#### 1 Title: Rapid evolution of bacterial mutualism in the plant rhizosphere

2

#### 3 Authors/ Affiliations

- 4 Erqin Li<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Ronnie de Jonge<sup>1,4,5\*</sup>, Chen Liu<sup>1</sup>, Henan Jiang<sup>1</sup>, Ville-Petri Friman<sup>6</sup>, Corné M.J.
- 5 Pieterse<sup>1</sup>, Peter A.H.M. Bakker<sup>1\*</sup> and Alexandre Jousset<sup>7\*</sup>
- <sup>6</sup> <sup>1</sup>Utrecht University, Department of Biology, Plant-Microbe Interactions, Padualaan 8, 3584 CH,
- 7 Utrecht, The Netherlands.
- 8 <sup>2</sup>Freie Universität Berlin, Institut für Biologie, Altensteinstr. 6, D-14195 Berlin, Germany.
- <sup>9</sup> <sup>3</sup>Berlin-Brandenburg Institute of Advanced Biodiversity Research, D-14195 Berlin, Germany.
- <sup>4</sup>VIB Center for Plant Systems Biology, Technologiepark 952, B-9052, Ghent, Belgium.
- <sup>5</sup>Ghent University, Department of Plant Biotechnology and Bioinformatics, Technologiepark 952,
- 12 B-9052, Ghent, Belgium.
- <sup>6</sup>University of York, Department of Biology, Wentworth Way, YO10 5DD, York, United
  Kingdom.

<sup>7</sup>Utrecht University, Department of Biology, Ecology and Biodiversity, Padualaan 8, 3584 CH,
Utrecht, The Netherlands.

#### 17 Author List Footnotes

- Further information and requests for resources and reagents should be directed to and will befulfilled by the Lead Contact, Alexandre Jousset (A.L.C.Jousset@uu.nl).
- 20 \*Correspondence to: <u>A.L.C.Jousset@uu.nl</u>, <u>P.A.H.M.Bakker@uu.nl</u>, <u>r.dejonge@uu.nl</u>

#### 22 Summary

23 Even though beneficial plant-microbe interactions are commonly observed in nature, direct 24 evidence for the evolution of bacterial mutualism in the rhizosphere remains elusive. Here we use 25 experimental evolution to causally show that initially plant-antagonistic Pseudomonas protegens 26 bacterium evolves into mutualists in the rhizosphere of Arabidopsis thaliana within six plant 27 growth cycles (6 months). This evolutionary transition was accompanied with increased mutualist 28 fitness via two mechanisms: i) improved competitiveness for root exudates and ii) enhanced 29 capacity for activating the root-specific transcription factor gene MYB72, which triggers the 30 production of plant-secreted scopoletin antimicrobial for which the mutualists evolved relatively 31 higher tolerance to. Genetically, mutualism was predominantly associated with different mutations 32 in the GacS/GacA two-component regulator system, which conferred high fitness benefits only in 33 the presence of plants. Together, our results show that bacteria can rapidly evolve along the 34 parasitism-mutualism continuum in the plant rhizosphere at an agriculturally relevant evolutionary 35 timescale.

36 Keywords: experimental evolution, mutualism, plant-microbe interaction, diversification,
 37 rhizosphere, genetics

#### 39 Introduction

40 Mutualistic interactions between multicellular hosts and their associated microbiota are important for the fitness of both parties <sup>1-4</sup>. However, while commonly observed in nature, direct evidence 41 for the evolution of mutualism at both phenotypic and genotypic level is still scarce <sup>5-7</sup>. The 42 43 rhizosphere is a hotspot for mutualistic interactions between the plant and free-living 44 microorganisms. For example, plants can preferentially interact with mutualistic microbes present 45 in the indigenous species pool of the soil and disproportionally increase their relative abundances in the rhizosphere <sup>8-10</sup>. While such plant-mediated ecological filtering can rapidly change the 46 47 relative abundances of mutualistic versus antagonistic species in the rhizosphere, it is less clear if 48 plants can drive evolution of mutualism within species by increasing the fitness of emerging de 49 *novo* mutualist genotypes. For example, even the most well-known plant mutualistic microbes, nitrogen-fixing rhizobia <sup>5</sup> and phosphorus-providing mycorrhizae <sup>11</sup>, can be detrimental to the 50 51 plant, suggesting that the interaction between a given pair of plant and microorganism varies 52 naturally <sup>12,13</sup>. It is thus possible that plant-associated microbes might evolve along the parasitism-53 mutualism continuum in response to selection exerted by plants.

54 Beneficial symbioses between eukaryotic and prokaryotic organisms have evolved multiple times across the eukaryotic domain <sup>14</sup> and are considered as one of the major evolutionary 55 transitions of life <sup>15</sup>. It has been suggested that the evolution of mutualism often requires two basic 56 components: currency and mechanism of exchange of the currency <sup>14</sup>. In the context of plant-57 58 bacteria interactions, currency could be, for example, a root exudate, which can be taken up by 59 bacteria. Similarly, bacteria might produce plant growth-promoting hormones such as auxin and 60 gibberellins <sup>16</sup>, that are beneficial for plant growth. When the currency exchange between both 61 parties is symmetrical, the selection is expected to favour the evolution of mutualism. Increased

mutualistic dependence is then thought to evolve via reciprocal coevolution or via adaptation by 62 63 one of the partners via selection on traits that are directly involved in the mutualistic interaction <sup>15</sup>. 64 However, currency exchange could also be asymmetrical, due to competition for shared limiting 65 nutrients, such as iron <sup>17</sup>, which could explain why certain plant-microbe interactions are 66 antagonistic. Moreover, due to the open nature of the rhizosphere, free diffusion of plant-derived 67 resources could select for increased levels of cheating where mutant bacterial genotypes take 68 advantage of 'public goods' without contributing to the production of plant growth-promoting compounds <sup>5,17</sup>. As a result, mutualistic plant-microbe interactions might require additional 69 enforcing from the plant <sup>5</sup> via sanctioning of cheating bacterial genotypes. 70

71 To assess whether plant-microbe mutualism can emerge as a consequence of plant-72 mediated effects, we used an *in vivo* experimental evolution design <sup>18</sup> where we allowed the 73 rhizosphere bacterium Pseudomonas protegens CHA0 to evolve on the roots of Arabidopsis 74 thaliana in the absence of other microbes. Furthermore, we used sterile sand free of organic carbon 75 as the growth substrate making bacterial growth obligately dependent on plant root exudates. As a 76 result, bacterial survival and evolution was solely dependent on the presence of the plant, and the 77 performance of evolved bacterial selection lines were thus compared with the ancestral bacterial 78 strain. To set up the selection experiment, we inoculated a clonal bacterial population on the roots 79 of five independent A. thaliana Col-0 replicate plant selection lines and grew the plants and P. 80 protegens in otherwise gnotobiotic conditions for a total of six plant growth cycles, which lasted 81 four weeks each. At the end of every growth cycle, the evolved bacterial populations were isolated 82 and transferred to the rhizosphere of new sterile plants (Fig. S1). In these experimental conditions, 83 the initial plant-bacterium interaction was antagonistic: A. thaliana aboveground biomass was clearly reduced in the presence of *P. protegens* CHA0 after one growth cycle ( $F_{1,8} = 45.4$ , *P*< 84 85 0.001, Fig. 1A), and likely cause for this is the production of diverse bioactive metabolites by

CHA0<sup>19</sup> that can constrain plant growth <sup>20</sup>. To quantify changes in plant-bacterium interaction, 86 87 sixteen evolved bacterial colonies were randomly selected from each plant replicate selection line 88 at the end of the second, fourth and sixth growth cycles, in addition to sixteen randomly selected 89 ancestral colonies (in total 256 isolates). Each isolated colony was characterized phenotypically by 90 measuring multiple key life-history traits, including growth on different carbon sources and media, 91 tolerance to diverse abiotic and biotic stresses, production of several bioactive compounds and their 92 ability to inhibit other microorganisms (Table S1). A subset of bacterial phenotypes was also full 93 genome sequenced and characterised for their effects on plant growth in terms of root architecture 94 and above and belowground biomasses at the end of the selection experiment.

#### 95 **Results**

## 96 Selection in the plant rhizosphere leads to bacterial phenotypic diversification and evolutionary

#### 97 transition towards mutualism

98 To study the evolution of P. protegens CHA0 in the A. thaliana rhizosphere, we isolated a total of 99 240 evolved bacterial isolates from every second time point along with sixteen ancestral isolates 100 (Supplementary dataset 1) and used K-means clustering analysis to separate them into five distinct 101 phenotypic groups based on measured all life-history traits (Fig. S2, Table S2). The phenotypic 102 groups were then given names that reflected key differences in their appearance, life-history traits, 103 and their mean effects on plant growth (Fig. 1; Fig. S3-S4). Evolved clones that clustered together 104 with the ancestral strain were named as 'Ancestral-like' phenotype. Another phenotype similar to 105 the ancestral strain, which only appeared momentarily before dropping below detection level was 106 named as 'Transient' phenotype (Figs. 1-2). A third phenotype that resembled the ancestral strain, 107 but which had clearly reduced abiotic stress tolerance (F<sub>5, 248</sub> = 40.8, P < 0.001, Fig. S4) and 108 increased ability to form a biofilm (F<sub>5, 249</sub> = 196.8, P< 0.001, Fig. S4), was named as 'Stress-

109 sensitive' phenotype. Agar plate assays were used to determine the effect of the evolved 110 phenotypes on A. thaliana growth. While the 'Ancestral-like', 'Transient' and 'Stress-sensitive' 111 phenotypes showed neutral effects on plant biomass relative to plant-only control lines (Shoot 112 biomass,  $F_{6,26} = 8.01$ , P < 0.001; Root biomass,  $F_{6,26} = 2.84$ , P = 0.029, Fig. 1), they had a negative 113 effect on the plant root length (Root length,  $F_{6,26} = 10.01$ , P < 0.001, Fig. 1E) and resulted in clear 114 bleaching of plants indicative of reduced chlorophyll activity similar to the ancestor (the amount of green pixels,  $F_{6,26} = 5.90$ , P < 0.001, Fig. 1F). These assays also revealed two novel phenotypes 115 116 that showed positive effects on plant shoot and root biomasses (Fig. 1B, C) with comparable levels 117 of plant 'greenness' to no-bacteria control treatment (Fig. 1F). These evolved phenotypes were 118 therefore named as 'Mutualist 1' and 'Mutualist 2'as indicated by their plant growth-promoting 119 activity.

120 The relative abundance of different phenotype groups changed over time (Fig. 2A). The 121 'Ancestral-like' phenotypes persisted throughout the experiment even though they were substituted 122 by evolved phenotypes in all plant selection lines (Fig. 2A). The evolutionary success of 'Transient' 123 and 'Stress-sensitive' phenotypes was short-lived: 'Transient' phenotypes disappeared below the 124 detection limit in all plant selection lines by the end of the sixth growth cycle (Fig. 2A), while the 125 'Stress-sensitive' phenotypes emerged only in three selection lines and survived until the end of 126 the experiment only in one of the selection lines (Fig. 2A). In contrast, the frequency of mutualistic 127 phenotypes increased in four out of five plant selection lines throughout the experiment, while one 128 selection line became dominated by 'Ancestral-like' and 'Stress-sensitive' phenotypes (Fig. 2A).

An aggregated 'plant performance' index summarising the effects of each bacterial isolate on both aboveground and belowground plant growth traits (Fig. 2B, PC1 of multivariate analysis), was used to explore if reduced antagonism towards the plant was associated with improved bacterial growth indicative of the evolution of reciprocally beneficial mutualistic interaction. We

133 found a significant positive correlation between plant performance index and bacterial phenotype 134 abundance per plant (F<sub>1, 28</sub> = 8.01, P < 0.001, Fig. 2C). Specifically, both mutualistic phenotypes 135 reached higher abundances in the plant rhizosphere compared to other phenotypes (bacterial cells 136 per plant). This indicates that reduced bacterial antagonism towards the plant was coupled with 137 improved growth in the rhizosphere, which could also explain why mutualists became the dominant 138 phenotypes in four out of five plant selection lines during the selection experiment (reaching up to 139 94% relative abundance, Fig. 2A). In support for this, a similar positive correlation was observed 140 between the degree of plant performance of each phenotype measured in separate plant growth 141 assays and their relative abundance in diversified rhizosphere populations at the end of the selection 142 experiment ( $F_{1,23} = 4.37$ , P = 0.048, Fig. S5). Together, these results demonstrate that the evolution 143 of plant-growth promotion was accompanied with increased bacterial fitness, indicative of a 144 mutualistic interaction where each species had a net benefit. As this evolutionary transition was 145 observed parallel in four out of five selection lines, it was likely driven by deterministic processes 146 such as selection exerted by the plant instead of random genetic drift due to bottlenecking between 147 plant growth cycles.

148

# Evolution of mutualism is linked to improved resource catabolism and tolerance to plant secreted antimicrobials

For stable mutualism to evolve, plants would need to provide the evolved mutualists a 'currency' that could not be accessed by the other phenotypes or employ some form of 'sanctioning' to constrain the growth of non-mutualist phenotypes. To study this, we first compared differences in the evolved phenotypes' ability to use a range of carbon sources that are typically found in *A*. *thaliana* root exudates  $^{21}$ , and which could have selectively preferred the growth of mutualist phenotypes. Second, we compared the evolved phenotypes' tolerance to scopoletin, which is an

157 antimicrobial secreted by plant roots known to modulate root microbiome composition for example by favouring more tolerant bacterial taxa <sup>22,23</sup>. We found that the 'Mutualist 1' phenotype showed 158 159 an improved ability to grow on various different carbon sources compared to the other phenotypes 160 (PC1 of multivariate analysis,  $F_{5, 248} = 50.72$ , P < 0.001, Fig. 3A). This suggests that 'Mutualist 1' 161 potentially evolved an ability to compete better for plant-derived root exudates during the selection 162 experiment, which could have increased their abundance relative to other phenotypes. Moreover, 163 'Transient', 'Stress-sensitive' and 'Mutualist 2' phenotypes showed reduced growth on carbon 164 sources relative to 'ancestral-like' phenotypes indicative of competitive disadvantage (Fig. 3A). 165 To explore the potential significance of scopoletin, we used a GUS reporter assay to determine how 166 different bacterial phenotypes affected the expression of the plant root-specific gene MYB72<sup>24</sup>, 167 which encodes a transcription factor that regulates the production of scopoletin. We found that 168 plants inoculated with 'Mutualist 1' and 'Mutualist 2' phenotypes retained high GUS activity, 169 which was comparable to the ancestor (F<sub>5.24</sub> = 5.6, P < 0.01, Fig. 3B, Fig. S6). However, the other 170 evolved phenotypes induced a reduced GUS activity in plant relative to the mutualists (Fig. 3B, 171 Fig. S6). While the 'Mutualist 1' and 'Mutualist 2' phenotype groups included strains that showed 172 very high tolerance to scopoletin, their mean tolerance did not significantly differ from other 173 phenotype groups (F<sub>5, 24</sub> = 1.76, P = 0.16; Fig. 3C). However, a significant positive correlation was 174 observed between the induction of MYB72 in A. thaliana roots and phenotypes' tolerance to scopoletin (F<sub>1, 28</sub> = 8.29, P < 0.01, Fig. 3D). This suggest that both the activation of scopoletin 175 production, and the scopoletin tolerance, were potentially under co-selection as mutualistic 176 177 phenotypes showed high scopoletin tolerance only when they were able to trigger increased 178 scopoletin production by the plant (upregulation of MYB72). Such mechanisms would have ensured 179 positive selection for mutualists relative to other evolved phenotypes.

### 181 *Mutualistic phenotypes had mutations in genes encoding the GacS/GacA two-component* 182 *regulatory system*

183 To gain insights into the genetic mechanisms underlying the evolution of mutualism, we performed 184 whole-genome re-sequencing of a subset of evolved isolates followed by reference-based 185 identification of point mutations (SNPs) and insertions or deletions (INDELs). These analyses 186 revealed that different evolved bacterial phenotypes were associated with relatively few mutations in global regulator genes (Fig. 4) underpinning their central role in bacterial adaptation <sup>25,26</sup>. While 187 188 only few non-parallel mutations were observed in case of 'Ancestral-like' and 'Transient' 189 phenotypes (Table S2), all but two mutualistic isolates (8/10) harboured mutations in genes 190 encoding the GacS/GacA two-component system, which regulates secondary metabolism 191 alongside many other aspects of bacterial physiology <sup>27</sup>. Despite high level of parallelism, a variety 192 of different mutations was observed in this locus. Three gacS/gacA mutations were unique to 193 'Mutualist 1' isolates, and specifically associated with an uncharacterized N-terminal histidine 194 kinase domain in GacS (G27D) and the response regulatory domain of GacA (G97S; D49Y, Fig. 195 4). Four unique 'Mutualist 2' mutations were found upstream (at -40 of the transcription start site) 196 or inside the gacA coding region (E38\*, D54Y and Y183S, Fig. 4). The conserved phosphate-197 accepting aspartate 54 (D54) residue is important for phospho-relay initiated by the sensor kinase GacS, and mutations of this residue are associated with complete loss-of-function <sup>28–30</sup>. Aspartate 198 199 49 (D49) is another conserved residue in the vicinity of D54, and the gacA (49Y) allele has previously been reported to be associated with a partial reduction in GacA activity <sup>30</sup>. The other 200 201 mutations in gacA are novel and conceivably have a significant impact on GacA activity as they 202 result in a severely truncated protein (E38\*) or are located within the third recognition helix of the 203 LuxR-like tetra-helical helix-turn-helix (HTH) domain, which is known to make most of the DNA 204 contacts (Y183S)<sup>31</sup>. In line with the predicted effects of the mutations, 'Mutualist 1' isolates

retained part of the GacS/GacA – mediated traits, while 'Mutualist 2' isolates showed a severe to complete disruption of secondary metabolite production (Fig. S3). These differences between individual mutations are thus likely to explain the variation in life-history traits within and between the 'Mutualist 1' and 'Mutualist 2' phenotype groups.

209 Several other genes were also mutated in the mutualistic isolates, including accC (E413K) 210 that encodes the biotin decarboxylase subunit of the acetyl coenzyme A carboxylase complex 211 involved in fatty acid biosynthesis in bacteria, and *fleO* (R320Q) which is linked with motility and 212 biofilm formation (Fig. 4). These mutations were plant replicate line-specific, and their effect on 213 bacterial physiology or bacteria-plant interactions are unknown. Interestingly, mutualists evolved 214 in all except one selection line, which became dominated by 'Stress-sensitive' bacteria (Fig. 1, Fig. 215 4), that also transiently appeared in two other plant selection lines. Genetically, this phenotype was 216 mainly associated with mutations in the *rpoS* coding region and its promoter (Q65\*, 3/5 of selection lines). The *rpoS* gene encodes sigma factor *sigma-38*, which mediates general stress resistance <sup>32,33</sup>, 217 downregulates the biosynthesis of antagonistic secondary metabolites <sup>34</sup> and is involved in biofilm 218 formation <sup>35</sup> with several bacteria. In line with this, we found that 'Stress-sensitive' phenotypes 219 220 were able to form high amounts of biofilm in vitro (Fig. S4), which may have supported more 221 efficient root colonization <sup>36</sup> and explain their dominance in one of the plant selection lines. Moreover, efficient root colonisation could have initiated a strong priority effect <sup>37,38</sup>, potentially 222 223 constraining the subsequent emergence of mutualistic bacterial phenotypes. One of the sequenced 224 'Stress-sensitive' clones had also a mutation in a TetR-family transcriptional regulator (tetR), 225 indicative of generalised stress tolerance evolution. Together, these results show that plant selection 226 can lead to high level of parallel evolution both at the phenotypic and molecular level.

227

#### 228 The fitness benefits of GacS/GacA mutations are specific to the rhizosphere environment

229 In order to assess whether the observed mutations specifically conferred an advantage in the 230 rhizosphere environment, we compared the fitness of evolved mutualists on plant roots and on 231 liquid growth culture media. To this end, the fitness of two evolved gacA (Mutualists 1 and 2; ID 242 and ID 220, respectively, Table S2), and one gacS genotype (Mutualist 1, ID 222, Table S2) 232 233 was compared relative to their direct ancestral genotypes without gac mutations (ID 133, ID 28 234 and ID 66, respectively, Table S2) within the same plant selection lines. Fitness was determined as 235 the relative competitive fitness in direct pairwise competitions as a deviation from the initial 1:1 236 ancestor-to-successor ratio in vivo on A. thaliana roots and in vitro in Kings' B (KB), lysogeny 237 broth (LB), and tryptic soy broth (TSB) growth media. Post-competitive genotype ratios were 238 determined using PCR-based high-resolution melting profile (RQ-HRM) analysis (see Methods 239 and Materials and Supplementary figure 7). It was found that all three gacS/gacA mutants had a 240 higher fitness in the rhizosphere relative to their direct ancestral genotypes without gac mutations 241 (F<sub>3, 32</sub> = 10.03, P < 0.001, Fig. 5). Interestingly, this advantage was smaller for one of the gacA 242 mutants (ID 220,  $F_{2,6} = 15.35$ , P = 0.004, Fig. 5) likely because its direct ancestor already showed 243 mutualistic behaviour due to a mutation in the *accC* gene, which likely reduced the relative benefit 244 of the gacA mutation within this lineage (Table S2). While the fitness benefits of gac mutations 245 were mainly observed in the rhizosphere, two gac mutants showed improved competitive fitness 246 in KB media indicative of general metabolic adaptations (genotype × measurement environment:  $F_{6,24} = 13.02, P < 0.001$ ; genotype comparisons in KB media:  $F_{2,6} = 162.6, P < 0.001$ ). Together, 247 248 these results confirm that the genetic changes underlying the evolution of bacterial mutualism were 249 primarily driven by plant selection.

250

#### 251 **Discussion**

252 Even though beneficial plant-microbe interactions are widely documented, their evolutionary 253 origin is less well understood. Here we studied how an initially antagonistic relationship between 254 P. protegens CHA0 bacterium and its host plant, Arabidopsis thaliana, changed during prolonged 255 selection over six plant growth cycles (6 months). While several studies have previously reported 256 beneficial effects of CHA0 strain on plant growth in natural soils, it initially showed antagonism 257 towards the plant in our experimental conditions potentially due to production of phytotoxic 258 compounds. Crucially, this interaction rapidly evolved during the experiment leading to clear 259 phenotypic and genetic bacterial diversification and evolution of bacterial mutualists that had 260 relatively higher competitive advantage in the rhizosphere, and positive effect on the plant growth 261 compared to ancestral and other evolved bacterial phenotypes.

262 Based on our results, we suggest the following conceptual model for the evolution of 263 mutualism. As bacterial growth in this system was dependent on plant root exudates, it is likely 264 that reduction in the production of exoproducts, including lytic enzymes and antimicrobial 265 secondary metabolites (Fig. S3), by mutualists had a positive effect on plant growth and the 266 availability of plant-derived nutrients. As many metabolites produced by *Pseudomonas spp.* are 267 potentially phytotoxic <sup>20</sup>, the observed shift from antagonism to mutualism could therefore be 268 explained by reduced toxicity to the plant. In turn, improved plant growth likely triggered selection 269 for mutualists that were better at competing for root exudates relative to other phenotypes, or by 270 selectively constraining the growth of non-mutualist phenotypes via certain sanctioning 271 mechanisms. As a support for this, 'Mutualist 1' phenotypes evolved better at growing on plant-272 derived nutrients, while 'Mutualist 2' phenotypes evolved to activate plant-derived scopoletin 273 production, a compound that was relatively more harmful to non-mutualistic phenotypes. Such 274 differences between two mutualist phenotypes were also linked with subtle differences in the predicted functional effects of observed gacS/gacA mutations. Together, these adaptations could 275

have created a strong selective advantage for mutualistic phenotypes as evidenced by their relatively higher abundance in the rhizosphere at the end of the selection experiment.

278 At a genetic level, the evolution of mutualism could be achieved with only a few successive 279 mutations involving mainly global regulators <sup>29</sup>. This result shows an interesting parallel with 280 recent work demonstrating that the loss of a few virulence traits can turn a pathogen into a 281 beneficial symbiont <sup>7</sup>. Evolution of mutualism was also linked with a clear phenotypic and genotypic bacterial diversification, which has previously been observed in aquatic <sup>39</sup> and soil <sup>40</sup> 282 283 microcosms in response to spatial heterogeneity. Here we show that such bacterial diversification 284 can also be driven by plant selection as evidenced by direct competition assays where competitive 285 benefit observed in the rhizosphere was reduced or completely absent in lab media in vitro. 286 Interestingly, we observed a contrasting evolutionary outcome in one of the five selection lines 287 where 'Stress-sensitive' genotypes were able to become dominant alongside with 'Ancestral-like' 288 genotypes potentially due to their enhanced ability to form biofilm and colonise plant roots. 289 Interestingly, none of the phenotypes was able to reach fixation in the rhizosphere. One possibility 290 for this is that the experiment was not long enough for the selective sweeps to drive beneficial 291 mutations into fixation. Alternatively, it is possible that multiple phenotypes were able to coexist 292 due to negative frequency dependent selection or because they occupied different spatial niches as seen in heterogenous soil environments <sup>40,41</sup>. These hypotheses could be studied directly in the 293 294 future using fluorescent microscopy and tagged strains to observe diversification and genotype 295 fluctuations in the rhizosphere both in space and time.

In summary, our results show that in addition to recruiting beneficial bacteria from multispecies microbial communities <sup>8–10</sup>, plants could also change the functioning of its associated microbiota by creating strong selection for *de novo* evolution of mutualistic bacterial genotypes. Steering bacterial evolution in the rhizosphere could thus offer plants a shortcut to improve their

fitness without evolving themselves <sup>42–44</sup>. Future work should focus on validating our findings in more complex microbial communities where bacterial diversification could be also affected by interactions with other microbes. In conclusion, our results call for eco-evolutionary management of plant-microbe interactions in agriculture by demonstrating that plant-associated bacteria can rapidly evolve along the parasitism-mutualism continuum within a few plant growing seasons.

#### Figures







324

(A) 0 2 4 0 2 0 2 4 Line 1 \_ine 4 (B) (C) PC2 (10.3% explained var.) 1.5  $R^2 = 0.71$ 1.0 < 0.0001 P Plant performance (PC1) 0.5-0.0 2 -0.5 1.0 0 2 -4 -2 0 -2 PC1 (76.9% explained var.) Color code 5.0e+07 1.0e+08 1.5e+08 Ancestor Transient Mutualist 2 • • Bacterial abundance (cells per plant) Ancestral-like Mutualist 1 Stress-sensitive Control •



Figure 2. Temporal changes in bacterial phenotypes during the selection experiment and positive correlation between evolved bacteria and plant growth. Panels in A show the dynamics of five bacterial phenotype groups across five plant replicate lines and the overall mean pattern during six growth cycles (6 months). The x-axis shows the plant growth cycle (0: ancestral bacterium), and the y-axis shows the relative abundance of each bacterial phenotype. Panel (B) shows a principal component analysis (PCA) for five representative bacterial isolates from each

evolved phenotype group in addition to ancestor isolates (See Table S2) based on their plant growth-related traits. The negative PC1 values of each isolate were extracted and combined to a 'Plant performance' index, which included bacterial effects on shoot biomass, root biomass and root architecture explaining 76.9% of the total variation in plant growth. Panel (C) shows a positive correlation between 'Plant performance' and bacterial abundance in the plant roots at the end of the fitness assays.



340

Figure 3. Selection mechanisms favouring the increase in the relative abundance of mutualists in the rhizosphere of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. Panel (A) shows the growth of ancestor and evolved *Pseudomonas protegens* CHA0 phenotypes on carbons typically secreted by *A*. *thaliana* (14 most dominant carbons analysed as a combined index based on normalised first principal component (PC1, which explained 83.9 % of total variation); in total, 16 ancestral, 119 'Ancestral-like', 11 'Stress-sensitive', 37 'Mutualist 1', 31 'Mutualist 2' and 41 'Transient' isolates

347 were characterized, Supplementary dataset 1). Panel (B) shows the effect of ancestor and evolved 348 P. protegens CHA0 phenotypes on the expression of MYB72 (transcription factor responsible for 349 scopoletin production) in the roots of a GUS A. thaliana reporter line (based on the quantification 350 of GUS staining of the roots, Fig. S6). Panel (C) shows the relative growth of ancestor and evolved 351 P. protegens CHA0 phenotypes in the presence of the plant-secreted scopoletin antimicrobial at 2 352 mM concentration after 96 hrs of incubation relative to no-scopoletin control. Panel (D) shows a 353 positive relationship between MYB72 expression (fold induction; x-axis) and scopoletin tolerance 354 (y-axis) for all tested isolates. Panels (B-D) include five representative bacterial isolates from each 355 phenotype in addition to the ancestor (each replicate line represented; See Table S2). In all panels, 356 colours represent different phenotype groups and statistical testing in panels (A-C) was carried out 357 using ANOVA (different letters indicate significant differences based on a Tukey HSD test 358 (α=0.05)).

			Effect on plant perforn	nance		
-2		<sup>-1</sup> Ancestor <sup>a</sup>	0	1	2	3
Line 1 - oa	wbpM ° afA <sup>y335x</sup> · RS17350 °			A <sup>D49Y b</sup>		
Line 2 -		galE <sup>ab</sup> ●	yvaQ2 <sup>b</sup> ●	accC <sup>bc</sup>	gacA <sup>G975</sup> .mraZ ≥ ● g	gacA <sup>Y183S d</sup>
Line 3 - oafA <sup>ĸs:</sup>	nlpD 385.feX18 <sup>a</sup>	a •		»● gacS <sup>b</sup>		
Line 4 -					gacA <sup>∈38x</sup> · RS11785 · flhA <sup>b</sup> ●	gacA-407>A b
Line 5 -	oS⁵ fleG	a <sup>b</sup> ● → tetR <sup>ab</sup>				
Bact	terial I	Plant replicate	Mutation		Protein function	
Mutu	alist 1 L	Line 1	gacA (D49Y)		Two-component regulator	360
	I	Line 2	gacA (Y97S)		Two-component regulator	500
			mraZ (upstream(22	lbp))	Transcriptional regulator Mr	aZ 261
	I	Line 3	gacS (G27D)	)	Two-component regulator	301
Mutu	ualist 2 I	Line 2	gacA (Y183S	)	Two-component regulator	
			gacA (D54Y)		Two-component regulator	362
	L	Line 4	gacA (upstrea	m (40 bp))	Two-component regulator	
			gacA (E38X)		Two-component regulator	
			RS1178	85 (S256C)	LysR family transcriptional	regulator 363
			<i>flhA</i> (H	393Q.fsX15)	Flagellar biosynthesis protei	n FlhA
	I	Line 5	<i>fleQ</i> (R320Q)		Sigma-54-dependent Fis fan transcriptional regulator	nily
Stres	s-sensitive L	Line 2	yvaQ2 (upstre	am (9 bp ))	Methyl-accepting chemotaxi	s protein 364
	I	Line 3	nlpD (Q197P)	)	LysM, promotor for rpoS	
	I	Line 5	rpoS (Q65X)		Sigma-38, stress regulon	
			tetR (Y	127X)	TetR family transcriptional r	egulator 365
						366

367 Figure 4. Genetic basis of bacterial evolution in the rhizosphere of Arabidopsis thaliana. Clear 368 parallel evolution was observed between four out five plant replicate selection lines based on re-369 sequencing of 25 evolved and five ancestor isolates used in the phenotypic assays. Filled dots 370 represent isolates with non-synonymous mutations (present in 18/25 evolved isolates), and the x-371 axis shows a combined index of 'Plant performance' relative to non-inoculated control plants 372 (values on the x-axis indicate positive and negative effects on the plant and the y-axis shows the 373 five independent plant replicate selection lines). The effect of the ancestral bacterial genotype on 374 plant performance is shown as a vertical dashed line. The different letters on the top right of each

375 genotype indicate significant differences based on a Tukey HSD test ( $\alpha$ =0.05; each line analysed 376 separately). The accumulation of mutations within replicate lines are shown with connected dashed 377 arrows. The table lists unique mutations (and the strains' ID number) linked with evolved bacterial 378 phenotypes, and additional mutations that appeared later during the experiment within the same 379 genetic background are shown after the indent; notably, these additional mutations did not affect 380 the bacterial phenotypes (See Table S3 for a more detailed description of the mutations).



Figure 5. Competitive fitness of *gac* mutants relative to their direct ancestors in the rhizosphere and in *in vitro* culture media. The *gac* mutants' relative fitness (*r*) was calculated based on the deviation from the initial 1:1 genotype ratio (dashed line) after direct competition in different environments. Fitness values above the dashed line indicate a relatively higher competitive advantage of *gac* mutants relative to their ancestral genotypes without *gac* mutations

(Table S2), whereas values below the dashed line denote for decreased competitive ability of evolved *gac* mutants. In all panels, green and beige backgrounds denote competition assays conducted in the rhizosphere and in standard culture media, respectively. Different small letters above the boxplots represent significant differences in *r* between growth conditions for each mutant based on three biological replicates (one-way ANOVA, Tukey's HSD test,  $\alpha$ =0.05).

#### 393 Materials and Methods

#### **Bacterial strain and growth conditions**

We used *Pseudomonas protegens* (formerly *Pseudomonas fluorescens*)<sup>45</sup> CHA0 as a model strain, 395 which was initially isolated from tobacco roots <sup>46</sup>. The strain was chromosomally tagged with GFP 396 397 and a kanamycin resistance cassette to enable specific tracking of the strain and detection of 398 contaminations<sup>19</sup>. This bacterium has the genetic potential to produce various bioactive 399 metabolites, including the plant hormone indole-3-acetic acid (IAA), antimicrobial compounds and lytic enzymes <sup>47</sup>. Prior to the experiment, bacteria were grown for 48 h on a King's medium B <sup>48</sup> 400 (KB) agar plate supplemented with 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> kanamycin, a single colony was randomly picked 401 and grown for 12 h in KB at 28 °C with agitation. The cell culture was then washed for three times 402 in 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub> and adjusted to 10<sup>7</sup> cells ml<sup>-1</sup> and used as inoculant for all plants. This inoculant 403 404 was also stored at -80 °C as frozen ancestral stock, from which 'Ancestor' isolates were picked in 405 later experiments.

406

#### 407 Host plant and growth conditions

We used *Arabidopsis thaliana* ecotype Col-0 as a model host plant. Surface-sterilized seeds were first sown in Petri dishes with agar-solidified (1.5% agar (w/v)) modified Hoagland's medium: (KNO<sub>3</sub> (3 mM), MgSO<sub>4</sub> (0.5 mM), CaCl<sub>2</sub> (1.5 mM), K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (1.5 mM), NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> (1.5 mM), H<sub>3</sub>BO<sub>3</sub> (25  $\mu$ M), MnSO<sub>4</sub> (1  $\mu$ M), ZnSO<sub>4</sub> (0.5  $\mu$ M), (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>6</sub>Mo<sub>7</sub>O<sub>24</sub> (0.05  $\mu$ M), CuSO<sub>4</sub> (0.3  $\mu$ M), MES (2.5 mM) and 50  $\mu$ M Fe(III)EDTA, pH = 5.8) and stratified for 2 days at 4 °C after Petri dishes were positioned vertically and transferred to a growth chamber (20 °C, 10 h light/14 h dark, light intensity 100  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> sec<sup>-1</sup>). After two weeks of incubation, two seedlings were transferred to

415 closed and sterile ECO2 boxes (<u>http://www.eco2box.com/ov80xxl\_nl.htm</u>) for selection 416 experiment. The ECO2 boxes were filled with 260 g of dry, carbon-free silver sand that was 417 previously washed with MilliQ water to remove dissolvable chemical elements and heated to 550 418 °C for 24 h to remove remaining organic material. Prior to transplantation the sand was amended 419 with 13 ml of modified Hoagland medium.

420

#### 421 **Design of the selection experiment**

422 The selection experiment was conducted in a gnotobiotic system to remove confounding effects 423 that may emerge as a result of competitive interactions with other micro-organisms, and to place 424 the focus on plant-mediated selective pressures. Moreover, we allowed only the bacteria to evolve 425 during the experiment and used new clonal plants at every bacterial transfer. We set up five 426 independent plant-bacterium replicate lines, which were grown for six independent plant growth cycles (see Figure S1 for an overview of the experimental design). The experiment was started by 427 inoculating 10<sup>6</sup> cells of the stock P. protegens CHA0 culture (From here on abbreviated as 428 429 "ancestor") into the rhizosphere of two-week-old A. thaliana seedlings growing in sterile silver 430 sand within ECO2 boxes (two plants per replicate selection line). Inoculated plants were then grown for four weeks (20 °C, 10 h light/14 h dark, light intensity 100  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> sec<sup>-1</sup>) after which 431 432 the plant growth cycle was terminated and root-associated bacteria were harvested by placing the 433 roots of both plants into a 1.5 ml Eppendorf tubes filled with 1 ml 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub> and two glass 434 beads. Rhizosphere bacteria were suspended into the liquid using TissueLyser II at a frequency of 435 20 s<sup>-1</sup> for 1 min after which bacterial cell densities were determined using flow cytometry (BD Accuri<sup>™</sup> C6 Plus, thresholds for FSC: 2000, SSC: 8000). After this, 10<sup>6</sup> cells were inoculated to 436 437 the rhizosphere of new A. thaliana plants to initiate the next plant growth cycle. Possible

438 contaminations were checked by plating the suspension on 3 g l<sup>-1</sup> tryptic soy agar (TSA) plates and
439 it was verified that all colonies carried the *GFP* marker gene, as observed under UV light.

440

#### 441 Bacterial life-history traits measurements

Individual bacterial colonies were isolated from all replicate plant selection lines for life-history measurements at the end of the second, fourth and sixth plant growth cycle by dilution plating the rhizosphere suspension on 3 g l<sup>-1</sup> TSA plates. After incubation at 28 °C for 24 h, 16 colonies were randomly picked from each replicate selection lines resulting in a total of 240 evolved and 16 ancestral colonies. All these colonies were characterized for a set of key bacterial life-history traits representative of growth, stress resistance and traits linked with plant-microbe interactions.

#### 448 a. Bacterial growth yield in KB medium

449 All the bacterial isolates were grown in 96-well plates with 160  $\mu$ l 1/3 strength liquid KB, at 20 °C 450 without shaking. Bacterial yield was determined as the maximum optical density at 600 nm after 451 three days of growth using a spectrophotometer (SPECTROstar Nano).

#### 452 b. Bacterial stress resistance

453 We measured bacterial resistance to a range of different stresses using various 96-well microplate assays. Abiotic stress resistance was determined by growing bacteria in 160  $\mu$ l of 1 g l<sup>-1</sup> tryptic soy 454 455 broth (TSB) containing 0.0025% H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (oxidative stress), 15% polyethylene glycol (PEG)-6000 456 (water potential stress) or 2% NaCl (salt stress). We used resistance to antibiotics commonly 457 produced by rhizosphere microorganisms as indicator of biotic stress resistance. Antibiotic resistance was tested in 160 µl of 1 g l<sup>-1</sup> TSB supplemented with 1 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> streptomycin, 1 µg ml<sup>-</sup> 458 <sup>1</sup> tetracycline, or 5 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> penicillin, respectively. Bacterial growth with and without stresses were 459 460 determined after three days of growth at 20 °C without shaking as optical density at 600 nm and

stress resistance defined as the ratio of bacterial growth in the stressed relative to the non-stressedcontrol treatment.

#### 463 c. Traits linked with plant-microbe interactions

464 *P. protegens* CHA0 harbours several traits that are linked to plant growth including production of 465 antibiotics and plant hormones. To assess these traits, we grew each bacterial colony in 96-well 466 plates containing 160  $\mu$ l of 1/3 strength liquid KB per well at 20 °C with agitation for 72 h. Cell-467 free supernatants were obtained by filter sterilization (0.22  $\mu$ m) using Multiscreen HTS 96-well 468 filtration plates (1000 × g, 30 min), which were used to measure the production of the plant 469 hormone auxin (Indole-3-acetic acid (IAA)), iron-chelating siderophores and proteolytic activity. 470 Furthermore, we also measured antifungal and antibacterial activity of all colonies.

471 **IAA detection:** The production of the plant hormone auxin was determined with a colorimetric 472 test <sup>49</sup>. Briefly, 30  $\mu$ l *P. protegens* CHA0 cell-free filtrate was incubated with 30  $\mu$ l R1 reagent (12 473 g l<sup>-1</sup> FeCl<sub>3</sub>, 7.9 M H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>) for 12 h in the dark and optical density read at 530 nm of the colorimetric 474 complex was used as a measurement of IAA concentration.

Siderophore activity: Iron chelating ability was measured as a proxy for siderophore production  $^{50}$ . To this end, 100 µl of *P. protegens* CHA0 cell-free filtrate was mixed with 100 µl of modified CAS solution (with 0.15 mM FeCl<sub>3</sub>) and optical density read at 630 nm after 3 hours of incubation was used as a proxy of siderophore production. The iron chelating ability was calculated based on the standard curve based on modified CAS assay solution with a range of iron concentration (0, 0.0015, 0.003, 0.006, 0.009, 0.012, 0.015 mM FeCl<sub>3</sub>).

481 **Proteolytic activity:** The proteolytic activity assay we used was adapted from Smeltzer et al. 482 (1993) <sup>51</sup>. Briefly, 15  $\mu$ l of *P. protegens* CHA0 cell-free filtrate was incubated with 25  $\mu$ l of

483 azocasein (2% w/v in 50 mM Tris-HCl pH 8.0) at 40 °C for 24 hours. 125  $\mu$ l of 10% w/v cold 484 trichloroacetic acid (TCA) was added to precipitate superfluous azocasein, and then 100  $\mu$ l 485 supernatant was neutralized with 100  $\mu$ l of 1M NaOH after centrifugation at 5000 rpm for 30 486 minutes. Optical density read at 440 nm was used as a proxy of exoprotease activity.

487 **Tryptophan side chain oxidase (TSO) activity:** TSO activity, an indicator of quorum sensing 488 activity in *P. protegens* CHA0, was measured based on an modified established colorimetric assay 489  $^{52}$ : Three-day-old bacterial cultures grown in 1/3 strength liquid KB were mixed at a 1:1 ratio with 490 a reagent solution (5 g l<sup>-1</sup> SDS, 37.6 g l<sup>-1</sup> glycine 2.04 l<sup>-1</sup> g tryptophan, pH 3.0) and TSO activity 491 was measured as optical density at 600 nm after overnight incubation.

492 **Biofilm formation:** We quantified bacterial biofilm formation using a standard protocol <sup>53</sup>. Briefly, 493 bacteria were grown at 20 °C for 72h in 160 µl 1 g l<sup>-1</sup> TSB in 96-well microtiter plate with TSP lid 494 (TSP, NUNC, Roskilde, Denmark). Planktonic cells were removed by immersing the lid with pegs 495 three times in phosphate-buffered saline solution (PBS). Subsequently, the biofilm on the pegs was 496 stained for 20 minutes in 160 µl 1% Crystal Violet solution. Pegs were washed five times in PBS 497 after which the Crystal Violet was extracted for 20 minutes from the biofilm in a new 96-well 498 microtiter plate containing 200 µl 96% ethanol per well. Biofilm formation was defined as the 499 optical density at 590 nm of the ethanol extracted Chrystal Violet <sup>54</sup>.

500 **Inhibition of other microorganisms:** Antimicrobial activity was defined as the relative growth of 501 the target organism in *P. protegens* supernatant compared to the control treatment. Antifungal 502 activity of the cell-free supernatant was assessed against the ascomycete *Verticillium dahlia*. The 503 fungus was grown on potato dextrose agar (PDA) at 28 °C for 4 days, after which plugs of fungal 504 mycelium were incubated in potato dextrose broth (PDB) medium at 28 °C and gentle shaking for 505 5 days. Fungal spores were collected by filtering out the mycelium from this culture over glass

506 wool. Subsequently, spores were washed and resuspended in water and the  $OD_{595}$  of the suspension 507 was adjusted to 1. Five µl of this spore suspension was then inoculated with 15 µl P. protegens CHA0 cell-free filtrate and incubated in 160 µl of 1g l<sup>-1</sup> PDB medium for 2 days at 20 °C in 96 508 509 well plates. Fungal growth was measured as optical density at 595 nm after 2 days of growth and 510 contrasted with the growth in the control treatment (PDB medium without P. protegens 511 supernatant). Antibacterial activity was determined using the plant pathogen Ralstonia solanacearum as a target organism. R. solanacearum was grown in 160 µl of 1 g l<sup>-1</sup> TSB medium 512 513 supplemented with 15 µl of *P. protegens* CHA0 cell-free filtrate or 15 µl of 1/3 strength liquid KB 514 as a control for 2 days at 20 °C. R. solanacearum growth was measured as optical density at 600 515 nm.

516

## 517 Determining changes in *P. protegens* CHA0 interactions with *A. thaliana* after 518 the selection experiment

Based on the life-history trait measurements, five distinct bacterial phenotypes were identified using K-means clustering analysis (Fig S2). In order to assess whether phenotypic changes reflected shifts in the strength and type of plant-bacterium interaction, we chose five isolates from each bacterial phenotype group representing each replicate selection line and five ancestral isolates for further measurements (a total of 30 isolates, Table S2).

524

#### 525 a. Effects of ancestor and evolved bacteria on plant performance

526 For each isolate we measured root colonizing ability and impact on plant performance. All 30 527 bacterial isolates were incubated overnight in 1/3 KB strength liquid at 20 °C. The culture was 528 centrifuged twice for five minutes at 5000 x g and the pellet was washed and finally resuspended

in 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub>. The resulting suspension was adjusted to an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.01 for each strain as described previously <sup>55</sup>. Ten  $\mu$ l of the bacterial suspension (or 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub> as a control) was applied to the roots of three 10-day old sterile *Arabidopsis thaliana* Col-0 seedlings (excluding 2days of stratification at 4 °C) grown on vertically positioned Petri dishes with agar-solidified (1.5% agar (w/v)) modified Hoagland's medium (n = 3 biological plant replicates, each containing 3 seedlings). Plants were grown for 14 days before harvesting. Plants were photographed before and 14 days after bacterial inoculation.

536 Bacterial effects on plant health were quantified as leaf 'greenness' as the presence of 537 ancestral strain was observed to lead to bleaching and loss of chlorophyll in A. thaliana leaves. The 538 'greenness' was quantified from photographs by measuring the number of green pixels. To this 539 end, photographs were first transformed in batch using Adobe Photoshop 2021 by sequentially 540 selecting only green areas followed by thresholding balancing green tissue over background noise 541 (Level 80). This resulted in black-and-white images for further analysis, and the mean number of 542 white pixels per fixed-sized region-of-interest of the aboveground tissue was subsequently 543 determined as 'greenness' using ImageJ. The numbers of lateral roots and the primary root length 544 were also measured using ImageJ (version 1.50i). The root morphology data measured at the end 545 of the experiment was normalized with the data collected at the time of inoculation for each 546 individual seedling.

To determine shoot biomass, the rosette of each plant was separated from the root system with a razor blade and weighted. The roots were placed into a pre-weighted 1.5 ml Eppendorf tubes to quantify the root biomass. Then these tubes were filled with 1 ml 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub> buffer solution and two glass beads. The rhizosphere bacteria were suspended into buffer solution using TissueLyser II at a frequency of 20 s<sup>-1</sup> for 1 min after which bacterial densities were determined using flow cytometry as described above.

553 Shoot biomass, root biomass, root length, and number of lateral roots were used in a 554 principal component analysis (PCA) to calculate an overall impact of the bacteria on plant 555 performance (Fig 2E). The first principal component (PC1) explained 79.9% of the variation and 556 was normalized against the control treatment to be used as a proxy of 'Plant performance' in which 557 positive values reflect plant growth promotion and negative values plant growth inhibition.

#### 558 **b.** Root derived carbon source utilization

559 To measure changes in bacterial growth on potential root derived carbon sources, we measured the 560 growth of all 256 isolates using modified Ornston and Stanier (OS) minimal medium <sup>56</sup> supplemented with single carbon sources at a final concentration of 0.5g l<sup>-1</sup> in 96-well plates 561 562 containing 160 µl carbon supplemented OS medium per well. The following carbon sources were selected based on their relatively high abundance in Arabidopsis root exudates<sup>21</sup>: alanine, 563 564 arabinose, butyrolactam, fructose, galactose, glucose, glycerol, glycine, lactic acid, putrescine, 565 serine, succinic acid, threonine and valine. Bacterial growth was determined by measuring optical 566 density at 600 nm after three days incubation at 20 °C.

#### 567 c. GUS histochemical staining assay and bacterial growth under scopoletin stress

568 To investigate effects of the ancestor and evolved strains of P. protegens CHA0 on expression of 569 MYB72 gene, we applied GUS histochemical staining assay to the 30 selected isolates (Table S2). 570 MYB72 is a transcription factor involved in production of the coumarin scopoletin in Arabidopsis 571 roots and specific rhizobacteria can upregulate expression of MYB72 in the roots. Scopoletin is an iron-mobilizing phenolic compound with selective antimicrobial activity  $^{22}$ . Seedlings of the A. 572 thaliana MYB72pro: GFP-GUS<sup>24</sup> reporter line were prepared as described above. Seven day old 573 574 seedlings were inoculated directly below the hypocotyls with 10 µl of a bacterial suspension (OD660 = 0.1) as described previously <sup>24</sup>. At 2 days after inoculation, the roots were separated 575

from the shoots and washed in Milli-Q water (Milliport Corp., Bedford, MA) to remove all the 576 577 adhered bacteria. GUS staining of the roots was performed in 12-well microtiter plates where each 578 well contained roots of 5 to 6 seedlings and 1 mL of freshly prepared GUS substrate solution (50 579 mM sodium phosphate with a pH at 7, 10 mM EDTA, 0.5 mM K4[Fe(CN)6], 0.5 mM K3[Fe(CN)6], 0.5 mM X-Gluc, and 0.01% Silwet L-77) as described previously <sup>57</sup>. Plates were 580 581 incubated in the dark at room temperature for 16 h. The roots were fixed overnight in 1mL 582 ethanol:acetic acid (3:1 v/v) solution at 4 °C and transferred to 75% ethanol. Then the pictures of 583 each microtiter plates were taken, and GUS activity was quantified by counting the number of blue 584 pixels in each well of the microtiter plates using image analysis in ImageJ (version 1.52t). To assess 585 the effects of scopoletin on ancestral and evolved P. protegens CHA0 isolates, we applied a 586 sensitivity assay to the 30 selected isolates (Table S2). In brief, growth of bacterial isolates was 587 measured in 1 g  $l^{-1}$  TSB medium (160 µl) supplemented with scopoletin at final concentrations of 588 0 µM (control), 500 µM, 1000 µM, and 2 mM using optical density at 600 nm after 96 h incubation 589 at 20 °C without shaking in 96-well microtiter plates. Maximal effect (Emax) of scopoletin was calculated via R package 'GRmetrics' <sup>58</sup> as an indication of scopoletin tolerance. 590

591

#### 592 Whole genome sequencing

All 30 isolated phenotypes were whole genome sequenced to identify possible mutations and affected genes. To this end, isolates were cultured overnight at 28 °C in 1/3 strength liquid KB. Chromosomal DNA was isolated from each culture using the GenElute<sup>™</sup> Bacterial Genomic DNA Kit Protocol (NA2100). DNA samples were sheared on a Covaris E-220 Focused-ultrasonicator and sheared DNA was then used to prepare Illumina sequencing libraries with the NEBNext® Ultra<sup>™</sup> DNA Library Prep Kit (New England Biolabs. France) and the NEBNext® Multiplex

599 Oligos for Illumina® (96 Index Primers). The final libraries were sequenced in multiplex on the 600 NextSeq 500 platform (2 x 75 bp paired-end) by the Utrecht Sequencing Facility 601 (<u>http://www.useq.nl</u>) yielding between 1.0 and 6.4 million reads per sample equivalent to  $\sim 10 - 70$ 602 fold coverage (based on comparison with the original 6.8 Mbp reference genome NCBI GenBank: 603 <u>CP003190.1</u>).

604

#### 605 Variant calling analysis

606 We first constructed an updated reference genome of P. protegens CHA0, carrying the GFP marker 607 gene on its chromosome, from the ancestral strain using the A5 pipeline with default parameters 608 <sup>59</sup>. The input dataset for this sample consisted of 3,1 M reads and totals an approximate 34-fold 609 coverage. The size of the updated reference genome is 6.8 Mbp, with a G+C content of 63.4%, and 610 it comprises 80 scaffolds, with a N<sub>50</sub> value of 343 Kbp. We subsequently used PROKKA <sup>60</sup> (version 611 1.12; https://github.com/tseemann/prokka) for full annotation of the updated reference genome, 612 and this resulted in the identification of 6,147 genes. The updated genome is deposited in NCBI 613 GenBank with following reference: RCSR0000000.1.

Having established the ancestral genome sequence, we subsequently used Snippy (version 3.2-dev; <u>https://github.com/tseemann/snippy</u>) to identify and functionally annotate single nucleotide polymorphisms and small insertions and deletions (indels) for each individual strain. In addition, we investigated the breadth of coverage for each gene per sample with BedTools <sup>61</sup> to identify genes with large insertions or deletions. An overview of the polymorphisms is shown in Supplementary Table S3. Raw sequencing data for this study is deposited at the NCBI database under BioProject <u>PRJNA473919</u>.

#### 622 Relative competitive fitness of gac mutants measured in vivo and in vitro

The relative competitive fitness of selected gac mutants was measured in direct competition with 623 624 their direct ancestors both in vivo in the rhizosphere of A. thaliana and in vitro in different standard 625 culture media. Relative fitness was measured as deviation from initial 1:1 ratio of bacterial clone 626 pairs based on PCR-based high-resolution melting profile (RQ-HRM) analysis. Three pairs of isolates were selected: A) Evolved gacA ID 242 (genotype  $oafA^{Y335X} \cdot RS17350^{A77A.fsX14}$ . 627 gacA<sup>D49Y</sup>) and its direct ancestral genotype 133 (genotype oafA<sup>Y335X</sup> · RS17350<sup>A77A.fsX14</sup>) from 628 evolutionary line 1; B) Evolved gacA ID 220 (genotype  $galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K} \cdot gacA^{D54Y}$ ) and its 629 direct ancestral genotype 28 (genotype  $galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K}$ ) from line 2; C) Evolved gacS ID 222 630 (genotype  $oafA^{K338S.fsX18} \cdot gacS^{G27D}$ ) and its direct ancestral genotype 66 (genotype  $oafA^{K338S.fsX18}$ ) 631 from line 3. Bacterial isolates were first grown overnight in KB medium at 28 °C, centrifuged at 632 633 4,500 rpm for 10 min and the pellet resuspended in 10 mM MgSO<sub>4</sub>. This washing procedure was 634 repeated twice. The resulting bacterial suspensions were diluted to  $OD_{600} = 0.05$ . The initial 635 inoculum for the competition assays was then generated by mixing equal volumes of evolved and 636 ancestral competitors in a ratio of 1:1.

637

#### 638 Measuring competitive fitness in A. thaliana rhizosphere

This assay was performed on the roots of 10-day old *A. thaliana* seedlings grown on full strength Hoagland agar plates, which were prepared as described earlier. Twenty  $\mu$ l of the initial inoculum, containing a total of 10<sup>6</sup> bacterial cells, was inoculated on to the root-shoot junction of each seedling. After 14 days of growth, bacterial populations were isolated from the roots as described earlier and stored at -80 °C in 42.5% glycerol for relative abundance measurements.

#### 645 Measuring competitive fitness in culture media

646 Competition assays were also performed in three commonly used nutrient-rich growth media: 647 Kings' B (KB), lysogeny broth (LB), and tryptic soy broth (TSB). KB contained 20 g proteose 648 peptone, 1.5 g MgSO<sub>4</sub>.7H<sub>2</sub>O, 1.2 g KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> and 10 g glycerol per litre and the pH was adjusted to 649  $7.3 \pm 0.2$ . TSB contained 30 g tryptic soy broth per litre and pH was adjusted to  $7.3 \pm 0.2$ . LB 650 contained 10 g peptone, 5 g yeast extract and 5 g NaCl per litre. Twenty µl inoculum of competing 651 strains, containing about 10<sup>6</sup> bacterial cells, were added into wells containing 140 µl fresh medium 652 in a 96-well plate. The microplates were incubated at 28 °C without shaking for 48 after 80 µl 653 sample was harvested and stored at -80 °C in 42.5% glycerol from each well for relative abundance 654 measurements.

655

#### 656 RQ-HRM assay for quantifying changes in genotype frequencies after competition

657 We used a High-Resolution Melting (HRM) curve profile assay with integrated LunaProbes to quantify the ratio of mutant to wild type genotypes <sup>62–64</sup>. The probes and primers used in this study 658 659 are listed in Table S4. Primers were designed using Primer3. Probes were designed with the single 660 nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) located in the middle of the sequence, and the 3' end was blocked 661 by carbon spacer C3. The primer asymmetry was set to 2:1 (excess primer: limiting primer) in all 662 cases. Pre-PCR was performed in a 10-µl reaction system, with 0.25 µM excess primer, 0.125 µM 663 limiting primer, 0.25 µM probe, 0.5 µl bacterial sample culture (100-fold diluted saved sample, 664 OD<sub>600</sub> is about 0.01), 1X LightScanner Master Mix (BioFire Defense). DMSO with the final 665 concentration 5% was supplemented in all reactions to ensure the targeted melting domains are 666 within the detection limit of the LightScanner (Idaho Technology Inc.). Finally, MQ water was 667 used to supplement up to 10 µl. A 96-well black microtiter plate with white wells was used to

minimize background fluorescence. Before amplification, 25 µl mineral oil was loaded in each well 668 669 to prevent evaporation, and the plate was covered with a foil seal to prevent the degradation of 670 fluorescent molecules. Amplification was initiated by a holding at 95 °C for 3 min, followed by 55 671 cycles of denaturation at 95 °C for 30 s, annealing at 60 °C for 30 s and extension at 72 °C for 30 672 s and then kept at 72 °C for 10 min. After amplification, samples were heated in a ThermalCycler 673 (Bio-Rad) shortly to 95 °C for 30 s to denature all double-stranded structures followed by a rapid 674 cooling to 25 °C for 30 s to facilitate successful hybridization between probes and the target strands. 675 The plate was then transferred to a LightScanner (Idaho Technology Inc.). Melting profiles of each 676 well were collected by monitoring the continuous loss of fluorescence with a steady increase of the 677 temperature from 35 °C to 97 °C with a ramp rate of 0.1 °C /s. The relative quantification was 678 based on the negative first derivative plots using software MATLAB. The areas of probe-target 679 duplexes melting peaks were auto-calculated by 'AutoFit Peaks I Residuals' function in software 680 PeakFit (SeaSolve Software Inc.). The mutant frequency X was calculated using the formula shown 681 below:

$$K = \frac{\text{Area}_{mutant}}{\text{Area}_{mutant} + \text{Area}_{W}}$$

To validate the RQ-HRM method, standard curves were generated by measuring mixed samples with known proportions of mutant templates: 0%, 10%, 20%, 30%, 40%, 50%, 60%, 70%, 80%, 90% and 100%. Measurements for each sample were done in triplicate. Linear regression formula of each mutant between actual frequencies and measured frequencies were shown in Figure S7. The high R<sup>2</sup> values, and nearly equal to 1 slope values of these equations, confirmed that the RQ-HRM method can accurately detect mutants' frequency in a mixed population.

689 The relative fitness of the evolved strains was calculated according to previous studies using the

690 following equation  $^{65,66}$ :

691 Relative fitness (r) = 
$$\frac{X_1(1 - X_0)}{X_0(1 - X_1)}$$

692  $X_0$ : initial mutant frequency;  $(1-X_0)$ : initial ancestor frequency.  $X_1$ : final mutant frequency;  $(1-X_1)$ :

693 final ancestor frequency.

#### 695 **References and Notes:**

- Berendsen, R. L., Pieterse, C. M. J. & Bakker, P. A. H. M. The rhizosphere microbiome and plant health. *Trends Plant Sci.* 17, 478–486 (2012).
- Philippot, L., Raaijmakers, J. M., Lemanceau, P. & van der Putten, W. H. Going back to
  the roots: the microbial ecology of the rhizosphere. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 11, 789–799
  (2013).
- 7013.Dethlefsen, L., McFall-Ngai, M. & Relman, D. A. An ecological and evolutionary
- perspective on human–microbe mutualism and disease. *Nature* **449**, 811–818 (2007).
- 4. Brownlie, J. C. & Johnson, K. N. Symbiont-mediated protection in insect hosts. *Trends Microbiol.* 17, 348–354 (2009).
- 5. Kiers, E. T. & Denison, R. F. Sanctions, cooperation, and the stability of plant-rhizosphere mutualisms. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst* 39, 215–236 (2008).
- King, K. C. *et al.* Rapid evolution of microbe-mediated protection against pathogens in a worm host. *ISME J.* 10, 1915–1924 (2016).
- 709 7. Tso, G. H. W. *et al.* Experimental evolution of a fungal pathogen into a gut symbiont.
  710 *Science* 362, 589–595 (2018).
- 8. Berendsen, R. L. *et al.* Disease-induced assemblage of a plant-beneficial bacterial consortium. *ISME J.* 12, 1496–1507 (2018).
- 9. Sasse, J., Martinoia, E. & Northen, T. Feed your friends: do plant exudates shape the root microbiome? *Trends Plant Sci.* 23, 25–41 (2018).
- Bakker, P. A. H. M., Pieterse, C. M. J., de Jonge, R. & Berendsen, R. L. The soil-borne
   legacy. *Cell* 172, 1178–1180 (2018).
- Johnson, N. C., Graham, J. H. & Smith, F. A. Functioning of mycorrhizal associations
  along the mutualism-parasitism continuum. *New Phytol.* 135, 575–586 (1997).
- 719 12. Kogel, K. H., Franken, P. & Hückelhoven, R. Endophyte or parasite what decides? *Curr*.
  720 *Opin. Plant Biol.* 9, 358–363 (2006).
- 13. Cosme, M., Fernández, I., Van der Heijden, M. G. A. & Pieterse, C. M. J. Nonmycorrhizal plants: the exceptions that prove the rule. *Trends in Plant Science* 23, 577–
  587 (2018).
- Wein, T. *et al.* Currency, exchange, and inheritance in the evolution of symbiosis. *Trends Microbiol.* 27, 836–849 (2019).
- 15. Chomicki, G., Kiers, E. T. & Renner, S. S. The evolution of mutualistic dependence. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 51, annurev-ecolsys-110218-024629 (2020).
- Stringlis, I. A., Zhang, H., Pieterse, C. M. J., Bolton, M. D. & De Jonge, R. Microbial
  small molecules-weapons of plant subversion. *Natural Product Reports* 35, 410–433
  (2018).
- 17. Kramer, J., Özkaya, Ö. & Kümmerli, R. Bacterial siderophores in community and host interactions. *Nature Reviews Microbiology* 18, 152–163 (2020).
- 18. Kawecki, T. J. et al. Experimental evolution. Trends Ecol. Evol. 27, 547–560 (2012).
- Jousset, A., Lara, E., Wall, L. G. & Valverde, C. Secondary metabolites help biocontrol strain *Pseudomonas fluorescens* CHA0 to escape protozoan grazing. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **72**, 7083–7090 (2006).
- Brazelton, J. N., Pfeufer, E. E., Sweat, T. A., Gardener, B. B. M. & Coenen, C. 2, 4Diacetylphloroglucinol alters plant root development. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 21, 1349–1358 (2008).
- Chaparro, J. M. *et al.* Root exudation of phytochemicals in *Arabidopsis* follows specific
   patterns that are developmentally programmed and correlate with soil microbial functions.

742 *PLoS One* **8**, e55731 (2013).

- Stringlis, I. A. *et al.* MYB72-dependent coumarin exudation shapes root microbiome assembly to promote plant health. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 115, E5213–E5222 (2018).
- Voges, M. J. E. E. E., Bai, Y., Schulze-Lefert, P. & Sattely, E. S. Plant-derived coumarins shape the composition of an *Arabidopsis* synthetic root microbiome. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* U. S. A. 116, 12558–12565 (2019).
- Zamioudis, C. *et al.* Rhizobacterial volatiles and photosynthesis-related signals coordinate
   *MYB72* expression in Arabidopsis roots during onset of induced systemic resistance and
   iron-deficiency responses. *Plant J.* 84, 309–322 (2015).
- Barrick, J. E. & Lenski, R. E. Genome dynamics during experimental evolution. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 14, 827–839 (2013).
- Yang, L. *et al.* Evolutionary dynamics of bacteria in a human host environment. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 108, 7481–7486 (2011).
- 756 27. Haas, D. & Défago, G. Biological control of soil-borne pathogens by fluorescent pseudomonads. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 3, 307–319 (2005).
- Reyrat, J. M., David, M., Batut, J. & Boistard, P. FixL of *Rhizobium meliloti* enhances the transcriptional activity of a mutant FixJD54N protein by phosphorylation of an alternate residue. *J. Bacteriol.* **176**, 1969–1976 (1994).
- 29. Laville, J. *et al.* Global control in *Pseudomonas fluorescens* mediating antibiotic synthesis
  and suppression of black root rot of tobacco. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 89, 1562–1566 (1992).
- 30. Bull, C. T. *et al.* Characterization of spontaneous *gacS* and *gacA* regulatory mutants of
   *Pseudomonas fluorescens* biocontrol strain CHA0. *Antonie Van Leeuwenhoek* 79, 327–336
   (2001).
- 766 31. Zhang, R. *et al.* Structure of a bacterial quorum-sensing transcription factor complexed
  767 with pheromone and DNA. *Nature* 417, 971–974 (2002).
- Battesti, A., Majdalani, N. & Gottesman, S. The RpoS-mediated general stress response in *Escherichia coli. Annu. Rev. Microbiol* 65, 189–213 (2011).
- 33. Stockwell, V. O. & Loper, J. E. The sigma factor RpoS is required for stress tolerance and environmental fitness of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* Pf-5. *Microbiology* 151, 3001–3009 (2005).
- Heeb, S., Valverde, C. & Haas, D. Role of the stress sigma factor RpoS in GacA / RsmAcontrolled secondary metabolism and resistance to oxidative stress in *Pseudomonas fluorescens* CHA0. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 243, 251–258 (2005).
- 35. Whiteley, M. *et al.* Gene expression in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilms. *Nature* 413, 860–864 (2001).
- Ramey, B. E., Koutsoudis, M., Bodman, S. B. V. & Fuqua, C. Biofilm formation in plantmicrobe associations. *Current Opinion in Microbiology* 7, 602–609 (2004).
- Fukami, T., Beaumont, H. J. E., Zhang, X. X. & Rainey, P. B. Immigration history
  controls diversification in experimental adaptive radiation. *Nature* 446, 436–439 (2007).
- Fukami, T. Historical contingency in community assembly: integrating niches, species
  pools, and priority effects. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 46, 1–23 (2015).
- Rainey, P. B. & Travisano, M. Adaptive radiation in a heterogeneous environment. *Nature* **394**, 69–70 (1998).
- 40. Gómez, P. & Buckling, A. Real-time microbial adaptive diversification in soil. *Ecol. Lett.*16, 650–655 (2013).
- 41. Houte, S. et al. Compost spatial heterogeneity promotes evolutionary diversification of a

789 bacterium. J. Evol. Biol. jeb.13722 (2020). doi:10.1111/jeb.13722 790 42. Klironomos, J. N. Feedback with soil biota contributes to plant rarity and invasiveness in 791 communities. Nature 417, 67-70 (2002). 792 Kardol, P., Martijn Bezemer, T. & van der Putten, W. H. Temporal variation in plant-soil 43. 793 feedback controls succession. Ecol. Lett. 9, 1080-1088 (2006). 794 Batstone, R. T., O'Brien, A. M., Harrison, T. L. & Frederickson, M. E. Experimental 44. 795 evolution makes microbes more cooperative with their local host genotype. Science 370, 796 476-478 (2020). 797 45. Ramette, A. et al. Pseudomonas protegens sp. nov., widespread plant-protecting bacteria 798 producing the biocontrol compounds 2,4-diacetylphloroglucinol and pyoluteorin. Syst. 799 Appl. Microbiol. 34, 180–188 (2011). 800 46. Stutz, E. W., Défago, G. & Kern, H. Naturally occurring fluorescent pseudomonads 801 involved in suppression of black root rot of tobacco. *Phytopathology* **76**, 181–185 (1986). 802 47. Jousset, A. et al. Full-genome sequence of the plant growth-promoting bacterium 803 Pseudomonas protegens CHA0. Genome Announc. 2, e00322-14 (2014). 804 48. King, E. O., Ward, M. K. & Raney, D. E. Two simple media for the demonstration of 805 pyocyanin and fluorescin. J. Lab. Clin. Med. 44, 301-307 (1954). 49. Glickmann, E. & Dessaux, Y. A critical examination of the specificity of the salkowski 806 reagent for indolic compounds produced by phytopathogenic bacteria. Appl. Environ. 807 808 Microbiol. 61, 793–796 (1995). 809 50. Alexander, D. B. & Zuberer, D. A. Use of chrome azurol S reagents to evaluate 810 siderophore production by rhizosphere bacteria. Biol. Fertil. Soils 12, 39-45 (1991). 811 51. Smeltzer, M. S., Hart, M. E. & Iandolo, J. J. Phenotypic characterization of xpr, a global 812 regulator of extracellular virulence factors in Staphylococcus aureus. Infect. Immun. 61, 813 919-925 (1993). 814 52. Oberhänsli, T., Défago, G. & Haas, D. Indole-3-acetic acid (IAA) synthesis in the 815 biocontrol strain CHA0 of *Pseudomonas fluorescens*: role of tryptophan side chain 816 oxidase. Microbiology 137, 2273–2279 (1991). 817 53. Moskowitz, S. M., Foster, J. M., Emerson, J. & Burns, J. L. Clinically feasible biofilm susceptibility assay for isolates of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* from patients with cystic 818 819 fibrosis. J. Clin. Microbiol. 42, 1915–1922 (2004). 820 Harrison, J. J. et al. Microtiter susceptibility testing of microbes growing on peg lids: a 54. miniaturized biofilm model for high-throughput screening. Nat. Protoc. 5, 1236-1254 821 822 (2010). 823 Zamioudis, C., Mastranesti, P., Dhonukshe, P., Blilou, I. & Pieterse, C. M. J. Unraveling 55. 824 root developmental programs initiated by beneficial Pseudomonas spp bacteria. Plant 825 Physiol. 162, 304–318 (2013). 826 56. Højberg, O., Schnider, U., Winteler, H. V., Sørensen, J. & Haas, D. Oxygen-sensing reporter strain of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* for monitoring the distribution of low-oxygen 827 828 habitats in soil. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 65, 4085–4093 (1999). Millet, Y. A. et al. Innate immune responses activated in Arabidopsis roots by microbe-829 57. associated molecular patterns. Plant Cell 22, 973-990 (2010). 830 831 58. Hafner, M., Niepel, M., Chung, M. & Sorger, P. K. Growth rate inhibition metrics correct 832 for confounders in measuring sensitivity to cancer drugs. Nat. Methods 13, 521-527 (2016). 833 834 59. Tritt, A., Eisen, J. A., Facciotti, M. T. & Darling, A. E. An integrated pipeline for de novo 835 assembly of microbial genomes. PLoS One 7, e42304 (2012).

- 836 60. Seemann, T. Prokka: rapid prokaryotic genome annotation. *Bioinformatics* 30, 2068–2069
  837 (2014).
- 838 61. Quinlan, A. R. & Hall, I. M. BEDTools: a flexible suite of utilities for comparing genomic features. *Bioinformatics* 26, 841–842 (2010).
- Kai Lee, H. *et al.* High-resolution melting approach to efficient identification and
  quantification of H275Y mutant influenza H1N1/2009 virus in mixed-virus-population
  samples. J. Clin. Microbiol. 49, 3555–3559 (2011).
- 843 63. Zhong, W.-L. *et al.* Development of unlabeled probe based high-resolution melting
  844 analysis for detection of filaggrin gene mutation c.3321delA. *J. Clin. Lab. Anal.* 30, 892–
  845 896 (2016).
- 64. Capper, R. L. *et al.* Quantitative high resolution melting: two methods to determine SNP allele frequencies from pooled samples. *BMC Genet.* 16, 62 (2015).
- 848 65. Jousset, A. *et al.* Predators promote defence of rhizosphere bacterial populations by 849 selective feeding on non-toxic cheaters. *ISME J.* **3**, 666–674 (2009).
- 850 66. Ross-Gillespie, A., Gardner, A., West, S. A. & Griffin, A. S. Frequency dependence and cooperation: theory and a test with bacteria. *Am. Nat.* **170**, 331–342 (2007).
- 852

#### 853 Acknowledgments:

- 854 We thank Roy van der Meijs for his excellent work on the scopoletin sensitivity assays and Ke Yu,
- 855 Roeland Berendsen and members of the Plant-Microbe Interactions lab for helpful discussion. This
- 856 work was supported by a China Scholarship Council fellowship (to E.L.), a postdoctoral fellowship
- 857 of the Research Foundation Flanders (FWO 12B8116RN) (to R.D.J.) and Royal Society Research
- Grants (grant nos. RSG\R1\180213 and CHL\R1\180031) at the University of York (V-P.F).

#### 859 Author contributions:

- 860 EL, PB and AJ designed the experiments. EL, HJ and CL performed the experiment. EL, RJ and
- AJ analysed the data. All authors collegially wrote the manuscript.

#### 862 **Declaration of Interests:**

- 863 Authors declare no competing interests.
- 864

865	Supplementary Materials for
866	Rapid evolution of bacterial mutualism in the plant rhizosphere
867	Data and materials availability:
868	The P. protegens CHA0-GFP reference strain genome sequence, determined for this study, is
869	deposited on GenBank: <u>RCSR00000000.1.</u> Raw sequencing data used in this study are deposited
870	at the NCBI database under BioProject PRJNA473919. Raw data of P. protegens CHA0
871	phenotypic traits, Supplementary dataset 1 and 2, are deposited at Mendeley Data: DOI:
872	10.17632/wh3ytm5rn8.1
873	
874	The following file includes:
875	Figs. S1 to S7
876	Tables S1 to S4

- 877 Legends of supplementary dataset 1 and 2

![](_page_42_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_42_Figure_2.jpeg)

879

880 Figure S1. Overview of the experimental design. In this study, we experimentally evolved Pseudomonas protegens CHA0 in the rhizosphere of sterile Arabidopsis thaliana plants. We used 881 a gnotobiotic, organic carbon-free soil system in which bacterial fitness strictly depended on their 882 883 interaction with plants. We set up five independent plant replicate lines, which were passed over six plant growth cycles (4 weeks each). To this end, 10<sup>6</sup> cells of the ancestral *P. protegens* CHA0 884 strain were introduced to the rhizosphere of two A. thaliana seedlings grown in sterile silver sand 885 886 supplemented with a plant nutrient solution in sterile ECO2 boxes. At the end of each growth cycle, the rhizosphere bacterial population was harvested, and  $10^6$  cells were inoculated onto a new plant. 887 The remaining bacteria were kept as frozen stock at -80 °C. At the end of the experiment, bacteria 888 889 from the -80 °C stock were plated on 3 g l<sup>-1</sup> Tryptic Soy Agar and sixteen single bacterial isolates 890 were randomly selected from each replicate line at the end of the second, fourth and sixth growth 891 cycle. In total, 240 evolved isolates and sixteen ancestral isolates were phenotyped regarding traits 892 associated with bacterial fitness and mutualistic activity with the plant.

![](_page_43_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_43_Figure_2.jpeg)

Figure S2. K-means clustering analysis of evolved *Pseudomonas protegens* CHA0 isolates. Isolated colonies were classified based on 14 phenotypic traits associated with bacterial fitness in the rhizosphere and mutualistic activity with the plant. In panel A, the x-axis ("Objects") represents the 256 screened isolates while the y-axis represents the potential number of clusters (K) shown in different colours. Panel B shows the SSI criterion values indicating the most parsimonious number of clusters needed to classify isolates into distinct phenotypic groups. Based on this analysis, we classified the isolates into five clusters (the highest SSI criterion value).

![](_page_44_Figure_1.jpeg)

902 Figure S3. Comparing the differences in extracellular proteolytic and antifungal activity of 903 ancestral and evolved *Pseudomonas protegens* CHA0 isolates. We measured the proteolytic (A) 904 and antifungal activity (B) as a proxy for secondary metabolite production. In total, we 905 characterized 16 ancestral, 119 ancestral-like, 11 stress-sensitive, 37 mutualist 1, 31 mutualist 2 906 and 41 transient isolates (Supplementary dataset 1). In panel A, the blue arrow indicates one isolate 907 that was phenotypically clustered as mutualist 2, but genetically bearing a unique *fleQ* mutation. 908 Statistical testing was carried out using ANOVA. Different letters indicate significant differences 909 based on a Tukey HSD test ( $\alpha$ =0.05).

![](_page_45_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_45_Figure_2.jpeg)

912 Figure S4. Comparing biofilm formation, biotic and abiotic stress resistance of ancestral and 913 evolved Pseudomonas protegens CHA0 isolates. In total, we characterized 16 ancestral, 119 914 ancestral-like, 11 stress-sensitive, 37 mutualist 1, 31 mutualist 2 and 41 transient isolates 915 (Supplementary dataset 1). Panels A to C show biofilm formation, biotic stress resistance index 916 (normalised PC1 of combined ability to grow in the presence of sub lethal doses of the antibiotics 917 streptomycin, tetracycline and penicillin) and abiotic stress resistance index (normalised first 918 principal component of combined ability of each isolate to grow under oxidative stress, water 919 potential stress and salt stress) respectively. Statistical testing was carried out using ANOVA. 920 Different letters indicate significant differences based on a Tukey HSD test ( $\alpha$ =0.05).

![](_page_46_Figure_1.jpeg)

923 Figure S5. Positive relationship between phenotype frequency at the end of the selection 924 experiment and isolate effect on the plant performance. Five representative bacterial isolates 925 from each phenotype in addition to the ancestor were selected to measure their effects on 926 Arabidopsis thaliana growth in terms of combined 'Plant performance' index (30 isolates 927 altogether, each replicate line represented; See Table S2). The y-axis represents the beneficial 928 effect of isolates on plant performance relative to the ancestor. Values on the x-axis show the 929 relative abundance of evolved phenotypes in their respective selection lines at the end of the sixth 930 plant growth cycle (see Figure 1). Colours and shapes represent different phenotypes and selection 931 lines, respectively.

![](_page_47_Figure_1.jpeg)

934 Figure S6. Induction of MYB72 assayed in a GUS reporter line in Arabidopsis thaliana by the

- 935 ancestor and a subset of evolved Pseudomonas protegens CHA0 isolates. GUS staining was
- 936 performed at 2 days after bacterial inoculation (n = 3 biological plant replicates, each containing 5
- 937 to 6 seedlings). See Table S2 for detailed information of the isolates.

![](_page_48_Figure_1.jpeg)

**Figure S7** Standard curves of measured mutant versus ancestor proportion as a function of the actual proportion, using series of mixed samples with known proportions (0%, 10%, 20%, 30%, 40%, 50%, 60%, 70%, 80%, 90% and 100% of mutant templates). Relative densities of mutant  $gacA^{D49Y}$ ,  $gacA^{D54Y}$ , and  $gacS^{G27D}$  were measured by PCR-based high-resolution melting profile (RQ-HRM) analysis. Measurements for each sample were done in triplicate. In each plot, the black dots represent the measurements, the blue fit line was generated based on linear regression model.

946 Table S1. In vitro measurement of different aspects of bacterial life-history traits, including 947 bacterial growth, tolerance to diverse abiotic and biotic stresses, production (or activity) of 948 bioactive compounds and antimicrobial activity. In total, 14 different phenotypic traits were 949 measured for 256 *Pseudomonas protegens* CHA0 isolates in this study including 16 isolated 950 isolates of ancestor.

Aspects of life-history traits	Details of measured traits				
Bacterial growth yield	Bacterial growth yield in King's medium B				
Stress tolerance	Growth yield under abiotic stresses: oxidative stress, water potential stress, salt stress Growth yield under biotic stresses (antibiotics): streptomycin stress, tetracycline stress, penicillin stress				
Production (or activity) of bioactive compounds	IAA (auxin) production, siderophore activity, quorum sensing (TSO) activity, proteolytic activity, biofilm formation				
Antimicrobial activity	Antifungal activity: Verticillium dahliae Antibacterial activity: Ralstonia solanacearum				

952 Table S2. Description of 5 ancestral and 25 evolved Pseudomonas protegens CHA0 isolates, which 953 were included to phenotyping and genotyping assays. "Sample ID" is the unique identifier of each 954 isolate and five isolates were selected from each phenotype class. The "Plant cycle" column refers 955 to the plant growth cycle from which the isolate was collected (see Figure S1) and the "Replicate" 956 column refers to the independent plant replicate selection line. Mutated genes were identified using 957 whole genome re-sequencing. On average, each evolved isolate encompassed 2-3 mutations 958 relative to the ancestral sequence that are typically non-synonymous in nature, *i.e.* they directly 959 affect predicted protein sequence and/or protein length. The same Sample ID superscript numbers 960 shown on bold (133 and 242, 66 and 222, 28 and 220) indicate paired samples used in relative 961 competition assays presented in Figure 5.

Phenotype	Sample	Plant	Replicate	Genotype
	ID	cycle		
Ancestor	7	0	Ancestor	_
Ancestor	31	0	Ancestor	_
Ancestor	79	0	Ancestor	_
Ancestor	127	0	Ancestor	_
Ancestor	163	0	Ancestor	_
Ancestral-like	52	4	Line 2	$galE^{V32M}$
Ancestral-like	65	2	Line 3	_
Ancestral-like	70	4	Line 5	_
Ancestral-like	80	4	Line 4	_
Ancestral-like	86	4	Line 1	$oafA^{ m Y335X} \cdot RS17350^{ m A77A.fsX14} \cdot wbpM^{ m G79R}$
Stress-sensitive	90	4	Line 3	$nlpD^{Q197P}$
Stress-sensitive	160	4	Line 2	$galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K} \cdot yvaQ2^{-9G>T}$
Stress-sensitive	239	6	Line 5	$rpoS^{Q65X} \cdot tetR^{Y127X}$
Stress-sensitive	262	6	Line 5	rpoS <sup>Q65X</sup>
Stress-sensitive	263	6	Line 5	rpoS <sup>Q65X</sup>
Mutualist 1	28 <sup>2</sup>	4	Line 2	$galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K}$
Mutualist 1	188	4	Line 4	gacA <sup>-40T&gt;A</sup>
Mutualist 1	222 <sup>3</sup>	6	Line 3	$oafA^{K338S.fsX18} \cdot gacS^{G27D}$

Mutualist 1	242 <sup>1</sup>	6	Line 1	$oafA^{Y335X} \cdot RS17350^{A77A.fsX14} \cdot gacA^{D49Y}$
Mutualist 1	268	6	Line 2	$galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K} \cdot gacA^{G97S} \cdot mraZ^{-211A>G}$
Mutualist 2	68	4	Line 4	$gacA^{-40T>A} \cdot RS11820^{33C>T}$
Mutualist 2	172	4	Line 2	gacA <sup>Y183S</sup>
Mutualist 2	220 <sup>2</sup>	6	Line 2	$galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K} \cdot gacA^{D54Y}$
Mutualist 2	251	6	Line 5	$fleQ^{R320Q}$
Mutualist 2	260	6	Line 4	$gacA^{E38X} \cdot RS11785^{S256C} \cdot flhA^{H393Q.fsX15}$
Transient	16	4	Line 2	$galE^{V32M} \cdot accC^{E413K}$
Transient	21	2	Line 4	hult <sup>786C&gt;T</sup>
Transient	58	4	Line 5	_
Transient	<b>66</b> <sup>3</sup>	4	Line 3	oafA <sup>K338S.fsX18</sup>
Transient	133 <sup>1</sup>	2	Line 1	$oafA^{Y335X} \cdot RS17350^{A77A.fsX14}$

963

Note: X, represents a stop codon (at its relative position in case of a shifted frame); fs, frame shift; sequence change positions are relative to the cDNA.

Gene	Product	Locus tag	DNA change	Effect
accC	Biotin carboxylase, acetyl-CoA carboxylase	PFLCHA0_RS03400	c.1237 G>A	p.E413K
flhA	Flagellar biosynthesis protein FlhA	PFLCHA0_RS08490	c.1154 T deleted	early stop
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	c.548 A>C	p.Y183S
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	c.289 G>A	p.G97S
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	c.160 G>T	p.D54Y
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	c.145 G>T	p.D49Y
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	c.112 G>T	p.E38*
gacA	Response regulator GacA	PFLCHA0_RS17965	-40 T>A	promoter
galE	UDP-glucose 4-epimerase	PFLCHA0_RS09920	c.94 G>A	p.V32M
RS11785	LysR family transcriptional regulator	PFLCHA0_RS11785	c.766 A>T	p.S256C
hutI	Imidazolonepropionase	PFLCHA0_RS02080	c.786 C>T	synonymous
RS11820	Paal family thioesterase	PFLCHA0_RS11820	c.33 C>T	synonymous
yvaQ2	Metyl-accepting chemotaxis protein	PFLCHA0_RS13000	-9bp G>T	promoter
mraZ	Transcriptional regulator mraZ	PFLCHA0_RS25175	-211bp A>G	promoter
	Lipoprotein nlpD/lppB/LysM domain-containing			
nlpD	protein	PFLCHA0_RS31060	c.590 A>C	p.Q197P
	Sigma-54-dependent Fis family transcriptional			
fleQ	regulator	PFLCHA0_RS08340	c.959 G>A	p.R320Q
oafA	O-acetyltransferase OatA	PFLCHA0_RS09890	c.1005 C>A	p.Y335*
oafA	O-acetyltransferase OatA	PFLCHA0_RS09890	c.1009 A deleted	early stop

**Table S3.** Overview of the affected genes that are identified in the 25 evolved *Pseudomonas protegens* CHA0 isolates (See Table S2).

wbpM	Polysaccharide	biosynthesis	protein/NDP-sugar			
	epimerase			PFLCHA0_RS21855	c.235 G>C	p.G79R
rpoS	RNA polymerase	e sigma factor F	RpoS	PFLCHA0_RS06125	c.193 C>T	p.Q65*
RS17350	Methyltransferase domain-containing protein			PFLCHA0_RS17350	c.116 C deleted	early stop

- 968 **Table S4** Primers and probes used for high-resolution melting (HRM) analysis. For the two *gacA* mutants the same set of primers was
- 969 used. Underlined bases indicate the position of the single nucleotide point (SNP) mutations within the probe sequences. ΔTm (°C)
- 970 indicates the melting temperature difference between WT-probe duplex and mutant-probe duplex.

Target gene	Strain ID	SNP locus	Forward primer (excess)	Reverse primer (limiting)	Amplicon size	Probe sequence	Probe length	Target strand	Perfect match/ mismatch	⊿Tm (°C)
gacA <sup>D49Y</sup>	242	145G>T	5'-	5'-	2051	5'- CATCAGGACCACA T <u>C</u> GGGCTTCAGCT CCCG-/C3/3'	30nt	WT	G::C / T::C	5.31
gacA <sup>D54Y</sup>	220	160G>T	ATCGATGGCCTGCAAGTAG T-3'	3'	200 00	5'- TGGCATCTTGACG T <u>C</u> CATCAGGACCA CATC-/C3/3'	30nt	WT	G::C / T::C	4.92
gacS <sup>G27D</sup>	222	80G>A	5'- GCGTACTGTTGCTGACCTTG -3'	5'- AGCATCTGGGTGTTGTGGTT- 3'	178bp	5'- AGGTGAAGTAGCC G <u>C</u> CCAGCACCAAA GCCA-/C3/3'	30nt	WT	G::C / A::C	4.83

Supplementary dataset 1: Sheet 1: Summary table for the set of fourteen phenotypic traits for the 256 characterised isolates used for
K-mean clustering. Sheet 2: Carbon use data for the 256 characterised isolates. In both sheets, each line corresponds to one isolate and
each column to one specific trait. See material and methods for a detailled description of experimental procedures.
Supplementary dataset 2: Sheet 1: Recapitulation of the origin (replicate line), time point and phenotype of each of the 30 isolates
tested in details for their interactions with the host plant. Sheet 2: Summary table for interactions between each of the 30 isolates tested
for plant growth, including effect on plant performance and induced GUS expression. Sheet 3: Scopoletin sensitivity. See material and

978 methods for a detailled description of experimental procedures.