*PSEUDOMONAS AERUGINOSA* VOLATILOME CHARACTERISTICS AND ADAPTATIONS

IN CHRONIC CYSTIC FIBROSIS LUNG INFECTIONS

Trenton J. Davis[a,b], Ava V. Karanjia[a,c], Charity N. Bhebhe[a], Sarah B. West[a], Matthew

Richardson[d,e], and Heather D. Bean[a,b,#]

[a]School of Life Sciences, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ 85287, USA

[b]Center for Fundamental and Applied Microbiomics, The Biodesign Institute, Tempe, AZ, USA

[c]School of Engineering of Matter, Transport, and Energy, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ,

USA

[d]Department of Respiratory Sciences, College of Life Sciences, University of Leicester,

Leicester, UK

[e]NIHR Biomedical Research Centre (Respiratory theme), Institute for Lung Health, Leicester,

UK

[#]Corresponding author:     Heather D. Bean

17                        Heather.D.Bean@asu.edu

**ABSTRACT**

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* chronic lung infections in individuals with cystic fibrosis (CF) significantly reduce quality of life and increase morbidity and mortality. Tracking these infections is critical for monitoring patient health and informing treatments. We are working toward the development of novel breath-based biomarkers to track chronic *P. aeruginosa* lung infections *in situ*. Using comprehensive two-dimensional gas chromatography coupled to time-of-flight mass spectrometry (GC×GC-TOFMS), we characterized the *in vitro* volatile metabolomes (or volatilomes) of 81 *P. aeruginosa* isolates collected from 17 CF patients over at least a five-year period of their chronic lung infections. We detected 539 volatiles produced by the *P. aeruginosa* isolates, 69 of which were core volatiles that were highly conserved. We found that each early infection isolate has a unique volatilome, and as infection progresses, the volatilomes of isolates from the same patient become increasingly dissimilar, to the point that these intra-patient isolates are no more similar to each other than to isolates from other patients. We observed that the size and chemical diversity of *P. aeruginosa* volatilomes do not change over the course of chronic infections; however, the relative abundances of core hydrocarbons, alcohols, and aldehydes do change, and are correlated to changes in phenotypes associated with chronic infections. This study indicates that it may be feasible to track *P. aeruginosa* chronic lung infections by measuring changes to the infection volatilome, and lays the groundwork for exploring the translatability of this approach to direct measurement using patient breath.

**KEYWORDS**

**RUNNING TITLE**

*P. aeruginosa* cystic fibrosis volatilome

## INTRODUCTION

Cystic fibrosis (CF) is an autosomal recessive disease caused by a mutation in the CFTR protein that regulates ion transport across epithelia. In the lungs, reduced or lost CFTR function leads to defective mucociliary transport, which facilitates infection and colonization by a plethora of microorganisms (1). *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* is one of the most prevalent lung pathogens in CF – especially after adolescence (2) – and is able to establish chronic infections that can last for years to decades (3, 4). *P. aeruginosa* lung infection is associated with more rapid lung function decline, increased risk of hospitalization, and increased risk of death (5, 6). Significant clinical efforts are therefore aimed at diagnosing and treating new infections to delay the onset of chronic infection (7). As *P. aeruginosa* transitions from an acute infection to chronicity, it undergoes a variety of genotypic, phenotypic, and metabolic changes (8, 9). It has been well-established that several phenotypes are correlated with chronic infection, including reduced motility and increased mucoidy, antibiotic resistance, and biofilm formation (9-11), and some of these phenotypes are also correlated with poorer patient outcomes (6, 12, 13). In light of this, *P. aeruginosa* phenotypes could be used to evaluate infection stage, CF disease progression, and patient morbidity risk (10, 12, 14, 15). Poor access to infection sites in the lower airways, however, delays the detection of new *P. aeruginosa* infections and reduces the feasibility and accuracy of disease state tracking via bacterial phenotypes, whether by culture-dependent or culture-independent methods (16).

We are developing breath-based diagnostics to detect new *P. aeruginosa* infections and track chronic infection phenotypes in the CF lung. Breath consists of thousands of volatile organic compounds containing a wealth of information about human health and disease (17, 18), and is being leveraged for the development of diagnostics for wide-ranging conditions (19, 20). In the context of chronic lung infections, breath-based diagnostics possess significant advantages over other diagnostic modalities. First, breath provides a non-invasive way of sampling the entire ventilated lung, a limitation of both sputum and bronchoalveolar lavage fluid

that leads to delayed diagnosis of new infections, or the detection of infection phenotype

changes (16, 21-24). Second, breath sampling captures metabolic information about the

pathogens *in situ*, eliminating the need for microbial enrichment steps and speeding the time-to-

diagnosis by days to weeks (25, 26). Additionally, *in situ* metabolic measurements provide

information on the physiology of the pathogens in the context of disease versus the context of

the lab. We propose that a breath-based diagnostic can be created for detecting and tracking

CF *P. aeruginosa* lung infections by correlating the microbial genotypic and phenotypic changes

that occur during chronic infections to changes in the infection volatile metabolome, or

"volatilome".

In order to develop a set of biomarkers for diagnosing and tracking *P. aeruginosa* lung

infections in CF, we must consider the genomic, phenomic, and volatilomic diversity of the

species, and how that diversity may be altered via adaptation to the CF lung environment. A

recent effort to sequence more than 1300 *P. aeruginosa* isolates demonstrates that the

genomes are highly flexible, with only 1% of the pan-genome conserved across all isolates (27).

An untargeted analysis of the volatile metabolites produced *in vitro* by 24 *P. aeruginosa* clinical

isolates shows that the volatilomes are also diverse, with 18% of the pan-volatilome conserved

in this comparatively small study (28). In the context of CF, most early *P. aeruginosa* infections

in young patients are caused by unique strains that come from the patients' environments (29-

32). We therefore expect the volatilomes early in infection to have high inter-patient dissimilarity,

reflecting the genomic diversity of *P. aeruginosa* CF isolates (3, 33-35), and to be chemically

diverse (*i.e.*, volatiles from a wide range of chemical classes). Once chronic infections are

established, however, the "founder" *P. aeruginosa* strain evolves into a population of clonal sub-

strains (3, 8, 36-40), many of which harbor CF-typical loss-of-function mutations in regulatory

genes and sigma factors (*e.g.*, *lasR* and *mucA*) (3, 41, 42). From this, we posit that the size of

the *P. aeruginosa* volatilome will shrink during chronic infection, with a concomitant decrease in

chemical diversity and a reduction in inter-patient dissimilarity.

To build a foundation for using volatilomes to diagnose and track *P. aeruginosa* CF lung

infections, we explored how the *in vitro* volatilome of *P. aeruginosa* CF isolates change over the

course of chronic infection. We used comprehensive two-dimensional gas chromatography

coupled with time-of-flight mass spectrometry (GC×GC-TOFMS) to characterize the volatilomes

of 81 *P. aeruginosa* isolates from early and late chronic CF lung infections from 17 persons with

CF. Using an untargeted metabolomics approach, we characterized the size and chemical

composition of the CF *P. aeruginosa* volatilome, and identified core volatiles that would be a

primary source of breath biomarkers for diagnosing infections. We also investigated how the *P.*

*aeruginosa* volatilome is shaped by the CF lung environment, characterizing changes in

volatilome sizes and compositions over time, and how these changes relate to intra-patient and

inter-patient volatilome dissimilarities.

**METHODS**

**Bacterial isolates**

Eighty one *P. aeruginosa* isolates from 17 individuals with CF were acquired from the Cystic

Fibrosis Isolate Core at Seattle Children's Hospital. From the majority of patients we obtained

three isolates: one early isolate, defined as the first cultured *P. aeruginosa* isolate, and two late

isolates collected a minimum of five years after the first isolate. For one patient (Patient 23), 32

additional isolates were collected at intervals over 7.5 years between the collections of the early

and two late isolates. For one patient, only one isolate was included in this study. We quantified

five phenotypes that are correlated with chronic infections: proteases, pyocyanin, rhamnolipids,

twitching motility, and mucoidy, using published methods (see Supplementary Information for

phenotype characterization methods). Twenty pairs of isolates (one Early and one Late) from

ten patients were selected for additional statistical analyses, described below, based on

changes to their phenotypes during chronic infections.

**Sample preparation**

Isolates were cultured as previously described (43). Briefly, isolates were cultured aerobically for 16 h at 37 °C in 5 mL of LB Lennox (LB) broth, and then diluted 1000-fold into 25 mL of fresh LB and grown for 24 h under the same conditions. For metabolomics analyses, cells were removed via centrifugation through a 0.2 $\mu$m filter and 2 mL of each filtrate was transferred to a 10 mL GC headspace vial with screw caps. Samples were prepared in biological triplicate, with LB media controls prepared in parallel, and stored at -20 °C prior to analysis.

**GC×GC analysis and data processing**

Culture filtrates were thawed and maintained at 4 °C until analyzed, as previously described (43). Headspace volatiles were characterized using a Pegasus® 4D GC×GC-TOFMS (Leco® Corporation, St. Joseph, MI) equipped with a MPS Pro® rail autosampler (Gerstel® Inc, Linthicum Heights, MD). Column set configuration, and GC×GC, MS, and data processing method parameters are previously reported (43), and summarized in Supplementary Table 1a-d.

Data processing steps are outlined in Fig. S1. Chromatographic artifacts and suspected contaminants based on peak names were removed (Supplementary Table 2), as well as peaks eluting prior to 358 s (acetone retention time) in the first dimension. Missing values were handled as follows: if detected in one of three replicates, the measured value was permuted to 0; if detected in two of three replicates, the missing value was imputed as half of the minimum detected value for that compound across all samples.

Probabilistic quotient normalization (PQN) was applied to account for differences in peak abundance due to variations in culture cell density, followed by a $\log_{10}$ transformation (44). Peaks were further filtered out based on the following criteria: (1) within-triplicate intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC) < 0.75 (definition: absolute agreement; model: two-way mixed

effects; type: mean of *k* measurements) (45); and (2) only detected in sterile media, or not

significantly greater in abundance compared to sterile media using the Wilcoxon rank-sum test

with Benjamini-Hochberg adjustment (significance threshold of 0.05) (46).

For statistical analyses beyond the reporting of detected peaks, peaks that showed

significant correlations to run order were identified using Kendall's tau with Benjamini-Hochberg

adjustment (-0.6 ≤ τ ≥ 0.6, significance threshold of 0.05) and removed. Principal component

analysis (PCA) revealed an apparent batch effect that was attributed to, at least in part, a non-

biological phenomenon and was described previously (43). This batch effect was corrected

using an empirical Bayes approach (47). The geometric means of triplicates of the batch-

corrected data were used for further statistical analyses. For analysis of the ten paired early and

late chronic infection isolates, batch-corrected data was not used as all of these isolates were

contained within the same batch.

Peaks were putatively identified using published reporting standards (48). Level 2

identifications were determined based on the following criteria: (1) ≥ 80% mass spectral forward

match using the NIST 2011 library; (2a) first dimension retention times that possess a strong

linear fit with carbon number in homologous series ($r^2$ ≥ 0.995, for the identification of select 2-,

3-, and 4-ketones), or (2b) experimentally determined linear retention indices (LRI) consistent

with published LRIs, as determined by the following acceptance criteria based on the

differences between experimental and published non-polar and polar column RIs for Grob's test

mix:

$$\left( \frac{\mathrm{RI}_{\mathrm{experimental}} - \mathrm{RI}_{\mathrm{non-polar}}}{\mathrm{RI}_{\mathrm{polar}} - \mathrm{RI}_{\mathrm{non-polar}}} \right) \times 100 = 0 - 43\%$$

Level 3 identifications were based on at least an 80% mass spectral forward match score. Level

4 identifications are those that meet none of the above-mentioned criteria.

**Statistical analyses**

Volatile compounds that were detected in at least 95% of all samples were classified as "core"

volatiles. Significant differences between inter-isolate phenotypes were tested using the

Wilcoxon signed-rank test (significance threshold of 0.05). The relatedness of isolates based on

their volatile metabolomes were assessed using agglomerative hierarchical clustering analysis

(HCA), non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS), and permutational multivariate analysis of

variances (PERMANOVA) on the Euclidean distances between isolates. Linear regression and

Pearson's correlation of Euclidean distances of Patient 23 isolates were used to assess intra-

patient isolate dissimilarity over time. All statistical analyses were performed using R version

3.3.2 (The R Foundation for Statistical Computing); information regarding the R packages used

are in Supplementary Table 3.

**Data availability**

Metabolomic data (chemical feature peak areas and retention time information) included in this

study will be made available at the NIH Common Fund's National Metabolomics Data

Repository (NMDR) website, the Metabolomics Workbench, at

www.metabolomicsworkbench.org.

**RESULTS**

**Characteristics of *P. aeruginosa* CF isolates**

We obtained from a biorepository 81 *P. aeruginosa* chronic infection isolates, which had been

collected from 17 individuals with CF. From 16 patients, three *P. aeruginosa* isolates were

obtained: one isolate that was the first cultured *P. aeruginosa*, and two isolates that were

collected at least five years after the first. We refer to these isolates as Early and Late,

respectively. For one patient (Patient 75), four isolates were collected: two Early isolates

collected one month apart and two Late isolates, collected ten and 16 years after the first. For

one patient (Patient 23), 32 additional isolates were collected over the course of a 7.5 y infection

period, which we have termed Intermediate isolates. For one patient, only one isolate was

collected. All of these isolates were genetically characterized in a study by Smith *et al*., who

determined that the intra-patient replicate isolates are all clonally related, with the exception of

the four isolates from patient 75, which are actually two clonally-related Early/Late pairs

(isolates 75E-1 and 75L-2 are clonal, and isolates 75E-2 and 75L-1 are clonal) (3).

For all isolates, we characterized five clinically relevant phenotypes *in vitro*: mucoidy,

pyocyanin production, rhamnolipids production, protease production, and twitching motility (Fig.

1; Supplementary Table 4). These phenotypes are commonly altered during the course of

chronic CF lung infections (15). There were wide ranges in the expression of these phenotypes

across all isolates, as expected. Several isolate sets exhibited phenotypes consistent with age

of collection in that Early isolates possessed higher degrees of motility, higher quantities of

pyocyanin, rhamnolipids, and proteases (indicating intact quorum regulation), and lower

mucoidy compared to their cognate Late isolates (*e.g*., Patients 23, 31, 33, 36, and 76). The

associations between relative patient age at isolate collection and *P. aeruginosa* phenotypes

were not perfect, however. For example, Early isolate 62E had no detectable pyocyanin,

proteases, rhamnolipids, or twitching motility, and many of the Late isolates retained more early-

like phenotypes (e.g., both Late isolates of 41, 66, 71, 75, and 101, and 60L-1, 74L-2, and 100L-

2). Despite observable changes in isolate phenotype within patient, no phenotypes were

significantly different when comparing Late isolate(s) to the Early isolate. Collectively, the 81

isolates were highly varied, and represented the array of phenotypes we expect to observe in

the span of *P. aeruginosa* CF lung infections from initial infection to long-established chronic

infections.

**FIG 1** Relative phenotype expression of 81 *P. aeruginosa* CF chronic lung infection isolates.

Score represents the sum of pyocyanin, proteases, rhamnolipids, twitching, and mucoidy. Each

phenotype was independently standardized.

**The *in vitro* volatile metabolome of *P. aeruginosa* CF isolates**

Taking an untargeted metabolomics approach, we cultured the clinical *P. aeruginosa* isolates *in*

*vitro* and characterized their volatile metabolomes using GC×GC-TOFMS. Following extensive

data processing, including removal of analytically biased chromatographic features, we

conservatively attribute 539 non-redundant volatile compounds to the growth and metabolism of

the *P. aeruginosa* isolates (Supplementary Table 5). Among these, 69 compounds are shared

by at least 95% ($n \geq 77$) of the isolates, representing core volatiles. Using minimum

metabolomics reporting standards, we assigned compound identification levels 1-4 (1 high, with

2 being the highest in this study) based on a combination of mass spectral and chromatographic

characteristics. We were able to assign putative names to 14 core and 33 non-core compounds

with an ID level 2, many of which have been previously reported as *P. aeruginosa* volatiles

(Table 1). While we detected 2-aminoacetophonone (the volatile compound responsible for the

grape-like odor of *P. aeruginosa*), it possessed an intraclass correlation slightly lower than the

applied threshold of 0.75 and was ultimately filtered out of our peak list. We also identified

several compounds of a variety of chemical classes that have not been previously reported for

*P. aeruginosa*, including: alcohols (3-methyl-1-buten-1-ol, 1-butoxy-2-propanol, 2-butyl-1-

octanol), esters (butanoic acids, methyl isovalerate), aromatics (tetrahydrofuran,

tetramethylpyrazine, 2-butylfuran, 3-cyano-2,5-dimethylpyrazine, 2,4-(1,1-dimethyl)-phenol),

unsaturated ketones (acetoin, 4-undecanone, 1-octen-3-one, 3-penten-2-one, 6-methyl-2-

heptanone, 1-(4-ethylphenyl)-ethanone), and an aldehyde (decanal).

**Table 1** Putatively identified volatile compounds metabolized by *P. aeruginosa* CF isolates.

| Compound Name[†] | Formula | Chemical Class | Samples (*n* = 81) |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Core volatile compounds*** | | | |
| **3-methylbutanal** | $C_5H_{10}O$ | ALD | 79 |
| thiocyanic acid, methyl ester | $C_2H_3NS$ | EST | 77 |
| 3-methyl-1-butanol | $C_5H_{12}O$ | ALC | 77 |
| **pyridine** | $C_5H_5N$ | ARO | 77 |
| **3-penten-2-one** | $C_5H_8O$ | KET | 77 |
| **3-methyl-1-buten-1-ol** | $C_5H_{10}O$ | ALC | 78 |
| 4-methyl-3-penten-2-one | $C_6H_{10}O$ | KET | 81 |
| hexanal | $C_6H_{12}O$ | ALD | 81 |
| **heptanal** | $C_7H_{14}O$ | ALD | 80 |
| 2,5-dimethylpyrazine | $C_6H_8N_2$ | ARO | 81 |
| 2-nonanone | $C_9H_{18}O$ | KET | 81 |
| **4-ethyl-1,2-dimethylbenzene** | $C_{10}H_{14}$ | ARO | 77 |
| **1,3,3-trimethyl-(bicyclo)-heptan-2-ol** | $C_{10}H_{18}O$ | ALC | 78 |
| **1-(4-ethylphenyl)-ethanone** | $C_{10}H_{12}O$ | KET | 79 |
| ***Non-core volatile compounds*** | | | |
| dimethyl sulfide | $C_2H_6S$ | OTH | 29 |
| **2-methyl-3-buten-2-ol** | $C_5H_{10}O$ | ALC | 35 |
| 2-butanone | $C_4H_8O$ | KET | 1 |
| **tetrahydrofuran** | $C_4H_8O$ | ARO | 1 |
| acetic acid | $C_2H_4O_2$ | CA | 55 |
| methyl thiolacetate | $C_3H_6OS$ | THI | 3 |
| 2,4-dimethylfuran | $C_6H_8O$ | ARO | 66 |
| **butanoic acid, methyl ester** | $C_5H_{10}O_2$ | EST | 3 |
| **3-hydroxybutan-2-one** | $C_4H_8O_2$ | KET | 18 |
| dimethyl disulfide | $C_2H_2S_2$ | OTH | 1 |
| **2-methyl-butanoic acid, methyl ester** | $C_6H_{12}O_2$ | EST | 3 |
| Compound Name[†] | Formula | Chemical Class | Samples (*n* = 81) |
| **3-methyl-butanoic acid, methyl ester** | $C_6H_{12}O_2$ | EST | 3 |
| furfural | $C_5H_4O_2$ | ARO | 67 |
| **2-butylfuran** | $C_8H_{12}O$ | ARO | 6 |
| 2-hexen-1-ol | $C_6H_{12}O$ | ALC | 51 |
| **1-butoxy-2-propanol** | $C_7H_{16}O_2$ | ALC | 61 |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| **6-methyl-2-heptanone** | $C_8H_{16}O$ | KET | 33 |
| **1-methylethylbenzene** | $C_9H_{12}$ | ARO | 57 |
| 3-octanone | $C_8H_{16}O$ | KET | 56 |
| **4,6-dimethyl-2-heptanone** | $C_9H_{18}O$ | KET | 47 |
| **2-ethyl-5-methylpyrazine** | $C_7H_{10}N_2$ | ARO | 58 |
| 4-nonanone | $C_9H_{18}O$ | KET | 49 |
| **tetramethylpyrazine** | $C_8H_{12}N_2$ | ARO | 5 |
| 2-octenal | $C_8H_{14}O$ | ALD | 48 |
| octanenitrile | $C_8H_{15}N$ | OTH | 73 |
| 2,4-octadienal | $C_8H_{12}O$ | ALD | 9 |
| 3-decanone | $C_{10}H_{20}O$ | KET | 41 |
| **decanal** | $C_{10}H_{20}O$ | ALD | 65 |
| 2-decanone | $C_{10}H_{20}O$ | KET | 13 |
| **4-undecanone** | $C_{11}H_{22}O$ | KET | 30 |
| 2-dodecanone | $C_{12}H_{24}O$ | KET | 18 |
| **2-butyl-1-octanol** | $C_{12}H_{26}O$ | ALC | 48 |
| **2,4-bis(1,1-dimethyl)-phenol** | $C_{14}H_{22}O$ | ARO | 26 |

†Bolded compounds have not been previously reported as *P. aeruginosa* volatile compounds.

ALC = alcohol, ALD = aldehyde, ARO = aromatic, CA = carboxylic acid, EST = ester, HC =

hydrocarbon, KET = ketone, THI = thiol, OTH = other.

Chemical classifications were assigned to ID level 2 and 3 compounds (187 compounds)

using mass spectral match and retention time characteristics (Fig. 2; Fig. S2). Among Level 2

and 3 core volatiles, the majority of classified compounds were hydrocarbons (41%), followed

by ketones (16%). Other oxidized compounds, including alcohols, aromatics, acids, and thiols,

accounted for an additional 43%. The non-core volatiles had similar chemical compositions,

which are consistent with previous studies of the *P. aeruginosa* volatilome (25, 49-52). Of the

entire volatilome, 65% of the volatiles ($n$ = 352) possessed less than an 80% mass spectral

match to the 2011 NIST MS library, and as such were classified as unknowns (Fig. S2).

**FIG 2** Size and chemical composition of the volatilome produced by 81 *P. aeruginosa* chronic

infection CF isolates, with unknown compounds excluded (Supplementary Figure 2 includes

unknowns). C = Core compounds, detected in at least 95% of samples; NC = Non-core

compounds; C+NC = sum of Core and Non-core compounds. ALC = alcohols, ALD =

aldehydes, ARO = aromatics, CA/EST = carboxylic acids and esters, HC = hydrocarbons, KET

= ketones, THI = thiols, OTH = other compounds.

**Relationships in the *P. aeruginosa* CF volatilome within and between patients**

Because every patient is infected by a genetically-unique strain, we hypothesized that the

dissimilarities of intra-patient volatilomes would be lower than inter-patient. Additionally, due to

the greater metabolic potential of early-infection isolates with intact regulatory networks, we

hypothesized that the volatilomes of inter-patient Early isolates would be more dissimilar than

those of inter-patient Late isolates. We calculated the pairwise Euclidean distances as a

measure of dissimilarity between all early isolate volatilomes ("inter-Early dissimilarity"), all late

isolate volatilomes ("inter-Late dissimilarity"), and between early and late isolate volatilomes

from the same patient ("intra-patient dissimilarity"). Interestingly, the inter-Early isolate

dissimilarity was the lowest (mean 35.2, median 33.8) and the inter-Late isolate dissimilarity was

the highest (mean 39.1, median 39.1), and these differences were significant ($P < 0.001$) (Fig.

3). Even more intriguing was that the inter-Early dissimilarity was lower than even the intra-

patient dissimilarity, though this difference was not significant ($P = 0.13$). For comparison, we

also calculated the pairwise Euclidean distances of all isolates in this study (Pooled; mean 38.0,

median 37.9); the mean inter-Early dissimilarity was also significantly lower than the mean

dissimilarity of the Pooled isolates ($P < 0.001$).

**FIG 3** Violin plots and box plots of pairwise dissimilarities (defined as Euclidean distance) of *P.*

*aeruginosa* chronic infection isolate volatilomes. Inter-Early are inter-patient Early-Early isolate

dissimilarities. Inter-Late are inter-patient Late-Late isolate dissimilarities. Intra-Patient are intra-

patient Early-Late isolate dissimilarities. Pooled represents all pairwise volatilome dissimilarities.

Red circles indicate the mean.

302            Visualizing the Euclidean distances between isolate volatilomes via non-metric

multidimensional scaling (NMDS) and ordered dissimilarity images (ODI), we looked for

clustering of clonal isolates, indicating intra-patient similarities. The NMDS and ODI of the

Euclidean distances of all 81 isolate volatilomes show a primary cluster comprised mostly of

intermediate isolates of Patient 23 (Fig. S3, Fig. S4). To reduce the influence of the over-

represented Patient 23 isolates in data visualization, we truncated our data set to 48 isolates by

removing the Intermediate isolates of Patient 23. The ODI plot and NMDS of the truncated set

revealed three clusters of similarity, none of which include all isolates from a single patient (Fig.

4; Fig. S5a). This refutes our hypothesis that isolates from the same patient maintain a similar

volatilome over time. To determine if any inter-patient or intra-patient isolate pairs are

significantly different, we performed permutational multivariate analysis of variance

(PERMANOVA) on the Euclidean distances for all possible pairs. Following Benjamini-Hochberg

adjustment of $P$ values, no pairs of isolates were identified as having significantly different

volatilomes ($P_{adj} \geq 0.1$ for all isolate pairs). However, PERMANOVA conducted on all isolates

indicated strong significant differences between the 81 volatilomes ($pseudo\text{-}F_{80,161} = 28.0$, $P <$

$0.01$), as well as between the volatilomes of the truncated set of 49 isolates ($pseudo\text{-}F_{47,96} =$

$29.2$, $P < 0.001$), reinforcing the inference from the ODI and NMDS that the CF *P. aeruginosa*

volatilome is heterogeneous.

**FIG 4** Ordered dissimilarity image (ODI) of the truncated set of 48 *P. aeruginosa* clinical isolates

depicting volatilome dissimilarity defined by Euclidean distance.

Though we do not find that patient isolates maintain similar volatilomes over the duration

of chronic infection, it is noteworthy that the majority of Patient 23's isolates have strong

similarities (Fig. S3, Fig. S4). Taking a closer look at the 35 isolates from Patient 23 (Fig. 5; Fig.

S6), the ODI and NMDS revealed four distinct similarity neighborhoods: one neighborhood

consisting of only the Early isolate 23E, which stands alone; a second consisting of the four

latest-collected isolates 23I-32, 23I-33, 23L-1, 23L-2; a third consisting of isolates 23I-7, 23I-9,

23I-12, 23I-14, 23I-29; and a fourth encompassing the remainder of the isolates. The four latest-

collected isolates are less defined by their similarity to each other than their dissimilarity to all

other isolates collected during the infection. A linear regression of the Euclidean distances

between the Early isolate and the Intermediate and Late isolates as a function of patient age

showed that isolates became increasingly dissimilar to the Early isolate over time (Pearson's r =

0.70, *P* < 0.001) (Fig. 6). These observations are underpinned by the phenotypic differences of

the four latest isolates, and the number and types of known mutations that were accumulated in

the 23L versus 23E isolates (3). As described by Smith *et al*., the *P. aeruginosa* infection

sampled from Patient 23 (referred to as Patient 1 in the referenced publication) diversified from

patient ages 1.5 to 3 y into a population of isolates, with gene mutations in virulence, motility,

quorum sensing, iron transport, efflux, and transcription and translation genes. The volatilome

dissimilarities we measured reflect the genotypic diversification of the infection as a function of

time (Fig. 6).

**FIG 5** Ordered dissimilarity image (ODI) of the 35 *P. aeruginosa* clinical isolates from Patient 23

depicting volatilome dissimilarity defined by Euclidean distance. For visual clarity, the isolate

labels do not include patient number (*e.g.*, 23)

**FIG 6** Dissimilarity of Patient 23 volatilomes over time, defined as Euclidian distance from the

Early isolate (not shown). For visual clarity, the isolate labels do not include patient number

(*e.g.*, 23) and intermediate isolate labels have been truncated to only include the numeral that

signifies collection order (*e.g.*, I-1 is represented as 1). The shade of the isolate labels depict the

relative phenotype Score (Fig. 1). The black line represents the linear regression fit, and the

shaded region represents the standard error of the regression line.

**Chemical characteristics of the volatilomes of Early and Late isolates**

We compared the chemical characteristics of the Early and Late volatile metabolomes, positing

that the size and chemical diversity of the volatilomes would decrease from Early to Late

infection due to loss-of-function mutations. To perform the comparison, we needed to balance

the size of the isolate groups, and did so by selecting ten pairs of *P. aeruginosa* isolates that

had large changes in phenotypes over the duration of infection, thereby enhancing the

differences we may find in the Early vs. Late volatilomes (Fig. 1; Supplementary Table 4). Visual

inspection of the ten pairs of GC×GC chromatograms suggests reductions in the number and

variety of volatile compounds produced by Late isolates (Fig. 7, Fig. S7). Contrary to the

appearance of the chromatograms, however, the overall size and chemical compositions of the

Early and Late volatilomes were similar to each other (Fig. S8), with hydrocarbons representing

approximately 50% and alcohols and ketones together representing approximately 30% of the

410 Early and 441 Late volatiles. We quantified the chemical richness and diversity of the

pooled Early and pooled Late isolates using the Shannon-Wiener diversity index

(Supplementary Table 6) and found the volatilomes of Early and Late isolates were similar,

whether using all volatiles or only the non-core volatiles.

The uniformity in the Early versus Late volatilomes is not a function of data aggregation,

as the volatilomes of the individual isolates are highly similar in number and chemical

composition, with the exception of one Late isolate (76L) that has a slow-growth phenotype (Fig.

S9). Furthermore, when looking at individual isolate pairs, for the vast majority there were no

differences in the richness and diversity of their volatilomes (Supplementary Table 6). Together,

these results suggest that there are not major differences between the number and diversity of

chemical compounds when comparing Early and Late infection isolates. Hierarchical clustering

analysis (HCA) of the *P. aeruginosa* isolates by their volatilomes underscores this observation;

we observed no discernible clustering of the Early versus Late isolates based on the presence

and absence of volatiles (Fig. S10).

**FIG 7** Representative GC×GC chromatograms of Early (top) and Late (bottom) chronic infection

isolates (Patient 41). Dark blue represents the baseline, and peak intensity is depicted using a

color gradient from light blue (low) to dark red (high). Chromatographic regions of $^1t_R < 200$ s

and $^2t_R < 0.5$ s were excluded for visual clarity. All chromatograms for the ten selected Early and

Late isolate pairs are provided in Fig. S7.

**Abundance of volatile compounds in Early and Late isolates**

Though we did not observe any differences in the Early and Late isolate volatilomes based on

presence and absence of metabolites, the chromatograms suggest a reduced volatilome in late

infection. We therefore posited that while the numbers of volatiles do not significantly change

from Early to Late infection isolates, the relative concentrations of volatiles do. Using volatile

abundances, we performed HCA on the 20 selected Early and Late isolates and found modest

clustering by the time of isolate collection (Fig. S11). We were interested in whether or not

clustering still occurs in the larger, less curated set of 48 isolates (*i.e.*, the truncated set), which

has more discordance between phenotype and time of collection (Fig. 1). HCA of the truncated

set of isolates shows that Early isolates are generally more similar to one another than Late

isolates are (Fig. 8), reinforcing observations made by calculating Euclidean distances;

however, significant proportions of the Early and the Late isolates are mis-clustered.

Interestingly, the majority of the Late isolates clustering with the Early isolates in the upper clade

have more early-like phenotypes, and several Early isolates that have more late-like phenotypes

(*e.g.*, 62E, 73E, 70E) cluster in the lower clade with Late isolates, indicating a relationship

between the isolate phenomes and volatilomes. We also observed clustering by phenotype

when the volatilomes of all 81 isolates were analyzed (Fig. S12), and this was seen in the set of

ten paired isolates as well. Similar phenomena are observed when clustering the truncated set

or all 81 isolates by the core volatilome (Fig. S13, Fig. S14), and even when using only the 23

core alcohols, aldehydes, and hydrocarbons (Fig. 9 and Fig. S15), suggesting that a set of

conserved volatiles could be identified and used as biomarkers for detecting phenotypic

changes in chronic infections.

**FIG 8** Hierarchical clustering analysis (HCA) of the truncated set of 48 *P. aeruginosa* clinical CF

isolates, based on the relative abundance of 539 volatile compounds. Volatiles are in columns

(standardized relative abundance). Clustering is based on rows (isolates), which are color-

coded by their phenotype score (left color block) and relative time of collection (right color

block). ALC = alcohols, ALD = aldehydes, ARO = aromatics, CA/EST = carboxylic acids and

esters, HC = hydrocarbons, KET = ketones, THI = thiols, OTH = other compounds, UNK =

unknown identity.

**FIG 9** Hierarchical clustering analysis (HCA) of the truncated set of 48 *P. aeruginosa* clinical CF

isolates, based on the relative abundance of 23 core alcohols, aldehydes, and hydrocarbons.

Volatiles are in columns (standardized relative abundance). Clustering is based on rows

(isolates), which are color-coded by their phenotype score (left color block) and relative time of

collection (right color block). ALC = alcohols, ALD = aldehydes, HC = hydrocarbons.

**DISCUSSION**

**DISCUSSION**

*P. aeruginosa* isolates from cystic fibrosis lung infections have a large and diverse

volatilome. We conservatively attribute 539 detected volatiles to *P. aeruginosa* growth and

metabolism, only 13% of which were core volatiles. For volatiles that we could assign to a

chemical class, hydrocarbons represented the highest proportion, followed by ketones, which

we observed both over the pan-volatilome and for individual patient isolates. The chemical

compositions are similar to previous volatilome studies of *P. aeruginosa* (49-52), and many of

the volatiles we detected have been frequently reported in other studies (*e.g.*, 2-butanone, 2-

nonanone, dimethyl sulfide, dimethyl disulfide). Only just over 40% of the core volatiles have

been identified in other *P. aeruginosa* metabolomic studies, suggesting that a CF-specific *P.*

*aeruginosa* volatilome is unlikely. However, due to the inter-strain variation in the *P. aeruginosa*

volatilome, many more CF and non-CF isolates will need to be characterized to test this

hypothesis.

Despite the trend toward reduced or loss-of-phenotype expression in late infection

isolates, which we hypothesized would correspond to a reduced metabolome size, we observed

that Late isolates produce the same number and variety of volatile compounds as Early isolates.

However, the relative abundance of volatiles produced by the Late isolates is significantly

reduced. Our data suggest that mutations that arise in *P. aeruginosa* chronic infection isolates

do not result in complete inhibition of metabolic pathways, but may instead reduce metabolic

flux. This observation has implications for diagnostics, signifying that presence and absence of

*P. aeruginosa* volatile metabolites would provide little diagnostic value for tracking chronic lung

infections. Rather, a breath-based diagnostic for monitoring *P. aeruginosa* adaptations in CF will

likely need to measure the relative abundance of metabolites, particularly in relation to a

baseline. Importantly, a subset of core volatiles can be used to cluster isolates based on

commonalities in phenotypes, indicating that a diagnostic based upon the relative abundances

of conserved hydrocarbons, alcohols, and aldehydes (or a few selected volatiles from these

classes) may be sufficient to track *P. aeruginosa* infection in most patients.

452            Based on the genomic heterogeneity of *P. aeruginosa* (3, 33-35), we hypothesized that

every patient would have a unique *P. aeruginosa* volatilome, and that intra-patient isolates

would have more similar volatilomes than inter-patient isolates. To the contrary, we observed

that the volatilomes of isolates from a single patient are no more similar to one another than

they are to any other isolate (intra-patient vs. pooled data, Fig. 3). Interestingly, the volatilomes

of inter-patient Early isolates are even more similar than intra-patient isolates, while the

volatilomes of inter-patient Late isolates have the highest dissimilarity. These data indicate that

the genomic similarity within patient is less influential on the volatilome than the post-

transcriptional diversity that evolves within a chronic *P. aeruginosa* infection population. The

data from Patient 23, however, suggest that intra-patient isolates are more likely to have similar

volatilomes when there are fewer mutational and phenotypic differences between them. From

these results, we propose that a breath-based diagnostic to track *P. aeruginosa* chronic lung

infections would be personalized, with each patient's breathprint at initial infection serving as a

baseline to which subsequent breathprints are compared. Sustained, significant deviations from

the baseline breathprint would indicate that the *P. aeruginosa* population phenotype has

changed, and therefore the patient may be at higher risk for associated poor clinical outcomes

(*e.g.*, higher risk of exacerbation) (15) and at higher risk of infection eradication failure after

antibiotic treatment (12). In a longitudinal case study of a single CF patient, we have shown that

changes in the dominant species colonizing the lung correlate to changes in the volatile

metabolites detected in sputum (53), and therefore monitoring for breathprint deviations may

also work for *P. aeruginosa* infections. Despite this, the issue of specificity becomes a concern

unless biomarkers for individual *P. aeruginosa* phenotypes are identified and used for tracking;

this is the subject of ongoing work.

Current methods for tracking *P. aeruginosa* lung infection progression are predominantly

culture-based (16, 21), and our results suggest a potential role for *in vitro* volatile metabolomics

in staging chronic infections in conjunction with established clinical laboratory methods. The

clinically-correlated *P. aeruginosa* phenotypes we measured in this study – mucoidy, motility,

and quorum-regulated traits – are sensitive to environment (54-57); as such, the metabolomes

we characterized from *in vitro* cultures are unlikely to directly reflect the metabolomes these

isolates produced in the CF lung. For the development of a breath test for tracking infections *in*

*situ*, it will be necessary to utilize culture models that are more reflective of the lung (58-61) and

to collect *ex vivo* and *in vivo* infection volatilomes (25, 62, 63). The utility of breath for tracking

chronic lung infections is being demonstrated in tuberculosis lung infection models (26), and

therefore we anticipate that the development of a breath-based diagnostic for tracking *P.*

*aeruginosa* chronic lung infections is feasible. Despite the limitations of *in vitro* analyses, this

study presents the first comprehensive analysis of the *P. aeruginosa* volatilome from chronic CF

lung infections, and lays the groundwork for the application of volatile metabolomics in tracking

CF lung disease.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Funding to support this work was provided by the Cystic Fibrosis Foundation (Hill17P0,

Hill18A0-CI), the National Institutes of Health (R56HL139846), and the ASU School of Life

Sciences Undergraduate Research (SOLUR) program. Isolates were obtained from the Cystic

Fibrosis Isolate Core at Seattle Children's Research Institute, funded by the National Institutes

of Health (P30 DK089507) and the Cystic Fibrosis Foundation (HOFFMA20Y2-OUT).

**AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

HB conceived of the study; HB, TD designed the experiments; AK, CB, SW, and TD collected

phenotype data; TD collected metabolomics data; TD and MR processed and analyzed the

metabolomics data; HB and TD wrote and edited the manuscript; all authors approved the final

version.

**CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or

financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**REFERENCES**

1.    Gibson RL, Burns JL, Ramsey BW. 2003. Pathophysiology and management of

pulmonary infections in cystic fibrosis. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 168:918-951.

2.    Marshall B, Faro A, Fink A, Loeffler D, Elbert A, O'Neil T, Rush T, Rizvi S. 2018. Cystic

Fibrosis Foundation patient registry: 2017 annual data report.  Cystic Fibrosis

Foundation, Foundation CF, Bethesda, MD.

3.    Smith EE, Buckley DG, Wu ZN, Saenphimmachak C, Hoffman LR, D'Argenio DA, Miller

SI, Ramsey BW, Speert DP, Moskowitz SM, Burns JL, Kaul R, Olson MV. 2006. Genetic

adaptation by *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* to the airways of cystic fibrosis patients. Proc

Natl Acad Sci U S A 103:8487-8492.

4.    Li ZH, Kosorok MR, Farrell PM, Laxova A, West SEH, Green CG, Collins J, Rock MJ,

Splaingard ML. 2005. Longitudinal development of mucoid *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

infection and lung disease progression in children with cystic fibrosis. JAMA 293:581-

588.

5.    Emerson J, Rosenfeld M, McNamara S, Ramsey B, Gibson RL. 2002. *Pseudomonas*

*aeruginosa* and other predictors of mortality and morbidity in young children with cystic

fibrosis. Pediatr Pulmonol 34:91-100.

6.  Kosorok MR, Zeng L, West SEH, Rock MJ, Splaingard ML, Laxova A, Green CG, Collins
J, Farrell PM. 2001. Acceleration of lung disease in children with cystic fibrosis after
*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* acquisition. Pediatr Pulmonol 32:277-287.

7.  Davidson AG, Chilvers MA, Lillquist YP. 2012. Effects of a *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*
eradication policy in a cystic fibrosis clinic. Curr Opin Pulm Med 18:615-21.

8.  Winstanley C, O'Brien S, Brockhurst MA. 2016. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* evolutionary
adaptation and diversification in cystic fibrosis chronic lung infections. Trends Microbiol
24:327-337.

9.  Hogardt M, Heesemann J. 2013. Microevolution of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* to a
chronic pathogen of the cystic fibrosis lung, p 91-118. *In* Dobrindt U, Hacker JH,
Svanborg C (ed), Between pathogenicity and commensalism, vol 358. Springer-Verlag
Berlin, Berlin.

10. Sanders DB. 2014. Phenotypes that matter: *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and progression
of cystic fibrosis lung disease. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 190:245-246.

11. Pritt B, O'Brien L, Winn W. 2007. Mucoid *Pseudomonas* in cystic fibrosis. Am J Clin
Pathol 128:32-34.

12. Mayer-Hamblett N, Ramsey BW, Kulasekara HD, Wolter DJ, Houston LS, Pope CE,
Kulasekara BR, Armbruster CR, Burns JL, Retsch-Bogart G, Rosenfeld M, Gibson RL,
Miller SI, Khan U, Hoffman LR. 2014. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* phenotypes associated
with eradication failure in children with cystic fibrosis. Clin Infect Dis 59:624-631.

545 13. Courtney JM, Bradley J, McCaughan J, O'Connor TM, Shortt C, Bredin CP, Bradbury I,

546   Elborn JS. 2007. Predictors of mortality in adults with cystic fibrosis. Pediatr Pulmonol

547   42:525-532.

548 14. Hauser AR, Jain M, Bar-Meir M, McColley SA. 2011. Clinical significance of microbial

549   infection and adaptation in cystic fibrosis. Clin Microbiol Rev 24:29-70.

550 15. Mayer-Hamblett N, Rosenfeld M, Gibson RL. 2014. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa in vitro*

551   phenotypes distinguish cystic fibrosis infection stages and outcomes. Am J Respir Crit

552   Care Med 190:289-297.

553 16. Héry-Arnaud G, Nowak E, Caillon J, David V, Dirou A, Revert K, Munck MR, Frachon I,

554   Haloun A, Horeau-Langlard D, Le Bihan J, Danner-Boucher I, Ramel S, Pelletier MP,

555   Rosec S, Gouriou S, Poulhazan E, Payan C, Ferec C, Rault G, Le Gal G, Le Berre R.

556   2017. Evaluation of quantitative PCR for early diagnosis of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

557   infection in cystic fibrosis: A prospective cohort study. Clin Microbiol Infect 23:203-207.

558 17. Kim K-H, Jahan SA, Kabir E. 2012. A review of breath analysis for diagnosis of human

559   health. Trends Anal Chem 33:1-8.

560 18. Ahmed WM, Lawal O, Nilsen TM, Goodacre R, Fowler SJ. 2017. Exhaled volatile

561   organic compounds of infection: A systematic review. ACS Infect Dis 3:695-710.

562 19. Oakley-Girvan I, Davis SW. 2018. Breath based volatile organic compounds in the

563   detection of breast, lung, and colorectal cancers: A systematic review. Cancer Biomark

564   21:29-39.

565    20.    Amann A, Miekisch W, Schubert J, Buszewski B, Ligor T, Jezierski T, Pleil J, Risby T.

566           2014. Analysis of exhaled breath for disease detection. Annu Rev Anal Chem, Vol 7

567           7:455-482.

568    21.    Smith WD, Bardin E, Cameron L, Edmondson CL, Farrant KV, Martin I, Murphy RA,

569           Soren O, Turnbull AR, Wierre-Gore N, Alton EW, Bundy JG, Bush A, Connett GJ, Faust

570           SN, Filloux A, Freemont PS, Jones AL, Takats Z, Webb JS, Williams HD, Davies JC.

571           2017. Current and future therapies for *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* infection in patients

572           with cystic fibrosis. FEMS Microbiol Lett 364.

573    22.    Burns JL, Gibson RL, McNamara S, Yim D, Emerson J, Rosenfeld M, Hiatt P, McCcoy

574           K, Castile R, Smith AL, Ramsey BW. 2001. Longitudinal assessment of *Pseudomonas*

575           *aeruginosa* in young children with cystic fibrosis. J Infect Dis 183:444-452.

576    23.    Hoppe JE, Towler EE, Wagner BD, Accurso FJ, Sagel SD, Zemanick ET. 2015. Sputum

577           induction improves detection of pathogens in children with cystic fibrosis. Pediatr

578           Pulmonol 50:638-646.

579    24.    West SEH, Zeng L, Lee BL, Kosorok MR, Laxova A, Rock MJ, Splaingard MJ, Farrell

580           PM. 2002. Respiratory infections with *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in children with cystic

581           fibrosis - early detection by serology and assessment of risk factors. JAMA 287:2958-

582           2967.

583    25.    Nasir M, Bean HD, Smolinska A, Rees CA, Zemanick ET, Hill JE. 2018. Volatile

584           molecules from bronchoalveolar lavage fluid can 'rule-in' *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and

585           'rule-out' *Staphylococcus aureus* infections in cystic fibrosis patients. Sci Rep 8.

586    26.    Beccaria M, Bobak C, Maitshotlo B, Mellors TR, Purcaro G, Franchina FA, Rees CA,

587           Nasir M, Black A, Hill JE. 2019. Exhaled human breath analysis in active pulmonary

tuberculosis diagnostics by comprehensive gas chromatography-mass spectrometry and

chemometric techniques. J Breath Res 13.

27.  Freschi L, Vincent AT, Jeukens J, Emond-Rheault JG, Kukavica-Ibrulj I, Dupont MJ,

Charette SJ, Boyle B, Levesque RC. 2019. The *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* pan-genome

provides new insights on its population structure, horizontal gene transfer, and

pathogenicity. Genome Biol Evol 11:109-120.

28.  Bean HD, Rees CA, Hill JE. 2016. Comparative analysis of the volatile metabolomes of

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* clinical isolates. J Breath Res 10:047102.

29.  Kelly NM, Fitzgerald MX, Tempany E, O'Boyle C, Falkiner FR, Keane CT. 1982. Does

*Pseudomonas* cross-infection occur between cystic-fibrosis patients. Lancet 2:688-90.

30.  Grothues D, Koopmann U, von der Hardt H, Tummler B. 1988. Genome fingerprinting of

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* indicates colonization of cystic fibrosis siblings with closely

related strains. J Clin Microbiol 26:1973-7.

31.  Thomassen MJ, Demko CA, Doershuk CF, Root JM. 1985. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

isolates: Comparisons of isolates from campers and from sibling pairs with cystic

fibrosis. Pediatr Pulmonol 1:40-5.

32.  Wolz C, Kiosz G, Ogle JW, Vasil ML, Schaad U, Botzenhart K, Doring G. 1989.

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* cross-colonization and persistence in patients with cystic

fibrosis. Use of a DNA probe. Epidemiol Infect 102:205-14.

33.  Ashish A, Paterson S, Mowat E, Fothergill JL, Walshaw MJ, Winstanley C. 2013.

Extensive diversification is a common feature of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* populations

during respiratory infections in cystic fibrosis. J Cyst Fibros 12:790-3.

34. Cramer N, Klockgether J, Wrasman K, Schmidt M, Davenport CF, Tummler B. 2011.

Microevolution of the major common *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* clones c and pa14 in

cystic fibrosis lungs. Environ Microbiol 13:1690-704.

35. Mowat E, Paterson S, Fothergill JL, Wright EA, Ledson MJ, Walshaw MJ, Brockhurst

MA, Winstanley C. 2011. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* population diversity and turnover in

cystic fibrosis chronic infections. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 183:1674-1679.

36. Bragonzi A, Paroni M, Nonis A, Cramer N, Montanari S, Rejman J, Di Serio C, Doring G,

Tummler B. 2009. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* microevolution during cystic fibrosis lung

infection establishes clones with adapted virulence. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 180:138-

45.

37. Kordes A, Preusse M, Willger SD, Braubach P, Jonigk D, Haverich A, Warnecke G,

Haussler S. 2019. Genetically diverse *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* populations display

similar transcriptomic profiles in a cystic fibrosis explanted lung. Nat Commun 10:3397.

38. Clark ST, Guttman DS, Hwang DM. 2018. Diversification of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

within the cystic fibrosis lung and its effects on antibiotic resistance. FEMS Microbiol Lett

365.

39. Schick A, Kassen R. 2018. Rapid diversification of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in cystic

fibrosis lung-like conditions. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 115:10714-10719.

40. Wilder CN, Allada G, Schuster M. 2009. Instantaneous within-patient diversity of

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* quorum-sensing populations from cystic fibrosis lung

infections. Infect Immun 77:5631-9.

41.    Smania AM, Segura I, Pezza RJ, Becerra C, Albesa I, Argarana CE. 2004. Emergence

of phenotypic variants upon mismatch repair disruption in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*.

Microbiology 150:1327-1338.

42.    Ciofu O, Mandsberg LF, Bjarnsholt T, Wassermann T, Hoiby N. 2010. Genetic

adaptation of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* during chronic lung infection of patients with

cystic fibrosis: Strong and weak mutators with heterogeneous genetic backgrounds

emerge in muca and/or lasr mutants. Microbiology 156:1108-1119.

43.    Higgins Keppler EA, Jenkins CL, Davis TJ, Bean HD. 2018. Advances in the application

of comprehensive two-dimensional gas chromatography in metabolomics. Trends Anal

Chem 109:275-286.

44.    Dieterle F, Ross A, Schlotterbeck G, Senn H. 2006. Probabilistic quotient normalization

as robust method to account for dilution of complex biological mixtures. Application in [1]H

NMR metabonomics. Anal Chem 78:4281-4290.

45.    Koo TK, Li MY. 2016. A guideline of selecting and reporting intraclass correlation

coefficients for reliability research. J Chiropr Med 15:155-163.

46.    Benjamini Y, Hochberg Y. 1995. Controlling the false discovery rate: A practical and

powerful approach to multiple testing. J R Stat Soc Series B Methodol 57:289-300.

47.    Johnson WE, Li C, Rabinovic A. 2007. Adjusting batch effects in microarray expression

data using empirical bayes methods. Biostatistics 8:118-27.

48.    Sumner LW, Amberg A, Barrett D, Beale MH, Beger R, Daykin CA, Fan TWM, Fiehn O,

Goodacre R, Griffin JL, Hankemeier T, Hardy N, Harnly J, Higashi R, Kopka J, Lane AN,

Lindon JC, Marriott P, Nicholls AW, Reily MD, Thaden JJ, Viant MR. 2007. Proposed

minimum reporting standards for chemical analysis Chemical Analysis Working Group

(CAWG) Metabolomics Standards Initiative (MSI). Metabolomics 3:211-221.

49.  Bean HD, Rees CA, Hill JE. 2016. Comparative analysis of the volatile metabolomes of

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* clinical isolates. J Breath Res 10.

50.  Bean HD, Dimandja J-MD, Hill JE. 2012. Bacterial volatile discovery using solid-phase

microextraction and comprehensive two-dimensional gas chromatography–time-of-flight

mass spectrometry. J Chromatogr B 901:41-46.

51.  Shestivska V, Španêl P, Dryahina K, Sovová K. 2012. Variability in the concentrations of

volatile metabolites emitted by genotypically different strains of *Pseudomonas*

*aeruginosa*. Journal of Applied Microbiology.

52.  Labows JN, McGinley KJ, Webster GF, Leyden JJ. 1980. Headspace analysis of volatile

metabolites of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and related species by gas chromatography-

mass spectrometry. J Clin Microbiol 12:521-6.

53.  Hahn A, Whiteson, K., Davis, T. J., Phan, J., Sami, I., Koumbourlis, A. C., Freishtat, R.

J., Crandall, K. A., Bean, H. D. 2020. Longitudinal associations of the cystic fibrosis

airway microbiome and volatile metabolites: A case study. Front Cell Infect Microbiol 10.

54.  Grosso-Becerra MV, Santos-Medellín C, González-Valdez A, Méndez JL, Delgado G,

Morales-Espinosa R, Servín-González L, Alcaraz LD, Soberón-Chávez G. 2014.

*Pseudomonas aeruginosa* clinical and environmental isolates constitute a single

population with high phenotypic diversity. BMC Genomics 15.

55.  Bragonzi A, Worlitzsch D, Pier GB, Timpert P, Ulrich M, Hentzer M, Andersen JB,

Givskov M, Conese M, Doring G. 2005. Nonmucoid *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

expresses alginate in the lungs of patients with cystic fibrosis and in a mouse model. J

Infect Dis 192:410-419.

56.   Moskowitz SM, Emerson JC, McNamara S, Shell RD, Orenstein DM, Rosenbluth D,

Katz MF, Ahrens R, Hornick D, Joseph PM, Gibson RL, Aitken ML, Benton WW, Burns

JL. 2011. Randomized trial of biofilm testing to select antibiotics for cystic fibrosis airway

infection. Pediatr Pulmonol 46:184-192.

57.   Cornforth DM, Dees JL, Ibberson CB, Huse HK, Mathiesen IH, Kirketerp-Moller K,

Wolcott RD, Rumbaugh KP, Bjarnsholt T, Whiteley M. 2018. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

transcriptome during human infection. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 115:E5125-E5134.

58.   Harrison F, Muruli A, Higgins S, Diggle SP. 2014. Development of an *ex vivo* porcine

lung model for studying growth, virulence, and signaling of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*.

Infect Immun 82:3312-3323.

59.   Bayes HK, Ritchie N, Irvine S, Evans TJ. 2016. A murine model of early *Pseudomonas*

*aeruginosa* lung disease with transition to chronic infection. Sci Rep 6.

60.   Crabbé A, Ledesma MA, Nickerson CA. 2014. Mimicking the host and its

microenvironment *in vitro* for studying mucosal infections by *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*.

Pathog Dis 71:1-19.

61.   Sønderholm M, Kragh KN, Koren K, Jakobsen TH, Darch SE, Alhede M, Jensen PO,

Whiteley M, Kühl M, Bjarnsholt T. 2017. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* aggregate formation

in an alginate bead model system exhibits *in vivo*-like characteristics. Appl Environ

Microbiol 83.

62.    Bean HD, Jiménez-Díaz J, Zhu J, Hill JE. 2015. Breathprints of model murine bacterial

697           lung infections are linked with immune response. Eur Respir J 45:21-24.

698    63.    Neerincx AH, Brinkman P, Van der Gouwe P, Paff T, Fens N, Gerritsen MG, Haarman E,

699           Van Aalderen WMC, Majoor CJ, Weersink EJM, Bos LD, Sterk PJ, Anke-Hilse Maitland-

700           Van der Z. 2018. Detection of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* in exhaled breath of cystic

701           fibrosis patients. Eur Respir J 52.