Tobramycin adaptation enhances policing of social cheaters in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

Rhea G. Abisado[a], John H. Kimbrough[ac], Brielle M. Mckee[a], Vaughn D. Craddock[a], Nicole E. Smalley[b], Ajai A. Dandekar[b], Josephine R. Chandler[a#]

[a]Department of Molecular Biosciences, University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS 66045,
[b]University of Washington School of Medicine, Seattle, WA 98195

Running title: Tobramycin, social cheating, and policing

[#]To whom correspondence should be addressed:
Josephine R. Chandler
1200 Sunnyside Ave.
Lawrence, KS 66045
Tel. 785-864-5329
Fax 785-864-5294
Email: jrchandler@ku.edu

[c]Current address:
Department of Microbiology and Immunology
University of Iowa
51 Newton Rd
Iowa City, IA 52242

ABSTRACT (200 max)

The *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* LasR-I quorum sensing (QS) system regulates secreted proteases that can be exploited by cheaters, such as QS receptor-defective (*lasR*) mutants. *lasR* mutants emerge in populations growing on casein as a sole source of carbon and energy and increase in the population because they do not incur the substantial cost of engaging in QS. QS also increases resistance to some antibiotics, such as tobramycin. Here, we show that tobramycin suppresses the emergence of *lasR* mutants in casein-passaged populations. We also identify several mutations that accumulate in those populations indicating evidence of antibiotic adaptation. Mutations in one gene, *ptsP,* increase activity of the LasR-I system and production of a QS-controlled phenazine, pyocyanin. We find that mutations in *ptsP* lead to suppression of cheaters independent of tobramycin. Cheater suppression relies on pyocyanin, which acts as a policing toxin by targeting cheaters. These results show that tobramycin suppresses *lasR* mutants through two mechanisms: first, by directly acting on tobramycin-susceptible cheaters and second, by selecting mutations in *ptsP* that lead to pyocyanin-dependent policing. This work demonstrates how adaptive mutations can alter the dynamics of cooperator-cheater relationships, which might be important for populations adapting to antibiotics during infections.

INTRODUCTION

Many Proteobacteria have quorum-sensing (QS) systems that sense and respond to *N*-acyl-homoserine lactones (AHLs) to cause population density-dependent changes in gene expression (1-3). AHL systems involve a LuxR-family signal receptor and a LuxI-family signal synthase (1, 4, 5). LuxR-I systems in many Proteobacteria control production of exoproducts such as proteases and toxins, which can be considered public goods (3, 6, 7). Public goods can be used by any member of the population; however, some population members do not contribute to public good production and are called freeloaders or cheaters (7-9). An example of a cheater is individuals with null mutations in the gene coding for the LuxR-family signal receptor; these mutants do not produce QS-dependent public goods but can still exploit public goods produced by QS cooperators in the population (8-10).

Cheater proliferation presents a serious threat to the stability of cooperating populations. Because public goods are metabolically costly, cheaters can overrun cooperators (8, 9, 11). In conditions where the public goods are required for growth, uncontrolled cheating can lead to population collapse (7, 12-14). Mechanisms must exist to control cheating in order for cooperative phenotypes to be maintained. One such mechanism is policing (15, 16). In bacteria, cooperators police cheaters by linking toxin and toxin-resistance factor production, such as through co-regulation of each of these by QS (16-18). QS can also control cheating through co-regulation of public goods with private goods (13) that benefit only producing cells. Previously, we showed that the soil bacterium *Chromobacterium subtsugae* (formerly *Chromobacterium violaceum*) uses QS to co-regulate a publically available secreted protease with a privately available cell-associated tetracycline-specific efflux pump (10). When *C. subtsugae* is grown on casein as a sole carbon and energy source, QS-dependent protease production can be exploited

by QS-defective cheaters. However, these cheaters are suppressed when tetracycline is included

in the casein medium, because they do not express the efflux pump conferring resistance (10).

This type of cheater suppression likely requires some other selective force ensuring that public

and private goods are maintained under co-regulation (19).

In this study, we sought to determine if antibiotics can restrain the emergence of QS-

defective cheaters in bacteria other than *C. subtsugae.* We were also interested in understanding

how adaptation under antibiotic selection can alter the dynamics of cooperation and cheating.

Previous reports show that AHL QS regulates antibiotic resistance in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*

(20-23). There are two AHL QS systems in *P. aeruginosa,* the LasR-I and RhlR-I systems. These

two systems produce and respond to the signals 3-oxododecanoyl-homoserine lactone (3OC12-

HSL) and butanoyl-homoserine lactone (C4-HSL), respectively (3, 24, 25). The systems are

hierarchical with LasR-I controlling activation of RhlR-I (25, 26). In biofilm conditions,

deletions in LasR were previously shown to cause sensitivity to tobramycin antibiotic in at least

one strain of *P. aeruginosa,* PAO1(20-22).

Here, we show the LasR-I system increases tobramycin resistance in planktonic

conditions in the *P. aeruginosa* strain PA14. We also show that tobramycin can suppress the

emergence of cheaters in cooperating PA14 populations grown on casein, similar to previous

observations with *C. subtsugae* (10). We sequenced the genomes of isolates from tobramycin-

evolved populations. All of the isolates had mutations in or upstream of *ptsP*, a gene coding for

phosphoenolpyruvate-protein phosphotransferase (EI^{Ntr}). This enzyme is the first in a global

regulatory system known as the nitrogen phosphotransferase system (PTS^{Ntr}) (27). Mutations in

ptsP were previously shown to increase LasR-I activity through a mechanism that is not well

understood (28). Interestingly, we observed that *ptsP* mutations suppress cheaters, even in

populations passaged with no antibiotic. We demonstrate the cheater suppression is due to the

QS-controlled toxin pyocyanin, which polices cheaters by selectively blocking their

proliferation. Our results show that genetic adaptation to tobramycin can enhance policing

against social cheaters. These results provide new information on policing mechanisms in *P.*

aeruginosa and demonstrate how antibiotic selection can lead to changes in cooperative activity.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Culture conditions and reagents

Bacteria were routinely grown in Luria-Bertani broth (LB) or LB buffered to pH 7 with 50 mM

3-(morpholino)-propanesulfonic acid (MOPS), or on LB agar (LBA; 1.5% (weight per volume)

Bacto-Agar). Growth media for specific experiments were M9-caseinate (casein broth; 6 g l^{-1}

Na_2HPO_4, 3 g l^{-1} KH_2PO_4, 0.5 g l^{-1} NaCl, 1 g l^{-1} NH_4Cl; pH 7.4, 1% sodium caseinate); MOPS

minimal medium (25 mM D-glucose, freshly prepared 5 µM $FeSO_4$, 15 mM NH_4Cl, and 2 mM

K_2HPO_4 added to a 1X MOPS base buffer consisting of 50 mM MOPS, 4 mM tricine, 50 mM

NaCl, 1 mM K_2SO_4, 50 µM $MgCl_2$, 10 µM $CaCl_2$, 0.3 µM $(NH_4)_6Mo_7O_{24}$, 40 µM H_3BO_3, 3 µM

$Co(OAc)_2$, 1 µM $CuSO_4$, 8 µM $MnSO_4$, and 1 µM $ZnSO_4$) (29); a modified M9-casamino acid

broth (200 ml l^{-1} 10X M9, 0.6 g l^{-1} thiamine hydrochloride, 1 ml l^{-1} 1 M $MgSO_4$, 1 ml l^{-1} 0.2 M

$CaCl_2$, 10 g l^{-1} casamino acid; freshly prepared; filter sterilized), Pyocyanin Producing Media

(PPM) (30), and 4% skim milk agar (SMA) (9). All *P. aeruginosa* broth cultures were grown at

37^oC with shaking at 250 rpm, 18 mm test tubes (for 2 ml cultures), 125 ml baffled flasks (10 ml

cultures), or 250 ml baffled flasks (60 ml cultures), unless otherwise specified. For *E. coli*, 100

µg ml^{-1} carbenicillin, 15 µg ml^{-1} gentamicin, and 10 µg ml^{-1} tetracycline were used. For *P.*

aeruginosa, 300 µg ml^{-1} carbenicillin, 50–200 µg ml^{-1} gentamicin, and 200 µg ml^{-1} tetracycline

were used. AHLs were purchased from Cayman Chemicals (MI, USA) and handled as described

elsewhere (10). Genomic or plasmid DNA was extracted using Qiagen Puregene Core A kit

(Hilden, Germany) or IBI Scientific plasmid purification mini-prep kit (IA, USA) while PCR

products were purified using IBI Scientific PCR clean-up/gel extraction kits, according to the

manufacturer's protocol. All antibiotics were purchased from GoldBio (MO, USA) except for

tetracycline which is from Fisher Scientific (PA, USA). Pyocyanin and DMSO (solvent for

pyocyanin) were purchased from Sigma Aldrich (MO, USA) and Acros Organics (WI, USA),

respectively.

Bacterial strains and strain construction

All bacterial strains, plasmids, and primers used in this study are listed in Tables S1–S3. *P.*

aeruginosa strain UCBPP-PA14 ('PA14') and PA14 derivatives were used for these studies.

Markerless deletions in specific loci of *P. aeruginosa* PA14 were generated using allelic

exchange as described previously (31). To generate plasmids for allelic exchange, DNA

fragments with the mutated or deleted gene allele plus 500 bp flanking DNA were generated by

PCR using primer-incorporated restriction enzyme sites. The PCR product was digested and

ligated to pEXG2 (*fusA1* G1634A) or pEX18Ap (Δ*lasR* and Δ*rhlR*) and transformed into the

appropriate *P. aeruginosa* strain. The plasmids for Δ*lasI* and Δ*ptsP* were described elsewhere

(27, 32). Merodiploids were selected on Pseudomonas Isolation Agar (PIA)-carbenicillin (300 μg

ml^{-1}) for Δ*lasR* and Δ*rhlR*, PIA-gentamicin (200 μg ml^{-1}) for Δ*lasI* and Δ*ptsP*, and LBA-

gentamicin (50 μg ml^{-1}) for *fusA1* G1634A. Deletion mutants were counterselected using NaCl

free-15% sucrose. Putative mutants were verified through antibiotic sensitivity tests and gene-

targeted Sanger sequencing. Plasmid transformations were described previously (27, 33-35).

Complementation strains were constructed by integration of the mini□CTX□1 vector at the

neutral chromosomal *attB* locus (27, 34).

Evolution experiments

To prepare the inoculum for evolution experiments, overnight (18 h) pure cultures were grown in

LB-MOPS, diluted 1:50 into 2 ml LB-MOPS, and grown to an OD_{600} of ~3.5. To start the

experiment, 50 µl from this starter culture was transferred to 2 ml fresh casein broth in an 18 mm

tube. At 24 h intervals, cultures were diluted 1:50 into fresh casein broth in a new tube.

Tobramycin was added every other day where indicated, similar to previous experiments with *C.*

subtsugae (10). CFU ml^{-1} for each lineage was determined by viable plate counts every 96 h. The

% *lasR* mutant cheater (*lasR* cheater) was determined by patching 100 colonies, unless otherwise

specified, on SMA. Sixteen *lasR* mutants were sequence-verified by Sanger sequencing (Table

S4).

Antimicrobial susceptibility assay

Tobramycin susceptibility was determined by MIC according to the 2020 guidelines of the

Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CSLI), using a modified dilution method. Briefly,

tobramycin was added to MOPS minimal medium and successively diluted 2-fold in a 200 µl

volume in 2 ml tubes. For each experiment, two dilution series were staggered by starting them

at different tobramycin concentrations to cover a broader range of concentrations. *P. aeruginosa*

inocula were from LB-grown stationary-phase cells (OD_{600} of 3.2–4), being careful to ensure that

all cultures in each experiment were grown to an identical cell density. The cultures were diluted

1:40 into each tube containing tobramycin, and the tubes were incubated with shaking for 20 h.

After incubation, turbidity was measured using a BioTek Synergy 2 plate reader. The MIC was

defined as the lowest concentration of tobramycin (µg ml^{-1}) in which bacterial growth was not

measurable. In some cases, CFU ml^{-1} was also determined by viable plate counts.

172   To determine susceptibility to *P. aeruginosa* culture fluid, we prepared culture fluid by

inoculating overnight cultures to an optical density at 600 nm (OD$_{600}$) of 0.1 into 60 ml casein

broth, grew these cultures for 20 h, then passed cultures through a 0.22 µm filter to remove cells.

The filtered fluid was mixed with 100 µl M9-casamino acid broth to a final volume of 2 ml and

this was inoculated at an initial OD$_{600}$ of 0.001 with either wild type, Δ*lasR*, Δ*ptsP*, or Δ*ptsP*

Δ*lasR* from logarithmic-stage LB-MOPS cultures at an OD$_{600}$ 0.2–0.6. The M9-casamino-filtrate

mixture was incubated for 24 h and the initial and final population counts (CFU ml^{-1}) were

enumerated by colony counting on plates.

Whole genome sequencing

A sequencing library with 350-bp inserts (strain T2) or 200-bp inserts (all other strains) was

constructed. Sequencing was performed using Illumina Platform PE150, Q30≥80% (for strain

T2) or Illumina MiSeq v3 paired end100 bp sequencing (MSv3-PE100) with ~25X coverage (all

other strains). The raw reads were aligned to the *P. aeruginosa* UCBPP-PA14 reference genome

(GenBank: CP000438.1) using Strand NGS (Bangalore, India) software v 3.1.1, using a pipeline

described previously (36). Mutations of interest were verified by gene-targeted Sanger

sequencing.

Measurements of LasR activity and pyocyanin production. To measure LasR activity, we

first introduced the LasR-responsive plasmid pBS351 to *P. aeruginosa* mutants or wild-type

PA14 strains by electroporation (35). Electrocompetent cells were prepared from overnight

cultures using 300 mM sucrose (37). Transformants were selected on LB agar using gentamicin

at 50–200 µg ml^{-1} and routinely grown with gentamicin (50 µg ml^{-1} for agar and 15 µg ml^{-1} for

broth) for plasmid maintenance. Transformants were grown in LB-MOPS with 15 μg ml^{-1}

gentamicin for 18 h, washed with phosphate buffered saline (PBS), and fluorescence was

measured using a BioTek Synergy 2 plate reader. For pyocyanin measurements, we extracted

pyocyanin as described previously (38-40). Briefly, cells were grown for 18 h in Pyocyanin-

producing media (30), and 5 ml whole culture was extracted with 2 ml chloroform. The organic

layer was separated and extracted a second time with 0.2 N HCl. The absorbance of the aqueous

layer was measured at 520 nm and multiplied by 17.072 to calculate the pyocyanin concentration

(μg ml^{-1}) (39). LasR activity and pyocyanin measurements were normalized to culture density

(optical density at 600 nm) for reporting data.

Coculture assays

Coculture experiments were conducted in 2 ml casein broth in 18 mm test tubes. To prepare the

inoculum, overnight (18 h) pure cultures were grown in LB-MOPS, diluted to an optical density

at 600 nm (OD$_{600}$) of 0.025 for cheaters or 0.05 for cooperators into LB-MOPS, and grown to an

OD$_{600}$ of ~3.5 before combining at a 99:1 (cooperator:cheater) ratio. This mixture was then

diluted 1:40 into casein broth to start the coculture. Cocultures were diluted 1:40 into fresh

casein broth in a new tube every 24 h until the end of the experiment at 72 h. The initial and final

total population counts (CFU ml^{-1}) were determined by viable plate counts. The % *lasR* cheater

was determined by patching 200 colonies on SMA.

RESULTS

LasR promotes tobramycin resistance in *P. aeruginosa* PA14 planktonic cultures.

As an initial test that LasR contributes to tobramycin resistance in planktonic conditions,

we determined the minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) of tobramycin against the

laboratory strain PA14 or PA14 with a deletion of *lasR* or *lasI*. To increase the MIC detection

sensitivity, we generated two tobramycin dilution series that were staggered by using two

different starting concentrations (41). We observed a small but reproducible 1.7-fold decrease in

the Δ*lasR* mutant MIC relative to PA14 (Fig. 1A). The difference was observed when

tobramycin was used to treat cultures grown to an optical density at 600 nm of 4 (OD_{600} 4), but

not cultures at lower cell densities (Fig. S1). After 24 h treatment with 1.1 µg ml^{-1} tobramycin,

about 200-fold fewer Δ*lasR* mutant cells were recovered than wild type (Fig. 1B). We also

observed a decrease in the MIC of the Δ*lasI* mutant similar to that of the Δ*lasR* mutant (Fig. 1A).

We could restore resistance to the Δ*lasI* mutant by adding synthetic 3OC12-HSL (Fig. 1A).

There was no significant difference between the wild type and the Δ*rhlR* mutant, supporting the

hypothesis that the RhlR system is not important for the resistance phenotype. Further, the MIC

of the Δ*lasR, *Δ*rhlR* double mutant was similar to that of the Δ*lasR* single mutant. Together,

these results show that the LasR-I system, but not the RhlR-I system, contributes to tobramycin

resistance in planktonically-grown *P. aeruginosa* strain PA14.

Tobramycin suppresses cheating in *P. aeruginosa*

P. aeruginosa requires a QS-controlled protease to grow in minimal medium with casein

as the sole source of carbon and energy, which can be exploited by *lasR*-mutated cheaters that

emerge in populations repeatedly passaged under these conditions (8, 9). We hypothesized that

tobramycin might suppress *lasR* mutants in cooperating *P. aeruginosa* populations passaged on

casein. To test this hypothesis, we assessed the frequency of *lasR* mutants in *P. aeruginosa*

populations in casein broth or in broth with 0.6 µg ml^{-1} tobramycin, a concentration determined

to be sub-MIC in these conditions. We distinguished *lasR* mutants by colony phenotypes (42,

43), which was confirmed in a subset of mutants by sequencing the *lasR* gene (Table S3). In

populations with no antibiotic, *lasR* mutants emerged between 5–8 days and increased to >99%

of the population (Fig. 2). None of our populations showed evidence of a collapse, as has been

reported in similar experiments with PAO1 (9, 13, 16). In the populations with tobramycin, *lasR*

mutant frequencies remained low or below the detection level throughout the experiment (Fig.

2). These results show that tobramycin can suppress the emergence of LasR-mutated cheaters in

casein-grown *P. aeruginosa* populations.

Variants from tobramycin-treated populations undergo genetic adaptation

246   To assess how antibiotic adaptation influences cheater emergence and suppression, we

carried out a second experiment using higher tobramycin concentrations for stronger selection.

We used an initial concentration of 0.6 μg ml^{-1} tobramycin and increased the concentration by

50% every 4 days to reach a final concentration of 7.1 μg ml^{-1}. In three independent cultures, the

lasR mutant population remained at less than 5% of the total population (Fig. 2). We did not

observe any significant growth inhibition at any stage of the experiment, even at the highest

tobramycin concentration (Fig. S2), suggesting genetic adaptation occurred during passage. To

test this hypothesis, we determined the MIC of one isolated variant from each of the passaged

populations (variants T1, T2, and T3 from populations passaged with 0.6–7.1 μg ml^{-1} tobramycin

and variants T4, T5, and T6 from populations passaged with 0.6 μg ml^{-1} tobramycin). All six

variants showed a higher tobramycin MIC than the ancestor strain (Fig. S3A) or variants from

identically treated populations with no added antibiotic (clones N1–N3, Fig. S3B).

258   To identify the mutations that accumulated in tobramycin-evolved variants, we

sequenced the genomes of our six tobramycin-evolved variants. For comparison, we also

sequenced the parent PA14 strain and clone N2 described above, an isolate from a population

passaged with no antibiotic. We identified 3–6 mutations in each of the tobramycin-evolved

variants that were not in either the parent PA14 or isolate N2 (Table 1 and S5). Most of the

tobramycin-evolved variants had mutations in two genes: *ptsP,* which codes for

phosphoenolpyruvate protein phosphotransferase and *fusA1*, which codes for translation

elongation factor EF-G1A and is considered essential (44). To verify the role of *ptsP* and *fusA1*

mutations in tobramycin resistance, we introduced mutations of each to the PA14 genome. We

used Δ*ptsP* or the *fusA1* G1643A mutation from isolate T5, because *fusA1* deletions are thought

to be nonviable (44). We also constructed a Δ*ptsP, fusA1* G1634A double mutant. We compared

the MIC of the mutated strains with that of the PA14 parent (Fig. S3C and S3D). Each of the

individual mutations increased PA14 resistance by about 2-fold and combining mutations

increased the MIC by about 3-fold (Fig S3E).

ptsP-mutated strains have enhanced LasR activity and pyocyanin production.

We focused our attention on the *ptsP* mutation because disrupting *ptsP* was previously

shown to increase LasR activity (28), and we were interested in understanding how these effects

could alter the cooperator-cheating dynamic. First, we tested the hypothesis that the LasR-LasI

system is elevated at least in the T1, T2 and T3 mutants. To do so, we used a P*lasI-gfp* plasmid

reporter (35), in which the *gfp* reporter gene is fused to the LasR-responsive *lasI* promoter. This

reporter showed ~2–3-fold higher fluorescence in the Δ*ptsP* mutant than that of the wild-type

PA14 strain (Fig. S4A), similar to previous results (28). The T1, T2 and T3 variants carrying this

reporter also showed ~3-fold higher fluorescence than that of PA14. The elevated fluorescence

levels in these variants could be restored to wild-type levels by introducing *ptsP* to the neutral

attB site in the genome (Fig. 3A). The reporter activities of isolates N1, N2, and N3 were similar

to that of PA14 (Fig. S4B). The difference in reporter activity in the PA14 $\Delta ptsP$ mutant or the

T1–T3 strains could not be explained by differences in growth (Table S6).

Disruptions in *ptsP* were previously shown to increase pyocyanin production by about 3-

fold (28). To test whether pyocyanin production was similarly elevated in our tobramycin-

evolved variants, we compared pyocyanin produced by the T1, T2, and T3 variants with that of

PA14. Our results showed the variants have ~3-fold higher pyocyanin production than the PA14

parent, and that pyocyanin production can be reduced to wild-type levels in the variants by

introducing *ptsP* to the *attB* site in the genome (Fig. 3B). This increase was not observed in

isolates N1–N3 (Fig. S4C). Thus, *ptsP* mutations also increase pyocyanin production in strains

passaged with tobramycin.

lasR-mutant cheaters are suppressed in _ptsP_ mutant populations.

Because *ptsP* mutations alter QS regulation, we predicted that these mutations might

influence cheating dynamics even in the absence of tobramycin. Specifically, we predicted *lasR*

mutant cheaters might emerge at a faster rate in *ptsP* mutant populations due to the metabolic

burden associated with the higher LasR activity. To test this hypothesis, we passaged the T1, T2,

and T3 variants in casein broth for 32 days in the absence of antibiotic and monitored the

emergence of *lasR*-mutant cheaters (Fig. 4A and S5). Surprisingly, cheaters emerged later in

these populations compared with that of the PA14 ancestor (23 to >32 days for T1–T3 vs. 6–8

days for PA14). For T2, cheaters were never observed even by 32 days. Further, the total cheater

frequency in the T1 and T3 populations did not reach the same levels as that of PA14 (33–67%

for T1 and T3 vs. >98% for PA14) (Fig. S5A). There were no differences in cheating observed

with variants N1–N3 passaged with no tobramycin, compared with PA14 (Fig. S5C). The total

cell density remained similar for all evolution experiments, suggesting the differences in

cheating were not due to differences in total population of the experiments (Fig. S5B, S5D).

We hypothesized that the difference in cheating observed with the tobramycin-evolved

variants was due to the disrupted *ptsP* gene in these strains. To test this hypothesis, we tested

cheating in a Δ*ptsP* mutant. We passaged the Δ*ptsP* mutant carrying either CTX-1 or the CTX-1-

ptsP cassette in 1% casein broth for 32 days and monitored cheater frequency over time. We also

monitored cheating in PA14 and PA14 CTX-1. We observed no differences in cheating of PA14

CTX-1 compared with PA14, verifying that the CTX-1 cassette had no effect on cheating.

However, cheaters emerged later and reached lower levels overall in the Δ*ptsP*-CTX-1

populations compared with either PA14 strain (Fig. 4B, S5E). Cheating was indistinguishable

from PA14 in the Δ*ptsP*-CTX-1-*ptsP* populations (Fig. 4B, S5E). There were no notable

differences in total growth of any of these populations (Fig. S5F). Together, our results show that

ptsP mutations cause delayed cheating and reduced cheater loads.

Pyocyanin produced by Δ*ptsP* mutants is active against *lasR*-mutated cheaters

A potential explanation for delayed cheating in the Δ*ptsP* mutant populations is that the

Δ*ptsP* mutant has a growth advantage compared with the PA14 ancestral strain. However, PA14

and Δ*ptsP* showed identical growth rates (Table S6), suggesting there is another explanation. We

hypothesized that the Δ*ptsP* mutant produces a toxin that inhibits growth of *lasR* mutant

cheaters. To test this hypothesis, we filtered culture fluid from a Δ*ptsP* mutant and tested its

ability to inhibit growth of logarithmically growing PA14 or PA14 with deletions of *ptsP*, *lasR,*

or both *ptsP* and *lasR*. We performed identical treatments with filtered fluid from PA14 or with

unspent culture media (untreated control) and enumerated cell growth after 24 h. Treatment with

PA14 culture fluid had no effects on growth and was similar to the untreated control (Fig. 5).

However, treatment with the Δ*ptsP* mutant filtrate reduced growth of the Δ*lasR* mutant by 83-

fold and Δ*ptsP* Δ*lasR* mutants by 13,000-fold, compared with no treatment. Thus, the Δ*ptsP*

mutant secretes a substance that is growth inhibitive to *lasR*-mutated strains and particularly to

Δ*ptsP* Δ*lasR* mutants.

We hypothesized that the activity in the Δ*ptsP* mutant culture fluid was due to pyocyanin,

based on our result that *ptsP* mutations increase pyocyanin production (Fig. 3). Pyocyanin is

produced from the *phzA1-G1* (*phz1*) and *phzA2-G*2 (*phz2*) gene clusters and the *phzM* and *phzS*

genes (Fig. 6A) (45, 46). Several of the pyocyanin intermediates are toxic, such as 5-

methylphenazine 1-carboxylic acid (5-Me-PCA) (47-49) . We tested several gene mutations in

this pathway to determine whether any of the products have activity against *lasR* mutants. We

deleted *phzM,* which is needed to convert the precursor phenazine-1-carboxylic acid (PCA) to 5-

Me-PCA, *phzS* which is needed to convert 5-Me-PCA to pyocyanin (45, 50), and *phzH* which is

not needed for pyocyanin production but involved in production of another product of this

pathway, phenazine-1-carboxamide (PCN) (45).

We initially tested whether pyocyanin biosynthesis contributes to the antimicrobial

activity of a *ptsP* mutant by making a Δ*ptsP* Δ*phz1* Δ*phz2* triple mutant. We compared

antimicrobial activity in culture fluid of this strain with that of the single Δ*ptsP* mutant, and

tested against the Δ*ptsP,* Δ*lasR* mutant. Deleting both *phz1* and *phz2* abolished the antimicrobial

activity observed with the Δ*ptsP* single mutant (Fig. 6B). Mutations in *phzM* or *phzS* similarly

abolished this activity (Fig. 6B). However, no effects were observed by deleting *phzH* (Fig. 6B),

which is important for production of the pyocyanin bi-product PCN but not pyocyanin itself.

These results support that the antimicrobial activity in Δ*ptsP* mutant culture fluid is due to

pyocyanin. We also tested whether commercially supplied pyocyanin could restore antimicrobial

activity of the $\Delta ptsP$ $\Delta phzS$ mutant by adding 10 µg ml^{-1} pyocyanin to $\Delta ptsP$ $\Delta phzS$ culture

filtrates prior to treating $\Delta ptsP$ $\Delta lasR$ cells. Adding pyocyanin reduced $\Delta ptsP,$ $\Delta lasR$ mutant

growth ~10^7-fold, whereas PA14 growth was only reduced by ~10-fold (Fig. 6C). Together,

these results support the conclusion that pyocyanin can selectively limit growth of $\Delta ptsP,$ $\Delta lasR$

mutants.

Pyocyanin production leads to enhanced policing by $\Delta ptsP$ mutants.

We also tested the role of pyocyanin in policing cheaters using competition experiments.

We mixed the $\Delta lasR$ mutant with a cooperator starting at a 1:99 (cheater:cooperator) ratio in 1%

casein media and transferred the population daily for 3 days. The results are shown in Fig. 6D. In

cocultures with PA14 as the cooperator, $\Delta lasR$ mutants increased from 1% to a final frequency

of 56%. However, the $\Delta lasR$ mutants increased to only 16% final frequency in identical

competition experiments with the $\Delta ptsP$ mutant, which is consistent with limited cheater

proliferation observed with this strain (Fig. 4B). Deleting *phzM* in PA14 did not alter the

outcome of the $\Delta lasR$ mutant frequency; however, when *phzM* was deleted in the $\Delta ptsP$ mutant

cooperator, cheaters increased to a final frequency of 88%. Altogether, our results support that

the cheater restriction observed in the $\Delta ptsP$ mutant is dependent on pyocyanin.

DISCUSSION

This study adds to the evidence that quorum sensing contributes to antibiotic resistance in

Proteobacteria. Results from these studies show that *P. aeruginosa* LasR increases tobramycin

resistance in planktonic PA14 cultures. The results also show that tobramycin can limit the

proliferation of *lasR* mutant cheaters in cooperating populations grown on casein. Cheaters are

suppressed directly by tobramycin because they are more susceptible to growth-inhibiting

effects. Cheaters are also suppressed, indirectly, by tetraycline-selected adaptive mutations that

lead to pyocyanin-dependent policing. Together, these results support the idea that antibiotics

influence quorum sensing stability directly and indirectly through adaptive changes in the

population.

These results also provide an example of how adaptive mutations can alter cheater

control mechanisms. Adaptive mutations have been shown to influence cooperation and cheating

in other studies (51-53). For example, adaptive mutations can improve the ability of cooperators

to outcompete cheaters (19, 52) or cause re-wiring of cooperative traits and allow the cheaters to

cooperate again (51). In this study, once adaptive mutations emerge in the population they

caused suppression of cheaters through policing. Thus, antibiotic exposure stabilized cooperation

through heritable changes that led to policing. These antibiotic-selected effects on cheating could

have important implications for understanding the long-term consequences of antibiotic usage

for treating infections.

In our study, cheater suppression was caused by increased production of the toxin

pyocyanin. Pyocyanin was previously shown to be involved in policing *lasR* mutant cheaters (17,

54). Pyocyanin leads to the generation of highly toxic hydroxyl radicals (55-57), which can cause

oxidative stress and cell death (58, 59). LasR mutant cheaters fail to upregulate enzymes

involved in relieving oxidative stress such as catalase and superoxide dismutase (SOD) (17, 56,

58, 60), which explains why these mutants might be more sensitive to pyocyanin than the wild

type (60, 61). However, these detoxifying enzymes can benefit both producing and non-

producing members of the population (19), which may explain how *lasR* cheaters were still able

to increase in frequency when cocultured with the cooperator, despite the policing effect of

pyocyanin (Fig. 6). It will be interesting to determine whether pyocyanin production could have

similar effects on stabilizing quorum sensing in natural communities, such as infections.

Pyocyanin production was increased due to mutations in *ptsP*. PtsP, along with two other

enzymes PtsN and PtsO, make up a poorly understood system called the nitrogen

phosphotransferase system (PTS^Ntr). In *Escherichia coli,* PTS^Ntr is involved in regulating diverse

physiological changes in response to nitrogen starvation (62, 63). It is unclear if PTS^Ntr plays a

similar role in *P. aeruginosa.* In *P. aeruginosa,* PtsP contributes to pathogenesis (64), biofilm

formation (27), and quorum sensing regulation (28). Mutations in *ptsP* have also been shown to

contribute to tobramycin resistance (65, 66), consistent with our results. The specific effects of

PtsP on pathogenesis, biofilm formation, and tobramycin resistance are as-yet unknown. In the

case of quorum sensing, it is thought that PtsP somehow represses LasR through the antiactivator

QscR (28), although it is not clear if PtsP acts entirely through QscR or modifies quorum sensing

through other pathways. The important effects of mutating PtsP on *P. aeruginosa* virulence and

virulence-associated behaviors suggest PtsP and the PTS^Ntr system might have potential as a new

target for therapeutic development.

Our results also show that quorum sensing has a small but appreciable contribution to

antibiotic resistance in *P. aeruginosa* strain PA14 under planktonic conditions (Fig. 1). Similar

results have been reported for other strains and species, for example in *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 in

biofilms (20-23), and *C. subtsugae* (10). In *C. subtsugae,* resistance is attributed to an efflux

pump, CdeAB-OprA, which is transcriptionally activated by the CviR quorum-sensing receptor

in response to the cognate quorum-sensing signal *N*-hexanoyl-homoserine lactone (10, 41). In *P.*

aeruginosa, there may be multiple factors contributing to antibiotic resistance. There are at least

three efflux pumps known to have overlapping specificity for aminoglycosides; MexAB (67, 68),

MexXY (69, 70), and PA1874-1877 (71); there are also aminoglycoside-inactivating enzymes

(67). Quorum-control of antibiotic resistance may provide an important evolutionary benefit. For

example, quorum sensing may increase resistance to protect against self-produced toxins, or

synchronize resistance factor expression across members of the population (72) to protect

neighboring cells from exported antibiotic (73). Understanding how and why quorum sensing

contributes to antibiotic resistance will provide important new information about the biology of

quorum sensing and will be relevant to designing new therapies that function by blocking

quorum-sensing systems.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported by the NIH through grant R35GM133572, CMADP COBRE (P20

GM103638), and K-INBRE (P20 GM103418) and by Inez Jay Fund to J.R.C. as well as grant

GM125714 to A.A.D. J.H.K. was supported by an NIH postdoctoral fellowship (T32 AI007343).

V.D.C. was supported by an Undergraduate Research Award from the KU Center for

Undergraduate Research and a K-INBRE fellowship (P20 GM103418). R.G.A. was supported by

the Fulbright Foreign Student Program (15160174). The authors would also like to acknowledge

Matthew Parsek and Dingding An (University of Washington), Matthew Cabeen (Oklahoma

State University) and Lars Dietrich (Columbia University) for providing *P. aeruginosa* strains

and plasmids, as well as Tony Ma, Matthew Johnson, and Bryan Murphy for their technical

support.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

1.   Fuqua WC, Winans SC, Greenberg EP. Quorum sensing in bacteria: the LuxR-LuxI
family of cell density-responsive transcriptional regulators. *Journal of Bacteriology*.
1994;176(2):269-75.

2.   Papenfort K, Bassler BL. Quorum sensing signal-response systems in gram-negative
bacteria. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*. 2016;14(9):576-88.

3.   Schuster M, Sexton DJ, Diggle SP, Greenberg EP. Acyl-homoserine lactone quorum
sensing: From evolution to application. *Annual Review of Microbiology*. 2013;67(1):43-63.

4.   Fuqua C, Greenberg EP. Listening in on bacteria: acyl-homoserine lactone signalling.
Nature Reviews Molecular Cell Biology. 2002;3(9):685-95.

5.   Fuqua C, Winans SC, Greenberg EP. Census and consensus in bacterial ecosystems: The
LuxR-LuxI family of quorum-sensing transcriptional regulators. *Annual Review of Microbiology*.
1996;50(1):727-51.

6.   Whiteley M, Diggle SP, Greenberg EP. Progress in and promise of bacterial quorum
sensing research. *Nature*. 2017;551:313-20.

7.   West SA, Griffin AS, Gardner A, Diggle SP. Social evolution theory for microorganisms.
Nature Reviews Microbiology. 2006;4:597.

8.   Diggle SP, Griffin AS, Campbell GS, West SA. Cooperation and conflict in quorum-
sensing bacterial populations. *Nature*. 2007;450:411.

9.   Sandoz KM, Mitzimberg SM, Schuster M. Social cheating in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*
quorum sensing. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. 2007;104(40):15876-81.

10.   Evans KC, Benomar S, Camuy-Vélez LA, Nasseri EB, Wang X, Neuenswander B, et al.
Quorum-sensing control of antibiotic resistance stabilizes cooperation in *Chromobacterium*
violaceum. *The ISME Journal*. 2018;12(5):1263-72.

11.   West SA, Diggle SP, Buckling A, Gardner A, Griffin AS. The social lives of microbes.
Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics. 2007;38(1):53-77.

12.   Hardin G. The tragedy of the commons. *Science*. 1968;162(3859):1243.

13.   Dandekar AA, Chugani S, Greenberg EP. Bacterial quorum sensing and metabolic
incentives to cooperate. *Science* 2012;338(6104):264-6.

14.   Rainey PB, Rainey K. Evolution of cooperation and conflict in experimental bacterial
populations. *Nature*. 2003;425(6953):72-4.

15.   Clutton-Brock   TH,   Parker   GA.   Punishment   in   animal   societies.   Nature.
1995;373(6511):209-16.

16.   Wang M, Schaefer AL, Dandekar AA, Greenberg EP. Quorum sensing and policing of
Pseudomonas aeruginosa social cheaters. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of*
the United States of America. 2015;112(7):2187-91.

17.   Castañeda-Tamez P, Ramírez-Peris J, Pérez-Velázquez J, Kuttler C, Jalalimanesh A,
Saucedo-Mora MÁ, et al. Pyocyanin restricts social cheating in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*.
Frontiers in Microbiology. 2018;9:1348-.

18.   Yan H, Asfahl KL, Li N, Sun F, Xiao J, Shen D, et al. Conditional quorum-sensing
induction of a cyanide-insensitive terminal oxidase stabilizes cooperating populations of
Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Nat Commun. 2019;10(1):4999.

19.   Schuster M, Sexton DJ, Hense BA. Why quorum sensing controls private goods.
Frontiers in Microbiology. 2017;8(885).

20.   Bjarnsholt T, Jensen PO, Burmolle M, Hentzer M, Haagensen JA, Hougen HP, et al.
Pseudomonas aeruginosa tolerance to tobramycin, hydrogen peroxide and polymorphonuclear
leukocytes is quorum-sensing dependent. Microbiology. 2005;151(Pt 2):373-83.

21.   Popat R, Crusz SA, Messina M, Williams P, West SA, Diggle SP. Quorum-sensing and
cheating in bacterial biofilms. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*.
2012;279(1748):4765-71.

22.   Rasmussen TB, Skindersoe ME, Bjarnsholt T, Phipps RK, Christensen KB, Jensen PO, et al. Identity and effects of quorum-sensing inhibitors produced by *Penicillium* species. *Microbiology*. 2005;151:1325-40.

23.   Shih P-C, Huang C-T. Effects of quorum-sensing deficiency on *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilm formation and antibiotic resistance. *Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy*. 2002;49(2):309-14.

24.   Pearson JP, Passador L, Iglewski BH, Greenberg EP. A second N-acylhomoserine lactone signal produced by *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*. 1995;92(5):1490-4.

25.   Pesci EC, Pearson JP, Seed PC, Iglewski BH. Regulation of *las* and *rhl* quorum sensing in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Journal of Bacteriology*. 1997;179(10):3127-32.

26.   Lee J, Zhang L. The hierarchy quorum sensing network in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Protein & Cell*. 2015;6(1):26-41.

27.   Cabeen MT, Leiman SA, Losick R. Colony-morphology screening uncovers a role for the *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* nitrogen-related phosphotransferase system in biofilm formation. *Molecular Microbiology*. 2016;99(3):557-70.

28.   Xu H, Lin W, Xia H, Xu S, Li Y, Yao H, et al. Influence of *ptsP* gene on pyocyanin production in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *FEMS Microbiol Lett*. 2005;253(1):103-9.

29.   Welsh MA, Blackwell HE. Chemical genetics reveals environment-specific roles for quorum sensing circuits in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Cell Chem Biol*. 2016;23(3):361-9.

30.   Wentworth BB. *Diagnostic procedures for bacterial infections*. Washington, DC: American Public Health Association; 1987.

31.   Hmelo LR, Borlee BR, Almblad H, Love ME, Randall TE, Tseng BS, et al. Precision-engineering the *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* genome with two-step allelic exchange. *Nature Protocols*. 2015;10:1820-41.

32.   Chugani S, Kim BS, Phattarasukol S, Brittnacher MJ, Choi SH, Harwood CS, et al. Strain-dependent diversity in the *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* quorum-sensing regulon. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2012;109(41):E2823-E31.

33.   Choi K-H, Schweizer HP. mini-Tn7 insertion in bacteria with single attTn7 sites:
example *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Nature Protocols*. 2006;1(1):153-61.

34.   Hoang TT, Kutchma AJ, Becher A, Schweizer HP. Integration-proficient plasmids for
Pseudomonas aeruginosa: Site-specific integration and use for engineering of reporter and
expression strains. *Plasmid*. 2000;43(1):59-72.

35.   Feltner JB, Wolter DJ, Pope CE, Groleau M-C, Smalley NE, Greenberg EP, et al. LasR
variant cystic fibrosis isolates reveal an adaptable quorum-sensing hierarchy in *Pseudomonas*
aeruginosa. *mBio*. 2016;7(5):1-9.

36.   Toussaint JP, Farrell-Sherman A, Feldman TP, Smalley NE, Schaefer AL, Greenberg EP,
et al. Gene duplication in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* improves growth on adenosine. Journal of
bacteriology. 2017.

37.   Choi KH, Kumar A, Schweizer HP. A 10-min method for preparation of highly
electrocompetent *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* cells: application for DNA fragment transfer
between chromosomes and plasmid transformation. Journal of microbiological methods.
2006;64(3):391-7.

38.   Kurachi M. Studies on the Biosynthesis of Pyocyanine. (II) : Isolation and Determination
of Pyocyanine. *Bulletin of the Institute for Chemical Research, Kyoto University*. 1958;36:174-
87.

39.   Essar DW, Eberly L, Hadero A, Crawford IP. Identification and characterization of genes
for a second anthranilate synthase in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*: interchangeability of the two
anthranilate synthases and evolutionary implications. *Journal of Bacteriology*. 1990;172(2):884-
900.

40.   Ding F, Oinuma K-I, Smalley NE, Schaefer AL, Hamwy O, Greenberg EP, et al. The
Pseudomonas aeruginosa orphan quorum sensing signal receptor QscR regulates global quorum
sensing gene expression by activating a single linked operon. *mBio*. 2018;9(4):e01274-18.

41.   Benomar S, Evans KC, Unckless RL, Chandler JR. Efflux pumps in *Chromobacterium*
species increase antibiotic resistance and promote survival in a co-culture competition model.
Applied and environmental microbiology. 2019;85(19):e00908-19.

42.   Hoffman LR, Kulasekara HD, Emerson J, Houston LS, Burns JL, Ramsey BW, et al.
Pseudomonas aeruginosa lasR mutants are associated with cystic fibrosis lung disease
progression. *Journal of Cystic Fibrosis*. 2009;8(1):66-70.

43.   D'Argenio DA, Wu M, Hoffman LR, Kulasekara HD, Déziel E, Smith EE, et al. Growth phenotypes of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa lasR* mutants adapted to the airways of cystic fibrosis patients. *Molecular Microbiology*. 2007;64(2):512-33.

44.   Bolard A, Plesiat P, Jeannot K. Mutations in gene *fusA1* as a novel mechanism of aminoglycoside resistance in clinical strains of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. Antimicrobial agents and chemotherapy. 2018;62(2):1-10.

45.   Mavrodi DV, Bonsall RF, Delaney SM, Soule MJ, Phillips G, Thomashow LS. Functional analysis of genes for biosynthesis of pyocyanin and phenazine-1-carboxamide from *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* PAO1. *Journal of Bacteriology*. 2001;183(21):6454.

46.   Recinos DA, Sekedat MD, Hernandez A, Cohen TS, Sakhtah H, Prince AS, et al. Redundant phenazine operons in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* exhibit environment-dependent expression and differential roles in pathogenicity. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. 2012;109(47):19420-5.

47.   Sakhtah H, Koyama L, Zhang Y, Morales DK, Fields BL, Price-Whelan A, et al. The *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* efflux pump MexGHI-OpmD transports a natural phenazine that controls gene expression and biofilm development. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. 2016;113(25):E3538-47.

48.   Cezairliyan B, Vinayavekhin N, Grenfell-Lee D, Yuen GJ, Saghatelian A, Ausubel FM. Identification of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* phenazines that kill *Caenorhabditis elegans*. *PLOS Pathogens*. 2013;9(1):e1003101.

49.   Gibson J, Sood A, Hogan DA. *Pseudomonas aeruginosa-Candida albicans* interactions: localization and fungal toxicity of a phenazine derivative. Applied and environmental microbiology. 2009;75(2):504-13.

50.   Parsons JF, Greenhagen BT, Shi K, Calabrese K, Robinson H, Ladner JE. Structural and functional analysis of the pyocyanin biosynthetic protein PhzM from *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Biochemistry*. 2007;46(7):1821-8.

51.   Oshri RD, Zrihen KS, Shner I, Omer Bendori S, Eldar A. Selection for increased quorum-sensing cooperation in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* through the shut-down of a drug resistance pump. The ISME journal. 2018;12(10):2458-69.

52.   Waite AJ, Shou W. Adaptation to a new environment allows cooperators to purge
cheaters stochastically. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. 2012;109(47):19079-
86.

53.   Asfahl KL, Walsh J, Gilbert K, Schuster M. Non-social adaptation defers a tragedy of the
commons in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* quorum sensing. *The ISME Journal*. 2015;9(8):1734-46.

54.   Lai B-m, Yan H-c, Wang M-z, Li N, Shen D-s. A common evolutionary pathway for
maintaining quorum sensing in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Journal of Microbiology*.
2018;56(2):83-9.

55.   Rada B, Leto TL. Pyocyanin effects on respiratory epithelium: relevance in *Pseudomonas
aeruginosa* airway infections. *Trends in Microbiology*. 2013;21(2):73-81.

56.   Hassett DJ, Charniga L, Bean K, Ohman DE, Cohen MS. Response of *Pseudomonas
aeruginosa* to pyocyanin: mechanisms of resistance, antioxidant defenses, and demonstration of
a manganese-cofactored superoxide dismutase. *Infection and Immunity*. 1992;60(2):328-36.

57.   Gardner PR. Superoxide production by the mycobacterial and pseudomonad quinoid
pigments phthiocol and pyocyanine in human lung cells. *Archives of Biochemistry and
Biophysics*. 1996;333(1):267-74.

58.   Meirelles LA, Newman DK. Both toxic and beneficial effects of pyocyanin contribute to
the lifecycle of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Molecular Microbiology*. 2018;110(6):995-1010.

59.   Das T, Manefield M. Pyocyanin promotes extracellular DNA release in *Pseudomonas
aeruginosa. PLOS One*. 2012;7(10):e46718.

60.   Hassett DJ, Ma J-F, Elkins JG, McDermott TR, Ochsner UA, West SEH, et al. Quorum
sensing in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* controls expression of catalase and superoxide dismutase
genes and mediates biofilm susceptibility to hydrogen peroxide. *Molecular Microbiology*.
1999;34(5):1082-93.

61.   García-Contreras R, Nuñez-López L, Jasso-Chávez R, Kwan BW, Belmont JA, Rangel-
Vega A, et al. Quorum sensing enhancement of the stress response promotes resistance to
quorum quenching and prevents social cheating. *The ISME Journal*. 2015;9(1):115-25.

62.   Pfluger-Grau K, Gorke B. Regulatory roles of the bacterial nitrogen-related
phosphotransferase system. *Trends Microbiol*. 2010;18(5):205-14.

63.   Velazquez F, Pfluger K, Cases I, De Eugenio LI, de Lorenzo V. The phosphotransferase
system formed by PtsP, PtsO, and PtsN proteins controls production of polyhydroxyalkanoates in
Pseudomonas putida. Journal of bacteriology. 2007;189(12):4529-33.

64.   Tan MW, Rahme LG, Sternberg JA, Tompkins RG, Ausubel FM. Pseudomonas
aeruginosa killing of Caenorhabditis elegans used to identify P. aeruginosa virulence factors.
Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America.
1999;96(5):2408-13.

65.   Schurek KN, Marr AK, Taylor PK, Wiegand I, Semenec L, Khaira BK, et al. Novel
genetic determinants of low-level aminoglycoside resistance in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*.
Antimicrobial agents and chemotherapy. 2008;52(12):4213.

66.   Scribner MR, Santos-Lopez A, Marshall CW, Deitrick C, Cooper VS. Parallel evolution
of tobramycin resistance across species and environments. mBio. 2020;11(3).

67.   Poole K. Aminoglycoside resistance in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Antimicrob Agents
Chemother*. 2005;49(2):479-87.

68.   Li X-Z, Poole K, Nikaido H. Contributions of MexAB-OprM and an EmrE homolog to
intrinsic resistance of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* to aminoglycosides and dyes. *Antimicrob Agents
Chemother*. 2003;47(1):27-33.

69.   Aires JR, Köhler T, Nikaido H, Plésiat P. Involvement of an active efflux system in the
natural resistance of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* to aminoglycosides. *Antimicrob Agents
Chemother*. 1999;43(11):2624-28.

70.   Masuda N, Sakagawa E, Ohya S GN, Tsujimoto H, Nishino T. Contribution of the
MexX-MexY-oprM efflux system to intrinsic resistance in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Antimicrob
Agents Chemother*. 2000;44(9):2242-6.

71.   Zhang L, Mah TF. Involvement of a novel efflux system in biofilm-specific resistance to
antibiotics. *J Bacteriol*. 2008;190(13):4447-52.

72.   Scholz RL, Greenberg EP. Positive autoregulation of an acyl-homoserine lactone
quorum-sensing circuit synchronizes the population response. mBio. 2017;8(4).

73.   El Meouche I, Dunlop MJ. Heterogeneity in efflux pump expression predisposes
antibiotic-resistant cells to mutation. Science. 2018;362(6415):686-90.

TABLES

Table 1. Mutations in variants from populations passed with 0.6–7.1 µg ml^{-1} tobramycin.

Variant	Gene mutation[a]		
	ptsP	*fusA1*	others
T1	1547T	G61A	*pmrB, mdpA*
T2	841ΔC	ND[b]	*mexZ, rrf2, psdR,* PA14_RS15595 (predicted nucleotide sugar dehydrogenase)
T3	1547T	G61A	*dppA3, ostA*

[a]Mutations are given by nucleotide location

[b]ND: not detected

FIGURE LEGENDS

Fig. 1. *lasR* contributes to tobramycin resistance in planktonically-grown *P. aeruginosa* PA14.

A. The minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) of tobramycin was determined for each of the

strains indicated as described in Materials and Methods. 3OC12-HSL was added before

inoculation where indicated (10 µM final). Statistical analysis by one-way ANOVA and

Dunnett's multiple comparisons test with wild type: *** $p<0.001$, **** $p<0.0001$. **B.** Cells

recovered following tobramycin treatment (1.1 µg ml^{-1}). Cells were treated as in part A and the

surviving cells were enumerated by serial dilution and plating following treatment. For both

experiments, the values shown represent the average of three independent experiments and the

error bars represent the standard deviation.

Fig. 2. Tobramycin suppresses the emergence of *lasR*-mutant cheaters. *P. aeruginosa*

populations were transferred daily in 1% casein broth for 32 days, and cheaters were enumerated

every 4 days by patching as described in Materials and Methods. For each experiment, one

culture was initially started with no tobramycin, and after 72 hr split into three cultures

propagated in one of three conditions; i) with no tobramycin (⬤), ii) with tobramycin added at

0.6 µg ml^{-1} (◼), iii) with tobramycin added at 0.6 µg ml^{-1} initially, and increased by 50% every

4 days to a final concentration of 7.1 µg ml^{-1} (△). For conditions ii and iii, tobramycin was

added every other day just after transfer to fresh medium. The detection level of cheaters was

1%. The values shown represent the average of three independent experiments and the error bars

represent the standard deviation.

Fig. 3. Effects of *ptsP* inactivation on LasR activity and pyocyanin production. **A.** Activity of

LasR. *P. aeruginosa* strains were electroporated with a plasmid containing a LasR-responsive

GFP reporter (pBS351). Reported values are fluorescence normalized to culture density at 18 h

of growth. **B.** Pyocyanin production. Cultures were inoculated into pyocyanin-producing media,

grown for 18 h, and extracted before quantifying pyocyanin as described in Materials and

Methods. In all cases, reported values are µg/ml pyocyanin normalized to culture density at the

time of measurement. Strains carried either the empty CTX-1 cassette (CTX), or the CTX-1-*ptsP*

cassette, inserted at the neutral *attB* site in the genome. The values represent the average of three

independent experiments and the error bars represent the standard deviation. Statistical analysis

by one-way ANOVA and Dunnett's multiple comparisons test with wild type: ** $p<0.01$, ***

$p<0.001$, **** $p<0.0001$.

Fig. 4. *ptsP* inactivation suppresses cheaters. P. *aeruginosa* populations were transferred daily in

1% casein broth for 32 days, and cheaters were enumerated every 4 days by patching as

described in Materials and Methods. Values shown indicate the number of days until *lasR*-

mutated cheaters emerge in **A**) populations of wild type PA14 (WT) and PA14 variants (T1, T2

and T3) from tobramycin-evolved populations and **B**) WT or the Δ*ptsP* mutant carrying either

the empty CTX-1 cassette (CTX), or the CTX-1-*ptsP* (CTX-*ptsP*) cassette, inserted at the neutral

attB site in the genome. Cheater emergence is defined as when *lasR* mutants reach a frequency in

the population of 8%, at which point it was generally observed that cheater frequencies

continued increasing rather than decreasing or remaining constant. Full data sets of cheater

frequency and total populations are shown in Fig. S5. Values represent the average of three

independent experiments and the error bars represent the standard deviation. Statistical analysis

by one-way ANOVA and Dunnett's multiple comparisons test with wild type for A; and by one-

way ANOVA and Tukey's multiple comparisons test for B: **** $p < 0.0001$.

Fig. 5. $\Delta ptsP$ mutant cultures has antimicrobial activity against *lasR* mutants. Final cell densities

of *P. aeruginosa* strains treated for 24 h with filtered fluid from 1% casein-grown cultures of

untreated (black), wild-type PA14 (light grey), or the *ptsP* mutant (dark grey). The initial cell

density of the treated cultures was 5–7 X 10^5 cells ml^{-1}. The values represent the average of three

independent experiments and the error bars represent the standard deviation. Statistical analysis

by two-way ANOVA and Dunnett's multiple comparison test with untreated for each strain. *

$p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$.

Fig. 6. $\Delta ptsP$ mutants police cheaters using pyocyanin. **A.** Pyocyanin biosynthesis steps. The

products of the *phzA1-G1* (*phz*1) and *phzA2-G2* (*phz*2) gene clusters synthesize phenazine-1-

carboxylic acid (PCA) from chorismate. PhzM and PhzH convert PCA into 5-methylphenazine

1-carboxylic acid (5-Me-PCA) or phenazine-1-carboxamide (PCN), respectively. PhzS converts

PCA into pyocyanin. **B.** Final cell densities of $\Delta ptsP$, $\Delta lasR$ cells treated with filtered fluid from

1% casein-grown cultures of a $\Delta ptsP$ mutant or $\Delta ptsP$ with the entire *phz1* and *phz2* operons

deleted (Δphz1-2) or with *phzM, phzS,* or *phzH* deleted. The initial cell density of the treated

cultures was 5–7 X 10^5 cells ml^{-1}. Data are the average of three independent experiments with

standard deviation. Statistical analysis by one-way ANOVA and Tukey's multiple comparisons

test with $\Delta ptsP$, *$p < 0.05$. **C.** Final cell densities of wild-type PA14 (WT) or the $\Delta ptsP$, $\Delta lasR$

mutant treated with 0 or 10 µg ml^{-1} pyocyanin and filtered fluid from 1% casein-grown $\Delta ptsP$

$\Delta phzS$ cultures. The initial cell density of treated cultures was 4–6X10^5 CFU ml^{-1}. Data are the

average of four independent experiments with standard deviations. Statistical analysis by two-

way ANOVA and multiple comparisons test with no-pyocyanin control, * p<0.05. **D.** Cheater

suppression during competition. Competitions were inoculated with the *lasR* mutant and each

cooperator strain at an initial ratio of 1:99 (cheater:cooperator) in 1% casein broth and

transferred to fresh medium daily for 3 days. On day 3, cheaters were enumerated by patching as

described in Materials and Methods. Each data point represents an independent experiment. The

horizontal line represents the mean and the vertical line represents the standard deviation of all

the experiments in each set. Statistical analysis by one-way ANOVA with Tukey's multiple

comparisons test of each set with the wild-type cooperator experiments: ** p<0.01, *** p<0.001.

Total population densities of each experiment are shown in Fig. S6.

738   Fig. 1

741   Fig. 2.

754   Fig. 3

P. aeruginosa strain or variant

757   Fig. 4

766   Fig. 5