Domestication of the emblematic white cheese-making fungus *Penicillium camemberti* and its diversification into two varieties

Jeanne Ropars[1], Estelle Didiot[1], Ricardo C. Rodríguez de la Vega[1], Bastien Bennetot[1], Monika Coton[2], Elisabeth Poirier[2], Emmanuel Coton[2], Alodie Snirc[1], Stéphanie Le Prieur[1] and Tatiana Giraud[1]

[1]Ecologie Systematique et Evolution, Universite Paris-Saclay, CNRS, AgroParisTech, 91400 Orsay, France
[2]Univ Brest, Laboratoire Universitaire de Biodiversité et Écologie Microbienne, F-29280 Plouzané, France

Corresponding author and lead contact: Jeanne Ropars, jeanne.ropars@universite-paris-saclay.fr

Keywords: domestication, fungi, cheese, *Penicillium,* mycotoxin, horizontal gene transfer

Summary

Domestication involves recent adaptation under strong human selection and rapid diversification, and therefore constitutes a good model for studies of these processes. We studied the domestication of the emblematic white mold *Penicillium camemberti*, used for the maturation of soft cheeses, such as Camembert and Brie, about which surprisingly little was known, despite its economic and cultural importance. Whole genome-based analyses of genetic relationships and diversity revealed that an ancient domestication event led to the emergence of the gray-green *P. biforme* mold used in cheese-making, by divergence from the blue-green wild *P. fuscoglaucum* fungus. Another much more recent domestication event led to the generation of the *P. camemberti* clonal lineage as a sister group to *P. biforme*. Both these domestication events were associated with strong bottlenecks. *Penicillium biforme* displayed signs of phenotypic adaptation to cheese-making relative to *P. fuscoglaucum*, in terms of whiter color, faster growth on cheese medium under cave conditions, lower levels of toxin production and greater ability to prevent the growth of other fungi. The *P. camemberti* lineage displayed even stronger signs of domestication for all these phenotypic features. We also identified two differentiated *P. camemberti* varieties, apparently associated with different kinds of cheeses, and with contrasted phenotypic features in terms of color, growth, toxin production and competitive ability. We have, thus, identified footprints of domestication in these fungi, with genetic differentiation between cheese and wild populations, and specific phenotypic traits beneficial for cheese-making. This study has not only fundamental implications for our understanding of domestication but can also have important impacts on cheese-making.

Introduction

Understanding how organisms adapt to their environment is a key issue in evolutionary biology, requiring investigations of population subdivision, and levels of genetic and phenotypic diversity or adaptive divergence. Domestication is a good model for studies of adaptive divergence, as it involves recent adaptation events affecting known traits under strong human selection and rapid diversification. Several studies on domesticated animals (e.g. horse, dog, pig [1–3]) and plants (e.g. maize, apricot [4,5]) have improved our understanding of adaptive divergence by revealing how adaptation and diversification into varieties occurred. Maize, for example, has undergone major changes in phenotype compared to its wild relative (teosinte), including a decrease in tillering, and the development of larger, non-dehiscent grains [6]. Several different maize varieties have been selected for different usages, with sugar-rich varieties grown for human consumption as kernels and field corn varieties grown for animal feed. Similarly, a number of different *Brassica* varieties have been selected for their leaves (cabbage and kale), stems (kohlrabi), flower shoots (broccoli and cauliflower) or buds (Brussels sprouts). Dog breeds have also diversified greatly under human selection, with different breeds displaying very different behaviors and phenotypes. Such notable adaptation is often associated with a decrease in fitness in natural environments, with, for example, a decrease in or loss of sexual reproduction ability in bulldogs [7] and bananas [8], smaller brains and less acute sense organs in most domesticated animals [9].

Fungi are excellent models for studying evolution and adaptation in eukaryotes, given their many experimental assets [10], including their small genomes and tractability for laboratory experiments. They can therefore be used to address questions in evolutionary biology through complementary approaches, including genomic and experimental methods. Humans have domesticated several fungi for the fermentation of foods (e.g. for beer, bread, wine, dried sausage and cheese), the production of secondary metabolites used in pharmaceutics (e.g. penicillin), and for their nutritional and gustatory qualities (e.g. button and shiitake mushrooms) [11]. Despite their economic and industrial importance, and their utility as biological models for studying adaptive divergence, fungi used by humans have been little studied, with the exception of the budding yeast *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* used for beer, wine and bread production [12–22], the filamentous fungus *Aspergillus oryzae* used to ferment soy and rice products in Asia [23–25] and the blue-cheese mold *Penicillium roqueforti* [26–28]. Whole-genome analyses have revealed that *P. roqueforti* has been domesticated twice, in two independent events, resulting in one population specific to the Roquefort protected designation of origin (PDO), the other population being used worldwide for all types of blue cheeses [26–29]. The Roquefort population displays some genetic

diversity and had beneficial traits for cheese production before the industrial era, growing more

slowly in cheese and displaying greater spore production on bread, the traditional multiplication

medium. By contrast, the non-Roquefort cheese population is a clonal lineage with traits

beneficial for industrial cheese production, such as high levels of lipolytic activity, efficient cheese

cavity colonization and high salt tolerance. Some of these beneficial traits have been conferred by

two large horizontally transferred genomic regions, *Wallaby* and *CheesyTer* [27,28], in the clonal

non-Roquefort cheese population. The non-Roquefort cheese *P. roqueforti* population grows more

slowly in harsh conditions (minimal medium) than the Roquefort cheese population [28]. Whole-

genome analyses of *S. cerevisiae* have also revealed the existence of a cheese-specific population of

this yeast differentiated from the populations used for alcohol or bread production. The cheese

S. cerevisiae population assimilates galactose more rapidly than *S. cerevisiae* populations thriving in

other food environments (e.g. beer, bread, wine) or in natural environments (oak) [30].

The white mold *Penicillium camemberti* is used for the maturation of soft cheeses, such as

Camembert, Brie and Neufchatel, and also to a lesser extent for dry sausage maturation. It is

thought to be a white mutant selected from the gray-green species *P. commune* for its color at the

start of the 20th century [31], and cultured clonally ever since. The first records of Brie cheeses

date from middle ages [32], being of blue aspect until the 20th century [33,34]. Very little is

known about the *P. camemberti* taxonomic status, origin and diversity, despite its great economic

and cultural importance. In particular, its relationships to the closely related species *P. biforme, P.*

caseifulvum, P. commune and *P. fuscoglaucum,* and even possible overlaps with these species, remain

unclear. *Penicillium camemberti* has only ever been found in the food environment. Strains identified

as *P. commune* are used for the maturation of other types of cheese (e.g. hard and blue cheeses)

and in the production of dried sausages, and can be commonly found as spoilers of dairy

products [35] and also in non-food environments. Genetic analyses however suggested that *P.*

commune was not monophyletic (Figure 1A), which supported the reinstatement of two ancient

species names, *P. biforme* (named by Thom in 1910) and *P. fuscoglaucum* (named by Biourge in

1923) [36]. A few genetic sequences indeed separated *P. commune* strains isolated from cheese

(including the *P. biforme* type) from *P. commune* strains isolated from other environments (including

the *P. fuscoglaucum* type) [36]. However, the most recent taxonomic reference study of the

Penicillium genus did not recognize *P. fuscoglaucum* as a species and maintained the *P. commune* name

[37]. *Penicillium caseifulvum* has also sometimes been advocated to constitute a separate species in

this clade [37], including cheese strains isolated from Danish blue and other German and French

cheeses, on the basis of colony morphology and their lack of production of cyclopiazonic acid

(CPA), a mycotoxin known to be produced by *P. camemberti*. However, a study based on a small

number of genetic markers was unable to differentiate these putative *P. caseifulvum* strains from *P.*
camemberti [36]. Parts of the horizontally transferred *CheesyTer* and *Wallaby* regions have also been
found in the reference *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* genomes [27,28].

The taxonomy of this clade thus remains unclear, and population structure has not been studied
with powerful genetic markers, despite the paramount importance of genetic relationships to our
understanding of domestication. Differences in phenotypic traits have not been extensively
studied either, but are also essential for determining whether or not domestication has occurred.
Humans may, indeed, have selected strains for specific traits beneficial for cheese production,
such as faster growth in cheese, attractive color and a greater ability to compete against food-
spoiling microorganisms, but without the production of detrimental extrolites, called mycotoxins.
Mycotoxins are natural secondary metabolites produced by fungi under certain conditions that
can inhibit competitor growth and reproduction and which can have a toxicological impact on
humans depending on the exposure conditions [38]. Cyclopiazonic acid is one of these toxic
secondary metabolites produced by *P. camemberti* under certain conditions [39,40].

Our goal here was to investigate the footprints of domestication by assessing genetic and
phenotypic differentiation, by sequencing the genomes of strains isolated from the rinds of
different cheeses from around the world (e.g. Camembert, tommes, blue cheeses), from other
food products (e.g. dry sausages, bread) and from other environments (e.g. leaf litter, ice and
wood). We performed a whole genome-based analysis of population structure, which revealed
that *P. biforme, P. camemberti* and *P. fuscoglaucum* formed separate and specific genetic clusters, *P.*
biforme and *P. camemberti* being sister clades (Figure 1A). The species name *P. commune* should
therefore be avoided, being paraphyletic. We found that the sister clades *P. camemberti* and *P.*
biforme were both specific to the cheese environment, whereas the more distantly related *P.*
fuscoglaucum clade was mostly found in natural environments. These relationships suggest an
ancient domestication event separating *P. biforme* from *P. fuscoglaucum* and a much more recent
domestication event separating the *P. camemberti* clonal lineage from *P. biforme*. Consistent with
this scenario, we found evidence of phenotypic adaptation to cheese-making in *P. biforme* relative
to *P. fuscoglaucum*, with a whiter color, faster growth on cheese medium under cave conditions and
lower levels of toxin production. We also reveal the diversification of *P. camemberti* into two
varieties, *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and var. *caseifulvum*, also displaying genetic and phenotypic
differentiation (in terms of growth rate, color, competitive abilities and mycotoxin production),
and maybe used for the production of different cheese types.

Results and Discussion

Penicillium camemberti, *P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* each form separate specific genetic clusters

We collected and sequenced the genomes of 61 strains with Illumina technology, including 36 strains isolated from the rinds of various types of cheese (e.g., tommes, Camembert, blue cheeses), 11 from other food products (e.g. dry sausages, bread), and 14 from non-food environments (e.g., wood or leaf litter), which were attributed by their collectors to the species *P. camemberti, P. biforme, P. commune* or *P. fuscoglaucum* (Supplemental information). We resequenced the reference genome of *P. camemberti* (LCP06093, also known as FM013, and initially sequenced with 454 technology [27]) with PacBio long-read technology and used the ca. 35Mb assembly obtained for mapping. We identified 392,072 SNPs across all strains (Supplemental Data 1). We investigated population structure with two clustering methods based on genetic differences and free from assumptions about mating system and mode of reproduction. Principal component analysis (PCA; Figure 2A) and neighbor-net (splitstree) analysis (Figure 2C) identified three genetic clusters, corresponding to *P. camemberti* (n=19)*, P. biforme* (n=28) and *P. fuscoglaucum* (n=14). A population structure analysis implemented in NGSadmix also identified the same three genetic clusters at K=3 (Figure 2D), the K value at which the structure was the strongest and clearest. The genetic differentiation between *P. camemberti, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* was further confirmed by the high values of fixation (F_{ST}) and absolute divergence (d_{xy}) indices (Table S1). A recent study described rapid phenotypic change from green-gray to white in a "wild *P. commune*" strain [41], interpreting these changes as evidence that domestication can occur within four weeks. However, we found that this *P. commune* strain actually belonged to the cheese *P. biforme* clade, being genetically almost identical to strains found in commercial cheeses (Figure S1).

The strains present in public collections under the name *"P. commune"* did not form a single cluster nor even a monophyletic clade (red shapes in Figures 2A, 2C and 3A); indeed, the *P. commune* strains isolated from natural environments clustered with *P. fuscoglaucum* strains whereas the *P. commune* strains isolated from cheese clustered with *P. biforme* strains, despite *P. fuscoglaucum* and *P. biforme* not being sister clades (Figure 3A). The *P. commune* neotype strain (LCP05531) and the *P. biforme* type strain (LCP05529) belonged to the same clade (Figures 2C-D and Figure 3A), further indicating that *P. commune* and *P. biforme* overlap. In contrast, the *P. caseifulvum* type strain

(LCP05630) and the *P. camemberti* type strain belonged to different clusters at *K* values ≥ 5 in the

population structure analysis (red stars on Figure 2C), suggesting that they do correspond to

different genetic clusters.

Penicillium camemberti was found only in food (cheese, sausage, food waste or animal feed; Figure

2). The three non-cheese strains were not differentiated from cheese strains. Only three of the 28

strains in the *P. biforme* cluster were isolated from environments other than food: the atmosphere,

ice and leaf litter. These three strains were not genetically differentiated from those isolated from

food (bread, cheese or sausage) and may therefore be feral strains, i.e. escaped from food. The *P.*

fuscoglaucum cluster included three strains isolated from food environments (two strains from

cheese and one from sausage) and 13 strains from natural environments, and was thus likely to

constitute a genuine wild population. The three food strains were not differentiated from the wild

strains.

Penicillium fuscoglaucum displayed the highest genetic diversity level, followed by *P. biforme,* as

indicated by several diversity indices, such as the number of SNPs, π and Watterson's θ (Table

S1), as well as strain scattering in PCA and neighbor-net network (Figures 2A and 2C). The very

low genetic diversity detected within *P. camemberti* suggests that it represents a clonal lineage

(Table S1, Figures 2A and 2C). The diversity in *P. biforme* was similar to that previously found in

the non-cheese *P. roqueforti* population (named the "silage/food spoiler" population in [26], Table

S1), while the diversity in *P. camemberti* was similar to that previously found in the domesticated

clonal cheese *P. roqueforti* population (named the "non-Roquefort" population in [26]). The

average nucleotide identity between *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* was very high (99.8%) and similar

to the 99.5% identity between the domesticated mold *Aspergillus oryzae* and its wild relative *A.*

flavus [42].

The long branches and the lack of reticulation observed in the neighbor-net analysis further

confirmed the clonality of *P. camemberti*, contrasting with the footprints of recombination

detected within both *P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* (Figure 2C). In *P. fuscoglaucum,* abundant

reticulation was observed, right to the branch edges (Figure 2C), reinforcing the view that *P.*

fuscoglaucum corresponded to a sexual population thriving in natural environments, while strains of

P. camemberti and *P. biforme* used in the food industry are replicated clonally.

We studied the mating-type genes controlling fungal mating compatibility to determine the

likelihood of sexual reproduction occurrence within each species. In heterothallic fungal species*,*

sexual reproduction occurs only between two haploid individuals carrying different alleles

(MAT1-1 and MAT1-2 in filamentous ascomycetes) at the mating-type locus. A lack of sexual

reproduction leads to relaxed selection on the mating-type genes, as they are no longer used, and a departure from a balanced ratio between mating types. Neither mating-type allele presented any evidence of loss-of-function mutations or SNPs in any of the genomes. In *P. fuscoglaucum,* we found no significant departure from the 1:1 ratio of the two mating-type alleles expected under conditions of regular sexual reproduction (χ_2 = 1.14; df = 1; P = 0.29). By contrast, *P. biforme* displayed a significant departure from the 1:1 ratio (χ_2 = 14.29; df = 1; P < 1e$_{-3}$), with MAT1-2 strains predominating. All 19 *P. camemberti* strains carried the MAT1-2 allele, providing further evidence of the clonality of *P. camemberti* [43,44]. The observed clonality in *P. camemberti* may be explained by the recent selection of a white mutant and its use in industrial cheese production [45], whereas *P. biforme* is more widely used in the production of artisanal cheeses and farmers may make use of diverse local strains.

Two genetic clusters within *Penicillium camemberti*

We found two genetic clusters within *P. camemberti*, as indicated by the population structure analysis implemented in NGSadmix at K = 5, the PCA and the neighbor-net without *P. fuscoglaucum*, as well as the PCA with only *P. camemberti* (Figures 2B, 2D and S2). The two *P. camemberti* genetic clusters displayed very few shared SNPs (13% of the 19,510 SNPs, Table S1), but a very high nucleotide identity (99.998%). The two genetic clusters within *P. camemberti* separated strains isolated from soft cheeses, such as Camembert, and strains isolated from other kinds, such as Rigotte de Condrieu and Saint Marcellin. The *P. caseifulvum* type strain (red star on Figure 2D) clustered with *P. camemberti* strains isolated from non-soft cheeses. The genetic cluster including the *P. caseifulvum* type strain will be referred to hereafter as *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum,* and the genetic cluster including the *P. camemberti* type strain will be referred to as *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti*. The nucleotide diversity was very low within both varieties (Table S1, Figure 2B). We designed two pairs of primers to identify by a single PCR reaction the *P. camemberti* variety, each yielding a specific amplicon size (Data S5).

The population structure analysis also suggested further genetic subdivision within each of *P. fuscoglaucum* and *P. biforme*; these subdivisions did not correspond to the environment from which the isolate was obtained, type of cheese, or any other variable for which we had data; it did not correspond to either a strong subdivision in the PCAs or the neighbor-nets (Figures 2 and S1).

Presence/absence polymorphism of the two horizontally transferred regions likely to be advantageous in cheese

By contrast to the first 454-sequenced FM013 reference genome [27], in which the *Wallaby*
horizontally transferred region was found to be fragmented, the PacBio-based genome assembly
of the same strain showed that the part of *Wallaby* present in the genome formed a single block
(scaffold 18, positions 102,711 to 538,265). Two genes in *Wallaby* have been highlighted as
putatively important for cheese-making. One, encoding the *Penicillium* antifungal protein (PAF)
[27], was absent from FM013, whereas the other, encoding Hce2, a protein with known
antimicrobial activities, was present. All *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* strains harbored the same
Wallaby region as FM013 (Figure 3C), whereas strains from the *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*
lineage carried fragmented and duplicated segments of the *Wallaby* fragment present in FM013, in
which the Hce2 gene was systematically present. We also found *Wallaby* fragmented with some
duplicated regions in 18 *P. biforme* strains; it was completely absent from the 10 remaining strains
(Figure 3C). *Wallaby* appeared to be even more fragmented in *P. fuscoglaucum* strains, always
lacking Hce2 but in one strain, and it was completely absent in nine strains. In contrast to *P.
roqueforti,* in which *Wallaby* was only found in strains isolated from the cheese environment*,*
fragments of *Wallaby* were found in some non-cheese strains of *P. fuscoglaucum*. However, even in
P. fuscoglaucum, no genetic variability could be detected within the *Wallaby* fragments, indicating
that they have also likely been acquired by horizontal gene transfer in this species. So far, we
found no species in which *Wallaby* showed genetic variability, indicating that we have not
identified the donor species.

The other horizontally transferred region thought to be beneficial for growth on cheese [28], the
57 kb *CheesyTer* region*,* was not located at the end of one scaffold in *P. camemberti* (scaffold 17,
positions 690,636 to 751,978 in FM013), like its position in *P. roqueforti*. We found no strict
association between *CheesyTer* and *Wallaby* in the clades studied here, whereas all strains of *P.
roqueforti* studied so far carried either both or neither of these regions [28]. In *P. camemberti,* 16 of
19 strains carried the whole *CheesyTer* region, with an identity of 100% (Figure 3B). The other
three *P. camemberti* strains (LCP00584T, LCP05527 and UBOCC-A-108096), belonging to the *P.
camemberti* var. *camemberti* cluster, completely lacked *CheesyTer* and an 80 kb-downstream fragment.
These three strains were isolated from Camembert cheeses around 1905, suggesting that the
horizontal transfer of *CheesyTer* to *P. camemberti* occurred after 1905, in a single strain that has
been since clonally cultured. In *P. biforme,* 25 of 28 strains carried *CheesyTer*, with an identity
>99.8% between strains. The identity between *P. biforme* and *P. camemberti* was also >99.8%*,*
except in the 5 kb region at the start of *CheesyTer,* in which the similarity between the two species
dropped to 90%. The differences between *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* at the start of *CheesyTer*
appeared to be mainly due to C:G to T:A mutations in *P. camemberti,* corresponding to the repeat-

induced point (RIP) mutations specific to fungi occurring in repeated sequences during sexual
reproduction [46]. As *P. camemberti* was found to be clonal and no RIP footprints were detected
within the rest of *CheesyTer*, these findings suggest that *CheesyTer* was transferred to an ancestor of
the two *P. camemberti* varieties with this RIPed sequence already present. *CheesyTer* was completely
absent from six strains of *P. fuscoglaucum* (Figure 3) and partially present in the other strains. One
P. fuscoglaucum strain (LCP00218, isolated from rubber) carried two copies of a 30 kb *CheesyTer*
terminal region. The two *CheesyTer* genes involved in lactose metabolism [28], one encoding a
lactose permease and the other a β-galactosidase, were present in all strains carrying at least one
part of *CheesyTer* in *P. camemberti, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* (Figure 3B).

Looking for genomic footprints of adaptation in *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme*

Not many genomic selection scans could be performed given the high level of clonality in *P.*
camemberti, as any selective sweep will hitchhike the whole genome. We investigated whether some
genomic regions showed greater differentiation than the genomic background when comparing
P. biforme on the one hand to either *P. camemberti* or *P. fuscoglaucum* on the other, as genomic
islands of differentiation can be footprints of divergent adaptation. We used a genomic selection
scan approach using 75kb windows based on an absolute measure of differentiation, d_{xy}, instead
of the F_{ST} statistic, as the latter is influenced by within-population diversity (Data S3). No
particularly striking genomic island of differentiation could be identified (Data S3, S4) and genes
within windows in the 1% highest d_{xy} were not enriched in any particular function. We also
performed genome scans of diversity based on π and Watterson's θ (Data S3) but no particular
genomic islands could be detected either. The genes within windows in the 1% highest d_{xy}
however contained significantly less genes with predicted functions than the rest of the reference
genome, suggesting that these regions contained more rapidly evolving genes.

Phenotypes better suited for cheese production in *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* than in the closely related wild species *P. fuscoglaucum*

Strains selected by humans are expected to display specific traits beneficial for cheese production,
such as faster growth in cheese, colonies of an attractive color, salt tolerance, an absence of
harmful toxin production and efficiency at excluding undesirable microorganisms. We performed
a set of laboratory experiments to determine whether cheese strains had evolved traits beneficial

for cheese production not present in the closely related wild *P. fuscoglaucum* lineage occurring in

other environments. In each of *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme,* we considered as a single group the

strains from cheese and other food types (e.g. dry sausage, bread) because they were not

genetically differentiated and the same strains are sold by producers for cheese and dry sausage

maturation.

We first investigated whether *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* had acquired traits enabling them to

grow more rapidly than *P. fuscoglaucum* in cheese-making conditions. Rapidly growing fungi can be

beneficial for cheese-making, as they are more capable of excluding spoiler bacteria, yeasts and

molds [11] and promote faster cheese maturation. The process of cheese maturation begins with

the transfer of salted milk curd to dark caves at a low temperature and high humidity. We

therefore grew 61 strains on various media (unsalted cheese, salted cheese, minimal and malt

media), in the dark and at different temperatures and humidity levels (25°C at ambient relative

humidity, 10°C at 98% humidity or 8°C at 100% humidity), and we measured colony radial

growth after 10 days. The non-parametric Kruskal-Wallis test as well as the ANOVA showed no

significant effect on growth of the substrate from which the isolate was originally obtained (i.e.

food versus non-food). We found a significant effect on growth of the culture media, species,

temperature/humidity conditions and the *P. camemberti* variety. The ANOVA further showed

significant effects on growth of the interactions between culture medium and species on the one

hand and between culture medium and temperature/humidity on the other hand (Data S1A and

S2A, Figure 4A). However, the significance of the interaction between culture medium and

temperature/humidity conditions (Data S1A and S2A) reflected the very slow growth at low

temperatures, making it difficult to detect significant differences between media. Although the

two *P. camemberti* varieties were genetically very closely related, *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* grew

similarly to *P. biforme* (post-hoc Tukey honestly significant difference - HSD test $P = 1$), with

greater radial growth on unsalted cheese and salted cheese, and slower growth on malt and

minimal media than *P. fuscoglaucum*. By contrast, *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* displayed weaker

radial growth than any other lineage on all media (Figure 4A), but was fluffier (Figure 1B).

Furthermore, *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* grew less rapidly than *P. fuscoglaucum* on minimal and

malt media, indicating a disadvantage for growth in harsh conditions, as expected for cheese

strains due to relaxed selection on functions useful only in wild environments. These findings

demonstrated that *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* and *P. biforme* have acquired rapid radial growth in

cheese which was likely beneficial for fast maturation. *Penicillium camemberti* var. *camemberti* grew

much less radially on cheese than any other lineage, but grew much more vertically (i.e. being

fluffier), with the mycelium growing up to the lid of the Petri dishes (Figure 1B). *Penicillium camemberti* var. *camemberti* might have been selected for fast vertical growth to make soft cheeses with a fluffy aspect within a short maturation period. Short maturation is beneficial for production when using cow or goat milk available throughout the year, as is the case for Camembert cheeses. In contrast, ewe milk is only available a few months a year, so that Roquefort cheeses need to be stored for several months to be sold and consumed throughout the year, in which case too fast maturation was not beneficial before fridges were available. Such historical long storage can explain a selection for slow growth in the Roquefort *P. roqueforti* population [26], in contrast to a selection for fast growth in *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme*.

High salt concentrations in cheeses prevent the growth of contaminants and cheese fungi may have adapted to such conditions. We found an effect of salt on *P. biforme* growth, with strains growing more rapidly on salted than unsalted cheese medium (post-hoc Tukey HSD test $P = 0.006$) and more rapidly on salted cheese medium than *P. camemberti* (post-hoc Tukey HSD test $P = 0.0001$). Salt had no effect on the growth of *P. camemberti* (post-hoc test $P = 1$) or *P. fuscoglaucum* (post-hoc test $P = 1$). There may have been stronger selection for salt tolerance in *P. biforme*, which is used to inoculate blue and goat cheeses, both being more salty than soft cheeses, such as Brie or Camembert [47], for which *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* is used.

We investigated whether cheese lineages had become whiter, which can be more attractive to some consumers than gray-green mold on cheese, by comparing the opacity of lineages on cheese medium, as opacity increases with the brightness and fluffiness of a colony [48]. We found significant effects of species and variety (Figure 4C and Data S1B and S2B), with *P. camemberti* being significantly more opaque (i.e. brighter and fluffier) than other lineages, and *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* even more so compared to var. *caseifulvum* (post-hoc Tukey HSD test $P = 0.03$). This is consistent with the white and fluffy aspect of the crust of Camembert and Brie, made with *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti*, whereas *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* was found here in cheeses with a grayer and less fluffy crust, such as Saint Marcellin or Rigotte de Condrieu (Figures 1 and 4B-C). The *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* and *P. biforme* lineages did not differ significantly from each other (post-hoc Tukey HSD test $P = 1$) and both were brighter than the wild blue-green *P. fuscoglaucum* (Figure 4B).

We also investigated whether cheese lineages produced smaller amounts of cyclopiazonic acid (CPA), which is cytotoxic to humans [38,40], than strains isolated from other environments.

Penicillium camemberti has been reported to produce CPA on yeast extract sucrose (YES) medium

and at very low, non-toxic concentrations in cheese [39]. None of the *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*

strains tested here produced CPA on YES (Figure 4D), consistent with findings for the type

strain [49]. By contrast, *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* produced CPA,

the highest levels being obtained with *P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* (Figure 4D, Data S1C and

S2C). The CPA biosynthesis cluster in the genome appeared to be functional, with six genes

present (*cpaA, cpaD, cpaO, cpaH, cpaM* and *cpaT*) but not the *cpaR* gene encoding a regulatory

protein (Figure S3). The only exceptions were the six *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* strains, in which

a 2 bp deletion in the *cpaA* gene led to a frameshift. The *cpaA* gene encodes a polyketide

synthase/non-ribosomal peptide synthase responsible for the first step of the CPA biosynthetic

pathway so that a non-functional protein probably prevents CPA production on all substrates.

Humans have often selected fungal strains unable to produce harmful toxins for use in food, as

exemplified by the *Aspergillus oryzae* strains used to ferment Asian food products, which do not

produce aflatoxins, whereas the wild ancestor, *A. flavus,* does [50]. In the blue cheese fungus *P.*

roqueforti, strains belonging to the non-Roquefort population were also found unable to produce

mycophenolic acid due to a 174 bp deletion in the *mpaC* gene [51].

Cheese is a nutrient-rich environment in which many microorganisms can thrive, including

undesirable food spoilage organisms. We therefore investigated whether the cheese lineages were

better able to outcompete challengers. We allowed strains of *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* (*n*=3), *P.*

camemberti var. *caseifulvum* (*n*=2) or *P. biforme* (*n*=10) to grow as lawns on the surface of the cheese

medium, which were inoculated 24 h later with a single spot, in the middle of the Petri dish, using

a challenger: *Geotrichum candidum* (*n*=5)*, P. biforme* (*n*=6)*, P. fuscoglaucum* (*n*=5)*,* or *P roqueforti* (*n*=12,

three strains from each of the four known genetic clusters [26]). The species and the variety used

as the lawn had significant effects on the growth of the challenger (ANOVA and non-parametric

Kruskal-Wallis tests, Data S1D and S2D, Figure 5). The two lineages of *P. camemberti* prevented

the growth of all challengers more effectively than *P. biforme*, and *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* was

the most effective. Furthermore, we observed significant differences between the species used as

challengers, with *G. candidum* having the highest growth differential on the various lawns, growing

less well on a *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* lawn than other lawns. *Geotrichum candidum* is a fungus

that is also present on the surface of soft cheeses. The exclusion effect may be mediated by the

fluffy morphology, resulting in the fungus occupying more space and using more resources,

and/or by biochemical interactions.

Conclusion

Population structure analyses based on whole-genome sequences revealed that *P. biforme, P. camemberti* and *P. fuscoglaucum* each formed a separate genetic cluster, with *P. biforme* and *P. camemberti* being sister clades. Strains identified as *P. commune* corresponded to either *P. biforme* or *P. fuscoglaucum*, being thus non-monophyletic (Figure 1A), so this name should not be used any longer. Furthermore, considering all *"P. commune"* strains to be wild, as it is currently common in the literature, leads to wrong inferences about trait evolution [41], as some *"P. commune"* strains (those corresponding to *P. biforme*) belong to a domesticated genetic cluster. We found that *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme* were sister clades specific to the cheese environment, whereas the more distantly related clade *P. fuscoglaucum* was found mostly in natural environments. These relationships and the lower diversity of *P. biforme* than *P. fuscoglaucum*, with even lower levels of diversity in *P. camemberti*, suggest that an ancient domestication event led to the divergence between *P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* and that a much more recent domestication event led to the differentiation between *P. camemberti* and *P. biforme*. We used here the *P. biforme, P. camemberti* and *P. fuscoglaucum* Latin species names as they are commonly used and corresponded to differentiated and monophyletic clades based on genome-wide information, harbored contrasted phenotypes and originated from different ecological niches. We did not address here the question of species status or definition, as they are notoriously difficult to elucidate among closely related fungal groups, especially in clonal ascomycetes [52,53].

Domestication often leads to bottlenecks [54–57], which can be very severe in clonally multiplied fungi [26,58]. Consistent with this scenario, we found evidence of phenotypic adaptation to cheese-making in *P. biforme* relative to the wild *P. fuscoglaucum* clade, with a whiter color, faster growth on cheese medium under cave conditions and lower levels of toxin production. These signs of domestication were even more marked in *P. camemberti* than in *P. biforme*. We observed a similar evolution of traits as in populations of the domesticated blue-cheese fungus *P. roqueforti*, which grows more rapidly on cheese medium, is more competitive against contaminant microorganisms, and grows less well under harsh conditions than wild strains [26,28]. Such convergent evolution under similar selective pressures suggests that evolution may repeat itself, as already reported in natural populations of *Anolis* lizards [59,60], three-spined sticklebacks [61], Mexican cavefishes [62], and cichlid fishes in African rifts [63] or crater lakes in central America [64,65]. Phenotypic convergent evolution has been also reported in domesticated organisms, particularly in crop plants, for the loss of seed shattering, minimization of seed dormancy and

increase in seed size and number, for example, with most of these changes resulting from
different genomic alterations in different species [66,67].

We identified two genetically differentiated *P. camemberti* varieties, *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and
P. camemberti var. *caseifulvum,* with contrasting phenotypic features, used in the production of
different kinds of cheese. The *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* strains were white and were isolated
from Camembert or Brie. Their radial growth was slower but their mycelia were much fluffier
than the other *Penicillium* strains tested (Figure 1B) and they produced similar amounts of CPA
compared to *P. biforme* strains. They excluded fungal competitors effectively, as previously
suggested [68], probably due to their fluffy morphology, taking up the available space and
monopolizing resources. *Penicillium camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* strains were gray-green, unable to
produce CPA, and were isolated from cheeses other than Camembert, such as St Marcellin or
Rigotte de Condrieu (Figure 1A). They displayed more rapid radial growth than *P. camemberti* var.
camemberti and grew similarly to *P. biforme* strains on cheese medium in cave conditions. The
difference in terms of cheese type usage between the two varieties should be confirmed in future
studies using more strains, but it seems to correspond well to the contrasted identified
phenotypes, and in particular color and fluffiness. The existence of two genetically and
phenotypically differentiated lineages with possibly different uses in cheese-making suggested
that these lineages emerged as a result of different human selection pressures, as reported for the
domesticated blue-cheese fungus *P. roqueforti* [26]*,* wine-making yeasts [12,15], maize, rice,
tomatoes, dogs, chickens and horses [1–6].

Penicillium camemberti var. *camemberti* is the emblematic species used to inoculate soft cheeses, such
as Camembert and Brie. According to the technical specifications for Brie de Meaux and Brie de
Melun PDOs and Camembert, the crust of the cheese must be white and fluffy, and inoculation
with *P. candidum* (a synonym of *P. camemberti*) is even specified for Brie de Meaux. These
specifications are recent (20th century) and seem to have had a negative impact on the diversity
of the fungi used for making these kinds of cheeses, as a single clonal lineage now predominates.
The genetic diversity of *P. roqueforti* has also been greatly reduced by recent industrialization
[26,29], although PDO specifications that local strains must be used have protected diversity to
some extent in Roquefort cheeses. Camembert and Brie cheeses were gray-green before the 20th
century [32,34,45], as illustrated by a 19th century painting by Marie Jules Justin entitled
"Symphonie des fromages en Brie majeur - Nature morte au fromage". First mentions of Brie
cheeses date from middle ages [32]. These historical records are consistent with our findings,
which suggest a first domestication event leading to the emergence of the gray-green mold *P.*

biforme, subsequently followed, around 1900, by the domestication of *P. camemberti,* with the selection of two different varieties displaying more marked signs of domestication than *P. biforme.*

These findings have industrial implications, as they reveal the existence of three closely related but different lineages that have evolved traits beneficial for cheese-making, with different phenotypic traits selected according to usage. This study should foster further research, as it would be interesting to assess other important traits, such as volatile compound production, and the efficiencies of lipolysis and proteolysis. Our findings raise questions about the use of limited numbers of clonal strains for cheese-making, which tends to lead to degeneration, limiting the possibilities for further improvement, which is currently a major concern in the agrofood sector [69], despite the great geneticist Nikolai Vavilov known for having identified the centers of origin of cultivated plants long ago highlighting the importance of genetic diversity in domesticated organisms for variety improvement and diversification [70].

Materials and Methods

Strain collection and DNA extraction

We analyzed strains isolated from 37 cheeses from five countries around the world (e.g. Camembert, Saint Marcellin, tomme, Sein de Nounou). We also collected strains from dried sausages (*n* = 8) and moldy food (e.g. bread, *n* = 4). Twelve were isolated from other substrates than food. Spores were sampled from the food sources and spread on Petri dishes containing malt-agar medium, which were then incubated for five days at 25°C. A total of 41 strains were obtained from public strain collections (the Laboratoire de Cryptogamie (LCP strains) at the National Museum of Natural History in Paris (France), the Laboratoire Universitaire de Biodiversité et Ecologie Microbienne (LUBEM, UBOCC strains) in Plouzané (France) and the Westerdijk Fungal Biodiversity Institute (CBS strains) in Utrecht (The Netherlands)). The LMA421 strain was kindly given by Steve Labrie (University of Laval, Canada). We obtained strains from natural environments (e.g. wood or natural cave walls) from eight different countries. Detailed information about the strains used in this study can be found in the Supplemental information. For each strain, single-spore cultures were generated by a dilution method, to ensure that only a single haploid genotype was cultured for each strain. We checked the species identification of all strains by Sanger sequencing of the ß-tubulin gene (primers Bt2a - GGTAACCAAATCGGTGCTGCTTTC and bt2b – AACCTCAGTGTAGTGACCCTTGGC [71]) and the PC4 microsatellite flanking regions [36] (primers PC4F –

CAAGCTGGCCGATAACCTG and PC4R – CCATCCGCTTGATTTCTCCT), to distinguish

between *P. biforme* and *P. camemberti*. All the strains were added to the ESE (Ecology Systematics

Evolution Laboratory) collection, under an ESE accession number, and are available from the

corresponding collections (ESE, LUBEM, MNHN). For each strain, we used the Nucleospin Soil

Kit (Machernary-Nagel, Düren, Germany) to extract DNA from fresh haploid mycelium grown

for five days on malt agar.

Genome sequencing, assembly and mapping

Sequencing was performed with Illumina HiSeq 2500 paired-end technology (Illumina Inc.), with

a mean insert size of 400 bp, at the INRA GenoToul platform, to obtain 10-50X coverage

(Supplemental information). In addition, the genome of the *P. camemberti* LCP06093 (also known

as FM013) reference strain, initially sequenced with 454 technology [27], was resequenced at 34x

using the PacBio's long-read technology, assembled with Canu 1.8 [72] and polished with pilon

1.23 [73]. The PacBio assembly and reads for all samples have been deposited at the NCBI

Sequence Read Archive under BioProject ID XXXX.

Reads were trimmed with Trimmomatic [74] (cut adapter, options PE, LEADING:3

TRAILING:3 SLIDINGWINDOW:4:25 MINLEN:36) and mapped onto the high-quality

PacBio reference genome of LCP06093 with Bowtie2 [75] (options very-sensitive-local, --

phred33 PL:ILLUMINA -X 1000). Mapped reads were filtered for PCR duplicates with picard

tools (http://broadinstitute.github.io/picard) and realigned on the PacBio reference genome with

GATK [76]. Single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) were called with GATK HaplotypeCaller,

which provides one gVCF per strain (option -ERC GVCF). GVCFs were combined with GATK

CombineGVCFs, genotyped with GATK genotype and hard filtered in accordance with GATK

best practice workflow recommendations (https://software.broadinstitute.org/gatk/best-

practices/).

Analysis of the mating-type genes

We looked for the mating type genes in *P. camemberti, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum* by extracting

the region including the flanking genes *APN2* and *SLA2* from all BAM files.

Statistics of population genetics and genomic scans

Nucleotide diversity indices (π and Watterson's θ) and genetic differentiation indices (F_{ST} and d_{xy})

were calculated using the R package PopGenome [77] for the four genetic clusters *P. biforme, P.*

fuscoglaucum, P. camemberti. var. *camemberti* and *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*. π and Watterson's θ were

calculated per site. We also performed genomic scans along the 20 largest scaffolds of the *P.*

camemberti PacBio reference using sliding windows of 75 kb and step sizes of 7.5 kb. Genome

scans for π and Watterson's θ were performed within each of the four genetic clusters (*P. biforme,*

P. fuscoglaucum, P. camemberti. var. *camemberti* and *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*). Genome scans based

on F_{ST} and d_{xy} indices were performed between all possible pairs of the four clusters (*P. biforme, P.*

fuscoglaucum, P. camemberti. var. *camemberti* and *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*). We tested whether the

genes belonging to windows with the 1% highest d_{xy} values were enriched in particular predicted

functions (interpro). We performed gene enrichment analyses using Fisher exact tests ('fisher.test'

function in the R package stats) corrected for multiple testing ('p.adjust' function in the R

package stats with the false discovery rate, 'fdr', method). We also tested whether the number of

genes with predicted functions within windows with the 1% highest d_{xy} values deviated from

expectations based on the proportion in the full genome of the PacBio reference using a χ^2 test.

We calculated the average pairwise identity between species pairs, as well as the number of fixed,

private and shared SNPs. When comparing two populations, private SNPs are sites that are

polymorphic in only one population (e.g. A/C for individuals in population 1 and T for

individuals in population 2), shared SNPs are polymorphic positions within the two populations

(e.g. A/C in population 1 and A/T in population 2) and fixed SNPs are positions that are fixed in

each population but different between populations (e.g. A for all individuals of population 1 and

G for all individuals of population 2).

Genetic structure

We used the dataset of 392,072 SNPs to infer population structure. We inferred individual

ancestry from genotype likelihoods based on realigned reads, by assuming a known number of

admixing populations, ranging from $K = 2$ to $K = 6$, using NGSadmix from the ANGSD package

[78]. A hundred independent runs were carried out for each number of clusters (*K)*. We identified

clustering solutions in replicated runs for each *K* value and displayed population structure

graphically using the R function 'barplot'. We used the R package phangorn [79] for neighbor-net

analyses, and the 'prcomp' function of R for principal component analysis (PCA).

Phylogenetic analyses

566   We inferred phylogenetic relationships among the 61 isolates using the dataset of 1,124,983 SNPs

567   in a maximum likelihood framework using IQ-Ttree2 [80]. We also used *P. cavernicola* (LCP05631

568   strain) and *P. palitans* (ESE00153 and LCP04862 strains). The tree has been midpoint rooted. The

569 best-fit model chosen using ModelFinder [81] according to BIC was TVM+F+ASC+R3. Branch

570 supports are SH-aLRT [82] and ultrafast bootstrap support [83].

Laboratory experiments

Sampling and calibration

All experiments were performed on the whole collection of *P. camemberti* ($n = 19$), *P. biforme* ($n =$

28) and *P. fuscoglaucum* ($n = 14$) strains, including 35 strains isolated from cheeses, 10 from other

food environments (e.g. bread, sausage) and 14 strains isolated from environments other than

food. Experiments were initiated with spore suspensions calibrated to 10^7 spores/mL with a

hemocytometer, under the constraint of the low rate of sporulation in *P. camemberti*.

Growth in different conditions and on different media

We investigated whether strains isolated from cheese displayed faster or slower radial growth

than strains isolated from other environments when cultured on cheese or other substrates, and

under conditions similar to those in maturation caves or other conditions. We prepared four

different culture media: a cheese medium without salt, a salted cheese medium (17g/L,

corresponding to a typical cheese), a malt medium and a minimal medium. The cheese media

were produced from an unsalted drained cow's milk cheese from Coubertin Farm in Saint Rémy-

les-Chevreuse (France), as previously described [68]; we added five drops of blue food coloring

to these media, to make it easier to distinguish white fungal colonies from the medium. The

cheese media were rich in lipids and proteins, whereas the malt medium (20 g/L) was rich in

carbohydrates. The minimal medium [84] contained only the trace elements necessary for fungal

survival (i.e. iron sulfate, zinc sulfate, boric acid, magnesium chloride, copper sulfate, ammonium

heptamolybdate, cobalt chloride, EDTA, sodium nitrate, potassium chloride, potassium

phosphate and magnesium sulfate). All media were sterilized in an autoclave (121°C for 20 min

for the malt and minimal media, 110°C for 15 min for the cheese media). Each 90 mm-diameter

Petri dish was filled with 20 mL of the appropriate medium.

We allowed the fungi to grow in the dark, under three different conditions for each strain and

each medium: 10°C with 98% humidity (Camembert cave conditions), 8°C with 85% humidity

(cave conditions for other cheeses) and 25°C with ambient relative humidity (ambient

conditions). We had 244 Petri dishes in total for each set of conditions, and we left the colonies

to grow for 10 days. Images of the Petri dishes were obtained with a Scan 1200 from Interscience

and analyzed with IRIS [48] for growth and color-opacity measurements. The colony size was

estimated as the colony area in pixels. The opacity score was defined as the sum of the brightness

values for all the pixels within the colony bounds; this score thus captures both the color and the

three-dimensional colony growth (as opacity increases with fluffiness) and can be used as a proxy

to assess the fluffiness of the fungal colony.

Mycotoxin production

We selected at least six strains from each genetic cluster for this experiment (Data S1). For

measurements of mycotoxin production, we used 1 μL of calibrated spore suspension (10_7

spores/mL) for each of the 61 strains to inoculate YES (yeast extract sucrose) agar medium

buffered at pH 4.5 with phosphate-citrate buffer and characterized by a high C/N ratio to favor

mycotoxin production as already described in [51]. Each culture was performed in triplicate for

mycotoxin analyses as well as for fungal dry weight measurements. The plates were incubated at

25°C in the dark for 10 days and were then stored at -20°C until mycotoxin analysis.

For mycotoxin extractions [51], we homogenized the thawed samples with an Ultraturrax T25

(IKA, Heidelberg, Germany) before recuperating 4g aliquots. Then, 25 mL of acetonitrile (ACN)

supplemented with 0.1% formic acid (v/v) was added, samples were vortexed for 30 sec followed

by 15 min sonication. Extracts were then centrifuged for 10 min at 5000g and the recuperated

supernatants were directly filtered through 0.2 μm PTFE membrane filters (GE Healthcare Life

Sciences, UK) into amber vials. All samples were stored at -20°C until analyses.

Mycotoxin detection and quantification were performed using an Agilent 6530 Accurate-Mass

Quadropole Time-of-Flight (Q-TOF) LC/MS system equipped with a Binary pump 1260 and

degasser, well plate autosampler set to 10°C and a thermostated column compartment. Filtered

samples (2μl) were injected into a ZORBAX Extend C-18 column (2.1x50mm and 1.8 μm, 600

bar) maintained at 35°C with a flow rate of 0.3 ml/min using mobile phase A (milli-Q water +

0.1% formic acid (v/v) and 0.1% ammonium formate (v/v) and mobile phase B (ACN + 0.1%

formic acid). Mobile phase B was maintained at 10% for 4 min followed by a gradient from 10 to

100% for 16 min. Then, mobile phase B was maintained at 100% for 2 min before a 5 min post-

time. Cyclopiazonic acid (CPA) was ionized in electrospray ionization mode ESI+ in the mass

spectrometer with the following parameters: capillary voltage 4 kV, source temperature 325°C,

nebulizer pressure 50 psig, drying gas 12 l/min, ion range 100-1000 m/z. CPA had a retention

time of 15.3 min and was quantified using the [M+H]+ 337.1545 m/z ion and [M+Na]+ 359.1366

qualifier ion (ESI+). Other extrolites included in our internal database that were targeted (in

ESI+ and ESI- modes) were andrastin A, citreoviridin, citrinin, ermefortins A & B, (iso)-

fumigaclavin A, griseofulvin, meleagrin, mycophenolic acid, ochratoxin A, patulin, penitrem A,

PR toxin, roquefortin C, sterigmatocystin.

We used a matrix matched calibration curve (R_2 >0.99) for reliable mycotoxin quantification with

final concentrations ranging from 10 to 10000 ng/ml. Method performance and mycotoxin

determination was carried out as previously described in [51]. Specific mycotoxin production was

expressed as ng per g fungal dry weight.

Competition

We inoculated salted cheese with 150 μL of a calibrated spore solution (10_7 spores/mL), which

we allowed to grow as a lawn. We used two *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* strains (LCP05630 and

ESE00019), three *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* strains (FM013, LCP04810 and LCP05527) and 10

P. biforme strains (ESE00018, ESE00086, ESE00089, ESE00126, ESE00139, LCP05531,

LCP06701, ESE00154, LCP06620 and LCP05496). After 24 h of growth, we deposited a single

20 μL drop of calibrated spore solution from a challenger species (10_7 spores/mL) in the middle

of the Petri dish. The challenger species used were *G. candidum* (*n*=4, ESE00163 and ESE00165,

CBS11628 and VTTC4559)*, P. biforme* (*n*=6, ESE00126, ESE00089, ESE00018, ESE00154,

LCP005531, LCP06701)*, P. fuscoglaucum* (*n*=5, ESE00090, LCP06621, LCP000797, LCP04799,

LCP03239)*,* and *P roqueforti* (*n*=12, three from each of the four genetic clusters described in [26]:

LCP06036, LCP06037, LCP06128, LCP06043, LCP06098, LCP06064, FM164, LCP06137,

LCP06131, LCP06173). The colony size of the challenger was calculated as the colony area in

pixels.

Statistical tests

We performed analyses of variance (ANOVAs) followed by post-ANOVA Tukey's HSD (honest

significant difference) tests, with R. The data normality was improved with the bestNormalize R

package [85]. For improving distribution normality, we used an ordered quantile (ORQ)

transformation (a one-to-one transformation for vectors with an arbitrary distribution that

generates normally distributed vectors) for diameter measurements and competition data and a

Yeo-Johnson transformation for CPA (mycotoxin) data. Some residuals were still not normally

distributed but ANOVA is known to be robust to deviations from normality [86]. When residues

deviated from normality (diameter measurements for the growth and competition), we

nevertheless also ran non parametric tests, i.e. Kruskal-Wallis tests, using R.

For ANOVAs, we used standard linear models in which all explanatory variables were discrete.

The variables common for all analyses (with explained variables being growth, opacity, CPA and

competition, respectively) were 'species', '*P. camemberti* variety' and 'substrate of origin' (food

versus non-food). The variables 'medium' and 'temperature/hygrometry' were explanatory

variables specific to the growth analysis. The 'challenger species' variable was specific to the

competition analysis. All variables and all interactions between them were implemented in the

ANOVA, and non-significant interactions were subsequently removed before performing post-

ANOVA Tukey's HSD tests.

Acknowledgments

677 We thank everyone who sent us cheese crusts, Steve Labrie for the LMA strain, and Joëlle

678 Dupont for strains from the National Museum of Natural History in Paris.

679 This work was supported by the Fungadapt ANR-19-CE20-0002-02 ANR grant to TG, JR, EC,

680 MC and a Fondation Louis D. grant from the Institut de France to TG.

Author contributions

683 JR and TG designed and supervised the study, and obtained funding. JR, ED, AS and SLP

684 generated the data. JR, RRdlV and BB analyzed the genomes. JR, ED and AS performed the

685 experiments. MC, EC and EP performed the mycotoxin and contributed to CPA biosynthetic

686 gene cluster analyses. JR and ED analyzed the data from the laboratory experiments. JR and TG

687 wrote the manuscript, with contributions from all the authors.

References

1. Warmuth, V., Eriksson, A., Bower, M.A., Cañon, J., Cothran, G., Distl, O., Glowatzki-
Mullis, M.-L., Hunt, H., Luís, C., do Mar Oom, M., *et al.* (2011). European Domestic
Horses Originated in Two Holocene Refugia. PLoS ONE *6*, e18194.

2. Axelsson, E., Ratnakumar, A., Arendt, M.-L., Maqbool, K., Webster, M.T., Perloski, M.,
Liberg, O., Arnemo, J.M., Hedhammar, Å., and Lindblad-Toh, K. (2013). The genomic
signature of dog domestication reveals adaptation to a starch-rich diet. Nature *495*, 360–
364.

3. Frantz, L.A.F., Schraiber, J.G., Madsen, O., Megens, H.-J., Cagan, A., Bosse, M., Paudel,
Y., Crooijmans, R.P.M.A., Larson, G., and Groenen, M.A.M. (2015). Evidence of long-
term gene flow and selection during domestication from analyses of Eurasian wild and
domestic pig genomes. Nat. Genet. *47*, 1141–1148.

4. Hufford, M.B., Xu, X., van Heerwaarden, J., Pyhäjärvi, T., Chia, J.-M., Cartwright, R.A.,
Elshire, R.J., Glaubitz, J.C., Guill, K.E., Kaeppler, S.M., *et al.* (2012). Comparative
population genomics of maize domestication and improvement. Nat Genet *44*, 808–811.

5. Decroocq, S., Cornille, A., Tricon, D., Babayeva, S., Chague, A., Eyquard, J.-P.,

Karychev, R., Dolgikh, S., Kostritsyna, T., Liu, S., *et al.* (2016). New insights into the history of domesticated and wild apricots and its contribution to Plum pox virus resistance. Mol. Ecol. *25*, 4712–4729.

6. Doebley, J. (2004). The Genetics of Maize Evolution. Annual Review of Genetics *38*, 37–59.

7. Wydooghe, E., Berghmans, E., Rijsselaere, T., and Soom, A.V. (2013). International breeder inquiry into the reproduction of the English bulldog. Vlaams Diergeneeskundig Tijdschrift *82*, 38–43.

8. Perrier, X., Langhe, E.D., Donohue, M., Lentfer, C., Vrydaghs, L., Bakry, F., Carreel, F., Hippolyte, I., Horry, J.-P., Jenny, C., *et al.* (2011). Multidisciplinary perspectives on banana (*Musa* spp.) domestication. PNAS *108*, 11311–11318.

9. Diamond, J. (2002). Evolution, consequences and future of plant and animal domestication. Nature *418*, 700–707.

10. Gladieux, P., Ropars, J., Badouin, H., Branca, A., Aguileta, G., de Vienne, D.M., Rodríguez de la Vega, R.C., Branco, S., and Giraud, T. (2014). Fungal evolutionary genomics provides insight into the mechanisms of adaptive divergence in eukaryotes. Molecular Ecology *23*, 753–773.

11. Dupont, J., Dequin, S., Giraud, T., Le Tacon, F., Marsit, S., Ropars, J., Richard, F., and Selosse, M.-A. (2017). Fungi as a Source of Food. In Microbiology Spectrum.

12. Almeida, P., Gonçalves, C., Teixeira, S., Libkind, D., Bontrager, M., Masneuf-Pomarède, I., Albertin, W., Durrens, P., Sherman, D.J., Marullo, P., *et al.* (2014). A Gondwanan imprint on global diversity and domestication of wine and cider yeast *Saccharomyces uvarum*. Nature Communications *5*.

13. Fay, J.C., and Benavides, J.A. (2005). Evidence for domesticated and wild populations of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*. PLoS Genet *1*, e5.

14. Gallone, B., Steensels, J., Prahl, T., Soriaga, L., Saels, V., Herrera-Malaver, B., Merlevede, A., Roncoroni, M., Voordeckers, K., Miraglia, L., *et al.* (2016). Domestication and divergence of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* beer yeasts. Cell *166*, 1397-1410.e16.

15. Legras, J.-L., Merdinoglu, D., Cornuet, J.-M., and Karst, F. (2007). Bread, beer and wine: *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* diversity reflects human history. Molecular Ecology *16*, 2091–2102.

16. Libkind, D., Hittinger, C.T., Valério, E., Gonçalves, C., Dover, J., Johnston, M., Gonçalves, P., and Sampaio, J.P. (2011). Microbe domestication and the identification of the wild genetic stock of lager-brewing yeast. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences *108*, 14539–14544.

17. Marsit, S., Mena, A., Bigey, F., Sauvage, F.-X., Couloux, A., Guy, J., Legras, J.-L., Barrio, E., Dequin, S., and Galeote, V. (2015). Evolutionary advantage conferred by an eukaryote-to-eukaryote gene transfer event in wine yeasts. Molecular Biology and Evolution *32*, 1695–1707.

18. Novo, M., Bigey, F., Beyne, E., Galeote, V., Gavory, F., Mallet, S., Cambon, B., Legras, J.-L., Wincker, P., Casaregola, S., *et al.* (2009). Eukaryote-to-eukaryote gene transfer events revealed by the genome sequence of the wine yeast *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* EC1118. PNAS *106*, 16333–16338.

19. Peter, J., Chiara, M.D., Friedrich, A., Yue, J.-X., Pflieger, D., Bergström, A., Sigwalt, A., Barre, B., Freel, K., Llored, A., *et al.* (2018). Genome evolution across 1,011 *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* isolates. Nature *556*, 339–344.

20. Liti, G., Carter, D.M., Moses, A.M., Warringer, J., Parts, L., James, S.A., Davey, R.P., Roberts, I.N., Burt, A., Koufopanou, V., *et al.* (2009). Population genomics of domestic and wild yeasts. Nature *458*, 337–341.

21. Spor, A., Kvitek, D.J., Nidelet, T., Martin, J., Legrand, J., Dillmann, C., Bourgais, A., De
Vienne, D., Sherlock, G., and Sicard, D. (2014). Phenotypic and genotypic convergences
are influenced by historical contingency and environment in yeast. Evolution *68*, 772–
790.
22. Dunn, B., Paulish, T., Stanbery, A., Piotrowski, J., Koniges, G., Kroll, E., Louis, E.J.,
Liti, G., Sherlock, G., and Rosenzweig, F. (2013). Recurrent rearrangement during
adaptive evolution in an interspecific yeast hybrid suggests a model for rapid
introgression. PLoS Genetics *9*, e1003366.
23. Galagan, J.E., Calvo, S.E., Cuomo, C., Ma, L.-J., Wortman, J.R., Batzoglou, S., Lee, S.-
I., Baştürkmen, M., Spevak, C.C., Clutterbuck, J., *et al.* (2005). Sequencing of
Aspergillus nidulans and comparative analysis with *A. fumigatus* and *A. oryzae*. Nature
438, 1105–1115.
24. Gibbons, J.G., Salichos, L., Slot, J.C., Rinker, D.C., McGary, K.L., King, J.G., Klich,
M.A., Tabb, D.L., McDonald, W.H., and Rokas, A. (2012). The evolutionary imprint of
domestication on genome variation and function of the filamentous fungus *Aspergillus*
oryzae. Current Biology *22*, 1403–1409.
25. Machida, M., Asai, K., Sano, M., Tanaka, T., Kumagai, T., Terai, G., Kusumoto, K.-I.,
Arima, T., Akita, O., Kashiwagi, Y., *et al.* (2005). Genome sequencing and analysis of
Aspergillus oryzae. Nature *438*, 1157–1161.
26. Dumas, E., Feurtey, A., Vega, R.C.R. de la, Prieur, S.L., Snirc, A., Coton, M., Thierry,
A., Coton, E., Piver, M.L., Roueyre, D., *et al.* (2020). Independent domestication events
in the blue-cheese fungus *Penicillium roqueforti*. Molecular Ecology *00*, 1–22.
27. Cheeseman, K., Ropars, J., Renault, P., Dupont, J., Gouzy, J., Branca, A., Abraham, A.-
L., Ceppi, M., Conseiller, E., Debuchy, R., *et al.* (2014). Multiple recent horizontal
transfers of a large genomic region in cheese making fungi. Nat Commun *5*, 2876.
28. Ropars, J., Rodríguez de la Vega, R.C., López-Villavicencio, M., Gouzy, J., Sallet, E.,
Dumas, É., Lacoste, S., Debuchy, R., Dupont, J., Branca, A., *et al.* (2015). Adaptive
horizontal gene transfers between multiple cheese-associated Fungi. Current Biology *25*,
2562–2569.
29. Gillot, G., Jany, J.-L., Coton, M., Le Floch, G., Debaets, S., Ropars, J., López-
Villavicencio, M., Dupont, J., Branca, A., Giraud, T., *et al.* (2015). Insights into
Penicillium roqueforti morphological and genetic diversity. PLOS ONE *10*, e0129849.
30. Legras, J.-L., Galeote, V., Bigey, F., Camarasa, C., Marsit, S., Nidelet, T., Sanchez, I.,
Couloux, A., Guy, J., Franco-Duarte, R., *et al.* (2018). Adaptation of *S. cerevisiae* to
fermented food environments reveals remarkable genome plasticity and the footprints of
domestication. Mol Biol Evol *35*, 1712–1727.
31. Pitt, J.I. (1979). The genus Penicillium and its teleomorphic states *Eupenicillium* and
Talaromyces. (London, UK: Academic Press).
32. Delfosse, C. (2008). Histoires de bries (Saint-Cyr-sur-Morin: Illustria Librairie des
Musées).
33. Pitt, J.I., Cruickshank, R.H., and Leistner, L. (1986). *Penicillium commune*, *P.*
camembertii, the origin of white cheese moulds, and the production of cyclopiazonic
acid. Food Microbiology *3*, 363–371.
34. Pouriau, A.-F.A. du texte (1895). La laiterie : art de traiter le lait, de fabriquer le beurre et
les principaux fromages français et étrangers (5e éd.) / par A.-F. Pouriau.
35. Garnier, L., Valence, F., Pawtowski, A., Auhustsinava-Galerne, L., Frotté, N., Baroncelli,
R., Deniel, F., Coton, E., and Mounier, J. (2017). Diversity of spoilage fungi associated
with various French dairy products. International Journal of Food Microbiology *241*,
191–197.
36. Giraud, F., Giraud, T., Aguileta, G., Fournier, E., Samson, R., Cruaud, C., Lacoste, S.,

Ropars, J., Tellier, A., and Dupont, J. (2010). Microsatellite loci to recognize species for
the cheese starter and contaminating strains associated with cheese manufacturing.
International Journal of Food Microbiology *137*, 204–213.

37. Visagie, C.M., Houbraken, J., Frisvad, J.C., Hong, S.-B., Klaassen, C.H.W., Perrone, G.,
Seifert, K.A., Varga, J., Yaguchi, T., and Samson, R.A. (2014). Identification and
nomenclature of the genus *Penicillium*. Studies in Mycology *78*, 343–371.

38. Hymery, N., Vasseur, V., Coton, M., Mounier, J., Jany, J.-L., Barbier, G., and Coton, E.
(2014). Filamentous Fungi and Mycotoxins in Cheese: A Review. Comprehensive
Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety *13*, 437–456.

39. Le Bars, J. (1979). Cyclopiazonic acid production by Penicillium camemberti Thom and
natural occurrence of this mycotoxin in cheese. Appl Environ Microbiol *38*, 1052–1055.

40. Hymery, N., Masson, F., Barbier, G., and Coton, E. (2014). Cytotoxicity and
immunotoxicity of cyclopiazonic acid on human cells. Toxicol In Vitro *28*, 940–947.

41. Bodinaku, I., Shaffer, J., Connors, A.B., Steenwyk, J.L., Biango-Daniels, M.N., Kastman,
E.K., Rokas, A., Robbat, A., and Wolfe, B.E. (2019). Rapid Phenotypic and Metabolomic
Domestication of Wild Penicillium Molds on Cheese. mBio *10*, e02445-19.

42. Gibbons, J.G., and Rokas, A. (2013). The function and evolution of the Aspergillus
genome. Trends in Microbiology *21*, 14–22.

43. Dyer, P.S., and O'Gorman, C.M. (2012). Sexual development and cryptic sexuality in
fungi: insights from Aspergillus species. FEMS Microbiol. Rev. *36*, 165–192.

44. Barve, M.P., Arie, T., Salimath, S.S., Muehlbauer, F.J., and Peever, T.L. (2003). Cloning
and characterization of the mating type (MAT) locus from Ascochyta rabiei (teleomorph:
Didymella rabiei) and a MAT phylogeny of legume-associated Ascochyta spp. Fungal
Genetics and Biology *39*, 151–167.

45. Boisard, P. (2007). Le camembert, mythe français Odile Jacob.

46. Selker, E.U., Cambareri, E.B., Jensen, B.C., and Haack, K.R. (1987). Rearrangement of
duplicated DNA in specialized cells of Neurospora. Cell *51*, 741–752.

47. Hashem, K.M., He, F.J., Jenner, K.H., and MacGregor, G.A. (2014). Cross-sectional
survey of salt content in cheese: a major contributor to salt intake in the UK. BMJ Open
4, e005051–e005051.

48. Kritikos, G., Banzhaf, M., Herrera-Dominguez, L., Koumoutsi, A., Wartel, M., Zietek,
M., and Typas, A. (2017). A tool named Iris for versatile high-throughput phenotyping in
microorganisms. Nature Microbiology *2*, 17014.

49. Lund, F., Filtenborg, O., and Frisvad, J.C. (1998). *Penicillium caseifulvum*, a new species
found on Penicillium roqueforti fermented cheeses. Journal of Food Mycology *1*, 95–
101.

50. Barbesgaard, P., Heldt-Hansen, H.P., and Diderichsen, B. (1992). On the safety of
Aspergillus oryzae: a review. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol *36*, 569–572.

51. Gillot, G., Jany, J.-L., Poirier, E., Maillard, M.-B., Debaets, S., Thierry, A., Coton, E.,
and Coton, M. (2017). Functional diversity within the *Penicillium roqueforti* species. Int.
J. Food Microbiol. *241*, 141–150.

52. Giraud, T., Refrégier, G., Le Gac, M., de Vienne, D.M., and Hood, M.E. (2008).
Speciation in fungi. Fungal Genetics and Biology *45*, 791–802.

53. Le Gac, M., and Giraud, T. (2008). Existence of a pattern of reproductive character
displacement in Homobasidiomycota but not in Ascomycota. Journal of Evolutionary
Biology *21*, 761–772.

54. Zhu, Q., Zheng, X., Luo, J., Gaut, B.S., and Ge, S. (2007). Multilocus analysis of
nucleotide variation of Oryza sativa and its wild relatives: severe bottleneck during
domestication of rice. Mol. Biol. Evol. *24*, 875–888.

55. Marsden, C.D., Ortega-Del Vecchyo, D., O'Brien, D.P., Taylor, J.F., Ramirez, O., Vilà,

C., Marques-Bonet, T., Schnabel, R.D., Wayne, R.K., and Lohmueller, K.E. (2015). Bottlenecks and selective sweeps during domestication have increased deleterious genetic variation in dogs. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 201512501.

56. Eyre-Walker, A., Gaut, R.L., Hilton, H., Feldman, D.L., and Gaut, B.S. (1998). Investigation of the bottleneck leading to the domestication of maize. PNAS *95*, 4441–4446.

57. Gaut, B.S., Díez, C.M., and Morrell, P.L. (2015). Genomics and the Contrasting Dynamics of Annual and Perennial Domestication. Trends in Genetics *31*, 709–719.

58. Duan, S.-F., Han, P.-J., Wang, Q.-M., Liu, W.-Q., Shi, J.-Y., Li, K., Zhang, X.-L., and Bai, F.-Y. (2018). The origin and adaptive evolution of domesticated populations of yeast from Far East Asia. Nat Commun *9*.

59. Mahler, D.L., Ingram, T., Revell, L.J., and Losos, J.B. (2013). Exceptional convergence on the macroevolutionary landscape in island lizard radiations. Science *341*, 292–295.

60. Thorpe, R.S., Barlow, A., Malhotra, A., and Surget-Groba, Y. (2015). Widespread parallel population adaptation to climate variation across a radiation: implications for adaptation to climate change. Mol Ecol *24*, 1019–1030.

61. Hohenlohe, P.A., Bassham, S., Etter, P.D., Stiffler, N., Johnson, E.A., and Cresko, W.A. (2010). Population Genomics of Parallel Adaptation in Threespine Stickleback using Sequenced RAD Tags. PLOS Genetics *6*, e1000862.

62. Duboué, E.R., Keene, A.C., and Borowsky, R.L. (2011). Evolutionary convergence on sleep loss in cavefish populations. Current Biology *21*, 671–676.

63. Salzburger, W. (2009). The interaction of sexually and naturally selected traits in the adaptive radiations of cichlid fishes. Molecular Ecology *18*, 169–185.

64. Elmer, K.R., Fan, S., Kusche, H., Spreitzer, M.L., Kautt, A.F., Franchini, P., and Meyer, A. (2014). Parallel evolution of Nicaraguan crater lake cichlid fishes via non-parallel routes. Nature Communications *5*, 5168.

65. Elmer, K.R., Kusche, H., Lehtonen, T.K., and Meyer, A. (2010). Local variation and parallel evolution: morphological and genetic diversity across a species complex of neotropical crater lake cichlid fishes. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci *365*, 1763–1782.

66. Martínez-Ainsworth, N.E., and Tenaillon, M.I. (2016). Superheroes and masterminds of plant domestication. Comptes Rendus Biologies *339*, 268–273.

67. Gross, B.L., and Olsen, K.M. (2010). Genetic perspectives on crop domestication. Trends in Plant Science *15*, 529–537.

68. Decker, M., and Nielsen, P.V. (2005). The inhibitory effect of *Penicillium camemberti* and *Geotrichum candidum* on the associated funga of white mould cheese. International Journal of Food Microbiology *104*, 51–60.

69. Gouyon, P.-H., Leriche, H., Civard, A., Reeves, H., and Hulot, N. (2010). Aux origines de l'environnement (Fayard).

70. Vavilov, N.I., Vavylov, M.I., Vavílov, N.Í., and Dorofeev, V.F. (1992). Origin and Geography of Cultivated Plants (Cambridge University Press).

71. Glass, N.L., and Donaldson, G.C. (1995). Development of primer sets designed for use with the PCR to amplify conserved genes from filamentous ascomycetes. Appl Environ Microbiol *61*, 1323–1330.

72. Koren, S., Walenz, B.P., Berlin, K., Miller, J.R., Bergman, N.H., and Phillippy, A.M. (2017). Canu: scalable and accurate long-read assembly via adaptive k-mer weighting and repeat separation. Genome Res. *27*, 722–736.

73. Walker, B.J., Abeel, T., Shea, T., Priest, M., Abouelliel, A., Sakthikumar, S., Cuomo, C.A., Zeng, Q., Wortman, J., Young, S.K., *et al.* (2014). Pilon: An Integrated Tool for Comprehensive Microbial Variant Detection and Genome Assembly Improvement.

PLOS ONE *9*, e112963.

74. Bolger, A.M., Lohse, M., and Usadel, B. (2014). Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for
Illumina sequence data. Bioinformatics *30*, 2114–2120.

75. Langmead, B., and Salzberg, S.L. (2012). Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2.
Nat. Methods *9*, 357–359.

76. McKenna, A., Hanna, M., Banks, E., Sivachenko, A., Cibulskis, K., Kernytsky, A.,
Garimella, K., Altshuler, D., Gabriel, S., Daly, M., *et al.* (2010). The Genome Analysis
Toolkit: a MapReduce framework for analyzing next-generation DNA sequencing data.
Genome Res. *20*, 1297–1303.

77. Pfeifer, B., Wittelsbürger, U., Ramos-Onsins, S.E., and Lercher, M.J. (2014).
PopGenome: An Efficient Swiss Army Knife for Population Genomic Analyses in R.
Mol Biol Evol *31*, 1929–1936.

78. Korneliussen, T.S., Albrechtsen, A., and Nielsen, R. (2014). ANGSD: Analysis of Next
Generation Sequencing Data. BMC Bioinformatics *15*, 356.

79. Schliep, K.P. (2011). phangorn: phylogenetic analysis in R. Bioinformatics *27*, 592–593.

80. Minh, B.Q., Schmidt, H.A., Chernomor, O., Schrempf, D., Woodhams, M.D., von
Haeseler, A., and Lanfear, R. (2020). IQ-TREE 2: New Models and Efficient Methods
for Phylogenetic Inference in the Genomic Era. Mol Biol Evol *37*, 1530–1534.

81. Kalyaanamoorthy, S., Minh, B.Q., Wong, T.K.F., von Haeseler, A., and Jermiin, L.S.
(2017). ModelFinder: fast model selection for accurate phylogenetic estimates. Nature
Methods *14*, 587–589.

82. Anisimova, M., Gil, M., Dufayard, J.-F., Dessimoz, C., and Gascuel, O. (2011). Survey
of Branch Support Methods Demonstrates Accuracy, Power, and Robustness of Fast
Likelihood-based Approximation Schemes. Syst Biol *60*, 685–699.

83. Minh, B.Q., Nguyen, M.A.T., and von Haeseler, A. (2013). Ultrafast approximation for
phylogenetic bootstrap. Mol. Biol. Evol. *30*, 1188–1195.

84. Hill, T.W., and Kafer, E. (2001). Improved protocols for Aspergillus minimal medium:
trace element and minimal medium salt stock solutions. Fungal Genetics Reports *48*, 20–
21.

85. Peterson, R.A., and Cavanaugh, J.E. (2019). Ordered quantile normalization: a
semiparametric transformation built for the cross-validation era. Journal of Applied
Statistics *0*, 1–16.

86. Porcher, E., Giraud, T., Goldringer, I., and Lavigne, C. (2004). Experimental
demonstration of a causal relationship between heterogeneity of selection and genetic
differentiation in quantitative traits. Evolution *58*, 1434–1445.
940

Figure Legends

Figure 1: Cheeses and fungi used for cheese-making.
A) Schematic representation of relationships between *Penicillium camemberti* and its closest
relatives, *P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum*. Pictures of *P. biforme, P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* on salted cheese medium at 25°C after 10 days of growth. B) Petri dish
with a white and fluffy *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* strain (FM013) and a green rough *P. fuscoglaucum* strain (LCP06617) on malt medium at 25°C.

**Figure 2: Population structure of 61 strains from the *Penicillium camemberti* species
complex, based on whole-genome data.**
A) Principal component analysis (PCA) based on the 61 strains, B) Principal component analysis
(PCA) based on only *P. camemberti* strains (n = 19). C) Neighbor-net analysis based on SNP data.
Cross-linking indicates the likely occurrence of recombination. Branch lengths are shown and the
scale bar represents 0.07 substitutions per site. D) Population subdivision inferred from $K = 2$ to

K = 6. Each column represents a strain and colored bars represent their coefficients of
membership for the various gene pools. For all panels, genetic clusters are represented by the
same colors: dark purple for *P. fuscoglaucum,* light blue for *P. biforme,* dark green for *P. camemberti*
var. *camemberti* and light green for *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum.* The strains identified as *P. commune*
(non-monophyletic group) by collectors are indicated in red. For PCA and neighbor-net analysis,
symbols correspond to the environment of collection: circles for cheese, triangles for dried
sausages and squares for other environments. On the structure analysis, letters below the plots
indicate the origin of the strains: C for cheese, F for food strains other than cheese and E for
other environments. Red asterisks indicated the type strains of *P. biforme, P. camemberti and P.*
caseifulvum.
See also Table S1, Figures S1, S2, Data S5 and Supplemental Information.

Figure 3: Phylogenetic relationships and presence/absence of the *Wallaby* and
CheesyTer* horizontally transferred regions in the 61 studied strains of the *Penicillium
***camemberti* species complex and the three outgroups.**
A) Maximum likelihood tree for the 64 strains based on 1,124,983 SNPs (586,131 parsimony
informative sites). Branch supports, represented as SH-aLRT/ultrafast bootstrap in percentage,
are only shown for clades but were always > 75%. The strain name color indicates the
environment of collection, black for food and blue for other environments. Asterisks after strains
indicate strains previously named *P. commune.*) Mapping coverage of the *CheeysyTer* region, as
defined in the reference genome *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* FM013. C) Mapping coverage of the
Wallaby region, as defined in the reference genome *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* FM013. On panels
B and C, no read mapping in a given position is represented in white, grey showing regions with
at least a read mapped.
See also Table S1, Figures S1, S2, Data S3, S4 and S5, Supplemental Information.

Figure 4: Phenotypic traits distinguishing the four lineages *Penicillium biforme, P.*
camemberti* var. *caseifulvum, P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and *P. fuscoglaucum. A)
Mean radial growth of the four lineages on unsalted cheese, salted cheese, malt and minimal
media. B) Pictures of colonies on unsalted cheese, salted cheese, malt and minimal media; *P.*
fuscoglaucum: LCP05471; *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti*: UBOCC-A-113052; *P. biforme*: ESE00211; *P.*
camemberti var. *caseifulvum*: LCP06622. C) Difference in opacity between the four lineages on salted
cheese at 25°C. D) Difference in production of cyclopiazonic acid between the four lineages on
yeast extract sucrose. C-D) Horizontal lines of the boxplots represent the upper quartile, the
median and the lower quartile. Each dot represents a strain and p-values are given for the tests of
differences between the lineages (Wilcoxon test). The color indicates assignments to the four
lineages as in other figures.
See also Data S1, S2, Figure S3 and Supplemental Information.

Figure 5: Competitive abilities of *Penicillium biforme, P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum*
and *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* against *Geotrichum candidum, P. biforme, P.*
***fuscoglaucum* and *P. roqueforti* competitors.** Top: Pictures of *P. roqueforti* FM164, *Geotrichum*
candidum ESE00163, *P. biforme* ESE00154 and *P. fuscoglaucum* ESE00221 on no lawn (first line), *P.*
biforme ESE00086 lawn (second line), *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* LCP04810 (third line) and *P.*
camemberti var. *caseifulvum* ESE00019 (fourth line) lawns, on salted cheese. Bottom: Boxplots
representing the differences of growth abilities of the competitors on different species lawn.
Horizontal lines of the boxplots represent the upper quartile, the median and the lower quartile.
Each dot represents a strain and p-values are given for the tests of differences between the
lineages (Wilcoxon test). The color indicates assignments to the three lineages as in other figures.
Abbreviations: *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti:* var. *cam; P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum:* var. *casei.*
See also Data S1, S2, supplemental Information.

Supplemental Data Legends

Table S1: Population genetics statistics in the *P. fuscoglaucum, P. biforme, P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and var. *caseifulvum* populations. F_{ST} and d_{xy} values were calculated on pairwise comparisons between populations, as well as proportion of shared, private and fixed SNPs. See also Figures 2 and 3.

Figure S1: Population structure of 61 strains from the *Penicillium camemberti* cheese-making fungal species complex, based on whole-genome data with the addition of the genome of the *P. commune* strain published in [41].
A) Principal component analysis; B) Neighbor-net analysis. Cross-linking indicates the likely occurrence of recombination Branch lengths are shown and the scale bar represents 0.04 substitutions per site. For both panels, the genetic clusters are represented by the same colors: light blue for *P. biforme,* dark green for *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and light green for *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum.* The strain added in this analysis, 162 3FA WT8, identified as *P. commune* (non-monophyletic group) is shown in red. The symbols correspond to the environment of collection: circles for cheese, triangles for dried sausages and squares for other environments.
See also Figures 2 and 3A.

Figure S2: Population structure of 47 strains from the two *Penicillium camemberti* varieties and *P. biforme* lineages, based on whole-genome data.
A) Principal component analysis; B) Neighbor-net analysis. Reticulation indicates the likely occurrence of recombination Branch lengths are shown and the scale bar represents 0.01 substitutions per site. For both panels, the genetic clusters are represented by the same colors: light blue for *P. biforme,* dark green for *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and light green for *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum.* The strains identified as *P. commune* (non-monophyletic group) by collectors are indicated in red. The symbols correspond to the environment of collection: circles for cheese, triangles for dried sausages and squares for other environments.
See also Figures 2 and 3A.

Figure S3: Cyclopiazonic acid (CPA) biosynthesis cluster in the *Penicillium camemberti* species complex. A) Schematic representation of the CPA biosynthesis cluster in the *P. camemberti* reference genome FM013. B) Amino-acid alignment of the *CpaA* gene showing a 2bp deletion in strains belonging to the *P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* genetic cluster, leading to a truncated protein.
See also Figure 4D.

Supplemental Information: Description of the origin, donor and genome coverage of the 61 strains of the *Penicillium camemberti* species complex used in this study.
See also Figures 2 - 5.

Data S1: Data for measured traits in *Penicillium camemberti* var. *camemberti, P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum.* A tab: growth; B tab: opacity; C tab: Cyclopiazonic acid production; D tab: competition.

Data S2: Results of statistical analyses performed for testing differences in traits between *Penicillium camemberti* var. *camemberti, P. camemberti* var. *caseifulvum, P. biforme* and *P. fuscoglaucum.* Significant P-values are indicated with an asterisk and highlighted in gray. A tab: growth; B tab: opacity; C tab: Cyclopiazonic acid production; D tab: competition.
See also Figures 4-5.

1056 **Data S3:** Genomic scans along the first 20 scaffolds of d_{xy}, F_{ST}, π and Watterson's θ. Dots show
1057 windows in the 1% highest d_{xy} between *Penicillium biforme* and *P. caememberti* var. *caseifulvum*, var.
1058 *camemberti* and *P. fuscoglaucum*.
1059 See also Figures 2 and 3A, Data S4.
1060
1061 **Data S4:** Gene annotation within windows in the 1% highest d_{xy} between *Penicillium biforme* and *P.*
1062 *camemberti* var. *caseifulvum* (A tab), var. *camemberti* (B tab) and *P. fuscoglaucum* (C tab).
1063 See also Figures 2 and 3A, Data S3.
1064
1065 **Data S5:** Oligonucleotide primer sets, PCR reaction, thermal cycler program for amplification,
1066 electrophoresis gel and Sanger sequences (PCR products were purified and sequenced by
1067 GENEWIZ) of *P. camemberti* var. *camemberti* and var. *caseifulvum*.
1068 See also Figures 2 and 3A.
1069
1070

Materials availability

1071
1072 Strains used in this study are publicly available: strains with LCP identifiers are from the public
1073 collection of the National Museum of Natural History in Paris; strains with UBOCC identifiers
1074 are from the public collection of the Université de Bretagne Occidentale Culture Collection;
1075 other strains with ESE numbers are conserved at the Ecology, Systematics and Evolution
1076 laboratory in Orsay.
1077

Data and code availability

1078
1079 Raw reads have been deposited to NCBI under the project number XXX.
1080 The codes generated during this study are available at XXX.

A

Penicillium fuscoglaucum

Penicillium biforme

Previously named *P. commune*

Penicillium camemberti var. *caseifulvum*

Penicillium camemberti var. *camemberti*

Cheese specific

B

A

B lac-Y   beta-gal   *CheesyTer*

C Hce2   *Wallaby*

100/100 LCP05631T
         ESE00153
         LCP04862

fuscoglaucum
LCP06617
LCP06623
ESE00090
LCP04799
LCP05327
LCP05471
LCP00797*
LCP06700
ESE00155
LCP00218
LCP03239
LCP06615
LCP06621
LCP06697

biforme
LCP05531NT*
ESE00126
LCP05529T
LCP06620
LMA421*
UBOCC-A-112050
ESE00023
ESE00086
ESE00087
ESE00089
ESE00211
ESE00151
ESE00207
LCP06701*
UBOCC-A-112053*
LCP05639
ESE00158
ESE00156
ESE00157
ESE00095
ESE00018
ESE00125
ESE00139
UBOCC-A-116003
ESE00154
ESE00137
LCP05496
UBOCC-A-112059*

var. *caseifulvum*
LCP05630T
LCP06622
LCP01920
UBOCC-A-108097
ESE00019
ESE00120

var. *camemberti*
LCP05527
UBOCC-A-101392
LCP04810
LCP00584T
UBOCC-A-108096
UBOCC-A-113052
UBOCC-A-113059
LCP04258
UBOCC-A-113054
FM013
LCP06699
UBOCC-A-113053
UBOCC-A-113056

100/100
100/100
100/100
100/100
100/100
100/100
100/100
100/100

0.02

CPA-

CPA+

scaffold 17   700   720   740

scaffold 18   200   300   400