Incipient resistance to an effective pesticide results from genetic adaptation and the canalization of gene expression

Xiaoshen Yin[a†], Alexander S. Martinez[a†], Abigail Perkins[a,b], Morgan M. Sparks[a], Avril M. Harder[a], Janna R. Willoughby[a,c], Maria S. Sepúlveda[d], Mark R. Christie[a,d,*]

[a]Department of Biological Sciences, Purdue University; 915 W. State St., West Lafayette, Indiana 47907-2054 USA

[b]Department of Anatomy, Cell Biology & Physiology, Indiana University School of Medicine; 320 W. 15th St., Indianapolis, Indiana 46202-2266 USA

[c]School of Forestry and Wildlife Sciences, Auburn University; 602 Duncan Dr., Auburn, Alabama 36849 USA

[d]Department of Forestry and Natural Resources, Purdue University; 715 W. State St., West Lafayette, Indiana 47907-2054 USA

[†]Authors contributed equally

*To whom correspondence should be addressed: Mark Christie, 915 W. State Street, Department of Biological Sciences, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN 47907-2054. Phone: (765) 494-2070, E-mail: markchristie@purdue.edu.

Abstract

The resistance of bacteria, disease vectors, and pest species to chemical controls has vast

ecological, economic, and societal costs. In most cases, resistance is only detected after

spreading throughout an entire population. Detecting resistance in its incipient stages, by

comparison, provides time to implement preventative strategies. Incipient resistance can be

detected by coupling standard toxicology assays with large-scale gene expression experiments.

We apply this approach to a system where an invasive parasite, sea lamprey (*Petromyzon*

marinus), has been treated with the highly-effective pesticide 3-trifluoromethyl-4-nitrophenol

(TFM) for 60 years. Toxicological experiments revealed that lamprey from treated populations

did not have higher survival to TFM exposure than lamprey from their native range,

demonstrating that full-fledged resistance has not yet evolved. In contrast, we find hundreds of

genes differentially expressed in response to TFM in the population with the longest history of

exposure, many of which relate to TFM's primary mode of action, the uncoupling of oxidative

phosphorylation and subsequent depletion of ATP. Three genes critical to oxidative

phosphorylation, *ATP5PB, PLCB1,* and *NDUFA9*, were nearly fixed for alternative alleles in

comparisons of SNPs between native and treated populations ($F_{ST} > 5$ SD from the mean).

ATP5PB encodes subunit b of ATP synthase and an additional subunit, *ATP5F1B*, was canalized

for high expression in treated populations, but remained plastic in response to TFM treatment in

individuals from the native range. These combined genomic and transcriptomic results

demonstrate that an adaptive, genetic response to TFM is driving incipient resistance in a

damaging pest species.

Keywords

ATP synthase, contemporary evolution, genetic adaptation, resistance, pesticides, RNA-seq

Introduction

The evolution of resistance often occurs in response to the continued and large-scale application

of chemical compounds such as antibiotics, herbicides, and pesticides (Davies & Davies, 2010;

Délye, Jasieniuk, & Le Corre, 2013; Georghiou & Taylor, 1977; Gould, Brown, & Kuzma,

2018). The costs associated with the evolution of resistance measure in the billions of dollars per

year and cut across diverse fields ranging from healthcare to agriculture (Levy & Marshall, 2004;

Pimentel & Burgess, 2014; Smith & Coast, 2013). Increased rates of disease, decreased food

security, and large-scale environmental costs represent only some of the negative effects when

microbes, pathogens, and pests can no longer be effectively controlled (Gould et al., 2018;

Ranson & Lissenden, 2016). In light of these costs, there is a considerable need to prevent or

delay the evolution of resistance. Unfortunately, resistance is often detected too late, after most

individuals in a population have acquired a resistant phenotype (McKenna, 2013). Once this

stage is reached, there is little to be done except to implement alternative control measures,

which are often less effective (Ghosh, Sarkar, Issa, & Haldar, 2019; Peterson, Collavo, Ovejero,

Shivrain, & Walsh, 2018), or stop employing control measures until resistant genotypes are

eliminated from the population, which can take tens to hundreds of generations (Andersson &

Hughes, 2010; Andersson & Levin, 1999; Christie, Sepúlveda, & Dunlop, 2019).

One solution to mitigating the costs of resistance is early detection; identifying the

evolution of resistance in its incipient stages can allow time for developing alternative control

measures or implementing management actions that can prevent the onset of population-wide

resistance (Andow & Ives, 2002; Apple & Smith, 1976; Stenberg, 2017). One approach to

detecting incipient resistance is to screen a large fraction of the population for resistant

genotypes or phenotypes. However, such measures can be costly and impractical because of the

large sample sizes required to identify small numbers of fully resistant individuals. Detectability

issues (e.g., false positives and negatives) compound this problem. Alternatively, the coupling of

experimental, eco-toxicological assays with the identification of genomic and transcriptomic

responses in populations with varied treatment histories can provide key insights into how and

whether resistance is beginning to evolve. We applied this design to an invasive vertebrate pest

species that has been controlled with a chemical pesticide for 60 years.

Throughout the Laurentian Great Lakes, invasive sea lamprey (*Petromyzon marinus*)

have negatively impacted native fish communities by feeding parasitically on other fishes

(Lawrie, 1970). With the construction and improvement of shipping canals in the early 1900s,

sea lamprey expanded their range from the northwestern Atlantic Ocean to the Great Lakes

(Smith & Tibbles, 1980) (Figure 1). Adult sea lamprey are hematophagous parasites of other

fishes and are not host specific (Figure 1d). The lack of host specialization, coupled with ample

spawning habitat found throughout the Great Lakes region, spurred the growth of parasitic sea

lamprey populations into the millions of individuals (Smith & Tibbles, 1980). High abundance of

invasive sea lamprey in the Great Lakes contributed to rapid and substantial declines in native

lake trout (*Salvelinus namaycush*) and other ecologically and commercially important fishes

(Baldwin, Saalfeld, Dochoda, Buettner, & Eshenroder, 2002; Bronte et al., 2003). In response to

the effects of sea lamprey on native fish and fisheries, there was an immediate and concerted

effort to develop efficient means for controlling sea lamprey populations in the Great Lakes.

One effort, initiated in the 1950s, involved testing over 4000 chemical compounds on sea

lamprey and other fish species (Applegate, 1957). The organic compound 3-trifluoromethyl-4-

nitrophenol (hereafter, TFM) was found to effectively kill larval sea lamprey, but had no

detectable effects on other fishes at low concentrations (Hubert, 2003; Middaugh, Sepúlveda, &

Höök, 2014). The larval stage of sea lamprey (Figure 1c) are targeted because they are small

(typically < 120 mm) and aggregate at high densities. The primary mode of action for TFM is to

uncouple oxidative phosphorylation (Birceanu, McClelland, Wang, Brown, & Wilkie, 2011;

Birceanu, McClelland, Wang, & Wilkie, 2009), and because sea lamprey are highly sensitive to

this mode of action, TFM is a very effective pesticide (Figure 1b). Since the application of TFM

to locations with abundant larval lamprey, invasive sea lamprey populations have declined by up

to 90% (Heinrich et al., 2003; Smith & Tibbles, 1980). However, TFM applications kill most,

but not all, larval sea lamprey (Dunlop et al., 2017) and it is possible that resistant individuals

could survive and reproduce. If this process is repeated over enough generations, then resistant

individuals could increase in frequency – a scenario documented in many systems where pests

have been controlled by chemical means (Whalon, Mota-Sanchez, & Hollingworth, 2008). The

evolution of resistance would greatly reduce the effectiveness of TFM, which is currently the

primary control method for invasive sea lamprey (Dunlop et al., 2017), and decreased pesticide

effectiveness would likely hamper the restoration of native and commercially-important fish

populations throughout the Great Lakes.

To test for the evolution of resistance, we first collected larval sea lamprey from three

populations with varied histories of TFM treatment (Figure 1a): Lake Michigan (56 years of

TFM treatment), Lake Champlain (26 years of TFM treatment), and Connecticut River (native

range; 0 years of TFM treatment). Larvae were acclimated in a common environment for 4

months before being experimentally exposed to TFM at lethal, sublethal, and control (no TFM)

levels. Detailed survival and toxicological analyses were coupled with tissue-specific RNA

sequencing (RNA-seq). Survival analyses revealed that the outright resistance of sea lamprey to

lethal concentrations of TFM could not be detected, but genomic and transcriptomic analyses

suggest that the early, incipient stages of resistance are well under way in populations with a

history of pesticide exposure.

Materials and Methods

Sample collection and experimental design

We collected a total of 2,035 larval sea lamprey (ammocoetes) from five locations during

summers of 2016 and 2017 using pulsed-DC backpack electrofishers, focusing our sampling

efforts on populations with different durations of exposure to TFM (Figure 1; Table S1). In 2016,

we obtained 565 ammocoetes from the Manistee River in Lake Michigan, 517 ammocoetes from

Corbeau Creek and the LaPlatte River in Lake Champlain, and 404 ammocoetes from

Connecticut River (Figure 1). Lake Michigan ammocoetes have been treated with TFM since

1960 (Lavis, Henson, Johnson, Koon, & Ollila, 2003), Lake Champlain ammocoetes have been

treated with TFM since 1990 (Marsden et al., 2003), and Connecticut River is part of the sea

lamprey's native range and has never been treated with TFM. To examine lamprey of similar

ages and developmental stages, we only collected ammocoetes from a narrow size range (80-120

mm). All ammocoetes were collected within five calendar days (July 11-July 15, 2016) of each

other and were transported to Purdue's Aquaculture Research Lab immediately after collection.

Upon arrival at Purdue's Aquaculture Research Lab, ammocoetes were acclimated into 24, 30-

gallon flow-through holding tanks (see *SI Materials and Methods* for details). In 2017, we

collected an additional 284 ammocoetes from the Platte River in Lake Michigan and 265

ammocoetes from Turner Falls, Massachusetts, to independently validate our 2016 toxicological

analyses (Table S1, Table S2).

Lethal exposure trials

After acclimation, we constructed an experimental array to conduct exposure trials in a

temperature-controlled environmental chamber (12.8°C) consisting of 36, 2.5-gallon glass

aquaria (see *SI Materials and Methods* for details). With ammocoetes collected in 2016 (2016

trials; Table S2), we conducted two toxicological exposure trials to directly assess whether sea

lamprey populations exhibited differential mortality in response to TFM exposure. We began

each exposure by transferring ammocoetes from their holding tanks into randomized

experimental array tanks pre-filled with 7 L of water. For the first 2016 trial (TOX 1; Table S2),

each population was allotted 12 aquaria with seven ammocoetes per tank (n = 84 lamprey per

population). Within a population, eight treatment aquaria received TFM (n = 56 individuals per

population) while four control aquaria (n = 28 individuals per population) received a volume of

water equal to the volume of TFM distributed into treatment aquaria. In TOX 1, we aimed for

high (i.e., > 80%) mortality to allow us to assess whether survivorship varied among populations

and we challenged ammocoetes in treatment tanks with a TFM concentration of 3 mg/L, as

determined by a multi-concentration, small-scale pilot exposure trial. We allowed ammocoetes to

acclimate for a period of one hour to the experimental tanks before introducing TFM with

peristaltic pumps. To simulate conditions associated with a typical TFM stream application,

ammocoetes were exposed to TFM for ten hours followed by a two-hour 'wash-out period'.

TFM concentrations were monitored hourly and verified by measuring TFM absorption using a

spectrophotometer. Mortality was assessed hourly over the 12-hour duration of the experiment.

At the conclusion of the experiment, dead individuals were measured for weight and length. The

second 2016 trial (TOX 2; Table S2) had the same experimental setup as TOX 1, except that a

TFM concentration of 1.67 mg/L was administered to treatment tanks to target more modest

levels of mortality (Table S2). To analyze survivorship data, we conducted a Kaplan-Meier

survival analysis (Kaplan & Meier, 1958) that generates an estimate of survival probability (S) at

time t_i and is calculated as:

$$S(t_i) = S(t_i - 1)(1 - \frac{d_i}{n_i}) \qquad\qquad (1)$$

where $S(t_i - 1)$ is the probability of being alive at time $t_i - 1$, n_i is the number of individuals

alive just prior to t_i, and d_i is the number of deaths occurring at t_i (Kaplan & Meier, 1958). We

performed the survival analysis in R (R core team, 2019), using both the SURVIVAL and OIsurv

packages to create survival curves and assess statistical differences between the survival curves

of three populations (Therneau, 2015). *P*-values associated with pairwise tests used to determine

which populations differ in their survivorship were FDR adjusted using the Benjamini-Hochberg

method (Benjamini & Hochberg, 1995).

To independently confirm toxicological analyses from 2016 trials, we conducted three

additional toxicological exposure trials with ammocoetes collected in 2017 (2017 trials; Table

S2). After a six-week acclimation, we conducted toxicological exposure trials similarly to the

2016 trials with three modifications to increase power for the detection of lethal concentrations

in a given population. First, in the 2017 trials, each trial examined only one population at a time.

Second, trials lasted for 20 hours instead of 12 hours. Third, these trials consisted of five

treatments—each with three replicate tanks of seven individuals—including the control (0, 0.5,

1.2, 1.5, and 2 mg/L of TFM), instead of a single TFM treatment (Table S2). With this

experimental design, we could quantify lethal concentrations (e.g., LC50). To compare

differences in survival, we computed lethal concentrations for each trial using the DRC package

(v 3.0-1) (Ritz, Baty, Streibig, & Gerhard, 2015), and made comparisons among trials at different

dosage levels using Kaplan-Meier survival analyses in the SURVIVAL package (Therneau,

2015) with visualization using the SURVMINER package (Kassambara & Kosinski, 2018) .

Sublethal exposure trials

To assess whether resistance was evolving at a sublethal level, we conducted two additional

exposure trials (i.e., gene expression trials GE 1 and GE 2; Table S2) to assess (i) how gene

expression profiles changed in response to TFM, and (ii) whether TFM exposure altered patterns

of gene expression differently among three populations with varying histories of exposure. The

experimental design for sublethal exposure was similar to that for the toxicological exposure

trials outlined above with two key differences. First, we exposed ammocoetes to sublethal levels

of TFM (i.e., 0.3 mg/L in GE 1 and 0.2 mg/L in GE 2; Table S2). Second, we preserved tissue

from ammocoetes at a predetermined time point (t = hour 6) during the 12-hour gene expression

exposure trial for RNA-seq. All populations were run concurrently, and all individuals were

sampled at the same time such that any differences in gene expression could not be due to

differences in time of day, week, or month. Sampling consisted of removing a single ammocoete

per replicate tank and immediately euthanizing it in a lethal dose of MS-222 before weighing,

measuring, and flash-freezing in cryovials with liquid nitrogen. At the completion of the

experiment, cryovials were directly transferred to a -80°C freezer.

RNA-seq and differential gene expression analysis

We used tissue-specific RNA-seq to compare patterns of gene expression in ammocoetes from

the three populations with varying histories of exposure to TFM. Comparing tissue-specific

patterns of expression required that we first dissect specific tissue samples from the body

segments collected during gene expression trials. Given TFM's established mode of action, we

targeted ammocoete muscle, liver, and brain tissues for downstream analyses of gene expression

profiles. We first transferred individuals frozen at -80°C into a solution of RNAlater-ICE

(Ambion Inc., Austin, TX, USA) at 10 volumes of solution relative to sample mass and allowed

the solution to permeate into the tissue for 16 hours at -20°C. Once the solution had permeated

into the tissue and segments had thawed, we dissected muscle, liver, and brain tissues for

subsequent mRNA extractions (Table S3). In total, we performed 71 mRNA extractions across

three populations (Lake Michigan, Lake Champlain, and Connecticut River), and three tissue

types (muscle, liver, and brain) using the Qiagen RNeasy Mini Kit (Table S3). Library

preparation and mRNA sequencing were performed by the Purdue Genomics Core Facility with

samples from GE 1 and GE 2 (Table S2) being sequenced on either an Illumina 2500 or an S2

NovaSeq lane. We obtained a total of 3.25 billion 150 bp paired-end reads, which we first used

to create an annotated transcriptome (see *SI Materials and Methods* for details on transcriptome

assembly).

We aligned all reads to our assembled sea lamprey transcriptome and estimated transcript

abundances using RSEM (Li & Dewey, 2011), and identified differentially expressed genes

(hereafter, DEGs) using a GLM with TFM concentration and sequencing machine as fixed

effects in edgeR (McCarthy, Chen, & Smyth, 2012; Robinson, McCarthy, & Smyth, 2010). We

compared gene expression profiles of treated versus untreated ammocoetes within each

population to identify genes that were significantly up- and down-regulated in response to TFM

treatment and were specific to each population. For genes to be classified as differentially

expressed, we set minimum thresholds for significance (FDR correction via the Benjamini-

Hochberg method; *p*-value < 0.05). While we did not explicitly filter DEGs by log fold change,

the minimum log2-fold changes we observed for DEGs were > 2 across all three populations

(2.04, 3.50, and 2.74 for Lake Michigan, Lake Champlain, and Connecticut River populations,

respectively). Finally, GOseq was used to determine which gene ontology functional categories

were overrepresented among differentially expressed genes in TFM treated individuals for each

population-tissue combination (Young, Wakefield, Smyth, & Oshlack, 2010). Only functionally

enriched categories significant below an FDR-adjusted *p*-value threshold of 0.05 were retained.

We constructed gene ontology (GO) hierarchy networks of the top 100 significant GO terms

identified with DEGs (FDR-corrected *p*-value < 0.01) using the metacoder package (Foster,

Sharpton, & Grünwald, 2017).

Genomic analysis

Using the trimmed RNA-seq reads, we called SNPs following the variant discovery pipeline

provided by the Genome Analysis Toolkit (GATK) (McKenna et al., 2010). We called SNPs

using both RNA-seq and DNA-seq variant calling pipelines (Brouard, Schenkel, Marete, &

Bissonnette, 2019) for muscle (n=44) and liver (n=19) tissue samples separately (see *SI*

Materials and Methods for details). After comparing variants from both pipelines, we only

included SNPs that were identified in both the DNA-seq and RNA-seq pipelines. We used the

genotypes from the DNA-seq pipeline because it calls genotypes that are homozygous for the

reference allele, while the RNA-seq pipeline cannot. For each individual, genotypes with fewer

than five reads were set as missing values. Muscle samples from two individuals 401 and 402

(Table S3) had over 90% missing data and thus were excluded from further analyses. Finally,

loci genotyped across at least 80% of all samples were retained as high-quality SNPs, and this

resulted in SNPs called for 42 and 19 samples from muscle and liver tissues, respectively (Table

S3). Separate analyses were conducted on high-quality SNPs obtained from different tissue

samples (i.e., muscle vs. liver). In each population, we further excluded loci out of Hardy-

Weinberg equilibrium, which we identified using the package HWxtest (likelihood ratio *p*-value

< 0.05) (Engels, 2009). We calculated pairwise F_{ST} for each locus among all three populations

(i.e., Lake Michigan vs. Lake Champlain, Lake Michigan vs. Connecticut River, and Lake

Champlain vs. Connecticut River populations) using Weir and Cockerham's unbiased estimator

(Weir & Cockerham, 1984). To detect outliers, we z-transformed F_{ST} in each comparison and

defined loci with F_{ST} greater than five standard deviations from the mean as outlier loci

(Axelsson et al., 2013; Willoughby, Harder, Tennessen, Scribner, & Christie, 2018). We

identified the corresponding genes on which outlier loci were located by mapping outlier loci to

the sea lamprey genome (Smith et al., 2013; Smith et al., 2018) and calculated the frequency of

all alleles at each outlier locus.

Results

We performed multiple independent toxicological assays over a two-year period using larvae

collected from historically untreated (native range) and treated tributaries (Figure 1a; Table S1).

The larvae collected from treated tributaries were not previously exposed to TFM prior to the

toxicological assays (i.e., any resistance, if detected, could not be due to inducible tolerance

(Hua, Morehouse, & Relyea, 2013)). If outright resistance has evolved, we would expect to

observe higher survivorship in sea lamprey collected from populations with a history of

treatment (i.e., Lake Michigan or Lake Champlain) in comparison to sea lamprey collected from

areas that have never been treated (i.e., the native range, Connecticut River). We found no

evidence to support this prediction. In 2016 trials (TOX 1-2; Table S2), the mortality for treated

individuals was highly similar across all populations over a 12-hour exposure period. The

combined mortality for treated individuals was 96.4%, 100%, and 91.1% for Lake Michigan,

Lake Champlain, and Connecticut River populations, respectively (Figure 2a). There was no

mortality within the control group for any population. We observed statistically significant, but

not biologically meaningful, differences in survivorship among populations over time (p-value =

0.019) where post-hoc pairwise comparisons using the log-rank test revealed that individuals

from the native, Connecticut River population had slightly higher survivorship than individuals

from either Lake Michigan or Lake Champlain populations (p-value = 0.031). However, these

slight differences in survivorship only translated to three additional Connecticut River

individuals surviving until the end of the experiment. In our 2017 trials (TOX 3-5; Table S2),

survivorship through time again did not vary substantially among populations (Figure S1) and

estimates of lethal concentrations required to kill 50% of the population (LC50) varied only

slightly among populations and trials (Figure 2b). The Lake Michigan population had lower

estimated lethal concentration values for 25% and 50% mortality (LC25: mean 0.74 ± s.e. 0.01;

LC50: mean 0.78 ± s.e. 0.01) than for larvae collected from the native range, Connecticut River

(LC25: mean 1.39 ± s.e. 0.17; LC50: mean 1.48 ± s.e. 0.24) (Figure 2b). The lethal concentration

values for the Connecticut River population were larger than that of the Lake Michigan

population at both LC25 and LC50 values. Furthermore, no individuals from Lake Michigan

survived TFM concentrations greater than 2 mg/L (Figure S1). When TFM is applied in the field,

stream concentrations of TFM range from 5.5 to 9 mg/L for the pH and alkalinity values used in

our experimental treatments (Figure 2b). In total, we performed five independent toxicological

trials with six tested concentrations and never detected any meaningful differences in survival

across populations (Table S2). From these analyses, we conclude that outright resistance to TFM

has not yet evolved, as no treated individuals survived TFM exposure at concentrations they

would be exposed to under ordinary stream treatment conditions.

By contrast, we observed remarkably large differences in patterns of gene expression

among sea lamprey from different populations exposed to the same, sublethal concentration of

TFM. Briefly, we exposed 56 larvae from each population to either 0.2 or 0.3 mg/L of TFM for 6

hours (Table S2). An equal number of control individuals per population were included (i.e.,

individuals not exposed to TFM), individuals from all populations had the exact same

acclimation history (4 months), and all populations were simultaneously included in each of two

large experiments to avoid confounding circadian (Conesa et al., 2016) or environmental effects

(Table S2, Table S3). Remarkably, when comparing samples treated with 0.3 mg/L TFM to

control samples, we found 336 genes that were differentially expressed (275 upregulated, 61

downregulated in comparison to control individuals) in muscle tissue in the Lake Michigan

population, dwarfing the number of differentially expressed genes (DEGs) found in both Lake

Champlain (n = 21) and Connecticut River (n = 68) populations (Figure 3a-c; Table S4). No

DEGs were shared among all three populations and different population responses were observed

when lower concentrations (i.e., 0.2 mg/L) of TFM were applied and when different tissues were

examined (Figures S2-S5).

The primary mode of action for TFM is to uncouple oxidative phosphorylation in the

mitochondria resulting in severe ATP depletion and eventual mortality (Birceanu et al., 2011;

Birceanu et al., 2009; Birceanu et al., 2014). Of the 336 DEGs identified in Lake Michigan,

several genes were directly related to this mode of action including *CRCM1* (LogFC = 2.60), a

calcium release-activated channel protein that controls the influx of calcium into cells when

depleted, and *PLCD4* (LogFC = 2.41), an enzyme, phospholipase c delta 4, responsible for

hydrolyzing phosphatidylinositol 4,5-bisphosphate into two secondary messenger molecules, one

of which (inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate or 'IP3') is known to release cellular calcium stores and

increase calcium concentrations within the cell (Berridge, 1993). Upregulated expression of

genes that increase intracellular concentrations of calcium could enhance oxidative

phosphorylation in Lake Michigan larvae and partially compensate for the uncoupling effects of

TFM (Figure 4a). In addition, calcium plays an integral role in activating and driving the

oxidative phosphorylation cascade in mitochondria, and studies have demonstrated a positive

relationship between nanomolar free calcium and the rate of phosphorylation (Fink, Bai, Yu, &

Sivitz, 2017; Glancy, Willis, Chess, & Balaban, 2013). In gene ontology (GO) hierarchy

networks, we also found regulation of calcium ion transport, regulation of calcium ion

transmembrane transport, regulation of calcium ion transmembrane transporter activity, and

regulation of voltage-gated calcium channel activity as significant biological processes (Figure

S6).

We next aligned our reads to the sea lamprey genome (Smith et al., 2013; Smith et al.,

2018), called single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs), and identified outliers based on Z-scores

of genetic divergence (Weir and Cockerham's F_{ST}) (Weir & Cockerham, 1984; Willoughby et

al., 2018). Out of 554,685 SNPs detected with muscle tissue samples, an outlier, *ATP5PB*, was

found in the comparison between Lake Michigan and Connecticut River populations and had an

F_{ST} value greater than five standard deviations from the mean (Figure 3d). *ATP5PB* encodes a

subunit of ATP synthase (subunit b) and, similar to many of the genes identified by expression

analyses, appears to be responding to strong selection in order to restore normal oxidative

phosphorylation in response to TFM's primary mode of action (Figure 4a). Closer examination

of the genotypes at the bi-allelic SNP found in this gene illustrates that a single allele is nearly

fixed in both Lake Michigan and Lake Champlain, but only occurs rarely in the native range

(Figure 4b). This outlier was also observed in comparisons between Lake Champlain and

Connecticut River populations across tissue types (Figure S7, Figure S9). Although the native-

range, Connecticut River lamprey are not fixed at the genetic level for this variant, they were

able to respond plastically with respect to TFM at ATP synthase. The gene *ATP5F1B*, which

codes for subunit beta of ATP synthase, was significantly upregulated in Connecticut River

lamprey in response to TFM treatment (LogFC = 4.68, FDR-corrected *p*-value < 0. 0072, Figure

4c) when compared to unexposed, control individuals, suggesting a plastic response.

Interestingly, *ATP5F1B* was upregulated in both control and treatment individuals from Lake

Michigan and Lake Champlain in comparison to Connecticut River control individuals,

suggesting a genetic response to constitutively increase expression of this gene.

327   An additional gene, *PLCB1*, was identified as an outlier between Lake Michigan and

Connecticut River populations and had an F_{ST} value greater than six standard deviations from the

mean (Figure 3d). Similar to the differentially expressed *PLCD4* (LogFC = 2.41; Figure 4a),

PLCB1, a nearly identical variant of *PLCD4*, encodes an enzyme catalyzing the production of

inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate ('IP3'). Alternative alleles are almost fixed at this bi-allelic SNP in

Lake Michigan and Connecticut River populations, and similar patterns of allele frequency are

observed in Lake Michigan and Lake Champlain (Figure 4d). This outlier was consistently

detected in comparisons between Lake Michigan and Connecticut River across tissue types

(Figure S8). *PLCD4* was upregulated in treated individuals in Lake Michigan. Lastly, an outlier,

NDUFA9, a gene encoding complex I in the electron transport chain (ETC) was found in

comparisons between Lake Michigan and Connecticut River and had an F_{ST} value greater than

six standard deviations from the mean (Figure 3d), but not in comparisons between Lake

Champlain and Connecticut River. The remaining 116 outlier genes (Figure 3d) have little to do

with TFM's known mode of action, many of which appear to be related to adaptation to the

recently-colonized environments.

Discussion

Here we provide evidence for the evolution of incipient resistance in invasive sea lamprey
treated with a pesticide. We found 336 genes differentially expressed in response to TFM in
larvae from Lake Michigan, the population with the longest history of using TFM (56 years).
This transcriptional response represents a nearly 5-fold greater number of differentially
expressed genes in comparison to larvae collected from the native range. The pesticide TFM's
primary mode of action is to serve as a protonophore, translocating protons across the inner
mitochondrial membrane, thus uncoupling oxidative phosphorylation and depleting ATP. Many
of the DEGs identified in Lake Michigan represent direct or indirect responses to ATP depletion.
We also identified genomic evidence of a response to selection imposed by TFM. In
comparisons between Lake Michigan and Connecticut River, the gene coding for ATP synthase
subunit b, *ATP5PB*, had an F_{ST} value greater than five standard deviations from the mean (Figure
3d). These large shifts in allele frequencies indicate a response to selection in a gene that are
critical to successful oxidative phosphorylation. We also identified a directly-related gene,
ATP5F1B, that was differentially expressed in the native Connecticut River population, but not
the other, treated populations. Interestingly, this gene is constitutively expressed at high levels in
treated populations, suggesting that an additional component of ATP synthase has responded to
pesticide-induced selection. Thus, the two populations with a lengthy history of TFM treatment
show adaptive responses in ATP synthase at the genomic level, while the naïve, native
population shows plastic responses in transcription of the same enzyme in response to TFM.

Two additional genes, *NDUFA9* and *PLCB1,* show genetic signatures of a response to
TFM-mediated selection (Figure 3, Figure 4). *NDUFA9* encodes a subunit of the ETC complex I,
and genetic modifications to this protein may allow for the more efficient transport of protons

when inundated with TFM. *PLCB1* is known to increase calcium concentrations within the cell

(Berridge, 1993), which could further assist with the transport of protons into the mitochondrial

inter-membrane space when cells are confronted with TFM. A nearly identical variant, *PLCD4*,

plastically increases expression in Lake Michigan and (albeit not significantly) in the native

range in response to TFM (Figure 4e) whereas the expression of *PLCD4* does not respond to

TFM in Lake Champlain. The observation that *NDUFA9* was not identified as a genetic outlier in

comparisons between Lake Champlain and the native range (Connecticut River) and that *PLCD4*

does not change expression in the presence of TFM in Lake Champlain, suggests that

modifications to the ETC complex I are more extensive in Lake Michigan, which has been

treated with TFM for a longer period of time.

Lake Michigan and Lake Champlain have been treated with TFM for 56 and 26 years,

respectively. Both show evidence of selection at *ATP5PB*, however, both responded to TFM

differently at the gene expression level with 336 and 21 genes differentially expressed in Lake

Michigan and Lake Champlain, respectively. These large differences in the number of genes

differentially expressed may reflect different evolutionary responses to TFM, one of which is

mediated exclusively at the genetic level and one that is mediated at both genetic and

transcriptomic levels. Alternatively, these differences may reflect the deeper evolutionary

histories between these two populations or the different duration and intensities of pesticide

usage (Whitehead, Clark, Reid, Hahn, & Nacci, 2017). We also observed large differences in

gene expression depending on the concentration of TFM used and the tissue examined (Figures

S2-S5). These similarities in adaptive, genetic responses and differences in broad patterns of

gene expression suggest that the TFM-mediated selection results in a convergent, genetic

response while the different evolutionary and treatment histories of these populations affect

overall patterns of gene expression.

We identified large genetic and transcriptomic differences among populations but did not

detect any individuals able to survive concentrations of TFM applied to streams in practice

(Figure 2). Thus, we may be documenting the earliest stages of resistance evolving in treated

populations (i.e., incipient resistance). Survival and reproductive advantages by larvae exposed

to sublethal concentrations of TFM, for example individuals at the peripheries of TFM treatment

or individuals buried deeper in the sediment, are inherited by their offspring and have spread

throughout the treated populations. It may only be a matter of time before further mutations

allow individuals to survive higher concentrations of TFM. In fact, recent modelling efforts have

revealed that given the estimated strength of selection imposed by lamprey control, full-fledged

resistance to TFM is predicted to occur soon (Christie et al., 2019). Because of the high gene

flow and lack of population structure found throughout the Great Lakes (i.e., Lake Michigan is

one, large panmictic population, see *SI Materials and Methods* for details), fully-resistant

individuals may already be spreading throughout the population even though it may take many

more years for successful detection (Christie et al., 2019). Alternatively, it may be that our

toxicological assays were simply not sensitive enough to detect resistance to lethal

concentrations of TFM. From a pragmatic standpoint, the detection of incipient resistance (IR)

means that the development of alternative control measures and the implementation of adaptive

management strategies focusing on delaying resistance should be a priority for the continued

control of invasive sea lamprey. The detection of resistance in its earliest stages, as documented

here, allows time for such actions to assist with the continued restoration of native and

commercially-important fishes. Regardless of the system, the detection of incipient resistance

can greatly assist in efforts to mitigate and delay the costly consequences of resistance.

Acknowledgments

We thank B.J. Allaire, Bryan Apell, William Ardren, Steve Gephard, Nick Johnson, Robert Stira,

Bradley Young, the Conte Anadromous Fish Research Laboratory, Michigan DNR, Connecticut

Department of Energy and Environmental Protection, Hammond Bay Biological Station, and

U.S. Fish & Wildlife for assistance with collecting larval lamprey. We thank Lori Criger, Sam

Guffey, Elizabeth LaRue, Phillip San Miguel, Bob Rode, Mike Siefkes, Jeramiah Smith, Benson

Solomon, and the Purdue Genomics Core for assistance with experiments and analyses. Matthew

Byrnes, Matthew Campbell, Lindsey Dice, Jessica Elliott, Megan Gannon, Nathan Greiling,

Kimberly Gulbranson, Jason Jaworski, Tara Novak, Ashe Owens, Emily Reverman, and Cassidy

Robinson aided in the second set of toxicological trials. This research was funded by the Great

Lakes Fishery Commission Project ID: 2016_CHR_54053.

References

Andersson, D. I., & Hughes, D. (2010). Antibiotic resistance and its cost: is it possible to reverse
resistance? *Nature Reviews Microbiology, 8*(4), 260.
Andersson, D. I., & Levin, B. R. (1999). The biological cost of antibiotic resistance. *Current opinion in
microbiology, 2*(5), 489-493.
Andow, D., & Ives, A. (2002). Monitoring and adaptive resistance management. *Ecological Applications,
12*(5), 1378-1390.
Apple, J. L., & Smith, R. F. (1976). *Integrated pest management*.
Applegate, V. C. (1957). *Toxicity of 4,346 chemicals to larval lampreys and fishes*: US Fish and Wildlife
Service.
Axelsson, E., Ratnakumar, A., Arendt, M. L., Maqbool, K., Webster, M. T., Perloski, M., . . . Lindblad-Toh,
K. (2013). The genomic signature of dog domestication reveals adaptation to a starch-rich diet.
Nature, 495(7441), 360-364. doi:10.1038/nature11837
Baldwin, N., Saalfeld, R., Dochoda, M., Buettner, H., & Eshenroder, R. (2002). Commercial fish
production in the Great Lakes 1867–2000. *Ann Arbor, Michigan: Great Lakes Fishery
Commission. Available: www. glfc. org.(September 2006)*.

Benjamini, Y., & Hochberg, Y. (1995). Controlling the false discovery rate: a practical and powerful
approach to multiple testing. *Journal of the Royal statistical society: series B (Methodological),*
57(1), 289-300.

Berridge, M. J. (1993). Inositol trisphosphate and calcium signalling. *Nature, 361*(6410), 315.

Birceanu, O., McClelland, G. B., Wang, Y. S., Brown, J. C., & Wilkie, M. P. (2011). The lampricide 3-
trifluoromethyl-4-nitrophenol (TFM) uncouples mitochondrial oxidative phosphorylation in both
sea lamprey (Petromyzon marinus) and TFM-tolerant rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss).
Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part C: Toxicology & Pharmacology, 153(3), 342-349.

Birceanu, O., McClelland, G. B., Wang, Y. S., & Wilkie, M. P. (2009). Failure of ATP supply to match ATP
demand: The mechanism of toxicity of the lampricide, 3-trifluoromethyl-4-nitrophenol (TFM),
used to control sea lamprey (Petromyzon marinus) populations in the Great Lakes. *Aquatic*
toxicology, 94(4), 265-274.

Birceanu, O., Sorensen, L. A., Henry, M., McClelland, G. B., Wang, Y. S., & Wilkie, M. P. (2014). The
effects of the lampricide 3-trifluoromethyl-4-nitrophenol (TFM) on fuel stores and ion balance in
a non-target fish, the rainbow trout (Oncorhynchus mykiss). *Comparative Biochemistry and*
Physiology Part C: Toxicology & Pharmacology, 160, 30-41.

Bronte, C. R., Ebener, M. P., Schreiner, D. R., DeVault, D. S., Petzold, M. M., Jensen, D. A., . . . Lozano, S. J.
(2003). Fish community change in Lake Superior, 1970–2000. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and*
Aquatic Sciences, 60(12), 1552-1574.

Brouard, J.-S., Schenkel, F., Marete, A., & Bissonnette, N. (2019). The GATK joint genotyping workflow is
appropriate for calling variants in RNA-seq experiments. *Journal of Animal Science and*
Biotechnology, 10(1), 44.

Christie, M. R., Sepúlveda, M. S., & Dunlop, E. S. (2019). Rapid resistance to pesticide control is predicted
to evolve in an invasive fish. *Scientific Reports, 9*(1). doi:10.1038/s41598-019-54260-5

Conesa, A., Madrigal, P., Tarazona, S., Gomez-Cabrero, D., Cervera, A., McPherson, A., . . . Zhang, X.
(2016). A survey of best practices for RNA-seq data analysis. *Genome biology, 17*(1), 13.

Davies, J., & Davies, D. (2010). Origins and evolution of antibiotic resistance. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.,*
74(3), 417-433.

Délye, C., Jasieniuk, M., & Le Corre, V. (2013). Deciphering the evolution of herbicide resistance in
weeds. *Trends in Genetics, 29*(11), 649-658.

Dunlop, E. S., McLaughlin, R., Adams, J. V., Jones, M., Birceanu, O., Christie, M. R., . . . Johnson, N. S.
(2017). Rapid evolution meets invasive species control: the potential for pesticide resistance in
sea lamprey. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences, 75*(1), 152-168.

Engels, W. R. (2009). Exact Tests for Hardy–Weinberg Proportions. *Genetics, 183*(4), 1431-1441.
doi:10.1534/genetics.109.108977

Fink, B. D., Bai, F., Yu, L., & Sivitz, W. I. (2017). Regulation of ATP production: dependence on calcium
concentration and respiratory state. *American Journal of Physiology-Cell Physiology, 313*(2),
C146-C153.

Foster, Z. S., Sharpton, T. J., & Grünwald, N. J. (2017). Metacoder: An R package for visualization and
manipulation of community taxonomic diversity data. *PLoS computational biology, 13*(2),
e1005404.

Georghiou, G. P., & Taylor, C. E. (1977). Genetic and biological influences in the evolution of insecticide
resistance. *Journal of economic entomology, 70*(3), 319-323.

Ghosh, C., Sarkar, P., Issa, R., & Haldar, J. (2019). Alternatives to conventional antibiotics in the era of
antimicrobial resistance. *Trends in microbiology*.

Glancy, B., Willis, W. T., Chess, D. J., & Balaban, R. S. (2013). Effect of calcium on the oxidative
phosphorylation cascade in skeletal muscle mitochondria. *Biochemistry, 52*(16), 2793-2809.

Gould, F., Brown, Z. S., & Kuzma, J. (2018). Wicked evolution: Can we address the sociobiological
dilemma of pesticide resistance? *Science, 360*(6390), 728-732.
Heinrich, J. W., Mullett, K. M., Hansen, M. J., Adams, J. V., Klar, G. T., Johnson, D. A., . . . Young, R. J.
(2003). Sea lamprey abundance and management in Lake Superior, 1957 to 1999. *Journal of*
Great Lakes Research, 29, 566-583.
Hua, J., Morehouse, N. I., & Relyea, R. (2013). Pesticide tolerance in amphibians: induced tolerance in
susceptible populations, constitutive tolerance in tolerant populations. *Evolutionary*
applications, 6(7), 1028-1040.
Hubert, T. D. (2003). Environmental fate and effects of the lampricide TFM: a review. *Journal of Great*
Lakes Research, 29, 456-474.
Kaplan, E. L., & Meier, P. (1958). Nonparametric estimation from incomplete observations. *Journal of the*
American statistical association, 53(282), 457-481.
Kassambara, A., & Kosinski, M. (2018). survminer: Drawing Survival Curves using 'ggplot2'. 2018. *URL*
https://CRAN. R-project. org/package= survminer. R package version 0.4, 3, 15.
Lavis, D. S., Henson, M. P., Johnson, D. A., Koon, E. M., & Ollila, D. J. (2003). A case history of sea lamprey
control in Lake Michigan: 1979 to 1999. *Journal of Great Lakes Research, 29*, 584-598.
Lawrie, A. (1970). The sea lamprey in the Great Lakes. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society,*
99(4), 766-775.
Levy, S. B., & Marshall, B. (2004). Antibacterial resistance worldwide: causes, challenges and responses.
Nature medicine, 10(12s), S122.
Li, B., & Dewey, C. N. (2011). RSEM: accurate transcript quantification from RNA-Seq data with or
without a reference genome. *BMC bioinformatics, 12*(1), 323.
Marsden, J. E., Chipman, B. D., Nashett, L. J., Anderson, J. K., Bouffard, W., Durfey, L., . . . Zerrenner, A.
(2003). Sea lamprey control in Lake Champlain. *Journal of Great Lakes Research, 29*, 655-676.
McCarthy, D. J., Chen, Y., & Smyth, G. K. (2012). Differential expression analysis of multifactor RNA-Seq
experiments with respect to biological variation. *Nucleic acids research, 40*(10), 4288-4297.
McKenna, A., Hanna, M., Banks, E., Sivachenko, A., Cibulskis, K., Kernytsky, A., . . . Daly, M. (2010). The
Genome Analysis Toolkit: a MapReduce framework for analyzing next-generation DNA
sequencing data. *Genome research, 20*(9), 1297-1303.
McKenna, M. (2013). Antibiotic resistance: the last resort. *Nature News, 499*(7459), 394.
Middaugh, C. R., Sepúlveda, M. S., & Höök, T. O. (2014). Growth and behavioral effects of the lampricide
TFM on non-target fish species. *Journal of Great Lakes Research, 40*(4), 1010-1015.
Peterson, M. A., Collavo, A., Ovejero, R., Shivrain, V., & Walsh, M. J. (2018). The challenge of herbicide
resistance around the world: a current summary. *Pest Management Science, 74*(10), 2246-2259.
doi:10.1002/ps.4821
Pimentel, D., & Burgess, M. (2014). Environmental and economic costs of the application of pesticides
primarily in the United States *Integrated pest management* (pp. 47-71): Springer.
R Core Team (2019). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. *R Foundation for*
Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
Ranson, H., & Lissenden, N. (2016). Insecticide resistance in African Anopheles mosquitoes: a worsening
situation that needs urgent action to maintain malaria control. *Trends in parasitology, 32*(3),
187-196.
Ritz, C., Baty, F., Streibig, J. C., & Gerhard, D. (2015). Dose-response analysis using R. *PloS one, 10*(12),
e0146021.
Robinson, M. D., McCarthy, D. J., & Smyth, G. K. (2010). edgeR: a Bioconductor package for differential
expression analysis of digital gene expression data. *Bioinformatics, 26*(1), 139-140.

Smith, B., & Tibbles, J. (1980). Sea lamprey (Petromyzon marinus) in Lakes Huron, Michigan, and
Superior: history of invasion and control, 1936–78. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic*
Sciences, 37(11), 1780-1801.
Smith, J. J., Kuraku, S., Holt, C., Sauka-Spengler, T., Jiang, N., Campbell, M. S., . . . Bloom, O. E. (2013).
Sequencing of the sea lamprey (Petromyzon marinus) genome provides insights into vertebrate
evolution. *Nature genetics, 45*(4), 415.
Smith, J. J., Timoshevskaya, N., Ye, C., Holt, C., Keinath, M. C., Parker, H. J., . . . Lamanna, F. (2018). The
sea lamprey germline genome provides insights into programmed genome rearrangement and
vertebrate evolution. *Nature genetics, 50*(2), 270.
Smith, R., & Coast, J. (2013). The true cost of antimicrobial resistance. *Bmj, 346*, f1493.
Stenberg, J. A. (2017). A conceptual framework for integrated pest management. *Trends in plant science,*
22(9), 759-769.
Therneau, T. (2015). A Package for Survival Analysis in S. version 2.38.
Weir, B. S., & Cockerham, C. C. (1984). Estimating F-statistics for the analysis of population structure.
evolution, 38(6), 1358-1370.
Whalon, M., Mota-Sanchez, D., & Hollingworth, R. (2008). Analysis of global pesticide resistance in
arthropods. *Global pesticide resistance in arthropods, 5*, 31.
Whitehead, A., Clark, B. W., Reid, N. M., Hahn, M. E., & Nacci, D. (2017). When evolution is the solution
to pollution: Key principles, and lessons from rapid repeated adaptation of killifish (Fundulus
heteroclitus) populations. *Evolutionary applications, 10*(8), 762-783.
Willoughby, J. R., Harder, A. M., Tennessen, J. A., Scribner, K. T., & Christie, M. R. (2018). Rapid genetic
adaptation to a novel environment despite a genome-wide reduction in genetic diversity.
Molecular ecology, 27(20), 4041-4051.
Young, M. D., Wakefield, M. J., Smyth, G. K., & Oshlack, A. (2010). Gene ontology analysis for RNA-seq:
accounting for selection bias. *Genome biology, 11*(2), R14.
557
558

Data Accessibility Statement

Code and scripts are available at https://github.com/ChristieLab/sea_lamprey_TFM. Trimmed

reads will be available via https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra upon acceptance of manuscript.

Author Contributions

MRC, ASM, and MSS designed the project, all authors provided logistic support, ASM

performed molecular analyses, XY, AMH, and ASM performed gene expression and genomic

analyses, ASM and MMS performed survival analyses, and XY, ASM, and MRC wrote the

manuscript with input from all authors.

Competing Interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

(a)

N=565

L. Michigan

Manistee R.

km
0 30 60

56 years of TFM treatment

N=517

Corbeau
Crk.

L. Champlain

km
0 10 20

LaPlatte R.

26 years of TFM treatment

N=404

Connecticut R.

Salmon R.

Atlantic Ocean

km
0 10 20

untreated

(b)

(c)

(d)

Figure 1. Sample collection sites, sample sizes, and pesticide (TFM) treatment histories for larval sea lamprey used in this study (a). Connecticut River sea lamprey were collected from their native range whereas sea lamprey from Lake Michigan and Lake Champlain are considered invasive. Sea lamprey abundance and metric tons of TFM applied to Lake Michigan from 1987 onwards (b); notice that TFM is an effective pesticide with decrease in lamprey abundance following increases in TFM application. The larval stage of sea lamprey remain buried in the sediment (c), aggregate in high densities, and are targeted with the pesticide TFM. After transformation, the juveniles are generalist parasites, using their circularly-arrayed teeth to attach to hosts and their rasping tongues to feed (d).

Figure 2. Results of toxicology assays illustrating survival through time and lethal concentrations. In 2016 trials, survival analyses revealed that previously unexposed larvae collected from treated populations did not survive at higher rates than larvae collected from the native population during exposure to lethal concentrations of TFM (a). In 2017 trials, independent toxicology assays from additional larvae collected from Lake Michigan (MI) and Connecticut River (native range; CT) again revealed that larvae collected from populations with a history of exposure did not survive lethal doses of TFM at higher rates than larvae collected from the native range (b). Lethal concentrations for 25% (LC25) and 50% (LC50) mortality were calculated and two separate assays were performed for Connecticut River individuals (CT1 and CT2). Dashed green lines border the range of TFM values larvae would be exposed to under typical stream application conditions. Collectively, these results illustrate that resistance to lethal concentrations of TFM has not yet evolved.

Figure 3. Transcriptomic and genomic evidence of incipient resistance (IR) in sea lamprey. A total of 336 genes were differentially expressed in response to sublethal concentrations of TFM in larval sea lamprey collected from Lake Michigan, the population with the longest history of TFM treatment (a). By contrast, only 21 and 68 genes were identified as differentially expressed in sea lamprey from Lake Champlain (b) and Connecticut River (native range) (c), respectively. After aligning reads back to the sea lamprey reference genome (sea lamprey have 99 chromosomes, 90 of which are assembled), calling SNPs and calculating F_{ST} between Lake Michigan and Connecticut River, three outliers relating to TFM's primary mode of action, uncoupling the electron transport chain, were identified: *NDUFA9*, a gene encoding a subunit of complex I in the electron transport chain, *ATP5PB*, a gene encoding subunit b of ATP synthase, and *PLCB1*, a gene encoding phospholipase c beta 1.

(a) Upregulated Genes Increase ETS Activity

(b) ATP5PB

(c) ATP5F1B

(d) PLCB1

(e) PLCD4

Figure 4. The pesticide TFM's primary mode of action is to act as a protonophore, translocating protons from the inter-membrane space back into the inner mitochondrial matrix, thus disrupting oxidative phosphorylation (a). Several genes upregulated in Lake Michigan, the population with the longest history of exposure, may play a role in responding to TFM's mode of action. For example, the upregulation of *CRCM1* and *PLCD4* increases intracellular concentrations of calcium and likely enhance oxidative phosphorylation in Lake Michigan ammocoetes when exposed to TFM (a, e). The gene *ATP5PB*, which encodes subunit b of ATP synthase and was identified as a putatively adaptive outlier (Fig. 3d), is nearly fixed at a bi-allelic SNP in the treated Lake Michigan and Lake Champlain populations, but segregates for different alleles in the native-range sea lamprey (b). A gene encoding an additional subunit of ATP synthase, *ATP5F1B*, is canalized for high expression in treated populations (i.e., the gene is expressed at high levels in both treatment (TFM+) and control (TFM-) individuals from the treated Lake Michigan (LM) and Lake Champlain (LC) populations) (c). By contrast, this gene is not constitutively upregulated in native-range, Connecticut River (CT) sea lamprey, but responds plastically to treatment. The gene *PLCB1*, which encodes phospholipase c beta 1 and was also identified as an outlier (Fig. 3d), is nearly fixed for alternative alleles at a bi-allelic SNP in the treated Lake Michigan and the native-range sea lamprey populations (d). A directly related gene encoding phospholipase c delta 4, *PLCD4*, shows significantly different levels of expression between control (TFM-) and treatment (TFM+) in Lake Michigan (e). Error bars depict standard deviation, *p*-value calculated from FDR-corrected tests of differential gene expression.