In vivo evaluation of the antiviral effect of ClO$_2$ in chicken embryos inoculated with avian

infectious bronchitis coronavirus

Zambrano-Estrada, Xóchitl[a], Domínguez-Sánchez, Carlos[b], Banuet-Martínez, Marina[b], Guerrero de

la Rosa, Fabiola[b], García-Gasca, Teresa[c], Acevedo-Whitehouse, Karina[b]

[a] Laboratory of Veterinary Diagnostic Pathology. School of Natural Sciences. Autonomous

University of Queretaro. Av. De las Ciencias S/N. Juriquilla, Queretaro. Qro. C.P.76230. Mexico,

[b] Unit for Basic and Applied Microbiology. School of Natural Sciences. Autonomous University of

Queretaro. Anillo Vial Fray Junípero Serra, Querétaro, Qro. C.P. 76140

[c] Laboratory of Cellular Biology. School of Natural Sciences. Autonomous University of Queretaro.

Av. De las Ciencias S/N. Juriquilla, Queretaro. Qro. C.P. 76230. Mexico

Corresponding author: Karina Acevedo-Whitehouse (karina.acevedo.whitehouse@uaq.mx)

Abstract

The need for safe and effective antiviral treatments is pressing, particularly given the number of

viral infections that are prevalent in animal and human populations, often causing devastating

economic losses and mortality. In the context of the current coronavirus pandemic, which has

highlighted how devastating the effects of a virus can be on a naïve population, it is imperative to

have rigorous and unbiased data on the efficacy and safety of potential antiviral treatments,

particularly those that have demonstrated virucidal effects as a disinfectant, are being considered

for use despite warnings on their potential toxicity, but no not have empirical evidence of their

antiviral effect *in vivo*. Here, we tested the effect of chlorine dioxide (ClO_2) on chick embryos

infected with avian infectious bronchitis coronavirus (IBV). We determined virus-induced mortality

on 10-day old embryos inoculated with 10^4 mean EID_{50}/mL of attenuated Massachusetts and

Connecticut IBV strains. We determined viral titres using RT-qPCR and conducted histopathological

examination of various tissues and organs. Viral titres were 2.4-fold lower and mortality was

reduced by half in infected embryos that were treated with ClO_2. Infection led to developmental

abnormalities regardless of treatment. Lesions typical of IBV infections were observed in all

inoculated embryos, but severity tended to be lower in ClO_2-treated embryos. We found no gross

or microscopic evidence of toxicity caused by ClO_2 at the doses used herein. Our study shows that

ClO_2 could be a safe and viable option for controlling avian coronavirus, and raises the possibility

that similar effects could be observed in other organisms.

Keywords

Chlorine dioxide, ClO_2, coronavirus, IBV, antiviral, chick embryo

Introduction

Since its start in January 2020, the COVID19 outbreak quickly reached pandemic proportions with

a steep rise in mortality and mounting pressure on health services worldwide, as well as marked

damage to the economy (Duan et al., 2020; Nicola et al., 2020). The pandemic has evidenced that

our available repertoire of antiviral drugs is insufficient. Existing antiviral [remdesivir (Wang et al.,

2020) and lopinavir/ritonavir (Kim et al., 2020; Lim et al., 2020)], anti-inflammatory

[dexamethasone (Villar et al., 2020)], and immunomodulatory drugs [chloroquine (Borba et al.,

2020), hydroxychloroquine (Meo et al., 2020; Sinha and Balayla, 2020), and ivermectin (Caly et al.,

2020; Heidary and Gharebaghi, 2020)], have been proposed as treatment following clinical trials.

However, except for dexamethasone, none of these drugs are currently recommended by the

World Health Organization to treat COVID19 patients other than outside the context of clinical

trials due to serious side effects (WHO, 2020). Despite this recommendation, remdesivir has

already been approved in some countries for emergency use in patients with severe COVID19

symptoms, as it decreases the duration of hospitalization and shows a modest reduction of

mortality rates in severely afflicted patients (Beigel et al., 2020). However, given that this drug

costs 2,430 USD per treatment[1], it is unlikely to be a sustainable option for developing countries,

such as those in Latin America, where the number of new COVID19 cases continues to grow

steadily. With nearly 38 million confirmed infections worldwide and more than one million deaths

at the time of writing this paper, the need for effective and safe options to treat COVID19 patients

is urgent.

The surge in COVID19 cases and the lack of effective treatments have led to a growing number of

informal reports and testimonials across social networks regarding the oral and intravenous use of

---

[1] https://www.gilead.com/news-and-press/press-room/press-releases/2020/6/an-open-letter-from-daniel-oday-chairman--ceo-gilead-sciences

chlorine dioxide (ClO_2) solution as an efficacious treatment of COVID19. In an unprecedented

move, the Senate of Bolivia authorized the extraordinary use of ClO_2 to "manufacture, sell, supply

and use ClO_2 to prevent and treat COVID19" (law PL N° 219/2019-2020 CS approved 15 July 2020).

This situation has sparked concern from health agencies of various countries regarding the

potential toxicity of using this disinfectant as a treatment, given that ClO_2 has strong oxidative

properties. Chlorine dioxide, a gas that is highly soluble in water, has been known since 1946 for

its broad antimicrobial properties (Sigstam et al., 2014), for which it is commonly used to purify

water for human consumption, decontaminate produce and other food items (López-Gálvez et al.,

2018), and disinfect surgical instruments (Doona et al., 2014). According to the Food and Drug

Administration (FDA) of the US, consuming ClO_2 can lead to adverse effects such as 'vomiting,

diarrhoea, dehydration, abdominal pain, metahemaglobinemia and systemic failures that could

potentially lead to death'. However, an impartial review of the scientific peer-reviewed literature

reveals few case reports of human patients presenting adverse effects after consumption of ClO_2,

none of which were fatal, and in all cases reversed completely after treatment (Kishan, 2009;

Bathina et al., 2013; Romanovsky et al., 2013; Loh and Shafi, 2014). Published studies on ClO_2

toxicity have reported null to mild effects in adult humans and other animals (e.g. Lubbers et al.,

1982; Akamatsu et al., 2012; Ma et al., 2017) and have stressed that toxicity is strongly dose-

dependent (Bercz et al., 1982; Hose et al., 1989; Ma et al., 2017). Interestingly, despite the voiced

concerns, there are two drugs based on acidified sodium chloride (a precursor for generation of

ClO_2, named NP001 and WF10) that have been used intravenously in humans to treat diverse

conditions, including diabetic foot ulcer and amyotrophic lateral sclerosis (ALS), without reporting

adverse reactions (Yingsakmongkol et al., 2011; Yingsakmongkol, 2013; Miller et al., 2015;

Maraprygsavan et al., 2016).

The virucidal effect of ClO_2 when used as a disinfectant of water and hard surfaces is well

documented. Specifically, there is evidence of virucidal activity against echovirus (Zhong et al.,

2017), enterovirus (Jin et al., 2013), poliovirus (Simonet and Gantzer, 2006), rotavirus (Chen and

Vaughn, 1990), norovirus (Lim et al., 2010; Montazeri et al., 2017), calicivirus (Montazeri et al.,

2017), and coronavirus (Wang et al., 2005). However, to date, there are few publications that

explore potential antiviral effects *in vitro* and *in vivo*. One of the few studies available found that

mice that were exposed to influenza A virus in an environment that contained aerosolized ClO_2

had significantly lower mortality than mice that were solely exposed to Influenza A virus (Ogata

and Shibata, 2008). The authors reported that the antiviral effect was due to denaturation of

hemaglutinin and neuraminidase glicoproteins, a finding that concurs with previous studies that

explain the virucidal mechanism of action of ClO_2 due to oxidation of amino acid residues that are

key for cell entry (Noss and Olivieri, 1985; Ison et al., 2006; Stewart et al., 2008). More recently,

the antiviral mechanism of action of ClO_2 was investigated *in vitro* using pig alveolar macrophages

and MARC-145 cells exposed to the porcine reproductive and respiratory syndrome virus

(PRRSV1), finding that the chemical also inhibits the synthesis of pro-inflammatory molecules that

contribute to the pathogenesis of this disease (Zhu et al., 2019). The authors concluded that viral

synthesis of RNA and proteins was impeded by ClO_2, leading to a reduction in viral replication.

Despite these studies, to date there has been no published report of an *in vivo* assessment of the

antiviral effect of ClO_2. Here, we have investigated the effect of a ClO_2 solution in 10-day old chick

embryos inoculated with attenuated avian infectious bronchitis coronavirus (IBV) Massachusetts

and Connecticut vaccine strains, which are pathogenic for birds during their embryonic stages of

development (Tsai et al., 2016).

Methods

Chick embryo inoculation

We used 30 10-day old SPF RossxRoss chick embryos (Pilgrims, Mexico) incubated at 38°C and 65-

70% humidity (Guy, 2015). Embryos were placed at random within the incubator to avoid any

slight variation in humidity and temperature that could affect results. Prior to starting the

experiment, all embryos were candled to ensure their viability, and were examined daily to search

for evidence of death (presence of blood ring or lack of visible eggshell membrane blood vessels).

Five chick embryos were assigned to each of the six experimental groups and treated accordingly

(see Table 1). In all cases, embryos were inoculated via the chorioallanotic sac, as recommended

for avian coronavirus replication (Jordan and Nassar, 1973; Escorcia et al., 2002). Before

inoculation, the eggshell was disinfected with 70% ethanol and 3.5% iodine (Guy, 2015). Using the

tip of sterile scissors, a hole was drilled in the eggshell over a 1 cm^2 transparent tape film and a

sterile 1ml syringe with a 28-g 5/16" needle was used to administer the treatment directly into the

allantoic cavity as indicated in Table 1. All procedures were carried out aseptically. After

inoculation, the drilled hole was sealed with a drop of glue and the embryo was returned to the

incubator. Inoculation of every embryo was performed by a single person to ensure experimental

variation was kept at a minimum. Embryos were candled daily to determine mortality. As there

was no death recorded within the first 24 h post-inoculation, none of the embryos were discarded

from the experiment.

<u>Macroscopic examination</u>

Seven days after inoculation, embryos were sacrificed according to the American Veterinary

Medical Association guidelines on humane treatment and euthanasia of chick embryos over 13

days of age (AVMA 2020). The embryos were placed at 4 °C for 4 h to ensure blood coagulation

and avoid contamination of the allantoic fluid (Guy, 2015). Next, each egg was placed on a firm

surface with the air chamber facing upwards. The eggshell over the air chamber was disinfected

with 70% ethanol and 3.5% iodine (Guy, 2015) and using sterile scissors, the eggshell and

chorioallantoic membrane were removed to expose the allanotic fluid. A sterile pipette was used

to aspirate 750 µl of the fluid and transfer it to a sterile cryovial before storage at −70 °C. Next, the

embryo was removed from the eggshell using sterile dissection forceps and placed in a sterile Petri

dish to be photographed.

Each embryo was cleaned with distilled water to remove any remaining albumin, vitellus and

amniotic fluid before its mass was determined with a precision scale (±0.1 mg). Embryonic axis

length was measured with digital callipers (± 0.1 cm). After decapitation with a sterile scalpel

blade, each embryo was examined for macroscopic lesions typically caused by avian coronavirus,

such as cutaneous haemorrhages, stunting, curving, urate deposits in the kidney and feather

alterations (Escorcia et al., 2002; Alexander D.J. and D.A. Senne, 2008). Chick embryos were

considered to have died during the experiment when there was evidence of disconnected or

detached blood vessels of the chorioallantoic membrane or their organs exhibited imbibition of

haemoglobin. Further evidence of mortality was determined by examining the presence of

autolysis at microscopic examination.

For each chick embryo, both femurs were dissected and their length was determined and

averaged with a digital calliper as a surrogate measure of chick development. We collected

samples of all organs and tissues, including those known to be affected by the Massachusetts and

Connecticut strains of avian coronavirus, namely trachea, lung, proventricle, duodenum, liver,

kidneys and the Bursa of Fabricius (Escorcia et al., 2002; Cavanagh, 2003, 2007; Tsai et al., 2016),

and those reportedly affected by exposure to ClO_2, namely thyroid (Bercz et al., 1982; Harrington

et al., 1986), thymus, spleen and bone marrow (EPA, 2000).

Microscopic examination

Samples were cut longitudinally at their mid-section and immersed in 10% buffered formalin, pH

7.4. Fixed samples were paraffin-embedded and sectioned at 3 µm with a microtome before being

stained with haematoxylin-eosin for microscopic examination. The slides were observed under the

microscope at 40X and 100X.

To assess haematopoietic status, bone marrow preparations were used for a 200-cell differential

count to classify the marrow precursors and to determine the myeloid:erythroid (M/E) ratio for

each embryo. This ratio was obtained by dividing the sum of all the granulocytic cells by the sum of

all the erythrocytic cells (Schalm and Jain, 1986).

Virus quantitation by RT-qPCR

The virus was quantified in the allantoid fluid with an RT-qPCR protocol (Naguib et al., 2017).

Briefly, RNA was extracted by adding 700 µL of Trizol (Invitrogen) to 500 µL of each sample. The

sample was incubated for 10 min at ambient temperature. Next, 200 µL of chloroform were

added, mixed by inversion, and centrifuged at 12,000 g for 10 min at 4 °C. The aqueous phase was

transferred to a sterile microtube, and 500 µL of isopropanol were added. The sample was

centrifuged at 12,000 g for 10 min at 4 °C prior to decanting the supernatant. The pellet was

washed with 500 µL of cold 70% ethanol, centrifuged at 7,500 g for 5 min at 4 °C and the

supernatant was removed completely. The dry pellet was resuspended in 12 µL of nuclease-free

water and centrifuged at 7,500 g for 1 min at 4 °C. Quantity and quality of the extracted RNA was

examined in a Nanodrop (Qiagen) spectrophotometer and all samples were diluted to 35 ng/mL

RNA before retrotranscription.

cDNA synthesis was performed with oligo dT and MLV reversotranscriptase (Invitrogen)according

to the manufacturer's instructions. Briefly, we used 8 µL of RNA, 1 µL of Oligo DT (50 ng/µL), 1 µL of

10 mM dNTP and 2 μL of nuclease-free H_2O. The reactions were incubated at 65 °C for 5 min and

placed on ice for 1 min. Seven μL of the kits cDNA synthesis mix, which contains 4 μL 5X First-Strand

Buffer, 2 μL 0.1 M DTT and 1 μL RNAse and DNAse free H_2O, were added prior to mixing by pipetting

and incubating at ambient temperature (~25 °C) for 2 min. We added 1 μL pf SuperScript II RT, mixed

by pipetting and incubated at ambient temperature for 10 min. The reactions were incubated at 42

°C for 50 min and inactivated at 70 °C for 15 min. All cDNA samples were stored at -20°C until used.

A 100 bp fragment of the avian coronavirus N gene was amplified using primers IBV-pan_FW-1 (5'-

CAG TCC CDG ATG CNT GGT A) and IBV-pan_RV (5'-CC TTW SCA GMA ACM CAC ACT) (Naguib et al.,

2017). Quantitation was done with SYBR Green qPCR (Qiagen) in a real-time thermal cycler (CFX

connect, Biorad) under the following protocol: 45 °C for 10 min, initial denaturation at 95 °C for 10

min and 35 cycles of 95 °C for 15 s, 52 °C for 15 s, and 68 °C for 30 s, with a final extension step at

68 °C for 10 min. We used a cDNA sample extracted from 500 μL of the vaccine as a positive control

(the vaccine contained 10^4 mean embryo infective dose (EID_{50})/mL of coronavirus strains

Massachusetts and Connecticut). A linear regression was used to calculate the correlation

coefficient ($R^2 = 0.99$) and the slope value (b = -5.062) of the RNA copy number and Cq values using

a 10-fold dilution of the vaccine (10^4 to 10^{-1}; see standard curve in Supplementary material). The

number of viral RNA copies (hereafter viral load) was determined by comparing the Cq against this

standard curve (Naguib et al., 2017). All cDNA samples were diluted 1:10 prior to running the qPCR

assays.

<u>Statistical analyses</u>

Contingency tables were built to investigate differences in the number of dead *vs*. live chick

embryos between experimental groups. The relative risk of developing virus-related lesions

between treated and un-treated embryos was calculated using Fisher exact tests to estimate

significance. Body mass, morphometrics, viral load, and lesion severity were compared among

groups by one-way ANOVA and post-hoc Tukey HSD tests. All analyses were performed in R

version 3.6.3 (R Core Team, 2016). Contingency tables, Fisher exact p-values and odds ratios were

calculated with R package Epitools version 0.5-10.1.

<u>Bioethics statement</u>

This study was carried out in compliance with the American Veterinary Medical Association

(AVMA) guide for humane treatment of chick embryos and approved by the Autonomous

University of Queretaro Research Ethics Committee.

Results

Avian coronavirus RNA was detected in all of the embryos that were inoculated with the vaccine

(n=15, in all cases Cq <40). The viral load varied significantly between treatments (ANOVA;

$F_{2,12}$=4.421, p=0.036; Fig. 1), being 2.4 times higher in the untreated embryos. The average viral

load of ClO_2-treated chicks was $10^{4.3}$/mL, range: $10^{3.66} - 10^{5.03}$ and of untreated chicks was

$10^{4.83}$/mL, range: $10^{4.52} - 10^{5.01}$, respectively (Tukey HSD, Group E *vs*. F, p = 0.03). There were no

differences in the viral load between both ClO_2-treated groups (p>0.05).

Embryo mortality varied among groups (Fig. 2) and differed significantly between virus-inoculated

and virus-free embryos (Pearson's Chi^2 = 7.78; p = 0.004), reaching 80 % (4/5) of mortality in the

viral control group (Group F). In the groups that contained viral-inoculated embryos treated with

ClO_2, 1/5 (20 %) of the infected embryos in the low dosage group (Group D) and 2/5 (40 %) of the

infected embryos in the high dosage group (Group E) died. In the groups that were not infected

with the virus, there was only one death observed, in the group that received the high dosage of

ClO_2 (Group C).

Body mass, embryonic axis length and femur length differed between the virus-inoculated and

virus free-groups, regardless of ClO_2 treatment. All of the virus-inoculated embryos exhibited

dwarfing and had, on average, 38% lower mass ($t = 21.15$, df = 29.40, $p = 2.2 \times 10^{-16}$; Fig. 3A), 10%

shorter axis length ($t = 58.43$, df = 29.26, $p = 2.2 \times 10^{-16}$; Fig. 3B), and 20% shorter femur length ($t =$

8.49, df = 23.34, $p = 1.4 \times 10^{-8}$; Fig 3C) than the virus-free groups. When analysing growth in the

virus-inoculated groups, mass was significantly higher in embryos that were treated with ClO_2 ($t = -$

2.74, df = 12.98, $p = 0.017$). Body length of virus-inoculated chicks did not vary according to ClO_2

treatment ($p > 0.1$). See supplementary material for photographs of the embryos.

Lesions previously described in embryos infected with avian coronavirus were observed at post

mortem examination. Namely, curling, the presence of white caseous material (urates), thickened

amnion and allantoic membranes that adhered to the embryos, oedematous serous membranes,

epidermal congestion, and subcutaneous haemorrhage (Table 2). Virus-inoculated embryos that

were treated with ClO_2 had a lower risk of epidermal congestion (RR = 0.4; Wald 95% CI: 0.187-

0.855; $p = 0.04$), haemorrhage (RR = 0.1; Wald 95% CI: 0.016 - 0.642; $p = 0.002$), curling (RR =

0.019; Wald 95% CI: 0.125 - 0.844; $p = 0.017$) and thickened membranes (RR = 0; $p = 0.003$) than

untreated infected embryos. All the embryos had a pale liver and mildly congested lungs,

regardless of their experimental group. Pale enlarged kidneys were observed in the virus-

inoculated groups but not in the virus-free groups, regardless of ClO_2-treatment (see Table 2).

Microscopic lesions compatible with avian IBV infection were observed in various organs in all

virus-inoculated groups (Fig. 4). The severity of the lesions was either similar or slightly lower in

the embryos that had been treated with ClO_2 than in the embryos that did not receive any

treatment (Table 3). Two exceptions were the kidneys and the duodenum. In the kidneys, swelling

and degeneration of renal tubular epithelium was more common and more severe in the infected

chicks that were administered ClO_2 than in the infected embryos that did not receive ClO_2,

although the former presented mitotic cells. The duodenal villi of the embryos in the IBV-infected

groups were longer (ANOVA; $F_{5,18}$ = 5.62, p = 0.003), and their base was wider (ANOVA; $F_{5,18}$ =

13.65, p = 1.39 x 10^{-05}) than embryos from the none-infected groups, and they were moderately

congested. Duodenal villous atrophy varied amongst groups (ANOVA; $F_{5,18}$ = 5.71, p = 0.003) and

post-hoc comparisons revealed that the significant differences were E *vs.* B (p = 0.021) and E *vs.* C

(p = 0.001). The percent of bursal lymphoid tissue decreased markedly in the virus-inoculated

embryos (ANOVA; $F_{5,12}$ = 3.58, p = 0.033; see Fig. 4). Virus-inoculated embryos showed mild

apoptosis in the thymus and heterophilic infiltration. Amongst the six experimental groups, all of

the embryos examined presented subacute heterophilic bursitis, and pulmonary interstitial

multifocal heterophilic foci with congestion (Table 3).

There were no observable alterations to the architecture and integrity of the tissues of non-

infected embryos that were administered ClO_2 (Experimental groups B and C), nor was any

difference in the area (μm^2) of the thyroid (p>0.1). ClO_2-treated groups showed a slightly higher

myeloid to erythroid ratio in the bone marrow than the experimental control group and the viral

control group, although the difference was not statistically significant (ANOVA; $F_{5,15}$ = 2.33, p =

0.094).

Discussion

The use of chlorine dioxide (ClO_2) as a disinfectant is well established, and its virucidal effects are

reported against a wide range of enveloped and non-enveloped viruses that can affect human and

domestic animal health. To date, its informal use as an antiviral drug is polemical, and there are no

published studies that have explored the antiviral action of this substance following oral or

parenteral administration. We have investigated the antiviral effect of 30 ppm and 300 ppm ClO_2

solutions (both concentrations below the reported NOAEL; Bercz et al., 1982) in chick embryos

infected with avian infectious bronchitis coronavirus (IBV) strains. We observed a reduction in viral

titre in infected embryos that were treated with ClO_2. Mortality decreased substantially in the

ClO_2-treated embryos, although alterations to chick development were prevalent regardless of

treatment.

Virulent avian IBV strains typically have a burst size of 10 to 100 infective units per cell (Robb and

Bond, 1979), which appear in culture within six hours and can reach peak virus titres of $10^{6.5}$–$10^{8.5}$

$TCID_{50}$ after 36 hours (Otsuki et al., 1979). The vaccine strains used here have lower replication

efficiencies as they are attenuated (Tsai et al., 2020), but they are capable of replicating and

causing damage in chick embryos (Tsai et al., 2016). With 2,000 infective units (200 μl of 10^4

infective units/mL) inoculated into each embryo, the ClO_2 treatments decreased viral load 2.4-fold

compared to the infected non-treated embryos, representing an average difference of 42,711

infective units. This result could be explained by two mechanisms described for ClO_2. Firstly, direct

destruction or neutralization of the virions exposed to ClO_2, could have occurred due to

denaturing of their envelope glycoproteins following oxidation of amino acid residues(Noss and

Olivieri, 1985; Ison et al., 2006; Ogata and Shibata, 2008). Secondly, viral replication efficiency

could have decreased due to ClO_2–induced biochemical changes in the extra- or intracellular

milieu impeding the synthesis of viral RNA and proteins (see Enjuanes et al., 2006; Zhu et al.,

2019). These proposed mechanisms of action are not mutually exclusive.

The effects of reduced viral titres in the infected embryos were evident, with a 50 to 75%

reduction in mortality in the treated embryos treated with 300 ppm and 30 ppm of ClO_2,

respectively. However, developmental abnormalities were observed in the majority of the infected

embryos, including the groups that received ClO_2 treatment. Namely, dwarfing, assessed by body

mass, axis length, and femur length were significantly lower in all infected embryos, as expected to

occur in IBV infections (Balasubramaniam et al., 2013). In contrast, curling – also caused by avian

IBV (Wickramasinghe et al., 2011; Mork et al., 2014) – was virtually absent in the embryos that

received ClO_2 after infection. Alterations associated con IBV infection were observed in the

proventriculus, spleen, liver, but specifically in kidneys, trachea and lung. (Butcher et al., 1990;

Cook et al., 2012) were observed in most of the infected embryos, including those that were

administered ClO_2. However, for most of these abnormalities, severity was lower or similar in the

ClO_2-treated groups. One exception was the pathology observed in the kidneys, where lesions

indicative of nephrosis were more severe and frequent in the IBV-infected embryos treated with

ClO_2 than in the IBV-infected non-treated embryos. Such lesions in the kidneys are unlikely to be

due to the ClO_2 treatment itself, given that none of the non-infected embryos that were

administered ClO_2 showed any abnormality in the kidneys. Similarly, atrophy of the duodenal villi

was highest in the inoculated group that was administered a high dose of ClO_2, but absent in the

non-infected groups that only received ClO_2. If duodenal atrophy and nephropathogenicity in IBV-

infected embryos are mitigated by inflammatory responses (Chhabra et al., 2018), it is possible

that the observed tubular damage reflected ClO_2-driven downregulation of acute inflammation

that allowed virion replication in the tubular epithelium and in the duodenal villi. This scenario

could be plausible if we consider that a recent study that investigated the antiviral effect of ClO_2 in

pig alveolar macrophages and African green monkey kidney cells infected with the porcine

reproductive and respiratory syndrome virus (PRRSV1) *in vitro*, reported downregulation of pro-

inflammatory cytokines IL-1, IL-6 and TNF-α (Zhu et al., 2019). The drug NP001 (a chemical

precursor of ClO_2) exerts strong anti-inflammatory responses by inhibiting macrophage activation

in humans, even after a single dose (Miller et al., 2014). In turn, WF10, a strong oxidizing agent

that is related to ClO_2 (Veerasarn et al., 2004), induces apoptosis of inflammatory cells and

downregulates pro-inflammatory genes (Giese et al., 2004; Yingsakmongkol et al., 2011).

Interestingly, the affected renal tubules had mitotic cells, suggestive of regeneration as a

reparative response to damage of the renal tubular epithelium (Toback, 1992; Fujigaki, 2012;

Lombardi et al., 2016). This possibility will need to be explored further in the animal model used in

our study. Unfortunately, knowledge of IBV pathogenesis, immune responses and tissue

reparation in the embryonated egg is limited. In hatched birds, IBV can impact lymphocyte

populations by inducing apoptosis, thus impeding virus clearance (Caron, 2010). We found some

evidence of this effect, as the virus-inoculated embryos had a reduced percent of bursal lymphoid

tissue.

Taken together, our results indicate that ClO_2 limited viral replication but as the embryos were

only administered a single dose of a ClO_2 solution rather than repeated doses, not all virions were

eliminated. The viruses that remained viable after administration of the ClO_2 were able to

replicate, yielding lower viral titres, and the damage that they caused to the embryos was less

severe and ultimately led to less mortality than in the untreated infected embryos. Repeated

administrations of ClO_2 solution might have reduced the viral load further, plausibly leading to

even less virus-induced damage, a possibility that we could not explore in this model. However, an

important result of our study was the lack of evidence of tissue damage caused by ClO_2 itself. Only

one (20%) of the uninfected embryos treated with the high dose of ClO_2 died, and this difference

was not statistically significant to the experimental control. It is possible that the death was due to

other causes, as a 20% embryo mortality rate is considered normal in aviculture (Romanoff, 1972;

Fasenko & O´Dea, 2008).

Further studies should aim to test the antiviral effect of ClO_2 in hatched chicks, which have a more

mature immune system, and where repeated administrations are easier to procure. However, it is

promising that we found an evident effect against IBV without any significant adverse effect or

evidence of toxicity to the chick embryos. Much research needs to be done before it is possible to

generalize and extrapolate our findings to other viruses and animal hosts. However, in the context

of the current COVID-19 crisis, with near to none viable, accessible and safe therapeutic option

available, it might be prudent to consider conducting controlled double-blind and randomized

studies on the antiviral effect of ClO_2 in COVID-19 patients.

Statement of conflict of interest

The authors declare they do not have any conflict of interest regarding this submission.

Funding

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or

not-for-profit sectors.

Author contributions

K.A-W. and T.G-G. conceived the idea. K.A-W. supervised the experiments, performed statistical

analyses and wrote the manuscript. X.Z-E. performed all gross examinations and histopathology

analyses. C.D-S. conducted molecular assays and artwork. M.B-M. and F.G-D performed the

inoculation experiments and assisted during necropsies. All authors participated in the discussion

of results.

Acknowledgments

We thank Luis A. Soto-García and Karla Zamora y Cuevas for their help with photographic and

video documentation of the experiment.

References

Akamatsu, A., Lee, C., Morino, H., Miura, T., Ogata, N., Shibata, T., 2012. Six-month low level

chlorine dioxide gas inhalation toxicity study with two-week recovery period in rats. J. Occup.

Med. Toxicol. 7, 2. doi:10.1186/1745-6673-7-2

Alexander D.J. and D.A. Senne, 2008. A Laboratory Manual for the Isolation, Identification and

Characterization of Avian Pathogens, American Association of Avian Pathologists.

ISBN:9780978916374

AVMA, 2020. Guidelines for the Euthanasia of Animals. American Veterinary Medicine Association.

ISBN:978-1-882691-54-8.

Balasubramaniam, A., Sukumar, K., Suresh, P., Puvarajan, B., 2013. Molecular characterisation of

membrane glycoprotein and 5b protein of nephropathogenic infectious bronchitis virus. Vet.

World. doi:10.14202/vetworld.2013.857-861

Bathina, G., Yadla, M., Burri, S., Enganti, R., Prasad Ch, R., Deshpande, P., Ch, R., Prayaga, A.,

Uppin, M., 2013. An unusual case of reversible acute kidney injury due to chlorine dioxide

poisoning. Ren. Fail. 35, 1176–1178. doi:10.3109/0886022X.2013.819711

Beigel, J.H., Tomashek, K.M., Dodd, L.E., Mehta, A.K., Zingman, B.S., Kalil, A.C., Hohmann, E., Chu,

H.Y., Luetkemeyer, A., Kline, S., Lopez de Castilla, D., Finberg, R.W., Dierberg, K., Tapson, V.,

Hsieh, L., Patterson, T.F., Paredes, R., Sweeney, D.A., Short, W.R., Touloumi, G., Lye, D.C.,

Ohmagari, N., Oh, M.-D., Ruiz-Palacios, G.M., Benfield, T., Fätkenheuer, G., Kortepeter, M.G.,

Atmar, R.L., Creech, C.B., Lundgren, J., Babiker, A.G., Pett, S., Neaton, J.D., Burgess, T.H.,

Bonnett, T., Green, M., Makowski, M., Osinusi, A., Nayak, S., Lane, H.C., 2020. Remdesivir for

the Treatment of Covid-19 - Final Report. N. Engl. J. Med. doi:10.1056/NEJMoa2007764

Bercz, J.P., Jones, L., Garner, L., Murray, D., Ludwig, D.A., Boston, J., 1982. Subchronic toxicity of

chlorine dioxide and related compounds in drinking water in the nonhuman primate.

Environ. Health Perspect. 46, 47–55. doi:10.1289/ehp.824647

Borba, M.G.S., Val, F.F.A., Sampaio, V.S., Alexandre, M.A.A., Melo, G.C., Brito, M., Mourão, M.P.G.,

Brito-Sousa, J.D., Baía-da-Silva, D., Guerra, M.V.F., Hajjar, L.A., Pinto, R.C., Balieiro, A.A.S.,

Pacheco, A.G.F., Santos, J.D.O., Naveca, F.G., Xavier, M.S., Siqueira, A.M., Schwarzbold, A.,

Croda, J., Nogueira, M.L., Romero, G.A.S., Bassat, Q., Fontes, C.J., Albuquerque, B.C., Daniel-

Ribeiro, C.T., Monteiro, W.M., Lacerda, M.V.G., 2020. Effect of High vs Low Doses of

Chloroquine Diphosphate as Adjunctive Therapy for Patients Hospitalized With Severe Acute

Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) Infection: A Randomized Clinical Trial.

JAMA Netw. open. doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.8857

Butcher, G.D., Winterfield, R.W., Shapiro, D.P., 1990. Pathogenesis of H13 nephropathogenic

infectious bronchitis virus. Avian Dis. 34, 916–921.

Caly, L., Druce, J.D., Catton, M.G., Jans, D.A., Wagstaff, K.M., 2020. The FDA-approved drug

ivermectin inhibits the replication of SARS-CoV-2 *in vitro*. Antiviral Res.

doi:10.1016/j.antiviral.2020.104787

Caron, L.F., 2010. Etiology and immunology of infectious bronchitis virus. Rev. Bras. Cienc. Avic.

doi:10.1590/S1516-635X2010000200007

Cavanagh, D., 2007. Coronavirus avian infectious bronchitis virus. Vet. Res. 38, 281–297.

doi:10.1051/vetres:2006055

Cavanagh, D., 2003. Severe acute respiratory syndrome vaccine development: experiences of

vaccination against avian infectious bronchitis coronavirus. Avian Pathol. 32, 567–582.

doi:10.1080/03079450310001621198

Chen, Y.S., Vaughn, J.M., 1990. Inactivation of human and simian rotaviruses by chlorine dioxide.

Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 56, 1363–1366. doi:10.1128/AEM.56.5.1363-1366.1990

Chhabra, R., Ball, C., Chantrey, J., Ganapathy, K., 2018. Differential innate immune responses

induced by classical and variant infectious bronchitis viruses in specific pathogen free chicks.

Dev. Comp. Immunol. 87, 16–23. doi:10.1016/j.dci.2018.04.026

Cook, J.K.A., Jackwood, M., Jones, R.C., 2012. The long view: 40 years of infectious bronchitis

research. Avian Pathol. 41, 239–250. doi:10.1080/03079457.2012.680432

Doona, C.J., Feeherry, F.E., Setlow, P., Malkin, A.J., Leighton, T.J., 2014. The Portable Chemical

Sterilizer (PCS), D-FENS, and D-FEND ALL: novel chlorine dioxide decontamination

technologies for the military. J. Vis. Exp. e4354. doi:10.3791/4354

Duan, H., Wang, S., Yang, C., 2020. Coronavirus: limit short-term economic damage. Nature.

doi:10.1038/d41586-020-00522-6

Enjuanes, L., Almazán, F., Sola, I., Zuñiga, S., 2006. Biochemical aspects of coronavirus replication

and virus-host interaction. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 60, 211–230.

doi:10.1146/annurev.micro.60.080805.142157

EPA, 2000. Toxicological Review of Chlorine dioxide and Chlorite. CAS Nos. 10049-04-4 and 7758-

19-2. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Washington, DC. http://www.epa.gov/iris.

Escorcia, M., Fortoul, T.I., Petrone, V.M., Galindo, F., López, C., Téllez, G., 2002. Gastric gross and

microscopic lesions caused by the UNAM-97 variant strain of infectious bronchitis virus after

the eighth passage in specific pathogen-free chicken embryos. Poult. Sci. 81, 1647–1652.

doi:10.1093/ps/81.11.1647

Fasenko, G.M., O´Dea, E.E., 2008. Evaluating Broiler Growth and Mortality in Chicks with Minor

Navel Conditions at Hatching. Poult. Sci. 87,594–597. doi: 10.3382/ps.2007-00352

Fujigaki, Y., 2012. Different modes of renal proximal tubule regeneration in health and disease.

World J. Nephrol. 1, 92–99. doi:10.5527/wjn.v1.i4.92

Giese, T., McGrath, M.S., Stumm, S., Schempp, H., Elstner, E., Meuer, S.C., 2004. Differential

effects on innate versus adaptive immune responses by WF10. Cell. Immunol. 229, 149–158.

doi:10.1016/j.cellimm.2004.08.001

Guy, J.S., 2015. Isolation and Propagation of Coronaviruses in Embryonated Eggs, in: Maier, H.J.,

Bickerton, E., Britton, P. (Eds.), Coronaviruses: Methods and Protocols, Methods in Molecular

Biology. Springer Protocols. New York. doi:10.1007/978-1-4939-2438-7_7

Harrington, R.M., Shertzer, H.G., Bercz, J.P., 1986. Effects of chlorine dioxide on thyroid function in

the African green monkey and the rat. J. Toxicol. Environ. Health 19, 235–242.

doi:10.1080/15287398609530923

Heidary, F., Gharebaghi, R., 2020. Ivermectin: a systematic review from antiviral effects to COVID-

19 complementary regimen. J. Antibiot. (Tokyo). doi:10.1038/s41429-020-0336-z

Hose, J.E., Di Fiore, D., Parker, H.S., Sciarrotta, T., 1989. Toxicity of chlorine dioxide to early life

stages of marine organisms. Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 42, 315–319.

doi:10.1007/BF01699954

Ison, A., Odeh, I.N., Margerum, D.W., 2006. Kinetics and mechanisms of chlorine dioxide and

chlorite oxidations of cysteine and glutathione. Inorg. Chem. 45, 8768–8775.

doi:10.1021/ic0609554

Jin, M., Shan, J., Chen, Z., Guo, X., Shen, Z., Qiu, Z., Xue, B., Wang, Y., Zhu, D., Wang, X., Li, J., 2013.

Chlorine dioxide inactivation of enterovirus 71 in water and its impact on genomic targets.

Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 4590–4597. doi:10.1021/es305282g

Jordan, F.T., Nassar, T.J., 1973. The combined influence of age of embryo and temperature and

duration of incubation on the replication and yield of avian infectious bronchitis (IB) virus in

the developing chick embryo. Avian Pathol. 2, 279–294. doi:10.1080/03079457309353804

Kim, J.-W., Kim, E.J., Kwon, H.H., Jung, C.Y., Kim, K.C., Choe, J.-Y., Hong, H.-L., 2020. Lopinavir-

ritonavir versus hydroxychloroquine for viral clearance and clinical improvement in patients

with mild to moderate coronavirus disease 2019. Korean J. Intern. Med.

doi:10.3904/kjim.2020.224

Kishan, H., 2009. Chlorine dioxide-induced acute hemolysis. J. Med. Toxicol. Off. J. Am. Coll. Med.

Toxicol.

Lim, J., Jeon, S., Shin, H.Y., Kim, M.J., Seong, Y.M., Lee, W.J., Choe, K.W., Kang, Y.M., Lee, B., Park,

S.J., 2020. Case of the index patient who caused tertiary transmission of coronavirus disease

2019 in Korea: The application of lopinavir/ritonavir for the treatment of COVID-19

pneumonia monitored by quantitative RT-PCR. J. Korean Med. Sci.

doi:10.3346/jkms.2020.35.e79

Lim, M.Y., Kim, J.-M., Ko, G., 2010. Disinfection kinetics of murine norovirus using chlorine and

chlorine dioxide. Water Res. 44, 3243–3251. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2010.03.003

Loh, J.M.R., Shafi, H., 2014. Kikuchi-Fujimoto disease presenting after consumption of "Miracle

Mineral Solution" (sodium chlorite). BMJ Case Rep. 2014. doi:10.1136/bcr-2014-205832

Lombardi, D., Becherucci, F., Romagnani, P., 2016. How much can the tubule regenerate and who

does it? An open question. Nephrol. Dial. Transplant. Off. Publ. Eur. Dial. Transpl. Assoc. -

Eur. Ren. Assoc. 31, 1243–1250. doi:10.1093/ndt/gfv262

López-Gálvez, F., Randazzo, W., Vásquez, A., Sánchez, G., Decol, L.T., Aznar, R., Gil, M.I., Allende,

A., 2018. Irrigating Lettuce with Wastewater Effluent: Does Disinfection with Chlorine Dioxide

Inactivate Viruses? J. Environ. Qual. 47, 1139–1145. doi:10.2134/jeq2017.12.0485

Lubbers, J.R., Chauan, S., Bianchine, J.R., 1982. Controlled clinical evaluations of chlorine dioxide,

chlorite and chlorate in man. Environ. Health Perspect. 46, 57–62. doi:10.1289/ehp.824657

Ma, J.-W., Huang, B.-S., Hsu, C.-W., Peng, C.-W., Cheng, M.-L., Kao, J.-Y., Way, T.-D., Yin, H.-C.,

Wang, S.-S., 2017. Efficacy and Safety Evaluation of a Chlorine Dioxide Solution. Int. J.

Environ. Res. Public Health 14. doi:10.3390/ijerph14030329

Maraprygsavan, P., Mongkolsuk, J., Arnhold, J., Kuehne, F.-W., 2016. The chlorite-based drug

WF10 constantly reduces hemoglobin A1c values and improves glucose control in diabetes

patients with severe foot syndrome. J. Clin. Transl. Endocrinol. 4, 53–58.

doi:10.1016/j.jcte.2016.05.001

Meo, S.A., Klonoff, D.C., Akram, J., 2020. Efficacy of chloroquine and hydroxychloroquine in the

treatment of COVID-19. Eur. Rev. Med. Pharmacol. Sci. doi:10.26355/eurrev_202004_21038

Miller, R.G., Block, G., Katz, J.S., Barohn, R.J., Gopalakrishnan, V., Cudkowicz, M., Zhang, J.R.,

McGrath, M.S., Ludington, E., Appel, S.H., Azhir, A., 2015. Randomized phase 2 trial of NP001-

a novel immune regulator: Safety and early efficacy in ALS. Neurol. Neuroimmunol.

neuroinflammation 2, e100. doi:10.1212/NXI.0000000000000100

Miller, R.G., Zhang, R., Block, G., Katz, J., Barohn, R., Kasarskis, E., Forshew, D., Gopalakrishnan, V.,

McGrath, M.S., 2014. NP001 regulation of macrophage activation markers in ALS: a phase I

clinical and biomarker study. Amyotroph. Lateral Scler. Frontotemporal Degener. 15, 601–

609. doi:10.3109/21678421.2014.951940

Montazeri, N., Manuel, C., Moorman, E., Khatiwada, J.R., Williams, L.L., Jaykus, L.-A., 2017.

Virucidal Activity of Fogged Chlorine Dioxide- and Hydrogen Peroxide-Based Disinfectants

against Human Norovirus and Its Surrogate, Feline Calicivirus, on Hard-to-Reach Surfaces.

Front. Microbiol. 8, 1031. doi:10.3389/fmicb.2017.01031

Mork, A.-K., Hesse, M., Abd El Rahman, S., Rautenschlein, S., Herrler, G., Winter, C., 2014.

Differences in the tissue tropism to chicken oviduct epithelial cells between avian

coronavirus IBV strains QX and B1648 are not related to the sialic acid binding properties of

their spike proteins. Vet. Res. 45, 67. doi:10.1186/1297-9716-45-67

Naguib, M.M., El-Kady, M.F., Lüschow, D., Hassan, K.E., Arafa, A.-S., El-Zanaty, A., Hassan, M.K.,

Hafez, H.M., Grund, C., Harder, T.C., 2017. New real time and conventional RT-PCRs for

updated molecular diagnosis of infectious bronchitis virus infection (IBV) in chickens in Egypt

associated with frequent co-infections with avian influenza and Newcastle Disease viruses. J.

Virol. Methods 245, 19–27. doi:10.1016/j.jviromet.2017.02.018

Nicola, M., Alsafi, Z., Sohrabi, C., Kerwan, A., Al-Jabir, A., Iosifidis, C., Agha, M., Agha, R., 2020. The

socio-economic implications of the coronavirus pandemic (COVID-19): A review. Int. J. Surg.

doi:10.1016/j.ijsu.2020.04.018

Noss, C.I., Olivieri, V.P., 1985. Disinfecting capabilities of oxychlorine compounds. Appl. Environ.

Microbiol. 50, 1162–1164. doi:10.1128/AEM.50.5.1162-1164.1985

Ogata, N., Shibata, T., 2008. Protective effect of low-concentration chlorine dioxide gas against

influenza A virus infection. J. Gen. Virol. 89, 60–67. doi:10.1099/vir.0.83393-0

Otsuki, K., Noro, K., Yamamoto, H., Tsubokura, M., 1979. Studies on avian infectious bronchitis

virus (IBV). II. Propagation of IBV in several cultured cells. Arch. Virol. 60, 115–122.

doi:10.1007/BF01348027

R Core Team, 2016. R Development Core Team. R A Lang. Environ. Stat. Comput.

Robb, J.A., Bond, C.W., 1979. Coronaviridae, in: Fraenkel-Conrat, H., Wagner, R.R. (Eds.),

Comprehensive Virology. Springer, Boston. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4684-3563-

4_3

Romanoff, A., Romanoff, A., 1972. Spontaneous malformations, in: Romanoff, A.L. (Ed.),

Pathogenesis of the avian embryo: an analysis of causes of malformations and prenatal

death. Wiley-Interscience, New York. ISBN:978-0471732402

Romanovsky, A., Djogovic, D., Chin, D., 2013. A case of sodium chlorite toxicity managed with

concurrent renal replacement therapy and red cell exchange. J. Med. Toxicol. Off. J. Am. Coll.

Med. Toxicol. 9, 67–70. doi:10.1007/s13181-012-0256-9

Schalm, O.W., Jain, N.C., 1986. Schalm's veterinary hematology, 4th editio. ed. Lea & Febiger,

Philadelphia.

Sigstam, T., Rohatschek, A., Zhong, Q., Brennecke, M., Kohn, T., 2014. On the cause of the tailing

phenomenon during virus disinfection by chlorine dioxide. Water Res. 48, 82–89.

doi:10.1016/j.watres.2013.09.023

Simonet, J., Gantzer, C., 2006. Degradation of the Poliovirus 1 genome by chlorine dioxide. J. Appl.

Microbiol. 100, 862–870. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2672.2005.02850.x

Sinha, N., Balayla, G., 2020. Hydroxychloroquine and covid-19. Postgrad. Med. J.

doi:10.1136/postgradmedj-2020-137785

Stewart, D.J., Napolitano, M.J., Bakhmutova-Albert, E. V, Margerum, D.W., 2008. Kinetics and

mechanisms of chlorine dioxide oxidation of tryptophan. Inorg. Chem. 47, 1639–1647.

doi:10.1021/ic701761p

Toback, F.G., 1992. Regeneration after acute tubular necrosis. Kidney Int. 41, 226–246.

doi:10.1038/ki.1992.32

Tsai, C.-T., Tsai, H.-F., Wang, C.-H., 2016. Detection of infectious bronchitis virus strains similar to

Japan in Taiwan. J. Vet. Med. Sci. 78, 867–871. doi:10.1292/jvms.15-0609

Tsai, C.-T., Wu, H.-Y., Wang, C.-H., 2020. Genetic sequence changes related to the attenuation of

avian infectious bronchitis virus strain TW2575/98. Virus Genes 56, 369–379.

doi:10.1007/s11262-020-01753-5

Veerasarn, V., Khorprasert, C., Lorvidhaya, V., Sangruchi, S., Tantivatana, T., Narkwong, L.,

Kongthanarat, Y., Chitapanarux, I., Tesavibul, C., Panichevaluk, A., Puribhat, S.,

Sangkittipaiboon, S., Sookpreedee, L., Lertsanguansinchai, P., Phromratanapongse, P.,

Rungpoka, P., Trithratipvikul, S., Lojanapiwat, B., Ruangdilokrat, S., Ngampanprasert, P.,

2004. Reduced recurrence of late hemorrhagic radiation cystitis by WF10 therapy in cervical

cancer patients: a multicenter, randomized, two-arm, open-label trial. Radiother. Oncol. J.

Eur. Soc. Ther. Radiol. Oncol. 73, 179–185. doi:10.1016/j.radonc.2004.05.007

Villar, J., Añón, J.M., Ferrando, C., Aguilar, G., Muñoz, T., Ferreres, J., Ambrós, A., Aldecoa, C.,

Suárez-Sipmann, F., Thorpe, K.E., Jüni, P., Slutsky, A.S., Ferrando, C., Mellado-Artigas, R.,

Fernández, J., Hernández, M., Castellá, M., Castro, P., Badia, J.R., Aguilar, G., Carbonell, J.A.,

Badenes, R., Tornero, C., Ferreres, J., Blasco, M.L., Carbonell, N., Serrano, A., Juan, M.,

Gómez-Herreras, J.I., López, M.L., Ambrós, A., Martín, C., Del Campo, R., Puig-Bernabeu, J.,

Ferrer, C., De Andrés, J., Muñoz, T., Serna-Grande, P., Tamayo, G., Martínez-Ruíz, A., Bilbao-

Villasante, I., Villar, J., Fernández, R.L., Calvo, C.P., Vidal, Á., Añón, J.M., Figueira, J.C., Asensio,

M.J., Maseda, E., Suárez-Sipmann, F., Ramasco, F., Varela-Durán, M., Díaz-Parada, P.,

Trenado-Álvarez, J., Fernández, M.M., Aldecoa, C., Rico-Feijoo, J., Fernández, L., Sánchez-

Ballesteros, J., Blanco-Schweizer, P., Martínez, D., Soler, J.A., Slutsky, A.S., Jüni, P., Thorpe,

K.E., Thomas, R., Wysocki, K., De Verno, P., Lakhanpal, G., Juando-Prats, C., 2020. Efficacy of

dexamethasone treatment for patients with the acute respiratory distress syndrome caused

by COVID-19: Study protocol for a randomized controlled superiority trial. Trials.

doi:10.1186/s13063-020-04643-1

Wang, X.-W., Li, J.-S., Jin, M., Zhen, B., Kong, Q.-X., Song, N., Xiao, W.-J., Yin, J., Wei, W., Wang, G.-

J., Si, B.-Y., Guo, B.-Z., Liu, C., Ou, G.-R., Wang, M.-N., Fang, T.-Y., Chao, F.-H., Li, J.-W., 2005.

Study on the resistance of severe acute respiratory syndrome-associated coronavirus. J. Virol.

Methods 126, 171–177. doi:10.1016/j.jviromet.2005.02.005

Wang, Yeming, Zhang, D., Du, G., Du, R., Zhao, J., Jin, Y., Fu, S., Gao, L., Cheng, Z., Lu, Q., Hu, Y.,

Luo, G., Wang, K., Lu, Y., Li, H., Wang, S., Ruan, S., Yang, C., Mei, C., Wang, Yi, Ding, D., Wu, F.,

Tang, X., Ye, X., Ye, Y., Liu, B., Yang, J., Yin, W., Wang, A., Fan, G., Zhou, F., Liu, Z., Gu, X., Xu,

J., Shang, L., Zhang, Y., Cao, L., Guo, T., Wan, Y., Qin, H., Jiang, Y., Jaki, T., Hayden, F.G., Horby,

P.W., Cao, B., Wang, C., 2020. Remdesivir in adults with severe COVID-19: a randomised,

double-blind, placebo-controlled, multicentre trial. Lancet. doi:10.1016/S0140-

6736(20)31022-9

Wickramasinghe, I.N.A., de Vries, R.P., Gröne, A., de Haan, C.A.M., Verheije, M.H., 2011. Binding of

avian coronavirus spike proteins to host factors reflects virus tropism and pathogenicity. J.

Virol. 85, 8903–8912. doi:10.1128/JVI.05112-11

WHO, 2020. Corticosteroids for COVID-19. World Health Organization. WHO/2019-

nCoV/Corticosteroids/2020.1. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-

Corticosteroids-2020.1

Yingsakmongkol, N., 2013. Clinical outcomes of WF10 adjunct to standard treatment of diabetic

foot ulcers. J. Wound Care 22, 130-132,134-136. doi:10.12968/jowc.2013.22.3.130

Yingsakmongkol, N., Maraprygsavan, P., Sukosit, P., 2011. Effect of WF10 (immunokine) on

diabetic foot ulcer therapy: a double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled trial. J. foot ankle

Surg. Off. Publ. Am. Coll. Foot Ankle Surg. 50, 635–640. doi:10.1053/j.jfas.2011.05.006

Zhong, Q., Carratalà, A., Ossola, R., Bachmann, V., Kohn, T., 2017. Cross-Resistance of UV- or

chlorine dioxide-resistant echovirus 11 to other disinfectants. Front. Microbiol. 8, 1928.

doi:10.3389/fmicb.2017.01928

Zhu, Z., Guo, Y., Yu, P., Wang, X., Zhang, X., Dong, W., Liu, X., Guo, C., 2019. Chlorine dioxide

inhibits the replication of porcine reproductive and respiratory syndrome virus by blocking

viral attachment. Infect. Genet. Evol. J. Mol. Epidemiol. Evol. Genet. Infect. Dis. 67, 78–87.

doi:10.1016/j.meegid.2018.11.002

Figures

Figure 1. Virus RNA copy number in the allantoic fluid of the infected embryos per treatment group. Virus

copy number was calculated by the geometric mean of the triplicate Cq value referred to the standard curve

(see methods). Experimental groups D to F contained virus-inoculated embryos (D: Low dose of ClO_2, E: High

dose of ClO_2, F. Viral control). For details on treatments, see Table 1.

Figure 2. Chick embryo mortality during the experiment. Experimental groups A to C contained virus-free

embryos (A: Experimental control, B: Low dose of ClO_2, C: High dose of ClO_2); experimental groups D to F

contained virus-inoculated embryos (D: Low dose of ClO_2, E: High dose of ClO_2, F. Viral control). For details

on treatments, see Table 1.

601   **Figure 3.** Chick embryo development at the end of the experiment (day 17 of incubation). A) mass, B) body

602   axis, C) femur length. Experimental groups A to C contained virus-free embryos (A: Experimental control,

603   B: Low dose of ClO_2, C: High dose of ClO_2); experimental groups D to F contained virus-inoculated embryos

604   (D: Low dose of ClO_2, E: High dose of ClO_2, F. Viral control). For details on treatments, see Table 1.

Figure 4. Histology of selected tissues from 17-day-old chick embryos. In each row, microphotograph pairs

show H&E-stained representative tissues of non-infected (left) and infected embryos (right), A) Bursa of

Fabricio (100X). Infected embryos showed severe lymphoid depletion, with approximately 10% of active

lymphoid tissue and abundant heterophils. B) Bone marrow (400 X). Infected embryos showed an increase

in erythroid cellularity ne, C) Spleen (400 X), Infected embryos showed reticuloendothelial hyperplasia, D)

Duodenum (400 X). Infected embryos showed mild villous atrophy, E) Proventricle (40X). Infected embryos

showed epithelial hyperplasia with desquamation and hyaline material, F) Proventricle (400X). Image

shows the increased length of the proventricular folds and mitotic cells indicative of epithelial

627   regeneration, G) Kidney (400X). Infected embryos showed swelling, cell detritus and protein within the

628   tubules, and basophilic material compatible with urate crystals, H) Liver (400X). Infected embryos showed

629   glucogenic degeneration, I) Trachea (400X). Infected embryos showed hyperplasia and epithelial

630   degeneration. Scale = 50 µm in all panels except for E (scale = 500 µm).

Table 1. Experimental groups used to assess the *in vivo* antiviral effect of high and low concentrations of ClO2 solution in chick embryos. The table shows the number of embryos included in each group. (LD: Low dose, HD: High dose)

Group	N	Treatment
Group A (Experimental control)	5	200 µl of sterile 0.9% saline solution
Group B (ClO$_2$ LD)	5	100 µl of sterile ClO$_2$ solution (30 ppm[1]) and 100 µl of sterile 0.9% saline solution
Group C (ClO$_2$ HD)	5	100 µl of sterile ClO$_2$ solution (300 ppm[2]) and 100 µl of sterile 0.9% saline solution
Group D (Virus + ClO$_2$ LD)	5	100 µl of resuspended avian coronavirus vaccine and 100 µl of sterile ClO$_2$ solution (30 ppm)
Group E (Virus + ClO$_2$ HD)	5	100 µl of resuspended avian coronavirus vaccine and 100 µl of sterile ClO$_2$ solution (300 ppm)
Group F (Viral control)	5	100 µl of resuspended live attenuated avian coronavirus vaccine (Bron Blen® Merial, containing 10^4 of mean embryo infective dose (EID$_{50}$)/mL of coronavirus strains Massachusetts and Connecticut) and 100 µl of sterile 0.9% saline solution

631   [1] This concentration is 10 times below the no-observed-adverse-effect level (NOAEL; 3.5 mg/kg per day)
632   determined for ClO$_2$ (Bercz et al. 1982), considering an embryonic mass of 10 g at the time of inoculation.
633   [2] This concentration is equal to the NOAEL considering an embryonic mass of 10 g at the time of inoculation.

Table 2. Macroscopic abnormalities observed at necropsy in the chick embryos. The table shows the number of embryos in each group that presented each lesion. (LD: Low dose, HD: High dose)

	Dwarfing	Curling	White caseous material	Thickened membranes	Oedema	Epidermal congestion	Pale and enlarged kidneys
Group A (Experimental control)	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5	0/5[f]	0/5
Group B (ClO$_2$ LD)	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5	0/5[f]	0/5
Group C (ClO$_2$ HD)	0/5[f]	0/5[f]	1/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5	2/5	0/5
Group D (Virus + ClO$_2$ LD)	5/5[a]	1/5	1/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5	2/5	5/5[f,a]
Group E (Virus + ClO$_2$ HD)	5/5[a]	0/5[f]	1/5[f]	0/5[f]	0/5	2/5	3/5[a]
Group F (Viral control)	5/5[a]	4/5[a]	4/5[a]	4/5[a]	1/5	5/5[a]	1/5

[a]: Indicates a significant difference to the experimental control

[f]: Indicates a significant difference to the viral control

Table 3. Microscopic abnormalities related to avian coronavirus infection in the chick embryos. (LD: Low dose, HD: High dose)

	A (Exp. control)	B (ClO$_2$ LD)	C (ClO$_2$ HD)	D (Virus + ClO$_2$ LD)	E (Virus + ClO$_2$ HD)	F (Viral control)
Trachea	-	Mild hyperplasia	Mild hyperplasia	Karyorexis, focal hyperplasia	Moderate congestion	Mild hyperplasia
Lung	Mild to moderate congestion	Moderate congestion, interstitial oedema	Mild to moderate congestion, interstitial oedema	Moderate to severe congestion, karyolysis	Mild to moderate congestion, moderate oedema	Mild to moderate congestion, severe to moderate oedema
Proventricle	-	-	-	Moderate hyperplasia	Mild hyperplasia	Moderate hyperplasia, mild congestion
Duodenum	-	-	-	Moderate congestion		Mild diffuse congestion, atrophy of intestinal villi
Liver	-	-	-	Gluogenic degeneration, mild congestion	Gluogenic degeneration, mild congestion	Gluogenic degeneration, moderate congestion, periportal eosinophilic material
Kidneys	-	-	-	Degeneration w/ regeneration, congestion, mild heterophilic infiltration, urates	Degeneration w/ regeneration, congestion, mild heterophilic infiltration, urates	Haemorrhage, multifocal heterophilic infiltration, urates
Spleen	-	-	-	Reticuloendothelial hyperplasia	Reticuloendothelial hyperplasia	Reticuloendothelial hyperplasia
Bursa of Fabricius	Subacute heterophilic bursitis	Subacute heterophilic bursitis	Subacute heterophilic bursitis	Subacute heterophilic bursitis	Subacute heterophilic bursitis	Subacute heterophilic bursitis