Discrimination of
 481 vibrotactile stimuli in the rat whisker system: behavior and neurometrics. *Neuron* 482 65:530–40.
- 483 Gerling GJ, Thomas GW. 2008. Fingerprint lines may not directly affect SA-I
 484 mechanoreceptor response. Somatosens Mot Res 25:61–76.
 485 doi:10.1080/08990220701838996
- 486 Grant AC, Zangaladze A, Thiagarajah MC, Sathian K. 1999. Tactile perception in
 487 developmental dyslexia: a psychophysical study using gratings. *Neuropsychologia*488 **37**:1201–1211.
- Han G, Choi S. 2010. Extended rate-hardness: A measure for perceived hardness. *Lect Notes Comput Sci* 6191 LNCS:117–124. doi:10.1007/978-3-642-14064-8_18
- Hipp J, Arabzadeh E, Zorzin E, Conradt J, Kayser C, Diamond ME, Konig P. 2006. Texture
 signals in whisker vibrations. *J Neurophysiol* **95**:1792–1799.
- Hollins M, Bensmaia SJ, Washburn S. 2001. Vibrotactile adaptation impairs discrimination of
 fine, but not coarse, textures. Somat Mot Res 18:253–262.
- Hollins M, Risner SR. 2000. Evidence for the duplex theory of tactile texture perception.
 Percept Psychophys 62:695–705.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

23

- Hubel DH, Wiesel TN. 1968. Receptive fields and functional architecture of monkey striate
 cortex. *J Physiol* **195**:215–243.
- Hyllienmark L, Brismar T, Ludvigsson J. 1995. Subclinical nerve dysfunction in children and adolescents with IDDM. *Diabetologia* 38:685–692.
- 501 Jadhav SP, Wolfe J, Feldman DE. 2009. Sparse temporal coding of elementary tactile 502 features during active whisker sensation. *Nat Neurosci* **12**:792–800.
- 503 Johansson RS, Birznieks I. 2004. First spikes in ensembles of human tactile afferents code 504 complex spatial fingertip events. *Nat Neurosci* **7**:170–7. doi:10.1038/nn1177
- Johansson RS, Westling G. 1987. Signals in tactile afferents from the fingers eliciting
 adaptive motor responses during precision grip. *Exp Brain Res Res* 66:141–154.
 doi:10.1007/BF00236210
- 508 Jones LM, Depireux DA, Simons DJ, Keller A. 2004. Robust temporal coding in the 509 trigeminal system. *Science (80-)* **304**:1986–1989.
- Laasonen M, Service E, Virsu V. 2001. Temporal order and processing acuity of visual,
 auditory, and tactile perception in developmentally dyslexic young adults. *Cogn Affect Behav Neurosci* 1:394–410.
- LaMotte RH, Mountcastle VB. 1975. Capacities of humans and monkeys to discriminate
 vibratory stimuli of different frequency and amplitude: a correlation between neural
 events and psychological measurements. *J Neurophysiol* 38:539–559.
 doi:psychophysics; monkeys; haptic; vibration; tactile; vibro-tactile; frequency;
 amplitude; integrated measure
- Lawrence DA, Pao LY, Dougherty AM, Salada MA, Pavlou Y. 2000. Rate-hardness: a new performance metric for haptic interfaces. *IEEE Trans Robot Autom* 16:357–371.
 doi:10.1109/70.864228
- Luna R, Hernandez A, Brody CD, Romo R. 2005. Neural codes for perceptual discrimination
 in primary somatosensory cortex. *Nat Neurosci* 8:1210–1219.
- Manfredi LR, Saal HP, Brown KJ, Zielinski MC, Dammann 3rd JF, Polashock VS, Bensmaia
 SJ. 2014. Natural scenes in tactile texture. *J Neurophysiol* 111:1792–1802.
 doi:10.1152/jn.00680.2013
- Maravall M, Petersen RS, Fairhall AL, Arabzadeh E, Diamond ME. 2007. Shifts in coding
 properties and maintenance of information transmission during adaptation in barrel
 cortex. *PLoS Biol* **5**:e19.
- 529 Oladazimi M, Brendel W, Schwarz C. 2018. Biomechanical Texture Coding in Rat Whiskers.
 530 Sci Rep 8:11139. doi:10.1038/s41598-018-29225-9
- 531 Oldfield RC. 1971. The assessment and analysis of handedness: The Edinburgh inventory.
 532 *Neuropsychologia* 9:97–113. doi:10.1016/0028-3932(71)90067-4
- Petersen RS, Brambilla M, Bale MR, Alenda A, Panzeri S, Montemurro MA, Maravall M.
 2008. Diverse and temporally precise kinetic feature selectivity in the VPm thalamic
 nucleus. *Neuron* 60:890–903.
- 536 Pruszynski JA, Johansson RS. 2014. Edge-orientation processing in first-order tactile
 537 neurons. *Nat Neurosci* 17:1404–9. doi:10.1038/nn.3804
- Ritt JT, Andermann ML, Moore CI. 2008. Embodied information processing: vibrissa
 mechanics and texture features shape micromotions in actively sensing rats. *Neuron* 57:599–613. doi:10.1016/j.neuron.2007.12.024
- 541 Salinas E, Hernandez A, Zainos A, Romo R. 2000. Periodicity and firing rate as candidate

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

- 542 neural codes for the frequency of vibrotactile stimuli. *J Neurosci* **20**:5503–5515.
- 543 Schwarz C. 2016. The slip hypothesis: Tactile perception and its neuronal bases. *Trends* 544 *Neurosci* **39**:449–462. doi:doi: 10.1016/j.tins.2016.04.008
- 545 Skedung L, Arvidsson M, Chung JY, Stafford CM, Berglund B, Rutland MW. 2013. Feeling 546 small: exploring the tactile perception limits. *Sci Rep* **3**:2617. doi:10.1038/srep02617
- Tong J, Ngo V, Goldreich D. 2016. Tactile length contraction as Bayesian inference. J
 Neurophysiol 116:369–379. doi:10.1152/jn.00029.2016
- Verrillo RT, Bolanowski SJ, McGlone FP. 1999. Subjective magnitude of tactile roughness.
 Somatosens Mot Res 16:352–360. doi:10.1080/08990229970401
- Waiblinger C, Brugger D, Schwarz C. 2015a. Vibrotactile discrimination in the rat whisker
 system is based on neuronal coding of instantaneous kinematic cues. *Cereb Cortex* 25:1093–106. doi:10.1093/cercor/bht305
- Waiblinger C, Brugger D, Whitmire CJ, Stanley GB, Schwarz C. 2015b. Support for the slip
 hypothesis from whisker-related tactile perception of rats in a noisy environment. *Front Integr Neurosci* 9:53. doi:10.3389/fnint.2015.00053
- Weber AI, Saal HP, Lieber JD, Cheng J-W, Manfredi LR, Dammann JF, Bensmaia SJ. 2013.
 Spatial and temporal codes mediate the tactile perception of natural textures. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 110:17107–12. doi:10.1073/pnas.1305509110
- Wichmann FA, Hill NJ. 2001. The psychometric function: I. Fitting, sampling, and goodness
 of fit. *Percept Psychophys* 63:1293–1313.
- 562 Wolfe J, Hill DN, Pahlavan S, Drew PJ, Kleinfeld D, Feldman DE. 2008. Texture coding in 563 the rat whisker system: slip-stick versus differential resonance. *PLoS Biol* **6**:e215.
- 564 Yoshioka T, Gibb B, Dorsch AK, Hsiao SS, Johnson KO. 2001. Neural coding mechanisms 565 underlying perceived roughness of finely textured surfaces. *J Neurosci* **21**:6905–6916.
- 566

567

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

25

568 Figure legends

569 Fig. 1. Definition of local coding and methods. A. The difference of local vs. global in the 570 time domain of a vibrotactile signal. Local coding is defined as focusing on short-lived events 571 in the vibrotactile signal, which can be extracted and analyzed (near-) instantly (golden 572 bracket). Global coding on the other hand is an integrative mechanism, analyzing a long stretch of the vibrotactile signal using averaging or frequency decomposition (black bracket). 573 574 B. In this study skin indentation of an actuated disk of 2.9 mm diameter at the fingertip of the 575 left index finger was used. C. Participants received pulsatile stimuli consisting of single-576 period sinusoids separated by zero movement. They were instructed to indicate detection an 577 abrupt change (orange) in either pulse waveform (Δ amplitude, Δ width; experiment 1, upper four stimuli), pulse frequency (Δpf , experiment 3, 5th stimulus), or both (experiment 2, 6th) 578 stimulus). The stimulus containing no change (4th stimulus, all black) was presented in all 579 580 experiments in 50 % of the trials. All traces are to scale and demonstrate the extremes of the stimulus space used (see stars in panel D and Fig.3A). The changes shown are: amplitude: 581 582 from 40 to 20 µm; width: from 5882 to 4167 µs; pulse frequency: from 90 Hz to 135 Hz. 583 Note, for demonstration purposes only a few pulses around the change are shown. D. 584 Definition of coding variables and stimulus space. Stimulus space spanning the change of pulse waveforms presented in experiment 1 is shown. Abscissa: change of pulse width, 585 586 Ordinate: change of pulse amplitude. The reference stimulus ('no change') is at (010). Stimuli 587 located on the nine iso-lines shown do not change the coding symbol indicated on the left 588 (color of line and coding symbol matches). Iso-lines of intensity variables (global) are 589 indicated by thin lines. Shades of green indicate velocity-based, while shades of blue 590 indicate acceleration-based variables. Instantaneous kinematic variables (local) are plotted 591 using thick lines. Note that two pairs of iso-lines (curly brackets) are congruent. Asterisks on 592 the corners mark the extreme stimulus changes demonstrated in C. E. Intensity variables 593 integrate long signal stretches. However, non-linear elements in their definition as well as

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

- 594 differntiation, can change the weights with which local features enter the value of a global
- 595 variable. An arbitrary velocity signal and respective first derivative (accel=acceleration) is
- shown in the upper row and taken to different powers (1,2, and 3; along columns). Higher
- 597 derivative / higher power intensity formulations are increasingly dominated by local features
- 598 in the signal.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

599	Fig. 2. Experiment 1. Detection of pulse waveform changes. A. Data and logistic fits to the
600	performance of one participant on all iso-lines shown in Fig. 1D. Same axes scaling in all
601	sub-panels. B. Logistic fits using pooled data of all 10 participants. C. Thresholds and 95%
602	confidence intervals expressed as pulse width for all isolines. Performance on 'maximum
603	velocity' iso-line is poorest across all participants. Colors match throughout all panels. Thick
604	lines / hollow symbols: iso-lines of local variables; Thin lines / filled symbols: iso-lines of local
605	variables. Statistics see text.

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

28

606	Fig. 3. Experiment 2. Disentangling the congruent iso-lines related to 'maximum velocity'
607	and 'mean absolute acceleration'. A. Iso-lines with (gray and red) and without (blue)
608	changes in pulse frequency (Δpf). Iso-lines of local variables do not change with adding
609	pulse frequency cues while those of global variables do. The gray curve is the unchanging
610	iso-line of maximum velocity with and without Δpf . The blue and red curves are the iso-lines
611	of mean absolute acceleration with and without Δpf , respectively. Effectively then, the
612	addition of Δpf disentangles the two isolines. For examples of stimulus waveforms refer to
613	figure 1C. B. Data and logistic fits for the same participant shown in figure 2B. C. Logistic fits
614	for the population of 9 participants. Poor performance is pegged to maximum velocity. There
615	is a slight non-significant improvement in performance when adding Δpf (blue to gray).
616	However, shifting the mean absolute acceleration iso-line with Δpf improves performance
617	significantly (blue to red). Colors in all panels match. Thick lines: iso-lines and respective
618	performance of local variables; thin lines: same for global variables

Bhattacharjee et al.,.

Local coding in tactile perception

29

619 Fig. 4. Performance with and without local cues. A. Performance on stimuli using pure global cues. i.e pure pulse frequency changes (Δpf , experiment 3; cf. 5th stimulus in Fig. 620 621 1C). B. Replotting data from A (red lines) and data obtained from the performance on seven 622 iso-lines in experiment 1. Each sub-panel plots the data from 7 iso-lines, scaled according to 623 one of six intensity variables. Each intensity variable in the six sub-panels is normalized and 624 scaled to the maximum of that variable found in the $\Delta p f$ stimuli. **C.** Thresholds of all logistic fits to the data shown in B, now all normalized to the same scale. Red stars relate to red 625 626 lines in B (experiment 3, Δpf stimuli), colored dots relate to the lines in B of the same color 627 (experiment 1, pulse waveform changes). Note the descending threshold obtained when 628 basing the performance on increasing power (red stars, green line: velocity-based intensity, 629 blue line: acceleration-based intensity). This comparison across scales suggests that 630 intensity definitions using higher powers (weighing local features higher) increasingly 631 represent performance as true local variables do.



Fig. 1



Fig. 2





Fig. 4