Multimodal-Multisensory Experiments: Design and Implementation

Moein Razavi 1, Takashi Yamauchi 1, Vahid Janfaza 2, Anton Leontiev 1, Shanle Longmire-Monford 1, Joseph Orr 1

1 Department of Psychological and Brain Sciences, Texas A&M University; moeinrazavi@tamu.edu, takashi-yamauchi@tamu.edu, a.g.leontiev@tamu.edu, college4me@tamu.edu, joseph.orr@tamu.edu
2 Department of Computer Science and Engineering, Texas A&M University; vahidjanfaza@tamu.edu

1.1. The mind is multimodal

Psychology is the scientific study of the brain, mind and behavior. The brain supervises different autonomic functions such as cardiac activity, respiration, perspiration, etc. Current methods to study human behavior include self-report, observation, task performance, gaze, gait and body motion, and physiological measures such as electroencephalogram (EEG), electrocardiogram (ECG), functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI). These measures are indicators of human behavior; however, the gap here is that they are mostly studied separately from each other, while human behavior is inherently multimodal and multisensory, where different measures are connected and dependent on each other. Signals from multiple sources have overlap in locations (spatial) or timing (temporal) in the brain; hence, a single measurement cannot be as informative as multiple measurements in distinguishing between different functions [1].
A more accurate behavioral measurement needs different measures to be recorded and analyzed concurrently [2]. Hochenberger (2015) suggests that multimodal experiments facilitate the perception of senses that operate in parallel [3]. Similar to using multiple classifiers to improve accuracy in a classification task, combining different measures in studies of brain functionality and its association with behavior helps improve the predictions of human behavior [4].

Designing and developing a multimodal and multisensory study is complicated and costly. All events and time series must be recorded and timestamped together; data from multiple measurements and multiple subjects should be stored in an easily accessible and analyzable format. All the devices must start recording at the same time without the effort of running the devices one by one. For psychological and cognitive science experiments, an instant and easy to setup system is vital, due to the need to collect data from a large group of participants (around 50-60 participants).

There are several proprietary systems that ease multimodal-multisensory experimentation (e.g., iMotions). Yet, it is costly and challenging to integrate different devices with these systems. Due to limitations of proprietary software the stimulus presentation and data acquisition should be in different software which makes it difficult for 1) synchronization (since different software may have different processing times which results in different delays) and 2) instant and easy experiment setup. Here we present a system that allows stimulus presentation, data acquisition and recording in the same [opensource] software and how to make this process automatic and adaptable for various multimodal-multisensory experiments.

**Contributions.** To summarize, this paper makes the following contributions.

- For psychological and cognitive science experiments, an instant and easy-to-setup system that can be used for multimodal-multisensory experiments is vital. We have designed a comprehensive, customizable and fully opensource system in PsychoPy and Unity platforms which can be used for that purpose. To the best of our knowledge, our system is the first of this kind.
- We have provided a tutorial on how to make stimulus presentation and data acquisition in the same [opensource] software and how to make the process of synchronizing multiple sensors, devices and markers (from environment and the user response) and saving the data on disk automatically.
- We have created several applications and also customized the SDKs of different devices to create multimodal-multisensory experiments using LSL and made the source files open access. By studying the source files, users will find how to customize their devices’ SDKs for this purpose.
- Due to limitation of the proprietary systems for supporting different devices, we have provided a platform which makes it possible for all opensource devices to be synchronized together automatically. Also, with the aid of our system, all non-opensource devices which can send data to one of the opensource platforms such as C, C++, C#, Python, Java and Octave can be synchronized.

In what follows, section 1.2 reviews previous works and their findings that elucidate the importance of using multisensory experiments. Section 2 discusses major challenges of implementing multisensory experiments and the available methods of addressing those challenges. Section 3 presents an overview of the tools and methods utilized in the proposed system. Sections 4 and 5, provide a step-by-step tutorial on developing multimodal/multisensory experiments in PsychoPy and Unity platforms, respectively. Finally, section 6 presents the results and discusses the cases of use and potential future works.

### 1.2. Related Work

Although many past studies provided useful information about human behavior using only a single source, multiple sources are involved with actual behavior in the natural environment [5]. A few studies tried to integrate multiple measures into the experimental psychology/neuroscience portal. Reeves et al. (2007) state the importance of using multiple measures in the goals of Augmented Cognition (AUGCOG) [6]; they discuss the combination of multiple measures together as a factor for...
the technologies that improve Cognitive State Assessment (CSA). Jimenez-Molina et al. (2018) showed that analyzing all measures of electrodermal activity (EDA), photoplethysmogram (PPG), EEG, temperature and pupil dilation at the same time, significantly improves the classification accuracy in a web-browsing workload classification task, compared to using a single measure or a combination of some of them [7].

Several studies to date have put these recommendations to work by integrating several measures concurrently. Born et al. (2019) used EEG, GSR and eye-tracking to predict task performance in a task load experiment; they found that low-beta frequency bands, pupil dilations and phasic components of GSR were correlated with task difficulty [8]. They also showed that the statistical results of analyzing EEG and GSR together were more reliable than analyzing them individually. Leontyev et al. combined user response time and mouse movement features with machine learning techniques and found an improvement in the accuracy of predicting attention-deficit/hyperactivity disorder (ADHD) [9–11]. Yamauchi et al. combined behavioral measures and multiple mouse motion features to better predict people's emotions and cognitive conflict in computer tasks [12,13]. Yamauchi et al. further demonstrated that people's emotional experiences change as their tactile sense (touching a plant) was augmented with visual sense (“seeing” their touch) in a multisensory interface system [14]. Chen et al. (2012) tried to identify possible correlations between increasing levels of cognitive demand and modalities from speech, digital pen, and freehand gesture to eye activity, galvanic skin response, and EEG [15]. Lazzeri et al. (2014) used physiological signals, eye gaze, video and audio acquisition to perform an integrated affective and behavioral analysis in Human-Robot Interaction (HRI) [16]; by acquiring synchronized data from multiple sources, they investigated how autism patients can interact with affective robots. Charles and Nixon (2019) reviewed 58 articles on mental workload. They found that physiological measurements such as ECG, respiration, GSR, blood pressure, EOG and EEG need to be triangulated because though they are sensitive to mental workload, no single measure satisfies to predict mental workload [17]. Lohani et al. (2019) suggest that analyzing multiple measures such as head movement together with physiological measures (e.g., EEG, heart rate, etc.) can be used for the drivers to detect cognitive states (e.g., distraction) [18]. Gibson et al. (2014) integrated questionnaires, qualitative methods, and physiological measures including ECG, respiration, electrodermal activity (EDA) and skin temperature to study activity settings in disabled youth [19]; they stated that using multiple measures reflects a better real-world setting of the youth experiences. Sciarini and Nicholson (2009) used EEG, eye blink, respiration, cardiovascular activity and speech measures in a workload task performance [20]; as they outlined, using only one measure is not sufficient in the multidimensional tasks in a dynamic environment. Thus, multiple measures should be considered. The authors also highlighted the lack of clear guidance on how to integrate different systems as an important issue.

Integrating multiple measurements is quite complicated. Although the aforementioned studies integrated multiple measures, they did not synchronize these measures together. They have different sampling rates and also lack a coherent and easy to implement method for combining the measures. Asynchronized multiple measures are prone to error and make it difficult to assess their interactions with each other.

The following section provides a summary of the challenges for device integration and different methods of addressing them.

2. Multisensory Experiments

2.1. Challenges of Implementation

There are several challenges to be addressed during the integration process:

1. All events and time series must be recorded and timestamped together, with the same timing reference, to be analyzable.

2. Because multiple subjects (N>50) are needed in psychological experiments for statistical analysis, data from multiple measures and multiple subjects should be stored in a format that can be easily analyzed together.
3. A method should be used to record the data from all the devices simultaneously without the need to run the devices one by one.

   For the first challenge, UDP (User Datagram Protocol) and TCP (Transmission Control Protocol) offer potential solutions. However, UDP is unreliable since it is a connectionless protocol that does not guarantee data delivery, order, or duplicate protection. On the other hand, TCP is a connection-oriented protocol that guarantees errorless, reliable and ordered data streaming and it works with internet protocol (IP) for data streaming. Thus, for reliable data transport, TCP is preferred.

   For the second and third challenges, there are at least two options. One is to use proprietary software (e.g., iMotions, Biopac, etc.) which has its own advantages. For example, it has extensive support and is relatively easy to implement. However, proprietary software is costly and restrictive; it often forces the researchers to purchase other proprietary devices that are functional only for that particular software design. Because of that, the users are limited in the number of experimental manipulations they can introduce. Finally, proprietary software developers often charge steep licensing fees, which limit people’s access (especially in developing countries). Thus, it is imperative to devise a system that will address the problem of simultaneous observation, but that is also accessible to everyone.

   Another method, which is more versatile and preferred, is to employ opensource tools that are available for multiple platforms (e.g., LSL). LSL (https://github.com/sccn/labstreaminglayer/wiki) is available on almost all open-source platforms including, Python, C, C++, C#, Java, Octave, etc. Currently, the majority of the consumer and research-grade devices support LSL. Above all, as long as these devices are capable of sending their data to the platforms like Python, C, MATLAB, etc., LSL can be used for streaming their data. LSL uses TCP for stream transport and UDP for stream discovery and time synchronization.

   LSL is developed by the Swartz Center for Computational Neuroscience (SCCN) at the University of California San Diego (UCSD).

   LSL can be embedded in free and open-source stimulus presentation platforms like PsychoPy (https://www.psychopy.org/) and Unity (https://unity.com/, Figure 1).

![Figure 1. Schematic architecture for integrating devices: Objects that are defined in PsychoPy/Unity (usually task markers) can send data directly to LSL. Also, different devices can send data to LSL by calling child processes inside PsychoPy/Unity](https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.12.01.405795)

Wang et al. (2014) used PsychoPy, EEG, and LSL for Brain-Computer Interface (BCI) stimulus presentations. They used these to synchronize the stimulus markers and EEG measurements [21]. Figure 2, shows the overall structure of the method proposed in this paper.
As shown in Figure 2, creating a multimodal/multisensory experiment can be done in **PsychoPy/Unity** environment. Different devices send data to **LSL** using **LSL** functions that are embedded in **PsychoPy/Unity**. Then by embedding **LabRecorder** in **PsychoPy/Unity**, data can be recorded on the disk as a **.xdf** file. The devices used for this paper can be called and start recording by running child processes in **Python** and **C#**, which allows the processes to be directly embedded in **PsychoPy** and **Unity**, respectively. Finally, everything can be started from a main **PsychoPy** experiment or **Unity VR** project.

In the following, an introduction to **PsychoPy/Unity**, **LSL**, and **LabRecorder** ([https://github.com/labstreaminglayer/App-LabRecorder/releases](https://github.com/labstreaminglayer/App-LabRecorder/releases)) is provided.

### 3. Overview: PsychoPy, Unity, Lab Streaming Layer (LSL), Lab Recorder

Our overall strategy for building a multimodal and multisensory experiment is to bridge **PsychoPy/Unity**, **LSL**, and **LabRecorder**. The principle of integration is to call different devices from **PsychoPy/Unity** to send their data streams to **LSL**; **LabRecorder** starts recording the streams available on **LSL** from **command line**, which would also be embedded in **PsychoPy/Unity**. **PsychoPy** allows for the building of behavioral experiments with little to no programming experience using premade templates for stimulus presentation and response collection. **Unity** enables the creation of 2D and 3D gaming environments. **LSL** is a set of libraries for synchronous collection of multiple time series in research experiments ([https://labstreaminglayer.readthedocs.io/info/intro.html](https://labstreaminglayer.readthedocs.io/info/intro.html)). **LabRecorder** is an **LSL** application that allows saving all the streams that are available on **LSL** on disk in a single **.xdf** file.

**PsychoPy**

**PsychoPy** is an open-source software package written in the Python programming language primarily for use in Neuroscience and Experimental Psychology research ([https://www.psychopy.org/](https://www.psychopy.org/)). **PsychoPy** has three main building blocks for constructing behavioral experiments: stimulus/response components, routines and loops (Figure 3).

Stimulus components are premade templates for displaying various types of stimuli: geometric shapes, pictures, videos, audio signals, etc. The user can control which stimuli they want to present, in what order and for how long (along with other stimulus-specific properties). Similarly, response

---

**Figure 2.** Flowchart of creating an automatic multisensory experiment using (a) **PsychoPy**; (b) **Unity**

- **PsychoPy**
- **Unity**
- **Lab Streaming Layer (LSL)**
- **Lab Recorder**
components allow for recording different types of responses: key press, mouse clicks/moves, as well as vocal responses.

Stimulus and response components are organized within routines, which are a sequence of events within one experimental trial. For example, consider a Flanker task (Figure 3) in which a participant is presented with five arrows, with the middle arrow pointing to the same direction as surrounding arrows (congruent) or to the opposite direction (incongruent). The participant has to press the key on the keyboard indicating the direction of the middle arrow (“left” or “right” arrow key). In this task, the stimulus component “arrows” (Figure 3C) presents the arrangement of letters for a given trial, while component “key_resp” (Figure 3D) records the participant’s response. Altogether, they constitute the routine “flanker_task” (Figure 3A).

The trial parameters (in this case, which succession of arrows to show, e.g., →→→→→ or ←←←←←) are controlled by the loop “trials_loop” (Figure 3B). Loops contain information about the variables that are supposed to change from trial to trial. As the name suggests, loops repeat routines updating the routine components with the values prescribed by the experimenter.

PsychoPy provides an option to include custom python code, which can be embedded in the beginning or the end of the experiment, in the beginning or the end of each routine, and for each frame of the screen; the code written in Each Frame will run every refreshment cycle of the monitor screen (Figure 4).
Unity

Unity is a game engine platform that allows creating games in 2D and 3D environments. It enables the users to script in C# for handling the scenes and objects. In Unity, the game environment is called a Scene, and each component in the environment (e.g., characters) is called a GameObject. Every GameObject will be defined in a Scene. Complete documentation of Unity is available on [https://docs.unity3d.com/Manual/UsingTheEditor.html](https://docs.unity3d.com/Manual/UsingTheEditor.html) (Figure 5).

![Figure 5](https://example.com/figure5.png)

**Figure 5.** (A) Left: tools for manipulating the Scene view and the GameObjects within Scene; Centre: play, pause and step buttons. (B) Hierarchy of every GameObject in the Scene shows how GameObjects attach together. (C) The Game view shows the final rendered game. The play button can start the game simulation. (D) The Scene view allows to visually navigate and edit your Scene. (E) The Inspector Window allows to view and edit all the properties of the currently selected GameObject. (F) The Project window shows the imported Assets of the game.

We created a multisensory experiment by embedding LSL in the PsychoPy custom code component and Unity. This process is discussed in detail in sections 4.4 and 5 for PsychoPy and Unity, respectively.

Lab Streaming Layer

The Lab Streaming Layer (LSL) connects a PsychoPy experiment or a game in Unity (stimulus presentation and data acquisition) with multiple sensor devices. LSL consists of a core library and applications built on top of that library, which allows synchronous collection of multiple time series in research experiments and recording the collected data on disk. In LSL, a single measurement from a device (from all channels) is called a Sample. Samples can be sent individually for improved latency or in chunks of multiple samples for improved throughput. All the information about data streams (series of sampled data) is sent through an XML as the metadata which contains name, type, channel_count, channel_format and source_id for each stream. Through Stream Outlet, chunks or samples of data are made available on LSL network and these streams are visible to all the computers connected to the same local network, LAN (Local Area Network) or WLAN (Wireless Local Area Network). Streams can be distinguished with their assigned name, type and other queries created on the XML metadata. The streams that are available on the LSL network can be received by the computers that call the Stream Inlet.
To define a stream in LSL, stream outlets are created by calling StreamOutlet functions that take StreamInfo as the input. StreamInfo includes name, type, number of channels, channel format (string, int, float, etc.) and source ID as the input. Name, type and source ID are arbitrary and can be defined by the user; the number of channels and channels format depends on the characteristics of the streams. Then whenever needed, data can be transported by calling the functions that push the data in Samples or Chunks to the LSL. Once all the stream outlets are available on the LSL network, they can be saved in a single XDF using LabRecorder application, or they can be received in another platform by means of StreamInlet functions.

This complicated data acquisition and synchronization process can be semi-automated by LabRecorder, which is explained in the next section.

LabRecorder

LabRecorder is responsible for recording the streams available on LSL on the hard disk (it can be downloaded from [https://github.com/labstreaminglayer/App-LabRecorder/releases](https://github.com/labstreaminglayer/App-LabRecorder/releases)). Figure 6 shows LabRecorder GUI; names of the streams that are available on LSL can be seen on the left panel. However, in the latest version of LabRecorder, there is no need for LabRecorder GUI to record the data. LabRecorder can start recording the available LSL streams by writing one line of code that opens the LabRecorder command line interface (LabRecorderCLI) in the background. This process is explained in Sections 4 and 5.

![Figure 6. LabRecorder GUI](image)

In sections 4 and 5, a case study explains how to integrate multiple devices such as EEG, GSR, Eyetracking, Bodymotion, mouse trajectories, button click, and task-related markers within a stimulus presentation software, PsychoPy (section 4) and Unity (section 5). The program automatically saves all the recording data in a single .xdf file in a user-specified folder. All these would be done with the aid of the LSL embedded in PsychoPy/Unity.

We used opensource software for the integration of different sensors and devices. Also, different consumer-grade and affordable devices are used, including 1) for EEG, g.tec Unicorn, Muse, Neurosky Mindwave [24], BrainProducts LiveAmp, OpenBCI Cyton (8-Channel) and OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy (16-Channel), 2) for GSR, Gazepoint biometrics device and also e-Health Sensor Platform v2.0 for Arduino, 3) for eyetracking Gazepoint, 4) for body motion, Microsoft Kinect Sensor V2 for Windows. A basic sample experiment in PsychoPy and a basic VR environment in Unity that integrate different devices are available on our GitHub: PsychoPy_Example_GitHub and VR_Example_GitHub. Table 1 shows the list of the devices used for the case study.
Table 1. The devices used for integration in the sample experiment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Device</th>
<th>Method for sending data to LSL</th>
<th>Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mouse clicks/coordinates</td>
<td>Mouse</td>
<td>define LSL stream in PsychoPy</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEG</td>
<td>g.tec Unicorn</td>
<td>C++ application called from PsychoPy/Unity</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Unicorn_LSL">https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Unicorn_LSL</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BrainProducts</td>
<td>LiveAmp</td>
<td>C++ application called from PsychoPy/Unity</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/LiveAmp-LSL">https://github.com/moeinrazavi/LiveAmp-LSL</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OpenBCI Cyton (+Daisy)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Python script called from PsychoPy/Unity</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/OpenBCI-LSL">https://github.com/moeinrazavi/OpenBCI-LSL</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NeuroSky</td>
<td>Mindwave</td>
<td>NeuroSky Python library and functions in Psychopy/Call a Python script in Unity</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muse</td>
<td></td>
<td>Muse Python library and functions in Psychopy/Call a Python Script in Unity</td>
<td>Link 1: <a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/BlueMuse_Application">BlueMuse_Application</a> Link 2: <a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/BlueMuse_Installation_Guide">BlueMuse_Installation_Guide</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSR</td>
<td>eHealth Sensor v2.0 Arduino Shield</td>
<td>Python script called from PsychoPy/Unity</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/eHealth-GSR-LSL">https://github.com/moeinrazavi/eHealth-GSR-LSL</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Body Motion</td>
<td>Kinect</td>
<td>C++ application called from PsychoPy/Unity</td>
<td><a href="https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Kinect-BodyBasics-LSL">https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Kinect-BodyBasics-LSL</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next two sections provide a step-by-step case study detailing the integration of multiple sensory devices using PsychoPy/Unity, LSL and LabRecorder. Also, it is explained how to make the process automatic for an easy-to-use multimodal-multisensory experiment.

4. Case Study: Building a Multisensory Experiment (PsychoPy)

This section provides a tutorial for building a multisensory experiment by embedding LSL in PsychoPy. The task used in this case study is a simple version of the Flanker task with only 4 trials. On each screen, participants are presented with a sequence of arrows $\rightarrow\rightarrow\rightarrow$, $\leftrightarrow\leftrightarrow\leftrightarrow$, $\rightarrow\leftrightarrow\leftrightarrow$ or $\leftrightarrow\rightarrow\rightarrow$ (Figure 7) and are asked to navigate their mouse cursor to a box on the top left or top right of the screen based on the direction of the center arrow in each sequence. Starting with this simple task, we show step by step how to add mouse/cursor motion, EEG (g.tec Unicorn, Muse, Neurosky Mindwave, BrainProducts LiveAmp, OpenBCI Cyton and OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy), GSR (e-Health Sensor Platform v2.0 for Arduino and also Gazepoint biometrics device), Eyetracking (Gazepoint), and Body Motion (Kinect) one by one to the experiment.

![Figure 7: Arrow Flanker task](image)

4.1. Software and Plugin Installation

PsychoPy provides a graphical user interface for designing a wide range of psychological experiments without any programming (see Appendix for the installation process). For example, text/picture can be added in different routines as stimuli by adding text/picture items, and also keyboard/mouse can be added as items for recording response. PsychoPy uses Python programming language in the background; custom Python code items can be used to add the features which are not available in the PsychoPy GUI (e.g., LSL). Routines and loops can be added for repeating one or several routines, including the stimuli, user’s response, and sending their markers to LSL in the experiment. Then all of these (routines, loops and custom code in routines) can be compiled and run together using PsychoPy. pylsl is a Python library that allows using LSL in Python (see Appendix for installing pylsl on PsychoPy). Module Popen from python subprocess library is used for sending data from different devices to LSL. Then, using module popen from python os library enables us to use command line to open LabRecorder in the background of the experiment. This will save all the streams automatically without needing to open the LabRecorder user interface (explained in section 4.3).

4.2. Design

As shown in Figure 8, the example experiment contains 6 routines and one loop for the last 3 routines, which repeats the stimulus presentation. There are 3 main routines named Initialize, Record_Start and Stimulus_Presentation. The Initialize routine defines all the streams from the task that are intended to be sent to LSL. In the Record_Start routine, we write a command to start recording all the streams that are available on LSL in a .xdf file. Finally, in the Stimulus_Presentation routine, we write the script to send the task stimulus markers and mouse coordinates to LSL.
Figure 8. Main components of the example multisensory experiment: 1) initializing LSL streams 2) start recording LSL streams 3) stimulus presentation and sending stimulus and response markers to LSL.

In the **Experiment Settings**, as shown in Figure 9, one of the fields is defined as **UIN**, which would be used in the recorded .xdf file name.

Figure 9. PsychoPy Experiment Settings

In the experiment folder, there is a folder, *Stimuli*, and a file, *stimuliFile.xlsx*, inside it, which contains **stimID**, **stim_type**, **stim**, **corr_key** (shows the correct response) and **cong** (indicates whether the stimulus is congruent or incongruent) (Figure 10). This .xlsx file is the input for the Conditions of the loop component **Trials_Loop** (Figure 11).
Figure 10. the Excel file used for stimulus presentation in our PsychoPy example experiment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>stimID</th>
<th>stim_type</th>
<th>stim</th>
<th>cor_key</th>
<th>cong</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;&lt;&lt;&lt;</td>
<td>Left_resp</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>&gt;&gt;&gt;&gt;</td>
<td>Right_resp</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>&gt;&gt;&gt;&gt;</td>
<td>Left_resp</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>&gt;&gt;&gt;&gt;</td>
<td>Right_resp</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11. Choosing stimuliFile.xlsx as the input for the Conditions of the loop.

4.3. Adding Automatic Data Acquisition to the Experiment

To start recording the data streams available on LSL into a .xdf file, the code script shown in Figure 12 is added in the custom code named xdf_record, which is inside the End Routine tab of the Recording_Start routine. This script uses Windows command line to open the LabRecorder in the background of the experiment and starts recording the data. It is important to note that all the streams are created and initialized before the script that calls LabRecorder in the background.
Figure 12. PsychoPy custom code from starting LabRecorder automatically from command line

In the following, a step by step process on how to add different streams to the experiment is shown.

4.3.1 Mouse data + Flanker task markers

After opening the experiment Flanker_Mouse.psyexp, inside the Initialize routine, there is a custom code named initialize_code. After opening initialize_code, in the Begin Experiment tab, first, the required modules are imported (Figure 13), then 3 LSL streams are created. The first stream is for sending stimulus markers (Figure 14), the second stream is for sending user response markers (Figure 15), and the third stream is for sending mouse coordinates to LSL (Figure 16).

Figure 13. Importing the required modules
Figure 14. Defining a stream for sending stimulus type (congruent/incongruent) to LSL in each stimulus presentation.

Figure 15. Defining a stream for sending user response (clicking on the left/right box) to LSL.

Figure 16. Defining a stream for sending mouse coordinates to LSL in each trial.
In order to send a stimulus marker to LSL, in the **Begin Routine** tab of the custom code, we added the code shown in Figure 17. In order to send the user response data to LSL, in the same custom code, we added the code shown in Figure 18 in the **End Routine** tab (since the option “End Routine on valid click” is selected for the mouse component in the **Stimulus_Presentation** routine). Finally, to send mouse coordinates data to LSL, in the **Each Frame** tab (since the mouse coordinates should be sent in each refresh of the monitor screen), we added the code shown in Figure 19.

Similarly, if keyboard is used instead of mouse for user response, to send keyboard data to LSL, `key_resp.keys` should be used as the argument for the `outlet.push_chunk/outlet.push_sample` (This is not shown here for brevity).

**Figure 17.** Sending the type of stimulus to LSL at the onset of stimulus presentation on the screen

**Figure 18.** Sending the user response data (whether the user clicked on the left/right box) to LSL at the moment he clicks on the left/right box.
386 Figure 19. Sending mouse coordinates in each refresh of the monitor screen to LSL.

387 Features such as maximum velocity, maximum acceleration, total distance of the mouse movement, area under the curve, maximum absolute deviation from a straight line, etc. can be extracted easily from Mouse data by a package for R and Python called mousetrap (Kieslich 2017).

4.3.2 Mouse Data + Flanker task markers + EEG

391 The following shows how to add different EEG devices to the experiment.

393 • g.tec Unicorn (8-channel EEG device)

394 We have developed a C++ program (using Unicorn SDK) to send the data from Unicorn device to LSL. The application can be downloaded from our GitHub and copied inside the experiment lib folder. Then the application can be simply called from PsychoPy by adding the script shown in Figure 20 in the Begin Experiment tab of the initialize_code inside the Initialize routine. This will automatically send data from a paired Unicorn device to LSL.

399 Figure 20. Running the application for sending g.tec Unicorn data to LSL.
- **BrainProducts LiveAmp (16, 32 and 64-channel EEG device)**

  We have developed three C++ applications (using LiveAmp SDK) to send data from 16, 32 and 64-channel LiveAmp devices to LSL. The application associated with the desired device can be downloaded from our GitHub and copied inside the experiment lib folder. Then, the application can be called from PsychoPy by adding the script shown in Figure 21 in the Begin Experiment tab of the initialize_code which is inside the Initialize routine. This will automatically send data from a LiveAmp device to LSL.

  ![Figure 21. Running the application for sending BrainProducts LiveAmp data to LSL](image)

- **OpenBCI Cyton (8-channel) and OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy (16-channel EEG Device)**

  First pyOpenBCI needs to be installed using: `pip install pyOpenBCI`. Then OpenBCILSL folder should be download from our GitHub and copied in the experiment lib folder. Then, to send data from OpenBCI automatically to LSL, the code shown in Figure 22 should be added in Begin Experiment tab of the initialize_code inside the Initialize routine. In the OpenBCILSL.py file, in case Daisy module (16-channel) is used, `daisy = True` and the number of channels in the LSL stream info = 16; otherwise, `daisy = False` and the number of channels in the LSL stream info = 8 (Figure 23).

  ![Figure 22. Calling the Python script for sending OpenBCI Cyton/OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy data to LSL](image)
Figure 23. Python script for sending OpenBCI Cyton/OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy data to LSL

- NeuroSky Mindwave (1-channel EEG device)
  First, mindwavelsl needs to be installed using the command `pip install mindwavelsl`. Then, the lines of code shown in Figure 24 should be added in the Begin Experiment tab of the initialize_code, which is inside the Initialize routine.

Figure 24. Sending NeuroSky Mindwave data to LSL

- Muse (4-channel EEG device)
  First, BlueMuse needs to be downloaded from: [https://github.com/kowalej/BlueMuse/releases/download/v2.1/BlueMuse_2.1.0.0.zip](https://github.com/kowalej/BlueMuse/releases/download/v2.1/BlueMuse_2.1.0.0.zip) and installed as instructed in [https://github.com/kowalej/BlueMuse](https://github.com/kowalej/BlueMuse). Then muselsl module should be installed using: `pip install muselsl`. To run BlueMuse automatically in the background when the experiment is started, the lines shown in Figure 25 should be added in the Begin Experiment tab of the initialize_code inside the Initialize routine.
438

Figure 25. Sending Muse data to LSL

439

EEG data can be analyzed in EEGLAB (MATLAB Toolbox; https://sccn.ucsd.edu/eeglab/index.php) and Python MNE module. In order to read the .xdf files in EEGLAB, xdfimporter extension needs to be added to EEGLAB. To analyze data using Python MNE, pyxdf module should be installed for Python.

4.3.3 Mouse Data + Flanker task markers + EEG + GSR (Arduino)

For GSR, 2 different devices are used, 1) eHealth Sensor v2.0 Arduino shield, and 2) Gazepoint Biometrics kit. For eHealth Arduino shield, first, add <eHealthDisplay.h> and <eHealth.h> libraries need to be added to Arduino IDE. To send data from Arduino to LSL, first its data should be sent to the Serial port with a script in Arduino IDE (https://www.arduino.cc/en/main/software) (Figure 26) and deploying this script on the Arduino device. Then, a separate Python/C/C++/etc. script can receive the data from the Serial port and send it to LSL. We have developed a Python script named Serial2LSL.py, which can be downloaded from our GitHub: https://github.com/moeinrazavi/eHealth-GSR-LSL. In this script the Serial port name needs to be changed based on the name of the port that the Arduino is connected to (Figure 27). Then, the Python script Serial2LSL.py should be called from PsychoPy as a subprocess (Figure 28). This will send the data from Arduino automatically to LSL when it is connected to the Serial port. The so-called Arduino IDE and Python scripts can be found in the lib folder.

Figure 26. Arduino IDE script to send Arduino data to Serial port
Figure 27. Python script for receiving data from Serial port and sending it to LSL

```
ser = serial.Serial('COM4', 115200)

while True:
    ser_bytes = (ser.readline()).decode('utf-8')
    if ser_bytes[0] == 'C':
        C = ser_bytes[1:2]
        print(C)
    elif ser_bytes[0] == 'R':
        R = ser_bytes[1:2]
        print(R)
    elif ser_bytes[0] == 'V':
        V = ser_bytes[1:2]
        print(V)
outlet.push_sample([V])
```

Figure 28. Calling the Python script for sending Arduino data to LSL

GSR data can be analyzed using ledalab (a MATLAB Toolbox) which can be downloaded from [http://www.ledalab.de/](http://www.ledalab.de/). To analyze the data in ledalab, the .xdf file needs to be opened in MATLAB workspace (See Appendix). In the next subsection, it is shown how to send GSR data from the Gazepoint Biometrics kit (along with Gazepoint eyetracking data) to LSL.
4.3.4 Mouse Data + Flanker task markers + EEG + GSR + Eyetracking

First, download the Gazepoint installer from [https://www.gazept.com/downloads/](https://www.gazept.com/downloads/) to install the Gazepoint Control application. This application is used for eyetracking calibration and needs to be run in the background of the experiment while collecting the data from Gazepoint. We have developed a Python script using Gazepoint SDK to send eyetracking and biometrics data (GSR, heart-rate, etc.) to LSL. This Python script can be accessed by downloading the folder Gazepoint(Eyetracking+Biometrics)-LSL from our GitHub: [https://github.com/moeinrazavi/MultiModal_MultiSensory_Flanker_Task/tree/master/lib](https://github.com/moeinrazavi/MultiModal_MultiSensory_Flanker_Task/tree/master/lib). The folder should be added to the experiment lib folder. The lines of code in Figure 29 are used to open Gazepoint Control. Then the code in Figure 30 is used to minimize the experiment screen to have access to Gazepoint Control for calibration. And finally, Figure 31 shows the code to check whether the Gazepoint Control is not closed by the user, and by running the `LSLGazepoint.py` as a subprocess, it starts sending data to LSL.

![Figure 29. Script for running Gazepoint Control application.](image1)

![Figure 30. Script for minimizing the experiment screen to access the Gazepoint Control calibration](image2)
If Gazepoint Control closed by the user, run it again and send Gazepoint eyetracking (+ GSR and heartrate) to LSL.

### 4.3.5 Mouse Data + Flanker task markers + EEG + GSR + Eyetracking + Body Motion

Kinect for Windows v2 is used to record body motion. To do so, the Microsoft Kinect for Windows SDK 2.0 should be downloaded from [https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/download/details.aspx?id=44561](https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/download/details.aspx?id=44561). We have developed a C++ application based on Kinect Body Basics SDK to send data from a connected Kinect device to LSL. This application can be accessed by downloading the folder `Kinect-BodyBasics-LSL` from our GitHub: [https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Kinect-BodyBasics-LSL](https://github.com/moeinrazavi/Kinect-BodyBasics-LSL) and copying this folder in the experiment `lib` folder. Then, the code shown in Figure 32 should be added to the `Begin Experiment` tab of `initialize_code` in the `Initialize` routine.

At the end of the experiment, in order to stop recording, the lines of code shown in Figure 33 can be added to the `End Experiment` tab.
Figure 3.3. Script for stop recording the data from all the devices

501

5. Building a Multisensory Virtual Reality (VR) Experiment (Unity)

In this section, first it is shown how to create simple interactable game objects in a VR environment using Unity. Then, a tutorial is provided on how to synchronize VR environment data (e.g., objects positions and orientations), user data (i.e., marker for pressing HTC VIVE controller trigger, positions of player and controllers), and data from multiple devices such as EEG (g.tec Unicorn, Muse, Neurosky Mindwave, BrainProducts LiveAmp, OpenBCI Cyton and OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy), GSR (e-Health Sensor Platform v2.0 for Arduino), Eyetracking (HTC VIVE Pro with Tobii Eyetracking), and Body Motion (Kinect) together by LSL. Finally, it is explained how to embed LabRecorder in Unity to save data automatically on disk.

5.1. Software and Plugin Installation

In order to design a VR environment, Unity (https://unity3d.com/get-unity/download) and Steam (https://store.steampowered.com/about/) need to be installed which are available to download for free.

5.2. Create simple interactable objects in VR environment

After installing Unity and Steam, in order to create a VR environment in Unity, a new 3D project should be created from Projects part in Unity Hub (Figure 3.4).

Figure 3.4. Create a new 3D project in Unity
After creating the project, there is a Main Camera object in Unity SampleScene which is fixed to the environment and useless for VR purposes (Figure 35). It will be shown later how to attach a camera object to the player that can move with it.

To utilize VR properties and functions, SteamVR Plugin should be imported to the project. SteamVR Plugin can be downloaded and imported from Asset Store in Unity. In the pop-up windows that appear after importing SteamVR Plugin, “import” (Figure 36.a) and “Accept All” (Figure 36.b) should be selected, respectively.
Next, simple objects (e.g., Plane and Cube) are added to the Scene (Figure 37). To make the objects interactable with the user, first the Interactable and then Throwable features should be added to the Cube object (Figure 38). By doing this, the user can move and throw the Cube object.

Figure 37. Add Plane and Cube objects to the Scene

Figure 38. Add Interactable and then Throwable components to the Cube

Then a Player object is added to the Scene by dragging it to the Scene (Figure 39). The Player object will define the position of the user in the VR environment. After that, [CameraRig] object is added to the Player by dragging it to the Player (Figure 40). This will attach the VR camera and controllers (here HTC VIVE Pro camera and controllers) to the Player object.
Figure 39. Add Player object to the Scene

Figure 40. Add [CameraRig] object to the Player

In the following, it is shown how to synchronize the data from the VR environment, user and different devices using LSL.

5.3. Synchronize data from VR, user and different devices by LSL

In this step, to use LSL features, LSL4Unity plugin should be added to the Assets folder in the main project folder (here VR_LSL). In addition, to send HTC VIVE eyetracking and controller trigger press data to LSL, we developed two C# scripts which should also be added to the Assets folder (Figure 41). The LSL4Unity plugin and these scripts can be accessed from our GitHub: https://github.com/moeinrazavi/VR_LSL.
Figure 41. Add LSL4Unity plugin and developed scripts for sending HTC VIVE eyetracking and controller trigger press data to LSL in the project’s Assets folder.

5.3.1 Send VR objects data to LSL

Each object in Unity has a component named Transform which defines the Position and Rotation of that object in the environment (Figure 42). The LSLTransformOutlet function in LSL4Unity plugin can be attached to each object and send data from its Transform component to LSL. Figure 43 shows how to add this function to the Cube object by dragging the function to the object. The Sample Source field of this function should be set to the object that its Transform data needs to be sent to LSL (Figure 44). The LSLTransformOutlet function provides up to 3 types of data to be sent to LSL. The first type contains 4 channels that send the rotation data in the Quaternion system (angles with x,y,z and w axes); the next one has 3 channels that are associated with the rotation data in the Euler system (angles with x,y and z axes). The last one includes 3 channels that send the position data (x, y and z coordinates) to LSL (Figure 44).

Figure 42. Transform component of an object

Figure 43. Add LSLTransformOutlet function to the Cube object
5.3.2 Send VR objects data + user data to LSL

Here it is shown how to send the camera rotation, camera position coordinates and controller trigger press markers to LSL. The camera is attached to the Player object.

First, to send the camera rotation and position data to LSL, similar to the previous subsection, the LSLTransformOutlet function is attached to Camera object under the Player object and Camera is chosen as the Sample Source of this function (Figure 45). Similar to camera, the position and rotation of the controllers can be sent to LSL by attaching LSLTransformOutlet function to the Transform component of each controller (not shown here for brevity).

Then, to have access to controllers, SteamVR Input need to be generated by clicking on SteamVR Input in Window tab. On every pop-up window that appears, Yes and finally Save and generate buttons should be selected (Figure 46). The SteamVR Input makes controller button actions accessible.
5.3.3 Send VR objects data + user data + data from different devices to LSL

In order to send data from controllers, eyetracking and other devices, an empty GameObject is created and added to LSL_Functions (Figure 47).

We have developed C# scripts to send data from different devices to LSL. In the following, it is shown how to add these scripts to LSL_Functions object, step by step. A brief explanation for some of the scripts is also provided.

- **Sending controller trigger press marker to LSL**
  
  To send the controller trigger press markers to LSL, the *Steam VR Activate Action Set On Load* function needs to be added to LSL_Functions object. This function allows access to controller button actions. The Action Set in this function must be set to `\actions\default`. Then the *VIVE_Controller_Trigger_LSL* script that we have developed in C# and the *LSL Marker Stream* function need to be added to LSL_Functions. The *VIVE_Controller_Trigger_LSL* function uses LSL *Marker Stream* to send controller trigger press data to LSL (Figure 48). In *VIVE_Controller_Trigger_LSL* panel, the *Trigger_Data* should be set on `\actions\default\in\GrabPinch`; this will assign the action of sending data to LSL to the controller.
trigger. Choosing Right Hand or Left Hand for the Hand Type, will determine whether to send data from the right-hand or the left-hand controller to LSL.

Figure 48. Add the scripts to send controller trigger press data to LSL.

- **Sending Eyetracking data to LSL**

In order to send the Eyetracking (HTC VIVE Pro with Tobii Eyetracking) data to LSL, first, Tobii XR SDK for Unity needs to be downloaded from https://vr.tobii.com/sdk/downloads/. Then, while the project is open, opening the downloaded file will start importing the required libraries for Tobii eyetracking in Unity.

Then the Tobii_Eye_Tracking_LSL function that we developed with C# should be added to the LSL_Functions object (Figure 49).

Figure 49. Add the script to send eyetracking data to LSL.

- **Send data from other devices to LSL**

Here it is shown how to send data from other devices (EEG (g.tec Unicorn, Muse, Neurosky Mindwave, BrainProducts LiveAmp, OpenBCI Cyton and OpenBCI Cyton + Daisy), GSR (e-Health Sensor Platform v2.0 for Arduino), and Body Motion (Kinect)) to LSL. To do that, first, the required folders should be downloaded from our GitHub and copied in the Assets folder (Figure 50). Also, the Multiple_Devices_LSL script that we developed in C# needs to be copied it in the Assets folder (Figure 51). This script uses Windows Command Prompt to automatically send data from the devices mentioned above to LSL (Figure 52).
Figure 50. Add files associated with different devices to the Assets folder

Figure 51. Add the Multiple_Devices_LSL script to Assets folder
Figure 52. Multiple Devices LSL script: Send data from 1) g.tec Unicorn, 2) BrainProducts LiveAmp, 3) OpenBCI, 4) NeuroSky Mindwave, 5) Muse, 6) eHealth v2 GSR sensor and 7) Kinect to LSL.

In Figure 53, it is shown how to add **Multiple Devices LSL** script to **LSL Functions** object in **Unity**.

In the following, it is shown how to call **LabRecorder** to start recording the data available on **LSL** automatically by embedding **LabRecorder** in **Unity**.

First, the **LabRecorder** folder available on our GitHub (https://github.com/moeinrazavi/VR_LSL/tree/master/Assets/LabRecorder) is added to the **Assets** folder (Figure 54). Also, the script **LabRecorder_Record_XDF** that we developed in C# should be added to the **Assets** folder (Figure 55). Then the **LabRecorder_Record_XDF** script must be added to
the LSL_Functions object (Figure 5.6). By doing this, when the Play button is pressed in Unity, all the data sent to LSL will start being recorded automatically.

Figure 5.4. Add the LabRecorder file to Assets folder

Figure 5.5. Add the LabRecorder_Record_XDF script to Assets folder

Figure 5.6. Add the LabRecorder_Record_XDF script to LSL_Functions object
6. Results and Discussion

6.1. Results

After the experiment is finished, for both PsychoPy and Unity projects, all the streams will be saved with their associated timestamps in a single .xdf file. Each stream can be easily accessed with the assigned name, type and source_id inside the Python script, MATLAB script or EEGLAB toolbox. Ojeda et al. (2014) created an open-source EEGLAB toolbox, MoBILab, for analyzing data from multiple sensors at the same time (EEG, body motion, eye movement, etc.) [25].

In order to open .xdf file using Python, see Appendix.

6.2. Discussion and Future Work

The ability to use multiple measures that are synchronized together to distinguish factors affecting behavior and brain functionality is getting more attention. Previous works have mostly used one or a couple of measures to study the human mind and behavior. Some studies showed that using various measures (multimodal experiments) can improve the accuracy and the confidence for interpretation of the results. That said, an accurate and easy to use system to integrate and synchronize multiple measures with different sampling rates is often lacking. In this paper, a practical and comprehensive method on integrating and synchronizing multiple different measures together is provided. We developed some applications that make the integration process easier and accessible for different devices. Once the experiment is created and all the streams are defined, it is straightforward for the experimenter to run the experiment for each subject as everything starts being recorded and saved on the disk automatically. It is also very time-saving in preparing the system for the multisensory experiments. An important customizable feature of the proposed system, which is useful for Brain-Computer Interface and Neurofeedback purposes, is that the user can easily define markers for special behaviors of the signals (e.g. abrupt changes in the signals) [26]. It is expected that for future works, adding stimuli from multiple sources that involve different human senses (e.g., tactile, hear, smell, taste, etc.) can result in higher accuracy and new findings. For instance, Marsja et al. (2019) found that changes in bimodal stimuli (both visual and auditory) conveyed a shift in the performance of spatial and verbal short-term memory tasks, while changes in visual or auditory stimuli individually did not lead to a significant shift in the performance of the mentioned tasks [27]. This can be easily achieved by the aid of our proposed system, by sending the markers indicating the onset, offset, and other information related to multiple stimuli in different streams simultaneously. As multimodal behavioral data are interwoven, using methods that enable the fusion of multimodal data would obtain a wide range of new findings in the human brain and behavior research that have never been found before. For this purpose, the state-of-the-art deep learning models are powerful tools that have recently been used for combining and analyzing data from multiple sources together. Gao et al. 2020 conducted a survey study on using deep learning techniques for multimodal data fusion and how they can help find new interpretations of the data [28]. Thus, deep learning models can be beneficial for multimodal data obtained from human studies as well.

Appendix

Install PsychoPy and pylsl

On windows, install the standalone version of PsychoPy from https://www.psychopy.org/download.html.

Install pylsl module on PsychoPy

In order to install pylsl (version>1.13) on PsychoPy using pip. To install pylsl on PsychoPy use the command: “C:\Program Files\PsychoPy3\python.exe” -m pip install pylsl --user in Windows command line.
Opening .xdf file in Python

In order to open .xdf file in Python, first it is required to install pyxdf in python using pip in command line: pip install pyxdf. The .py file in the link: pyxdf_example is an example of opening .xdf files in Python. It is recommended to use Spyder (https://docs.spyder-ide.org/installation.html) as the Python platform to open the .xdf files, since the Variable Explorer panel in Spyder allows to track the variables. The fields of a .xdf file in Python are shown in shown Figure A1.

![Figure A1. Fields of a .xdf file in Python](image)

Opening .xdf file in MATLAB

In order to open .xdf file in MATLAB, first the folder including the load_xdf.m function (download from xdf_importer_GitHub) should be added to MATLAB path (using Set Path in MATLAB Home tab). Then, the .xdf file can be loaded in MATLAB workspace by running load_xdf(“ADDRESS_TO_XDF_FILE.xdf”) in MATLAB command window. The fields of a .xdf file in MATLAB are shown in shown Figure A2.

![Figure A2. Fields of a .xdf file in MATLAB](image)

References


