1

Growth, metabolism, and morphology of *Akkermansia muciniphila* grown in

different nutrient media

Zhi-tao Li[a], Guo-ao Hu[a], Li Zhu[b], Zheng-long Sun[c], Yun-Jiang, Min-jie Gao[a*], Xiao-bei Zhan[a*]

[a] Key Laboratory of Carbohydrate Chemistry and Biotechnology, Ministry of

Education,

School of Biotechnology, Jiangnan University, Wuxi 214122, China

[b] Wuxi Galaxy Biotech Co. Ltd., Wuxi 214125, China

[c] Suzhou Institute of Biomedical Engineering and Technology, Chinese Academy of

Sciences,

Suzhou 215163, China

*Corresponding authors:

Tel: +86 0510 85918299

gaominjie@msn.com (Min-jie Gao)

E-mail: xbzhan@yahoo.com (Xiao-bei Zhan)

Abstract: *Akkermansia muciniphila*, a human intestinal microbe, is a potential next-generation probiotic. Therefore, studying the in vitro cultivation of *A. muciniphila* is important. In this study, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media were used to ferment *A. muciniphila* in vitro. Results showed that HM had the highest biomass of *A. muciniphila* (2.89 g/L). The main metabolites of HM and PM were acetic and butyric acids, and the main metabolites of BHI medium, BPM, and BHM were acetic, propionic, isobutyric, butyric, isovaleric, and valeric acids. The butyric acid concentrations of BPM and BHM reached 9.88 and 12.88 mM, respectively. *A. muciniphila* had the highest outer membrane protein concentration in PM and HM, reaching 24.36 and 26.26 μg/mg, respectively. Electron microscopy showed that the outer membrane thickness of *A. muciniphila* was positively correlated with the outer membrane protein concentration. The appearance of *A. muciniphila* was round or elliptical in five kinds of culture media. In the BHI medium, *A. muciniphila* had the smallest diameter and length of 871 nm. This study provides a theoretical basis for the regulation of host metabolism of *A. muciniphila*.

Keywords: *Akkermansia muciniphila,* short-chain fatty acids, bioreactor, anaerobic fermentation

Importance

This article explains the growth, metabolism and appearance of *Akkermansia muciniphila* previously described as strictly anaerobic bacteria in different nutrient media. Interestingly, the nutritional composition has a presumptive relationship with *A. muciniphila* biomass, outer membrane protein concentration and thickness, and diameter. At conditions containing mucin as sole carbon and nitrogen sources, the metabolites of *A. muciniphila* are acetic and butyric acids. This study provides a certain reference for the mechanism of action of *A. muciniphila* in the host.

1. Introduction

In recent years, the research and the development of *Akkermansia muciniphila* has attracted interest[1-5]. *A. muciniphila* is an elliptical, immobile, strictly anaerobic Gram-negative strain that can use mucin in the intestine as carbon, nitrogen, and energy sources for growth[6]. The main metabolite of *A. muciniphila* is a short-chain fatty acid[7-9]. Evidence shows that *A. muciniphila* has a causal relationship with obesity[10-13], diabetes[14-16], inflammation[17-18], autism[19-20], amyotrophic lateral sclerosis[21], premature aging[22], epilepsy[23], hypertension[24], cancer[25] and metabolic abnormalities[26]. Thus, *A. muciniphila* is considered a potential probiotic especially in the prevention and the treatment of diabetes, obesity, and related metabolic disorders in terms of potential. A recent study shows that pasteurized *A. muciniphila* is better than live bacteria in preventing obesity and related complications due to the bacterial outer membrane protein Amuc-1100[13]. This discovery is important and provides an important theoretical basis for the application of the bacteria in clinical treatment. Therefore, the high-density industrial cultivation research for *A. muciniphila* is a future research hotspot.

Most intestinal bacteria are generally aerobic or facultative anaerobic bacteria. The use of nutrient-rich medium or semicombined medium with appropriate carbon source can achieve the purpose of separation and cultivation, and *A. muciniphila* is a typical strict anaerobic bacterium and extremely difficult to isolate and culture[6]. *A. muciniphila* grows slowly in a medium with glucose, N-acetylglucosamine, and N-acetylgalactosamine as carbon sources and grows well in the mucin basic medium[27-29]. The pig-derived mucin is the key component of *A. muciniphila* medium in most reports. By adding a certain amount of mucin to the brain heart

extract (BHI) broth to cultivate *A. muciniphila*, the nutritional requirements for its growth can

be met. The in vitro culture of *A. muciniphila* with human mucin has not been reported yet. In

porcine mucin medium, *A. muciniphila* can grow in single cells or in pairs and rarely grow in

chains. *A. muciniphila* usually forms aggregates, and a translucent layer of material can be

observed. In the BHI medium, this substance is rarely observed, and cells appear alone or in

pairs but rarely in groups.

Previous studies show that *A. muciniphila* cultured in different media has different

aggregates and cell sizes[6]. Therefore, *A. muciniphila* cultured in different media is conjectured

to have evident characteristics in terms of growth, metabolites, and appearance. In this study,

A. muciniphila was cultured in vitro by using the BHI medium and porcine- (PM), human-

(HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media. The

growth status, metabolites, and appearance morphology in different media and the preliminary

exploration of the mechanism of action of *A. muciniphila* and the host were determined.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1 . Strains and media

2.1.1 Strains

A. muciniphila DSM 22959 was purchased from the German Collection of

Microorganisms and Cell Cultures.

2.1.2 Medium preparation

The BHI medium contained 10.0 g/L tryptone, 2.5 g/L dibasic sodium phosphate, 17.5 g/L

BHI, 5.0 g/L sodium chloride, and 2.0 g/L glucose and was maintained at pH 7.4.

The PM contained 4 g/L porcine mucin, 2.5 g/L disodium hydrogen phosphate, and 5.0

g/L sodium chloride and was maintained at pH 7.4 (porcine mucin, Kuer, Beijing)

The HM contained 4 g/L human mucin, 2.5 g/L disodium hydrogen phosphate, and 5.0

g/L sodium chloride and was maintained at pH 7.4 (human mucin, extracted from pancreatic

myxoma)

The BPM contained 10.0 g/L tryptone, 2.5 g/L disodium hydrogen phosphate, 17.5 g/L

bovine heart dip powder, 5.0 g/L sodium chloride, 2.0 g/L glucose, and 4 g/L pig-derived mucin

and was maintained at pH 7.4.

The BHM contained 10.0 g/L tryptone, 2.5 g/L disodium hydrogen phosphate, 17.5 g/L

bovine heart dip powder, 5.0 g/L sodium chloride, 2.0 g/L glucose, and 4 g/L human mucin and

was maintained at pH 7.4.

All media had the same concentration, magnetically stirred for 2 h, mixed well, and

sterilized at 121°C for 30 min before use.

2.2. Cultivation method

2.2.1 Device introduction

An in vitro model of the bionic large intestine was developed to simulate the environment

of *A. muciniphila* in the real large intestine[30]. As shown in Figure 1, the model was composed

of three interconnected reaction bottles with a flexible and transparent model that simulated the

internal intestinal wall and the shape of the bionic large intestine. The membrane between the

reaction flask and the large intestine (Figure 1d) was filled with deionized water at 37 °C. The

simulated large intestine contracted and caused peristaltic waves by controlling the pressure of

the water flow of the circulating water pump through the computer. Thus, the materials in the

simulated large intestine were mixed and moved in the system. This mixing was better than the

mixing done in the fermenter, where the phase separation of fluid and solid occurred. The

reaction bottle was equipped with vacuum (Figure 1g) and mixed gas (Figure 1h) control

devices to continuously maintain the oxygen-free environment in the simulation chamber. The

system was also added with a water absorption device that simulated the function of the large

intestine (Figure 1j). The mixture in the cavity was absorbed to simulate the formation of feces.

By continuously measuring the pH (Figure 1l) and secreting alkaline solution (Figure 1e) to

neutralize the acid, the system pH was maintained to prevent the accumulation of microbial

metabolites (when the model accumulated, inhibition or death occurred). The system was

equipped with a dialysis device, which consisted of hollow fiber nanofiltration membranes that

filtered the metabolic products of microorganisms. Thus, the microbial metabolites in the model

cavity were maintained at physiological concentrations. The specific operation of dynamic

culture was as follows. First, the air tightness of the system was checked, and the whole reactor

was immersed in water. The mixed gas aerator was opened to fill the reactor cavity with gas. If

no bubble emerged, the air tightness of the system was good. The connection seals of each

reaction bottle were detected to ensure that no bubble emerged.

2.2.2 Inoculation method

An aliquot of frozen stock culture of *A. muciniphila* (100 μL) was inoculated in 5 mL

medium and incubated at 37 °C for 48 h under strict anaerobic conditions (hydrogen, 5%;

carbon dioxide, 10%; nitrogen, 85%). The configured medium was added into the bionic large

intestine in vitro model through the sample port, placed in a sterilization pot maintained at

121 °C for 30 min, and cooled to 37 °C. The extraction valve was opened, and the air in the

model was extracted. The extraction valve was closed, and the inflation valve was opened.

Anaerobic gas (hydrogen, 5%; carbon dioxide, 10%; nitrogen 85%) was poured into the model,

and the process was repeated thrice for the model to have an anaerobic environment. The seed

fluid flow of the incubated strain was added to the model cavity through a peristaltic pump. The

model peristaltic system and the dynamic cultivation of the strain were started. In addition, the

OD_{600} module (Figure 1m) can be added to this model to monitor the OD_{600} value of the

fermentation broth in real time.

Figure 1 Bionic large intestine dynamic digestion model: (A) discharge port, (B) sealing ring,

(C) reaction bottle, (D) simulated large intestine, (E) alkali-adding port, (F) feeding port, (G)

vacuum port, (H) filling mixed gas port, (I) sample port, (J) water suction device, (K) sampling

port, (L) pH electrode, (M) OD600 detection module, (N) peristaltic tube, (O) filter screen, (P)

dialysis device.

2.2.3 . Biomass determination

The fermentation broth (10 mL) was collected and centrifuged, washed twice with

deionized water, moved to the centrifuge tube after weighing, and centrifuged to obtain the cells.

The cells were dried at 105 °C and weighed.

2.2.4 Determination of the short-chain fatty acids of metabolites

The fermentation broth (1 mL) was collected, added with 10 μL 2-methylbutyric acid (1

M) as an internal standard, and slowly added with 250 μL concentrated hydrochloric acid. The

mixture was mixed well, added with 1 mL diethyl ether, vortexed for 1 min, and allowed to

stand until the organic and the water phases separated. The supernatant (organic phase) was

carefully collected, added with anhydrous sodium sulfate, vortexed, and passed through a 0.22

μm organic filter. The supernatant (5 μL) was injected into the Agilent 7890 gas chromatograph

equipped with an electron capture detector (Agilent, USA), which was used to determine the

short-chain fatty acids of *A. muciniphila*.

The gas chromatographic conditions were as follows: instrument, Agilent-7890A;

chromatography column, HP-INNOWAX; detector temperature, 250 °C; inlet temperature,

220 °C; flow rate, 1.5 mL/min; split ratio, 1:20; heating program, 60 °C–190 °C, 4 min; and

injection volume, 5 μL.

2.2.5 Bacterial outer membrane protein extraction method and concentration determination

A. muciniphila was subjected to outer membrane protein extraction using the bacterial

outer membrane protein extraction kit (BIOLABO HR0095, Beijing), and the protein content

was estimated using the enhanced BCA protein assay kit (Beyotime Biotechnology, Beijing).

2.2.6 FSEM and FTEM

The cultured strains were washed with PBS buffer; fixed with 2.5% glutaraldehyde

solution at 4 °C for 2 h; washed again with PBS buffer; dehydrated using 30%, 50%, 70%, 80%,

90%, and 100% alcohol; dried; sprayed with gold; and lyophilized using the SU8200 (Japan)

equipment. FSEM analysis was performed, and the morphology of *A. muciniphila* was observed

at 3.0 KV×10.0k. The cell suspension was dropped on the copper grid and then dried at room

temperature. TEM observations were taken by a transmission electronic microscope (JEM-I010,

Hitachi, Tokyo, Japan) in 120 kV.

2.2.7 A. muciniphila outer membrane relative thickness and diameter measurement

The TEM and SEM images were imported into the Adobe Photoshop CC 20.0.4, and the

ruler tool was used to measure the relative thickness and diameter of the adventitia. Each cell

was measured four times at different locations and averaged.

2.2.8 Statistical analysis

Data were expressed as mean ± SEM. Differences between the two groups were assessed

using the unpaired two-tailed Student t test. The data sets that involved more than two groups

were assessed using ANOVA. In the figures, data with * were significantly different at P < 0.05

in accordance with posthoc ANOVA. Data were analyzed using the GraphPad Prism version

8.00 for Windows (GraphPad Software).

Statistical comparisons were indicated with *, **, and *** for P < 0.05, P < 0.01, and P <

0.001, respectively.

2.   Results and Discussion

3.1 Effect of different media on A. muciniphila biomass

First, the *A. muciniphila* biomass with different sources of mucin medium was compared.

As shown in Figure 2a, the *A. muciniphila* biomass grown in PM and HM slowly grew at 0–18

h, and the *A. muciniphila* biomass grown in PM (0.68 g/L) was higher than that in HM (0.35

g/L) because the mucin in the culture medium was the only carbon and nitrogen sources for the

growth of *A. muciniphila*. When the A. muciniphila grew, glycosidase should be secreted to

degrade the glycoprotein exposed to the terminal in mucin and the N-acetylgalactosamine, N-

acetylglucosamine, fucose, and galactose components that grow as a carbon source[31-33]. The *A.*

muciniphila in PM grew better than that in HM. This finding was because the pig-derived mucin

in PM was highly pure and easily degraded by *A. muciniphila*, whereas the human-derived

mucin in HM was extracted from the human body and only purified once*, so at the beginning,*

the utilization rate of A. muciniphila to HM was not high. The *A. muciniphila* grown in PM and

HM were in the logarithmic growth period from 18 h to 36 h. During this period, *A. muciniphila*

adapted to the growth environment of the medium, and the secretion rates of glycosidase and

protease accelerated, resulting in increased degradation of mucin. At 36–48 h, the biomass of

A. muciniphila in HM exceeded that in PM and reached 2.89 g/L at 48 h, and this finding may

be because the strain used was extracted from the human body and suitable for human mucin

culture medium. These results proved that the culture medium based on human mucin was

suitable for the growth of *A. muciniphila*. Moreover, the effects of the BHI medium, BPM, and

BHM on the growth performance of *A. muciniphila* were studied. As shown in Figure 2b, the

A. muciniphila grown in BPM and BHM were in logarithmic growth phase at 4–8 h, and the *A.*

muciniphila biomass in BPM (1.26 g/L) was higher than that in BHM (0.85 g/L). The *A.*

muciniphila grown in the BHI medium was in the logarithmic growth phase at 8–12 h, and the

A. muciniphila biomass of 0.61 g/L was obtained, which was lower than that in BPM and BHM.

The BHI, BPM and BHM subsequently entered a stable growth phase. After 48 h, the biomasses

in the BHI medium, BPM, and BHM were 1.17, 1.92, and 1.96 g/L, respectively. BPM and

BHM had better growth effects than the BHI medium because *A. muciniphila* grew best on

mucin-based medium. Derrien and colleagues have found that *A. muciniphila* can also grow on

a limited amount of sugar, including N-acetylglucosamine, N-acetylgalactosamine, and

glucose[6, 29]. The BHI medium contains 2 g/L glucose and has a rich nitrogen source that can

replace mucin. Thus, the BHI medium can support the growth of *A. muciniphila*, but the

biomass is only half of that obtained using the mucin medium. In addition, soy protein and

threonine can be used instead of mucin, and a certain amount of N-acetylglucosamine, N-

acetylgalactosamine, and glucose can be added to form a mixed medium to cultivate *A.*

muciniphila, and the biomass of which is not significantly different with that grown in BPM[13,

34]. In addition, the study found that by adding fructooligosaccharides[35-36], metformin[37-38],

polyphenols[39-42], probiotics[43] and fish oil unsaturated fatty acids[44] can increase the abundance

of *A. muciniphila* in vivo.

Figure 2 Effect of different media on the *A. muciniphila* biomass.

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added

porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media

3.2 Effect of different media on the A. muciniphila metabolites

A. muciniphila is an anaerobic bacterium found in the intestinal tract and a potential

probiotic that has a causal relationship with various chronic diseases, such as obesity and

diabetes. The main metabolite of *A. muciniphila* is a short-chain fatty acid. In this study, the

type and the concentration *of A. muciniphila* short-chain fatty acid metabolite in five kinds of

culture media were measured, and an interesting conclusion was obtained, as shown in Figure

3. The metabolites of *A. muciniphila* in HM were acetic and butyric acids in linear fatty acids,

whereas the metabolites of *A. muciniphila* in the BHI medium, BPM, and BHM were acetic,

propionic, butyric, valeric, isobutyric, and isovaleric acids in branched-chain fatty acid. In PM

and HM, the concentrations of acetic acid (4–6 mM) were not significantly different (Figure

3b), but the concentrations of butyric acid were significantly different (Figure 3a, $P < 0.05$).

The concentrations of butyric acid reached 1.06 mM in HM and 0.68 mM in PM. The latest

research shows the causal relationship between the butyric acid produced by intestinal

microorganisms and the risk of diabetes[45]. Butyric acid can promote the secretion of insulin by

β cells, regulate blood sugar, and improve the body's insulin response[46-47]. Further research is

needed on the mechanism of *A. muciniphila*'s main metabolites (i.e., acetic and butyric acids)

in PM and HM. The concentrations of acetic acid in the BHI medium, BPM, and BHM are

shown in Figure 3c. The concentrations of acetic acid in the BHI medium (50.43 mM) and

BHM (22.81 mM) were significantly different ($P < 0.05$). No significant difference was

observed in the concentrations of propionic acid among the BHI medium, BPM, and BHM

(Figure 3d). The concentrations of isobutyric acid in the BHI medium (3.15 mM) and BHM

(2.88 mM) were significantly different (Figure 3e, $P < 0.05$). The concentration of butyric acid

is shown in Fig. 3f. The concentrations of butyric acid in the BHI medium (5.79 mM), BPM

(9.88 mM), and BHM (12.88 mM) were significantly different ($P < 0.05$). The concentrations

of isovaleric acid in the BHI medium (4.25 mM) and BHM (4.07 mM) were significantly

different ($P < 0.05$). The concentration of valeric acid is shown in Figure 3g. The concentration

of valeric acid in the BHI medium was very significantly different with that in BPM ($P < 0.01$).

The concentrations of valeric acid in the BHI medium and BHM were very significantly

different ($P < 0.001$), and those of BPM and BHM were also significantly different ($P < 0.05$).

The valeric acid concentrations in the BHI medium, BPM, and BHM were 0.14, 0.41, and 0.51

mM, respectively. Studies have shown that branched-chain fatty acids, such as isobutyric and

isovaleric acids, are derived from the fermentation of branched-chain amino acids[48]. Compared

with linear short-chain fatty acids, these compounds were considered harmful to the colon and

metabolic health. Isobutyric and isovaleric acids were produced in the BHI medium because

when the carbon source in the BHI medium was exhausted or difficult to ferment, *A.*

muciniphila turned to protein fermentation, which produced toxic metabolites, such as

isobutyric and isovaleric acids. The contents of butyric and valeric acids in BPM and BHM

were relatively high, indicating that the mucin or mucin used by *A. muciniphila* was used

simultaneously with glucose. This specific situation needs further research.

Figure 3 Effect of different media on the metabolites of *A. muciniphila*

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added

porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media

3.3 Effect of different media on the concentration of A. muciniphila outer membrane protein

A. muciniphila's outer membrane protein had a specific protein Amuc_1100, which can

maintain a stable state at the temperature of pasteurization and improve the intestinal barrier.

Through daily quantitative *A. muciniphila* feeding to mice, *A. muciniphila* can offset the

increase in body weight and fat caused by high-fat diet (HFD) and improve glucose tolerance

and insulin resistance, indicating that pasteurization *A. muciniphila* outer the beneficial effect

of membrane protein Amuc_1100 on HFD-induced metabolic syndrome. We quantitatively

detected the content of the outer membrane protein of *A. muciniphila* in five kinds of culture

media. As shown in Figure 4, the outer membrane protein concentrations of *A. muciniphila* in

the BHI medium, PM, HM, BPM, and BHM were 17.03, 24.36, 26.26, 18.34, and 19.45 µg/mg,

respectively. Significant differences were observed between BHI medium and BPM ($P < 0.05$),

BHI medium and BHM ($P < 0.05$), PM and HM ($P < 0.05$), PM and BHM ($P < 0.05$), BHI

medium and PM ($P < 0.01$), HM and BHM ($P < 0.01$), BHI medium and HM ($P < 0.001$), PM

and BPM ($P < 0.001$), and HM and BPM ($P < 0.001$). Results showed that the *A. muciniphila*

culture with medium containing only mucin from pig or human significantly increased the

concentration of the outer membrane protein. We speculated that the content of the Amuc_1100

protein increased to some extent. This provides a reference for the future increase in

Amuc_1100 A. muciniphila outer membrane protein content.

Figure 4 Effect of different media on the concentration of the *A. muciniphila* outer membrane

protein.

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added

porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media

3.4 Effects of different media on the thickness and diameter of A. muciniphila outer membrane

Figure 5 shows the TEM and SEM images of *A. muciniphila* in five kinds of culture media.

The cells of *A. muciniphila* were round or elliptical. The cells in the BHI medium grew alone

or in pairs, whereas the cells in PM, HM, BPM, and BHM containing mucin grew in pairs or

chains and even formed aggregates. The same morphology was observed with the Muct strain

studied by Derrien et al. As shown in Table 1, the relative thicknesses of the outer membranes

of *A. muciniphila* in the BHI medium, PM, HM, BPM, and BHM were 71.66, 101.20, 104.50,

71.46, and 72.11 nm, respectively. Significant differences were observed between BHI medium

and PM ($P < 0.05$), PM and BPM ($P < 0.05$), PM and BHM ($P < 0.05$), BHI medium and HM

($P < 0.01$), HM and BPM ($P < 0.01$), and HM and BHM ($P < 0.01$). No significant difference

was observed in the other remaining groups ($P > 0.05$). The above results were the same as

those of the outer membrane protein concentration of *A. muciniphila*, indicating that increased

outer membrane thickness of the cells resulted in high outer membrane protein concentration.

The cell diameters of *A. muciniphila* in the BHI medium, PM, HM, BPM, and BHM were 871,

985, 999, 980, and 971 nm, respectively. The cell diameter in the BHI medium was significantly

different with those of the four other media ($P < 0.05$), and no significant difference was

observed between the other groups ($P > 0.05$). Derrien et al. have found that the cell size differed

depending on the medium. In the mucin medium, *A. muciniphila* had a diameter and length of

640 and 690 nm, respectively. In the BHI medium, *A. muciniphila* had a diameter and length of

830 nm and 1 mm, respectively, which was also different from the conclusions obtained in this

study. The differences were because the present study used dynamic culture, whereas the former

study used static culture, causing a difference in the diameter of organism. This result showed

that *A. muciniphila* had improved outer membrane thickness and diameter in PM and HM.

These advantages provide a reference for the future high-density cultivation of *A. muciniphila*.

Figure 5 SEM and TEM images *of A. muciniphila* in different media.

In the figure, a, b, c, d, f respectively BHI, PM, HM, BPM and BHM. The brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM),

human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin

media

Table 1 Comparative analysis of relative thickness and diameter of akk outer membrane in

different culture media

Notes: a: Relative thickness of the outer membrane of *A. muciniphila,* b: Diameter of *A.*

muciniphila. The brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added

porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media

4 Conclusion

This study explored the growth status, metabolites, and appearance of *A. muciniphila* by

using five different media. The biomass of *A. muciniphila* grown in HM is the highest, followed

by that grown in PM, and the lowest was that grown in the BHI medium. The metabolites of *A.*

muciniphila in PM and HM are acetic and butyric acids, and the main metabolites in the BHI

medium, BPM and BHM are acetic, propionic, isobutyric, butyric, isovaleric, and valeric acids.

Among them, butyric and valeric acids in BPM and BHM are significantly different from those

in the BHI medium. The outer membrane protein concentrations of *A. muciniphila* in HM and PM are 35%–40% higher than that in the three other media. The relative thickness of *A. muciniphila* outer membrane is positively correlated with the concentration of the outer membrane protein. A thick outer membrane results in high outer membrane protein concentration. The appearance of *A. muciniphila* is round or oval. The diameter of *A. muciniphila* in the BHI medium is the smallest, and no significant difference in the diameter of other media is observed. This study can provide a reference for the metabolic mechanism of *A. muciniphila* to the host.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by National Key Research and Development Program of China (2017YFD0400302), Fundamental Research Funds for Central Universities (JUSRP51504, JUSRP51632A), and Jiangsu Province Modern Agriculture Key Project (BE2018367) and the Priority Academic Program Development of Jiangsu Higher Education Institutions, the 111 Project (No. 111-2-06) is gratefully acknowledged.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

References

1.   Cani, P. D.; de Vos, W. M., Next-Generation Beneficial Microbes: The Case of Akkermansia muciniphila. *Front Microbiol* **2017,** *8,* 1765.

2.   Zhai, Q.; Feng, S.; Arjan, N.; Chen, W., A next generation probiotic, Akkermansia muciniphila. *Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nutr.* **2019,** *59* (19), 3227-3236.

3.   Zhang, T.; Li, Q.; Cheng, L.; Buch, H.; Zhang, F., Akkermansia muciniphila is a promising probiotic. *Microb Biotechnol* **2019,** *12* (6), 1109-1125.

4.   van der Ark, K. C. H.; Aalvink, S.; Suarez-Diez, M.; Schaap, P. J.; de Vos, W. M.; Belzer, C., Model-driven design of a minimal medium for Akkermansia muciniphila confirms mucus adaptation. *Microb Biotechnol* **2018,** *11* (3), 476-485.

5.   Zhou, K., Strategies to promote abundance of Akkermansia muciniphila, an emerging probiotics in the gut, evidence from dietary intervention studies. *J Funct Foods* **2017,** *33,* 194-201.

6.   Derrien, M.; Vaughan, E. E.; Plugge, C. M.; de Vos, W. M., Akkermansia muciniphila gen. nov., sp. nov., a human intestinal mucin-degrading bacterium. *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* **2004,** *54* (Pt 5), 1469-76.

7.   Le Poul, E.; Loison, C.; Struyf, S.; Springael, J. Y.; Lannoy, V.; Decobecq, M. E.; Brezillon, S.; Dupriez, V.; Vassart, G.; Van Damme, J.; Parmentier, M.; Detheux, M., Functional characterization of human receptors for short chain fatty acids and their role in polymorphonuclear cell activation. *J. Biol. Chem.* **2003,** *278* (28), 25481-9.

8.   Koecher, K. J.; Noack, J. A.; Timm, D. A.; Klosterbuer, A. S.; Thomas, W.; Slavin, J. L., Estimation and interpretation of fermentation in the gut: coupling results from a 24 h batch in vitro system with fecal measurements from a human intervention feeding study using fructo-oligosaccharides, inulin, gum acacia, and pea fiber. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2014,** *62* (6), 1332-1337.

9.   Jonathan, M. C.; van den Borne, J. J. G. C.; van Wiechen, P.; Souza da Silva, C.; Schols, H. A.; Gruppen, H., In vitro fermentation of 12 dietary fibres by faecal inoculum from pigs and humans. *Food Chem.* **2012,** *133* (3), 889-897.

10.   Chassaing, B.; Koren, O.; Goodrich, J. K.; Poole, A. C.; Srinivasan, S.; Ley, R. E.; Gewirtz, A. T., Dietary emulsifiers impact the mouse gut microbiota promoting colitis and metabolic syndrome. *Nature* **2015,** *519* (7541), 92-6.

11.   Dao, M. C.; Everard, A.; Aron-Wisnewsky, J.; Sokolovska, N.; Prifti, E.; Verger, E. O.; Kayser, B. D.; Levenez, F.; Chilloux, J.; Hoyles, L.; Consortium, M. I.-O.; Dumas, M. E.; Rizkalla, S. W.; Dore, J.; Cani, P. D.; Clement, K., Akkermansia muciniphila and improved metabolic health during a dietary intervention in obesity: relationship with gut microbiome richness and ecology. *Gut* **2016,** *65* (3), 426-36.

12.   Everard, A.; Belzer, C.; Geurts, L.; Ouwerkerk, J. P.; Druart, C.; Bindels, L. B.; Guiot, Y.; Derrien, M.; Muccioli, G. G.; Delzenne, N. M.; de Vos, W. M.; Cani, P. D., Cross-talk between Akkermansia muciniphila and intestinal epithelium controls diet-induced obesity. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* **2013,** *110* (22), 9066-71.

13.   Plovier, H.; Everard, A.; Druart, C.; Depommier, C.; Van Hul, M.; Geurts, L.; Chilloux, J.; Ottman, N.; Duparc, T.; Lichtenstein, L.; Myridakis, A.; Delzenne, N. M.; Klievink, J.; Bhattacharjee, A.; van der Ark, K. C.; Aalvink, S.; Martinez, L. O.; Dumas, M. E.; Maiter, D.; Loumaye, A.; Hermans, M. P.; Thissen, J. P.; Belzer, C.; de Vos, W. M.; Cani, P. D., A purified membrane protein from Akkermansia muciniphila or the pasteurized bacterium improves metabolism in obese and diabetic mice. *Nat. Med.*

2017, *23* (1), 107-113.

14.   Qin, J.; Li, Y.; Cai, Z.; Li, S.; Zhu, J.; Zhang, F.; Liang, S.; Zhang, W.; Guan, Y.; Shen, D.; Peng, Y.;
Zhang, D.; Jie, Z.; Wu, W.; Qin, Y.; Xue, W.; Li, J.; Han, L.; Lu, D.; Wu, P.; Dai, Y.; Sun, X.; Li, Z.; Tang,
A.; Zhong, S.; Li, X.; Chen, W.; Xu, R.; Wang, M.; Feng, Q.; Gong, M.; Yu, J.; Zhang, Y.; Zhang, M.;
Hansen, T.; Sanchez, G.; Raes, J.; Falony, G.; Okuda, S.; Almeida, M.; LeChatelier, E.; Renault, P.; Pons,
N.; Batto, J. M.; Zhang, Z.; Chen, H.; Yang, R.; Zheng, W.; Li, S.; Yang, H.; Wang, J.; Ehrlich, S. D.;
Nielsen, R.; Pedersen, O.; Kristiansen, K.; Wang, J., A metagenome-wide association study of gut
microbiota in type 2 diabetes. *Nature* **2012,** *490* (7418), 55-60.

15.   Zhao, S.; Liu, W.; Wang, J.; Shi, J.; Sun, Y.; Wang, W.; Ning, G.; Liu1, R.; Hong, J., Akkermansia
muciniphila improves metabolic profiles by reducing inflammation in chow diet-fed mice. *J Mol*
Endocrinol **2017,** *58* (1), 1-14.

16.   Depommier, C.; Everard, A.; Druart, C.; Plovier, H.; Van Hul, M.; Vieira-Silva, S.; Falony, G.; Raes,
J.; Maiter, D.; Delzenne, N. M.; de Barsy, M.; Loumaye, A.; Hermans, M. P.; Thissen, J. P.; de Vos, W.
M.; Cani, P. D., Supplementation with Akkermansia muciniphila in overweight and obese human
volunteers: a proof-of-concept exploratory study. *Nat. Med.* **2019,** *25* (7), 1096-1103.

17.   Png, C. W.; Linden, S. K.; Gilshenan, K. S.; Zoetendal, E. G.; McSweeney, C. S.; Sly, L. I.;
McGuckin, M. A.; Florin, T. H., Mucolytic bacteria with increased prevalence in IBD mucosa augment
in vitro utilization of mucin by other bacteria. *Am J Gastroenterol* **2010,** *105* (11), 2420-8.

18.   Zhai, R.; Xue, X.; Zhang, L.; Yang, X.; Zhao, L.; Zhang, C., Strain-Specific Anti-inflammatory
Properties of Two Akkermansia muciniphila Strains on Chronic Colitis in Mice. *Front Cell Infect*
Microbiol **2019,** *9*, 239.

19.   Wang, L.; Christophersen, C. T.; Sorich, M. J.; Gerber, J. P.; Angley, M. T.; Conlon, M. A., Low
relative abundances of the mucolytic bacterium Akkermansia muciniphila and Bifidobacterium spp. in
feces of children with autism. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2011,** *77* (18), 6718-21.

20.   Candela, M.; Rampelli, S.; Turroni, S.; Severgnini, M.; Consolandi, C.; Bellis, G. D.; Masetti, R.;
Ricci, G.; Pession, A.; Brigidi, P., Unbalance of intestinal microbiota in atopic children. *BMC Microbiol.*
2012, *12* (95), 2-9.

21.   Blacher, E.; Bashiardes, S.; Shapiro, H.; Rothschild, D.; Mor, U.; Dori-Bachash, M.; Kleimeyer, C.;
Moresi, C.; Harnik, Y.; Zur, M.; Zabari, M.; Brik, R. B.; Kviatcovsky, D.; Zmora, N.; Cohen, Y.; Bar, N.;
Levi, I.; Amar, N.; Mehlman, T.; Brandis, A.; Biton, I.; Kuperman, Y.; Tsoory, M.; Alfahel, L.; Harmelin,
A.; Schwartz, M.; Israelson, A.; Arike, L.; Johansson, M. E. V.; Hansson, G. C.; Gotkine, M.; Segal, E.;
Elinav, E., Potential roles of gut microbiome and metabolites in modulating ALS in mice. *Nature* **2019,**
572 (7770), 474-480.

22.   Barcena, C.; Valdes-Mas, R.; Mayoral, P.; Garabaya, C.; Durand, S.; Rodriguez, F.; Fernandez-
Garcia, M. T.; Salazar, N.; Nogacka, A. M.; Garatachea, N.; Bossut, N.; Aprahamian, F.; Lucia, A.;
Kroemer, G.; Freije, J. M. P.; Quiros, P. M.; Lopez-Otin, C., Healthspan and lifespan extension by fecal
microbiota transplantation into progeroid mice. *Nat. Med.* **2019,** *25* (8), 1234-1242.

23.   Olson, C. A.; Vuong, H. E.; Yano, J. M.; Liang, Q. Y.; Nusbaum, D. J.; Hsiao, E. Y., The Gut
Microbiota Mediates the Anti-Seizure Effects of the Ketogenic Diet. *Cell* **2018,** *173* (7), 1728-1741 e13.

24.   Li, J.; Zhao, F.; Wang, Y.; Chen, J.; Tao, J.; Tian, G.; Wu, S.; Liu, W.; Cui, Q.; Geng, B.; Zhang, W.;
Weldon, R.; Auguste, K.; Yang, L.; Liu, X.; Chen, L.; Yang, X.; Zhu, B.; Cai, J., Gut microbiota dysbiosis
contributes to the development of hypertension. *Microbiome* **2017,** *5* (1), 14.

25.   Routy, B.; Chatelier, E. L.; Derosa, L.; Duong, C. P. M.; Alou, M. T.; Daillère, R.; Fluckiger, A.;
Messaoudene, M.; Rauber, C.; Roberti, M. P.; Fidelle, M., Gut microbiome influences efficacy of PD-1–

based immunotherapy against epithelial tumors. *Science* **2018,** *259*, 91-97.

26.   Ijssennagger, N.; Belzer, C.; Hooiveld, G. J.; Dekker, J.; van Mil, S. W.; Muller, M.; Kleerebezem, M.; van der Meer, R., Gut microbiota facilitates dietary heme-induced epithelial hyperproliferation by opening the mucus barrier in colon. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* **2015,** *112* (32), 10038-43.

27.   Guo, X.; Zhang, J.; Wu, F.; Zhang, M.; Yi, M.; Peng, Y., Different subtype strains of Akkermansia muciniphila abundantly colonize in southern China. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* **2016,** *120* (2), 452-9.

28.   Marcial-Coba, M. S.; Saaby, L.; Knochel, S.; Nielsen, D. S., Dark chocolate as a stable carrier of microencapsulated Akkermansia muciniphila and Lactobacillus casei. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* **2019,** *366* (2).

29.   Derrien, M.; Collado, M. C.; Ben-Amor, K.; Salminen, S.; de Vos, W. M., The Mucin degrader Akkermansia muciniphila is an abundant resident of the human intestinal tract. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2008,** *74* (5), 1646-8.

30.   Li, Z.-t.; Zhu, L.; Zhang, W.-l.; Zhan, X.-b.; Gao, M.-j., New dynamic digestion model reactor that mimics gastrointestinal function. *Biochem. Eng. J.* **2020,** *154*.

31.   Ottman, N.; Davids, M.; Suarez-Diez, M.; Boeren, S.; Schaap, P. J.; Martins Dos Santos, V. A. P.; Smidt, H.; Belzer, C.; de Vos, W. M., Genome-Scale Model and Omics Analysis of Metabolic Capacities of Akkermansia muciniphila Reveal a Preferential Mucin-Degrading Lifestyle. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2017,** *83* (18).

32.   Wang, M.; Zhang, X. Y.; Guo, R. R.; Cai, Z. P.; Hu, X. C.; Chen, H.; Wei, S.; Voglmeir, J.; Liu, L., Cloning, purification and biochemical characterization of two beta-N-acetylhexosaminidases from the mucin-degrading gut bacterium Akkermansia muciniphila. *Carbohydr Res* **2018,** *457*, 1-7.

33.   Collado, M. C.; Derrien, M.; Isolauri, E.; de Vos, W. M.; Salminen, S., Intestinal integrity and Akkermansia muciniphila, a mucin-degrading member of the intestinal microbiota present in infants, adults, and the elderly. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2007,** *73* (23), 7767-70.

34.   Ouwerkerk, J. P.; van der Ark, K. C. H.; Davids, M.; Claassens, N. J.; Finestra, T. R.; de Vos, W. M.; Belzer, C., Adaptation of Akkermansia muciniphila to the Oxic-Anoxic Interface of the Mucus Layer. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2016,** *82* (23), 6983-6993.

35.   Reid, D. T.; Eller, L. K.; Nettleton, J. E.; Reimer, R. A., Postnatal prebiotic fibre intake mitigates some detrimental metabolic outcomes of early overnutrition in rats. *Eur J Nutr* **2016,** *55* (8), 2399-2409.

36.   Everard., A.; Lazarevic., V.; Derrien., M.; Girard., M.; Muccioli., G. G.; Neyrinck., A. M.; Possemiers., S.; Holle., A. V., Responses of Gut Microbiota and Glucose and Lipid Metabolism to Prebiotics in Genetic Obese and Diet-Induced Leptin-Resistant Mice. *Diabetes* **2011,** *60*, 2775-2786.

37.   Zhou, Z. Y.; Ren, L. W.; Zhan, P.; Yang, H. Y.; Chai, D. D.; Yu, Z. W., Metformin exerts glucose-lowering action in high-fat fed mice via attenuating endotoxemia and enhancing insulin signaling. *Acta Pharmacol Sin* **2016,** *37* (8), 1063-75.

38.   Lee, H.; Ko, G., Effect of metformin on metabolic improvement and gut microbiota. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **2014,** *80* (19), 5935-43.

39.   Anhe, F. F.; Nachbar, R. T.; Varin, T. V.; Vilela, V.; Dudonne, S.; Pilon, G.; Fournier, M.; Lecours, M. A.; Desjardins, Y.; Roy, D.; Levy, E.; Marette, A., A polyphenol-rich cranberry extract reverses insulin resistance and hepatic steatosis independently of body weight loss. *Mol Metab* **2017,** *6* (12), 1563-1573.

40.   Anhe, F. F.; Roy, D.; Pilon, G.; Dudonne, S.; Matamoros, S.; Varin, T. V.; Garofalo, C.; Moine, Q.; Desjardins, Y.; Levy, E.; Marette, A., A polyphenol-rich cranberry extract protects from diet-induced obesity, insulin resistance and intestinal inflammation in association with increased Akkermansia spp. population in the gut microbiota of mice. *Gut* **2015,** *64* (6), 872-83.

41.   Roopchand., D. E.; Carmody., R. N.; Kuhn., P.; Moskal., K.; Rojas-Silva., P.; Turnbaugh., P. J.;
Raskin, I., Dietary Polyphenols Promote Growth of the Gut Bacterium Akkermansia muciniphila and
Attenuate High-Fat Diet–Induced Metabolic Syndrome. *Diabetes* **2015,** *64*, 2847-2858.

42.   Anhe, F. F.; Pilon, G.; Roy, D.; Desjardins, Y.; Levy, E.; Marette, A., Triggering Akkermansia with
dietary polyphenols: A new weapon to combat the metabolic syndrome? *Gut Microbes* **2016,** *7* (2), 146-
53.

43.   Alard, J.; Lehrter, V.; Rhimi, M.; Mangin, I.; Peucelle, V.; Abraham, A. L.; Mariadassou, M.;
Maguin, E.; Waligora-Dupriet, A. J.; Pot, B.; Wolowczuk, I.; Grangette, C., Beneficial metabolic effects
of selected probiotics on diet-induced obesity and insulin resistance in mice are associated with
improvement of dysbiotic gut microbiota. *Environ. Microbiol.* **2016,** *18* (5), 1484-97.

44.   Caesar, R.; Tremaroli, V.; Kovatcheva-Datchary, P.; Cani, P. D.; Backhed, F., Crosstalk between Gut
Microbiota and Dietary Lipids Aggravates WAT Inflammation through TLR Signaling. *Cell Metab* **2015,**
22 (4), 658-68.

45.   Sanna, S.; van Zuydam, N. R.; Mahajan, A.; Kurilshikov, A.; Vich Vila, A.; Võsa, U.; Mujagic, Z.;
Masclee, A. A. M.; Jonkers, D. M. A. E.; Oosting, M.; Joosten, L. A. B.; Netea, M. G.; Franke, L.;
Zhernakova, A.; Fu, J.; Wijmenga, C.; McCarthy, M. I., Causal relationships among the gut microbiome,
short-chain fatty acids and metabolic diseases. *Nat. Genet.* **2019,** *51* (4), 600-605.

46.   Belzer, C.; Chia, L. W.; Aalvink, S.; Chamlagain, B.; Piironen, V.; Knol, J.; de Vos, W. M., Microbial
Metabolic Networks at the Mucus Layer Lead to Diet-Independent Butyrate and Vitamin B12 Production
by Intestinal Symbionts. *mBio* **2017,** *8* (5).

47.   Chia, L. W.; Hornung, B. V. H.; Aalvink, S.; Schaap, P. J.; de Vos, W. M.; Knol, J.; Belzer, C.,
Deciphering the trophic interaction between Akkermansia muciniphila and the butyrogenic gut
commensal Anaerostipes caccae using a metatranscriptomic approach. *Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek* **2018,**
111 (6), 859-873.

48.   Liebisch, G.; Ecker, J.; Roth, S.; Schweizer, S.; Ottl, V.; Schott, H. F.; Yoon, H.; Haller, D.; Holler,
E.; Burkhardt, R.; Matysik, S., Quantification of Fecal Short Chain Fatty Acids by Liquid
Chromatography Tandem Mass Spectrometry-Investigation of Pre-Analytic Stability. *Biomolecules* **2019,**
9 (4).

List of the Tables

Table 1 Comparative analysis of relative thickness and diameter of *A. muciniphila* outer

membrane in different culture media

Notes: a: Relative thickness of the outer membrane of *A. muciniphila,* b: Diameter of *A.*

muciniphila. The brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added

porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract

(BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added

human-derived (BHM) mucin media.

List of Figures

Figure 1 Bionic large intestine dynamic digestion model: (A) discharge port, (B) sealing ring, (C) reaction bottle, (D) simulated large intestine, (E) alkali-adding port, (F) feeding port, (G) vacuum port, (H) filling mixed gas port, (I) sample port, (J) water suction device, (K) sampling port, (L) pH electrode, (M) OD600 detection module, (N) peristaltic tube, (O) filter screen, (P) dialysis device.

Figure 2 Effect of different media on the A. muciniphila biomass.

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media.

Figure 3 Effect of different media on the metabolites of A. muciniphila

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media.

Figure 4 Effect of different media on the concentration of the A. muciniphila outer membrane protein.

In this figure, the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media.

Figure 5 SEM and TEM images of A. muciniphila in different media.

In the figure, a, b, c, d, f respectively BHI, PM, HM, BPM and BHM. The brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media the brain heart extract (BHI) broth and porcine- (PM), human- (HM), BHI-added porcine- (BPM), and BHI-added human-derived (BHM) mucin media.

Figure-1

Figure-2

Figure-3

Figure-4

Figure-5

TEM

SEM

Table

Table 1 Comparative analysis of relative thickness and diameter of *A. muciniphila* outer *membrane in* different culture media

Tukey's multiple comparisons test	Mean 1	Mean 2	Summary	Adjusted P Value
a:BHI vs. PM	70.66	101.2	*	0.0159
a:BHI vs. HM	70.66	104.5	**	0.0072
a:BHI vs. BPM	70.66	71.46	ns	>0.9999
a:BHI vs. BHM	70.66	72.11	ns	>0.9999
a:PM vs. HM	101.2	104.5	ns	0.9934
a:PM vs. BPM	101.2	71.46	*	0.0177
a:PM vs. BHM	101.2	72.11	*	0.0152
a:HM vs. BPM	104.5	71.46	**	0.008
a:HM vs. BHM	104.5	72.11	**	0.0068
a:BPM vs. BHM	72.11	72.11	ns	>0.9999
b:BHI vs. PM	871	985	*	0.0137
b:BHI vs. PM	871	999.3	**	0.0035
b:BHI vs. BPM	871	980	*	0.0136
b:BHI vs. BHM	871	971.7	*	0.0214
b:PM vs. HM	985	999.3	ns	0.4533
b:PM vs. BPM	985	980	ns	0.9623
b:PM vs. BHM	985	971.7	ns	0.589
b:HM vs. BPM	999.3	980	ns	0.5442
b:HM vs. BHM	999.3	971.7	ns	0.3824
b:BPM vs. BHM	980	971.7	ns	0.1124