Time-course transcriptome landscape of achene development in lettuce

Chen Luo, Shenglin Wang, Kang Ning, Zijing Chen, Jingjing Yang, Yixin Wang,

Meixia Qi, Qian Wang*

Department of Vegetable Sciences, Beijing Key Laboratory of Growth and

Developmental Regulation for Protected Vegetable Crops, China Agricultural

University, Beijing 100193

*Corresponding author

E-mail address: wangq@cau.edu.cn

Tel.: +86-010-62732823

Abstract

Lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* L.), which belongs to the large Asteraceae (Compositae) family, breeds by sexual reproduction and produce seeds. Actually, lettuce seeds are achenes, which are defined as fruits. However, few studies have described the morphological characteristics of the lettuce achenes, and genes essential for achene development are largely unknown in lettuce. To investigate the gene activity during achene development and determine the possible mechanisms that influence achene development in lettuce, we performed a time-course transcriptome analysis of lettuce achenes. A total of 23,790 expressed genes were detected at the five achene development stages. We investigated the gene expression patterns during achene development and identified the enriched biological processes at the corresponding stages. Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and Genomes and Gene Ontology analyses revealed a variety of transcriptomic similarities and differentiation at different achene development stages. Further, transcription factors and phytohormones were found to play important roles during achene development. Finally, we proposed a working model to illustrate the gene expression modules and possible molecular mechanism underlying achene development. Our time-course transcriptome data also provides a foundation for future functional studies to reveal the genetic control of achene development in lettuce.

Keywords: lettuce; achene development; transcriptome; fruit; seed; transcription factor

Introduction

Lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* L.) supplies dietary fiber, vitamins, and minerals, and is one of the most important leafy vegetables consumed worldwide (Zhang et al., 2017). Lettuce belongs to the large Asteraceae (Compositae) family (Reyes-Chin-Wo et al., 2017). It is a heat-promoted bolting vegetable, so the transition from vegetative growth to reproductive growth is accelerated under high temperatures (Han et al., 2016). Finally, the lettuce plants begin to bloom and bear fruit. Previously, we characterized the inflorescence development of lettuce (Chen et al., 2017), and proposed a model for lettuce floral organ specification (Ning et al., 2019). Lettuce seeds are achene fruits that are developed from the ovaries. However, gene activity during lettuce achene development and the general mechanisms influencing achene development are still largely unknown.

In angiosperms, the ovule develops into a seed upon fertilization, whereas the ovary differentiates into a fruit (Ruan et al., 2012). Many fruit types have evolved as flowering plants have adapted to different conditions (Seymour et al., 2013). Fruit types can be classified according to the following characteristics: carpel number, free or fused carpels, texture, dehiscence or indehiscence. Fruits derived from a mature ovary and containing seeds are defined as true fruits. However, some fruits are composed of a variety of tissues other than the ovary, such as bracts, sepals, petals, and receptacle, and these fruits are defined as false fruits. In general, fruits can be divided into two main categories: fleshy fruits and dry fruits (Dardick & Callahan, 2014). Fleshy fruits include berries, pomes, drupes, pepos, and hesperidia. Dry fruits can be either dehiscent or indehiscent depending on whether or not the pericarp splits open at maturity. In dehiscent fruits, including siliques, capsules, and legumes, the fruits open to disperse the seeds during maturation. In indehiscent fruits, including achenes, caryopses, and nuts, the fruits do not open during maturation.

The fruit of *Arabidopsis* has been considered as a model to study fruit development. The fruit is mostly made up of an ovary with three distinct tissues, the valve, the replum, and the valve margin (Roeder & Yanofsky, 2006). Until now, crucial genetic

networks that regulate fruit development have been uncovered mainly in *Arabidopsis*

(Pabon-Mora et al., 2014). For example, *FRUITFULL* (*FUL*) plays a direct role in

promoting valve development (Gu et al., 1998); *REPLUMLESS* (*RPL*) and

BREVIPEDICELLUS (*BP*) are necessary for replum identity (Venglat et al., 2002;

Roeder et al., 2003), and *ASYMMETRIC LEAVES1* (*AS1*) and *ASYMMETRIC*

LEAVES2 (*AS2*) regulate replum development by repressing *BP* and *RPL*

(Alonso-Cantabrana et al., 2007). Furthermore, *INDEHISCENT* (*IND*) and

ALCATRAZ (*ALC*) are necessary for correct valve margin formation in fruit

development (Rajani & Sundaresan, 2001; Liljegren et al., 2004), and

SHATTERPROOF1 (*SHP1*) and *SHATTERPROOF2* (*SHP2*) regulate valve margin

formation by positively regulating *IND* and *ALC* (Liljegren et al., 2000). Fruit

development and seed development are highly synchronized (Robert, 2019). Fruits

protect the developing seeds and contribute to seed dispersal. The seed is composed of

seed coat, embryo, and endosperm (Sreenivasulu & Wobus, 2013). Seed development

is a complex process that is controlled by multiple biological processes and signaling

pathways, such as the ubiquitin-proteasome pathway, phytohormone biosynthesis and

signal transduction, and transcriptional regulators (Li & Li, 2016). Many important

regulators associated with seed development and seed size determination have been

identified (Li et al., 2019), including *DA1*, *DA1-related1* (*DAR1*), *AUXIN RESPONSE*

FACTOR2 (*ARF2*), *BRASSINOSTEROID INSENSITIVE1* (*BRI1*),

BRASSINAZOLE-RESISTANT1 (*BZR1*), *APETALA2* (*AP2*), *AINTEGUMENTA* (*ANT*),

and *TRANSPARENT TESTA GLABRA2* (*TTG2*).

Many transcriptome profiling studies have been performed to elucidate the gene

dynamic activity and biological processes during fruit or seed development in

different plant species. In *Arabidopsis*, a time-course transcriptome analysis of the

siliques identified genes that control fruit formation and maturation, and revealed the

molecular mechanisms affecting silique development and maturation (Mizzotti et al.,

2018). In kiwifruit, an integrated analysis of the fruit metabolome and transcriptome

provided insights into the regulatory network of flavonoid biosynthesis during fruit

development (Li et al., 2018). In chickpea, a global transcriptome and co-expression

network analysis revealed the molecular mechanism underlying seed development,

and identified candidate genes associated with seed development and seed size/weight

determination (Garg et al., 2017). In maize, a high temporal-resolution transcriptome

landscape of early maize seed development was reported. The high-density,

time-course transcriptome data provided a high-resolution gene expression profile and

demonstrated four key stages during early seed development in maize (Yi et al.,

2019).

Achenes are indehiscent dry fruits of, for example, strawberry, buckwheat, and

Asteraceae plants. Achenes are single-seeded fruits, and a mature achene has four

major components: a hard and relatively thick pericarp, a thin testa (integument), an

embryo, and an endosperm. However, few studies have analyzed the transcriptomes

of achenes to explore the gene activity and molecular mechanisms involved in achene

development, especially in Asteraceae plants. In this study, we identified

representative developmental stages of lettuce achenes and performed time-course

transcriptome analysis of the achenes at five developmental stages. We analyzed gene

activity during achene development and proposed a possible mechanism that may

influence achene development. Our time-course transcriptome data provide an

important resource for future functional studies and shed light on the genetic control

of achene development in lettuce.

Materials and methods

Plant materials and growth conditions

The lettuce cultivar S39 was used in this study. In the vegetative growth stage, the

lettuce plants were grown in growth chambers under a cycle of 16-h light at 25°C and

8-h dark at 18°C. When the lettuce plants transitioned to reproductive growth, they

were transplanted to a greenhouse in China Agricultural University under standard

conditions.

Sample collection and RNA extraction

Achene samples were collected at the S0, S1, S3, S6, and S9 stages for

RNA-sequencing (RNA-seq). The achenes were harvested from at least five

capitulum for each pooled sample. A total of 15 samples, from five developmental

stages with three biological replicates, were collected and stored in an ultra-low

temperature freeze at $-80°C$. Total RNA was extracted from each sample using a

Quick RNA isolation kit (Huayueyang, Beijing, China) according to the

manufacturer's protocol.

RNA-seq and bioinformatic analysis

Paired-end libraries were constructed and sequenced using an Illumina

Nova-PE150 platform at Novogene (Beijing, China). Bioinformatic analysis of the

RNA-seq data was performed on the BMKCloud platform (www.biocloud.net). Raw

reads were filtered to generate the clean reads, and the clean reads were mapped to the

lettuce reference genome using the HISAT2 software (Kim et al., 2015). Transcript

abundances were determined by the fragments per kilobase of transcript per million

mapped reads (FPKM) values, and genes with FPKM values ≥0.1 were retained for

further analysis. Principle component analysis (PCA) was performed using the

prcomp function in R software (R Core Team, 2014).

Gene expression pattern analysis

To further explore the gene expression patterns during achene development,

clustering analysis was performed using the K-means method with the Pearson

correlation distance in the MeV software (https://sourceforge.net/projects/mev-tm4/).

The expression level of each gene was normalized by the average FPKM values of the

different achene development stages. Then, 12 clusters were generated, and the

heatmaps for each cluster were created using the normalized FPKM values of the

different achene development stages.

Functional annotation

Genes were functionally annotated with the NCBI non-redundant protein sequences database using the BLAST software. Gene Ontology (GO) enrichment analysis was performed using the GOseq R packages (Young et al., 2010). GO enrichment heatmap for the genes in five of the clusters (Cluster1–Cluster5) was created using the TBtools software (Chen et al., 2020). Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes and Genomes (KEGG) analysis was performed using the KOBAS software (Mao et al., 2005).

Results

Representative achene development stages of lettuce

The lettuce inflorescence is a capitulum that consists of multiple ray florets, each of which has five major components: petal, pappus, stamen, pistil, and ovary (Figure 1a). The ovary develops into an achene, often referred to as the seed in lettuce. We defined the achene development stages according to the number of days after pollination, and the representative stages are as follows: S0 stage, the day of pollination (the processes of pollination and double fertilization take place, and the achene begins to develop); S1 stage, 1 day after pollination (the achene elongates rapidly); S3 stage, 3 days after pollination (the achene grows longer and wider); S6 stage, 6 days after pollination (the achene expands and obvious longitudinal ribs appear on the achene surface); and S9 stage, 9 days after pollination (the longitudinal ribs are more pronounced and the achene coat becomes darker, and the achene is fully developed and ready to ripen) (Figure 1b).

Global analysis of the time-course transcriptome data from different achene samples

To investigate the gene activity and analyze the molecular networks during achene development in lettuce, we performed time-course transcriptome analysis of the

achenes from the five developmental stages, with three biological replicates for each time point. A total of 730.58 million clean reads (109.59 Gb clean bases) were generated from the 15 samples, with 39.31–57.45 million clean reads for each sample (Table S1). Clean reads were mapped to the lettuce genome, and the unique mapped reads ratios were 85.60%–93.08% (Table S1).

The principal component analysis (PCA) of the transcriptome datasets showed that the 15 time-series samples formed four groups: group1 (S0 and S1), group2 (S3), group3 (S6), group4 (S9) (Figure 1c). The S0 and S1 stages were closer than the other adjacent stages, indicating that the gene expression profiles for S0 and S1 were more similar than those for the other stages. Transcript abundances were determined by FPKM values (Figure S1), and a total of 27,390 transcripts (FPKM >0.1) were found among the five stages. Among them, 18,226 genes were widely expressed at the five developmental stages (Figure 1d). A further 459, 349, 949, 302, and 313 genes were specially expressed at the S0, S1, S3, S6, and S9 stages, respectively (Figure 1d).

Gene expression during different achene development stages

To investigate the gene expression patterns during achene development, we performed K-means clustering analysis for the 27,390 expressed genes and generated 12 co-expression clusters (Figure 2a). Genes grouped into the same cluster showed similar expression patterns. The genes in five of the clusters (Cluster1–Cluster5) were mainly highly expressed at only one of the five developmental stages (Figure 2b), indicating that they might have specific functions at the corresponding stages. These genes were functionally annotated by GO enrichment analysis (Figure 2c).

Genes in Cluster1 were highly expressed at the S0 stage, but their expression decreased sharply at the later stages. Most of these genes were related to basic functional processes, such as RNA binding (GO:0003723), structural constituent of ribosome (GO:0003735), and translation (GO:0006412). Moreover, genes related to embryo sac egg cell differentiation (GO:0009560) also were abundant in Cluster1. S0 stage is best represented by Cluster1 because pollination and fertilization take place in

this stage, which also mark the beginning of achene development. After double fertilization, cell division and cell differentiation occur more frequently and biosynthesis processes proceed rapidly. Genes in Cluster2 were more highly expressed at the S1 stage than at the other stages. Some of these genes were related to cell wall, such as plant-type cell wall (GO:0009505) and pectin catabolic process (GO:0045490), indicating that they might be associated with primary cell wall formation during achene development. Genes in Cluster3 were highly expressed only at the S3 stage. Genes related to the anabolic processes of lignin and glucuronoxylan were abundant, and genes related to plant-type secondary cell wall biogenesis (GO:0009834) were enriched in Cluster3. Glucuronoxylan is the main component of hemi-cellulose, and secondary cell walls are composed of cellulose, hemi-cellulose, lignin, pectin, and some proteins (Zhong et al., 2019). Because hardening of the pericarp occurs through secondary cell wall formation and lignification (Dardick & Callahan, 2014), reflecting that these enriched genes might be involved in pericarp hardening of lettuce achene. Genes in Cluster4 were more highly expressed at the S6 stage than at the other stages. These genes were related to nucleoside transmembrane transporter activity (GO:0005337), lipid metabolic process (GO:0006629), and oligopeptide transport (GO:0006857). Lipids include fatty acids and fats that are essential for energy storage and supply (Lim et al., 2017). The high abundance of genes associated with lipid metabolic process indicated that biochemical reactions and pathways involving lipids were more active at the S6 stage. Genes in Cluster5 had low expression at the early stages, but their expression increased significantly at the S9 stage. Some of these genes were related to transcription from plastid promoter (GO:0042793), glyoxylate cycle (GO:0006097), and heat acclimation (GO:0010286), indicating that they may be involved in plastid transcription, energy and substance metabolism, and response to high temperatures during achene development.

The genes in Cluster6–Cluster12 were expressed at more than one of the five developmental stages, which indicated that common functional processes took place at the different developmental stages. For example, Cluster10 is best presented by 5050 genes, which displayed high expression levels at the S0, S1, and S3 stages.

254 These genes were enriched in many basic functional processes (Figure S2), including

255 proteasome core complex assembly (GO:0080129), response to misfolded protein

256 (GO:0051788), and intracellular protein transport (GO:0006886).

257 Transcriptomic similarities at the different achene development stages

To investigate the transcriptomic similarities at the five developmental stages, we

performed KEGG analysis of the 18,226 widely expressed genes (Figure 3a). The

most significantly enriched pathways were ribosome (ko03010), mRNA surveillance

pathway (ko03015), and RNA transport (ko03013), which are involved in mRNA

translation to a polypeptide chain, indicating that protein biosynthesis played a

dominant role during achene development. Other pathways involved in the

biosynthesis and metabolism of other substances also were active during achene

development. These results indicate that biosynthesis and metabolism processes are

highly active to ensure the normal development of achenes.

The 18,266 widely expressed genes also were assigned terms under the three main

GO categories (molecular function, cellular component, and biological process)

(Figure 3b). Under molecular function, the most enriched GO terms were zinc ion

binding (GO:0008270) and structural constituent of ribosome (GO:0003735). Under

cellular component, the most enriched terms were cytosol (GO:0005829) and

cytosolic small ribosomal subunit (GO:0022627). Under biological process, the most

enriched terms were translation (GO:0006412) and RNA splicing, via endonucleolytic

cleavage and ligation (GO:0000394). These genes, which were expressed at all five

developmental stages, were enriched in many basic functional processes, and the

results of the GO and KEGG analyses were generally consistent.

277 Transcriptomic differentiation at the different achene development stages

We analyzed the transcriptome profiling data to identify the specially expressed

genes at particular stages of achene development. Then, we performed KEGG

analysis of these genes in each developmental stage. At the S0 stage, the most

enriched pathways were plant-pathogen interaction (ko04626) and galactose

metabolism (ko00052) (Figure 4a), which are related to environmental adaptation and

carbohydrate metabolism. At the S1 stage, the most enriched pathways were

phenylpropanoid biosynthesis (ko00940) and carbon fixation in photosynthetic

organisms (ko00710) (Figure 4b). Phenylpropanoids are plant secondary metabolites

that function as structural and signaling molecules (Liu et al., 2015). Carbon fixation

is essential for energy metabolism during achene development. Brassinosteroid (BR)

biosynthesis (ko00905) also was active at the S1 stage (Figure 4b), indicating that BR

is an important regulator during achene development in lettuce. Genes related to

flavonoid biosynthesis (ko00941) were more abundant at the S3 stage (Figure 4c).

Flavonoids are major secondary metabolites that are related to fruit flavor and color,

and provide resistance against diseases and pests (Xu et al., 2015). At the S6 stage,

biosynthesis of unsaturated fatty acids (ko01040) and fatty acid metabolism (ko01212)

were the most enriched pathways (Figure 4d). Fatty acids have multitude functions

including energy storage and heat supply (Lim et al., 2017), which indicated that the

rapid expansion of achene at this stage was accompanied with the biosynthesis and

metabolism of fatty acids. Anthocyanins are common plant pigments (Jaakola, 2013),

so the active anthocyanin biosynthesis (ko00942) process at the S9 stage was

consistent with the color change of achene coat at this stage (Figure 4e).

Identification of transcription factors during different achene development
stages

Transcription factors (TFs) are important regulators of transcription and gene

expression, and TFs play dominant roles in regulating the growth, development, and

stress tolerance of plants (Riechmann et al., 2000; Samad et al., 2017). Members of

many TF families have been shown to play a wide variety of roles in controlling fruit

and seed development (Sun et al., 2010). In this study, we identified 1579 genes that

encode TFs from the transcriptome data. Most of these TFs were expressed at all five

achene development stages, but were strongly expressed at the early stages, especially

at the S1 stage, although a small number of genes were highly expressed at the later stages (Figure 5a). The top 100 highly expressed TFs at each developmental stage were classified and counted. The significantly enriched TFs mainly belonged to the MYB, APETALA2/ETHYLENE RESPONSIVE FACTOR (AP2/ERF), Homeobox (HB), MADS-box, basic leucine zipper (bZIP), and NAM/ATAF/CUC (NAC) families (Figure 5b).

MYB TFs play prominent roles in controlling development, signal transduction pathways, the biosynthesis of secondary metabolites, and response to biotic and abiotic stresses (Dubos et al., 2010). We found that the MYB TFs accounted for 8%−10% of the top 100 TFs at all five developmental stages, indicating that MYB TFs functioned throughout the achene development process. The AP2/ERF TFs constitute one of the largest TF families in plants, and orchestrate the developmental processes and stress responses (Licausi et al., 2013; Xie et al., 2019). Here, we found that the AP2/ERF TFs accounted for about 9% of the top 100 TFs at the early stages, and 15% and 17% at the S6 and S9 stages respectively, reflecting the important role of AP2/ERF TFs in achene development. HB TFs, which belong to several subfamilies, regulate a large number of developmental processes in plants, including embryonic development, meristem maintenance, and organ formation (Bürglin & Affolter, 2015). Members of MADS-box TF family participate in numerous developmental process in plants, and their role in floral organ identity determination is conserved among divergent plant species. MADS-box TFs also play important roles in inflorescence architecture and fruit and seed development (Ng & Yanofsky, 2001; Smaczniak et al., 2012). In this study, we found that there were more HB and MADS-box TFs highly expressed at the early stages than at the later stages, suggesting that they played crucial roles at the early stages of achene development. The bZIP TFs are involved in diverse biological processes, including environmental signaling, seed maturation, flower development, and stress response (Jakoby et al., 2002; Droge-Laser et al., 2018). Here, the bZIP TFs accounted for 6%−8% of the top 100 TFs at the different developmental stages. Previous studies have revealed that NAC TFs function in developmental programs, response to environmental signals, and defense (Olsen et al.,

2005; Puranik et al., 2012; Kim et al., 2016). Here, we found that the NAC TFs were

expressed throughout the five developmental stages but had high proportions at the S3

and S6 stages, indicating that NAC TFs might have important functions at these

stages. Further, the C2H2 and Trihelix TFs accounted for 7% and 6% only at the S6

and S9 stages, respectively.

Expression pattern of key genes associated with fruit and seed development

across the achene development stages

The lettuce achene is developed from the ovary wall and ovule, thus the achene

development combines both fruit development and seed development. Here, we first

identified genes associated with fruit development across the development stages

(Figure 6a). Notably, the majority of these regulators are TFs. Most of the genes

involved in fruit development were highly expressed at the early stages, although

some genes were expressed at low levels at all five stages. We found that the lettuce

homologs of *AGAMOUS* (*AG*) and *SEEDSTICK* (*STK*), which belong to the

MADS-box TF family (Favaro et al., 2003), were up-regulated at the S0, S1 and S3

stages, indicating that they might be important for carpel development in lettuce. The

APETALA1/FRUITFULL (*AP1/FUL*) clade of lettuce had multiple gene duplications,

implying that these genes may display functional redundancy in valve development.

In *Arabidopsis*, *SPATULA* (*SPT*) plays a minor role in promoting separation layer

formation of the fruit (Heisler et al., 2001; Groszmann et al., 2011). We identified a

lettuce homolog of *SPT* that showed increased expression at the S3 stage then

decreased expression at the later stages. Furthermore, the expression levels of *BP* and

AS1 were higher than those of other genes associated with replum development,

indicating that *BP* and *AS1* may contribute most to replum formation. Members of the

KANADI (KAN) and YABBY (YAB) TF families that play central roles in lateral

organ development also are crucial for ovule development in *Arabidopsis* (Kelley &

Gasser, 2009). Several lettuce homologs of *KANs* and *YABs* were identified, and a

YAB1 gene (*Lsat_1_v5_gn_7_9041*) that was highly expressed across the five

developmental stages might play a major role in ovule development.

Seed development is a complex process, and many pathways involved in seed

development have been proposed (Li et al., 2019). In this study, we identified genes

associated with seed development across the five developmental stages (Figure 6b).

Genes related to the ubiquitin-proteasome pathway, G-protein signaling pathway, and

the mitogen-activated protein kinase signaling pathway were stably expressed with

normal expression levels at all stages. The genes related to the ubiquitin-proteasome

pathway had duplicate copies, which may have resulted in functional redundancy

among them. Genes related to phytohormone signaling and homeostasis and

transcriptional regulators were the most highly expressed genes at the early stages,

and the expression of most of them gradually decreased at the later stages. Previous

studies have shown that plant hormones regulate seed growth (Sun et al., 2010), and

the BR receptor BRI1 and the BR response TF BZR1, which are involved in BR

signal transduction, were shown to control seed development (He et al., 2005; Kim et

al., 2009; Huang et al., 2013). Here, we found that the lettuce homologs of *BRI1* and

BZR1 were highly expressed at the S0, S1, and S3 stages, and their expression

decreased at the later stages. Besides, a homolog of *DE-ETIOLATED2* (*DET2*), which

is involved in BR biosynthesis (Fujioka et al., 1997; Jiang et al., 2013), was more

abundant at the S3 stage. These results revealed the importance of BR in regulating

achene development in lettuce. The expression patterns of lettuce AP2 TFs were

similar to those of the lettuce BZR1 TFs. Homologs of *ANT* and *TTG2* displayed

higher expression at the S3 stage than at the other stages, indicating that *ANT* and

TTG2 may have important functions at the S3 stage. Further, genes that influence

endosperm growth were highly expressed at the later stages of achene development,

especially the abscisic acid (ABA) response TF ABA-INSENSITIVE5 (ABI5), which

was highly expressed at the S6 and S9 stages. ABA activates seed dormancy and

suppresses germination (Cutler et al., 2010), which indicated that the lettuce achenes

were about to ripen and become dormant at the later stages.

Discussion

The lettuce seed is an achene fruit, and the development of a lettuce achene from the small ovary to its final size must involve extensive biological processes. In this study, we performed a time-course transcriptome analysis of lettuce achenes and revealed a possible mechanism that influenced achene development. To illustrate this idea, we proposed a working model of lettuce achene development (Figure 7).

Overall, genes related to basic functional categories were abundant at almost every achene development stage, indicating that the basic biosynthesis and metabolism processes proceeded throughout the achene development, especially pathways associated with protein biosynthesis. These continuous and stable biological processes likely ensure the normal development of the achenes. We also found that genes that encode TFs and genes associated with phytohormone signaling and homeostasis play crucial roles during achene development. Most of these genes were highly expressed at the early stages of achene development, and their expression gradually decreased with the development of the achene.

The K-means clustering analysis identified the highly expressed genes at each developmental stage. Differential expression analysis identified genes that were particularly expressed at each stage. We also found that many biological processes, especially synthetic and metabolic activities, were significantly different at different developmental stages. At the S0 stage, the enriched pathways were RNA binding and translation, and genes related to galactose metabolism also were abundant in this stage, which reflected the rapid growth of achene after pollination and fertilization. At the S1 stage, genes related to cell wall and phenylpropanoid biosynthesis were enriched. The BR biosynthesis pathway also was active at the S1 stage, indicating the important role of BR during achene development. At the S3 stage, genes associated with the components and biogenesis process of the secondary cell wall were highly expressed, indicating that these genes may be involved in pericarp hardening of lettuce achene. The flavonoid biosynthesis pathway also was enriched at the S3 stage. Flavonoids are involved in multiple physiological functions, and many types of flavonoids in seeds

are found such as flavonols and anthocyanins (Lepiniec et al., 2006), reflecting the

important roles of flavonoids during achene development. At the S6 stage, the

anabolic processes of lipids occurred more frequently, including fatty acid

biosynthesis and metabolism. Lipids are essential for energy storage and supply (Lim

et al., 2017), indicating that the rapid expansion of achene was accompanied by the

accumulation of energy substances at the S6 stage. At the S9 stage, the enriched

pathways included plastid transcription and heat acclimation, and genes related to

anthocyanin biosynthesis also were abundant. Anthocyanins are common plant

pigments and temperatures affect the stability of anthocyanins (Marszałek et al.,

2017), so the high expression of these genes is consistent with the dark achene coat

that develops at this stage.

Direct orthologs of *IND*, *ALC*, *SHP1*, and *SHP2* have not been detected in lettuce,

which coincide with the report that these genes may be found only in Brassicaceae

(Pabon-Mora et al., 2014). The fruit structure of lettuce is different from that of

Arabidopsis; the achenes of lettuce are indehiscent fruits, whereas the siliques of

Arabidopsis are dehiscent fruits. The four genes, *IND*, *ALC*, *SHP1*, and *SHP2*, are

required for the valve margin formation and dehiscence, but the achenes do not

undergo dehiscence when the fruits are fully mature. The structural differences

between the fruits of lettuce and *Arabidopsis* might explain the absence of genes

associated with fruit valve margin formation in lettuce.

Taken together, our data provide a foundation for future functional studies. Many

genes that were highly expressed in the achenes, such as *AG*, *STK*, *BZR1*, *AP2*, and

ABI5, may be responsible for important traits in lettuce, such as achene size, achene

shape, grain weight, seed shattering, seed dispersal, and oil concentration. The

biological functions of these genes need to be further confirmed in lettuce. The lettuce

genome has been sequenced and CRISPR/Cas9-mediated genome editing has been

applied to lettuce (Woo et al., 2015; Reyes-Chin-Wo et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2018),

so making good use of the genomics and biotechnologies will be helpful to reveal

novel genetic and epigenetic variations in lettuce that can be applied to breed

improved lettuce varieties in the future.

Acknowledgments

This study was funded by Beijing Leafy Vegetables Innovation Team of Modern Agro-industry Technology Research System (BAIC07-2020) and The Construction of Beijing Science and Technology Innovation and Service Capacity in Top Subjects (CEFF-PXM2019_014207_000032).

Author Contributions

C.L. and Q.W. designed the research; C.L., S.L.W. and K.N. performed the research; Z.J.C., J.J.Y., Y.X.W. and M.X.Q analyzed the data; C.L. wrote the paper with the help of S.L.W., K.N. and Q.W.

Conflict of interest

The authors have no conflict of interest to declare.

Supplemental data

Figure S1. Boxplot for the gene expression level distribution.

Figure S2. GO enrichment analysis of the genes in Cluster10.

Table S1. Summary of the sequencing data.

References

Alonso-Cantabrana, H., Ripoll, J. J., Ochando, I., Vera, A., Ferrándiz, C., & Martínez-Laborda, A. (2007). Common regulatory networks in leaf and fruit patterning revealed by mutations in the Arabidopsis ASYMMETRIC LEAVES1 gene. *Development, 134*, 2663-2671. doi:10.1242/dev.02864

Bürglin, T. R., & Affolter, M. (2015). Homeodomain proteins: an update. *Chromosoma, 125*, 497-521. doi:10.1007/s00412-015-0543-8

Chen, C., Chen, H., Zhang, Y., Thomas, H. R., Frank, M. H., He, Y., & Xia, R. (2020). TBtools - an integrative toolkit developed for interactive analyses of big biological data. *Molecular Plant*. doi:10.1016/j.molp.2020.06.009

Chen, Z., Han, Y., Ning, K., Ding, Y., Zhao, W., Yan, S., . . . Zhang, X. (2017). Inflorescence development and the role of LsFT in regulating bolting in lettuce (Lactuca sativa L.). *Frontiers in Plant Science, 8*, 2248. doi:10.3389/fpls.2017.02248

Cutler, S. R., Rodriguez, P. L., Finkelstein, R. R., & Abrams, S. R. (2010). Abscisic acid: emergence of a core signaling network. *Annual Review of Plant Biology, 61*, 651-679. doi:10.1146/annurev-arplant-042809-112122

Dardick, C., & Callahan, A. M. (2014). Evolution of the fruit endocarp: molecular mechanisms underlying adaptations in seed protection and dispersal strategies. *Frontiers in Plant Science, 5*, 284. doi:10.3389/fpls.2014.00284

Droge-Laser, W., Snoek, B. L., Snel, B., & Weiste, C. (2018). The Arabidopsis bZIP transcription factor family-an update. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology, 45*, 36-49. doi:10.1016/j.pbi.2018.05.001

Dubos, C., Stracke, R., Grotewold, E., Weisshaar, B., Martin, C., & Lepiniec, L. (2010). MYB transcription factors in Arabidopsis. *Trends in Plant Science, 15*, 573-581. doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2010.06.005

Favaro, R., Pinyopich, A., Battaglia, R., Kooiker, M., Borghi, L., Ditta, G., . . . Colombo, L. (2003). MADS-box protein complexes control carpel and ovule development in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Cell, 15*, 2603-2611. doi:10.1105/tpc.015123

Fujioka, S., Li, J., Choi, Y. H., Seto, H., Takatsuto, S., Noguchi, T., . . . Sakurai, A. (1997). The Arabidopsis deetiolated2 mutant is blocked early in brassinosteroid biosynthesis. *The Plant Cell, 9*, 1951-1962. doi:10.1105/tpc.9.11.1951

Garg, R., Singh, V. K., Rajkumar, M. S., Kumar, V., & Jain, M. (2017). Global transcriptome and coexpression network analyses reveal cultivar-specific molecular signatures associated with seed development and seed size/weight determination in chickpea. *The Plant Journal, 91*, 1088-1107. doi:10.1111/tpj.13621

Groszmann, M., Paicu, T., Alvarez, J. P., Swain, S. M., & Smyth, D. R. (2011). SPATULA and ALCATRAZ, are partially redundant, functionally diverging bHLH genes required for Arabidopsis gynoecium and fruit development. *The Plant Journal, 68*, 816-829. doi:10.1111/j.1365-313X.2011.04732.x

Gu, Q., Ferrándiz, C., Yanofsky, M. F., & Martienssen, R. (1998). The FRUITFULL MADS-box gene mediates cell differentiation during Arabidopsis fruit development. *Development, 125*, 1509-1517.

Han, Y., Chen, Z., Lv, S., Ning, K., Ji, X., Liu, X., . . . Zhang, X. (2016). MADS-box genes and gibberellins regulate bolting in lettuce (Lactuca sativa L.). *Frontiers in Plant Science, 7*, 1889. doi:10.3389/fpls.2016.01889

He, J.-X., Gendron, J. M., Sun, Y., Gampala, S. S. L., Gendron, N., Sun, C. Q., & Wang, Z.-Y. (2005).
BZR1 is a transcriptional repressor with dual roles in brassinosteroid homeostasis and growth
responses. *Science, 307*, 1634-1638. doi:10.1126/science.1107580

Heisler, M. G., Atkinson, A., Bylstra, Y. H., Walsh, R., & Smyth, D. R. (2001). SPATULA, a gene that
controls development of carpel margin tissues in Arabidopsis, encodes a bHLH protein.
Development, 128, 1089-1098.

Huang, H. Y., Jiang, W. B., Hu, Y. W., Wu, P., Zhu, J. Y., Liang, W. Q., . . . Lin, W. H. (2013). BR signal
influences Arabidopsis ovule and seed number through regulating related genes expression by
BZR1. *Molecular Plant, 6*, 456-469. doi:10.1093/mp/sss070

Jaakola, L. (2013). New insights into the regulation of anthocyanin biosynthesis in fruits. *Trends in
Plant Science, 18*, 477-483. doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2013.06.003

Jakoby, M., Weisshaar, B., Dröge-Laser, W., Vicente-Carbajosa, J., Tiedemann, J., Kroj, T., & Parcy, F.
(2002). bZIP transcription factors in Arabidopsis. *Trends in Plant Science, 7*, 106-111.
doi:10.1016/s1360-1385(01)02223-3

Jiang, W. B., Huang, H. Y., Hu, Y. W., Zhu, S. W., Wang, Z. Y., & Lin, W. H. (2013). Brassinosteroid
regulates seed size and shape in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiology, 162*, 1965-1977.
doi:10.1104/pp.113.217703

Kelley, D. R., & Gasser, C. S. (2009). Ovule development: genetic trends and evolutionary
considerations. *Sexual Plant Reproduction, 22*, 229-234. doi:10.1007/s00497-009-0107-2

Kim, D., Langmead, B., & Salzberg, S. L. (2015). HISAT: a fast spliced aligner with low memory
requirements. *Nature Methods, 12*, 357-360. doi:10.1038/nmeth.3317

Kim, H. J., Nam, H. G., & Lim, P. O. (2016). Regulatory network of NAC transcription factors in leaf
senescence. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology, 33*, 48-56. doi:10.1016/j.pbi.2016.06.002

Kim, T.-W., Guan, S., Sun, Y., Deng, Z., Tang, W., Shang, J.-X., . . . Wang, Z.-Y. (2009).
Brassinosteroid signal transduction from cell-surface receptor kinases to nuclear transcription
factors. *Nature Cell Biology, 11*, 1254-1260. doi:10.1038/ncb1970

Lepiniec, L., Debeaujon, I., Routaboul, J.-M., Baudry, A., Pourcel, L., Nesi, N., & Caboche, M. (2006).
Genetics and biochemistry of seed flavonoids. *Annual Review of Plant Biology, 57*, 405-430.
doi:10.1146/annurev.arplant.57.032905.105252

Li, N., & Li, Y. (2016). Signaling pathways of seed size control in plants. *Current Opinion in Plant
Biology, 33*, 23-32. doi:10.1016/j.pbi.2016.05.008

Li, N., Xu, R., & Li, Y. (2019). Molecular networks of seed size control in plants. *Annual Review of
Plant Biology, 70*, 435-463. doi:10.1146/annurev-arplant-050718-095851

Li, Y., Fang, J., Qi, X., Lin, M., Zhong, Y., Sun, L., & Cui, W. (2018). Combined Analysis of the Fruit
Metabolome and Transcriptome Reveals Candidate Genes Involved in Flavonoid Biosynthesis in
Actinidia arguta. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 19*. doi:10.3390/ijms19051471

Licausi, F., Ohme-Takagi, M., & Perata, P. (2013). APETALA2/Ethylene Responsive Factor (AP2/ERF)
transcription factors: mediators of stress responses and developmental programs. *New Phytologist,
199*, 639-649. doi:10.1111/nph.12291

Liljegren, S. J., Ditta, G. S., Eshed, Y., Savidge, B., Bowman, J. L., & Yanofsky, M. F. (2000).
SHATTERPROOF MADS-box genes control seed dispersal in Arabidopsis. *Nature, 404*, 766-770.
doi:10.1038/35008089

Liljegren, S. J., Roeder, A. H. K., Kempin, S. A., Gremski, K., Østergaard, L., Guimil, S., . . . Yanofsky,
M. F. (2004). Control of fruit patterning in Arabidopsis by INDEHISCENT. *Cell, 116*, 843-853.

doi:10.1016/s0092-8674(04)00217-x

Lim, G.-H., Singhal, R., Kachroo, A., & Kachroo, P. (2017). Fatty Acid- and Lipid-Mediated Signaling in Plant Defense. *Annual Review of Phytopathology, 55*, 505-536. doi:10.1146/annurev-phyto-080516-035406

Liu, J., Osbourn, A., & Ma, P. (2015). MYB Transcription Factors as Regulators of Phenylpropanoid Metabolism in Plants. *Molecular Plant, 8*, 689-708. doi:10.1016/j.molp.2015.03.012

Mao, X., Cai, T., Olyarchuk, J. G., & Wei, L. (2005). Automated genome annotation and pathway identification using the KEGG Orthology (KO) as a controlled vocabulary. *Bioinformatics, 21*, 3787-3793. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/bti430

Marszałek, K., Woźniak, Ł., Kruszewski, B., & Skąpska, S. (2017). The Effect of High Pressure Techniques on the Stability of Anthocyanins in Fruit and Vegetables. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 18*. doi:10.3390/ijms18020277

Mizzotti, C., Rotasperti, L., Moretto, M., Tadini, L., Resentini, F., Galliani, B. M., . . . Masiero, S. (2018). Time-Course Transcriptome Analysis of Arabidopsis Siliques Discloses Genes Essential for Fruit Development and Maturation. *Plant Physiology, 178*, 1249-1268. doi:10.1104/pp.18.00727

Ng, M., & Yanofsky, M. F. (2001). Function and evolution of the plant MADS-box gene family. *Nature Reviews: Genetics, 2*, 186-195. doi:10.1038/35056041

Ning, K., Han, Y., Chen, Z., Luo, C., Wang, S., Zhang, W., . . . Wang, Q. (2019). Genome-wide analysis of MADS-box family genes during flower development in lettuce. *Plant, Cell & Environment, 42*, 1868-1881. doi:10.1111/pce.13523

Olsen, A. N., Ernst, H. A., Leggio, L. L., & Skriver, K. (2005). NAC transcription factors: structurally distinct, functionally diverse. *Trends in Plant Science, 10*, 79-87. doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2004.12.010

Pabon-Mora, N., Wong, G. K., & Ambrose, B. A. (2014). Evolution of fruit development genes in flowering plants. *Frontiers in Plant Science, 5*, 300. doi:10.3389/fpls.2014.00300

Puranik, S., Sahu, P. P., Srivastava, P. S., & Prasad, M. (2012). NAC proteins: regulation and role in stress tolerance. *Trends in Plant Science, 17*, 369-381. doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2012.02.004

R Core Team. (2014). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. *R Foundation for Statistical Computing, 14*, 12-21.

Rajani, S., & Sundaresan, V. (2001). The Arabidopsis myc/bHLH gene ALCATRAZ enables cell separation in fruit dehiscence. *Current Biology, 11*, 1914-1922. doi:10.1016/s0960-9822(01)00593-0

Reyes-Chin-Wo, S., Wang, Z., Yang, X., Kozik, A., Arikit, S., Song, C., . . . Michelmore, R. W. (2017). Genome assembly with in vitro proximity ligation data and whole-genome triplication in lettuce. *Nature Communications, 8*, 14953. doi:10.1038/ncomms14953

Riechmann, J. L., Heard, J., Martin, G., Reuber, L., Jiang, C., Keddie, J., . . . Yu, G. (2000). Arabidopsis transcription factors: genome-wide comparative analysis among eukaryotes. *Science, 290*, 2105-2110. doi:10.1126/science.290.5499.2105

Robert, H. S. (2019). Molecular Communication for Coordinated Seed and Fruit Development: What Can We Learn from Auxin and Sugars? *International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 20*. doi:10.3390/ijms20040936

Roeder, A. H., & Yanofsky, M. F. (2006). Fruit development in Arabidopsis. *The Arabidopsis Book, 4*, e0075. doi:10.1199/tab.0075

Roeder, A. H. K., Ferrándiz, C., & Yanofsky, M. F. (2003). The role of the REPLUMLESS homeodomain protein in patterning the Arabidopsis fruit. *Current Biology, 13*, 1630-1635.

doi:10.1016/j.cub.2003.08.027

Ruan, Y.-L., Patrick, J. W., Bouzayen, M., Osorio, S., & Fernie, A. R. (2012). Molecular regulation of
seed and fruit set. *Trends in Plant Science, 17*, 656-665. doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2012.06.005

Samad, A. F. A., Sajad, M., Nazaruddin, N., Fauzi, I. A., Murad, A. M. A., Zainal, Z., & Ismail, I.
(2017). MicroRNA and Transcription Factor: Key Players in Plant Regulatory Network. *Frontiers
in Plant Science, 8*, 565. doi:10.3389/fpls.2017.00565

Seymour, G. B., Ostergaard, L., Chapman, N. H., Knapp, S., & Martin, C. (2013). Fruit development
and   ripening.   *Annual   Review   of   Plant   Biology,   64*,   219-241.
doi:10.1146/annurev-arplant-050312-120057

Smaczniak, C., Immink, R. G. H., Angenent, G. C., & Kaufmann, K. (2012). Developmental and
evolutionary diversity of plant MADS-domain factors: insights from recent studies. *Development,
139*, 3081-3098. doi:10.1242/dev.074674

Sreenivasulu, N., & Wobus, U. (2013). Seed-development programs: a systems biology-based
comparison between dicots and monocots. *Annual Review of Plant Biology, 64*, 189-217.
doi:10.1146/annurev-arplant-050312-120215

Sun, X., Shantharaj, D., Kang, X., & Ni, M. (2010). Transcriptional and hormonal signaling control of
Arabidopsis seed development. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology, 13*, 611-620.
doi:10.1016/j.pbi.2010.08.009

Venglat, S. P., Dumonceaux, T., Rozwadowski, K., Parnell, L., Babic, V., Keller, W., . . . Datla, R.
(2002). The homeobox gene BREVIPEDICELLUS is a key regulator of inflorescence architecture
in Arabidopsis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA, 99*, 4730-4735.
doi:10.1073/pnas.072626099

Woo, J. W., Kim, J., Kwon, S. I., Corvalan, C., Cho, S. W., Kim, H., . . . Kim, J. S. (2015). DNA-free
genome editing in plants with preassembled CRISPR-Cas9 ribonucleoproteins. *Nature
Biotechnology, 33*, 1162-1164. doi:10.1038/nbt.3389

Xie, Z., Nolan, T. M., Jiang, H., & Yin, Y. (2019). AP2/ERF Transcription Factor Regulatory Networks
in Hormone and Abiotic Stress Responses in Arabidopsis. *Frontiers in Plant Science, 10*.
doi:10.3389/fpls.2019.00228

Xu, W., Dubos, C., & Lepiniec, L. (2015). Transcriptional control of flavonoid biosynthesis by
MYB-bHLH-WDR   complexes.   *Trends   in   Plant   Science,   20*,   176-185.
doi:10.1016/j.tplants.2014.12.001

Yi, F., Gu, W., Chen, J., Song, N., Gao, X., Zhang, X., . . . Lai, J. (2019). High Temporal-Resolution
Transcriptome Landscape of Early Maize Seed Development. *The Plant Cell, 31*, 974-992.
doi:10.1105/tpc.18.00961

Young, M. D., Wakefield, M. J., Smyth, G. K., & Oshlack, A. (2010). Gene ontology analysis for
RNA-seq: accounting for selection bias. *Genome Biology, 11*, R14. doi:10.1186/gb-2010-11-2-r14

Zhang, H., Si, X., Ji, X., Fan, R., Liu, J., Chen, K., . . . Gao, C. (2018). Genome editing of upstream
open reading frames enables translational control in plants. *Nature Biotechnology, 36*, 894-898.
doi:10.1038/nbt.4202

Zhang, L., Su, W., Tao, R., Zhang, W., Chen, J., Wu, P., . . . Kuang, H. (2017). RNA sequencing
provides insights into the evolution of lettuce and the regulation of flavonoid biosynthesis. *Nature
Communications, 8*, 2264. doi:10.1038/s41467-017-02445-9

Zhong, R., Cui, D., & Ye, Z.-H. (2019). Secondary cell wall biosynthesis. *The New Phytologist, 221*,
1703-1723. doi:10.1111/nph.15537

Figure legends

Figure 1. Morphological characterization of the lettuce achenes and global analysis of the transcriptome data. (a) Morphological characterization of the lettuce capitulum and floret. (b) Morphology of achenes at different developmental stages. (c) PCA of gene expression in different achene samples. (d) Venn diagram for gene expression analysis in different achene samples. Scale bars, 1 mm.

Figure 2. Gene expression patterns and functional transition at different achene development stages. (a) Twelve clusters for the gene expression patterns based on the normalized FPKM values. (b) Heatmaps for the gene expression patterns in different co-expression clusters. (c) GO functional enrichment analysis of the genes in different co-expression clusters.

Figure 3. KEGG and GO analysis of the widely expressed genes at different achene development stages. (a) KEGG enrichment analysis of the widely expressed genes. (b) Significantly enriched GO terms of the widely expressed genes.

Figure 4. Analysis of the specially expressed genes at different achene development stages. (a–e) KEGG enrichment analysis of the stage-specific genes at the S0 (a), S1 (b), S3 (c), S6 (d), and S9 (e) stages.

Figure 5. Identification of transcription factors at different achene development stages. (a) Heatmap expression profile of the identified TFs. (b) Pie charts of the top 100 highly expressed TFs at each developmental stage.

Figure 6. Expression patterns of key genes associated with fruit and seed development at different achene development stages. (a) Heatmap expression

profile of the fruit development related genes. (b) Heatmap expression profile of the

seed development related genes.

Figure 7. Proposed working model of achene development in lettuce. The gene

expression modules and possible molecular mechanism underlying achene

development in lettuce are illustrated. Biological processes and components above the

lines indicate that the related genes are expressed during the corresponding achene

development stages.

(a)

Top 10 enriched pathways

Caffeine metabolism
Arachidonic acid metabolism
Glycosylphosphatidylinositol(GPI)−anchor biosynthesis
N−Glycan biosynthesis
Ribosome biogenesis in eukaryotes
Phagosome
Folate biosynthesis
RNA transport
mRNA surveillance pathway
Ribosome

gene_number
● 100
● 200
● 300

qvalue
1.00
0.75
0.50
0.25
0.00

Rich factor

(b)

The most enriched GO terms

zinc ion binding
structural constituent of ribosome
ubiquitin-protein transferase activity
ATP binding
protein serine/threonine kinase activity
RNA polymerase II regulatory region sequence-specific DNA binding
protein binding
RNA binding
unfolded protein binding
GTP binding
cytosol
cytosolic small ribosomal subunit
trans-Golgi network
endoplasmic reticulum
nucleolus
Golgi apparatus
nucleoplasm part
peroxisome
endosome
plasma membrane
translation
RNA splicing, via endonucleolytic cleavage and ligation
protein targeting to mitochondrion
proteasome-mediated ubiquitin-dependent protein catabolic process
embryo development ending in seed dormancy
methionine biosynthetic process
response to misfolded protein
thylakoid membrane organization
protein ubiquitination
acetyl-CoA metabolic process

■ Molecular Function
■ Cellular Component
■ Biological Process

-log10(*p*-value)