Outdoor Atmospheric Microbial Diversity is Associated with Urban Landscape Structure and

Differs from Indoor-Transit Systems as Revealed by Mobile Monitoring and Three-Dimensional

Spatial Analysis

JD Stewart#[a,b], P. Kremer[a], K.M. Shakya[a], M. Conway[a], A. Saad[a]

#Corresponding author

Amsterdam, de Boelelaan 1085, 1081 HV, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Department of Ecological Sciences

Vrije Universiteit

Phone: +31 657173777

Email: j.d.stewart@vu.nl

[a]Department of Geography and the Environment, Villanova University, Pennsylvania, USA

[b]Department of Ecological Science, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Contribution to the field

The research presented in the manuscript encompasses mobile monitoring

characterization of the near-surface atmospheric microbiome in outdoor and indoor transit airs.

We complement this with a spatial analysis of the 3D structure of the urban landscape. Urban

areas are the fastest growing ecosystems in the world and no study to date has employed mobile

monitoring or analysis that incorporates building height at the city-wide spatial scale. The goal of

this study was to understand how subtle variations of urban structure influences microbial

community structure and compare it to an enclosed air environment. We quantified community

structure using marker gene sequencing and function through genome prediction. These analyses

were combined with spatial analysis of land cover and building height datasets. Results indicate

that the heterogeneity of the urban landscape is significantly associated with multiple levels of

microbial diversity. We identify the potentially pathogenic fraction of the atmospheric

microbiome as well as their likely sources. Our research contributes to the understanding of

microbial community structure in understudied urban air, which is pertinent to the structure-

function relationships of microorganisms and their environment. Research related to the ways in

which communities assemble and function is vital to developing new strategies for managing

ecosystems under global change scenarios.

Abstract:

Microbes are abundant inhabitants of the near-surface atmosphere in urban areas. The

distribution of microbial communities may benefit or hinder human wellbeing and ecosystem

function. Surveys of airborne microbial diversity are uncommon in both natural and built

environments and those that investigate diversity are stationary in the city, thus missing

continuous exposure to microbes that covary with three-dimensional urban structure. Individuals

in cities are generally mobile and would be exposed to diverse urban structures outdoors and

within indoor-transit systems in a day. We used mobile monitoring of microbial diversity and

geographic information system spatial analysis, across Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA in

outdoor and indoor-transit (subways and train cars) environments. This study identifies to the

role of the three-dimensional urban landscape in structuring atmospheric microbiomes and

employs mobile monitoring over ~1920 kilometers to measure continuous biodiversity. We

found more diverse communities outdoors that significantly differ from indoor-transit air in

microbial community structure, function, likely source environment, and potentially pathogenic

fraction of the community. Variation in the structure of the urban landscape was associated with

diversity and function of the near-surface atmospheric microbiome in outdoor samples.

Importance:

Global nutrient cycling and human health depend on the rich biodiversity of

microorganisms. The influence of the urban environment on microbiomes remains poorly

described despite cities being the fastest growing ecosystems. All life is exposed to the

atmosphere and thus discerning what microbes are present and what their functions may be is

critical to create resistant and resilient cities under climate change. This study combines a

spatially explicit analysis of urban structure with mobile monitoring of the atmospheric

microbiome.

Introduction:

Microbes are abundant inhabitants of the near-surface atmosphere (Burrows et al., 2009)

whose presence and distributions in urban areas have implications on public health and

ecosystem function. The atmosphere serves as both a source and a sink for microorganisms that

may return to the surface through dry or wet deposition (Chate et al., 2003; Wu et al., 2018).

Furthermore, urban areas are the fastest growing ecosystems (Grimm et al., 2008) and are

composed of heterogeneous landscapes (Cadenasso et al., 2007) with diverse land covers

combined in various configurations and proportions. Many studies of urban structure rely on

remotely sensed landcover datasets that distinguish between the built and natural elements of the

landscape; however, they ignore the vertical dimension. Building height influences urban

ecosystems by altering wind currents and casting shadows which alter physical properties such

as air temperature and evapotranspiration potential.

Structure of Urban Landscape (STURLA) spatial analysis studies have demonstrated that

cities are composed of a discrete number of three-dimensional composite land classes where a

small number of classes (5-10) explain the urban landscape and host distinct physical properties

of the environment (Larondelle et al., 2014; Hamstead et al., 2016) and is useful for studies of

urban ecosystem services (Haase et al., 2014). The urban landscape is classified by applying a

fishnet grid of 120m^2 sized pixels over a city and calculating the relative proportions of land

cover elements within a pixel as derived from remotely sensed satellite imagery. STURLA

classes represent combinations of the natural and built aspects of urban structure while

incorporating the vertical dimension (lowrise, midrise, and highrise buildings) which gives it an

explanatory advantage over most land-cover datasets. For example, class *tgplm* is a STURLA

class heterogeneously composed of trees (*t*), grass (*grass*), pavement (*p*), low-rise (*l*), and mid-

rise buildings (*m*). This framework allows for scalable and reproducible tracing of urban spatio-

temporal patterns that can be applied across cities to identify structure function relationships.

Likewise, it could easily be incorporated into models that forecast near-term changes (Dietze et

al., 2018) in urban ecosystem services including and their resilience to change (Folke et al.,

2002; Gunderson et al., 2012).

Urban areas host diverse microbiomes with unique selective pressures (e.g. pollution and

chronic disturbance) that vary along spatial gradients (Reese et al., 2016; Mhuireach et al.,

2019a); however, relationships between urban landscape heterogeneity and atmospheric

microbes remain largely unexplored. Aside from outdoor air, public transit systems also host

unique microbiomes. These systems are taxonomically diverse (Dybwad et al., 2012; Leung et

al., 2014; Triadó-Margarit et al., 2017; Gohli et al., 2019) and represent unique ecological niches

due to their high usage rate by humans and rapid turnover in occupancy. Likewise, studies of

outdoor atmospheric microbiomes have until now been mostly stationary (Bowers et al., 2009;

Lee et al., 2009; Mazar et al., 2016; Cáliz et al., 2018; Stewart et al., 2020) and miss the

continuous biodiversity of the urban landscape. Microbiomes of both outdoor and indoor-transit

air are assembled from diverse environments including soils(Bowers et al., 2009, 2011b), water

(Methé et al., 1998; Linz et al., 2017), vegetation (Lymperopoulou et al., 2016), and animals

(Täubel et al., 2009; Hospodsky et al., 2012; Leung et al., 2014). These communities host diverse

bacterial phyla largely composed of three phyla: *Proteobacteria*, *Actinobacteria*, *Firmicutes,* and

Bacteroidetes (Li et al., 2019; Mhuireach et al., 2019b) that vary seasonally (Cáliz et al., 2018;

Du et al., 2018) and by the environment surrounding the air (Bowers et al., 2011b, 2013). Mobile

monitoring (sampling while moving) of the atmosphere is increasingly used to understand

patterns of particles in air (Wallace et al., 2009; Shakya et al., 2019; Deshmukh et al., 2020) and

microbial diversity in a subway (Leung et al., 2014), until now it has not been applied to

identifying patterns of microbial biodiversity in outdoor air relevant to the populations living in

cities.

Recently, the health effects of microbial exposure in addition to pathogen identification

are now being explored (Ege et al., 2011; Hanski et al., 2012; Ruokolainen et al., 2015). Low-

diversity microbiomes in animals are associated with chronic-diseases including: asthma,

irritable bowel syndrome (Frank et al., 2007; Round and Mazmanian, 2009), and obesity

(Turnbaugh et al., 2008). Research has identified exposure to microbially diverse outdoor and

built environments during childhood offers protection against asthma and immune diseases

(Rook, 2009; von Hertzen et al., 2011; Mills et al., 2017). Niche occupation of the respiratory

tract by diverse taxa would limit the surface area where bacteria suggested to exacerbate asthma

(e.g. *Haemophilus spp.* or *Streptococcus spp.*) could settle (Ege et al., 2011). Likewise, diverse

microbial exposure has been suggested to activate downstream signaling pathways of toll-like

receptors that induce regulatory T-cells (Schaub et al., 2009). Given these associations,

discerning patterns of diversity in urban airs holds implications for human health.

Understanding how structural elements relate to atmospheric microbial diversity and

function is necessary for understanding urban ecology (Jansson, 2013), and can guide urban

development in ways that utilize ecological functions to enhance environmental performance and

human wellbeing. In this study we combine mobile monitoring of the atmospheric microbiome

from 07/01/19 to 07/25/19 using marker gene sequencing (16s rRNA) and genome prediction to

characterize the diversity and inferred functional potential in outdoor and indoor-transit air.

Samples were taken outdoors by driving across 240 kilometers with eight repetitions and

commuting through three train lines four times in Philadelphia PA. This is complemented with

three-dimensional spatial analysis of how subtle variation in urban landscape composition

influences microbial communities.

Materials and Methods:

Site Description and Sample Collection:

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA is a city flanked by two bodies of water located

in the Mid-Atlantic region of the United States of America with a 2018 population estimate of

1,584,138 (Lynch et al., 2014). Samples were collected on sterilized (500°C for 3 hours) quartz

fiber filters using a PDR1500 Air Quality Dust Monitor (Thermo-Fisher Scientific, United States

of America) where the inlet tube and mesh filter holder was cleaned with 70% ethanol before

sampling . Only particles smaller than 2.5 micrometers in diameter ($PM_{2.5}$) were collected using a

particulate matter sampler with a flow rate of 1.5 liters per minute. Particulate matter was

impacted on quartz fiber filters, as done in similar studies (Bowers et al., 2013; Stewart et al.,

2020), where after collection the filter was removed using sterilized tweezers and stored in

aluminum foil at -20 °C until DNA extraction. DNA was then stored at -80 °C until downstream

analyses.

Urban Structure and Route Generation:

Urban structure was characterized in 120 m^2 blocks using the STructure of Urban

LAndscapes (STURLA) system, a multi-dimensional spatial classification system that

incorporates land cover with urban building/structure height as previously described (Hamstead

et al., 2016). Relative frequencies of STURLA classes were calculated and those with an

abundance below 0.1% were grouped into the category "other". STURLA across Philadelphia

can be found in Figure 1. Routes were generated to include at least 50 points in each of the

composite classes represented in the city STURLA classification to maximize variation in urban

structure. Points were randomly selected based on a stratified random sample to ensure adequate

representation of the most common composite classes. In addition, points of interest were added

to the random sample including industrial sites, EPA TRI sites, and EPA air pollution monitoring

station sites. Using ESRI ArcGIS 10.7.1 Network Analyst, an optimal route of approximately

480 kilometers was generated, passing through the sample points. The route was then divided

into two routes—R1 and R2 for feasibility of driving within one day. The routes were loaded to a

professional-grade GPS unit (Thimble Juno 3b, USA), and the van was driven along each route.

Each route was replicated 4 times for a total of 8 samples; however, variation of each route exists

day to day to test the role of subtle variation in the urban landscape.

Outdoor Sampling:

Outdoor air samples (n=8) were collected using the same instrument (PDR1500) strapped

to the roof of a van (~1.5 meters in height) with the inlet facing out to the side of the roof.

Samples were collected from two routes (R1: Route 1, R2: Route 2) with R1 being more diverse

in urban structure. The van was driven at a variety of speeds ranging from 0 km/hr - ~100 km/hr

(e.g. stoplight vs highway). Average sampling period for each of the routes was 601 ± 48

minutes for each of the outdoor air sample days, collecting an average of $913.3 L \pm 73.4 L$ of

air. Variation exists within routes to address the roles of both large (between route) and small

(within-route) variation in structuring the atmospheric microbiome (Figure 2). The distribution of

STURLA classes throughout the city can be found in Figure 3B.

Indoor-transit Sampling:

Three indoor-transit lines (Figure 3A), the Market-Frankford Line (above/below ground),

Norristown Line (above ground), and BSL (below ground) of air were collected to comprise one

sample. Collection (n=4) took place inside train cars for an average 288.3 ± 21.1 minutes

impacting $438.1 \pm 32.4 L$ of air. On average ~30 people were counted in each train car during

sampling.

DNA Extraction, Sequencing, Processing, and Genome Prediction:

DNA was extracted using the MoBio PowerSoil™ DNA Isolation Kit following the

manufacturer's suggested protocol. The 16S rRNA gene HV4 region for bacterial and archaeal

microorganisms   (515F: 5'-GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA,   806R: 5'-

GGACTACHVHHHTWTCTAAT, Thermo-Fisher, Waltham, MA, USA) was then amplified by

polymerase chain reaction (PCR) using the Earth Microbiome Project's protocol (Earth

Microbiome Project, 2016). A positive control of *E. coli* and a negative control of deionised

water were used and no contamination was found in either. Sequencing was performed at MR

DNA (www.mrdnalab.com, Shallowater, TX, USA) using the Illumina MiSeq platform. DNA

sequences were analyzed and statistical analysis was conducted using QIIME 2 (Bolyen et al.,

2019) following the *Moving Pictures* tutorial code and R (3.6). Briefly, raw reads were

demultiplexed, denoised using the DADA2 algorithm (Callahan et al., 2016), and truncated at

180 basepairs.

Sequences were rarefied to 1,55,547 sequences aligned to the SILVA 132 99% reference

taxonomy database (Quast et al., 2013) using a Naive Bayes classifier to amplicon sequence

variants (ASVs). Sequences were aligned using mafft (Katoh and Standley, 2013) followed by

construction of an unrooted phylogenetic tree using FastTree (Price et al., 2009). Alpha diversity

metrics including observed number of ASVs, Pielou's evenness, and Faith's Phylogenetic

Diversity (Faith, 1992) were calculated. Beta diversity was calculated using unweighted UniFrac

for phylogenetic analysis (Lozupone and Knight, 2005). Unweighted UniFrac was chosen as it is

qualitative and thus makes our analyses less sensitive to differences in sampling volume and

allows comparability to qualitative functional inference (e.g. functional Bray-Curtis PcoA).

PICRUSt 2 (Douglas et al., 2019) was used to infer functional genes using the maximum

parsimony hidden-state prediction methodology (Louca and Doebeli, 2018) as done in other

studies of the atmospheric microbiome (Pan et al., 2019; Stewart et al., 2020). Functional gene

predictions were rarefied to the minimum number of features found between all samples. Beta

diversity for functional gene predictions was conducted using Bray-Curtis dissimilarity and

Principal Coordinates Analysis (PcoA).

Data Analysis:

Identification of potentially pathogenic taxa was conducted comparing the average 40

most relatively abundant ASVs with a reference database of bacterial strains that are known

human pathogens (UK Health and Safety Executive Advisory Committee on Dangerous

Pathogens). Taxa representing less than 0.01 % of the pathogenic subset of taxa were grouped

into the category "Other". Likely source environment for the top 40 ASVs was determined

through a literature review (Stewart et al., 2020) (supplemental references). A taxon found in

more than one environment was categorized as a "generalist" as done in previous research

(Stewart et al., 2020). For this the relative abundance of each taxon was coded based on their

likely source environment. Coded environment was then used for statistical analysis as seen

below.

Bray-Curtis dissimilarity for functional gene predictions, source environment, and

potentially pathogenic taxa was calculated. Kruskal-Wallis tests were used to test for significant

differences indoor-transit, outdoor air, and variation between R1 and R2 in diversity.

PERMANOVA tests identified if community structure (phylogenetic, by source environment,

predicted functional genes, and potentially pathogenic taxa) varied between air types and route

driven. Taxon reoccurrence was measured by taking the sum of the presence of a taxon in

outdoor and indoor-transit samples and breaking them into equal thirds ranked by number of

occurrences across all samples.

Shannon diversity (H) was used to calculate the diversity of STURLA classifications

encountered (Shannon and Weaver, 1963). Richness of land cover was measured by taking the

sum of the number of unique STURLA classes passed through on each route. These two metrics

are used as proxies for how many STURLA classes (e.g. as one walks throughout a city) and

which classes in a city are to be associated with microbial diversity. Dissimilarity in routes was

calculated using the Bray-Curtis dissimilarity metric (Beals, 1984). Permutational correlations

(to account for spatial and temporal autocorrelation) with Bonferroni correction were used to test

for relationships between STURLA diversity and microbial structure/function using relative

proportions of STURLA classes (as this accounts for differences in total driving time). A mantel

test was employed to test for correlation between microbial beta diversity and STURLA

dissimilarity.

Data availability:

DNA sequences have been deposited to the National Institute of Health Sequence Read

Archive under accession number: SRR11612565. Code can be found at

https://github.com/thecrobe/STURLAMicrobiome.

Results

Microbial Community Structure and Function:

Molecular analysis from mobile monitoring revealed diverse communities of 337

amplicon sequence variants (ASVs, a proxy for species). 22 phyla were observed that varied

significantly in community structure (Figure 4A, *p*=0.001) and inferred functional potential

(Figure 4B *p*=0.002) between outdoor and indoor-transit air as well as between outdoor route

driven. Outdoor communities were seen to host reoccurring taxa less frequently than indoors

(Figure S1). A diverse set of metabolic genes were identified including carbon fixation, sulfate

reduction/assimilation/oxidation, nitrate reduction, and aromatic compound degradation. No

virulence genes were observed. Despite differences in composition and inferred functional

potential, both indoor-transit and outside air hosted reoccurring taxa similarly (*p*=0.9631, Figure

S1) where the majority of ASVs in outdoor and indoor-transit were found in all samples. No

phylum was unique to a single sample, air type, or route (Figure 4C) thus suggesting that the

atmospheric microbiome in general is panmictic; however may vary between indoor and outdoor

airs .

Indoor air hosted almost double the number of rare taxa (49 ASVs), an ASV found in just

one sample, than outdoor air (26 ASVs). Outdoor air hosted significantly more phylogenetic

(*p*=0.006, Figure 5A) and functionally diverse (*p*=0.002, Figure 5B) communities as compared

to indoor-transit air. Furthermore, outdoor communities were more rich (*p*=0.045, Figure 5C),

and evenly distributed (p=0.007, Figure 5D). The 40 most abundant ASVs accounted for an

average 86.01% (coefficient of variance: 11.06%) of all taxa across all samples were identified

as likely originating from animals, soil, or were generalists (Figure 6A). Enterobacteriaceae

(likely from mammalian gastro-intestinal systems) were on average the most abundant animal-

associated microorganisms and were more variable outdoors (16.71% ± 15.01%) than indoors

(90.5% ± 1.7%).

While indoor transit air was dominated by Enterobacteriaceae, the skin associated genus

Staphylococcus (mean: 14.22%, coefficient of variance: 30.62%) made notable contributions to

the potentially pathogenic fraction of outdoor air communities and was more variable in

abundance across samples as compared to indoors (mean: 0.01%, coefficient of variance:

18.90%). Plant pathogen containing genus *Ralstonia* represented the most abundant taxa sourced

to soil and were in greater abundance and less variable outdoors (mean: 17.56%, coefficient of

variance: 9.48%) than indoors (mean: 2.49%, coefficient of variance 39.15%). Lastly, the most

abundant generalist ASVs were identified as the Oxyphotobacteria, the only group of bacteria

that can carry out oxygenic photosynthesis, were also more abundant and variable outdoors

(mean: 4.16%, coefficient of variance: 82.73% than indoors (mean: 0.24%, coefficient of

variance: 70.87%). Taxonomic composition by source environment significantly differed from

outdoor and indoor-transit air (p=0.003) but not by route driven (p=0.311) Proportions of source

environments were not uniform between outdoor and indoor-transit air as the most abundant

ASVs in outdoor air were attributed to more evenly distributed source environments.

A total of 30 Amplicon Sequence Variants (ASVs) were identified as being potentially

pathogenic where, on average, these taxa composed (mean: 33.89%, coefficient of variance:

19.0%) of outdoor air and (mean: 48.41%, coefficient of variance 21.1%) of indoor-transit

microbial communities (Figure 6B). The majority of these taxa are commensal human bacteria

that are also opportunistic pathogens. *Corynebacterium spp.,* and *Pseudomonas spp.,* were absent

in indoor-transit air. Structure and taxonomic composition of potentially pathogenic taxa was

significantly different between indoor-transit and outdoor air (p=0.007) but not between route

driven outdoors (p=0.661).

The Three-Dimensional Landscape and Biodiversity:

Classification of the urban landscape identified 42 STURLA classes encountered while

driving with *tgpl (trees, grass, pavement, lowrise buildings)* being most frequent (Figure 2,

larger maps found in Supplemental Figures 5-12).The majority of the urban landscape from

routes driven was homogenous in class composition where 92.16 % $\pm$ % 1.43 % was explained

by 9 STURLA classes (Figure 3B). Despite this homogeneity, routes significantly differed

(p=0.0364) in STURLA classes encountered each day. Diversity of STURLA classes

encountered was significantly correlated with phylogenetic diversity (Rho: 0.74, p= 0.045) and

observed number of ASVs (Rho: 0.83, p= 0.011) but not with community evenness (Rho: 0.21,

p= 0.620). We found that variation of the STURLA classes was significantly associated with

beta diversity of microbial communities (Mantel Test, r: 0.341, p=0.04) At the individual

STURLA class level, inferred functional diversity was significantly correlated with *tgpl*, *tgplmh*,

other (all p <0.05) and *tgp, tgwp, tgbp,* (all p < 0.1) (Figure 7) as was the number of observed

ASVs and phylogenetic diversity with *tgpl* and *tgplmh*. Furthermore, diversity of STURLA

classes by day was strongly, albeit insignificantly, correlated with 14 metabolic pathways

(Supplemental Figure 2), 25 biosynthesis pathways (Supplemental Figure 3), and 10 degradation

pathways (Supplemental figure 4). Class richness was also correlated with 3 metabolic pathways,

9 biosynthesis pathways, and 4 degradation pathways.

Discussion:

The high level of diversity observed in outdoor particulate matter is likely attributed to

the unrestricted dispersal by wind at both the local (within-city) (Pankhurst et al., 2012) and

intercontinental scales (Smith et al., 2013). This diversity may also be a function of high

temporal variation at short time scales (i.e. days) of microbial biodiversity previously found in

the atmospheric microbiome (Stewart et al., 2020) and should be considered when interpreting

these results. This is attributed to sampling across diverse landscapes that included water

features, greenspace, unpaved land as well as a dense urban core consisting of the built

environment where humans and animal companions primarily walk and drive outside. For

atmospheric communities it is expected that dispersal is the dominating process affecting

community assembly as opposed to diversification, selection, and drift (Vellend, 2010; Nemergut

et al., 2013). We also found a relatively small number of ASVs as compared to other

environments (e.g. soil); however, this is consistent with estimates of atmospheric microbial

biodiversity that has found 29-690 phylotypes pers sample (Bowers et al., 2013). Our finding

that communities host reoccurring taxa over time in both outdoor and indoor-transit air suggests

that atmospheric microorganisms are not endemic and have cosmopolitan distributions in their

environment, likely a function of the large populations of microorganisms combined with their

small size (Wilkinson et al., 2012). Despite this, the significant differences in community

composition by air type also suggests that the mixing is dispersal limited (e.g. greater mixing

outside as opposed to a largely enclosed built environment). When outdoors, aerosolized

microbes are blocked by buildings, trees, and everything in the urban landscape; however they

have a wider possible geographic range (a function of wind dispersal) than indoors. For example,

a microbe aerosolized from a plant leaf can move in all directions, including vertically where it

could be lifted and transported long distances (Smith et al., 2013). Being able to across wide

geographic ranges allows endemic microbes to escape their native geographic ranges. While

inside a building such as a subway or train station wind speeds do not reach levels found

outdoors. Likewise, indoor microbes have an obstacle, exits/entrances. The microorganisms

would have to exit the system before it could enter outdoor air.

Furthermore, in semi-closed environments such as indoor-transit systems, physical

dispersal limitation (e.g. a pillar or turnstile) should increase residence time for microbes

(Adams et al., 2013; Kembel et al., 2014) and influence microbial diversity. The closed

environment (aside from exits) of the indoor-transit system combined with high human

occupancy seems to enrich the taxa brought into the system by its riders as it does in other

structures of the built environment (Meadow et al., 2014). It is expected to find bacteria disperse

into and throughout the indoor-transit environment by three primary mechanisms: (1) contact

with indoor surfaces; (2) particle emission from breath, clothes, skin and hair; and (3)

resuspension of dust containing other microbial-loaded particles (Meadow et al., 2015). Given

that humans carry 10^{12} microorganisms on the epidermis and 10^{14} microorganisms in the

alimentary tract (Luckey, 1972) and shed ~ 10^6 particles (>0.5 µm in diameter) an hour (You et

al., 2013; Bhangar et al., 2016) we likely serve as the dominant source of microorganisms in

indoor-transit air.

Complementing our findings of higher proportions of animal-associated taxa in indoor-

transit air, it has been seen that human occupancy increases the load of animal-associated

bacteria in the built environment. This includes subways (Leung et al., 2014; Hsu et al., 2016)

university classrooms (Hospodsky et al., 2012; Meadow et al., 2014), public restrooms (Flores et

al., 2011), dust (Täubel et al., 2009), and kitchens (Flores et al., 2013). Outdoor air microbes also

seem to enter into the transit system, albeit to a lesser extent, given there were no unique phyla

identified outside that were not encountered in transit air. Furthermore, architectural design

(Kembel et al., 2012, 2014) has been seen to influence microbial community structure and acts as

a physical barrier differentiating outdoor versus indoor-transit air which may account for

observed variation in diversity in this study.

High human occupancy in small spaces such as train cars combined with our finding of

almost half of the microbiome being potentially pathogenic may alter the health state of the lung

and respiratory tract microbiome. Despite the lack of specific inferred virulence genes, shifts in

microbial composition can have negative health effects as an emergent property. A decrease in

microbial diversity, richness and evenness, as we found in indoor-transit air compared to outdoor

air, are frequent features of chronic lung inflammation (Hilty et al., 2010; You et al., 2013). The

presence of microbial derived molecules influences immune systems through Toll-like receptor

recognition even when a microbe is dead. These molecules include bacterial lipopolysaccharide

(Faure et al., 2000; Ibeagha-Awemu et al., 2008), flagellin (Hayashi et al., 2001), and

lipoproteins(Takeuchi et al., 2001) . Thus, dead microbes that lack pathogenicity genes may still

have negative health outcomes upon inhalation by activating the immune system. Previous

research has demonstrated that approximately 80% of particulate matter ($PM_{2.5}$) in subway

systems deposits in human respiratory tract and biologically stresses the immune system and

cultured lung cells (Karlsson et al., 2005; Bachoual et al., 2007). This combined with the high

percentages of potentially pathogenic taxa in indoor-transit air may have negative health effects

on those with unstable lung microbial communities such as individuals who have a recurring

cough, mechanically disrupting microbes, or have decreased diversity due to antibiotic use

(Klepac-Ceraj et al., 2010; Zhao et al., 2012). In contrast, the lower proportions of potentially

pathogenic taxa and relatively higher diversity of outdoor air (Ege et al., 2011; Lynch et al.,

2014) has been linked to decreased rates of asthma. The influence of outdoor air may be less than

that of the indoor-transit system as 90% of urban individuals spend their time indoors (Klepeis et

al., 2001).

One possible benefit of spending time outdoors aside from aesthetics and recreation

(Soga and Gaston, 2016) may be improving respiratory health. It should be noted that these are

suggestive findings that would benefit from empirical measurements from qPCR or other

functional analyses. Effects of microbial presence in the atmosphere on respiratory tract

colonization is currently unknown; however, it is suggested to be largely determined by

processes including birth, death, immigration, and emigration (Whiteson et al., 2014; Willis et

al., 2020). Recent studies have also observed relationships between post-mortem microbial

biodiversity on the human body (e.g. nose, rectum, and eyes) that suggest urban inhabitants are

influenced by their local atmospheric microbiome (Pearson et al., 2019, 2020) and population

demographics (Pechal et al., 2018). Likewise, black carbon (Janssen et al., 2011), particulate

matter (Dockery et al., 1993), and other pollutants may play a role in counteracting the benefits

of microbial exposure.

While it is known that urban and rural/agricultural air host distinct microbial

communities (Shaffer and Lighthart, 1997; Bowers et al., 2011a; Leung et al., 2014; Stewart et

al., 2020) the role of within city variation where there are less obvious contrasts in landscape

structure is largely unstudied.

Likewise, understanding the biogeography of microbial communities in cities offers a

way to investigate colonization of urban residents by microbes. Recent studies investigating

these relationships have shown that microbial diversity of deceased individuals is significantly

and positively correlated with greenness (Pearson et al., 2019, 2020). While this study does not

investigate individual human microbiomes, we do find the opposite relationships with classes

that host greenness, specifically *tgbpl* and *tgplmh.* Both of these STURLA classes host greenness

(*t*) and the interaction between greenspace and other urban elements (*l*, *m,* and *h*) suggest that

relationships between urban structure and atmospheric microbial biodiversity are an emergent

property of the built and natural environment. Likewise as trees across the majority of

Philadelphia's urban landscape (*tgpl*) measuring greenness alone does not account for the true

variation in the 3D landscape.

More associations between biodiversity and urban structure were seen with STURLA

diversity as opposed to STURLA richness, suggesting the composition of heterogeneous 3D

landscapes has greater influence on microbiome composition than the number of times the same

landscape is encountered throughout a day. Likewise more correlations with urban structure were

observed with inferred function genes which suggests that STURLA classes may host similar

taxa phylogenetically and taxonomically but be tailored to specific functions. This may be a

result of environmental filtering of microbial communities on the land (Lauber et al., 2013)

below the atmosphere that are then aerosolized. Further investigations of microbial biodiversity

in the atmosphere above and on the land within STURLA classes could provide urban planners

with buildable units of land to increase functional diversity (Allison and Martiny, 2008) and

urban resilience (Gómez-Baggethun and Barton, 2013; Jansson, 2013; McPhearson et al., 2016).

For example, significant positive correlations between inferred functional diversity and

STURLA class *tgplm* were observed while a negative relationship was found with *tgplmh*. This

research provides further evidence that biodiversity is influenced by urban structure composed of

the built and natural environment (Pearson et al., 2019). It should be noted that the sampling was

heterogenous as samples were collected while stationary (e.g. stoplight) as well as when moving

(e.g. city streets and highways) as well as the density of cars and people on the streets. These

findings suggest that different structures of the urban landscape host taxonomically and

functionally distinct microbiomes in their aerosols.

In a rapidly urbanizing global community, humans spend the majority of their time in urban landscapes of varying landscape structure, density and configuration. While both outdoors and in transit systems, we constantly emit and interact with microbes sourced from diverse environments that may influence our well-being. In this study we found that microbial communities vary between outdoor and indoor-transit air with the former being more diverse and associated with the structure of the urban landscape. Likewise indoor-transit systems hosted largely homogenous communities with higher proportions of potentially pathogenic taxa likely emitted from animals. Limitations include not analyzing the fungal and viral fractions of atmospheric particles, use of inferred functional pathways instead of directly measuring gene expression or metagenomes (Steele and Streit, 2005), and testing the PM_{25} subset of the atmospheric particles as opposed to total suspended particles (TSP). Likewise, sampling efficiency/length/speed, local pollutant conditions inhibiting molecular analyses and seasonality may be latent factors influencing our results. Future studies may consider exploring the variations of relationships to microbial diversity within a STURLA class as test the influence of within-season and between-season variation.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by NSF Grant 1832407. This manuscript has been released as a preprint at Biorxiv under DOI https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.06.17.157651 (Stewart, 2020)

We appreciate the help from Gerardo Bandera and Jennifer Santoro for analyses and Radley Reist for sample collection. Collina Strada's sustainable fashion line is credited with colors used in graphics. We thank the editor and two reviewers for their time and energy.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References:

Adams, R. I., Miletto, M., Taylor, J. W., and Bruns, T. D. (2013). Dispersal in microbes: fungi in

indoor air are dominated by outdoor air and show dispersal limitation at short distances.

ISME J. 7, 1262–1273. doi:10.1038/ismej.2013.28.

Allison, S. D., and Martiny, J. B. H. (2008). Resistance, resilience, and redundancy in microbial

communities. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 105, 11512–11519. Available at:

https://www.pnas.org/content/105/Supplement_1/11512.short.

Bachoual, R., Boczkowski, J., Goven, D., Amara, N., Tabet, L., On, D., et al. (2007). Biological

effects of particles from the paris subway system. *Chem. Res. Toxicol.*

doi:10.1021/tx700093j.

Beals, E. W. (1984). "Bray-Curtis Ordination: An Effective Strategy for Analysis of Multivariate

Ecological Data," in *Advances in Ecological Research*, eds. A. MacFadyen and E. D. Ford

(Academic Press), 1–55. doi:10.1016/S0065-2504(08)60168-3.

Bhangar, S., Adams, R. I., Pasut, W., Huffman, J. A., and others (2016). Chamber bioaerosol

study: human emissions of size☐resolved fluorescent biological aerosol particles. *Indoor.*

Available at: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/ina.12195.

Bolyen, E., Rideout, J. R., Dillon, M. R., Bokulich, N. A., Abnet, C. C., Al-Ghalith, G. A., et al.

(2019). Author Correction: Reproducible, interactive, scalable and extensible microbiome

data science using QIIME 2. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 37, 1091. doi:10.1038/s41587-019-0252-6.

Bowers, R. M., Clements, N., Emerson, J. B., Wiedinmyer, C., Hannigan, M. P., and Fierer, N.

(2013). Seasonal Variability in Bacterial and Fungal Diversity of the Near-Surface

Atmosphere. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 47, 12097–12106. doi:10.1021/es402970s.

Bowers, R. M., Lauber, C. L., Wiedinmyer, C., Hamady, M., Hallar, A. G., Fall, R., et al. (2009).

Characterization of Airborne Microbial Communities at a High-Elevation Site and Their

Potential To Act as Atmospheric Ice Nuclei. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 75, 5121–5130.

doi:10.1128/aem.00447-09.

Bowers, R. M., McLetchie, S., Knight, R., and Fierer, N. (2011a). Spatial variability in airborne

bacterial communities across land-use types and their relationship to the bacterial

communities of potential source environments. *ISME J.* 5, 601–612.

doi:10.1038/ismej.2010.167.

Bowers, R. M., Sullivan, A. P., Costello, E. K., Collett Jr, J. L., Knight, R., and Fierer, N.

(2011b). Sources of bacteria in outdoor air across cities in the midwestern United States.

Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 77, 6350–6356. doi:10.1128/AEM.05498-11.

Burrows, S. M., Elbert, W., Lawrence, M. G., and Pöschl, U. (2009). Bacteria in the global

atmosphere – Part 1: Review and synthesis of literature data for different ecosystems.

Atmos. Chem. Phys. 9, 9263–9280. doi:10.5194/acp-9-9263-2009.

Cadenasso, M. L., Pickett, S. T. A., and Schwarz, K. (2007). Spatial heterogeneity in urban

ecosystems: reconceptualizing land cover and a framework for classification. *Front. Ecol.*

Environ. 5, 80–88. doi:10.1890/1540-9295(2007)5[80:SHIUER]2.0.CO;2.

Cáliz, J., Triadó-Margarit, X., Camarero, L., and Casamayor, E. O. (2018). A long-term survey

unveils strong seasonal patterns in the airborne microbiome coupled to general and regional

atmospheric circulations. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 115, 12229–12234.

doi:10.1073/pnas.1812826115.

Callahan, B. J., McMurdie, P. J., Rosen, M. J., Han, A. W., Johnson, A. J. A., and Holmes, S. P.

(2016). DADA2: High-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. *Nat.*

Methods 13, 581–583. doi:10.1038/nmeth.3869.

Chate, D. M., Rao, P. S. P., Naik, M. S., Momin, G. A., Safai, P. D., and Ali, K. (2003).

Scavenging of aerosols and their chemical species by rain. *Atmos. Environ.* 37, 2477–2484.

doi:10.1016/s1352-2310(03)00162-6.

Deshmukh, P., Kimbrough, S., Krabbe, S., Logan, R., Isakov, V., and Baldauf, R. (2020).

Identifying air pollution source impacts in urban communities using mobile monitoring. *Sci.*

Total Environ. 715, 136979. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.136979.

Dietze, M. C., Fox, A., Beck-Johnson, L. M., Betancourt, J. L., Hooten, M. B., Jarnevich, C. S.,

et al. (2018). Iterative near-term ecological forecasting: Needs, opportunities, and

challenges. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* doi:10.1073/pnas.1710231115.

Dockery, D. W., Pope, C. A., Xu, X., Spengler, J. D., Ware, J. H., Fay, M. E., et al. (1993). An

Association between Air Pollution and Mortality in Six U.S. Cities. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 329,

1753–1759. doi:10.1056/NEJM199312093292401.

Douglas, G. M., Maffei, V. J., Zaneveld, J., Yurgel, S. N., Brown, J. R., Taylor, C. M., et al.

(2019). PICRUSt2: An improved and extensible approach for metagenome inference.

bioRxiv. doi:10.1101/672295.

Du, P., Du, R., Lu, Z., Ren, W., and Fu, P. (2018). Variation of Bacterial and Fungal Community

Structures in PM2.5 Collected during the 2014 APEC Summit Periods. *Aerosol Air Qual.*

Res. 18, 444–455. doi:10.4209/aaqr.2017.07.0238.

Dybwad, M., Granum, P. E., Bruheim, P., and Blatny, J. M. (2012). Characterization of airborne

bacteria at an underground subway station. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 78, 1917–1929.

doi:10.1128/AEM.07212-11.

Earth Microbiome Project (2016). 16S PCR Protocol. Available at:

https://phylogenomics.me/protocols/16s-pcr-protocol/ [Accessed November 19, 2018].

Ege, M. J., Mayer, M., Normand, A.-C., Genuneit, J., Cookson, W. O. C. M., Braun-Fahrländer,

C., et al. (2011). Exposure to environmental microorganisms and childhood asthma. *N.*

Engl. J. Med. 364, 701–709. doi:10.1056/NEJMoa1007302.

Faith, D. P. (1992). Conservation evaluation and phylogenetic diversity. *Biol. Conserv.* 61, 1–10.

doi:10.1016/0006-3207(92)91201-3.

Faure, E., Equils, O., Sieling, P. A., Thomas, L., Zhang, F. X., Kirschning, C. J., et al. (2000).

Bacterial lipopolysaccharide activates NF-κB through toll-like receptor 4 (TLR-4) in

cultured human dermal endothelial cells. Differential expression of TLR-4 and TLR-2 in

endothelial cells. *J. Biol. Chem.* doi:10.1074/jbc.275.15.11058.

Flores, G. E., Bates, S. T., Caporaso, J. G., Lauber, C. L., Leff, J. W., Knight, R., et al. (2013).

Diversity, distribution and sources of bacteria in residential kitchens. *Environ. Microbiol.*

15, 588–596. doi:10.1111/1462-2920.12036.

Flores, G. E., Bates, S. T., Knights, D., Lauber, C. L., Stombaugh, J., Knight, R., et al. (2011).

Microbial biogeography of public restroom surfaces. *PLoS One* 6, e28132.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0028132.

Folke, C., Carpenter, S., Elmqvist, T., Gunderson, L., Holling, C. S., and Walker, B. (2002).

Resilience and sustainable development: building adaptive capacity in a world of

transformations. *Ambio* 31, 437–440. doi:10.1579/0044-7447-31.5.437.

Frank, D. N., St. Amand, A. L., Feldman, R. A., Boedeker, E. C., Harpaz, N., and Pace, N. R.

(2007). Molecular-phylogenetic characterization of microbial community imbalances in

human inflammatory bowel diseases. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 104, 13780–13785.

doi:10.1073/pnas.0706625104.

Gohli, J., Bøifot, K. O., Moen, L. V., Pastuszek, P., Skogan, G., Udekwu, K. I., et al. (2019). The

subway microbiome: seasonal dynamics and direct comparison of air and surface bacterial

communities. *Microbiome* 7, 160. doi:10.1186/s40168-019-0772-9.

Gómez-Baggethun, E., and Barton, D. N. (2013). Classifying and valuing ecosystem services for

urban planning. *Ecol. Econ.* 86, 235–245. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2012.08.019.

Grimm, N. B., Faeth, S. H., Golubiewski, N. E., Redman, C. L., Wu, J., Bai, X., et al. (2008).

Global change and the ecology of cities. *Science (80-.).* 319, 756–760.

doi:10.1126/science.1150195.

Gunderson, L. H., Allen, C. R., and Holling, C. S. (2012). *Foundations of Ecological Resilience.*

Island Press Available at: https://play.google.com/store/books/details?id=C0q7hXOGuY8C

LB - D0o8R.

Haase, D., Larondelle, N., Andersson, E., Artmann, M., Borgström, S., Breuste, J., et al. (2014).

A quantitative review of urban ecosystem service assessments: concepts, models, and

implementation. *Ambio* 43, 413–433. doi:10.1007/s13280-014-0504-0.

Hamstead, Z. A., Kremer, P., Larondelle, N., McPhearson, T., and Haase, D. (2016).

Classification of the heterogeneous structure of urban landscapes (STURLA) as an indicator

of landscape function applied to surface temperature in New York City. *Ecol. Indic.* 70,

574–585. doi:10.1016/j.ecolind.2015.10.014.

Hanski, I., von Hertzen, L., Fyhrquist, N., Koskinen, K., Torppa, K., Laatikainen, T., et al.

(2012). Environmental biodiversity, human microbiota, and allergy are interrelated. *Proc.*

Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 109, 8334–8339. doi:10.1073/pnas.1205624109.

Hayashi, F., Smith, K. D., Ozinsky, A., Hawn, T. R., Yi, E. C., Goodlett, D. R., et al. (2001). The

innate immune response to bacterial flagellin is mediated by Toll-like receptor 5. *Nature*.

doi:10.1038/35074106.

Hilty, M., Burke, C., Pedro, H., Cardenas, P., Bush, A., Bossley, C., et al. (2010). Disordered

microbial communities in asthmatic airways. *PLoS One* 5, e8578.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0008578.

Hospodsky, D., Qian, J., Nazaroff, W. W., Yamamoto, N., Bibby, K., Rismani-Yazdi, H., et al.

(2012). Human occupancy as a source of indoor airborne bacteria. *PLoS One* 7, e34867.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0034867.

Hsu, T., Joice, R., Vallarino, J., Abu-Ali, G., Hartmann, E. M., Shafquat, A., et al. (2016). Urban

Transit System Microbial Communities Differ by Surface Type and Interaction with

Humans and the Environment. *mSystems* 1. doi:10.1128/mSystems.00018-16.

Ibeagha-Awemu, E. M., Lee, J. W., Ibeagha, A. E., Bannerman, D. D., Paape, M. J., and Zhao,

X. (2008). Bacterial lipopolysaccharide induces increased expression of toll-like receptor

(TLR) 4 and downstream TLR signaling molecules in bovine mammary epithelial cells. *Vet.*

Res. doi:10.1051/vetres:2007047.

Janssen, N. A. H., Hoek, G., Simic-Lawson, M., Fischer, P., van Bree, L., ten Brink, H., et al.

(2011). Black carbon as an additional indicator of the adverse health effects of airborne

particles compared with PM10 and PM2.5. *Environ. Heal. Perspect.* 119, 1691–1699.

doi:10.1289/ehp.1003369.

Jansson, Å. (2013). Reaching for a sustainable, resilient urban future using the lens of ecosystem

services. *Ecol. Econ.* 86, 285–291. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2012.06.013.

Karlsson, H. L., Nilsson, L., and Möller, L. (2005). Subway particles are more genotoxic than

street particles and induce oxidative stress in cultured human lung cells. *Chem. Res.*

Toxicol. doi:10.1021/tx049723c.

Katoh, K., and Standley, D. M. (2013). MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version 7:

improvements in performance and usability. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 30, 772–780.

doi:10.1093/molbev/mst010.

Kembel, S. W., Jones, E., Kline, J., Northcutt, D., Stenson, J., Womack, A. M., et al. (2012).

Architectural design influences the diversity and structure of the built environment

microbiome. *ISME J.* 6, 1469–1479. doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.211.

Kembel, S. W., Meadow, J. F., O'Connor, T. K., Mhuireach, G., Northcutt, D., Kline, J., et al.

(2014). Architectural design drives the biogeography of indoor bacterial communities. *PLoS*

One 9, e87093. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0087093.

Klepac-Ceraj, V., Lemon, K. P., Martin, T. R., Allgaier, M., Kembel, S. W., Knapp, A. A., et al.

(2010). Relationship between cystic fibrosis respiratory tract bacterial communities and age,

genotype, antibiotics and Pseudomonas aeruginosa. *Environ. Microbiol.* 12, 1293–1303.

Available at: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1462-

2920.2010.02173.x?casa_token=5sGx-

sTSZR4AAAAA:K43hfsj2XpBgXqsUO4r7EGEaFJae17d2jxzw7K0u41Ic3aooXHHXlvup

mInoDeGjs-GiGLLWMqFeu3DT.

Klepeis, N. E., Nelson, W. C., Ott, W. R., Robinson, J. P., Tsang, A. M., Switzer, P., et al.

(2001). The National Human Activity Pattern Survey (NHAPS): a resource for assessing

exposure to environmental pollutants. *J. Expo. Anal. Environ. Epidemiol.* 11, 231–252.

doi:10.1038/sj.jea.7500165.

Larondelle, N., Hamstead, Z. A., Kremer, P., Haase, D., and McPhearson, T. (2014). Applying a

novel urban structure classification to compare the relationships of urban structure and

surface temperature in Berlin and New York City. *Appl. Geogr.* 53, 427–437.

doi:10.1016/j.apgeog.2014.07.004.

Lauber, C. L., Ramirez, K. S., Aanderud, Z., Lennon, J., and Fierer, N. (2013). Temporal

variability in soil microbial communities across land-use types. *ISME J.* 7, 1641–1650.

doi:10.1038/ismej.2013.50.

Lee, S., Choi, B., Yi, S. M., and Ko, G. P. (2009). Characterization of microbial community

during Asian dust events in Korea. *Sci. Total Environ.* 407, 5308–5314.

doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2009.06.052.

Leung, M. H. Y., Wilkins, D., Li, E. K. T., Kong, F. K. F., and Lee, P. K. H. (2014). Indoor-air

microbiome in an urban subway network: diversity and dynamics. *Appl. Environ.*

Microbiol. 80, 6760–6770. doi:10.1128/AEM.02244-14.

Li, H., Zhou, X.-Y., Yang, X.-R., Zhu, Y.-G., Hong, Y.-W., and Su, J.-Q. (2019). Spatial and

seasonal variation of the airborne microbiome in a rapidly developing city of China. *Sci.*

Total Environ. 665, 61–68. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.01.367.

Linz, A. M., Crary, B. C., Shade, A., Owens, S., Gilbert, J. A., Knight, R., et al. (2017). Bacterial

Community Composition and Dynamics Spanning Five Years in Freshwater Bog Lakes.

mSphere 2. doi:10.1128/mSphere.00169-17.

Louca, S., and Doebeli, M. (2018). Efficient comparative phylogenetics on large trees.

Bioinformatics 34, 1053–1055. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btx701.

Lozupone, C., and Knight, R. (2005). UniFrac: a new phylogenetic method for comparing

microbial communities. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 71, 8228–8235.

doi:10.1128/AEM.71.12.8228-8235.2005.

Luckey, T. D. (1972). Introduction to intestinal microecology. *Am. J. Clin. Nutr.* 25, 1292–1294.

doi:10.1093/ajcn/25.12.1292.

Lymperopoulou, D. S., Adams, R. I., and Lindow, S. E. (2016). Contribution of Vegetation to

the Microbial Composition of Nearby Outdoor Air. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 82, 3822–

3833. doi:10.1128/AEM.00610-16.

Lynch, S. V, Wood, R. A., Boushey, H., Bacharier, L. B., Bloomberg, G. R., Kattan, M., et al.

(2014). Effects of early-life exposure to allergens and bacteria on recurrent wheeze and

atopy in urban children. *J. Allergy Clin. Immunol.* 134, 593-601.e12.

doi:10.1016/j.jaci.2014.04.018.

Mazar, Y., Cytryn, E., Erel, Y., and Rudich, Y. (2016). Effect of Dust Storms on the

Atmospheric Microbiome in the Eastern Mediterranean. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 50, 4194–

4202. doi:10.1021/acs.est.5b06348.

McPhearson, T., Pickett, S. T. A. A., Grimm, N. B., Niemelä, J., Alberti, M., Elmqvist, T., et al.

(2016). Advancing Urban Ecology toward a Science of Cities. *Bioscience*, biw002.

doi:10.1093/biosci/biw002.

Meadow, J. F., Altrichter, A. E., Bateman, A. C., Stenson, J., Brown, G. Z., Green, J. L., et al.

(2015). Humans differ in their personal microbial cloud. *PeerJ* 3, e1258.

doi:10.7717/peerj.1258.

Meadow, J. F., Altrichter, A. E., Kembel, S. W., Kline, J., Mhuireach, G., Moriyama, M., et al.

(2014). Indoor airborne bacterial communities are influenced by ventilation, occupancy, and

outdoor air source. *Indoor Air* 24, 41–48. doi:10.1111/ina.12047.

Methé, B. A., Hiorns, W. D., and Zehr, J. P. (1998). Contrasts between marine and freshwater

bacterial community composition: Analyses of communities in Lake George and six other

Adirondack lakes. *Limnol. Ocean.* 43, 368–374. doi:10.4319/lo.1998.43.2.0368.

Mhuireach, G. Á., Betancourt-Román, C. M., Green, J. L., and Johnson, B. R. (2019a).

Spatiotemporal Controls on the Urban Aerobiome. *Front. Ecol. Evol.* 7, 43.

doi:10.3389/fevo.2019.00043.

Mhuireach, G., Betancourt-Román, C. M., Green, J. L., and Johnson, B. R. (2019b).

Spatiotemporal controls on the urban aerobiome. *Front. Ecol. Evol.*

doi:10.3389/fevo.2019.00043.

Mills, J. G., Weinstein, P., Gellie, N. J. C., Weyrich, L. S., Lowe, A. J., and Breed, M. F. (2017).

Urban habitat restoration provides a human health benefit through microbiome rewilding:

the Microbiome Rewilding Hypothesis. *Restor. Ecol.* 25, 866–872. Available at:

https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/rec.12610?casa_token=hMKwkkcEjnYAA

AAA:EUkH6N_7thD2KBqWl9e3h5BRN-

rHGUoLG3QC5hL1FAWnk66u7v6E2pxqei83AsaHm7h-akXsmqeNh2XY.

Nemergut, D. R., Schmidt, S. K., Fukami, T., O'Neill, S. P., Bilinski, T. M., Stanish, L. F., et al.

(2013). Patterns and processes of microbial community assembly. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol.*

Rev. 77, 342–356. doi:10.1128/MMBR.00051-12.

Pan, Y., Pan, X., Xiao, H., and Xiao, H. (2019). Structural Characteristics and Functional

Implications of PM2.5 Bacterial Communities During Fall in Beijing and Shanghai, China.

Front. Microbiol. 10. doi:10.3389/fmicb.2019.02369.

Pankhurst, L. J., Whitby, C., Pawlett, M., Larcombe, L. D., McKew, B., Deacon, L. J., et al.

(2012). Temporal and spatial changes in the microbial bioaerosol communities in green-

waste composting. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 79, 229–239. doi:10.1111/j.1574-

6941.2011.01210.x.

Pearson, A. L., Pechal, J., Lin, Z., Benbow, M. E., Schmidt, C., and Mavoa, S. (2020).

Associations detected between measures of neighborhood environmental conditions and

human microbiome diversity. *Sci. Total Environ.* doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.141029.

Pearson, A. L., Rzotkiewicz, A., Pechal, J. L., Schmidt, C. J., Jordan, H. R., Zwickle, A., et al.

(2019). Initial Evidence of the Relationships between the Human Postmortem Microbiome

and Neighborhood Blight and Greening Efforts. *Ann. Am. Assoc. Geogr.*

doi:10.1080/24694452.2018.1519407.

Pechal, J. L., Schmidt, C. J., Jordan, H. R., and Benbow, M. E. (2018). A large-scale survey of

the postmortem human microbiome, and its potential to provide insight into the living

health condition. *Sci. Rep.* doi:10.1038/s41598-018-23989-w.

Price, M. N., Dehal, P. S., and Arkin, A. P. (2009). FastTree: computing large minimum

evolution trees with profiles instead of a distance matrix. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 26, 1641–1650.

doi:10.1093/molbev/msp077.

Quast, C., Pruesse, E., Yilmaz, P., Gerken, J., Schweer, T., Yarza, P., et al. (2013). The SILVA

ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools.

Nucleic Acids Res. 41, D590-6. doi:10.1093/nar/gks1219.

Reese, A. T., Savage, A., Youngsteadt, E., McGuire, K. L., Koling, A., Watkins, O., et al.

(2016). Urban stress is associated with variation in microbial species composition—but not

richness—in Manhattan. *ISME J.* 10, 751–760. doi:10.1038/ismej.2015.152.

Rook, G. A. W. (2009). Review series on helminths, immune modulation and the hygiene

hypothesis: the broader implications of the hygiene hypothesis. *Immunology* 126, 3–11.

doi:10.1111/j.1365-2567.2008.03007.x.

Round, J. L., and Mazmanian, S. K. (2009). The gut microbiota shapes intestinal immune

responses during health and disease. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* 9, 313–323. doi:10.1038/nri2515.

Ruokolainen, L., von Hertzen, L., Fyhrquist, N., Laatikainen, T., Lehtomäki, J., Auvinen, P., et

al. (2015). Green areas around homes reduce atopic sensitization in children. *Allergy* 70,

195–202. doi:10.1111/all.12545.

Schaub, B., Liu, J., Höppler, S., Schleich, I., Huehn, J., Olek, S., et al. (2009). Maternal farm

exposure modulates neonatal immune mechanisms through regulatory T cells. *J. Allergy*

Clin. Immunol. doi:10.1016/j.jaci.2009.01.056.

Shaffer, B. T., and Lighthart, B. (1997). Survey of Culturable Airborne Bacteria at Four Diverse

Locations in Oregon: Urban, Rural, Forest, and Coastal. *Microb. Ecol.* 34, 167–177.

doi:10.1007/s002489900046.

Shakya, K. M., Kremer, P., Henderson, K., McMahon, M., Peltier, R. E., Bromberg, S., et al.

(2019). Mobile monitoring of air and noise pollution in Philadelphia neighborhoods during

summer 2017. *Environ. Pollut.* 255, 113195. doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2019.113195.

Shannon, C. E., and Weaver, W. (1963). The mathematical theory of communication. *Univ.*

Illinois Press 5, 1–131. doi:10.1145/584091.584093.

Smith, D. J., Timonen, H. J., Jaffe, D. A., Griffin, D. W., Birmele, M. N., Perry, K. D., et al.

(2013). Intercontinental dispersal of bacteria and archaea by transpacific winds. *Appl.*

Environ. Microbiol. 79, 1134–1139. doi:10.1128/AEM.03029-12.

Soga, M., and Gaston, K. J. (2016). Extinction of experience: the loss of human–nature

interactions. *Front. Ecol. Environ.* 14, 94–101. doi:10.1002/fee.1225.

Steele, H. L., and Streit, W. R. (2005). Metagenomics: Advances in ecology and biotechnology.

FEMS Microbiol. Lett. doi:10.1016/j.femsle.2005.05.011.

Stewart, J., Shakya, K. M., Bilinski, T., Wilson, J., Ravi, S., and Choi, C. S. (2020). Variation of

near surface atmosphere microbial communities at an urban and a suburban site in

Philadelphia, PA, USA. *Sci. Total Environ.*, 138353. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138353.

Takeuchi, O., Kawai, T., Mühlradt, P. F., Morr, M., Radolf, J. D., Zychlinsky, A., et al. (2001).

Discrimination of bacterial lipoproteins by Toll-like recepttor 6. *Int. Immunol.*

doi:10.1093/intimm/13.7.933.

Täubel, M., Rintala, H., Pitkäranta, M., Paulin, L., Laitinen, S., Pekkanen, J., et al. (2009). The

occupant as a source of house dust bacteria. *J. Allergy Clin. Immunol.* 124, 834–40.e47.

doi:10.1016/j.jaci.2009.07.045.

Triadó-Margarit, X., Veillette, M., Duchaine, C., Talbot, M., Amato, F., Minguillón, M. C., et al.

(2017). Bioaerosols in the Barcelona subway system. *Indoor Air* 27, 564–575.

doi:10.1111/ina.12343.

Turnbaugh, P. J., Bäckhed, F., Fulton, L., and Gordon, J. I. (2008). Diet-induced obesity is

linked to marked but reversible alterations in the mouse distal gut microbiome. *Cell Host*

Microbe 3, 213–223. doi:10.1016/j.chom.2008.02.015.

Vellend, M. (2010). Conceptual synthesis in community ecology. *Q. Rev. Biol.* 85, 183–206.

Available at: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20565040.

von Hertzen, L., Hanski, I., and Haahtela, T. (2011). Natural immunity. *EMBO Rep.* 12, 1089–

1093. doi:10.1038/embor.2011.195.

Wallace, J., Corr, D., Deluca, P., Kanaroglou, P., and McCarry, B. (2009). Mobile monitoring of

air pollution in cities: the case of Hamilton, Ontario, Canada. *J. Environ. Monit.* 11, 998–

1003. doi:10.1039/b818477a.

Whiteson, K. L., Bailey, B., Bergkessel, M., Conrad, D., Delhaes, L., Felts, B., et al. (2014). The

upper respiratory tract as a microbial source for pulmonary infections in cystic fibrosis:

Parallels from island biogeography. *Am. J. Respir. Crit. Care Med.*

doi:10.1164/rccm.201312-2129PP.

Wilkinson, D. M., Koumoutsaris, S., Mitchell, E. A. D., and Bey, I. (2012). Modelling the effect

of size on the aerial dispersal of microorganisms. *J. Biogeogr.* 39, 89–97.

doi:10.1111/j.1365-2699.2011.02569.x.

Willis, K. A., Stewart, J. D., and Ambalavanan, N. (2020). Recent Advances in Understanding

the Ecology of the Lung Microbiota and Deciphering the Gut-Lung Axis.

https://doi.org/10.1152/ajplung.00360.2020. doi:10.1152/ajplung.00360.2020.

Wu, Y., Liu, J., Zhai, J., Cong, L., Wang, Y., Ma, W., et al. (2018). Comparison of dry and wet

deposition of particulate matter in near-surface waters during summer. *PLoS One* 13,

e0199241. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0199241.

You, R., Cui, W., Chen, C., and Zhao, B. (2013). Measuring the short-term emission rates of

particles in the "personal cloud" with different clothes and activity intensities in a sealed

chamber. *Aerosol Air Qual. Res.* 13, 911e21. Available at:

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Bin_Zhao/publication/273451233_Measuring_short-

term_emission_rate_of_particles_in_the_personal_cloud_with_different_clothes_and_activi

ty_intensities_in_a_sealed_chamber/links/550243d90cf231de076de914/Measuring-short-te.

Zhao, J., Schloss, P. D., Kalikin, L. M., Carmody, L. A., Foster, B. K., Petrosino, J. F., et al.

(2012). Decade-long bacterial community dynamics in cystic fibrosis airways. *Proc. Natl.*

Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 109, 5809–5814. doi:10.1073/pnas.1120577109.

Figure 1: STURLA map of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA where each color corresponds to a

different STURLA code. T: trees, G: grass, B: bare, W: water, P: pavement, L: low-rise, M:

midrise, H: highrise. The combination of these individual letters creates a STURLA code; for

example, class *tgpl* is composed of various proportions of trees (T), grass (G), pavement (P), and

low-rise buildings (L).

Figure 2: Sampling routes for each day of collection, colors correspond with STURLA class. The

reader is encouraged to zoom in on each map to examine the spatial distribution of sampling and

the corresponding STURLA class. T: trees, G: grass, B: bare, W: water, P: pavement, L: low-

rise, M: midrise, H: highrise. The combination of these individual letters creates a STURLA

code; for example, class *tgpl* is composed of various proportions of trees (T), grass (G),

pavement (P), and low-rise buildings (L).

Figure 3: A. Routes where indoor transit system air was collected (BSL: Broad Street Line,

MFL: Market-Frankford Line, NHL: Norristown Highspeed Line) B. Barplot of mean class

frequency encountered while driving, colors correspond with STURLA class.

Figure 4 : A. Principal Coordinates Analysis (PcoA) of phylogenetic beta-diversity (between

sites) using unweighted UnifFrac distances with air type colored by site and shaped by indoor

(circle) and outdoor (triangle) air. Shape/Color X Shape/Color indicates the factors used in

hypothesis testing with the test above and p-value to the right. B. Principal Coordinates Analysis

(PcoA) of inferred functional potential beta-diversity (between sites) using Bray-Curtis

dissimilarity with air type colored by site (green: indoor transit, dark brown: outdoor route 1,

light brown: outdoor route 2) and shaped by indoor (circle) and outdoor (triangle) air.

Shape/Color X Shape/Color indicates the factors used in hypothesis testing with the test above

and p-value to the right. It should be noted the split color is for visualization and statistical tests

were conducted on outdoor ~ indoor samples. C. Relative abundances of phyla identified in

samples separated by air type (outdoor route 1 vs outdoor route 2 vs indoor transit) with

collection date above each column.

Figure 5. Alpha Diversity Metrics separated by air type (circle: indoor transit, triangle: outdoor)

and route driven for outdoor samples (color) with date of collection on the x axis. Shape/Color X

Shape/Color indicates the factors used in hypothesis testing with the test above and p-value to

the right. It should be noted the split color is for visualization and statistical tests were conducted

on outdoor ~ indoor samples. A. Faith's phylogenetic diversity (PD). B. Inferred functional

diversity calculated using the Shannon index on PICRUSt functional pathways. C. Observed

number of ASVs. D. Pielou's evenness metric.

Figure 6. A. Relative abundances of sources identified in samples separated by air type on the

bottom (outdoor route 1 vs outdoor route 2 vs indoor transit) with collection date above each

column. Hypothesis test results and factors are under the legend. B. Relative abundances of

potentially pathogenic taxa identified in samples separated by air type on the bottom (outdoor

route 1 vs outdoor route 2 vs indoor transit) with collection date above each column. Taxa in

abundance smaller than 0.01% were grouped in the category "other" for visualization only.

Hypothesis test results and factors are under the legend.

Figure 7: A. Heatmap of Permutational correlation coefficients where lighter colors indicate

magnitude of the correlation. X indicates a statistically significant p-value after Bonferroni

correction. STURLA Code elements: t: trees, g: grass, p: pavement, b: bare, w: water, l: lowrise,

m: midrise, h, highrise.

830
831

A. Indoor Transit Routes

Train
- BSL
- MFL
- NHL