Tinamou egg color displacement at ecoregion co-partitioning

Qin Li[1], Silu Wang[2]*

[1]Department of Science and Education, Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago, IL 60605, USA

[2]Valley Life Science Building, Harmon Way, University of California, Berkeley, 94720

*Corresponding author email: siluwang.evo@gmail.com

Abstract

The divergence of reproductive traits frequently underpins the evolution of reproductive

isolation. One of the most enduring puzzles on this subject concerns the variability in egg

coloration among species of tinamou (Tinamidae), endemic to neotropics. Here we investigated

the hypothesis that tinamou egg coloration is a mating signal and its diversification was driven

by reinforcement. For most tinamou species, the male guards the nest that is sequentially visited

and laid eggs in by multiple females. The colorations of the existing eggs in the nest could signal

mate quality and species identities to the upcoming females, preventing costly hybridization, thus

were selected to diverge among species (Mating Signal Character Displacement Hypothesis). If

so, two predictions should follow: (1) egg colors should coevolve with known mating signals as

the tinamou lineages diverged; (2) species that partition similar ecoregions should display

different egg colors. The tinamou songs are important mating signals and are highly divergent

among species. We found that the egg luminance was significantly associated with the first

principal component of the song variables, which supports prediction (1). In addition, we found

support for (2): tinamou species that co-partition ecoregions tend to display different egg colors,

controlling for song variation. Egg color and songs could be multimodal mating signals that are

divergently selected as different tinamou species diverged. Mating signal evolution could be

opportunistic and even exploit post-mating trait as premating signals that undergo character

displacement at sympatry.

Introduction

Reproductive trait divergence is crucial for speciation because these traits frequently underpin barriers to gene flow in the onset of speciation (Koski and Ashman 2016; Pfennig 2016). A very puzzling reproductive trait divergence exists in tinamou egg coloration. Tinamiformes (common name: tinamou) is the most species-rich order of Palaeognathae, containing 48 extant species (Figure 1) (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002). Tinamous are mostly dull in plumage, but various species of tinamous lay brightly colored eggs ranging from brilliant magenta, to pink, purple, turquoise, and olive green (Figure 1) (Cabot 1992). Despite its evolutionary uniqueness, tinamou egg color divergence remains a mystery due to the cryptic and elusive plumage and behavior of the birds (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002).

Two main hypotheses have been made about evolutionary mechanism of egg color divergence: (1) 'aposematism hypothesis' (Swynnerton 1916) states that eggs are brightly colored to warn predators of their distastefulness; (2) 'mating signaling character displacement hypothesis', which predicts that egg color are employed for mating recognition and attraction (Weeks 1973; Brennan 2010), and could be divergently selected among closely related species at sympatry. The aposematic function of egg coloration was thought to be unlikely, because egg predators are nocturnal mammals or reptiles that prioritize chemical cues over visual cues (Skutch 1966; Cabot 1992; Brennan 2010). The 'mating signal character displacement hypothesis' is plausible considering the ecology and mating systems of tinamou species. In most tinamou species, males collect and incubate eggs laid by multiple females (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002). An initial female is attracted by distinctive songs to the nest guarded a male. If mating occurs, the female lays eggs in the nest and leaves before other females come and lay more eggs that are all incubated by the same male (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002). The colors of the existing

eggs in the nest could signal intra-specific mate identity to prevent costly hybridization. Such

alternative "mating channel" might be especially favored when the plumage is adapted for

camouflage (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002). If egg colors of different tinamou species is adapted for

mate recognition, reinforcement (Dobzhansky 1937; Mayr 1942; Liou and Price 1994; Servedio

2000) could have driven egg color divergence among different tinamou species.

Here we investigated the 'mating signal character displacement hypothesis' of tinamou egg

color divergence. If tinamou egg colors are employed as a species-specific mate recognition

signal, it should coevolve with other mate-recognition signals as the tinamou lineages diverged.

Songs of tinamous are known to be important and highly divergent mating signals among species

(Cabot 1992; Bertelli and Tubaro 2002; Laverde-R. and Cadena 2014; Boesman et al. 2018). In

addition to songs, multimodality of mating signals is selected for efficient mate-recognition in

complex environment (Partan and Marler 1999; Rowe 1999; Secondi et al. 2015; Halfwerk et al.

2019). When glamorous plumage is costly due to increased predation risk, alternative signal

modality such as egg coloration could be favored. Since the birds themselves (instead of the

eggs) tend to attract nest predation (Brennan 2010), egg coloration could be employed to fulfill

signal multimodality, bypassing the evolutionary constraints for plumage. To investigate this

possibility, here we ask: (1) whether egg coloration coevolved with songs as tinamou species

diverged; and (2) whether species that co-partition ecoregions tend to display divergent egg

colors?

80   **Methods**

To investigate the mating signal character displacement hypothesis in tinamou egg color

evolution, we examined the association of song, egg colors, and ecoregion co-partitions among

tinamou species. Tinamou egg coloration data was extracted from existing tinamou egg color

analysis (Schläpfer 2017), which quantified coloration of the eggs from 32 tinamou species.

Since tinamou egg colors are known to decay over the course museum storage, tinamou nest

photos are used to best represent the functional egg color (Schläpfer 2017). Briefly, for each

species, the egg coloration reflected in hue, chroma, and luminance in the CIELAB color space

as well as RGB color space was quantified (Schläpfer 2017). To efficiently infer egg color

variation among species, we conducted principal component analysis (PCA) of the RGB color

space with RGB axes shifted to center around zero and scaled to unit variance.

Song data was acquired from a previous study (Bertelli and Tubaro 2002), in which four

song variables from 40 tinamou species were quantified: maximum frequency (Hz), minimum

frequency (Hz), emphasized frequency (frequency of the note with highest amplitude in the song,

Hz), and bandwidth (the difference between maximum and minimum frequency, Hz). Because

these variables are correlated (Figure S1), we used PCA to generate PC1 that captured 81.2% of

the variation in song data. Four song variables were shifted to center around zero and scaled to

unit variance preceding PCA.

We tested whether egg hue, chroma, and luminance is respectively associated with song

PC1 among tinamous, accounting for the potential confounding phylogenetic signals as well as

habitat type, which was shown to be correlated with song variation among tinamous (Figure 1

A)(Bertelli and Tubaro 2002). We used the Tinamidae phylogenetic tree inferred with both

molecular (1143 bp mitochondrial and 1145 bp nuclear) and morphological characters (237

characters) (Bertelli and Porzecanski 2004), in which the polytomy was resolved with additional

morphological and life history traits (Bertelli 2017). We first tested if there is phylogenetic signal

(Pagel 1999) in each of the egg color variable with phytools (Revell 2012). If no significant

phylogenetic signal was identified, we ran permutation test of independence between song PC1

and the egg color variable with *coin* package. If there is significant ($p < 0.05$) phylogenetic

signal, we first calculated independent contrasts of egg colors and song PC1 with Ape (Paradis

and Schliep 2019), then executed independence test. To correct for multiple hypotheses testing,

we conducted False Discovery Rate correction (Benjamini and Hochberg 1995) to correct for

three tests.

Species ranges were generated according to their occurrences. Geo-referenced

occurrences were downloaded from GBIF (Global Biodiversity Information Facility, GBIF.org)

for all the tinamou species. Occurrences with uncertainty in coordinates less than 10km were

kept, and were further filtered by removing redundant localities within a 1-km^2 grid cell via R

package *ecospat* (Cola et al. 2017) after Lambert azimuthal equal-area projection (ranging 9 –

9413, median = 469). Ecoregion designation for each species was carried out by overlaying

occurrences with the ecoregion map of America. Ecoregion maps were downloaded for North

America (https://www.epa.gov) and South America (http://ecologicalregions.info) separately at

level I and then were combined as one to include 11 ecoregions for all occurrences. For each

species, an ecoregion with which the proportion of occurrences was greater than 10% (or > 50 if

the total number > 1000) was included in the species' ecoregion distribution.

With this data, we calculated pairwise probability of ecoregion co-partitioning among

tinamou species. For each pair of species, the probability of ecoregion co-partitioning is the sum

(across all ecoregions) of the multiplication of the probability of species-specific partitioning

within each ecoregion. For each species, the probability of partitioning within an ecoregion is the

number of points of occurrence within the ecoregion over the total points of occurrence for the

species. If the probability of ecoregion co-partitioning is an effective indicator of sympatry or

parapatry in the course of tinamou speciation, closely related species should be more likely to co-

partition ecoregions. We employed Mantel Pearson's correlation test with function *mantel.test* to

test if the species distance matrix is correlated with the ecoregion co-partitioning probability

matrix.

Further, we examined the evolutionary relationship between the PC1 of the egg RGB

color space and ecoregion co-partitioning while controlling for song PC1 among species. We

first computed the distance matrices of egg color PC1 and song PC1 respectively with the *dist*

function in R. To examined matrix correlation between the distance matrix of egg color PC1 and

the probability matrix of ecoregion co-partitioning while controlling for song PC1 distance

matrix among species, we used one-tailed Partial Mantel Pearson's correlation test with 10,000

iterations with the *mantel.partial* function.

141   **Results**

The macroevolutionary relation among egg color, ecoregion partitioning, and song

characters is consistent with the Character Displacement Hypothesis. We found a significant

association between tinamou songs and egg luminance. Song PC1 represents 81.2% variation

among the song variables in tinamous. Significant phylogenetic signal was observed in egg hue

(K = 0.43, p = 0.049), chroma (K= 0.96, p = 0.001), and habitat type (K = 1.15, p = 0.001), but

not in luminance (K = 0.37, p = 0.17). The tinamou song PC1 was significantly associated with

egg luminance (Z = -2.42, p = 0.015, $p_{corrected}$ = 0.045; Figure 1B), but not with egg hue (Z =

0.34, p = 0.72, $p_{corrected}$ = 0.75), nor with egg chroma (Z = -0.32, p = 0.75, $p_{corrected}$ = 0.75). The

habitat type was although associated with tinamou song variation (Bertelli and Tubaro 2002), not

significantly associated with egg color (Figure 1C): luminance (Phylogenetic ANOVA, F = 1.18,

$p = 0.82$), chroma (F = 0.99, $p = 0.84$), or hue (F = 3.58, $p = 0.53$).

153
154
Figure 1 Association of habitat type, song variation, and egg colour among tinamou species.
(A) There is an association between song variation and habitat type among tinamou species
(Bertelli and Tubaro 2002). (B) There is significant association between egg luminance and song
PC1 (permutation test of independence, $Z = -2.42$, $R^2 = 0.20$, $p = 0.015$, $p_{corrected} = 0.045$). The
color of dots represent the RGB color of the eggs of each species. (C) Egg color PC1 in the RGB
space is not significantly associated with habitat types among tinamou species ($p > 0.05$).

We further observed greater egg color divergence between species that co-partition

ecoregions after controlling for song variation among tinamou species. The PC1 explains 54%

variation of egg colors in the RGB color space. The distance of egg color PC1 distance is

significantly positively associated with the ecoregion co-partitioning among species controlling

for song distance among tinamou species (Partial Mantel r = 0.066, $p = 0.048$). Ecoregion co-

occurrence is likely an effective indicator of parapatry or sympatry in history of tinamou

speciation, as closely related species tends to co-occur at ecoregions (Mantel Z = 1530.38, $p =$

0.001).

Figure 2 Tinamous ecoregion co-partitioning is associated with egg colour difference among species. There is significantly greater distance in egg colour among species that partition similar ecoregions, after controlling for song variation (partial mantel test, $p < 0.05$). The Tinamidae phylogeny was inferred with molecular and morphological data (Bertelli and Porzecanski 2004).

Discussion

The macroevolution relationship among egg colors, song variation, and ecoregion partitioning, is consistent with the 'Mating Signal Character Displacement Hypothesis' that tinamou egg coloration is an alternative mating signal that is divergently selected among species with similar ecogeographical partition (Weeks 1973; Brennan 2010). Egg colors and songs could be divergently selected as multimodal mate-recognition signals among tinamou species with similar appearance that partition similar ecogeographical range. When the plumage modality is constrained by anti-predation adaptation, egg coloration could be opportunistically adopted to fulfill mating signal multimodality for species recognition at sympatry. This study sheds light on

the evolution of multimodal sexual signals that bypasses natural selection for plumage

camouflage in the most species-rich order of Palaeognathae.

Egg coloration could be both a pre- and post-mating signals in tinamous. In many other

bird species, egg color is known to be post-mating signals indicating female quality and to

influence male incubation and promiscuity (Soler et al. 2005; English 2009). In tinamous, egg

coloration can also function as premating signal as well, received by females. For most of the

tinamou species, males guard and incubate the eggs laid by multiple females (Cabot 1992). The

coloration of the existing eggs in the nest could be a mating signal received by the upcoming

females to the nest. As premating signals, egg colors could reflect mate species identity (Sætre et

al. 1997; Servedio and Noor 2003; Secondi et al. 2015) and mate quality, and stimulate female

mate choice copying (Dugatkin 1992; Gibson and Höglund 1992).

Then why do tinamous adopt egg colors as mating signals in addition to songs? Songs

that are important mating signals in tinamous (Bertelli and Tubaro 2002) and are involved in

duetting between mating partners (Boesman et al. 2018). However, such acoustic modality is

usually insufficient for mate communication in complex environment, thus signal redundancy or

multimodality is further selected for mate communication to alleviate mate-searching effort

and/or hybridization (Partan and Marler 1999; Rowe 1999; Uy et al. 2008; Secondi et al. 2015).

Plumage patterning and coloration are frequently adopted as inter-specific and intra-specific

mating signals at a finer spatial scale in birds (Uy et al. 2008, 2009; Seddon et al. 2013).

However, most tinamou species exhibited cryptic plumage as an adaption for anti-predatory

camouflage (Cabot 1992; Davies 2002). Sexual selection for plumage elaboration would

compromise the adaptation for camouflage favored by natural selection. Egg coloration can be an

alternative modality of mate signaling enrichment towards mate-searching refinement, bypassing

the conflict between natural and sexual selection.

Reinforcement may have driven egg color and song divergence among sympatric or

parapatric tinamou species. Many closely-related tinamou species demonstrate historical and/or

contemporary ecoregion overlap (Cabot 1992)(Fig. 2), suggesting sympatry in the course of their

speciation history. Ecological and/or intrinsic incompatibility among diverged lineages leads to

reduced hybrid fitness, which in turn select for premating signal divergence to avoid costly

hybridization (Dobzhansky 1940; Mayr 1942; Liou and Price 1994; Servedio 2000). Mating

signal multimodality is needed to ensure mate recognition in complex heterospecific

environment (Uy et al. 2008; Secondi et al. 2015). The divergence of tinamou song and egg

coloration could jointly reduce heterospecific reproductive efforts among sympatric tinamou

species. Closely related tinamou species that are mostly allopatric at present, but could still

harbor footprints of historical character displacement of egg colors formed at historical sympatry

either over secondary contact or sympatry speciation. Notably, the species with greater

likelihood of ecoregion co-occurrence tend to display divergent egg colors (Fig. 2). For example,

the closely related species *Crypturellus erythropus*, *C. notivagus*, *C. variegatus*, *C. brevirostris*

still partition similar ecoregions and demonstrate distinct egg coloration, which may have been

driven by reinforcement at historical sympatry (Fig. 3). Although the speciation event among

tinamou species have long passed (~34% sequence divergence), the likelihood of ecoregion co-

occurrence is potentially an effective indicator of historical sympatry/parapatry in the history of

tinamou speciation because the closely related species tend to share ecoregions.

Although we found significant supports for both of the predictions of the Mating Signal

Character Displacement Hypothesis, the significance levels were marginal. This indicates that

there are other potential evolutionary forces shaping tinamou egg color divergence. Besides the

local tinamou species assembly, other complex aspects of biotic interactions such as sexual

conflicts, predation, and parasitism, might contribute to the egg color signal diversity.

Figure 3 Reconstructed ancestral distribution of a *Crypturellus* clade. Black lines depict the
boundaries of ecoregions corresponding to Figure 2, and dashed lines depicted boundaries of
species' distribution ranges. Ranges of tips were concave hull polygons generated via R package
rangemap (Cobos et al. 2021) with a hierarchical clustering method, and kernel densities were
estimated via R package *spatstat* (Adrian Baddeley, Ege Rubak 2015), to capture the spatial
configuration of the occurrences. Distributions of internal nodes were generated by the same
method with an intermediate step of rescaling densities (at a 100-km-resolution) of all
descendants to offset the effect of variation in abundance. Blue to red colors depict the relative
scale of kernel densities from low to high (ranging 0 to 1).

The genetic underpinning of such song and egg color association is unclear. The simplest

genetic mechanism underlying such association is pleiotropy (one gene affecting multiple traits)

(Fisher 1930; Williams 1957). For example, the pleiotropic *foraging* gene underpins the

association among social behavior and life history traits in natural populations (de Belle et al.

1989; Mery et al. 2007; Wang and Sokolowski 2017). There might be an omnipotent pleiotropic

gene linking egg coloration, songs, among many other traits. If so, a wide array of traits

underpinned by such pleiotropy are expected to coevolve. However, the association between

song and egg color of tinamous is fairly specific: only luminance (but not hue or chroma) of the

egg color is associated with tinamou songs. Such specificity in song-egg-color association is

consistent with mating signal multimodality in which specifically signals were coupled among

modalities (Gilliard 1956; Partan and Marler 1999; Hebets and Papaj 2005). Various signal

modality can be underpinned by different genes and selected to coevolve as multimodal signals.

Future investigation of genetic underpinnings of tinamou song and egg colors would further shed

light on this interesting co-divergence. In sum, the results presented herein are concordant with

the hypothesis that egg coloration in tinamous serves as mating signals either for mate attraction

or mate species-recognition and could be divergently selected upon historical

sympatry/parapatry.

Acknowledgement

266   Thank Dahong Chen, Patricia Brennan, Daniel Hanley, Julia Clarke, and Jonathan

267   Rolland for helpful discussions. Thank Daniel Hanley, Ken Thompson, Dahong Chen, and

268   Jonathan Rolland for comments on the manuscript.

Conflict of interest

270   There is no conflict of interest in this study.

Reference

Adrian Baddeley, Ege Rubak, R. T. (2015). 2015. Spatial Point Patterns: Methodology and
    Applications with R. Chapman and Hall/CRC Press, London, UK.

Benjamini, Y., and Y. Hochberg. 1995. Controlling the False Discovery Rate: A Practical and
    Powerful Approach to Multiple Testing. J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B 57:289–300.

Bertelli, S. 2017. Advances on tinamou phylogeny: an assembled cladistic study of the volant
    palaeognathous birds. Cladistics 33:351–374.

Bertelli, S., and A. L. Porzecanski. 2004. Tinamou (tinamidae) systematics: a preliminary
combined analysis of morphology and molecules. Ornitol. Neotrop. 15:293–299.
Bertelli, S., and P. L. Tubaro. 2002. Body mass and habitat correlates of song structure in a
primitive group of birds. Biol. J. Linn. Soc. 77:423–430.
Boesman, P., O. Claessens, T. V. V. Costa, V. Pelletier, J. Ingels, and A. Renaudier. 2018. Songs
of Rusty Tinamou Crypturellus brevirostris and duetting in Crypturellus species. Bull. Br.
Ornithol. Club 138:69–78.
Brennan, P. L. R. 2010. Clutch predation in great tinamous Tinamus major and implications for
the evolution of egg color. J. Avian Biol. 41:419–426.
Cabot, J. 1992. Tinamiformes. Pp. 112–144 in D. Hoyo, A. Elliot, and J. Sargatal, eds.
Handbook of birds of the world. Barcelona.
Cobos, M. E., V. Barve, N. Barve, A. Jimenez-Valverde, and C. Nuñez-Penichet. 2021.
rangemap: Simple Tools for Defining Species Ranges (v0.1.18).
Cola, V. Di, O. Broennimann, B. Petitpierre, F. T. Breiner, M. D'Amen, C. Randin, R. Engler, J.
Pottier, D. Pio, A. Dubuis, L. Pellissier, R. G. Mateo, W. Hordijk, N. Salamin, and A.
Guisan. 2017. ecospat: an R package to support spatial analyses and modeling of species
niches and distributions. Ecography (Cop.). 40:774–787.
Davies, S. J. J. F. 2002. Ratities and tinamous. Tinamidae, Rheidae, Dromaiidae, Casuariidae,
Apterygidae, Struthionidae. Oxford Univ. Press, New York.
de Belle, J. S., A. J. Hilliker, and M. B. Sokolowski. 1989. Genetic localization of foraging (for):
a major gene for larval behavior in Drosophila melanogaster. Genetics 123:157–164.
Dobzhansky, T. 1937. Genetics and the Origin of Species. Columbia University Press, New
York.
Dobzhansky, T. 1940. Speciation as a Stage in Evolutionary Divergence. Am. Nat. 74:312–321.
Dugatkin, L. A. 1992. Sexual Selection and Imitation: Females Copy the Mate Choice of Others.
Am. Nat. 139:1384–1389.
English, P. 2009. Why is a robin's egg blue? Exploring the evolution of egg colour in birds.
Queen's University.
Fisher, R. A. 1930. The Genetical Theory of Natural Selection. Oxford Univ. Press, Oxford,
England.
Gibson, R., and J. Höglund. 1992. Copying sexual selection. Trends Ecol. Evol. 7:229–232.
Gilliard, E. T. 1956. Bower Ornamentation versus Plumage Characters in Bower-Birds. Auk
73:450–451.
GBIF.org (30 September 2021) GBIF Occurrence Download https://doi.org/10.15468/dl.fqnhrk
Halfwerk, W., J. Varkevisser, R. Simon, E. Mendoza, C. Scharff, and K. Riebel. 2019. Toward
testing for multimodal perception of mating signals. Front. Ecol. Evol. 7:1–7.
Hebets, E. A., and D. R. Papaj. 2005. Complex signal function: Developing a framework of
testable hypotheses.
Koski, M. H., and T. L. Ashman. 2016. Reproductive character displacement and environmental
filtering shape floral variation between sympatric sister taxa. Evolution (N. Y). 70:2616–
2622.
Laverde-R., O., and C. D. Cadena. 2014. Taxonomy and conservation: A tale of two tinamou
species groups (Tinamidae, Crypturellus). J. Avian Biol. 45:484–492.
Liou, L. W., and T. D. Price. 1994. Speciation by Reinforcement of Premating Isolation.
Evolution (N. Y). 48:1451–1459.
Mayr, E. 1942. Systematics and the origin of species. Columbia University Press, New York.

Mery, F., A. T. Belay, A. K. C. So, M. B. Sokolowski, and T. J. Kawecki. 2007. Natural
polymorphism affecting learning and memory in Drosophila. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.
104:13051–13055.
Pagel, M. 1999. Inferring the historical patterns of biological evolution. Nature 401:877–884.
Paradis, E., and K. Schliep. 2019. Ape 5.0: An environment for modern phylogenetics and
evolutionary analyses in R. Bioinformatics 35:526–528.
Partan, S., and P. Marler. 1999. Communication goes multimodal. Science (80-.). 283:1272–
1273.
Pfennig, K. S. 2016. Reinforcement as an initiator of population divergence and speciation. Curr.
Zool. 62:145–154.
Revell, L. J. 2012. phytools: An R package for phylogenetic comparative biology (and other
things). Methods Ecol. Evol. 3:217–223.
Rowe, C. 1999. Receiver psychology and the evolution of multicomponent signals. Anim.
Behav., doi: 10.1006/anbe.1999.1242.
Sætre, G. P., T. Moum, S. Bureš, M. Král, M. Adamjan, and J. Moreno. 1997. A sexually
selected character displacement in flycatchers reinforces premating isolation. Nature
387:589–592.
Schläpfer, K. 2017. The colorful eggs of the tinamous.
Secondi, J., G. Rodgers, F. Bayle, S. Source, and M. Théry. 2015. Mate preference, species
recognition and multimodal communication in heterogeneous environments. Evol. Ecol.
29:217–227.
Seddon, N., C. A. Botero, J. A. Tobias, P. O. Dunn, H. E. A. MacGregor, D. R. Rubenstein, J. A.
C. Uy, J. T. Weir, L. A. Whittingham, and R. J. Safran. 2013. Sexual selection accelerates
signal evolution during speciation in birds. Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 280:20131065.
Servedio, M. R. 2000. Reinforcement and the genetics of nonrandom mating. Evolution (N. Y).
54:21–29.
Servedio, M. R., and M. A. Noor. 2003. The role of reinforcement in speciation: Theory and
data. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 34:339–364.
Skutch, A. F. 1966. A breeding bird census and nesting success in Central America. Ibis (Lond.
1859). 108:1–16.
Soler, J. J., J. Moreno, J. M. Avilés, and A. P. Møller. 2005. Blue and green egg-color intensity
is associated with parental effort and mating system in passerines: support for the sexual
selection hypothesis. Evolution (N. Y). 59:636–644.
Swynnerton, C. F. M. 1916. On the Coloration of the Mouths and Eggs of Birds: On the
Coloration of Eggs. Ibis (Lond. 1859). 58:529–606.
Uy, J. A. C., R. G. Moyle, and C. E. Filardi. 2008. Plumage and song differences mediate species
recognition between incipient flycatcher species of the Solomon Islands. Evolution (N. Y).
63:153–164.
Uy, J. A. C., R. G. Moyle, C. E. Filardi, and Z. A. Cheviron. 2009. Difference in Plumage Color
Used in Species Recognition between Incipient Species Is Linked to a Single Amino Acid
Substitution in the Melanocortin-1 Receptor. Am. Nat. 174:244–254.
Wang, S., and M. B. Sokolowski. 2017. Aggressive behaviours, food deprivation and the
foraging gene. R. Soc. open Sci. 4:170042.
Weeks, S. . 1973. The behavior of the red-winged tinamou (Rhynchotus rufescens). Zoologica
58:13–40.
Williams, G. C. 1957. Pleiotropy, Natural Selection, and the Evolution of Senescence. Evolution

(N. Y). 11:398–411.
372
373

374   **Supplementary information**

375
376   **Figure S1 Scatterplots showing correlations among the four song variables**.