Title: Convergent stress response repertoire to thermal challenges in a temperate aposymbiotic

coral

Authors: Wuitchik DM, Almanzar A, Benson BE, Brennan SA, Chavez JD, Liesegang MB,

Reavis JL, Reyes CL, Schniedewind MK, Trumble IF, and Davies SW

Department of Biology, Boston University, Boston, MA

Abstract:
Corals are threatened worldwide due to rapidly warming oceans associated with anthropogenic
climate change. A growing body of work has explored how corals respond to heat stress, however,
responses of corals across the full range of their thermal breadth are rarely explored even though
winter colds are also known to induce coral stress. Here, we leverage the temperate stony coral,
Astrangia poculata, which naturally exhibits a facultative symbiosis with Symbiodiniaceae, to
explicitly examine how thermal challenges influence coral hosts in isolation from their symbionts.
Aposymbiotic *A. poculata* were collected from Woods Hole, MA, the northern range limit for this
species. Corals were thermally challenged in two independent common garden experiments (Heat
challenge: 31˚C, 10 days; Cold challenge: 6˚C, 16 days) to determine the effects of divergent
thermal stressors. Behavioural responses to food stimuli were monitored throughout the thermal
challenges and genome-wide gene expression profiling (TagSeq) was used to characterize
molecular underpinnings of the coral's response to stress in its aposymbiotic state. Behaviourally,
both thermal challenges induced polyp retraction and colonies failed to respond to food stimuli.
Surprisingly, seven times as many genes were differentially expressed under cold challenge heat
challenge. Despite a greater magnitude of response under cold challenge, significant similarities
in gene expression were detected across the two thermal challenge experiments, with many of the
most responsive genes having been previously implicated in coral heat stress response. Given that
our data were generated from aposymbiotic colonies, we hypothesize that these genes previously
linked to heat stress are more likely indicative of a generalized stress response. Overall this work
highlights the unique insights facultatively symbiotic corals offer for deciphering the stress
response of the coral host in the absence of bleaching.

Introduction

Temperature is an important factor in determining species distribution patterns in ectothermic

organisms [1]. As sea surface temperatures continue to rise, understanding how this will affect

species distributions demands a broad understanding of an organisms' physiological sensitivities

to temperature across their native range. There is overwhelming evidence that temperature

increases associated with anthropogenic climate change are having widespread ecological

consequences on marine species distributions [2,3]. Coral reefs are particularly sensitive to these

thermal changes, which have been implicated in widespread reef declines [4]. Temperature

anomalies are the primary driver of the breakdown of the obligate symbiotic relationship between

corals and their endosymbiotic algae [5] in the family Symbiodiniaceae [6]. This breakdown

results in the expulsion of algae from coral host tissue in a process commonly referred to as coral

bleaching. Because symbiotic algae translocate carbon sugars to the coral host, losing these

symbionts results in significant energy loss and many corals are unable to survive extended periods

in a bleached state [7].

The majority of research on coral bleaching has focused on responses to elevated temperatures in

tropical reef-building corals [8]. However, tropical corals are known to bleach in response to a

variety of stressors, including high nutrients [9], ocean acidification [10], pathogens [11], low

salinity [12] and chemical exposures [13]. Coral responses to cold stress remain understudied, even

though these events can have substantial impacts on reefs. For example, in 2010 a cold water

bleaching event decimated inshore coral populations along the Florida reef tract [14], and cold

water has caused bleaching on the Great Barrier Reef [15]. While the main effect of climate change

on marine systems is a net increase in mean global sea surface temperatures, these cold thermal

challenges will still occur [16] and may disproportionately affect subtropical and temperate coral

species.

Tropical reef-building corals live in oligotrophic waters and cannot survive long-term without their

symbionts. Because energy deprivation in these corals results from any mechanism of symbiont

loss [17], uncoupling a thermal stress response from a general stress response (i.e. energy deficit)

is challenging. Given that many tropical corals exhibit an obligate symbiotic relationship, it is

difficult to uncouple the host's stress response to extreme temperatures from that of the host's

response to algal by-products released under stress (i.e. reactive oxygen species (ROS) [18]) and

the resulting energy deprivation from the loss their algal symbiont induced by a bleached state.

However, there are several species of subtropical and temperate reef-building corals that exhibit

facultative symbioses. The Northern Star Coral, *Astrangia poculata,* exhibits a

facultatively symbiotic relationship with *Breviolum psygmophilum* [19] and can be found naturally

in sympatry across two symbiotic states that are visually distinguishable by colour. Symbiotic

colonies appear brown due to high densities of *B. psygmophilum*, and much like a bleached coral,

aposymbiotic colonies of *A. poculata* appear white due to very low algal densities [20]. Unlike

obligately symbiotic corals, *A. poculata* can thrive in its "bleached" state by feeding autonomously

via heterotrophy. Additionally, *A. poculata* experiences large seasonal variation in temperature at

its northern range, making these populations ideal models for investigating how corals might

withstand wide thermal ranges. Taken together, *A. poculata* provides a unique opportunity to

leverage its aposymbiotic state to determine how broad thermal anomalies influence the coral host

in isolation from its symbionts.

Characterising changes in gene expression profiles provides a snapshot into the current

physiological state of an organism, offering insights into the biological processes, molecular

functions, and cellular components that corals engage to withstand various stressors. Modern

transcriptomics have demonstrated that corals mount dynamic responses to pollutants [21,22], pH

[23,24] and bacterial challenges [25,26] and considerable efforts have been made to understand

how corals respond to heat challenges (for review see [8]). Interestingly, similar patterns of gene

expression emerge from these different stressors. Barshis *et al.* [27] made the connection that

corals demonstrate a widespread stress response across thousands of genes much like that of yeast

in what is termed the environmental stress response (ESR). The ESR in yeast is characterized by

a consistent response to diverse environmental stressors [28]. How corals respond to divergent

stressors remains understudied, and testing single stressors does not indicate whether genes being

expressed are a unique response to a particular stressor or a generalized ESR.

In order to disentangle how coral hosts respond to thermal challenges in isolation, we leverage the

facultative symbiosis offered by *A. poculata* to assess how thermal challenges influence the host's

stress response. We present two experiments that independently assess the behavioural and

molecular responses of aposymbiotic *A. poculata* to divergent thermal challenges. We then

contrast these stress responses to better understand this coral's ESR to a wide breadth of thermal

challenges to explore how conserved these response repertoires might be.

Figure 1 | A) Map of the eastern seaboard of the United States with a native range of *Astrangia poculata* in green. Inset shows the Woods Hole collection site denoted with a yellow star. Distributions are based on [29]. **B)** Seasonal temperature profile at Woods Hole averaged over ten years (2008-2018). The black solid line indicates mean monthly temperatures with mean monthly maximum and minimum temperatures in grey. Temperatures (˚C) of thermal challenge experimental controls (dashed lines) and treatments (solid lines) are superimposed with cold challenge treatments in blue and heat challenge treatments in red. Seasonal temperatures were mined from the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration weather buoy #BZBM3. **C)** Picture of an aposymbiotic *Astrangia poculata* colony fragment.

Methods

Thermal challenge common garden experiments

Aposymbiotic colonies of *Astrangia poculata* (n = 18; Figure 1C) were collected in Woods Hole,

Massachusetts (41.54 N, 70.64 W; Figure 1A) in October 2017 and transported to the Marine

Invertebrate Research Facility at Boston University. Colonies were acclimated to 16°C for three

weeks. On November 17, 2017, colonies were fragmented, and each nubbin was assigned a unique

ID based on colony ID and glued to a labelled dish. Corals were then further acclimated at 16°C

under a 12 L:12 D photoperiod with light levels ranging from 6-12 µmol m^{-2}s^{-1} and fed *Artemia*

nauplii daily for 24 days.

Thermal challenge I: Cold experiment

Nine colonies were assigned to the cold challenge experiment. At least one nubbin (n = 43) from

each colony was represented in one of three replicate tanks assigned to control conditions (22˚C)

and one of three to the cold challenge treatment (22°C that was incrementally lowered to 6°C over

16 days). It is worth noting that 6°C is above the minimum temperature *A. poculata* experience

within their normal seasonal averages (Figure 1B), however, achieving lower temperatures was

limited by the capacity of our chillers. In addition, the rate of chilling was much more rapid than

what these corals experience naturally and given that these corals were collected in the summer,

the rate of change and the temperature achieved is expected to represent a considerable thermal

challenge.

Thermal challenge II: Heat experiment

An independent set of nine aposymbiotic colonies of *A. poculata* were fragmented (n = 43) and at

least one nubbin from each colony were assigned to each treatment. There were three replicate

tanks for control conditions (16°C) as well as the heat challenge treatment (23°C that was

incrementally ramped every three days until 31°C was achieved; t_{total} = 10 days) and at least one

nubbin of each colony was assigned to each treatment (Figure 3B). Due to insufficient RNA

quality, some samples were not successfully represented in library preparations. As a result, four

colonies are only represented in one of the treatments. It is also worth noting that the final heat

challenge temperature tested here was well above the maximum temperature these corals typically

experience at their source location (Figure 1B).

Coral polyp behaviour in response to food stimulus

In the cold challenge experiment, corals were fed daily and subsequent feeding behaviours were

recorded. In contrast, in the heat challenge experiment, corals were offered food every third day.

Coral polyp behaviour in response to the food stimulus was quantified as the total coral surface

area that had observable polyp extension relative to retracted polyps. This was scored on a scale

of 1 to 5 based on the estimated percentage of active polyps within a fragment (1 = 0%, 2 = 25%,

3 = 50%, 4 = 75%, 5 = 100%) and the same researcher conducted all behavioural assays to control

for observer biases. An ordered logistic regression was performed to establish if temperature

influenced polyp extension rates using the *polr* function as part of the *MASS* package (version 7.3-

51.1) in R.

Global gene expression profiling

Upon reaching maximum thermal differences between challenge and control treatments in both

experiments, several aposymbiotic polyps from all colonies were sampled using sterilized bone

cutters, immediately placed in 200 proof ethanol and stored at -80°C. Total RNA was extracted

using an RNAqueous kit (Ambion by LifeTechnologies) following the manufacturer's

recommendations. An additional step using 0.5 mm glass beads (BioSpec), which were added to

the vial of lysis buffer and samples were homogenized using a bead beater for 1 min. RNA quantity

and integrity were determined using a DeNovix DS-11+ spectrophotometer and ribosomal RNA

bands were confirmed on 1% agarose gels. Trace DNA contamination was removed using a DNase

1 (Ambion) digestion at 37°C for 45 minutes, then libraries were created from 1500 ng of total

RNA following [30] and adapted for Illumina Hi-Seq sequencing [31,32]. In brief, RNA was heat-

sheared and transcribed into first-strand cDNA using a template-switching oligo and

SMARTScribe reverse transcriptase (Clontech). Complementary-DNA was then PCR- amplified,

individual libraries were normalized, and Illumina barcodes were incorporated using a secondary

PCR. Samples were pooled and size-selected prior to sequencing on Illumina Hiseq 2500 single-

end (SE) 50 basepair (bp) at Tufts University Core Facility (TUCF). Of the 43 samples within each

experiment, 23 and 27 libraries were prepared for the heat and cold challenge experiments,

respectively.

Gene Expression Analyses

A preliminary *A. poculata* holobiont transcriptome [33] was first separated into the host and

symbiont fractions (following [24]). In brief, the resulting host transcriptome was cleaned by

removing all genes that had high-level matches to the SILVA ribosomal small (16s/18s) and large

(34s/28s) subunit databases [34] using BLASTn [35]. Genes which had annotations associated

with chloroplasts were also removed as they are indicative of symbiont or turf algae contamination.

Raw reads across libraries ranged from 2.1-7.4 million SE 50 bp sequences. Illumina TruSeq

adapters   and   poly-A   tails   were   removed   using   the   *FASTX-Toolkit*   (v   0.0.14,

http://hannonlab.cshl.edu/fastx_toolkit) and resulting sequences that were less than 20 bp in length

were removed. In addition, only those sequences with > 90% of bases having a quality score > 20

were retained. PCR duplicates were removed and resulting quality-filtered reads were mapped to

the cleaned *A. poculata* transcriptome using Bowtie2 [36]. Raw count data for each challenge

experiment were first tested for outliers using *arrayQualityMetrics* as part of DESeq [37] and no

outliers were detected for either experiment. DESeq2 [38] was then used to identify differentially

expressed genes (DEGs) associated with heat and cold thermal challenge relative to their

respective controls using a Wald's test. P-values were adjusted for multiple testing using the

Benjamini and Hochberg method (FDR < 0.05; [39]). Lastly, expression data for each experiment

were r-log normalized and these data were used as input for a principal component analysis. A

permutational multivariate analysis of variance was then used to determine if overall gene

expression patterns between thermal challenge treatments differed significantly from their controls

using the *adonis* function in Vegan v2.5-4 [40].

Gene ontology (GO) enrichment analysis was performed using adaptive clustering of GO

categories and Mann–Whitney U tests (GO-MWU) based on the ranking of signed log p-values

[41], which is particularly suitable for non-model organisms [42]. Results were visualized in

dendrograms tracing the level of gene sharing between significant categories and direction of

change in treatment temperatures compared to their respective controls. All data for the two

thermal challenge experiments were analyzed separately.

Testing for a convergent response to thermal challenge

Lists of DEGs (FDR < 0.05) between the two thermal challenge experiments were compared and

visualized using a Venn Diagram and significant enrichment of genes at the intersection between

experiments was tested for using a hypergeometric test. The DEGs at the intersection between

experiments (common DEGs) were visualized based on log fold change for each experiment and

the most highly up- and down-regulated genes were highlighted and defined as convergently

responding genes (CRG). GO categories that were independently identified as enriched (FDR <

0.05) in both experiments were visualized by their respective delta-ranks of enrichment to

demonstrate the conservation of GO function across the thermal challenges (for details, see [42]).

Results

Astrangia poculata *response to cold challenge*

Throughout the experiment, *Astrangia poculata* behavioural responses to food stimulus under

control conditions varied, however, nearly all colonies exhibited some polyp extension (Figure

2A). This contrasts with behaviours observed under cold challenge, where rapid declines in polyp

activity were observed by day eight (12˚C) and most polyps remained inactive across cooler

temperatures (10˚C-6˚C, Figure 2A). Overall, *A. poculata* polyp activity was significantly reduced

under cold challenge ($p < 0.01$). Transcriptomes of *A. poculata* were also significantly influenced

by cold challenge and a strong treatment effect on overall gene expression was observed (*Adonis*

$p_{treatment} < 0.001$, Figure 2C), with cold challenge resulting in 3,428 (7.8%) DEGs (FDR < 0.05;

1,468 (3.3%) up-regulated; 1,960 (4.5%) down-regulated). There were also many GO terms

enriched between cold challenge and control conditions (FDR < 0.10; BP = 419, MF = 106, CC =

146; Supplemental Figure 1). Of these, notable GO terms include: SNAP receptor activity

(GO:0005486), tumour necrosis factor-activated receptor (GO:0005031), apoptotic signalling

(GO:0097190) and cell death (GO:0008219).

Figure 2 | *Astrangia poculata* behavioural and transcriptomic response to cold challenge. A) Frequency of behavioural scores (proportion of polyps extended per fragment, 1 = 0%, 2 = 25%, 3 = 50%, 4 = 75%, 5 = 100%) in response to food stimulus throughout the 16-day experiment (Left: Cold Control, Right: Cold Challenge, $p < 0.01$). B) Temperature profile of experimental tanks throughout the 16-day experiment, where blue represents cold challenge and grey represents control conditions. C) Principal component analysis of overall gene expression with blue symbols representing gene expression of coral fragments from cold challenge conditions and grey symbols representing gene expression of coral fragments under control conditions. Percentages represent the total amount of variance explained by each axis and shaded areas are 95% confidence ellipses. P-value indicates the significance of treatment using a permutational multivariate analysis of variance.

Astrangia poculata responses to heat challenge

Throughout the experiment, *Astrangia poculata* behavioural responses to food stimulus under

control conditions were consistent and coral polyps remained fully extended (Figure 3A). This

contrasts with behavioural responses under heat challenge, where corals exhibited less polyp

activity in response to food stimulus as temperatures increased. By the end of the experiment (day

10), only one colony under heat challenge was observed to have 100% polyp extension and half

of the colonies had less than 25% of their polyps extended (Figure 3A). Overall, *A. poculata* polyp

activity was significantly reduced under heat challenge ($p < 0.01$). Transcriptomes of *A. poculata*

were also significantly influenced by heat challenge and a significant effect of treatment on overall

gene expression was observed (*Adonis* $p_{treatment} < 0.001$, Figure 3C) with 485 (1.1%) DEGs (FDR

< 0.05; 230 (0.53%) up-regulated; 255 (0.58%) down-regulated) observed. Many GO terms were

found to be significantly enriched under heat challenge relative to control conditions (FDR < 0.10;

BP = 179, MF = 91, CC = 93; Supplemental Figure 1) and notable GO terms include: NF-kappaB

complex (GO:0033256), mitochondrial parts (GO:0005739), catabolic process (GO:0009894), and

regulation of proteolysis (GO:0030162).

Figure 3 | *Astrangia poculata* behavioural and transcriptomic response to heat challenge. A) Frequency of behavioural scores (proportion of polyps extended per fragment, 1 = 0%, 2 = 25%, 3 = 50%, 4 = 75%, 5 = 100%) in response to food stimulus throughout the 10-day experiment (Left: Heat Control, Right: Heat Challenge, p < 0.01). B) Temperature profile of experimental tanks throughout the 16-day experiment, where red represents heat challenge and grey represents control conditions. C) Principal component analysis of overall gene expression with red symbols representing gene expression of coral fragments from heat challenge conditions and grey symbols representing gene expression of coral fragments under control conditions. Percentages represent the total amount of variance explained by each axis and shaded boxes are 95% confidence ellipses. P-value indicates the significance of treatment using a permutational multivariate analysis of variance.

Convergent response repertoires to heat and cold challenge in Astrangia poculata

Both sets of thermal challenges induced a reduction in polyp activity in response to food stimulus

(Figure 2A, 3A), however, there was a more pronounced reduction in behaviour to cold challenge

where nearly all polyps were retracted. There were seven times more genes that were differentially

expressed under cold challenge compared to heat challenge (Figure 4). More than half (267 out of

485) of DEGs in the heat challenge experiment were also differentially expressed in the cold

challenge experiment, which is significantly more genes shared between experiments than would

be expected by chance (hypergeometric test, $p < 0.05$). Genes that were up- or down-regulated

under both thermal challenges were visualized and the most notable highly up- or down-regulated

genes are highlighted in Figure 4B. These genes include *tumour necrosis receptor 3* (TRAF3),

malignant in brain tumours 1 (DMBT1), *universal stress protein A* (USPA), *trypsin,* and

oncoprotein-induced transcript 3 (OIT). GO terms enriched in both experiments were also plotted

by heat and cold experimental delta-ranks of enrichment for each comparison (FDR < 0.10; BP =

113, CC = 49, MF = 24, supplemental figures 2-4) and the top three similarly enriched GO terms

for each GO category have been highlighted (Table 1).

Table 1 | Top enriched GO terms conserved between cold and heat challenge experiments.

Biological Process	Molecular function	Cellular Component
Regulation of glucose import in response to insulin stimulus (GO:2001273)	Oxidoreductase activity, acting on a sulfur group of donors, quinone or similar compound as acceptor (GO:0016672)	Methylosome (GO:0034709)
Spliceosomal snRNP assembly (GO:0000387)	Death receptor activity (GO:0005035)	Azurophil granule membrane (GO:0035577)

Mitochondrial transmembrane transport (GO:1990542)	Prostaglandin-D synthase activity (GO:0004667)	Amphisome (GO:0044753)

Figure 4 | *Astrangia poculata* transcriptomic response to heat and cold thermal challenge. **A)** Venn diagram of differentially expressed genes that are shared (intersection) between cold (blue) and heat (red) thermal challenges. These genes were designated as convergently responding genes (CRG). **B)** CRG ($n = 267$) under heat and cold thermal challenge with their respective log-2fold changes. Annotated CRG of interest that are consistently up- or down-regulated are highlighted and labelled with gene symbols. Highlighted up-regulated CRG include *tumour necrosis receptor 3* (TRAF3), *deleted in malignant brain tumours 1* (DMBT1), *universal stress protein A* (USPA). Highlighted down-regulated CRG include *trypsin1,* and *oncoprotein-induced transcript 3* (OIT).

Discussion

Astrangia poculata *exhibit strong response to cold challenge*

Astrangia poculata from Woods Hole represents one of the most northern populations of the

species and these corals experience a wide range of temperatures throughout the year (Figure 1B).

Given this temperature range, it was surprising that such strong behavioural and transcriptomic

responses were observed under cold challenge (Figure 2A; 2C). This reduction in polyp activity

under cold temperatures is consistent with field observations during winter months, when corals

fail to respond to stimulus in the field [43]. This dormant polyp behaviour is possibly a quiescent

response to cope with long winter cold periods. However, very little is known about quiescence in

coral, and even less is known about what a transcriptomic signature of quiescence might look like.

Previous gene expression work described larval transcriptomic profiles associated with diapause

[44], which may have signatures similar to quiescence. Expression profiles associated with

diapause included cell cycle arrest, reduced transcription, increased ribosome production and

upregulation of oxidative stress defences [44]. Here, we observed strong overall transcriptomic

modifications associated with the cold challenge (Figure 2C), however, these gene expression

patterns were not consistent with diapause. Instead, we found GO enrichment that is consistent

with stress signatures in previous coral studies. SNAP receptor activity (GO:0005486) was highly

enriched under cold challenge, which has been implicated in stress from high solar irradiance and

is thought to be involved in coral bleaching [45]. Tumour necrosis factor–activated receptor

(GO:0005031), which is involved in regulating death receptor activity, was enriched and these

receptors have been heavily implicated in responses to heat-related stressors [27,46,47]. This stress

signature is further corroborated by enrichment of regulation of apoptotic signalling pathways

(GO:0097190) and cell death (GO:0008219), which were enriched under cold challenge (Fig S1).

Apoptosis is a universal response of severely stressed cells [48] and its upregulation suggests that

the cold challenge performed here elicited a strong stress response from *A. poculata*. This stress

response is intriguing considering that the temperatures achieved in this experiment were well

within the thermal range that these corals experience in their natural environment (Figure 1B).

However, we also acknowledge that the rate of temperature change is important and that in their

native environments these corals would experience these temperature shifts across seasons. We,

therefore, suspect that this rate of change contributed to the strong stress signature observed here.

We propose that future work would benefit from a gradual decrease in temperature to mirror the

natural temporal progression of the field more closely. In addition, field-collected samples across

seasons may be more likely to capture the gene expression signature of quiescence.

Astrangia poculata *exhibit subtle responses to extreme heat challenge*

Natural summer temperatures reached at Woods Hole over the last 10 years was much lower than

the heat challenge reached in our experiment (Figure 1B). It is therefore surprising that *A. poculata*

from this site did not exhibit extreme behavioural and transcriptomic responses under this heat

challenge given that the temperature was considerably higher than temperatures they ever

experience *in situ* (Figure 3A; 3C). Corals did exhibit reductions in polyp activity in response to

food stimulus under heat challenge, however, unlike observed polyp inactivity during winter

months [43], there is no prior evidence for a decrease in polyp activity due to warm temperatures

in this species. In tropical corals, polyp contraction can occur as a response to heat stress and often

precedes tissue necrosis [49]. We speculate that similar to the response to the cold challenge, this

reduced behaviour was most likely due to stress.

A coral's molecular response to heat stress has been meticulously explored in tropical reef-building

corals (as reviewed in [8]), however, this is one of the first studies to explore the molecular

response of an aposymbiotic reef-building coral to heat challenge in the absence of the algal

symbiont. Much like we observed in response to cold challenge, heat challenge elicited a stress

signature often observed in coral. For example, NF-kappaB complex (GO:0033256) which is

important to coral innate immunity [50] was enriched under heat challenge (Figure S1) and this is

consistent with other coral heat stress studies [51–53]. We also observed an enrichment of many

terms related to mitochondria, suggesting that *A. poculata* were exhibiting increased respiration

under heat challenge. Enrichment of respiration under high temperatures is not surprising given

that these patterns have been demonstrated in heat-tolerant coral larvae [42]. Interestingly,

enrichment of genes associated with respiration was also previously found under extreme pCO$_2$

stress in *Siderastrea siderea*, highlighting the potential for greater energetic demands associated

with the putative coral ESR [24]. Lastly, we observed an enrichment of regulation of catabolic

processes (GO:0009894), specifically the regulation of proteolysis (GO:0030162). Protein

catabolism is typical during starvation [54], as it's indicative of depleted stores of fats and

carbohydrates following the cessation of heterotrophy (i.e. reduced polyp extension), which would

be particularly detrimental to aposymbiotic corals. Overall, it appears that aposymbiotic *A.*

poculata mirror the hallmarks of heat stress responses that have been previously described in their

symbiotic tropical relatives. It would be interesting to pursue work contrasting how aposymbiotic

and symbiotic *A. poculata* respond to heat stress to see how symbiotic state modulates the heat

stress response.

Cold challenge elicits a much stronger response than heat challenge in A. poculata

Our data demonstrate that *A. poculata* exhibits greater behavioural and transcriptomic responses

to the cold challenge applied here relative to heat challenge, which is surprising considering that

the cold challenge temperatures achieved were within the ecological bounds of *A. poculata*'s

normal environmental temperature range (Figure 1B). This contrasts with heat challenge

temperatures, which far exceeded any temperature experienced within their native environment

and very likely reached their thermal maximum in their southern range. While few studies have

directly compared thermal extremes in corals, similar studies that have contrasted heat and cold

challenges in marine invertebrates have demonstrated mixed results. For example, Roth & Deheyn

found that acute cold stress was more detrimental to the tropical coral *Acropora yongei* than heat

stress, however, they did suggest that heat stress may be more detrimental over long term

timescales [55]. This contrasts with Nielsen *et al.* who found that *Acropora millepora* improved

its physiological condition under cold temperatures compared with ambient or heat conditions

[56]. Bellis & Denver found that heat stress caused greater bleaching in the sea anemone *Aiptasia*

than did cold stress [57] and Zhu *et al.* observed similar transcriptional responses of oysters to both

heat and cold stress [58]. While there is no clear consensus, it is widely accepted that the specific

temperatures reached in each stress treatment and the rate at which those temperatures are reached

are both important factors and these responses are dependent on the species-specific thermal niche

breadth [59]. For example, the heat challenge exposure in our study may have elicited a more

muted response because *A. poculata* were collected in the summer, so perhaps they were already

acclimated to warmer conditions. Future experimental designs should, therefore, focus on

assessing the influence of thermal challenges across seasons to better understand the influence of

these divergent thermal stressors.

Convergent stress response repertoire to cold and heat challenge

Our behavioural results align with field observations of *A. poculata* where polyp extension

diminishes during winter months [43]. This lack of polyp activity could be indicative of corals

entering a quiescent state, where they lower metabolic activity as an adaptation to cooler

temperatures. However, our behavioural data also suggest that this reduction in polyp activity is

convergent across thermal challenges (Fig 2A, 3A). Interestingly, our transcriptomic responses

under both thermal challenges show up-regulation of genes associated with catabolic activity,

particularly protein catabolism (Fig S2-3). Large scale protein catabolism often occurs during

starvation after an organism has utilized most of its carbohydrate and lipid stores [54], which is

consistent with reductions in polyp activities observed here under both thermal challenges. Given

that quiescence is associated with reduced metabolism, we suggest that even though our cold-

challenged corals were exhibiting quiescence phenotypes, increases in catabolic-related genes

point instead to high energetic demands associated with stress-related cell functions at both thermal

extremes [48].

In addition to *A. poculata* exhibiting similar behavioural responses to both heat and cold thermal

challenges, we also found a set of convergently responsive genes (CRG) that were consistently

regulated across thermal challenge experiments (Figure 4B). These CRG included upregulation of

Deleted in malignant brain tumours 1 (DMBT1) under both thermal challenges. DMBT1 was

previously found highly up-regulated in corals that survived bacterial [26] and lipopolysaccharide

challenges [60]. Taken together, these data suggest that DMBT1 plays a role in both microbial and

broad thermal stress responses. Furthermore, *Tumour necrosis factor receptor 3* (TRAF3) was also

a highly up-regulated CRG under both thermal stressors. TRAF3 is an intracellular signalling

molecule that regulates mitogen-activated protein kinase activity and nuclear factor-κB (Nf-κB)

signalling [61], which has been shown to be upregulated during stress-induced bleaching in

Aiptasia [50]. TRAF3 has also been found to be constitutively up-regulated or "front-loaded" in

corals tolerant to heat stress [27,47,51] and has been found upregulated under low magnesium

[62], white band disease [63], and high carbon dioxide treatments [64]. Our results provide

evidence that TRAF3 may be a CRG that is consistently up-regulated in response to all stressors,

not just high temperatures.

Universal stress protein A (USPA) was also an up-regulated CRG under heat and cold

challenge (Fig 5B). USPA was previously found to be up-regulated under light stress [65] and, as

the name would suggest, USPA is produced in response to a large number of different

environmental stressors and is a highly conserved stress response gene in diverse taxa [66]. In

addition to up-regulated CRGs, a number of CRGs are similarly down-regulated in *A. poculata*

under both heat and cold challenge. These genes include *oncoprotein-induced transcript 3* (OIT),

which - like TRAF3 - was previously found to be frontloaded in thermally tolerant corals [27].

OIT3 has been found to be up-regulated under toxic stressors from a crude oil treatment [22] and

downregulated in response to low magnesium [62], providing evidence that this gene may serve a

fundamental role in stress responses more generally. *Trypsin* was also found to be a CRG, however,

it is not well established for its role in stress response in coral. Trypsin is involved in protein

catabolism [67] and it is therefore consistent with our findings that protein catabolism is being

regulated by both heat and cold challenges. Taken together, these CRG highlighted here appear to

be regulated in response to a wide range of stressors and may represent a core set of genes

comprising a generalized stress response.

In addition to CRG, we also found consistently enriched GO categories under both heat

and cold challenges that corroborate the biological functions of the CRGs highlighted above. For

example, regulation of glucose import in response to insulin stimulus (GO:2001273) was enriched

under both challenges (Table 1). While there is no direct evidence of insulin in corals, insulin-like

signalling has been reported to antagonize the transforming growth factor β pathway in sea sponges

(TGFβ) [68]. TGFβ signalling has been widely implicated in coral immunity and stress responses

including signalling apoptosis [69]. Apoptosis is a universal response of severely stressed cells

[48] and is associated with death receptor activity (GO:0008219), which was also enriched under

both heat and cold challenges. Corals that are sensitive to disease have also been observed to highly

upregulate apoptotic pathways, which have been suggested as clear indications of stress [25].

Overall, the enrichment of apoptosis-associated GO terms observed here under thermal challenges

likely indicate extreme stress and cell death and further confirm that the thermal challenges applied

here were likely achieved at too rapid a pace to allow for acclimation.

Conclusions

While the stress response repertoire in tropical reef-building corals has been widely studied,

especially in response to hot thermal extremes, this study represents the first to characterize the

stress response of a naturally aposymbiotic coral to divergent thermal challenges. Our results

demonstrate that divergent thermal challenges elicit a convergent stress response in aposymbiotic

corals in the absence of symbiont-associated ROS. The CRG highlighted here will provide the

foundation for future research into how the added complexity of symbiosis influences the stress

response of coral. Overall, this work effectively highlights the benefits to studying facultatively

symbiotic corals to disentangle stress responses of the coral host from their algal symbionts and

future work leveraging this facultative relationship may lead to a stronger mechanistic

understanding of why coral dysbiosis is increasing in frequency in corals worldwide.

Acknowledgements

This work was made possible through the Boston University Marine Program with special thanks

to Justin Scace for husbandry of *Astrangia poculata.* The authors extend appreciation to K. Sharp,

R. Rotjan, S. Grace and the annual Astrangia Workshop hosted by Roger Williams University and

Southern Connecticut State University for fostering creative conversations and collaborations

leading to this work. Also, we thank SJS Wuitchik and HE Aichelman for helpful edits and insights

on this manuscript.

Funding

This work was partially funded by Boston University's start-up package to S.W.D.

Data Availability

All sequences are available from the NCBI SRI under accession PRJNA595158. Code for all

analyses are available by request or can be found at wuitchik.weebly.com/bioinformatics.

Author Contributions

S.W.D designed the experiment. A.A., S.A.B., J.D.C., M.B.L., J.L.R., M.K.S., and I.F.T.

conducted the experiment. B.E.B. and C.L.R. completed all molecular work and TagSeq library

preparations. D.M.W. performed all statistical and bioinformatic analyses and drafted the

manuscript. S.W.D. supervised the experiment, analyses and co-authored the manuscript. All

authors edited and approved the manuscript.

1.   Angilleta MJ. 2009 *Thermal adaptation: a theoretical and empirical synthesis.* Oxford

University Press.

2.   Hoegh-Guldberg O *et al.* 2008 Change and Ocean Acidification. *Science.* **318**, 1737–

1742. (doi:10.1126/science.1152509)

3.   Pinsky ML, Eikeset AM, Mccauley DJ, Payne JL, Sunday JM. 2019 Greater vulnerability

to warming of marine versus terrestrial ectotherms. *Nature* (doi:10.1038/s41586-019-

1132-4)

4.   Hughes TP *et al.* 2017 Global warming and recurrent mass bleaching of corals. *Nature*

543. (doi:10.1038/nature21707)

5.   Venn AA, Loram JE, Douglas AE. 2008 Photosynthetic symbioses in animals. *J. Exp. Bot.*

59, 1069–1080. (doi:10.1093/jxb/erm328)

6.   LaJeunesse TC *et al.* 2018 Systematic Revision of Symbiodiniaceae Highlights the

Antiquity and Diversity of Coral Endosymbionts Article Systematic Revision of

Symbiodiniaceae Highlights the Antiquity and Diversity of Coral Endosymbionts. *Curr.*

Biol. **28**, 2570-2580.e6. (doi:10.1016/j.cub.2018.07.008)

7.   Weis VM. 2008 Cellular mechanisms of Cnidarian bleaching: Stress causes the collapse

of symbiosis. *J. Exp. Biol.* **211**, 3059–3066. (doi:10.1242/jeb.009597)

8.   Cziesielski MJ, Schmidt-Roach S, Aranda M. 2019 The past, present, and future of coral

heat stress studies. *Ecol. Evol.* , 1–12. (doi:10.1002/ece3.5576)

9.   Wiedenmann J, D'Angelo C, Smith EG, Hunt AN, Legiret FE, Postle AD, Achterberg EP.

2013 Nutrient enrichment can increase the susceptibility of reef corals to bleaching. *Nat.*

Clim. Chang. **3**, 160–164. (doi:10.1038/nclimate1661)

10. Anthony KRN, Kline DI, Diaz-Pulido G, Dove S, Hoegh-Guldberg O. 2008 Ocean

acidification causes bleaching and productivity loss in coral reef builders. *Proc. Natl.*

Acad. Sci. U. S. A. **105**, 17442–17446. (doi:10.1073/pnas.0804478105)

11. Ben-Haim Y, Rosenberg E. 2002 A novel Vibrio sp. pathogen of the coral Pocillopora

damicornis. *Mar. Biol.* **141**, 47–55. (doi:10.1007/s00227-002-0797-6)

12. Goreau TF. 1964 Mass expulsion of zooxanthellae from Jamaican reef communities after

hurricane flora. *Science.* **145**, 383–386. (doi:10.1126/science.145.3630.383)

13. Cervino JM, Hayes RL, Honovich M, Goreau TJ, Jones S, Rubec PJ. 2003 Changes in

zooxanthellae density, morphology, and mitotic index in hermatypic corals and anemones

exposed to cyanide. *Mar. Pollut. Bull.* **46**, 573–586. (doi:10.1016/S0025-326X(03)00071-

7)

14. Lirman D *et al.* 2011 Severe 2010 cold-water event caused unprecedented mortality to

corals of the Florida reef tract and reversed previous survivorship patterns. *PLoS One* **6**,

1–10. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0023047)

15. Hoegh-Guldberg O, Fine M. 2004 Low temperatures cause coral bleaching. *Coral Reefs*

23, 444–444. (doi:10.1007/s00338-004-0401-2)

16. Pörtner HO *et al.* 2019 IPCC, 2019: IPCC Special Report on the Ocean and Cryosphere in

a Changing Climate.

17. Baena-González E, Sheen J. 2008 Convergent energy and stress signaling. *Trends Plant*

Sci. **13**, 474–482. (doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2008.06.006)

18. McGinty ES, Pieczonka J, Mydlarz LD. 2012 Variations in Reactive Oxygen Release and

525  Antioxidant Activity in Multiple Symbiodinium Types in Response to Elevated

526  Temperature. *Microb. Ecol.* , 1000–1007. (doi:10.1007/s00248-012-0085-z)

527 19. Aichelman HE, Zimmerman RC, Barshis DJ. 2019 Adaptive signatures in thermal

528  performance of the temperate coral Astrangia poculata. *J. Exp. Biol.* **222**, 1–13.

529  (doi:10.1242/jeb.189225)

530 20. Dimond J, Carrington E. 2007 Temporal variation in the symbiosis and growth of the

531  temperate scleractinian coral Astrangia poculata. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* **348**, 161–172.

532  (doi:10.3354/meps07050)

533 21. Gust K a *et al.* 2014 Coral-zooxanthellae meta-transcriptomics reveals integrated response

534  to pollutant stress. *BMC Genomics* **15**, 591. (doi:10.1186/1471-2164-15-591)

535 22. Ruiz-Ramos D V, Fisher CR, Baums IB. 2017 Stress response of the black coral

536  Leiopathes glaberrima when exposed to sub-lethal amounts of crude oil and dispersant.

537  *Elem. Sci. Anthr.* **77**, 1–16.

538 23. Moya A *et al.* 2012 Whole Transcriptome Analysis of the Coral Acropora millepora

539  Reveals Complex Responses to CO 2-driven Acidification during the Initiation of

540  Calcification. *Mol. Ecol.* **21**, 2440–2454. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-294X.2012.05554.x)

541 24. Davies SW, Marchetti A, Ries JB, Castillo KD. 2016 Thermal and pCO2 Stress Elicit

542  Divergent Transcriptomic Responses in a Resilient Coral. *Front. Mar. Sci.* **3**, 1–15.

543  (doi:10.3389/fmars.2016.00112)

544 25. Fuess LE, Pinzón C JH, Weil E, Grinshpon RD, Mydlarz LD. 2017 Life or death: Disease-

545  tolerant coral species activate autophagy following immune challenge. *Proc. R. Soc. B*

546  *Biol. Sci.* **284**. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2017.0771)

547 26. Wright RM, Kenkel CD, Dunn CE, Shilling EN, Bay LK. 2017 Intraspecific differences in

molecular stress responses and coral pathobiome contribute to mortality under bacterial

challenge in Acropora millepora. *Sci. Rep.* , 1–13. (doi:10.1038/s41598-017-02685-1)

27.   Barshis DJ, Ladner JT, Oliver T a, Seneca FO, Traylor-Knowles N, Palumbi SR. 2013

Genomic basis for coral resilience to climate change. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **110**,

1387–92. (doi:10.1073/pnas.1210224110)

28.   Gasch A, Spellman P, Kao C, Carmel-Harel O, Eisen M, Storz G, Botstein D, Brown P.

2000 Genomic expression programs in the response of yeast cells to environmental

changes. *J. Chem. Phys.* **11**, 4241–4257. (doi:10.1063/1.1734046)

29.   Thornhill DJ, Kemp DW, Bruns BU, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW. 2008 Correspondence

between cold tolerance and temperate biogeography in a western Atlantic Symbiodinium

(Dinophyta) lineage. *J. Phycol.* **44**, 1126–1135. (doi:10.1111/j.1529-8817.2008.00567.x)

30.   Meyer E, Aglyamova G V., Matz M V. 2011 Profiling gene expression responses of coral

larvae (Acropora millepora) to elevated temperature and settlement inducers using a novel

RNA-Seq procedure. *Mol. Ecol.* **20**, 3599–3616. (doi:10.1111/j.1365-294X.2011.05205.x)

31.   Dixon GB, Davies SW, Aglyamova G V, Meyer E, Bay LK, Matz M V. 2015 Genomic

determinants of coral heat tolerance across latitudes. *Science.* **348**, 2014–2016.

32.   Lohman B, Weber J, Bolnick D. 2016 Evaluation of TagSeq, a reliable low-cost

alternative for RNAseq. *Mol. Ecol. Resour.* , 1–16.

(doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1101/036426.)

33.   Burmester EM. 2017 Insights into coral recovery based on symbiont state and

environmental conditions in the temperate, facultatively symbiotic coral Astrangia

poculata. Boston University.

34.   Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, Peplies J, Glöckner FO.

571   2013 The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: Improved data processing and

572   web-based tools. *Nucleic Acids Res.* **41**, 590–596. (doi:10.1093/nar/gks1219)

573   35.   Altschul S, Gish W, Miller W, Myers E, Lipman D. 1990 Basic Local Alignment Search

574   Tool. *J. Mol. Biol.* **215**, 403–410.

575   36.   Langmead B, Salzberg SL. 2012 Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. *Nat. Methods*

576   **9**, 357–359. (doi:10.1038/nmeth.1923)

577   37.   Anders S, Huber W. 2010 Differential expression analysis for sequence count data.

578   *Genome Biol.* **11**, R106. (doi:10.1186/gb-2010-11-10-r106)

579   38.   Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. 2014 Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion

580   for RNA-Seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol.* **15**, 550. (doi:10.1101/002832)

581   39.   Benjamini Y, Hochberg Y. 1995 Controlling the False Discovery Rate: A practical and

582   powerful approach to multiple testing. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B* **57**, 289–300.

583   40.   Oksanen J *et al.* 2019 vegan: community ecology package.

584   41.   Voolstra CR *et al.* 2011 Rapid evolution of coral proteins responsible for interaction with

585   the environment. *PLoS One* **6**, 1–11. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0020392)

586   42.   Dixon G, Davies S, Aglyamova G, Meyer E, Bay L, Matz M. 2015 Genomic determinants

587   of coral heat tolerance across latitudes. *Science.* **348**, 1460–1462.

588   43.   Grace S. 2017 Winter Quiescence, Growth Rate, and the Release from Competition in the

589   Temperate Scleractinian Coral Astrangia poculata (Ellis & Solander 1786). *Northeast.*

590   *Nat.* **24**, B119–B134. (doi:10.1656/045.024.s715)

591   44.   Strader ME. 2017 Investigating Complex Larval Traits in a Reef-building Coral.

592   University of Texas at Austin.

45.   Starcevic A, Dunlap WC, Cullum J, Malcolm Shick J, Hranueli D, Long PF. 2010 Gene

expression in the scleractinian Acropora microphthalma exposed to high solar irradiance

reveals elements of photoprotection and coral bleaching. *PLoS One* **5**.

(doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0013975)

46. Palumbi SR, Barshis DJ, Traylor-Knowles N, Bay RA. 2008 Mechanisms of reef coral

resistance to future climate change. *Science.* **344**, 4354–4364.

47. Seneca FO, Palumbi SR. 2015 The role of transcriptome resilience in resistance of corals

to bleaching. *Mol. Ecol.* (doi:10.1111/mec.13125)

48. Kültz D. 2005 Molecular and Evolutionary Basis of the Cellular Stress Response. *Annu.*

Rev. Physiol. **67**, 225–257. (doi:10.1146/annurev.physiol.67.040403.103635)

49. Kersting DK, Linares C. 2019 Living evidence of a fossil survival strategy raises hope for

warming-affected corals. *Sci. Adv.* **5**, 1–6. (doi:10.1126/sciadv.aax2950)

50. Mansfield KM *et al.* 2017 Transcription factor NF-κB is modulated by symbiotic status in

a sea anemone model of cnidarian bleaching. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 1–14. (doi:10.1038/s41598-017-

16168-w)

51. DeSalvo MK, Sunagawa S, Voolstra CR, Medina M. 2010 Transcriptomic responses to

heat stress and bleaching in the elkhorn coral Acropora palmata. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*

402, 97–113. (doi:10.3354/meps08372)

52. Traylor-Knowles N, Rose NH, Sheets EA, Palumbi SR. 2017 Early transcriptional

responses during heat stress in the coral Acropora hyacinthus. *Biol. Bull.* **232**, 91–100.

(doi:10.1086/692717)

53. Zhou Z *et al.* 2017 Suppression of NF-κB signal pathway by NLRC3-like protein in stony

coral Acropora aculeus under heat stress. *Fish Shellfish Immunol.* **67**, 322–330.

(doi:10.1016/j.fsi.2017.06.027)

54. Kaur J, Debnath J. 2015 Autophagy at the crossroads of catabolism and anabolism. *Nat.*

Rev. Mol. Cell Biol. **16**, 461–472. (doi:10.1038/nrm4024)

55. Roth MS, Deheyn DD. 2013 Effects of cold stress and heat stress on coral fluorescence in

reef-building corals. *Sci. Rep.* **3**, 1–8. (doi:10.1038/srep01421)

56. Nielsen JJ, Kenkel CD, Bourne DG, Despringhere L, Mocellin V, Bay LK. 2020

Physiological effects of heat and cold exposure in the common reef coral Acropora

millepora. *Coral Reefs* (doi:10.1007/s00338-019-01881-x)

57. Bellis ES, Denver DR. 2017 Natural variation in responses to acute heat and cold stress in

a sea anemone model system for coral bleaching. *Biol. Bull.* **233**, 168–181.

(doi:10.1086/694890)

58. Zhu Q, Zhang L, Li L, Que H, Zhang G. 2016 Expression Characterization of Stress

Genes Under High and Low Temperature Stresses in the Pacific Oyster , Crassostrea

gigas. *Mar. Biotechnol.* **18**, 176–188. (doi:10.1007/s10126-015-9678-0)

59. Louis YD, Bhagooli R, Kenkel CD, Baker AC, Dyall SD. 2017 Gene expression

biomarkers of heat stress in scleractinian corals: Promises and limitations. *Comp.*

Biochem. Physiol. Part - C Toxicol. Pharmacol. **191**, 63–77.

(doi:10.1016/j.cbpc.2016.08.007)

60. Fuess LE, Pinzón JH, Weil E, Mydlarz LD. 2016 Associations between transcriptional

changes and protein phenotypes provide insights into immune regulation in corals. *Dev.*

Comp. Immunol. **62**, 17–28. (doi:10.1016/j.dci.2016.04.017)

61. Häcker H, Tseng PH, Karin M. 2011 Expanding TRAF function: TRAF3 as a tri-faced

immune regulator. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* **11**, 457–468. (doi:10.1038/nri2998)

62. Yuyama I, Higuchi T. 2019 Differential gene expression in skeletal organic matrix

proteins of scleractinian corals associated with mixed aragonite/calcite skeletons under

low m Mg/Ca conditions. *PeerJ* **7**, 1–13. (doi:10.7717/peerj.7241)

63.   Libro S, Kaluziak ST, Vollmer S V. 2013 RNA-seq profiles of immune related genes in

the staghorn coral Acropora cervicornis Infected with white band disease. *PLoS One* **8**, 1–

11. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0081821)

64.   Kaniewska P, Campbell PR, Kline DI, Rodriguez-Lanetty M, Miller DJ, Dove S, Hoegh-

Guldberg O. 2012 Major cellular and physiological impacts of ocean acidification on a

reef building coral. *PLoS One* **7**. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0034659)

65.   DeSalvo MK, Estrada a., Sunagawa S, Medina M. 2012 Transcriptomic responses to

darkness stress point to common coral bleaching mechanisms. *Coral Reefs* **31**, 215–228.

(doi:10.1007/s00338-011-0833-4)

66.   Kvint K, Nachin L, Diez A, Nyström T. 2003 The bacterial universal stress protein:

Function and regulation. *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.* **6**, 140–145. (doi:10.1016/S1369-

5274(03)00025-0)

67.   Rawlings ND, Barrett AJ. 1994 Families of serine peptidases. *Methods Enzymol.*

(doi:10.1016/0076-6879(94)44004-2)

68.   Sun T, Wang Q, Yu Z, Zhang Y, Guo Y, Chen K, Shen X, Jiang H. 2007 Hyrtiosal, a

PTP1B inhibitor from the marine sponge Hyrtios erectus, shows extensive cellular effects

on PI3K/AKT activation, glucose transport, and TGFβ/Smad2 signaling. *ChemBioChem*

8, 187–193. (doi:10.1002/cbic.200600349)

69.   Weis VM. 2019 Cell Biology of Coral Symbiosis: Foundational Study Can Inform

Solutions to the Coral Reef Crisis. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* **59**, 845–855.

(doi:10.1093/icb/icz067)

Figure S1 | Gene ontology categories significantly enrichment (red: heat challenge, blue: cold

challenge). Font identifies adjusted-value from Mann-Whitney U test. Dendrogram clustering

similar GO categories.

Figure S2| Delta-ranks of enriched cellular components between cold and heat challenge

experiments.

677   **Figure S3|** Delta-ranks of enriched molecular functions between cold and heat challenge

678   experiments.

683   **Figure S4|** Delta-ranks of the enriched biological process between cold and heat challenge

684   experiments.

688