Resolving spatial complexities of hybridization in the context of the gray zone of speciation in North American ratsnakes (*Pantherophis obsoletus* complex)

Frank T. Burbrink[1*]

Marcelo Gehara[1,2]

Edward A. Myers[1,3]

[1]Department of Herpetology, The American Museum of Natural History, Central Park West and 79th Street, New York, NY 10024 USA

[2]Department of Biological Sciences, Rutgers University Newark, 195 University Ave, Newark, NJ 07102

[3]Department of Vertebrate Zoology, National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, DC, USA

*Corresponding author – fburbrink@amnh.org

Author contributions: FTB and EAM contributed to data collection, all authors contributed to analyses, FTB wrote the initial draft, and all authors edited subsequent versions.

Abstract:

Inferring the history of divergence between species in a framework that permits the presence of gene flow has been crucial for characterizing the gray zone of speciation, which is the period of time where lineages have diverged but have not yet achieved strict reproductive isolation. However, estimates of both divergence times and rates gene flow often ignore spatial information, for example the formation and shape of hybrid zones. Using population genomic data from the eastern ratsnake complex (*Pantherophis obsoletus*), we infer phylogeographic groups, gene flow, changes in demography, the timing of divergence, and hybrid zone widths. We examine the spatial context of diversification by linking migration and timing of divergence to the location and widths of hybrid zones. Artificial neural network approaches are applied to understand how landscape features and past climate have influenced population genetic structure among these lineages prior to hybridization. Rates of migration between lineages are associated with the width and shape of hybrid zones. Timing of divergence is not related to migration rate across species pairs and is therefore a poor proxy for inferring position in the gray zone. However, timing of divergence is related to the number of loci weakly introgressing through hybrid zones.

Key Words: Eastern Nearctic, migration, isolation, neural networks, reproductive isolation, cline, hybrid zone

Wide-ranging species complexes that cross numerous biogeographic barriers provide opportunities to better understand how changing landscapes affect diversification, gene flow, demography, and the formation of hybrid zones. Lineages within species complexes ranging

across heterogeneous landscapes are likely at different stages of the speciation process. These

differences may reflect how specific environmental and biogeographic barriers have uniquely

altered changes in gene flow and other demographic processes in a particular complex (Myers et

al. 2020). Even at the same barrier within related groups of organisms, the timing of divergence

and degree of gene flow can be species specific and dependent on when they encountered the

barrier (Riddle 2016; Myers et al. 2019b). Alternatively, generalist species not as constrained to

specific habitats may not show a correlation between genetic variation and landscape features

(Joseph and Wilke 2007; Makowsky et al. 2009; Lourenço et al. 2017).

Lineage divergence can be placed in the context of the gray zone of speciation, which

defines the range of time where speciation proceeds from early population differentiation with

unfettered gene flow to nearly reproductive isolation defined by low rates of gene flow (de

Queiroz 2007; Hewitt 2008; Roux et al. 2016; Jackson et al. 2017). The ability to delimit species

therefore may be correlated with their position in the gray zone, which has previously been

assessed by relating measures of genetic isolation and migration (the genealogical divergence

index; GDI) with species-delimitation probabilities (Roux et al. 2016; Leaché et al. 2019).

Moreover, the position within the gray zone could be simply predicted by the age of lineage

formation relative to population size if the evolution of Dobzhansky-Muller incompatibilities

via genetic drift alone occurred after divergence (Orr 1995; Gavrilets 2004; Singhal and Moritz

2013). Deviations from a negative correlation between rates of gene flow and age of divergence

could occur where increased gene flow between the oldest divergences in a group may cause

lineages to rapidly collapse, such as in the case where physical barriers to gene flow disappear.

On the other hand, strong selection may prevent young lineages from exchanging alleles at

particular loci, shortening the time in the gray zone (Mayr 1963; Barton 2010; Feder et al. 2012;

Roux et al. 2016; Edwards et al. 2020). Therefore, finding a threshold that can determine if two

species are unique given only divergence times may fail where rates of gene flow between

lineages drastically change over time and space (Gourbière and Mallet 2010; Nosil et al. 2017).

86   Understanding how divergence has occurred over the landscape in the context of hybrid

zones should provide a better understanding of the location of diverging lineages in the gray

zone. As first point of inquiry, examining gene flow in space determines if lineages were

generated via isolation and migration or are simply artificially partitioned groups with

continuous gene flow over the landscape defined by isolation by distance (IBD; Wright 1943;

Frantz et al. 2010; Bradburd et al. 2018). Barring the latter, if species pairs rapidly adapt to

unique habitats across their distribution, then age of divergence and degree of gene flow may be

unrelated relative to neutral processes when compared across taxa (Nosil and Crespi 2006;

Agrawal et al. 2011; Nosil 2012; Karrenberg et al. 2019). Therefore, divergence over landscape

can show how selection at a barrier can be discordant from the timing of origin of the lineages

(Barton and Hewitt 1985; Harrison 1993; Jiggins and Mallet 2000; Gay et al. 2008; Seehausen et

al. 2014; Stankowski et al. 2017).

98   To understand population divergence many studies use coalescent-derived, isolation-

migration models (Hey and Nielsen 2004; Hey 2010) to estimate gene flow throughout time,

reflecting position in the gray zone of speciation. These coalescent models have been used to

detect unique species (Rannala and Yang 2020), however, they lack any spatial component

necessary to understand the underlying geographic and environmental processes influencing

contemporary migration and degree of reproductive isolation reflected within any particular

locus. Coalescent estimates for understanding gene flow, timing, and species delimitation are

also affected by geographic sampling and connectivity among populations (Pante et al. 2015;

Coates et al. 2018; Mason et al. 2020). Studying this connectivity can determine if hybridization

among lineages are enhancing or reducing reproductive isolation (Abbott et al. 2013) and can

reveal if contemporary gene flow is restricted to a few loci (genic species) or most of the genome

(biological species; Nosil and Feder 2013). Therefore, studying hybrid zones should enhance

traditional coalescent estimators of divergence by determining: 1) the location and size where

lineages meet and migration occurs, 2) how genes respond to selection across these zones, 3) the

degree of contemporary reproductive isolation, and 4) if parental lineages exist in unique

habitats.

To understand the factors shaping reproductive isolation in a species complex, we ask

whether divergence time predicts rates of gene flow or cline width across space in the North

American ratsnakes (*Pantherophis obsoletus* complex). This complex is a wide-ranging group of

four species found throughout the forested regions of the Eastern Nearctic and nearby

Chihuahuan Desert that have diverged at three unique biogeographic barriers. The primary

divergence in this complex occurred at the Mississippi River, which has consistently been

identified as one of the main biogeographic barriers in the ENA (Robison 1986; Burbrink et al.

2000; Soltis et al. 2006; Brandley et al. 2010; Zellmer et al. 2012; Myers et al. 2020). Further

east, the Appalachian Mountains and Apalachicola/Chattahoochee River System (AARS) have

noted barrier effects in other organisms and likely contributed to the divergence between *P.*

alleghaniensis and *P. spiloides* (Walker and Avise 1998; Burbrink et al. 2000; Soltis et al. 2006).

West of the Mississippi River, divergences occurred at the transition between temperate forests

to the western edge of the Edwards Plateau into the Chihuahuan Desert and isolated the species

P. obsoletus and *P. bairdi* (Fig.1; Lawson and Lieb 1990; Burbrink et al. 2000; Burbrink 2001).

Since the Pliocene, the ENA has experienced numerous climate change events associated with

glacial cycles that forced species into refugia and compressed populations; upon climate

amelioration populations expanded into formerly glaciated areas (Hewitt 2000; Bintanja and van

de Wal 2008; Burbrink et al. 2016). Using dense population sampling and genomic-scale data,

we combine isolation-migration estimates with spatial information to understand species

divergence in the context of geographic distance, contemporary and historical environments, and

biogeographic boundaries. We examine how migration rates and divergence dates relate to the

widths of hybrid zones at biogeographic boundaries and investigate demographic changes

through time to understand if population expansion occurs among all lineages as predicted given

glacial cycling. Addressing these questions provides an integrated view of phylogeographic

history over a physically and historically complex landscape and yields a clearer understanding

of speciation processes and delimitation in the gray zone.

Methods

Dataset

We sampled 288 individuals liberally covering the range of all species within the

Pantherophis obsoletus complex (Fig.1; Dryad XXX). DNA was extracted from all samples

using Qiagen DNeasy Blood & Tissue Kits and samples were screened for quality using broad-

range Qubit Assays. We used services from RAPiD Genomics (https://www.rapid-

genomics.com/services/) to generate 5472 baits and to sequence 5060 conserved elements

(UCEs) loci following the protocols from (Faircloth et al. 2012) and (Sun et al. 2014). These

markers have been used to address phylogeographic/population genetic and deeper phylogenetic

questions (Myers et al. 2019a; Younger et al. 2019). We mapped UCE reads to a Chromium 10x

Pantherophis spiloides genome (in prep), removed loci containing >50% missing samples, and

removed individual specimens missing >30% of all alignments (details on the assembly of UCE

loci are available in Supporting Information Material 1). We produced both phased locus

datasets, used in our coalescent estimators, and single SNPs/locus for all other analyses. We

filtered the unlinked SNP dataset to remove alleles with a minor allele frequency <0.1 and used

these data for population structuring analyses (Linck and Battey 2019).

Geographic groupings

We estimated population structure by comparing Discriminant Analysis of Principal

Components (DAPC; Jombart et al., 2010) in the R package (R Core Team 2015) adegenet

v2.1.2 (Jombart 2008). Additionally, we estimated effective migration surfaces (EEMS; Petkova

et al., 2016) three times with different starting seeds to insure consistency. This method models

effective migration rates over geography to represent regions where migration is low in cases

where genetic dissimilarity increases rapidly (details on these population grouping methods and

other methods used for assessing structure are available in Supporting Information Material 1).

Isolation, migration, and historical demography

We generated a coalescent-based species tree with SNAPP v1.3.0 (Bryant et al. 2012) to

test species limits and understand relationships among the four groups identified from clustering

analyses. Because generating a tree in SNAPP using all individuals was computationally

intractable, we used four individuals per taxon that were sampled from different regions of the

taxon's distribution. We estimated SNAPP trees using BEAST v2.5.2 (Bouckaert et al. 2014;

details on parameter setting for SNAPP are available in Supporting Information Material 1). We

assessed four alternative species delimitation models including four taxa, three taxa (collapsing

P. bairdi/P. obsoletus or *P. alleghaniensis/P. spiloides*), and two taxa (collapsing *P. bairdi/P.*

obsoletus and *P.alleghaniensis/P. spiloides).*

Using the four inferred lineages, we examined which demographic models of species

divergence best described the origins of these groups given divergence time, historical

demographic change, and migration between spatially adjacent taxa. We tested 2,300 candidate

isolation-migration models including all possible topologies with or without migration between

all spatially adjacent pairs using the program PHRAPL (Jackson et al. 2017) implemented in R.

To further test that four genetic lineages exist, we ran pairwise comparisons between the best

selected model and models of three populations where sister species were collapsed into a single

entity; four *Pantherophis* species against one model where *P. obsoletus* and *P. bairdi* were

collapsed, and another where *P. spiloides* and *P. alleghaniensis* were collapsed (details on

PHRAPL runs are available in Supporting Information Material 1).

To estimate gene flow, timing of divergence, and demographic change, we used

PipeMaster (Gehara et al., 2017; Gehara et al. in review) to simulate genetic data and perform

approximate Bayesian computation (ABC) and supervised machine-learning. Here we used the

best model selected in the PHRAPL analysis as a template (same topology and migration

parameters) to generate three competing models: (i) an isolation migration model with constant

population size for each lineage and constant migration, (ii) demographic change along each

lineage and constant migration through time and demographic change, and (iii) population size

change with migration occurring after the Last Glacial Maximum. We simulated 100,000 data

sets of 54 summary statistics and performed ABC rejection with 0.01 tolerance level to select the

best of these three models (Table S1). We then took the selected model and performed rejection

using a 0.1 tolerance level with a neural network regression using a single layer and 20 nodes to

estimate the model parameters. We also performed this without hybrid individuals (admixture

proportions between 0.5-0.7) to explore how including these samples may change estimates of

divergence timing, demographic change, timing of demographic change, and migration within

these lineages.

Spatial population genetics

We used redundancy analyses (RDA; Legendre et al. 2011; Diniz-Filho et al. 2013) and

artificial neural networks (ANN; Lek and Guégan 1999; Legendre and Fortin 2010; Legendre et

al. 2011) to understand how contemporary and historical aspects of the landscape and climate

generated genetic diversity. To set up our data for these analyses, we used as our response

variable Euclidian genetic distance and transformations of this (see below) among all individuals

in R. For predictor variables, we used 1) geographic distances measured as pairwise great-circle

distances among all points to account for isolation-by-distance using the R package fossil

(Vavrek 2020), 2) binary categorization of isolation east and west of the Mississippi River, 3)

elevation, and 4) bioclimatic variables at 2.5 mins representing current climate, Last Glacial

Maximum (LGM, 21kya), Last interglacial (LIG, 130 kya), and Pleistocene Marine Isotope

Stage 19 (MS19, 787 kya) all obtained from the PaleoClim database (Brown et al. 2018). We

also extracted level II ecoregions for all individuals. Ecoregion variables delineate unique

ecological areas and are well characterized across North America (Bailey 1995). For the

bioclimatic data and elevation, we extracted parameter values given the latitude and longitude for

each individual sample using the R package raster (Hijmans et al. 2014). To reduce

dimensionality of the bioclimatic variables for each type (current, LGM, etc.), we eliminated

correlated variables (>0.90) and transformed remaining variables using centered principal

components analyses in R. We transformed categorical ecoregion data into dummy variables and

reduced dimensionality using logistic PCA for binary variables (Landgraf and Lee 2015). To

account for the effect of geographic distances on genetic structure, we transformed spatial

distance between all samples using principal coordinates neighbor matrices (PCNM) in the R

package vegan (Dixon 2003). This method allowed us to account for multiple spatial structures

(neighborhoods) on heterogenous ecological structures and barriers, which better clarified non-

spatial effects on genetic structure (Borcard and Legendre 2002).

We first used RDA, asymmetric canonical analysis, to determine the significance for each

spatial predictor axis (Legendre et al. 2011) on genetic structure (McGaughran et al. 2014;

Noguerales et al. 2016). We then used the reduced set of significant spatial axes to examine their

effect with environmental and barrier variables on genetic structure using RDA and ANN (see

Supporting Information Material 1 for details). Machine learning methods, such ANN, can infer

non-linear interactions among many predictor variables, regardless of the distribution or variable

type and can generate a range of models of varying complexity (Lek et al. 1996; Zhang 2010;

Libbrecht and Noble 2015; Sheehan et al. 2016). We transformed Euclidian genetic distances

into principal coordinates (PCoA; (Gower 1966) in adegenet (Jombart 2008) to produce

uncorrelated orthogonal axes to summarize genetic variation and assessed accuracy and variable

importance on the first 10 PCoA axes. We used regression-based ANN to determine which

variables predict genetic distances and rank those with the highest model importance. To conduct

the ANN regressions we used the R package *caret* (Kuhn 2008) and partitioned the data into the

standard 70% training and 30% test sets (Lek et al. 1996; Zhang 2010; Burbrink et al. 2020).

This analysis was run using 1,000 maximum iterations to ensure convergence. We resampled the

data using the default 25 bootstrap replicates to reach convergence over the following

parameters: weight decay, root mean squared error, r^2, and mean absolute error. Accuracy was

compared to an ANN run with random shuffling of the response variable. We also compared

results from our ANN analysis to those using redundancy analyses (RDA, see Supporting

Information Material 1 for details).

Hybrid-zone dynamics

Using the program HZAR v.2-9 (Derryberry et al. 2014) we used admixture proportions

to determine if cline widths differ among adjacent species. We used TESS3r to estimate

admixture for each species pair using SNPs and geographic data (see Supporting Information

Material 1; Caye et al. 2018). As required by HZAR, we reduced 2-dimensional space (latitude

and longitude) into 1-dimensional distance from the hybrid zone. We first determined the

location of the hybrid zone by mapping admixed individuals (0.5-0.6 admixture), calculating all

sample distances to the hybrid zone, and then fixing a sign to these distances where 0 was the

hybrid zone, positive distances trended towards one parental taxon, and negative distances

trended towards the other. Using the Gaussian cline model, we estimated the center and width of

the cline and determined if these sigmoidal distributions have significant tails by fitting the

following models: 1) no tails, 2) right tail only, 3) left tail only, 4) mirrored tails, and 5) both

tails estimated independently (see Derryberry et al. 2014). We fit these models to our data using

AICc and ran the MCMC chains for 5×10^6 generations, thinned by 5×10^3 generations, and

estimated stationarity using ESS >200 in the R package CODA (Plummer et al. 2006).

To examine the width of these clines over environmental space, we transformed

environmental space to a single dimension and measured distance relative to the hybrid zone. We

filtered correlated bioclim data (>0.90), reduced dimensionality using PCA, estimated absolute

environmental distance between all individual points and hybrid zones, and provided a positive

or negative sign depending on the side of the hybrid zone. We ran HZAR described above for

spatial distance data.

To examine the width of allelic clines through hybrid zones relative to overall admixture,

we also estimated cline widths for each locus over geographic and environmental distance. Here

we used allele frequencies for each individual and applied the same distances as described above

using HZAR. To better understand the effects of selection over geographic space for each

species-pair comparison (see Stankowski et al. 2017), we determined which loci were fixed for

each parental taxa (>0.80) in the tails of the cline and also showed sharp clines (reduced widths).

The difference in the frequency of fixation (ΔP) between each tail of the cline (sampling 5% of

each most distant tail) was estimated and widths were compared to neutral expectations of size

(see below).

Using equations from Barton and Gale (1993) and applied in Bailey et al. (2015) we

evaluated selection against hybridization for each cline. With estimates of the root mean squared

(RMS) maximum lifetime dispersal (σ) for ratsnakes, we predicted the width of the cline under

neutrality over a range of generation times (T) since the origin of each sister pair and group using

the equation: $w = 2.51\sigma\sqrt{T}$. Unfortunately RMS of dispersal is unknown for ratsnakes, but we

bound this from 1.02 to 4.03 km given mean and maximum distances of nesting sites to

hibernaculum (Blouin-Demers and Weatherhead 2002). The maximum width was likely an

underestimate of lifetime dispersal, particularly in areas in the southern United States where

ratsnakes are not constrained by hibernacula.

All scripts, genetic, and spatial data are available on Dryad XX.

Results

Data and population genetic structure

295   After filtering loci for presence in 70% or more individuals, we generated 2,491 UCE

296   loci. For all downstream analyses we randomly sampled one SNP per locus yielding a total of

297   846 SNPs for 238 individuals for an average of 13.96% missing data.

298   Both EEMS and DAPC found population structure that generally matched the geographic

ranges of *P. alleghaniensis*, *P. spiloides, P. obsoletus*, and *P. bairdi* (Fig. 1 and Fig. S1;

Burbrink, 2001). All three EEMS generated similar acceptance proportions for all proposal types

(12-51%). Total DAPC assignment probabilities without a priori species groupings were 0.975

(*P. bairdi* = 1.0, *P. obsoletus* = 0.96; *P. spiloides* = 1.0, and *P. alleghaniensis* = 0.97). Similarly,

all three EEMS replicates showed low migration at the Mississippi River (MR) and the area

separating the *P. bairdi* and *P. obsoletus* in west Texas. East of the MR, estimated low migration

occurred near the Appalachian Mountains, though this area is a complex mixture of isolation and

gene flow (Fig. 1).

307   These estimates of population structure all showed *P. alleghaniensis* as occurring mostly

in the Florida Peninsula and north along the east coast to Virginia/Delaware, *P. spiloides* was

found from western Florida to the Mississippi River up through the Midwest and east to the

northeastern US, *P. obsoletus* was found west of the Mississippi River in the forested regions of

the Midwest, and *P. bairdi* was distributed in the Chihuahuan Desert of west Texas (Fig. 1).

Isolation-migration processes

Our SNAPP analyses produced a phylogeny with a root separating the taxa east and west

of the Mississippi River with a sister relationship between *P. bairdi* and *P. obsoletus* and then *P.*

spiloides and *P. alleghaniensis* (Fig. 2), consistent with Burbrink et al. (2000). Bayes factors

(BF) showed the four-taxon model as decisively superior to the three-taxon (BF =35.40) and

two-taxon model (BF=2022.46).

Using those four lineages we filtered models of divergence using PHRAPL. A model

delimiting all four taxa, incorporating migration between spatially adjacent lineages was

preferred with the same topology as found using SNAPP. ΔAIC between the best ranked model

and next model was > 20, suggesting high confidence in model selection (Table S2).

The demographic model estimated from PipeMaster that incorporated historical

population size change and constant migration (IMD) best fit the data (posterior probability 1.0;

see PCA plots in Fig. S2; Fig. 2). Median migration rates were highest between eastern groups

(*P. alleghaniensis* to *P. spiloides* = 2.79 and *P. spiloides* to *P. alleghaniensis* = 3.79

individuals/generation), lower in the central groups across the Mississippi River (*P. spiloides* to

P. obsoletus = 1.95 and *P. obsoletus* to *P. spiloides* = 1.28 individuals/generation), and lowest in

western groups (*P. bairdi* to *P. obsoletus*= 0.55 and *P. obsoletus* to *P. bairdi* = 0.65

individuals/generations; Table 1 & Fig. 3). Divergence occurred earliest in the central lineages at

the Mississippi River at 3.181 My (95% quantile =1.65 to 5.02 My), then the eastern lineages at

1.95 My (95% quantile = 0.674 to 2.95 My) and western lineages at 1.10 My (95% quantile

0.407 to 2.62 My; Table 1 & Fig. 3). Divergence dates and average rates of migration were

uncorrelated (ρ=0.264, *P*=0.83, n=3). For all taxa we inferred population expansion from

ancestral N_e sizes ranging from 5,200 to 5,600 to modern sizes at 138,000 to 281,000 (Fig. 3).

Median expansion times were similar for all taxa (0.230-0.260 Ky) with lower 95% quantiles

always occurring in the Pleistocene (0.024-0.38 Ky; Fig S3). Posterior distributions for all

parameters were different from the uniform priors, though wide distributions of several

parameters suggested some uncertainty in these estimates (Fig. 3). Similarly, rerunning

PipeMaster without heavily admixed individuals resulted in similar predictions but with lower

estimates of migration for eastern and central lineages (Fig. S3).

Spatial population genetics and hybrid zones

We used ANN to determine what features of the landscape and environmental layers

through time best predict genetic structure (Fig.4). Estimates of accuracy using ANN were high

(>90%) for the first PCoA axis of genetic distance and declined rapidly thereafter approaching

random shuffling of the response variable by axis 4-7 (Fig. 4). Most genetic structure was

predicted by the Mississippi River showing 100% variable importance, when examining

population structure across all four species. Spatial components alone also played a role in

structuring these data for all species-pair comparisons, although they were partialed out in RDA

analyses showing the significant effect of environmental and biogeographic variables (see

Supporting Information Material 1). For those lineages east of the Mississippi River, population

structure was predicted by climate at the Last interglacial and current environment for the first

PCoA axis. For those lineages west of the Mississippi River, elevation, Last Glacial Maximum

and eceoregions were important for structuring these lineages in the first PCoA axis. We note

that while accuracy decreased on the 2nd and 3rd PCoA, other environmental variables still

showed importance.

Using TESS admixture estimates and one-dimensional spatial distances, HZAR showed

support for a model with no tails for all lineage-pair comparisons (eastern ΔAIC =-4 .08 – -8.34;

central ΔAIC = -3.55 – -8.17; western ΔAIC = -2.12 – -8.48; Fig. 5, Table 1). Median width of

clines decreased from the eastern lineages (256 km), to central (147 km) to the western lineages

(21 km). Using environmental distances, both the eastern (ΔAIC = -4.39 – -9.45) and central

lineages (ΔAIC = -4.32– -346.38) showed support for a model with no tails for both, whereas the

western lineages supported a left-tailed model (ΔAIC = -6.12 – -11.55). As a percentage of the

entire environmental distance for a species-pair comparison, the environmental cline width

decreased from the central (5.0%), eastern (4.0%), and western lineages (2.1%; Table 1).

Percentages of widths per species-pair comparison were lower as a measure of total

environmental distance than spatial distance.

We examined cline widths by locus for each species pair (Fig.6). For each comparison a

large number of loci were uninformative about cline widths, due to a lack of fixed differences

among parental taxa. However, as a measure of expected cline width per locus under neutrality

from the last glacial maximum, we showed that widths should be much larger (~633-733 km)

than found using admixture coefficients and across many loci (Fig. S5). We estimated that 128

loci between the central lineages, 8 between the eastern lineages, and 4 between the western

lineages were both fixed in the tails of a cline for each parental taxon(ΔP>0.80) and presented

cline widths lower than neutral expectations,(Fig. 6). Median cline centers for all loci, where the

direction of selection on an allele was expected to change, was close to zero, the predicted center

based on admixture proportions, for the central and western lineages, -8.32 and 4.95 km,

respectively. However, center estimates ranged from -28.35 to 1766 for the eastern lineages,

though a large number of loci (n=66) estimated the center closest to zero (ranging 20 km on each

side; Fig. 6).

When using a single SNP per locus we showed that 30% of loci from central lineages*,

10.9% of loci for western lineages, and only 1.9% of loci for eastern lineages attained an F_{st}

>0.35. Given demographic histories between comparisons, this threshold for F_{st} was generally

considered extreme population disconnection beyond which advantageous loci will be exchanged

between populations (Wright 1978; Frankham et al. 2010).

Discussion

Grey Zone Dynamics

To understand the factors shaping reproductive isolation in a species complex, we show

that divergence time does not predict rates of migration or cline width across space in eastern

ratsnakes. While reproductive isolation should increase with time (Orr 1995; Singhal and Moritz

2013), our results indicate that overall genomic estimates of gene flow may be inadequate to

assess reproductive isolation with time. In contrast, the number of loci showing steep cline shifts

in contact zones is related to timing of divergence. Disconnection between episodes of repeated

secondary contact through time differing among species-pair comparisons or variable strength of

ecological divergence may account for the dissociation between time and overall migration rate.

Using multiple methods to examine genetic structure and migration over space and

accounting for isolation by distance, we show that the eastern ratsnakes are composed of four

divergent lineages, with *P. alleghaniensis* and *P. spiloides* meeting in the southeastern US at the

intersection of subtropical and temperate areas, *P. spiloides* and *P. obsoletus* separated at the

Mississippi River, and *P. obsoletus* and *P. bairdi* meeting at the connection on the forested and

rocky habitats on the western edge of the Edwards Plateau. The western lineages (*P. obsoletus*,

P. bairdi) have low migration rates, a cline equivalent to only 1.6% of the parental range, large

fixation indexes ($F_{st} > 0.35$) in 10.9% of loci, and likely geographic selection in only 4 loci. This

is in comparison with central lineages (*P. obsoletus, P. spiloides*) showing more migration, a

cline occupying 7.2% of the parental ranges, but with 35% of loci showing high F_{st}, and

geographic selection in 128 loci. Finally, eastern lineages (*P. alleghanienis, P. spiloides*) have

the highest rate of migration, with only 1.9% of loci showing high fixation, and only 8 loci

revealing geographic selection (Figs. 3 & 6). The oldest species-pair at the Mississippi River

have moderate migration/generation but yet have the highest number of loci showing steep clines

at the hybrid zones. Similar to other studies where many loci showing differential introgression

or variance in cline slope (Nosil et al. 2009; Carneiro et al. 2013; Stankowski et al. 2019), our

results lend support that the degree of reproductive isolation may be defined at the level of the

genes and not the genome (Macholán et al. 2011; Harrison 2012). Therefore, it is likely that

these species-pairs of ratsnakes are traversing different phases of reproductive isolation, from the

genic to genomic, and therefore overall coalescent estimates of migration alone may not useful

proxies for understanding position in the gray zone.

Hybrid zone dynamics help to understand the interactions between pairs of taxa as

characteristics of the hybrid zone reveal whether there is selection against hybrids (tension

zones), selection for hybrids (bounded superiority), or ecological gradients with reduced fitness.

They also reveal whether selection is endogenous (genomic) and/or exogenous (environmental;

Barton and Hewitt 1985; Barton and Gale 1993). Our results that combine estimates of when and

how divergence occurred with contemporary dynamics of hybrid zones provide a comprehensive

view of how lineage structure is maintained through time. Demographic models for ratsnakes

indicate that some migration at the Mississippi River and among all species pairs occurred during

the Pleistocene suggesting primary or secondary contact existed through major climate change

cycles. Population expansion in all lineages occurred at a minimum before the LGM, likely

indicating ancient contact and formation of these hybrid zones. Given this age and assuming

selective neutrality, we demonstrate that even after the last glacial maximum (LGM) that these

hybrid zones should be much larger, in most cases exceeding the ranges of parental taxa (Fig.

S5). The widths of the current hybrid zones have likely been maintained or continuously

reformed through time after reemerging from glacial refugia, as discussed for other temperate

taxa (Hewitt 1996, 2011). Despite constant connectivity, the historical and geographic identity of

the parental taxa are preserved. While there is likely some selection against hybrids as estimated

from hybrid zone width and dispersal, depending on species-pair comparison, it is possible that

other factors may be constraining these hybrid zones, for example fitness changes along an

ecological gradient or isolation by environment (Case and Taper 2000; Case et al. 2005;

McEntee et al. 2018). For all groups, our ANN show that either past or current environmental

differences or barriers to dispersal are important for structuring overall genetic differences

among species pairs. Among contemporary lineages and analyses, we show that admixture clines

change sharply at environmental transitions relative to just spatial distances (Fig. 5), which

suggests that fitness is likely changing across these ecological areas. Similarly, we find several

loci in each species-pair comparison that show similar or smaller cline shifts in these areas found

for overall admixture predictions. Unless these loci represent the outcomes of isolation by

distance and fixation in each ends of the cline, there is likely some selection on these genes.

Therefore, barriers that isolated these lineages initially, along with combinations of current and

past environmental changes across the ranges of all these species pairs, likely helped form and

maintain these hybrid zones.

Influence of barriers and environment on population structure

These ratsnake lineages are structured by a complex of physical barriers, historical

climate profiles, and geographic distance. Machine learning approaches show that the

Mississippi River has served as a strong barrier for isolating lineages of ratsnakes, forming

groups east and west of this river during the late Pleistocene/Pliocene (Figs 1&3,4, Table 1).

These results are consistent with previous mtDNA and morphological conclusions (Burbrink,

2001; Burbrink et al., 2000). The Mississippi River has served as a strong barrier to gene flow

given evidence from historical estimates of increased drainage (Cox et al. 2014) and numerous

unrelated organisms show genetic disconnection across the river (Robison 1986; Burbrink 2002;

Soltis et al. 2006; Burbrink et al. 2008; Pyron and Burbrink 2009; Brandley et al. 2010; Satler

and Carstens 2017; Myers et al. 2020). Hybridization, while low (1-2 individuals/generation,

Fig.3), does occur in a zone (~100km) east of the Mississippi River between the central lineages

(*P. obsoletus* and *P. spiloides*). Furthermore, genetic structure is also predicted by geographic

distance and mid-Pleistocene climate change (787kya).

The Mississippi River is responsible for the earliest divergence in this complex but other

geographic features are also important. East of the Mississippi River, divergence between *P.*

alleghaniensis and *P. spiloides* was influenced by climate at the last interglacial, current climate,

and geographic distance (Fig 4). For these taxa, divergence occurred at the Appalachian

Mountains and Apalachicola/Chattahoochee River System. *Pantherophis alleghaniensis* may

have diverged in an isolated Florida, due to sea level changes during interglacials, as suggested

by our ANN, and subsequently expanded north and west. This isolation is reflected by the unique

morphology there showing a high concentration of the yellow, striped color patterns in the range

of *P. alleghaniensis* in Florida and parts of the southeastern coast of the US (Schultz 1996;

Burbrink 2001). This suture zone between the Florida peninsula and the continental US has been

found for many taxa (Remington 1968; Swenson and Howard 2005; Burbrink et al. 2008). While

these two forms can be delimited with genetic data and occupy distinctly different geographic

regions, reproductive isolation may not be complete. Although, individual loci likely show

varying levels of reproductive isolation. Niches are also different between these taxa; *P.*

alleghaniensis is typically found in the Florida peninsula and coastal plains environments (Bailey

1995; Burbrink 2001), whereas *P. spiloides* is found throughout the remainder of the forested

habitats east of the Mississippi River including the ecoregions defined as interior river valleys

and hills, interior plateau, Appalachian habitats, southeastern and southcentral plains, and

Mississippi River valley. Uncertainty in the identity of taxa using morphology where these taxa

meet is likely due to extensive gene flow in hybrid zones at barriers following postglacial range

expansion. Finer-scale testing is necessary to tease apart the effects of these river systems,

ancient embayments, and connections to uplifted areas. Although the timing of divergence

predates the last interglacial, it is possible that repeated 100,000 year glacial cycles isolated these

taxa into refugia, as has been suggested previously for ratsnakes and other organisms (Fig.3;

Waltari et al. 2007; Noss et al. 2015).

Divergence between *P. bairdi* and *P. obsoletus* occurred in the western edge of the

Edwards Plateau, with the former extending westward into xeric forested or Chihuahuan desert

scrub associated with rocky habitats, whereas the latter extends east into Texas, preferring

forested habitats, (Lawson and Lieb 1990; Werler and Dixon 2000). Population genetic structure

between these taxa is associated with elevation, the last glacial maximum, ecoregion differences,

and geographic distance (Fig. 4). Dates of origin of these taxa are within the mid-Pleistocene,

suggesting that past climate played a strong role in promoting population divergence. During this

period, the Chihuahuan Desert was much drier relative to the late-Pleistocene (Graham and Mead

1987; Metcalfe et al. 2002; Metcalfe 2006) and this increased aridity could have driven

ecological divergence between this species pair. While divergence time is not the oldest here,

migration rates are lowest, and the hybrid zone is narrow. Previous research shows limited

hybridization with backcrosses between these taxa occurring in a narrow region of the

southwestern Edwards Plateau (Lawson and Lieb 1990; Vandewege et al. 2012).

Despite each lineage occupying uniquely different habitats, population responses to

Pleistocene climate change were similar (Fig. 3). Given the divergence time for each group, N_e

has expanded synchronously by 50 times since the Pleistocene. These estimates are consistent

with other predictions in the ENA, where 75% of the tested vertebrates show population size

expansion and 75% of tested snakes show synchronous expansion of N_e, likely coinciding with

the retreat of glaciers at various times in the Pleistocene or during the Holocene (Bintanja and

van de Wal 2008; Burbrink et al. 2016). However, *Pantherophis bairdi* has a range only in a

small area of the west Texas and isolated populations in northeastern Mexico, where habitats

may have been indirectly affected by glacial cycles.

Taxonomy and delimitation in the genomic age

Delimiting species using genetic data, while useful, has proved controversial (Bauer et al.

2011; Sukumaran and Knowles 2017; Leaché et al. 2019). In particular, most coalescent

delimitation methods fail to account for gene flow (but see Flouris et al. 2019), do not consider

spatial information, and place individuals into predefined groups prior to testing (O'Meara

2010). These methods all assume species diverge at an evolutionary time scale where mutations

accumulate through drift or selection (Rannala 2015). And while simulations show that a

threshold above one migrating individual/10 generations will cause model-based delimitation

methods to fail at finding two species (Zhang et al. 2011), it is not clear how pulses or

inconsistent migration affect species transitioning through the gray zone. Importantly, Wright

(1931) indicated that up to 1,000 individuals migrating/generation may not prevent populations

from drifting given effective population size and spatial segregation. Also, this does not consider

the effects of selection and recombination producing variable introgression among loci.

Modern thresholds for species delimitation (Jackson et al. 2017; Leaché et al. 2019) use

GDI (>0.7), estimates of species divergence time over population size ($2\tau/\theta>1$), absolute

divergence time (10^4) and maximum migration rates (M=Nm<1), metrics that are all likely

influenced by sampling effort, location of samples sequenced, and detection of hybrids. For

example, if large hybrid zones exist but remain poorly sampled then estimates of migration will

be reduced, GDI will be high, and the probability of MSC estimators will suggest multiple

species. Conversely, if only hybrid zones are sampled then all metrics will predict only a single

species. For all pairs of ratsnakes $2\tau/\theta>1$ and divergence time is greater than 10^4. However,

overall migration rates remain high between adjacent pairs in the eastern lineages. This forces us

to address how we are defining a species in the context of hybrid zones, how we infer

reproductive isolation beyond MSC methods, and how selection is maintaining hybrid zones. For

all lineages of ratsnakes, hybrid zones are smaller than predicted by neutral selection if these

hybrid zones formed in the Pleistocene. However, geographic lineage identity has been

maintained for >133,000 generations in all pairs, regardless of migration. Moreover, where

hybrid zones extend over large areas, gene flow likely varies throughout space and may have

changed over time (Barton and Hewitt 1985; Mallet 2007), particularly in response to glacial

cycles. Thus, identifying and delimiting species in the context of genetic admixture alone may be

difficult without understanding the history of gene flow, and as shown here, specific locus

introgression.

We have demonstrated that these four species, delimited previously using mtDNA and

morphology (Burbrink, 2001; Burbrink et al., 2000) can be recognized as distinct taxa given

methods of spatial grouping and species delimitation, though ranges in the eastern-most lineage

are restricted further south than previously thought. However, migration rates between *P.*

spiloides and *P. alleghaniensis* (Fig. 3) may be high enough that they do not represent

independent evolutionary trajectories (de Queiroz, 2007; Rannala, 2015; Zhang et al., 2011),

though differential introgression among some might suggest that reproductive isolation is

maintained for some loci. Unique niches in the subtropical areas of the southeastern US and

morphology provides some evidence for isolation between these taxa: the striped forms (with

variable ground colors of orange, yellow, green, and gray) are indicative of *P. alleghaniensis*

whereas adults with dark saddle patterns on grey, olive, brown, or black ground colors (or

completely black with no pattern) are found west of Florida and east of the Mississippi River,

throughout the Midwest and up to the northeastern US and Canada represent *P. spiloides*.

However, hybridization north and west of Florida is likely represented by a dulling of this yellow

ground color and mixed patterned individuals (Schultz 1996; see Supporting Information

Material 1 for more information on taxonomy).

Modern genomic tools have advanced our understanding of timing of divergence,

population isolation, lineage connectivity, and the nature of hybrid zones. As we show with the

eastern ratsnakes, we can better comprehend processes of speciation by integrating studies of

hybrid zones to understand changes in admixture and differential introgression with coalescent

estimates of isolation and migration. We also show that timing, rates of gene flow, and

differential introgression at hybrid zones are unique to each species pair, likely traversing

different genic and genomic scales of divergence in the gray zone across changing environments

in the Eastern Nearctic. Future studies should examine clines with more detailed sampling using

whole genomes to connect weakly introgressing loci with traits.

Literature Cited

Abbott, R., D. Albach, S. Ansell, J. W. Arntzen, S. J. E. Baird, N. Bierne, J. Boughman, A.

Brelsford, C. A. Buerkle, R. Buggs, R. K. Butlin, U. Dieckmann, F. Eroukhmanoff, A.

Grill, S. H. Cahan, J. S. Hermansen, G. Hewitt, A. G. Hudson, C. Jiggins, J. Jones, B.

Keller, T. Marczewski, J. Mallet, P. Martinez-Rodriguez, M. Möst, S. Mullen, R. Nichols,

A. W. Nolte, C. Parisod, K. Pfennig, A. M. Rice, M. G. Ritchie, B. Seifert, C. M. Smadja,

R. Stelkens, J. M. Szymura, R. Väinölä, J. B. W. Wolf, and D. Zinner. 2013. Hybridization

and speciation. J. Evol. Biol. 26:229–246.

Agrawal, A. F., J. L. Feder, and P. Nosil. 2011. Ecological divergence and the origins of intrinsic

postmating isolation with gene flow. Int. J. Ecol. 2011:1–15. Hindawi.

Bailey, R. G. 1995. Description of the ecoregions of the United States. 2nd ed. USDA Forest

Service.

Bailey, R. I., M. R. Tesaker, C. N. Trier, and G.-P. Saetre. 2015. Strong selection on male

plumage in a hybrid zone between a hybrid bird species and one of its parents. J. Evol. Biol.

28:1257–1269. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Barton, H. H., and K. Gale. 1993. Genetic analysis of hybrid zones. Pp. 13–45 *in* Hybrid Zones

588   and the Evolutionary Process. Oxford University Press, New York.

589   Barton, N. H. 2010. What role does natural selection play in speciation? Philos. Trans. R. Soc.

590   Lond. B. Biol. Sci. 365:1825–40. The Royal Society.

591   Barton, N. H., and G. M. Hewitt. 1985. Analysis of Hybrid Zones. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.

592   16:113–148. Annual Reviews 4139 El Camino Way, P.O. Box 10139, Palo Alto, CA

593   94303-0139, USA .

594   Bauer, A. M., J. F. Parham, R. M. Brown, B. L. Stuart, L. Grismer, T. J. Papenfuss, W. Böhme,

595   J. M. Savage, S. Carranza, J. L. Grismer, P. Wagner, A. Schmitz, N. B. Ananjeva, and R. F.

596   Inger. 2011. Availability of new Bayesian-delimited gecko names and the importance of

597   character-based species descriptions. Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 278:490. The Royal Society.

598   Bintanja, R., and R. S. W. van de Wal. 2008. North American ice-sheet dynamics and the onset

599   of 100,000-year glacial cycles. Nature 454:869–72. Nature Publishing Group.

600   Blouin-Demers, G., and P. J. Weatherhead. 2002. Implications of movement patterns for gene

601   flow in black rat snakes (*Elaphe obsoleta*). Can. J. Zool. 80:1162–1172. NRC Research

602   Press Ottawa, Canada .

603   Borcard, D., and P. Legendre. 2002. All-scale spatial analysis of ecological data by means of

604   principal coordinates of neighbour matrices. Ecol. Modell. 153:51–68. Elsevier.

605   Bouckaert, R., J. Heled, D. Kühnert, T. Vaughan, C.-H. Wu, D. Xie, M. A. Suchard, A.

606   Rambaut, and A. J. Drummond. 2014. BEAST 2: A software platform for Bayesian

607   evolutionary analysis. PLoS Comput. Biol. 10:e1003537. Public Library of Science.

Bradburd, G. S., G. M. Coop, and P. L. Ralph. 2018. Inferring continuous and discrete

population genetic structure across space. Genetics 210:33–52. Genetics.

Brandley, M. C., T. J. Guiher, R. A. Pyron, C. T. T. Winne, and F. T. Burbrink. 2010. Does

dispersal across an aquatic geographic barrier obscure phylogeographic structure in the

diamond-backed watersnake (*Nerodia rhombifer*)? Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 57:552–560.

Brown, J. L., D. J. Hill, A. M. Dolan, A. C. Carnaval, and A. M. Haywood. 2018. PaleoClim,

high spatial resolution paleoclimate surfaces for global land areas. Sci. Data 5:180254.

Nature Publishing Group.

Bryant, D., R. Bouckaert, J. Felsenstein, N. A. Rosenberg, and A. RoyChoudhury. 2012.

Inferring species trees directly from biallelic genetic markers: bypassing gene trees in a full

coalescent analysis. Mol. Biol. Evol. 29:1917–1932.

Burbrink, F. T. 2002. Phylogeographic analysis of the cornsnake (*Elaphe guttata*) complex as

inferred from maximum likelihood and Bayesian analyses. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 25:465–

476.

Burbrink, F. T. 2001. Systematics of the eastern ratsnake complex (*Elaphe obsoleta*). Herpetol.

Monogr. 1–53.

Burbrink, F. T., Y. L. Chan, E. A. Myers, S. Ruane, B. T. Smith, and M. J. Hickerson. 2016.

Asynchronous demographic responses to Pleistocene climate change in Eastern Nearctic

vertebrates. Ecol. Lett. 19:1457–1467.

Burbrink, F. T., F. Fontanella, R. A. Pyron, T. J. Guiher, C. Jimenez, and R. Alexander Pyron.

2008. Phylogeography across a continent: The evolutionary and demographic history of the

North American racer (Serpentes : Colubridae : *Coluber constrictor*). Mol. Phylogenet.

Evol. 47:274–288.

Burbrink, F. T., F. G. Grazziotin, R. A. Pyron, D. Cundall, S. Donnellan, F. Irish, J. S. Keogh, F.

Kraus, R. W. Murphy, B. Noonan, C. J. Raxworthy, S. Ruane, A. R. Lemmon, E. M.

Lemmon, and H. Zaher. 2020. Interrogating genomic-scale data for Squamata (lizards,

snakes, and amphisbaenians) shows no support for key traditional morphological

relationships. Syst. Biol. 69:502–520.

Burbrink, F. T., R. Lawson, and J. B. Slowinski. 2000. Mitochondrial DNA phylogeography of

the polytypic North American rat snake (*Elaphe obsoleta*): A critique of the subspecies

concept. Evolution (N. Y). 54:2107–2118.

Carneiro, M., S. J. E. Baird, S. Afonso, E. Ramirez, P. Tarroso, H. Teotónio, R. Villafuerte, M.

W. Nachman, and N. Ferrand. 2013. Steep clines within a highly permeable genome across

a hybrid zone between two subspecies of the European rabbit. Mol. Ecol. 22:2511–25. Mol

Ecol.

Case, T. J., R. D. Holt, M. A. McPeek, and T. H. Keitt. 2005. The community context of species'

borders: ecological and evolutionary perspectives. Oikos 108:28–46.

Case, T. J., and M. L. Taper. 2000. Interspecific competition, environmental gradients, gene

flow, and the coevolution of species' borders. Am. Nat. 155:583–605.

Caye, K., F. Jay, O. Michel, and O. François. 2018. Fast inference of individual admixture

coefficients using geographic data. Ann. Appl. Stat. 12:586–608. Institute of Mathematical

Statistics.

Coates, D. J., M. Byrne, and C. Moritz. 2018. Genetic diversity and conservation units: dealing

with the species-population continuum in the age of genomics. Front. Ecol. Evol. 6:165.

Frontiers.

Cox, R. T., D. N. Lumsden, and R. B. Van Arsdale. 2014. Possible relict meanders of the

Pliocene Mississippi River and their implications. J. Geol. 122:609–622.

de Queiroz, K. 2007. Species concepts and species delimitation. Syst. Biol. 56:879–886.

Derryberry, E. P., G. E. Derryberry, J. M. Maley, and R. T. Brumfield. 2014. hzar : hybrid zone

analysis using an R software package. Mol. Ecol. Resour. 14:652–663.

Diniz-Filho, J. A. F., T. N. Soares, J. S. Lima, R. Dobrovolski, V. L. Landeiro, M. P. D. C.

Telles, T. F. Rangel, and L. M. Bini. 2013. Mantel test in population genetics. Genet. Mol.

Biol. 36:475–485.

Dixon, P. 2003. VEGAN, a package of R functions for community ecology. J. Veg. Sci. 14:927–

930. Blackwell Publishing.

Edwards, S., R. Hopkins, and J. Mallet. 2020. Speciation. Pp. 296–318 *in* S. Scheiner and D.

Mindell, eds. The Theory of Evolution. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Faircloth, B. C., J. E. McCormack, N. G. Crawford, M. G. Harvey, R. T. Brumfield, and T. C.

Glenn. 2012. Ultraconserved elements anchor thousands of genetic markers spanning

multiple evolutionary timescales. Syst. Biol. 61:717–726. Narnia.

Feder, J. L., S. P. Egan, and P. Nosil. 2012. The genomics of speciation-with-gene-flow. Trends

Genet. 28:342–350. Elsevier Current Trends.

Flouris, T., X. Jiao, B. Rannala, and Z. Yang. 2019. A Bayesian implementation of the

multispecies coalescent model with introgression for phylogenomic analysis. Mol. Biol.

Evol., doi: 10.1093/molbev/msz296.

Frankham, R., J. D. (Jonathan D. . Ballou, and D. A. (David A. Briscoe. 2010. Introduction to

conservation genetics. Cambridge University Press.

Frantz, A. C., L. C. Pope, T. R. Etherington, G. J. Wilson, and T. Burke. 2010. Using isolation-

by-distance-based approaches to assess the barrier effect of linear landscape elements on

badger (*Meles meles*) dispersal. Mol. Ecol. 19:1663–1674. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

(10.1111).

Gavrilets, S. 2004. Fitness landscapes and the origin of species. Princeton University Press.

Gay, L., P.-A. Crochet, D. A. Bell, and T. Lenormand. 2008. Comparing clines on molecular and

phenotypic traits in hybrid zones: a window on tension zone models. Evolution (N. Y).

62:2789–2806. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Gehara, M., A. A. Garda, F. P. Werneck, E. F. Oliveira, E. M. da Fonseca, F. Camurugi, F. d. M.

Magalhães, F. M. F. M. Lanna, J. W. Sites, R. Marques, R. Silveira-Filho, V. A. São Pedro,

G. R. Colli, G. C. Costa, and F. T. Burbrink. 2017. Estimating synchronous demographic

changes across populations using hABC and its application for a herpetological community

from northeastern Brazil. Mol. Ecol. 26:4756–4771.

Gourbière, S., and J. Mallet. 2010. Are species real? The shape of the species boundry with

exponential failure, reinforcement, and the "missing snowball." Evolution (N. Y). 64:1–24.

John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Gower, J. C. 1966. Some distance properties of latent root and vector methods used in

multivariate analysis. Biometrika 53:325–338. Oxford Academic.

Graham, R. W., and J. I. Mead. 1987. Environmental fluctuations and evolution of mammalian

faunas during the last deglaciation in North America. Pp. 371–402 *in* North America and

Adjacent Oceans During the Last Deglaciation. Geological Society of America, Boulder,

Colorado 80301.

Harrison, R. G. 1993. Hybrid zones and the evolutionary process. Oxford University Press.

Harrison, R. G. 2012. The language of speciation. Evolution (N. Y). 66:3643–3657. John Wiley

& Sons, Ltd.

Hewitt, G. 2000. The genetic legacy of the Quaternary ice ages. Nature 405:907–913.

Hewitt, G. M. 2011. Quaternary phylogeography: the roots of hybrid zones. Genetica 139:617–

638. Springer.

Hewitt, G. M. 1996. Some genetic consequences of ice ages, and their role in divergence and

speciation. Biol. J. Linn. Soc. 58:247–276.

Hewitt, G. M. 2008. Speciation, hybrid zones and phylogeography - or seeing genes in space and

time. Mol. Ecol. 10:537–549. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Hey, J. 2010. Isolation with migration models for more than two populations. Mol. Biol. Evol.

27:905–920.

Hey, J., and R. Nielsen. 2004. Multilocus methods for estimating population sizes, migration

rates and divergence time, with applications to the divergence of *Drosophila pseudoobscura*

and *D-persimilis*. Genetics 167:747–760.

Hijmans, R. J., J. van Etten, and J. Checg. 2014. Geographic data analysis and modeling [R

package raster version 2.5-8]. Comprehensive R Archive Network (CRAN).

Jackson, N. D., B. C. Carstens, A. E. Morales, and B. C. O'Meara. 2017. Species delimitation

with gene flow. Syst. Biol. 66:799–812. Oxford Academic.

Jiggins, C. D., and J. Mallet. 2000. Bimodal hybrid zones and speciation. Trends Ecol. Evol.

15:250–255. Elsevier Current Trends.

Jombart, T. 2008. adegenet: a R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic markers.

Bioinformatics 24:1403–1405.

Jombart, T., S. Devillard, and F. Balloux. 2010. Discriminant analysis of principal components: a

new method for the analysis of genetically structured populations. BMC Genet. 11:94.

BioMed Central.

Joseph, L., and T. Wilke. 2007. Lack of phylogeographic structure in three widespread

Australian birds reinforces emerging challenges in Australian historical biogeography. J.

Biogeogr. 34:612–624.

Karrenberg, S., X. Liu, E. Hallander, A. Favre, J. Herforth-Rahmé, and A. Widmer. 2019.

Ecological divergence plays an important role in strong but complex reproductive isolation

in campions (Silene). Evolution (N. Y). 73:245–261. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Kuhn, M. 2008. Caret: Classification and Regression Training Package. R package version 6.0-

77.

Landgraf, A. J., and Y. Lee. 2015. Dimensionality Reduction for Binary Data through the

Projection of Natural Parameters.

Lawson, R., and C. S. Lieb. 1990. Variation and hybridization in *Elaphe bairdi* (Serpentes:

Colubridae). J. Herpetol. 24:280.

Leaché, A. D., T. Zhu, B. Rannala, and Z. Yang. 2019. The spectre of too many species. Syst.

Biol. 68:168–181. Narnia.

Legendre, P., and M. J. Fortin. 2010. Comparison of the Mantel test and alternative approaches

for detecting complex multivariate relationships in the spatial analysis of genetic data. Mol.

Ecol. Resour. 10:831–844.

Legendre, P., J. Oksanen, and C. J. F. ter Braak. 2011. Testing the significance of canonical axes

in redundancy analysis. Methods Ecol. Evol. 2:269–277. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

(10.1111).

Lek, S., M. Delacoste, P. Baran, I. Dimopoulos, J. Lauga, and S. Aulagnier. 1996. Application of

neural networks to modelling nonlinear relationships in ecology. Ecol. Modell. 90:39–52.

Lek, S., and J. F. Gue. 1999. Artificial neural networks as a tool in ecological modelling , an

introduction. 120:65–73.

Libbrecht, M. W., and W. S. Noble. 2015. Machine learning applications in genetics and

genomics. Nat. Rev. Genet. 16:321–332.

Linck, E., and C. J. Battey. 2019. Minor allele frequency thresholds strongly affect population

structure inference with genomic data sets. Mol. Ecol. Resour. 19:639–647. John Wiley &

Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Lourenço, C. R., K. R. Nicastro, C. D. McQuaid, R. M. Chefaoui, J. Assis, M. Z. Taleb, and G. I.

Zardi. 2017. Evidence for rangewide panmixia despite multiple barriers to dispersal in a

marine mussel. Sci. Rep. 7:10279. Nature Publishing Group.

Macholán, M., S. J. E. Baird, P. Dufková, P. Munclinger, B. V. Bímová, and J. Piálek. 2011.

Assessing multilocus introgression patterns: a case study on the mouse X chromosome in

Central Europe. Evolution (N. Y). 65:1428–1446. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Makowsky, R., J. Chesser, and L. J. Rissler. 2009. A striking lack of genetic diversity across the

wide-ranging amphibian *Gastrophryne carolinensis* (Anura: Microhylidae). Genetica

135:169–183. Springer Netherlands.

Mallet, J. 2007. Hybrid speciation. Nature 446:279–283. Nature Publishing Group.

Mason, N. A., N. K. Fletcher, B. A. Gill, W. C. Funk, and K. R. Zamudio. 2020. Coalescent-

based species delimitation is sensitive to geographic sampling and isolation by distance.

Syst. Biodivers. 18:269–280. Taylor & Francis.

Mayr, E. 1963. Animal species and evolution. Belknap Press of Harvard University Press,

Cambridge,.

McEntee, J. P., J. G. Burleigh, and S. Singhal. 2018. Dispersal predicts hybrid zone widths

across animal diversity: Implications for species borders under incomplete reproductive

isolation. bioRxiv 472506. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory.

McGaughran, A., K. Morgan, and R. J. Sommer. 2014. Environmental variables explain genetic

structure in a beetle-associated nematode. PLoS One 9:e87317. Public Library of Science.

Metcalfe, S. E. 2006. Late Quaternary environments of the northern deserts and central

transvolcanic belt of Mexico. Ann. Missouri Bot. Gard. 93:258–273. Missouri Botanical

Garden Press.

Metcalfe, S., A. Say, S. Black, R. McCulloch, and S. O'Hara. 2002. Wet Conditions during the

Last Glaciation in the Chihuahuan Desert, Alta Babicora Basin, Mexico. Quat. Res. 57:91–

101.

Myers, E. A., R. W. Bryson, R. W. Hansen, M. L. Aardema, D. Lazcano, and F. T. Burbrink.

2019a. Exploring Chihuahuan Desert diversification in the gray-banded kingsnake,

Lampropeltis alterna (Serpentes: Colubridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 131:211–218.

Myers, E. A., A. D. McKelvy, and F. T. Burbrink. 2020. Biogeographic barriers, Pleistocene

refugia, and climatic gradients in the southeastern Nearctic drive diversification in

cornsnakes (*Pantherophis guttatus* complex). Mol. Ecol. 29:797–811. John Wiley & Sons,

Ltd.

Myers, E. A., A. T. Xue, M. Gehara, C. L. Cox, A. R. Davis Rabosky, J. Lemos-Espinal, J. E.

Martínez-Gómez, and F. T. Burbrink. 2019b. Environmental heterogeneity and not vicariant

biogeographic barriers generate community-wide population structure in desert-adapted

snakes. Mol. Ecol. 28:4535–4548.

Noguerales, V., P. J. Cordero, and J. Ortego. 2016. Hierarchical genetic structure shaped by

topography in a narrow-endemic montane grasshopper. BMC Evol. Biol. 16:96. BioMed

Central.

Nosil, P. 2012. Ecological Speciation. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Nosil, P., and B. J. Crespi. 2006. Ecological divergence promotes the evolution of cryptic

reproductive isolation. Proc. R. Soc. B-Biological Sci. 273:991–997.

Nosil, P., and J. L. Feder. 2013. Genome evolution and speciation: toward quantitative

descriptions of pattern and process. Evolution 67:2461–7.

Nosil, P., J. L. Feder, S. M. Flaxman, and Z. Gompert. 2017. Tipping points in the dynamics of

speciation. Nat. Ecol. Evol. 1:1. Nat Ecol Evol.

Nosil, P., D. J. Funk, and D. Ortiz-Barrientos. 2009. Divergent selection and heterogeneous

genomic divergence. Mol. Ecol. 18:375–402.

Noss, R. F., W. J. Platt, B. A. Sorrie, A. S. Weakley, D. B. Means, J. Costanza, and R. K. Peet.

2015. How global biodiversity hotspots may go unrecognized: lessons from the North

American Coastal Plain. Divers. Distrib. 21:236–244.

O'Meara, B. C. 2010. New heuristic methods for joint species delimitation and species tree

inference. Syst. Biol. 59:59–73.

Orr, H. A. 1995. The population genetics of speciation: the evolution of hybrid incompatibilities.

Genetics 139:1805–13. Genetics Society of America.

Pante, E., N. Puillandre, A. Viricel, S. Arnaud-Haond, D. Aurelle, M. Castelin, A. Chenuil, C.

Destombe, D. Forcioli, M. Valero, F. Viard, and S. Samadi. 2015. Species are hypotheses:

avoid connectivity assessments based on pillars of sand. Mol. Ecol. 24:525–544. John

Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Petkova, D., J. Novembre, and M. Stephens. 2016. Visualizing spatial population structure with

estimated effective migration surfaces. Nat. Genet. 48:94–100. Nature Publishing Group.

Plummer, M., N. Best, K. Cowles, and K. Vines. 2006. CODA: Convergence diagnosis and

output analysis for MCMC. R News 6:7–11.

Pyron, R. A., and F. T. Burbrink. 2009. Lineage diversification in a widespread species: roles for

niche divergence and conservatism in the common kingsnake, *Lampropeltis getula*. Mol.

Ecol. 18:3443–3457.

R Core Team. 2015. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation

for Statistical Computing., Vienna, Austria.

Rannala, B. 2015. The art and science of species delimitation. Curr. Zool. 61:846–853.

Rannala, B., and Z. Yang. 2020. Species Delimitation. Pp. 5.5:1--5.5:18 *in* C. Scornavacca, F.

Delsuc, and N. Galtier, eds. Phylogenetics in the Genomic Era. No commercial publisher |

Authors open access book.

Remington, C. L. 1968. Suture-zones of hybrid interaction between recently joined biotas. Pp.

321–428 *in* Evolutionary Biology. Springer US, Boston, MA.

Riddle, B. R. 2016. Comparative phylogeography clarifies the complexity and problems of

continental distribution that drove A. R. Wallace to favor islands. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.

S. A. 113:7970. National Academy of Sciences.

Robison, H. W. 1986. Zoogeographic implications of the Mississippi River Basin. Pp. 267–285

in The Zoogeography of North American Freshwater Fishes. Wiley, New York.

Roux, C., C. Fraïsse, J. Romiguier, Y. Anciaux, N. Galtier, and N. Bierne. 2016. Shedding light

on the grey zone of speciation along a continuum of genomic divergence. PLoS Biol.

14:e2000234. Public Library of Science.

Satler, J. D., and B. C. Carstens. 2017. Do ecological communities disperse across biogeographic

barriers as a unit? Mol. Ecol. 26:3533–3545. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Schultz, K. D. 1996. A monograph of the colubrid snakes of the genus *Elaphe* Fitzinger. Koelz

Scientific Books, Havlicuv.

Seehausen, O., R. K. Butlin, I. Keller, C. E. Wagner, J. W. Boughman, P. A. Hohenlohe, C. L.

Peichel, G.-P. Saetre, C. Bank, A. Brannstrom, A. Brelsford, C. S. Clarkson, F.

Eroukhmanoff, J. L. Feder, M. C. Fischer, A. D. Foote, P. Franchini, C. D. Jiggins, F. C.

Jones, A. K. Lindholm, K. Lucek, M. E. Maan, D. A. Marques, S. H. Martin, B. Matthews,

J. I. Meier, M. Most, M. W. Nachman, E. Nonaka, D. J. Rennison, J. Schwarzer, E. T.

Watson, A. M. Westram, and A. Widmer. 2014. Genomics and the origin of species. Nat

Rev Genet 15:176–192. Nature Publishing Group.

Sheehan, S., Y. S. Song, E. Buzbas, D. Petrov, A. Boyko, and A. Auton. 2016. Deep learning for

population genetic inference. PLOS Comput. Biol. 12:e1004845. Public Library of Science.

Singhal, S., and C. Moritz. 2013. Reproductive isolation between phylogeographic lineages

scales with divergence. Proceedings. Biol. Sci. 280:20132246. The Royal Society.

Soltis, D. E., A. B. Morris, J. S. McLachlan, P. S. Manos, and P. S. Soltis. 2006. Comparative

phylogeography of unglaciated eastern North America. Mol. Ecol. 15:4261–4293.

Stankowski, S., M. A. Chase, A. M. Fuiten, M. F. Rodrigues, P. L. Ralph, and M. A. Streisfeld.

2019. Widespread selection and gene flow shape the genomic landscape during a radiation

of monkeyflowers. PLOS Biol. 17:e3000391. Public Library of Science.

Stankowski, S., J. M. Sobel, and M. A. Streisfeld. 2017. Geographic cline analysis as a tool for

studying genome-wide variation: a case study of pollinator-mediated divergence in a

monkeyflower. Mol. Ecol. 26:107–122.

Sukumaran, J., and L. L. Knowles. 2017. Multispecies coalescent delimits structure, not species.

Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 114:1607–1612. National Academy of Sciences.

Sun, K., K. A. Meiklejohn, B. C. Faircloth, T. C. Glenn, E. L. Braun, and R. T. Kimball. 2014.

The evolution of peafowl and other taxa with ocelli (eyespots): a phylogenomic approach.

862   Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 281:20140823. The Royal Society.

863 Swenson, N. G., and D. J. Howard. 2005. Clustering of contact zones, hybrid zones, and

864   phylogeographic breaks in North America. Am. Nat. 166:581–591.

865 Vandewege, M. W., D. Rodriguez, J. P. Weaver, T. D. Hibbitts, M. R. J. Forstner, and L. D.

866   Densmore. 2012. Evidence of Hybridization between *Elaphe bairdi* and *Elaphe obsoleta*

867   *lindheimeri* Including Comparative Population Genetics Inferred from Microsatellites and

868   Mitochondrial DNA. J. Herpetol. 46:56–63. Society for the Study of Amphibians and

869   Reptiles.

870 Vavrek, M. J. 2020. Fossil. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/fossil/index.html.

871 Walker, D., and J. C. Avise. 1998. Principles of phylogeography as illustrated by freshwater and

872   terrestrial turtles in the southeastern United States. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 29:23–58.

873 Waltari, E., R. J. Hijmans, A. T. Peterson, Á. S. Nyári, S. L. Perkins, and R. P. Guralnick. 2007.

874   Locating Pleistocene refugia: comparing phylogeographic and ecological niche model

875   predictions. PLoS One 2:e563. Public Library of Science.

876 Werler, J. E., and J. R. Dixon. 2000. Texas snakes : identification, distribution, and natural

877   history. 1st ed. University of Texas Press, Austin.

878 Wright, S. 1978. Evolution and the Genetics of Populations. Vol. 4. Variability within and

879   among Natural Populations. University Chicago Press.

880 Wright, S. 1931. Evolution in Mendelian populations. Genetics 16:97–159. Genetics Society of

881   America.

882 Wright, S. 1943. Isolation by distance. Genetics 28:114–38. Genetics Society of America.

883 Younger, J. L., P. Dempster, Á. S. Nyári, T. O. Helms, M. J. Raherilalao, S. M. Goodman, and S.

884   Reddy. 2019. Phylogeography of the Rufous vanga and the role of bioclimatic transition

zones in promoting speciation within Madagascar. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 139:106535.

Academic Press.

Zellmer, A. J., M. M. Hanes, S. M. Hird, and B. C. Carstens. 2012. Deep phylogeographic

structure and environmental differentiation in the carnivorous plant Sarracenia alata. Syst.

Biol. 61:763–777.

Zhang, C., D.-X. Zhang, T. Zhu, and Z. Yang. 2011. Evaluation of a bayesian coalescent method

of species delimitation. Syst. Biol. 60:747–761.

Zhang, W. 2010. Computational Ecology: Artificial Neural Networks and Their Applications.

World Scientific.

Acknowledgments: We thank R. Glor, R. Brown, and L. Welton at KU and C. Austin and D.
Dittman at LSUMN and K. Krysko and FLMNH, D. Shepard at Louisiana Tech University, and
A. McKelvy for providing tissues. We also thank L. and G. Derryberry for help with HZAR. We
also thank E. Chen for help extracting DNA. EAM was funded by the Gerstner Scholar/Theodore
Roosevelt and Peter Buck/Walter Rathbone Bacon fellowships. We thank D. Frost, A. Leaché,
A. Bauer, and K. deQuieroz for helpful discussions on species delimitation, type specimens, and
admixed type specimens.

915
916 **Data Accessibility Statement:** All data and unique scripts are available on Dryad XXX.
917 **Title:** Resolving spatial complexities of hybridization in the context of the gray zone of

Table 1. Measures of divergence dates in millions of years (My), migration rates (first number is first taxon migrating into second taxon, e.g., *Pantherophis alleganiensis* into *P.spiloides*, and second represents second species migrating into the first), and cline widths for both spatial distance (Km) and environmental distance for all species-pair comparisons in the *Pantherophis obsoletus* complex. Percentage of median width over total sampled distance are shown for both spatial and environmental clines

Group	Age (My)	Migration Rate (ind/gen)	Cline Width (Km)	Cline Width (Env)
Eastern (*P. alleghaniensis* x *P.spiloides*)	1.95 (0.674-0.2.95)	2.79/3.79	256 (168-356); 14.8%	0.81 (0.32-1.45); 4.0%
Central (*P.spiloides* x *P.obsoletus*)	3.18 (1.65-5.02)	1.96/1.28	147 (40-283); 7.2%	0.13 (0.06-0.24); 5.0%
Western (*P.obsoletus* x *P. bairdi*)	1.10 (0.407-02.62)	0.65/0.55	21 (2-46); 1.6%	4.4 (3.2-12.53); 2.1%

Figures

Fig.1. Distribution of species within the North American ratsnake complex. (A) Map showing

range and geographic features: Chihuahuan Desert Province, the Mississippi River, and the

Appalachian Mountains and Apalachicola/Chattahoochee River System (AARS). (B) Estimated

effective migration surfaces (EEMS) showing areas of both high (blue) and low migration

(brown). (C) Population structure using Discriminant Analysis of Principal Components (DAPC)

shows the location of four geographically distinct lineages. (D) Bi-plots of PC space shows

relative distances among the four taxa using DAPC.

Fig.2. The results of SNAPP species-tree estimation for the four taxa over all loci (A) and

models showing Isolation Migration (IM) and Isolation Migration with Demographic Change

(IMD; best-fit model) and Isolation with Recent Migration and Demographic Change (IMRD)

estimated in PipeMaster. Colored arrows represent migration among spatially adjacent pairs. (B).

Photographs representing some of the typical color patterns seen in ratsnakes: 1) *Pantherophis*

alleghaniensis (photo F. Burbrink), 2) *P. alleghaniensis* (photo N. Claunch), 3) *P. spiloides*

(photo A. Meier), 4) *P. obsoletus* (photo D. Shepard), and 5) *P. bairdi* (E. Myers).

Fig.3. Results from PipeMaster showing estimates and directionality of migration (2Nm) (A), divergence times between taxon pairs and across the Mississippi River (*P. alleghaniensis/ P. spiloides* vs *P. obsoletus/P. bairdi*) (B), and changes in population sizes over time (C).

Fig.4. Artificial neural network results showing accuracy predicting genetic structure for 10

PCoA axes among all lineages and species pairs for real and randomly shuffled dependent

variables (A). Variable importance are shown for spatial data (grey; principal coordinates

neighbor matrices) and environmental charcteristics (red; B-D). Variable abbreviations are: Miss

Ri (Mississippi River), Elev (elevation), ecoreg (ecoregions), Mis19 (Pleistocene Marine Isotope

Stage 19 - 787 Kya), LIG (Last interglacial – 130 Kya), LGM (Last glacial maximum – 21Kya),

and Cur (Current climate data). Asterisks above red columns are significant after corrected for

space using redundancy analyses (RDA).

 Fig.5. Using admixture from TESS3r (A), Gaussian cline (HZAR) model predictions are shown

998 for both spatial (B) and environmental distances (C) for all three species pairs.

1000

1001

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006   Fig.6. Beeswarm plots showing predicted cline widths and centers for all three species pairs over

1007   all loci using HZAR. Cline widths for loci lower than the predictions for neutrally forming

1008   hybrid zones since the last glacial maximum fall below the indicated dashed line.

1009

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023

1024   **Supplemental Material**

1025   **Supporting Information Material 1**

1026

1027

1028   **Supplemental Methods and Results**

1029

Dataset

We sampled 288 individuals liberally covering the range of all species within the

Pantherophis obsoletus complex (Fig.1; Dryad XXX). DNA was extracted from all samples

using Qiagen DNeasy Blood & Tissue Kits and samples were screened for quality using broad-

range Qubit Assays (https://www.thermofisher.com/us/en/home/industrial/spectroscopy-

elemental-isotope-analysis/molecular-spectroscopy/fluorometers/qubit/qubit-assays.html). We

used services from RAPiD Genomics (https://www.rapid-genomics.com/services/) to generate

5472 baits and to sequence 5060 conserved elements (UCEs) loci following the protocols from

(Faircloth et al. 2012) and (Sun et al. 2014).

Raw sequence reads were trimmed of adapter contamination using illumiprocessor

(Faircloth 2013), a wrapper around the trimmomatic package (Bolger et al. 2014). These

sequence capture data were then assembled by mapping reads to all UCEs found within a

Chromium 10x assembled *Pantherophis spiloides* genome (Burbrink and Myers, *in prep*) after

2,500 base pairs of flanking DNA around UCE baits were pulled from this genome assembly

using the Phyluce commands *phyluce_probe_run_multiple_lastzs_sqlite* and

phyluce_probe_slice_sequence_from_genomes (Faircloth 2016). Sequence reads for each sample

were then mapped to the 'reference' UCE dataset using bwa v0.7.17 (Li and Durbin 2009).

Samtools was used to convert sam format to bam files and alignments were soft clipped using the

CleanSam tool in Picard (http://broadinstitute.github.io/picard/). To phase these data, we mapped

reads back to each individual sample's alignments. To do this, bam files were converted to fastq

using samtools mpileup (Li et al. 2009), fastq files were converted to fasta format via seqtk

(https://github.com/lh3/seqtk) and all missing sites were removed using seqkit (Shen et al 2016).

These newly created fasta files were then used as a reference sequence for phasing the data

following the seqcap_pop pipeline (Harvey et al. 2016). Briefly we followed this pipeline and

used GATK (McKenna et al. 2010) to mark duplicates, call, realign, and annotate/mask indels,

call and annotate SNPs via GATK, restrict SNP calling to high quality SNPs, and then conducted

read backed phasing. Finally, we created a sample specific fasta file of all phased loci for every

sample using 'add_phased_snps_to_seqs_filter.py' available via the seqcap_pop pipeline

(Harvey et al. 2016). All samples were combined into locus specific fasta files using a perl script

developed in (Myers et al. 2019). Locus specific fasta files were aligned using muscle as

implemented in the R package ape (Paradis and Schliep 2019) after removing individuals from

alignments that fell below the 25% quantile of the distribution of sequence lengths for each

locus. All fasta files were conservatively trimmed of missing data resulting in alignments with no

missing sites (i.e., trimming to the shortest sequence in the alignment). We filtered these

alignments by removing all loci that were missing >50% sequenced samples and removed all

individuals that were missing from >30% of all alignments. Finally, we created a vcf file from

these alignments and using vcftools (Danecek et al. 2011) and filtered this for minor allele

frequency >10% retaining only 1 SNP/locus for population assignment analyses (Linck and

Battey 2019).

1069

1070

Geographic groupings

We estimated population structure by comparing Discriminant Analysis of Principal

Components (DAPC; Jombart et al., 2010) and spatial Principal Component analysis (sPCA;

Jombart et al., 2008) in adegenet v2.1.2(Jombart 2008), sparse nonnegative matrix

factorization (SNMF; Frichot et al., 2014) in LEA v1.4.0 (Frichot and François 2015), and

estimated effective migration surfaces (EEMS v; Petkova et al., 2016), which accounts for IBD .

Each of these methods use different assumptions for grouping individuals and we compare

congruence among them.The model-free method DAPC sequentially estimates K-means for

clustering and selects the best fit to infer genetic clusters in the absence of prior group

identification. Using the package adegenet (Jombart 2008) in R (R Core Team 2015) we first

transformed data using PCA by choosing a large number of PC axes (n=200), then picking the

number of discriminant functions yielding large F-statistics (>2000) and optimal number of

groups using BIC (Bayesian inference criterion). Because using a large number of the PCs may

yield arbitrary solutions, we estimated the optimal *a-score*, which measures this bias by

calculating the difference between the actual cluster assignment probabilities and randomly

assigned probabilities (predicting 15-23 PCs). We also used cross-validation with a 90% training

and 10% test dataset to estimate the average predicted success for each group.

Because DAPC does not account for spatial structure, such as IBD, we also used sPCA.

Similar to DAPC, this method does not require data to be in Hardy-Weinberg or linkage

equilibrium. sPCA also adds an element of space by isolating global structure, representing

disconnected groups or clines, from local structure, representing repulsion (selection against

similar genetic types co-occurring), and random noise. Using adegenet, we estimated sPCA

given SNPs and locations of each sample using up to 15 positive eigenvalues (global structures)

and 15 negative eigenvalues (local structures). To connect individual locations to build a

connection network, we used Delaunay triangulation. We also implemented Monte-Carlo tests

with 100 permutations using the function *spca_randtests* to determine if significant local or

global spatial structures exist.

We also assessed ancestral coefficients using SNMF in the package LEA (Frichot and

François 2015). This methodology is comparable to ADMIXTURE (Alexander et al. 2009) and

Structure (Pritchard et al. 2000) methods, but runs 10-30x faster using genomic-scale data. This

method produces a least-squares estimate of ancestry populations given K ancestral populations

We estimated ancestry coefficients over 1-6 K using 100 repetitions per K, 100 iterations per

algorithm, and a tolerance of 0.05. To determine the appropriate number of groups, we used a

cross-validation technique with the entropy criterion, which masks genotypes to fit a particular

model to each K.

Finally, to compare these methods of grouping individuals into populations, we estimated

migration rates over the landscape using EEMS (Petkova et al. 2016). This method models

effective migration rates over geography to represent regions where migration is low in cases

when genetic dissimilarity increases rapidly, thus providing a uniquely distinct view of the

location of population clusters relative to biogeographic barriers as compared to DAPC, sPCA,

and SNMF. We ran EEMS 3 times for $3x10^6$ generations with burnin set at $1x10^6$ generations,

thinned by 9,999 generations, with 1,000 demes covering the known range of the *P. obsoletus*

complex (Burbrink 2001).

Both EEMS and DAPC find population structure, generally matched the geographic

ranges of *P. alleghaniensis*, *P. spiloides, P. obsoletus*, and *P. bairdi* (Fig. 1 and Fig. S1;

Burbrink, 2001). Total DAPC assignment probabilities were 0.975 (*P. bairdi* = 1.0, *P. obsoletus*

= 0.96; *P. spiloides* = 1.0, and *P. alleghaniensis* = 0.97). Comparing these assignments to those

from SMNF, we found that only *P. alleghaniensis* was misclassified as *P. spiloides* 8.5% of the

time. Similarly, SNMF cross validation predicted four groups (cv = 0.599) as compared to two

(cv=0.627), three (cv=0.607), and five (cv=0.601). These four groups generally match the same

ranges as those found in DAPC. sPCA showed the presence of four groups, with PC1 showing

the separation of groups at the MR and the two lineages east of this river, whereas PC2-5 shows

divergence in all taxa. Importantly, global spatial structures were significant (observed spatial

structure test statistic = 75.47, random expectation = 28.14; $P < 0.009$). Similarly, all three

EEMS runs suggest low migration at the MR and the area separating the *P. bairdi* and *P.*

obsoletus in west Texas. East of the MR, estimated low migration occurred near the Appalachian

Mountains, though this area is a complex mixture of isolation and gene flow (Fig. 1). All three

EEMS generated similar acceptance proportions for all proposal types (12-51%).

1129

Running SNAPP

We set forward and reverse mutation rates to 1. We applied a gamma distribution ($\alpha = 2$,

$\beta = 200$) for the speciation rate (λ) prior and the *snapprior* was set to $\alpha = 1$, $\beta = 250$, and $\kappa = 1$. To

test the four alternative species delimitation models including four taxa, three taxa (collapsing *P.*

bairdi/P. obsoletus or *P. alleghaniensis/P. spiloides*), and two taxa (collapsing *P. bairdi/P.*

obsoletus and *P.alleghaniensis/P. spiloides* we used a stepping-stone analysis with the

PathSampleAnalyser with 72 steps and a chain length of 200000, burnin percentage at 50%, and

a preBurnin of 10,000. We checked for stationarity using Tracer v1.7.1 (Drummond and

Rambaut 2007) determining that estimated sample size (ESS) were > 200 for all parameters.

Running PHRAPL

PHRAPL uses gene-tree distances between simulated and empirical data to rank models using

approximate likelihoods and AICs. To generate the empirical observations we estimated

unrooted gene trees for each loci using IQ-Tree 1.6.12 (Nguyen et al. 2015) and testing all

substitution models per locus prior to estimation. We rooted the trees using midpoint rooting and

performed 100 subsamples of two individuals per population. To reduce model space, we

allowed only one population size parameter (all populations have equal size) and one migration

parameter (all migration rates are equal). We then ran 1000 simulations per model, searching

over a grid of four CollapseStarts values and five MigrationStarts values.

1148

Spatial genetics using RDA

We predicted genetic distances from environmental, elevation, river, ecoregion, and

distance variables using RDA in the R package Vegan (Dixon 2003), which avoided problems

with spatial data using Mantel tests (Legendre et al. 2015). This method was used to compare

results from the ANN analyses. RDA is an asymmetric canonical analysis here used to determine

the significance of predictor axes (Legendre et al. 2011) at generating predict genetic structure

over a landscape (McGaughran et al. 2014; Noguerales et al. 2016). We converted spatial

distances using principal coordinates of neighbor matrices (PCNM) in the r package vegan

(Dixon 2003) keeping all axes with positive eigenvectors. We ran this using the *capscale*

function with only spatial variables alone to determine which significantly predict genetic

distance to be passed to out ANN analyses. We also ran this with the significant spatial axes

partialed out and environmental, elevational, ecoregion, and river variables. All variable

distances were used to predict genetic distance and significance of each variable was tested using

anova-like permutation tests to examine the joint effect of predictor variables given partial

effects from spatial distance to account for IBD.

1164   Estimates of accuracy using ANN were high (>90%) for all comparisons and yielded

similar conclusions to RDA in that environmental and geographic barriers and not just spatial

variables predicted genetic structure. Here, RDA demonstrated that most of the structure for all

taxa can be predicted by the Mississippi River ($P=0.001$), ecoregion ($P =0.008$), and current

climate ($P=0.019$). Distance also played a role in structuring these data, though they were

partialed out in RDA. For those lineages east of the Mississippi River, population structure was

predicted by ecoregion ($P=0.014$), Pleistocene Marine Isotope Stage 19 (787 Kya; $P=0.001$), last

interglacial ($P=0.007$) and ecoregion ($P=0014$). For those lineages west of the Mississippi

River, we demonstrated predicted by ecoregion ($P= 0.001$).

1173

1174   *Genomics, the ICZN, and Taxonomy*

1175   One problem likely to be encountered by other researchers using genomic data is that

previously named type specimens at particular type localities may be from regions that show

some admixture. For instance, the type locality of the eastern-most species, *P. alleghaniensis* is

"the summit of the Blue Ridge in Virginia and the Highlands of the Hudson" (Holbrook 1836;

Schultz 1996). Both areas are likely composed of admixed individuals and the International Code

of Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN) forbids naming species based on hybrids (Article

1.3.3;ICZN, 1999) though the intention of this ICZN article did not consider proportions of

admixture. One possible solution would be to use the next available name from Florida, where

no admixture is present (eliminating *P. quadrivittata*), which would be *P.deckerti* (type locality:

Lower Matecumber Key, FL; Brady 1932). Another solution would be to designate a Neotype

from a locality showing no admixture and retain *P. alleghaniensis.* If *P. alleghaniensis/P.*

spiloides were not considered unique, then *P. alleghaniensis* has priority by 18 years (Holbrook

1836; Duméril et al. 1854).

The type locality for the remaining taxa, *P. spiloides (*New Orleans, Louisiana; Duméril

et al. 1854), *P. obsoletus* (On the Missouri River from the Vicinity Isle au Vache to Council

Bluff; Say, 1823), and *P. bairdi* (Fort Davis, Apache Mountains, Jeff Davis Co.: Texas; Yarrow

1880) are all from regions that likely represent individuals not admixed (Fig.1 & 5, Burbrink,

2001). Species delimitation methods, estimates of fixation for loci, and observation that these

four organisms have remained geographically distinct in the face of gene flow throughout the

Pleistocene suggests that these taxa should be considered unique species though hybrid zones

exist. We acknowledge difficulties recognizing the eastern lineages as distinct and could argue

for recognizing them as a single taxon, *P. alleghaniensis*.

1197

1198

Literature Cited

Alexander, D. H., J. Novembre, and K. Lange. 2009. Fast model-based estimation of ancestry in

unrelated individuals. Genome Res. 19:1655–64. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press.

Bolger, A. M., M. Lohse, and B. Usadel. 2014. Trimmomatic: A flexible trimmer for Illumina

Sequence Data. Bioinformatics.

Brady, M. K. 1932. A new snake from Florida. Proc. Biol. Soc. Washingt. 5–8.

Burbrink, F. T. 2001. Systematics of the eastern ratsnake complex (*Elaphe obsoleta*). Herpetol.

Monogr. 1–53.

Danecek, P., A. Auton, G. Abecasis, C. A. Albers, E. Banks, M. A. DePristo, R. E. Handsaker,

G. Lunter, G. T. Marth, S. T. Sherry, G. McVean, and R. Durbin. 2011. The variant call

format and VCFtools. Bioinformatics 27:2156–2158. Narnia.

Derryberry, E. P., G. E. Derryberry, J. M. Maley, and R. T. Brumfield. 2014. hzar : hybrid zone

analysis using an R software package. Mol. Ecol. Resour. 14:652–663.

Dixon, P. 2003. VEGAN, a package of R functions for community ecology. J. Veg. Sci. 14:927–

930. Blackwell Publishing.

Drummond, A. J., and A. Rambaut. 2007. BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling

trees. Bmc Evol. Biol. 7.

Duméril, A. M. C., G. Bibron, and A. H. A. Duméril. 1854. Erpétologie Genérale ou Histoire

Naturelle Complète des Reptiles Vol. 7. Paris: Librarie Enclyclopedique de Roret., Paris.

Faircloth, B. C. 2013. illumiprocessor: a trimmomatic wrapper for parallel adapter and quality

trimming.

Faircloth, B. C. 2016. PHYLUCE is a software package for the analysis of conserved genomic

loci. Bioinformatics 32:786–788. Narnia.

Faircloth, B. C., J. E. McCormack, N. G. Crawford, M. G. Harvey, R. T. Brumfield, and T. C.

Glenn. 2012. Ultraconserved Elements Anchor Thousands of Genetic Markers Spanning

Multiple Evolutionary Timescales. Syst. Biol. 61:717–726. Narnia.

Frichot, E., and O. François. 2015. LEA : An R package for landscape and ecological association

studies. Methods Ecol. Evol. 6:925–929. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Frichot, E., F. Mathieu, T. Trouillon, G. Bouchard, and O. François. 2014. Fast and Efficient

Estimation of Individual Ancestry Coefficients. Genetics 196:973–983.

Harvey, M. G., B. T. Smith, T. C. Glenn, B. C. Faircloth, and R. T. Brumfield. 2016. Sequence

Capture versus Restriction Site Associated DNA Sequencing for Shallow Systematics. Syst.

Biol. 65:910–924. Narnia.

Holbrook, J. E. 1836. North American herpetology : or, A description of the reptiles inhabiting

the United States / by John Edwards Holbrook. J. Dobson, Philadelphia :

ICZN: 1999. International Code of Zoological Nomenclature. Fourth. London, England.

Jombart, T. 2008. adegenet: a R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic markers.

Bioinformatics 24:1403–1405.

Jombart, T., S. Devillard, and F. Balloux. 2010. Discriminant analysis of principal components: a

new method for the analysis of genetically structured populations. BMC Genet. 11:94.

BioMed Central.

Jombart, T., S. Devillard, A. B. Dufour, and D. Pontier. 2008. Revealing cryptic spatial patterns

in genetic variability by a new multivariate method. Heredity (Edinb). 101:92–103.

Legendre, P., M.-J. Fortin, and D. Borcard. 2015. Should the Mantel test be used in spatial

analysis? Methods Ecol. Evol. 6:1239–1247. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

Legendre, P., J. Oksanen, and C. J. F. ter Braak. 2011. Testing the significance of canonical axes

in redundancy analysis. Methods Ecol. Evol. 2:269–277. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

(10.1111).

Li, H., and R. Durbin. 2009. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler

transform. Bioinformatics 25:1754–1760. Narnia.

Li, H., B. Handsaker, A. Wysoker, T. Fennell, J. Ruan, N. Homer, G. Marth, G. Abecasis, and R.

Durbin. 2009. The Sequence Alignment/Map format and SAMtools. Bioinformatics

25:2078–2079. Narnia.

Linck, E., and C. J. Battey. 2019. Minor allele frequency thresholds strongly affect population

structure inference with genomic data sets. Mol. Ecol. Resour. 19:639–647. John Wiley &

Sons, Ltd (10.1111).

McGaughran, A., K. Morgan, and R. J. Sommer. 2014. Environmental variables explain genetic

structure in a beetle-associated nematode. PLoS One 9:e87317. Public Library of Science.

McKenna, A., M. Hanna, E. Banks, A. Sivachenko, K. Cibulskis, A. Kernytsky, K. Garimella, D.

Altshuler, S. Gabriel, M. Daly, and M. A. DePristo. 2010. The Genome Analysis Toolkit: a

MapReduce framework for analyzing next-generation DNA sequencing data. Genome Res.

20:1297–303. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press.

Myers, E. A., R. W. Bryson, R. W. Hansen, M. L. Aardema, D. Lazcano, and F. T. Burbrink.

2019. Exploring Chihuahuan Desert diversification in the gray-banded kingsnake,

Lampropeltis alterna (Serpentes: Colubridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 131:211–218.

Nguyen, L.-T., H. A. Schmidt, A. von Haeseler, and B. Q. Minh. 2015. IQ-TREE: A fast and

effective stochastic algorithm for estimating Maximum-Likelihood phylogenies. Mol. Biol.

Evol. 32:268–274. Oxford University Press.

Noguerales, V., P. J. Cordero, and J. Ortego. 2016. Hierarchical genetic structure shaped by

topography in a narrow-endemic montane grasshopper. BMC Evol. Biol. 16:96. BioMed

Central.

Paradis, E., and K. Schliep. 2019. ape 5.0: an environment for modern phylogenetics and

evolutionary analyses in R. Bioinformatics 35:526–528. Narnia.

Petkova, D., J. Novembre, and M. Stephens. 2016. Visualizing spatial population structure with

estimated effective migration surfaces. Nat. Genet. 48:94–100. Nature Publishing Group.

Plummer, M., N. Best, K. Cowles, and K. Vines. 2006. CODA: Convergence diagnosis and

output analysis for MCMC. R News 6:7–11.

Pritchard, J. K., M. Stephens, and P. Donnelly. 2000. Inference of population structure using

multilocus genotype data. Genetics 155:945–959.

R Core Team. 2015. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation

for Statistical Computing., Vienna, Austria.

Say, T. 1823. Coluber obsoletus. P. 140 *in* Account of an expedition from Pittsburgh to the

Rocky Mountains, Performed in the Years 1819 and '20. Logman, Hurst, Rees, Ovme, and

Brown, London.

Schultz, K. D. 1996. A monograph of the colubrid snakes of the genus *Elaphe* Fitzinger. Koelz

Scientific Books, Havlicuv.

Sun, K., K. A. Meiklejohn, B. C. Faircloth, T. C. Glenn, E. L. Braun, and R. T. Kimball. 2014.

The evolution of peafowl and other taxa with ocelli (eyespots): a phylogenomic approach.

Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci. 281:20140823. The Royal Society.

Yarrow, H. C. 1880. Coluber bairdi sp. nov. P. *in* E. D. Cope, ed. On the zoological position of

Texas Bull. US Natl. Mus.

1290

1291

1292

1293

1294

1295

1296 Fig.S1 – Delimiting populations using sparse nonnegative matrix factorization (SNMF) and

1297 spatial Principal Component analysis (sPCA) showing the location of four geographically

1298 distinct lineages.

1299

1300

1301

1302

1303   Fig. S2 – PipeMaster model fit of observed data to simulations under IM, IMD, and IMD-LGM

1304   models for PC1-PC10.

1305

1306

1307

1308

1309

1310

1311

1312

1313

1314

1315   Fig. S3 – Expansion times estimated from PipeMaster for all adjacent taxon pairs.

1316

1317

1318

1319

1320

1321

1322

1323

1324

1325

1326

1327   Fig. S4– Results from PipeMaster after removing hyrbids showing estimates and directionality of

1328   gene flow (A), divergence times between groups and taxon pairs and the Mississippi River

1329   (*P.alleghaniensis/ P.spiloides* vs *P.obsoletus/P.bairdi*) (B), and changes in population sizes over

1330   time (C).

1331

1332

1333

1334

1335

1336

1337 Fig. S5 – Prediction of cline width under neutrality (black line through time) given divergence

1338 times for each species pair: A) *Pantherophis alleghaniensis/P. spiloides*, B) *P.*

1339 *spiloides/P.obsoletus*, and C) *P. obsoletus/P.bairdi.* Colored vertical lines represent times of

1340 divergence between species pairs and horizontal colored lines indicate actual cline widths.

1341

1342

1343

1344

1354   Table S1. Priors and summary stats for PipeMaster for the IM, IMD, IMD-LGM models;
1355   estimating migration, timing of divergence, and historical demography.
1356
1357   **IM**

PARAMETER	PRIOR.1	PRIOR.2	DISTRIBUTION	
1	Ne0.pop1	20000	500000	runif
2	Ne0.pop2	20000	5e+05	runif
3	Ne0.pop3	20000	5e+05	runif
4	Ne0.pop4	20000	5e+05	runif
5	mig0.1_2	2	5	runif
6	mig0.1_3	0	0	runif
7	mig0.1_4	0	0	runif
8	mig0.2_1	2	5	runif
9	mig0.2_3	2	5	runif
10	mig0.2_4	0	0	runif
11	mig0.3_1	0	0	runif
12	mig0.3_2	2	5	runif
13	mig0.3_4	2	5	runif
14	mig0.4_1	0	0	runif
15	mig0.4_2	0	0	runif
16	mig0.4_3	2	5	runif
17	join1_2	30000	1000000	runif
18	join3_4	30000	1000000	runif
19	join2_4	500000	1700000	runif

1358
1359   **IMD**

PARAMETER	PRIOR.1	PRIOR.2	DISTRIBUTION	
1	Ne0.pop1	10000	500000	runif
2	Ne0.pop2	10000	500000	runif
3	Ne0.pop3	10000	500000	runif
4	Ne0.pop4	10000	500000	runif
5	mig0.1_2	2	5	rtnorm
6	mig0.1_3	0	0	rtnorm
7	mig0.1_4	0	0	rtnorm
8	mig0.2_1	2	5	rtnorm
9	mig0.2_3	2	5	rtnorm
10	mig0.2_4	0	0	rtnorm
11	mig0.3_1	0	0	rtnorm
12	mig0.3_2	2	5	rtnorm
13	mig0.3_4	2	5	rtnorm
14	mig0.4_1	0	0	rtnorm
15	mig0.4_2	0	0	rtnorm
16	mig0.4_3	2	5	rtnorm
17	Ne1.pop1	1000	10000	runif
18	Ne1.pop2	1000	10000	runif
19	Ne1.pop3	1000	10000	runif

20	Ne1.pop4	1000	10000	runif	
21	t.Ne1.pop1	3000	170000	runif	
22	t.Ne1.pop2	3000	170000	runif	
23	t.Ne1.pop3	3000	170000	runif	
24	t.Ne1.pop4	3000	170000	runif	
25	join1_2	30000	1000000	runif	
26	join3_4	30000	1000000	runif	
27	join2_4	500000	1700000	runif	

1361

IMD-LGM

PARAMETER	PRIOR.1	PRIOR.2	DISTRIBUTION	
1	Ne0.pop1	10000	500000	runif
2	Ne0.pop2	10000	500000	runif
3	Ne0.pop3	10000	500000	runif
4	Ne0.pop4	10000	500000	runif
5	mig0.1_2	2	5	rtnorm
6	mig0.1_3	0	0	rtnorm
7	mig0.1_4	0	0	rtnorm
8	mig0.2_1	2	5	rtnorm
9	mig0.2_3	2	5	rtnorm
10	mig0.2_4	0	0	rtnorm
11	mig0.3_1	0	0	rtnorm
12	mig0.3_2	2	5	rtnorm
13	mig0.3_4	2	5	rtnorm
14	mig0.4_1	0	0	rtnorm
15	mig0.4_2	0	0	rtnorm
16	mig0.4_3	2	5	rtnorm
17	Ne1.pop1	1000	10000	runif
18	Ne1.pop2	1000	10000	runif
19	Ne1.pop3	1000	10000	runif
20	Ne1.pop4	1000	10000	runif
21	t.Ne1.pop1	3000	170000	runif
22	t.Ne1.pop2	3000	170000	runif
23	t.Ne1.pop3	3000	170000	runif
24	t.Ne1.pop4	3000	170000	runif
25	mig1.1_2	0	0	runif
26	mig1.1_3	0	0	runif
27	mig1.1_4	0	0	runif
28	mig1.2_1	0	0	runif
29	mig1.2_3	0	0	runif
30	mig1.2_4	0	0	runif
31	mig1.3_1	0	0	runif
32	mig1.3_2	0	0	runif
33	mig1.3_4	0	0	runif
34	mig1.4_1	0	0	runif
35	mig1.4_2	0	0	runif

36	mig1.4_3	0	0	runif
37	t.mig1.1_2	0	8700	runif
38	t.mig1.1_3	0	8700	runif
39	t.mig1.1_4	0	8700	runif
40	t.mig1.2_1	0	8700	runif
41	t.mig1.2_3	0	8700	runif
42	t.mig1.2_4	0	8700	runif
43	t.mig1.3_1	0	8700	runif
44	t.mig1.3_2	0	8700	runif
45	t.mig1.3_4	0	8700	runif
46	t.mig1.4_1	0	8700	runif
47	t.mig1.4_2	0	8700	runif
48	t.mig1.4_3	0	8700	runif
49	join1_2	30000	1000000	runif
50	join3_4	30000	1000000	runif
51	join2_4	500000	1700000	runif

1362
1363