1

# The relationship of mRNA with protein expression in CD8^{+} T cells associates with gene class and gene characteristics

10    Benoît P. Nicolet and Monika C. Wolkers

[1] Department of Hematopoiesis, Sanquin Research, Landsteiner Laboratory, Amsterdam UMC,
University of Amsterdam, and Oncode Institute, Amsterdam, The Netherlands.
* Corresponding author: M. Wolkers, Sanquin Research, Department of Hematopoiesis, Plesmanlaan
125, 1066 CX Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Tel: +31-20-5127003; Fax: +31-20-5123474; Email:
m.wolkers@sanquin.nl

**Short title:** mRNA with protein expression associates with gene class and characteristics

**SUMMARY**

T cells are key players in our defence against infections and malignancies. When T cells differentiate

or become activated, they undergo substantial alterations in gene expression. Even though RNA

expression levels are now well documented throughout different stages of T cells, it is not well

understood how mRNA expression translates into the protein landscape. By combining paired RNA

sequencing and mass spectrometry data of primary human CD8$^+$ T cells, we report that mRNA

expression is a poor proxy for the overall protein output, irrespective of the differentiation or

activation status. Yet, gene class stratification revealed a function-specific correlation of mRNA with

protein expression. This gene class-specific expression pattern associated with differences in gene

characteristics such as sequence conservation and untranslated region (UTR) lengths. In addition, the

presence of AU-rich elements in the 3'UTR associated with alterations in mRNA and protein

abundance T cell activation dependent, gene class-specific manner. In conclusion, our study

highlights the role of gene characteristics as a determinant for gene expression in T cells.

## INTRODUCTION

CD8^{+} T cell responses are key players in clearing and controlling microbial infections and tumor cells. To exert their effector function, naïve T cells become activated upon antigen recognition, and they differentiate into effector T cells (reviewed in [1]). T cells also mature into different subsets of memory T cells, which provide us often life-long protection from severe sickness by recurring infections [2,3]. This protection is achieved by their capacity to become rapidly reactivated upon antigen recognition, resulting in the rapid production of effector molecules, such as granzymes, chemokines, and cytokines [1,4–6].

T cell differentiation and activation depends on substantial alterations of the transcriptional landscape, and on metabolic reprogramming [7–9]. In CD8^{+} T cells, dynamic genome-wide alterations were observed during infections in mice and human at the transcript levels [7,10]. However, data integration of the transcriptome and proteome revealed a striking discrepancy between transcript and protein levels. In fact, model systems including NIH3T3 mouse fibroblasts, HeLa cells, or human and mouse T cells all showed a correlation coefficient of a mere ~ 0.4 [11–14]. Whether this limited correlation coefficient is a feature of all cells at steady state conditions, and whether it changes during differentiation or upon receiving external cues is to date not known. In particular studies in T cells are lacking.

In addition to transcriptional and metabolic alterations, post-transcriptional and post-translational mechanisms are critical determinants for T cell effector function [15]. For example, in activated Jurkat T cells, as much as 50% of the transcriptome changes was attributed to alterations in mRNA stability [16]. Untranslated regions (UTRs) are key regulatory elements in this process, as they are required for the modulation of mRNA transcript stability, translation initiation, and translation

efficiency [17]. Several motifs within the 3'UTR contribute to this regulation. For example, AU-rich

elements (AREs) are hubs for RNA binding proteins which in turn determine the fate of mRNA, as

exemplified for the key pro-inflammatory cytokines IFN-γ, TNF-α and IL-2 [18–20]. Whether this

observed discrepancy of mRNA and protein levels for IFN-γ, TNF-α and IL-2 also holds true for

other gene products, and whether gene regulation is defined by specific gene classes, or whether

specific features in mRNA influence the protein output in T cells is to date not well understood.

Here, we studied how T cell differentiation and T cell activation modulates the relation between

mRNA and protein expression in human CD8$^+$ T cells. We found that independent of the

differentiation status the overall correlation coefficient of mRNA and protein in T cells remained

unchanged. Nevertheless, the relation of mRNA expression with protein expression was gene class-

specific, and it associated with specific sequence characteristics. Gene class specificity even

extended to the effect on mRNA and protein levels of AU rich elements.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

*Data acquisition*

For analysis of mRNA and protein abundance during T cell differentiation, we used paired RNA-seq

data with paired MS data from *Böttcher et al.* (Supplemental table 3 of: [21]), and the National

Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) gene expression omnibus (GEO) repository under the

accession no: GSE63144). Biological replicates of human naïve ($T_N$; CD45RA$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$), central

memory ($T_{CM}$; CD45RO$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$ CX3CR1$^-$) and effector-memory ($T_{EM}$; CD45RO$^+$, CD62L$^{low}$,

CX3CR1$^{high}$) CD8$^+$ T cells were averaged per group for downstream analysis. Samples of memory

CD45RO$^+$ CD8$^+$ T cells ($T_{MEM}$) from *Bottcher et al* were averaged. Sequencing runs of the same

samples were concatenated. For analysis on CD8$^+$ T cell activation, we used our previously

published data [22] on the NCBI GEO repository under the accession no: GSE125497. MS data were

acquired on the Proteome Xchange Consortium via the PRoteomics IDEntifications Database

(PRIDE) repository with the dataset identifier no: PXD012874. For comparative analysis presented

here, RNA-seq and MS data from each biological replicate containing IFN-γ producers, IL-2

producers, IFN-γ/IL-2 double producers, and double negative producers were pooled, and the

average expression was used.

*RNA-seq analysis*

All samples passed our quality control (Fig S1A). An average of 10.5x10$^6$ (*Böttcher et al.*) and

21.4x10$^6$ (*Nicolet et al.*) reads per sample were used for quasi-mapping using Salmon (version 0.13)

on the human coding transcriptome hg38-release 92 from ENSEMBL [49]. Normalized counts in

'Transcripts per kilobase per million' (TPM; which corrects for transcript length and library size)

was calculated by Salmon, and ENSEMBL annotations were used to filter for protein-coding

transcripts, and to sum up the TPMs per genes. Genes with TPM>0.1 (*Bottcher et al*) and TPM>0.01

(*Nicolet et al*) were considered as expressed. Due to shallower sequencing depth in samples from

*Bottcher et al*, a higher cut-off was used. TPMs per gene were log10-tranformed and averaged across

samples as described above.

*MS analysis*

For samples from *Nicolet et al* [22], the RAW mass spectrometry files were processed as described

[22]. The Perseus (version 1.6.0.7) plugin for Protein ruler methodology [23] was used to calculate

protein copy number (CN) and protein content per cell (in pg per cell). CN values of all 12 biological

replicates were averaged and used to integrate with mRNA data. For samples from [21], raw data

were not available. LFQ values provided by the authors were used to compute CN values in Perseus.

Values from all samples were averaged to integrate with mRNA data.

*RNA-protein relation in different gene classes*

Genes　encoding　secreted　proteins　were　extracted　from

https://www.proteinatlas.org/humanproteome/tissue/secretome　(downloaded　Jan　2018),　and

manually curated for obvious mis-annotations (histones, membrane, TF, RNA-binding, CD

molecules, protein without protein evidence, collagen, nuclear, nucleus, ribosomal, mitochondrial).

Similarly, genes and proteins encoding CD molecules were extracted with the corresponding gene

and　protein　names　(www.uniprot.org/docs/cdlist.txt;　downloaded　July　2017).　Genes　of

experimentally validated RNA-binding proteins were obtained from [50–52]. Genes encoding for

transcription　factors,　ribosomal　proteins,　and　TCA-cycle　were　obtained　from

https://www.proteinatlas.org/humanproteome/proteinclasses　(downloaded　Jan.　2019).　A-U　rich

element (ARE) cluster  content of 3'UTRs was obtained from ARED-plus [29]. Genes with more

than one ARE cluster were annotated as ">1 ARE". GC content of genes (pre-mRNA sequence),

orthologous (pre-mRNA) sequence conservation between human and Zebrafish (*Danio rerio*), and 5'

and 3'UTR lengths were obtained from Ensembl BioMART (ENSEMBL; [53]). For each sequence

parameter (Fig 4 and S2), the data were subdivided into 3 groups based on top 25%, intermediate

50%, and top 25%.

*Statistical analysis and Data visualisation*

The mRNA-protein slope is the slope coefficient defined by the linear model (*lm()* function of R

'stats' package) using the formula '*lm(protein ~ mRNA)*' where protein is the log10(*copy number*)

and mRNA is the log10(*TPM*). The mRNA to protein ratio was calculated for each gene class using

the average mRNA in log10(*TPM*) plotted against the average protein in log10(copy number).

Statistical analysis was performed in R using a two-tailed t-test. The resulting p-values were adjusted

using Benjamini-Hochberg procedure. Differences were considered significant if adjusted p-value

<0.05, depicted in each graph. Plots were generated with ggplot2 version 3.0, and with GraphPad

PRISM version 8. Heatmaps were generated with pHeatmap version 1.0.10. Scripts used in this

study                  are                available                  on                Github                  at

https://github.com/BenNicolet/mRNA_and_protein_intregration_in_CD8_Tcells.

## RESULTS

**Limited correlation of mRNA and protein abundance in CD8$^+$ T cell populations**

We first asked how the mRNA and protein expression related to each other in human T cells. For this analysis, we used previously published RNA-sequencing (RNA-seq) and mass spectrometry (MS) data of peripheral blood-derived human CD8$^+$ T cells that were naïve (T$_N$), central memory (T$_{CM}$) or effector-memory (T$_{EM}$) cells [21]. In addition, we included datasets of CD8$^+$ T cells activated for 4h with PMA/Ionomycin (T$_{Activated}$) [22]. We mapped RNA-seq reads and computed normalized read counts in transcript per kilobase per million (TPM), which corrects for transcript length and sequencing depth, a critical feature for accurate quantification of RNA abundance. Across all T cell populations, we detected 14,195 genes expressed on average, representing ~70% of all protein-coding genes (Fig S1). The mass spectrometry measurements of paired samples identified 6,069 proteins across all blood-derived populations, and 4,626 proteins in T$_{Activated}$. To estimate protein abundance, we computed the protein copy number (CN) from MS data using the proteomic ruler methodology [23]. mRNA and protein abundance spanned over 7.2 and 6.2 orders of magnitude, respectively (Fig 1A, B; Table S1, S2). With the proteomic ruler methodology, we found that blood-derived CD8$^+$ T cells contain on average 47.35 pg of protein per cell (n=16; Fig 1C). In line with previous reports [24] [25], the protein content per cell nearly doubled in activated CD8$^+$ T cells to 93.75 pg/cell (n=12; Fig 1C). This finding thus indicates a substantial rearrangement of the T cell proteome upon activation.

The use of TPM (transcriptome) and CN (proteome) units allowed us to integrate mRNA expression levels with protein measurements. 6,013 gene products were detected both at mRNA and protein levels in blood-derived T cells, representing ~99,1% of detected protein and ~42% of all genes detected at mRNA level. Activated T cells contained 4,583 gene products with co-detected mRNA and protein levels. Intriguingly, irrespective of T cells differentiation or activation status, the mRNA-

protein correlation was almost identical (Pearson's coefficient = 0.40-0.42; Spearman's coefficient:

0.36-0.37; Fig 1D-F). We also calculated the overall mRNA-to-protein slope, which reflects how

mRNA abundance translates into protein abundance (Fig 1D). The mRNA-to-protein slope,

visualized by the regression line, was 0.58-0.65 (Fig 1E-F). Notably, even though the mass per cell

nearly doubled in activated T cells (Fig 1C), this had no effect on the correlation and slope between

mRNA and protein (Fig 1E-F). In conclusion, the overall abundance of mRNA in human CD8^{+} T

cells only moderately correlates with protein expression and is independent of the cell status.

**Distinct gene functions show differential correlation of mRNA with protein expression**

We next questioned whether this limited correlation of mRNA expression with protein output was

equal for all genes, or whether different gene classes displayed specific expression patterns. We first

examined the relation between mRNA and protein abundance in activated CD8^{+} T cells. We

specifically isolated secreted proteins, CD molecules, transcription factors, RNA-binding proteins

(RBPs), ribosomal proteins and Tricarboxylic (citric) acid cycle gene products (TCA) (Table S1,

S2). Of note, because protein secretion was blocked by Monensin during activation, we could

measure the expression of 22 secreted proteins. Secreted proteins and the 1174 RBPs displayed a

Pearson's correlation coefficient of 0.57 and 0.51, respectively, which was above average of all

genes combined (~0.42; Fig 1E, 2A), and were only outcompeted by the 24 genes involved in TCA

cycle (0.7) and the 93 mammalian ribosomal proteins (0.72). The 84 CD molecules were close to the

average with a Pearson's correlation coefficient of 0.43. In contrast, the 176 transcription factors and

66 mitochondrial ribosomal proteins showed a correlation coefficient of only 0.31 and 0.03,

respectively (Fig 2A). These finding highlights that subsets of genes, defined by their function, have

a distinct mRNA-protein correlation in activated CD8^{+} T cells.

We next examined whether the differential mRNA-protein correlation for these gene classes was also

observed throughout T cell differentiation. Mitochondrial ribosomal proteins displayed with -0.20 to

-0.26 even a negative Pearson's correlation coefficient, indicating that as mRNA levels increase,

lower protein levels are observed (Fig 2B). Conversely, mammalian ribosomal proteins, TCA cycle

genes, RBPs and CD molecules remained their Pearson's correlation coefficient during T cell

differentiation (Fig 2B). Nevertheless, T cell activation resulted in an increased coefficient for TCA

cycle genes and RBPs, and a decreased coefficient for CD molecules (Fig 2B). For secreted proteins,

the Pearson's correlation coefficient increased through differentiation and upon T cell activation (Fig

2B). Similar patterns were observed with the mRNA-to-protein slope for gene classes (Fig 2C).

Thus, mRNA and protein levels correlate in a gene class-specific manner, which only alters slightly

through T cell differentiation and upon activation.

**Gene classes display distinct gene characteristics**

Differential gene characteristics could explain the diversity of mRNA and protein relation in gene

classes. We therefore examined the sequence conservation of the different gene classes, by

comparing the sequence homology at the gene level between human and zebrafish (*Danio rerio*). In

particular the sequence of mammalian ribosomal proteins was highly conserved (median: 90.4%

sequence homology), followed by TCA cycle genes with a median value of 75.47% sequence

homology (Fig 3A). Mitochondrial ribosomal proteins displayed only a median sequence homology

of 53.01%, comparable to transcription factors with 50.57% and RBPs with 60.8%, with the latter

two displaying a wide spread in sequence conservation (Fig 3A). CD molecules and secreted proteins

had the lowest sequence conservation with 23.03% and 39.37% homology, respectively (Fig 3A).

Untranslated regions of RNAs are critical components in defining the RNA levels and the protein

output of a given mRNA, and the length of 5'UTR and 3'UTRs is contributing [26]. We therefore

also compared the length of 5'UTRs and 3'UTRs across gene classes, and found that they show

similar patterns (Fig 3B, C). For example, ribosomal proteins and TCA cycle genes tended to have

shorter UTRs than other gene classes (Fig 3B, C). In contrast, transcription factors had longer UTRs

than other gene classes (medians: 5'UTR: 233nt; 3'UTR: 1189.21nt), followed by RBPs (5'UTR:

163.1nt; 3'UTR: 848.13nt). Secreted protein and CD molecules, had similar length distributions, and

their UTR length spanned over 2 orders of magnitude for 5'UTR length and 3 orders of magnitude

for 3'UTR length (Fig 3B, C).

Also the GC content can influence a gene's expression. Even though the GC content of all genes

ranged from 25% to 77%, we did not observe large differences in medians between gene classes.

Nonetheless, RBPs had a somewhat reduced median GC% and CD molecules a somewhat increased

median GC% (Fig 3D). Combined, in particular different levels of sequence homology and of UTR

length is observed across gene classes.

**Gene and transcript characteristics associate with mRNA and protein abundance**

We next investigated how gene characteristics related to expression levels. We used mRNA and

protein abundance of activated CD8$^+$ T cells, and examined the relation between expression and

sequence conservation (Fig 4A). Of the 4,583 gene products that were co-detected at mRNA and

protein level in PMA-Ionomycin activated CD8$^+$ T cells, 4,568 (99.7%) gene products were present

in both human and zebra fish (*Danio rerio*). We divided these genes high sequence homology (top

25% of genes: >76.9% conservation), intermediate (25-75% of genes: 50%-76.9% conservation), and

low sequence homology (bottom 25% of genes: <50% conservation; Fig 4A, Fig S2). High

conservation correlated with the highest mRNA abundance and protein abundance in activated T

cells (Fig 4A). This translated in a high mRNA-protein slope (0.79) for these well conserved

transcripts, while intermediate and low conserved genes reached only 0.47 and 0.42, respectively

(Fig 4B). Thus, highly conserved genes display the highest expression in T cells.

We then turned to the relation between UTR lengths and gene expression, which we stratified into

genes with short (shortest 25%: < ~50nt), intermediate (25-75%), or long 5'UTRs (longest 25%: >

~200nt; Fig 4C, S2), and short (bottom 25%, < ~100nt), intermediate (25-75%), and long (top 25%,

> ~1,000nt) 3'UTRs (Fig 4E, S2). mRNA abundance was not affected by the length of the 5'UTR,

and only slightly reduced by long 3'UTRs (Fig 4C, E). A short 5'UTR resulted in slight but

significantly higher protein levels (Fig 4C), as previously reported in yeast (*Saccharomyces*

*cerevisiae*) [27]. A similar correlation of long 3'UTRs with reduced protein expression was observed

(Fig 4E). This also translated into higher mRNA-protein slopes for genes with long 5'UTRs, and

even more so for genes with long 3'UTRs (Fig 4D, F). Thus, the length of the UTRs - and in

particular that of the 3'UTR - influences the mRNA and protein level in activated T cells.

Genes with a high GC content (top 25% of genes: GC>50.9%) had a significantly higher mRNA and

protein abundance compared to genes with low (GC<39.7%,) or intermediate GC content

(39.7%<GC<50.9%), which was also reflected in the RNA-protein slope (Fig 4G, H, S2). Thus, gene

characteristics not only associate with particular gene functions, but also associate with altered

mRNA and protein expression in CD8$^{+}$ T cells.

**AU-rich elements influence the relation between mRNA and protein**

The influence of 3'UTR on gene expression is not limited to length. In fact, 3'UTR contain many

binding sites for RNA-binding proteins and microRNAs. A key regulatory element in 3'UTRs are A-

U rich elements (AREs) [17,18,28]. Indeed, ARE-containing transcripts such as *IFNG*, *TNF* and *IL2*,

are strictly regulated by ARE-binding RBP especially during T cell activation when these cytokines

are secreted [15]. To define whether AREs associate with mRNA and protein abundance in CD8$^+$ T

cells, we used ARED-plus AU-rich element annotations from [29]. ARED-plus annotations define 1

cluster as WWWW(AUUUA)WWWW (where W is A or U), 2 clusters as AUUUAUUUAU or

UAUUUAUUUA flanked by W or WW, and 3 and over clusters are defined as

AUUUAUUUAUUUA and additional repeats of AUUUA [29]. When we integrated the number of

ARE clusters with mRNA abundance in $T_{MEM}$ cells, mRNAs containing one or more ARE clusters in

3'UTR expressed higher mRNA levels (Fig 5A).

In activated T cells, we did not observe differences on mRNA levels in the presence or absence of

ARE clusters (Fig 5B), indicating that AREs may be more important in defining transcript

expression in non-activated $T_{MEM}$ cells than in activated T cells. Nonetheless, ARE clusters within

the 3'UTR significantly affected the protein abundance both $T_{MEM}$ cells and activated T cells (Fig

5A, B), indicating that AREs consistently modulate the protein output irrespective of the activation

status of T cells. This is consistent with the notion that AREs can modulate both mRNA stability and

mRNA translation [30]. Consequently, ARE-containing transcripts displayed a lower mRNA-protein

slope with 0.34-0.44 than transcripts without ARE clusters (0.68; Fig 5C). Hence, the presence of

ARE clusters within 3'UTRs modifies the mRNA and protein relation in activated T cells.

**AU-rich elements mostly affect secreted proteins**

We next examined the effect of ARE clusters on mRNA expression and protein output in gene

classes. ARE is thought to drive expression of transcripts that require a rapid on-off production, such

as certain CD molecules, transcription factors and secreted proteins [15]. For CD molecules and

transcription factors, we did not detect a role of ARE clusters on mRNA or protein expression levels

in $T_{MEM}$, or in activated T cells (Fig S3A-D). In addition, CD molecules lacking ARE-Clusters were

subject to strong differences in mRNA-protein slopes between $T_{MEM}$ and activated T cells (0.56 to

296 0.36), while genes with 1ARE had marginal changes (0.68 to 0.53), pointing to ARE-independent

297 effects on gene expression for these genes at activation (Fig 6A, B). Transcription factors only

298 showed marginal if any changes in the mRNA-protein slopes when comparing genes containing 0 or

299 1ARE cluster, in $T_{MEM}$ with activated T cells (Fig 6C, D). In contrast, the slope of genes containing

300 >1ARE cluster increased from -0.25 in $T_{MEM}$ to 0.13 in activated T cells. Thus, even though the

301 mRNA-protein slope changed, it remains below that of transcription factors containing 0 or 1ARE

302 cluster.

304 Secreted proteins did not display alterations in mRNA abundance in $T_{MEM}$ CD8$^+$ T cells (Fig S3E,

305 F). Yet, the average mRNA levels went down with increasing numbers of ARE clusters (means:

306 0ARE: 1.2 TPM; 1ARE: 0.38 TPM; >1ARE: 0.14 TPM; Fig S3E, F), which appeared specific for

307 secreted molecules (Fig S3). Interestingly, even though T cell activation resulted in overall increased

308 mRNA levels, this was most apparent for mRNAs with >1ARE cluster (>1ARE: mean 30.4 TPM;

309 Fig S3E, F). None of the 23 mRNAs containing >1ARE clusters in $T_{MEM}$ CD8$^+$ T cells had

310 detectable protein levels (Fig 6E, S3E). Upon T cell activation, 6 out of the 17 mRNAs with >1ARE

311 clusters showed protein production (CCL3, CSF2, CXCL8, IL2, PTGS2, TNF) in activated T cells

312 (Fig 6F, S3F). The mRNA-to-protein slope for secreted proteins of transcripts in $T_{MEM}$ with 0 or

313 1ARE cluster was with 0.39 identical (Fig 6E). However, in activated T cells, the mRNA-protein

314 slope increased irrespective of the ARE cluster content (Fig 6F). Only 7 and 6 mRNA/proteins pairs

315 were co-detected in 1 and >1ARE clusters, respectively (1ARE: CSF1, IFNG, IL13, IL23A, LIF,

316 TGFB1, XCL2; >1ARE: CCL3, CSF2, CXCL8, IL2, PTGS2, TNF), yet the slope differed between

317 these two groups (1ARE: 1.38; >1ARE: 0.35; Fig 6F). Together, our findings indicate that ARE

318 clusters associate with suppression of protein abundance in secreted proteins and transcription

319 factors, but not in CD molecules.

**DISCUSSION**

With an integrated analysis of transcriptome and proteome data from primary human CD8$^+$ T cells,

we show here that the mRNA expression only moderately correlates with protein expression, a

feature that is independent of T cell differentiation or activation. Even though we did not detect

peptides for all transcripts by MS analysis, the limited correlation holds true at least for the ~40% of

the protein-encoding mRNAs of which we used the protein expression data.

The limited correlation in mRNA and protein abundance was previously reported in other model

systems [11–14], and has been attributed to differences in transcriptional rates, mRNA stability for

mRNA abundance, and to protein synthesis and degradation rates for protein abundance [31]. Which

of these parameters is the prime driver of the mRNA expression levels and protein output may be

gene-specific and may depend on the differentiation and activation status of a cell. Indeed, whereas

the overall correlation between mRNA and protein was limited, we found gene class-specific mRNA

and protein expression patterns. Mitochondrial ribosomal proteins are only stable when bound to the

mitochondrial ribosome [32]. In contrast, the mRNA of mammalian ribosomal proteins are

considered stable [33], and mammalian ribosomal proteins are known to be expressed in ribosome-

unbound form as well [34]. Differential degradation of unbound mitochondrial ribosomal proteins

and mammalian ribosomal protein could thus lead to the observed discrepancy in mRNA and protein

abundance for both protein classes. Similarly, TCA genes did not only express high levels of mRNA

and protein but also showed a strong correlation of mRNA abundance with protein abundance. It is

therefore conceivable that the conservation of these so-called 'housekeeping' genes resulted in high

transcription and translation efficiency [35].

Protein stability is another important determinant of protein expression levels [12,36]. Mammalian

ribosomal proteins and nucleosomes are more stable than secreted proteins, as are zinc-finger

containing proteins (both RNA-binding proteins and transcription factors [36,37]). However, protein

stability is also cell-type specific [38]. Although we did not directly address protein stability in

differentiating and activated human $CD8^+$ T cells, the high correlation for mRNA and protein

expression for TCA proteins and ribosomal protein match with these studies and reiterate the

positive relation of gene sequence conservation with mRNA and protein expression levels.

Evolutionary sequence conservation can also result in altered GC-content of the mRNA coding

region, which translates into higher mRNA levels and translation efficiency [39,40]. This could

explain why high GC content associates with higher mRNA and protein levels. Complementary to

our findings, GC content manipulation of the IL6 and IL2 gene resulted in higher mRNA stability,

ribosome occupancy and protein output [39,41]. GC content also influences codon usage and

secondary structures, which in turn increases translation efficiency and protein output [42–45].

Not only sequence conservation, but also the length of 5' and 3'UTR influences the mRNA and

protein abundance. UTR length alone, however, is unlikely to be the sole factor that influences

mRNA and protein abundance. Similar to the increased presence of ARE clusters in longer 3'UTRs

[26], the overall likelihood of containing regulatory motifs and structures increases with length.

Notably, murine T cells activated for 48h with aCD3/CD28 beads display substantial shortening of

3'UTRs [46]. Whether this also occurs after 4h PMA-Ionomycin activation is yet to be determined. It

is however conceivable that alterations in 3'UTR length can contribute to mRNA expression in

activated T cells by altering the content of miRNA seeds and thus mRNA stability [47].

Also AU-rich elements strongly influence the mRNA and protein levels [19,30,48]. Interestingly,

ARE-mediated regulation in CD molecules did not alter mRNA and protein expression. Only ARE-

containing transcripts encoding secreted proteins and transcription factors had high mRNA levels

while having low to undetectable protein levels in memory T cells. Upon activation, however, these

transcript showed high mRNA and high protein levels, reflecting the discrepancy of mRNA and

protein levels of IFN-$\gamma$ in memory and tumor-infiltrating T cells due to a ARE-dependent

translational block [30,48]. What makes transcripts susceptible to this regulation is yet to be

determined, but it could possibly stem from subtle differences in position and spacing between

AREs, the surrounding RNA structures, or the interplay with other regulatory mechanisms on the

same transcript.

In summary, we show that the limited relation between the mRNA and protein levels is gene class

specific and is defined by sequence conservation and by sequences and structures of UTRs. Our

findings serve as valuable resource to further study the relation between sequence characteristic and

gene expression in CD8^{+} T cells.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We would like to thank Branka Popovic and Nordin Zandhuis for critical reading of this manuscript.

**AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION**

B.P.N. and M.C.W. designed experiments; B.P.N. performed experiments and analyzed data.

M.C.W. directed the study; B.P.N. and M.C.W wrote the manuscript.

**DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

The authors declare no competing interests.

**FUNDING**

This research was supported by the Oncode Institute, and the European research council (ERC-

Printers 817533).

**REFERENCES**
400

1.   Harty JT, Badovinac VP. Shaping and reshaping CD8+ T-cell memory. Nature Reviews
Immunology. 2008;8: 107–119. doi:10.1038/nri2251

2.   Kaech SM, Cui W. Transcriptional control of effector and memory CD8+ T cell differentiation.
Nature Reviews Immunology. 2012;12: 749–761. doi:10.1038/nri3307

3.   Amsen D, Van Gisbergen KPJM, Hombrink P, Van Lier RAW. Tissue-resident memory T cells
at the center of immunity to solid tumors. Nature Immunology. 2018;19: 538–546.
doi:10.1038/s41590-018-0114-2

4.   Reinhardt RL, Khoruts A, Merica R, Zell T, Jenkins MK. Visualizing the generation of memory
CD4 T cells in the whole body. Nature. 2001;410: 101–105. doi:10.1038/35065111

5.   Masopust D. Preferential Localization of Effector Memory Cells in Nonlymphoid Tissue.
Science. 2001;291: 2413–2417. doi:10.1126/science.1058867

6.   Han Q, Bagheri N, Bradshaw EM, Hafler DA, Lauffenburger DA, Love JC. Polyfunctional
responses by human T cells result from sequential release of cytokines. Proceedings of the
National Academy of Sciences. 2012;109: 1607–1612. doi:10.1073/pnas.1117194109

7.   Best JA, Blair DA, Knell J, Yang E, Mayya V, Doedens A, et al. Transcriptional insights into
the CD8 + T cell response to infection and memory T cell formation. Nature Immunology.
2013;14: 404–412. doi:10.1038/ni.2536

8.   van der Windt GJW, Everts B, Chang CH, Curtis JD, Freitas TC, Amiel E, et al. Mitochondrial
Respiratory Capacity Is a Critical Regulator of CD8 + T Cell Memory Development. Immunity.
2012;36: 68–78. doi:10.1016/j.immuni.2011.12.007

9.   Jurgens AP, Popović B, Wolkers MC. T cells at work: how post-transcriptional mechanisms
control T cell homeostasis and activation. European Journal of Immunology. 2021;n/a.
doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/eji.202049055

10.  Roychoudhuri R, Clever D, Li P, Wakabayashi Y, Quinn KM, Klebanoff CA, et al. BACH2
regulates CD8+ T cell differentiation by controlling access of AP-1 factors to enhancers. Nature
Immunology. 2016;17: 851–860. doi:10.1038/ni.3441

11.  Hukelmann JL, Anderson KE, Sinclair L V., Grzes KM, Murillo AB, Hawkins PT, et al. The
cytotoxic T cell proteome and its shaping by the kinase mTOR. Nature Immunology. 2016;17:
104–112. doi:10.1038/ni.3314

12.  Schwanhäusser B, Busse D, Li N, Dittmar G, Schuchhardt J, Wolf J, et al. Global quantification
of mammalian gene expression control. Nature. 2011;473: 337–342. doi:10.1038/nature10098

13.  Nagaraj N, Wisniewski JR, Geiger T, Cox J, Kircher M, Kelso J, et al. Deep proteome and
transcriptome mapping of a human cancer cell line. Molecular Systems Biology. 2011;7: 1–8.
doi:10.1038/msb.2011.81

14.  Cuadrado E, van den Biggelaar M, de Kivit S, Chen Y yen, Slot M, Doubal I, et al. Proteomic
Analyses of Human Regulatory T Cells Reveal Adaptations in Signaling Pathways that Protect
Cellular Identity. Immunity. 2018;48: 1046-1059.e6. doi:10.1016/j.immuni.2018.04.008

15.   Salerno F, Turner M, Wolkers MC. Dynamic Post-Transcriptional Events Governing CD8+ T
Cell Homeostasis and Effector Function. Trends in Immunology. 2020;41: 240–254.
doi:10.1016/j.it.2020.01.001

16.   Cheadle C, Fan J, Cho-Chung YS, Werner T, Ray J, Do L, et al. Control of gene expression
during T cell activation: Alternate regulation of mRNA transcription and mRNA stability. BMC
Genomics. 2005;6: 1–16. doi:10.1186/1471-2164-6-75

17.   Mayr C. Regulation by 3′-Untranslated Regions. Annual Review of Genetics. 2017;51: 171–
194. doi:10.1146/annurev-genet-120116-024704

18.   Caput D, Beutler B, Hartog K, Thayer R, Brown-Shimer S, Cerami A. Identification of a
common nucleotide sequence in the 3'-untranslated region of mRNA molecules specifying
inflammatory mediators. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States
of America. 1986;83: 1670–1674. doi:10.1073/pnas.83.6.1670

19.   Kontoyiannis D, Pasparakis M, Pizarro TT, Cominelli F, Kollias G. Impaired on/off regulation
of TNF biosynthesis in mice lacking TNF AU- rich elements: Implications for joint and gut-
associated immunopathologies. Immunity. 1999;10: 387–398. doi:10.1016/S1074-
7613(00)80038-2

20.   Stoecklin G, Lu M, Rattenbacher B, Moroni C. A Constitutive Decay Element Promotes Tumor
Necrosis Factor Alpha mRNA Degradation via an AU-Rich Element-Independent Pathway.
Molecular and Cellular Biology. 2003;23: 3506–3515. doi:10.1128/mcb.23.10.3506-3515.2003

21.   Böttcher JP, Beyer M, Meissner F, Abdullah Z, Sander J, Höchst B, et al. Functional
classification of memory CD8 + T cells by CX 3 CR1 expression. Nature Communications.
2015;6: 8306. doi:10.1038/ncomms9306

22.   Nicolet BP, Guislain A, van Alphen FPJ, Gomez-Eerland R, Schumacher TNM, van den
Biggelaar M, et al. CD29 identifies IFN-γ–producing human CD8 + T cells with an increased
cytotoxic potential. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences. 2020;117: 6686–6696.
doi:10.1073/pnas.1913940117

23.   Wiśniewski JR, Hein MY, Cox J, Mann M. A "Proteomic Ruler" for Protein Copy Number and
Concentration Estimation without Spike-in Standards. Molecular & Cellular Proteomics.
2014;13: 3497–3506. doi:10.1074/mcp.m113.037309

24.   Marchingo JM, Sinclair L V, Howden AJ, Cantrell DA. Quantitative analysis of how Myc
controls T cell proteomes and metabolic pathways during T cell activation. eLife. 2020;9:
e53725. doi:10.7554/eLife.53725

25.   Wolf T, Jin W, Zoppi G, Vogel IA, Akhmedov M, Bleck CKE, et al. Dynamics in protein
translation sustaining T cell preparedness. Nature Immunology. 2020;21: 927–937.
doi:10.1038/s41590-020-0714-5

26.   Nicolet BP, Zandhuis ND, Lattanzio VM, Wolkers MC. Sequence determinants as key
regulators in gene expression of T cells. Immunological Reviews. 2021;304: 10–29.
doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/imr.13021

27. Dvir S, Velten L, Sharon E, Zeevi D, Carey LB, Weinberger A, et al. Deciphering the rules by
which 5'-UTR sequences affect protein expression in yeast. Proceedings of the National
Academy of Sciences. 2013;110: E2792–E2801. doi:10.1073/pnas.1222534110

28. Chen CYA, Shyu A Bin. AU-rich elements: characterization and importance in mRNA
degradation. Trends in Biochemical Sciences. 1995;20: 465–470. doi:10.1016/S0968-
0004(00)89102-1

29. Bakheet T, Hitti E, Khabar KSA. ARED-Plus: An updated and expanded database of AU-rich
element-containing mRNAs and pre-mRNAs. Nucleic Acids Research. 2018;46: D218–D220.
doi:10.1093/nar/gkx975

30. Salerno F, Engels S, van den Biggelaar M, van Alphen FPJ, Guislain A, Zhao W, et al.
Translational repression of pre-formed cytokine-encoding mRNA prevents chronic activation of
memory T cells. Nature Immunology. 2018;19: 828–837. doi:10.1038/s41590-018-0155-6

31. Vogel C, Marcotte EM. Insights into the regulation of protein abundance from proteomic and
transcriptomic analyses. Nature Reviews Genetics. 2012;13: 227–232. doi:10.1038/nrg3185

32. Bogenhagen DF, Ostermeyer-Fay AG, Haley JD, Garcia-Diaz M. Kinetics and Mechanism of
Mammalian Mitochondrial Ribosome Assembly. Cell Reports. 2018;22: 1935–1944.
doi:10.1016/j.celrep.2018.01.066

33. Perry RP. Balanced production of ribosomal proteins. Gene. 2007;401: 1–3.
doi:10.1016/j.gene.2007.07.007

34. Simsek D, Tiu GC, Flynn RA, Byeon GW, Leppek K, Xu AF, et al. The Mammalian Ribo-
interactome Reveals Ribosome Functional Diversity and Heterogeneity. Cell. 2017;169: 1051-
1065.e18. doi:10.1016/j.cell.2017.05.022

35. Berthelot C, Villar D, Horvath JE, Odom DT, Flicek P. Complexity and conservation of
regulatory landscapes underlie evolutionary resilience of mammalian gene expression. Nature
Ecology and Evolution. 2018;2: 152–163. doi:10.1038/s41559-017-0377-2

36. Kristensen AR, Gsponer J, Foster LJ. Protein synthesis rate is the predominant regulator of
protein expression during differentiation. Molecular Systems Biology. 2013;9:689.
doi:10.1038/msb.2013.47

37. Cassandri M, Smirnov A, Novelli F, Pitolli C, Agostini M, Malewicz M, et al. Zinc-finger
proteins in health and disease. Cell Death Discovery. 2017;3,17071.
doi:10.1038/cddiscovery.2017.71

38. Mathieson T, Franken H, Kosinski J, Kurzawa N, Zinn N, Sweetman G, et al. Systematic
analysis of protein turnover in primary cells. Nature Communications. 2018;9: 1–10.
doi:10.1038/s41467-018-03106-1

39. Kudla G, Lipinski L, Caffin F, Helwak A, Zylicz M. High guanine and cytosine content
increases mRNA levels in mammalian cells. PLoS Biology. 2006;4: 0933–0942.
doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.0040180

40.   Rudolph KLM, Schmitt BM, Villar D, White RJ, Marioni JC, Kutter C, et al. Codon-Driven
514           Translational Efficiency Is Stable across Diverse Mammalian Cell States. PLoS Genetics.
515           2016;12: 1–23. doi:10.1371/journal.pgen.1006024

516    41.   Hia F, Yang SF, Shichino Y, Yoshinaga M, Murakawa Y, Vandenbon A, et al.  Codon bias
517           confers stability to human mRNA s . EMBO reports. 2019;20: 1–19.
518           doi:10.15252/embr.201948220

519    42.   Chen SL, Lee W, Hottes AK, Shapiro L, McAdams HH. Codon usage between genomes is
520           constrained genome-wide mutational processes. Proceedings of the National Academy of
521           Sciences of the United States of America. 2004;101: 3480–3485. doi:10.1073/pnas.0307827100

522    43.   De Smit MH, Van Duin J. Secondary structure of the ribosome binding site determines
523           translational efficiency: A quantitative analysis. Proceedings of the National Academy of
524           Sciences of the United States of America. 1990;87: 7668–7672. doi:10.1073/pnas.87.19.7668

525    44.   Vogel C, De Sousa Abreu R, Ko D, Le SY, Shapiro BA, Burns SC, et al. Sequence signatures
526           and mRNA concentration can explain two-thirds of protein abundance variation in a human cell
527           line. Molecular Systems Biology. 2010;6: 1–9. doi:10.1038/msb.2010.59

528    45.   Fang H, Huang YF, Radhakrishnan A, Siepel A, Lyon GJ, Schatz MC. Scikit-ribo Enables
529           Accurate Estimation and Robust Modeling of Translation Dynamics at Codon Resolution. Cell
530           Systems. 2018;6: 180-191.e4. doi:10.1016/j.cels.2017.12.007

531    46.   Sandberg R, Neilson JR, Sarma A, Sharp PA, Burge CB. Proliferating cells express mRNAs
532           with shortened 3′ untranslated regions and fewer microRNA target sites. Science. 2008;320:
533           1643–1647. doi:10.1126/science.1155390

534    47.   Mayr C, Bartel DP. Widespread Shortening of 3′UTRs by Alternative Cleavage and
535           Polyadenylation Activates Oncogenes in Cancer Cells. Cell. 2009;138: 673–684.
536           doi:10.1016/j.cell.2009.06.016

537    48.   Salerno F, Guislain A, Freen-Van Heeren JJ, Nicolet BP, Young HA, Wolkers MC. Critical role
538           of post-transcriptional regulation for IFN-γ in tumor-infiltrating T cells. OncoImmunology.
539           2019;8: 1–12. doi:10.1080/2162402X.2018.1532762

540    49.   Zerbino DR, Achuthan P, Akanni W, Amode MR, Barrell D, Bhai J, et al. Ensembl 2018.
541           Nucleic Acids Research. 2018;46: D754–D761. doi:10.1093/nar/gkx1098

542    50.   Gerstberger S, Hafner M, Tuschl T. A census of human RNA-binding proteins. Nature Reviews
543           Genetics. 2014;15: 829–845. doi:10.1038/nrg3813

544    51.   Perez-Perri JI, Rogell B, Schwarzl T, Stein F, Zhou Y, Rettel M, et al. Discovery of RNA-
545           binding proteins and characterization of their dynamic responses by enhanced RNA interactome
546           capture. Nature Communications. 2018;9: 4408. doi:10.1038/s41467-018-06557-8

547    52.   Castello A, Fischer B, Frese CK, Horos R, Alleaume A-M, Foehr S, et al. Comprehensive
548           Identification of RNA-Binding Domains in Human Cells. Molecular Cell. 2016;63: 696–710.
549           doi:10.1016/j.molcel.2016.06.029

550    53.  Kinsella RJ, Kähäri A, Haider S, Zamora J, Proctor G, Spudich G, et al. Ensembl BioMarts: A
551         hub for data retrieval across taxonomic space. Database. 2011;2011: 1–9.
552         doi:10.1093/database/bar030

 **FIG LEGENDS**

**Fig 1: Transcriptome and proteome integration in human CD8$^+$ T cells**

(**A**-**B**) mRNA abundance in transcript per kilobase per million (TPM) and protein abundance data in

protein copy number (CN) of CD8$^+$ T cells that were activated for 2 days with αCD3/αCD28,

cultured for 4 days, and were then re-activated for 4h with PMA-Ionomycin (T$_{Activated}$; n=12; from

[22]). (**C**) Estimated protein mass per cells using the proteomic ruler methodology [23] of blood-

derived, naïve (T$_N$; CD45RA$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$; n=3), central memory (T$_{CM}$; CD45RO$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$

CX3CR1$^-$; n=3) and effector-memory (T$_{EM}$; CD45RO$^+$, CD62L$^{low}$, CX3CR1$^{high}$; n=4) CD8$^+$ T cell

subsets and for CD8$^+$ T cells from (A). The p-value resulting from two-tailed t-test is indicated in

(C). (**D**) Graph representing mRNA and protein correlation (such as Pearson's correlation) and slope

of a linear regression. Of note, the correlation coefficient represents a numerical integration of the

dispersion of the data points, and is not a measure of the angle of the regression line. (**E**) Integrated

mRNA and protein abundance in T$_{Activated}$. The Pearson's correlation coefficient, the linear regression

(grey line), and its mRNA-to-protein slope are indicated in the graph. (**F**) Table indicating the

Pearson's correlation coefficient and the mRNA-to-protein slope for T cell populations in (C).

**Fig 2: Gene class-specific mRNA and protein abundance**

(**A**) Integrated mRNA (TPM) and protein abundance (CN) of secreted proteins, CD molecules,

transcription factors, RNA-binding proteins (RBPs), mammalian (light green) and mitochondrial

(dark green) ribosomal proteins, and TCA (citric acid) cycle proteins of activated CD8$^+$ T cells

(T$_{Activated}$). The number of genes per class, the Pearson's correlation coefficient, and regression line

(linear model) were calculated for each class and are indicated in the panels. (**B**-**C**) Pearson's

correlation coefficient (B) and mRNA-to-protein slope (C) of the integrated mRNA and protein

abundance of gene classes indicated in (A) during T cell differentiation and upon T cell activation.

**Fig 3: Distinct gene characteristics are associated with gene functions**

(**A-D**) Relation between gene classes (Fig 2) and sequence homology of human genes with Zebrafish (*D. rerio*) (A), the length of the 5'UTR (B) and 3'UTR (C), and the GC content (D). Red bars indicate the median values per gene class, which are also indicated numerically at each respective graph. nt: nucleotides.

**Fig 4: Altered mRNA and protein abundance is associated with gene characteristics**

(**A**, **B**) The effect of sequence conservation on mRNA (A, left panel) and protein abundance (A, right panel) and the relation thereof (B) in PMA-Ionomycin activated CD8$^+$ T cells. Genes products were stratified according to Fig S2, in: (**A, B**)  high (>76.9%), intermediate (between 50-76.9%) and low (<50%) orthologous sequence conservation between Human and Zebra-fish (*Danio rerio*); (**C, D**) short (<~50nt), intermediate (~50nt- ~200nt), and long 5'UTRs (>~200nt); (**E, F**) short (<~100nt), intermediate (~100- ~1,000nt), and long (>~1,000nt) 3'UTRs; (**G, H**) high (>50.9%), intermediate (39.7%<GC<50.9%) and low (<39.7%) GC content per gene. The slope of the regression line of each group is color-coded in B, D, F, H. Differences between groups were assessed with a two-tailed t-test followed by adjustment of p-value using the Benjamini-Hochberg procedure. Adjusted p-value are indicated. Only gene products that are detected both at mRNA and protein levels are shown. TPM: Transcripts per kilo-base per million; CN: Protein copy number.

**Fig 5: ARE clusters differentially modulate mRNA and protein levels in resting and activated CD8$^+$ T cells**

(**A-B**) mRNA (TPM) and protein (CN) abundance in (A) CD45RO$^+$ CD8$^+$ memory T cell subsets (T$_{MEM}$; n=16; from [21]) and (B) T$_{Activated}$ CD8$^+$ T cells of all genes, grouped according to the number of AU-rich element in cluster within the transcript's 3'UTR clusters according to ARED-plus annotation (**A**; see methods). Differences between groups were assessed with a two-tailed t-test followed by adjustment of p-value using the Benjamini-Hochberg procedure. Adjusted p-value are

indicated. (**C**) and integrated mRNA and protein abundance. The slope of the regression line of each

group is color-coded in (A-B), and only gene products that are detected both at mRNA and protein

levels are shown. TPM: Transcripts per kilo-base per million; CN: Protein copy number.

**Fig 6: ARE cluster content differentially affect gene classes**

(**A-F**) Integrated mRNA (TPM) and protein (CN) abundance of genes co-detected at mRNA and

protein levels, for (**A-B**) CD molecules, (**C-D**) transcription factors, or (**E-F**) secreted proteins.

Genes were stratified according to the number of AU-rich element in cluster within the transcript's

3'UTR, for (**A,C,E**) $T_{MEM}$ or (**B,D,F**) $T_{Activated}$ CD8$^+$ T cells. The linear regression and its slope are

color-coded for each group. Difference between groups were assessed with a two-tailed t-test

followed by adjustment of p-value using the Benjamini-Hochberg procedure. Adjusted p-value are

indicated. TPM: Transcripts per kilo-base per million; CN: Protein copy number.

**SUPPLEMENTAL FIG LEGENDS**

**Fig S1: Quality control of RNA sequencing and Mass spectrometry data**

Quality control (QC), number of reads mapped to transcriptome, number of gene expressed and

protein detected for blood-derived, naïve ($T_N$; CD45RA$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$; n=3), central memory ($T_{CM}$;

CD45RO$^+$ CD62L$^{high}$ CX3CR1$^-$; n=3) and effector-memory ($T_{EM}$; CD45RO$^+$, CD62L$^{low}$,

CX3CR1$^{high}$; n=4) CD8$^+$ T cell subsets and for CD8$^+$ T cells that were activated for 2 days with

αCD3/αCD28, cultured for 4 days, and were then re-activated for 4h with PMA-Ionomycin

($T_{Activated}$; n=12; from [22]).

**Fig S2: mRNA and/or protein abundance associates with gene characteristics**

Distribution and color-coded cut-off (top 25%; mid. 50%; bottom 25% of all genes) for stratifying

orthologous gene sequence conservation between Human and Zebrafish (in %), GC content (in %),

5' and 3'UTR length (in nucleotides; nt). Only gene products detected at mRNA and protein levels

are shown.

**Fig S3: ARE-mediated regulation of transcripts encoding CD molecules and transcription**

**factors do not alter upon T cell activation**

(**A-F**) mRNA (TPM) and protein (CN) abundance for CD molecules (A-B), transcription factors (C-

D), or secreted molecules (E-F) in $T_{MEM}$ (A, C, E) or $T_{Activated}$ CD8$^+$ T cells (B, D, F). Genes products

are color-coded according to the number of ARE clusters (ARED annotation) within the 3'UTR.

Differences were assessed with a two-tailed t-test followed by adjustment of p-value using the

Benjamini-Hochberg procedure. N.D. : not detected.

**Table S1: Transcriptome and proteome data in TActivated from [22].**

**Table S2: Transcriptome and proteome data of TN, TCM, TEM and TMEM from [21].**

Figure 2 Nicolet et al.

Figure 5 Nicolet et al.

# ARE in cluster in 3'UTR   ● 0   ● 1   ● >1