Host-generalist fungal pathogens of seedlings may maintain forest diversity via host-

specific impacts and differential susceptibility among tree species

Erin R. Spear[1*] and Kirk Broders[1]

1. Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Panama City, Panama, Republic of

Panama.

*Corresponding author: erin.r.spear@gmail.com

Summary

• Host-specialized pathogens are credited with the maintenance of tropical forest

diversity under the Janzen-Connell hypothesis. Yet, in diverse forests, selection

may favor pathogens with broad host ranges given their passive dispersal and the

relative rarity of tree species.

• We surveyed the host associations of potential pathogens isolated from

symptomatic seedlings in the forests in Panama and used inoculations to assess:

(i) the pathogenicity and host ranges of 27 fungal isolates, and (ii) differences

among tree species in susceptibility.

• Thirty-one of the 33 non-singleton OTUs isolated from seedlings are multi-host.

All 31 multi-host OTUs exhibit low to moderate specialization, and we observed

phylogenetically overdispersed host use for 19 OTUs. The pathogenicity of 10

isolates was experimentally confirmed; nine caused disease in seedlings in

multiple families. However, the outcome of infection differs among tree species

susceptible to a given multi-host pathogen. Furthermore, some tree species were

seemingly resistant to all fungi tested, while others were susceptible to multiple

fungi. Tree species adapted to environments with lower disease pressure were

most likely to exhibit disease.

• Our results suggest that generalist pathogens contribute to the maintenance of

local and regional forest diversity via host-specific impacts and the exclusion of

disease-sensitive trees from disease-prone habitats.

Key words: *Clonostachys*, host generalists, host-specific impacts, multi-host pathogens,

Mycoleptodiscus, Nectriaceae, seedlings, tropical forests

Introduction

The maintenance of local diversity is commonly attributed to host-specific natural enemies believed to prevent any single host species from becoming competitively dominant. Under the Janzen-Connell hypothesis (JCH), conspecific seeds and seedlings at high densities near conspecific adults suffer disproportionately higher mortality relative to heterospecific seeds and seedlings due to an accumulation of host-specialized enemies (Gillett, 1962; Janzen, 1970; Connell, 1971; Comita *et al*., 2014). However, support for the JCH has often been based on spatial and temporal patterns of conspecific negative density-dependent mortality (e.g., Harms *et al*., 2000; Comita *et al*., 2010), which cannot identify the mechanism(s) driving the observed patterns.

Experimental studies suggest that pathogens may contribute to density- and distance-dependent mortality of conspecific seedlings (Augspurger & Kelly, 1984; Bell *et al*., 2006; Mangan *et al*., 2010; Bagchi *et al*., 2014). However, the pathogens are rarely identified, and most studies fail to experimentally address a crucial assumption of the JCH, that the pathogens exhibit high host specificity with regard to locally available hosts (but see Packer & Clay, 2000; Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Liu *et al*., 2012). Furthermore, the relative rarity of tree species in diverse tropical forests and the passive dispersal of fungi may select for pathogens with intermediate to broad host ranges (May, 1991; Coley & Barone, 1996). Indeed, mounting evidence from tropical and temperate forests suggests that multi-host pathogens are prevalent (Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Gallery *et al*., 2007; Gilbert & Webb, 2007; Kluger *et al*., 2008; Hersh *et al*., 2012; Schweizer *et al*., 2013; Sarmiento *et al*., 2017; Chen *et al*., 2019).

Pathogens are classified as specialists or generalists based on the number and phylogenetic relatedness of host species (Barrett *et al*., 2009). Host-specialized multi-host pathogens are predicted to exhibit a phylogenetic signal to their host range (Barrett *et al*., 2009). A variety of plant traits influence the outcome of plant-pathogen interactions, specifically susceptibility to infection, and resistance and tolerance post-infection (Coley & Barone, 1996; Bradley *et al*., 2003; Barrett *et al*., 2009). Plant defense traits are often, but not always, phylogenetically conserved (Fine *et al*., 2006; Agrawal, 2007; Kursar *et al*., 2009). Assuming that closely related plants are more likely to possess similar defense traits, the likelihood of tree species sharing a pathogen should decrease with decreasing

63   phylogenetic relatedness (Barrett *et al.*, 2009). Pathogens specialized at the clade-level

64   could still maintain plant community diversity, but at higher taxonomic levels (Parker *et*

65   *al.*, 2015).

66   While specialist pathogens are invoked under JCH, generalist pathogens may

contribute to the maintenance of host community diversity via effective specialization

(Benítez *et al.*, 2013). One form is host-specific impacts (Sarmiento *et al.*, 2017),

meaning disease severity differs among hosts of a given pathogen. Host-specific impacts

could be an equalizing mechanism that maintains plant community diversity if the growth

and survival of infected seedlings varies among host species (Barrett *et al.*, 2009);

particularly, if differential impacts reflect ecological trade-offs between allocation of

resources to defense, competitive ability, and/or tolerance of stressors. For example, for

tree species adapted to environments with high and/or consistent disease pressure, the

fitness benefits of physical and chemical resistance and/or tolerance traits may outweigh

the associated allocation costs of those traits, while the costs may outweigh the benefits

for tree species adapted to environments with low and/or inconsistent disease pressure

(Haak *et al.*, 2012). The risk of pathogen attack, referred to here as pathogen pressure,

varies with environmental conditions that impact pathogen and plant fitness (Barrett *et*

al., 2009). High pathogen pressure has been observed in areas with low light, high soil

moisture, and persistent fog and dew (Augspurger & Kelly, 1984; Bradley *et al.*, 2003;

Mordecai, 2012; Spear *et al.*, 2015). Plants adapted to environments with high and/or

consistent pathogen pressure may be under selection for increased defenses, whereas

plants adapted to low and/or inconsistent pathogen pressure environments may be poorly

defended (Coley & Barone, 1996, Talley *et al.*, 2002).

86   Here we describe (i) pathogens infecting tree seedlings in the forests of Panama,

(ii) their host ranges, (iii) interspecific variability among tree species in pathogen

susceptibility, and (iv) the relationship between disease susceptibility and plant habitat

associations. We had four central hypotheses. First, in these diverse tropical forests,

seedling pathogens are often multi-host. Second, there is a phylogenetic signal to the host

ranges of these multi-host pathogens (i.e., pathogen sharing is positively correlated with

host relatedness). Third, tree species differ in their susceptibility to pathogens because the

cost-to-benefit ratio of defense traits differs among species (Strauss & Agrawal, 1999;

Endara & Coley, 2010). Fourth, plants adapted to environments with low and/or

inconsistent disease pressure are more susceptible to disease than those adapted to high

and/or consistent disease pressure.

Materials and Methods

Identification of putative pathogens

Potentially pathogenic fungi and oomycetes were isolated from 124 seedlings,

representing 26 tree species in 13 families, with disease on the leaf, stem, and/or root

(Supporting Information Fig. **S1; Table S1**). Symptomatic seedlings were collected from

seven forest sites in 2007, 2010-2012, and 2019 by: (1) opportunistic collection of

naturally occurring seedlings ($n = 59$); (2) collection of seedlings germinated in a

shadehouse and then transplanted to forest sites ($n = 22$), and (3) collection of seedlings

that germinated from surface-sterilized seeds planted directly in the forests ($n = 43$)

(Table **S2**). Most putative pathogens were isolated from leaves (52.13%), followed by

stems (37.44%) and roots (10.43%). Molecular identification was completed by

bidirectional Sanger sequencing of either the nuclear ribosomal Internal Transcribed

Spacer (ITS) region (149 isolates) or the ITS plus an adjacent portion of the large subunit

(ITS+LSU) (62 isolates). See Table **S2** and Spear (2017) for details.

All 211 unique isolates were identified and assigned to operational taxonomic

units (OTUs) based on 99% sequence similarity (minimum overlap of 40 bp) in

Sequencher v. 5.4.6. We used a stringent similarity threshold that splits rather than lumps,

while accounting for ≤1% sequencing error, because we make statements about host

specificity and to avoid masking strain-specific effects (Higgins *et al*., 2011). We

estimated the taxonomic placement of the fungal isolates by querying all 209 edited

sequences against the well-curated Full UNITE+INSD dataset for Fungi (v. 8.2, released

2020-02-04; Abarenkov *et al*., 2020) (detailed in Methods **S1**). For the two oomycetes,

we queried their sequences against GenBank (accessed 8-Oct-2020; Benson *et al*., 2012)

and the curated database *Phytophthora*-ID (v. 2.0, accessed 8-Oct-2020; Grünwald *et al*.,

2011). All assigned nomenclatures represent estimates as: (i) the ITS region is an

imprecise barcode for species discrimination for certain taxa; (ii) multi-locus phylogenies

are required for accuracy; and (iii) precision is limited by incomplete taxonomic and

geographic coverage of databases (Kang *et al*., 2010; Hofstetter *et al*., 2019; Lücking *et*

al., 2020). Additionally, sequences in the UNITE database are clustered into

hypothesized species-level groups (Species Hypotheses, SHs) based on sequence

similarity thresholds ranging from 97–100% (Kõljalg *et al*., 2013; Robbertse *et al*.,

2017), while we used 99% sequence similarity to designate OTUs because 97-98.5% is

too relaxed for species delimitation for some taxa (Lücking *et al*., 2020). Because our

grouping strategy often differed from that of the UNITE database, multiple, distinct

OTUs in our study sometimes share the same nomenclature based on the SH of the best-

matching UNITE reference sequence (e.g., OTUs Z and AAG are both annotated as

Colletotrichum brevisporum). Finally, for certain groups of fungi, UNITE SHs

erroneously include distinct species (Robbertse *et al*., 2017).

Sequences for the 90 previously published fungal isolates (Spear, 2017) were

submitted to the NCBI GenBank database (KY413686–KY413775). Sequences for the

121 isolates collected in 2019 will be submitted to GenBank (XXXXXXX–

XXXXXXX).

To characterize sampling efficacy and the relative abundance of OTUs, we

calculated the richness of observed OTUs and plotted the taxon accumulation curve

(vegan package; Oksanen *et al*., 2019) and rank-abundance distribution (BiodiversityR

package; Kindt & Coe, 2005) ($n = 211$ isolates from 124 seedlings). We defined OTUs

observed ≥10 times as abundant.

Survey-based assessments of host associations and ranges of putative pathogens

Our survey-based assessments of the host associations and ranges of putative

pathogens utilize our full dataset ($n = 211$ isolates, representing 66 OTUs, from 26 tree

species) and two subsets to ameliorate the influence of undersampled taxa. Subset A

excludes singleton OTUs ($n = 178$ isolates, representing 33 OTUs, from 24 tree species)

and B excludes singleton and doubleton OTUs and tree species ($n = 144$ isolates,

representing 22 OTUs, from 13 tree species). All three datasets include isolates collected

in all 5 yr.

We used four approaches to characterize host associations. We (1) summed and

plotted the number of observed host tree species (unweighted links) (full dataset), and (2)

calculated Blüthgen's weighted specialization index d' for each of the 33 non-singleton

OTUs (subset A; bipartite package; Blüthgen *et al*., 2006; Dormann *et al*., 2008). The d′ index is useful for identifying discriminatory host use because it accounts for interaction strength (i.e., strong, frequent vs. weak, occasional interactions) and sampling intensity, while the number of interacting partners does neither (Blüthgen *et al*., 2006; Dormann, 2011). The index estimates specialization by calculating the degree to which observed differs from expected host use given partner availability (Blüthgen *et al*., 2006; Dormann, 2011). We could not adjust for the relative abundances of tree species when calculating d′ as the tree species are not uniformly distributed across the seven forest sites (Pyke *et al*., 2001). Thus, we relied on the interaction matrix's marginal sums (column- and row-wise totals) as a measure of partner availability, meaning that, for our data, a generalized microbe infects tree species proportional to their sampling intensities, while a specialized microbe infects tree species independent of their sampling intensities (Blüthgen *et al*., 2006). We considered d' values ranging from 0–0.33, 0.34–0.67, and 0.68–1.00 to represent low, moderate, and high specialization, respectively (Blüthgen *et al*., 2006; Spear & Mordecai, 2018). We (3) calculated the observed number of shared OTUs (rich package; Rossi, 2011) and, because that metric generally results in an underestimation of similarity due to undetected species, we (4) estimated similarities in the communities of putative pathogens shared between pairs of tree species via the inverse of the Chao dissimilarity index (vegan package; Oksanen *et al*., 2019) (full dataset and subset B). The Chao index accounts for the relative abundances of observed OTUs and unseen shared OTUs, making it relatively robust to unequal sampling and diverse guilds with many rare taxa (Chao *et al*., 2005).

To determine if there is a phylogenetic signal to the host ranges of the OTUs, (i) we used mean pairwise phylogenetic distance (MPD) to determine if a given multi-host OTU infects phylogenetically clustered or dispersed hosts, and (ii) we used two binomial generalized linear models (GLMs) (logit link) to determine whether putative pathogen community similarity is positively correlated with host relatedness. Specifically, for the 31 OTUs isolated from ≥2 tree species, we compared the observed MPD between tree species infected by a given OTU to the MPD expected under a null model with random host-OTU associations (full dataset; 999 randomizations of the host phylogeny tip labels; picante and ape packages; Kembel *et al*., 2010; Paradis & Schliep, 2018). For the GLMs,

187   we used our full dataset and subset B, and we regressed and plotted the pairwise

188   estimated community similarities (1 - Chao index) against the pairwise phylogenetic

189   distances. The phylogeny of tree species was generated by Phylomatic

190   (phylodiversity.net/phylomatic/), which called the Zanne *et al*. (2014) supertree.

191   We tested for correlations between (i) the frequency with which a given fungal

OTU was isolated and the number of tree species from which it was isolated, and (ii)

sampling intensity (number of seedlings collected) and the number of OTUs isolated

from a given tree species using non-parametric Spearman's rank tests (full dataset; stats

package; R Core Team, 2020). One-tailed tests were used because we had directional,

literature-based *a priori* hypotheses (Quinn & Keough, 2002; Ruxton & Neuhäuser,

2010) that: (i) the most abundant fungal taxa would be multi-host, and (ii) observed

fungal richness associated with a given plant species would increase with increased

sampling (Ferrer & Gilbert, 2003; Spear & Mordecai, 2018).

Experimental assessments of pathogenicity and host range

201   In 2011 and 2012, inoculation experiments were used to assess the pathogenicity

and host specificities of 27 fungal isolates collected in 2010 and 2011 (Fig. **S2a**). We

tested the isolates, representing 18 OTUs, against seedlings of 35 tree species,

representing 20 families (Table **S1**). We could not test four isolates against the tree

species from which they were originally isolated because seeds were unavailable or

available in insufficient quantities (e.g., ERS033; Fig. **3**; Table **S1**). Related, recreating

the exact conditions under which disease developed for a specific fungus-plant

combination is challenging. Thus, some tree species were included as phytometers of

pathogenicity based on previously observed disease susceptibility (e.g., *Luehea*

seemannii, Augspurger & Wilkinson 2007; *Dalbergia retusa*, Spear, personal

observation). Tree species-by-isolate combinations were not fully reciprocal (285 of 945

possible combinations; 3,154 seedlings total) due to space, time, and seed availability

constraints. A given fungal isolate was tested against 3–28 tree species and 48% of

isolates evaluated were tested against seedlings of ≥10 tree species. Because an objective

of the experiments was to describe pathogen host range, once isolates displayed

pathogenicity, we prioritized testing those isolates against additional tree species (12-28

tree species, median 15) over expanding the testing of isolates failing to generate

significant disease. A given tree species was tested against 1–26 isolates, and 29% of tree species were tested against ≥10 isolates.

Our inoculation technique simulated infested plant material in the soil to passively inoculate the seedlings with the fungal isolates selected for screening (modified from Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007). To generate seedlings for the experiments, seeds were collected from forests bordering the Panama Canal (May-Nov. 2011, May-June 2012), surface-sterilized (sequential washes of 95% EtOH [10 s], 10% commercial bleach [2 min], 70% EtOH [2 min]), and germinated in flats of autoclave-sterilized (1 hour at 121º C, twice) commercial soil (Fig. **S2b**). Seedlings were transplanted to individual pots containing autoclaved commercial soil and either rice visibly colonized by one of the isolates or inoculum-free, autoclave-sterilized rice (control/sham treatment) (Fig. **S2c-f**). Depending on seed availability, 5–12 seedlings per species were included in each treatment.

Inoculation experiments were conducted in Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute shadehouses in Gamboa, Panama during the wet seasons of 2011 and 2012 (Fig. **S2a**). The two screened-in shadehouses were covered on all sides with shadecloth and their roofs were covered with plastic to minimize external contamination and to mimic the forest understory. Shadehouse air temperatures (26.1 and 25.6ºC) did not significantly differ from those recorded simultaneously in a nearby forest understory (25.4 and 25.3ºC; Paton, 2019a). Relative humidity was significantly lower in the shadehouses (85.1 and 87.6%) than in the forest understory (95.6 and 96.7%; Paton, 2019b). Photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) reaching the shadehouse seedlings was slightly higher (1.4 and 1.7% of full PAR) than observed in a nearby forest understory (1.3%; Brenes-Arguedas *et al*., 2011). See Table **S3** for details. Light was somewhat variable within a given shadehouse. To counteract this potentially confounding factor, seedlings were rotated among the tables weekly.

Disease was documented every 3 d (for ≤5 wk) and categorized as: (i) mortality; (ii) stem damage (Fig. **S2g-o**); (iii) wilting (Fig. **S2p,q**); and (iv) stunting (Fig. **S2r,s**). A seedling was classified as morbid if it had any of the four symptoms. Wilting was considered a disease symptom because the soil did not dry out (seedlings were hand-watered every 3 d) and pathogens attacking roots can impede water uptake (Yadeta &

Thomma, 2013). Similarly, stunting can indicate pathogen-caused damage to roots and/or

the vascular system (Yadeta & Thomma, 2013). Additionally, stunting may occur

because energy and resources are allocated to defenses and/or tissue replacement rather

than growth (Huot *et al*., 2014). We did not document root damage and could not ascribe

foliar damage to a specific treatment because we observed a synchronous occurrence of

morphologically similar foliar necrosis across distinct treatments and the controls,

suggesting that the causative pathogen (*Xylaria* sp., unpublished data) blew into the

shadehouses. Thus, neither damage type was included in our analyses.

To compare the proportion of symptomatic seedlings in the inoculated versus

inoculum-free control treatments, we used generalized linear models (GLMs) with

binomial error distributions (probit link) and mean bias-reducing score adjustments

(brglm package; Firth, 1993; Kosmidis & Firth, 2009; Kosmidis, 2019). We used bias-

reduced GLMs because we observed complete and quasi-complete separation of data for

some isolate-by-tree species combinations (i.e., treatment perfectly, or near perfectly,

predicted the binary outcome; Albert & Anderson, 1984). The response variables were

presence/absence of (i) general morbidity and (ii) mortality. Each isolate-by-tree species

combination was considered individually for each response variable. We considered an

isolate pathogenic if, for at least one tree species, a significantly greater proportion of

inoculated seedlings were symptomatic than paired control seedlings (using $\alpha = 0.10$

because small sample sizes limited our power to detect treatment effects; Quinn &

Keough, 2002; Thiese *et al*., 2016). We tested for a correlation between the frequency

with which a fungal OTU was isolated and the number of tree species in which it caused

statistically significant disease using a non-parametric Spearman's rank test. We used a

one-tailed test because we had the *a priori* hypothesis that the most abundant fungal taxa

would be multi-host.

Plant traits and disease susceptibility

We used logit-link beta-binomial generalized linear models to explore disease

susceptibility as a function of habitat associations and seed size (aod package; Lesnoff &

Lancelot, 2012). We obtained data for seed size, shade tolerance, and spatial distribution

relative to annual rainfall from published sources (Table **S1**). In all models, the response

variable was presence/absence of morbidity in inoculated seedlings, controlling for the

morbidity observed in paired control seedlings and considering all 27 isolates tested

(pathogens and non-pathogens alike). Because negative relative proportions are

biologically equivalent to zero (no disease caused), and for statistical purposes, we

converted all negative values to zero. We used two global models that contained (i) the

additive main effects of seed size (continuous) and shade tolerance (categorical), and

their interaction, or (ii) the additive main effects of seed size and distribution relative to

rainfall (categorical), and their interaction. We excluded seeds with average dry masses

>3,000 mg to improve model stability. For both categorical predictors, we limited our

comparisons to binary extremes (i.e., only shade-intolerant and -tolerant, and wet- and

dry-site tree species). We analyzed disease as a function of shade tolerance (26 tree

species, 179 observations: 42 for intolerant, 137 for tolerant spp.) and spatial distribution

(15 tree species, 154 observations: 108 for dry-site, 46 for wet-site spp.) separately due to

differences in the availability of trait data. For the two sets of models, automated model

selection and averaging was done based on the global models, the Akaike information

criterion with a correction for small sample sizes (AICc), and ΔAICc ≤ 2 (MuMIn

package; Bartoń, 2020).

All data were processed in R v. 4.0.0 (R Core Team, 2020). In addition to the

aforementioned packages, we used fossil (Vavrek, 2011), ggplot2 (Wickham, 2016),

otuSummary (Yang, 2020), plot.matrix (Klinke, 2019), plyr (Wickham, 2011), reshape2

(Wickham, 2007), and VennDiagram (Chen, 2018) for data formatting and figures.

Results

Abundances and taxonomic assignments of putative pathogens

The 211 isolates represent 66 operational taxonomic units (OTUs); however, the

taxon accumulation curve is non-asymptotic (Fig. **S3b**). Most of the OTUs are relatively

rare, 33 are singletons (Figs **1**, **S3a**; Table **S4**). Four OTUs are common (observed $\geq$10)

and comprised 35% of all isolates: A–*Colletotrichum xanthorrhoeae*, B–Nectriaceae, C–

Mycoleptodiscus suttonii, and F–*Diaporthe tulliensis* (Figs **1**, **S3a**; Table **S4**). The 209

fungal and two oomycete isolates represent five classes (Sordariomycetes,

Dothideomycetes, Agaricomycetes, Eurotiomycetes, Oomycetes) and 11 orders. Most

(81.5%) of the isolates could be assigned to 26 genera; *Colletotrichum*, *Diaporthe,* and

Mycoleptodiscus were most frequently isolated (Fig. **1**; Table **S4**). We observed overlap

in fungal OTUs among the tissues sampled: leaves, stems, and roots (Fig. **S4d**). While

sampling occurred over 5 yr, there was overlap in the tree species and forest sites

sampled, and the isolation and molecular techniques used (Table **S2**). Accordingly, we

observed overlap in fungal OTUs among the years, seedling collection methods, and

isolation media (Fig. **S4a-c**).

Fungi associated with symptomatic seedlings are often host generalists

The non-singleton fungi isolated from symptomatic seedlings are predominately

multi-host generalists with wide host ranges. Of the 33 non-singleton OTUs, 31 were

isolated from 2–9 tree species (median = 3) (Fig. **1**; Table **S4**). The number of tree

species from which a fungal OTU was isolated is positively correlated with isolation

frequency (Spearman's rank correlation: rho = 0.96, $P < 0.001$; blue points Fig. **S5**). A–*C.*

xanthorrhoeae was isolated with the greatest frequency (35 times) and from the greatest

number of tree species (nine in seven families) (Fig. **1**; Table **S4**). Only two of the non-

singleton OTUs (T–*Macrophomina*, X–*Ceratobasidium*) were not multi-host, but each

was isolated only twice, and from the best-sampled tree species, suggesting their

observed host ranges are a sampling artifact (Fig. **1**; Tables **S1, S4**). Based on the

specialization index d', 57.6% of 33 the non-singleton OTUs, including A–*C.*

xanthorrhoeae and B–Nectriaceae, exhibit low host-specialization and 42.4%, including

C–*M. suttonii* and F–*D. tulliensis*, exhibit moderate host-specialization at the species

level (Table **S4**). We observed phylogenetically overdispersed host use for 19 of the 31

multi-host OTUs, significant for B–Nectriaceae and AV–*Cylindrocladiella variabilis*,

and marginally significant for M–*Lasiodiplodia gonubiensis* and AU–*Beltrania*

pseudorhombica (Fig. **1**; Table **S4**). Conversely, 12 OTUs exhibited phylogenetically

clustered host use, marginally significant for R–*Diaporthe fraxini-angustifoliae* and Q–

Diaporthe cf. *columnaris* (Fig. **1**; Table S4). Both OTUs were solely isolated from

Anacardium excelsum (Anacardiaceae, Sapindales) and *Protium panamense*

(Burseraceae, Sapindales), providing tentative evidence of a phylogenetic signal to host

range.

Tree species are infected by various microbes, and their microbial communities overlap

Multiple OTUs were isolated for all tree species with >2 seedlings collected (Fig.

1; Table **S1**). Predictably, the number of OTUs isolated from a given tree species is

strongly positively correlated with sampling intensity (Spearman's rank correlation: rho =

0.95, $P < 0.001$; Fig. **1**). The greatest richness of fungi (24 OTUs) was recovered from

the best-sampled tree species (41 isolates), *A. excelsum* (Table **S1**).

We observed overlap among the microbial communities of distantly related tree

species (Fig. **1**). Based on subset B, only tree species and OTUs observed ≥3 times, the

estimated average similarity (1 - Chao index) between the microbial communities of pairs

of tree species is 0.21 (median = 0.15; Table **S5**). The GLMs suggest microbial

community similarity is unrelated to phylogenetic distance between tree species (Fig. **2**;

full dataset: Est. ± SE = 0.002 ± 0.003, z-value = 0.60, $P = 0.55$; subset B: Est. ± SE =

0.002 ± 0.004, z-value = 0.36, $P = 0.72$).

Identities and impacts of confirmed pathogens

We experimentally confirmed the pathogenicity of 10 of the 27 fungal isolates

tested (Fig. **3**). The pathogenic isolates belong to six OTUs, all in the phylum

Ascomycota, and were isolated from stems, roots, and leaves of seedlings of seven tree

species in seven families (Fig. **3**; Table **1**). Based on morbidity (i.e., any of the four

symptoms: wilting, stunting, stem damage, or mortality), significant pathogenicity was

observed for 20 of the 285 tree species-by-isolate combinations (Fig. **3**; Table **1**). For 13

of these combinations, infection led to mortality (Table **1**). Multiple symptoms were often

observed for a single tree species-by-pathogen combination (e.g., *Annona glabra*

seedlings suffered stem damage, wilt, and mortality when inoculated with isolate

ERS029). Seven of the pathogenic isolates were tested against the tree species from

which they were originally isolated, but for those tree species-by-isolate combinations

neither morbidity nor mortality significantly differed between the inoculated and control

seedlings (Fig. **3**).

Fungi with confirmed pathogenicity are multi-host

We show that fungal pathogens can attack tree species belonging to

phylogenetically dispersed families. Five of the 10 pathogenic isolates successfully

attacked multiple tree species (Table **1**). The 10 pathogenic isolates generated significant

disease in 6–31% of the tree species against which they were tested (median = 10%). At
the high end, ERS029 (C–*Mycoleptodiscus suttonii*) caused significant disease in 31% of
the 13 tree species it was tested against, and the four susceptible tree species belong to
three orders (Fig. **3**; Tables **1**, **S1**).

Three of the OTUs were represented by multiple isolates: B–Nectriaceae, G–
Clonostachys rosea, and C–*M. suttonii*. The two isolates of B–Nectriaceae were
recovered from *Trichilia tuberculata* and *Calophyllum longifolium*, and combined were
pathogenic on six of the 28 tree species tested (Fig. **3**; Table **1**). The three isolates of G–
C. rosea were isolated from *Virola surinamensis* and *Protium tenuifolium*, and combined
caused significant disease on four tree species (Fig. **3**; Table **1**). The two isolates of C–*M.*
suttonii were isolated from *V. surinamensis* and *Randia armata*, and combined caused
significant disease on five species (Fig. **3**; Table **1**). While the tree species-by-isolate
combinations were not fully reciprocal, limiting conclusions, we observed possible strain-
specific effects (e.g., B–Nectriaceae: ERS034 caused significant disease on *Guapira*
standleyana while ERS036 did not; Fig. **3**). Finally, there is a marginally significant
positive association between the frequency with which a fungal OTU was isolated and
the number of tree species in which it caused statistically significant ($\alpha = 0.10$) disease
(Spearman's rank correlation rho = 0.72, *P* = 0.053; green points Fig. **S5**).

Tree species are differentially impacted by pathogens

We documented interspecific differences in disease susceptibility and impact
among tree species. Most tree species tested were seemingly resistant to, or tolerant of,
all isolates tested, suffering minimal to no fitness impacts despite soil inoculation (Fig.
3). For 13 of the 35 tree species tested, at least one of the 27 fungal isolates tested caused
significant disease (Table **1**). Five tree species experienced significant disease from 2–3
of the isolates tested (Table **1**). Those five species experienced significant disease from
10–50% (median = 15%) of the isolates against which they were tested (Fig. **3**).

The 13 susceptible tree species differed in their tolerance of attack. For most of
the susceptible tree species, pathogen attack did not consistently lead to death, the impact
from infection depended on the pathogenic isolate with which it was inoculated. For
example, while *Castilla elastica* seedlings suffered significant disease when inoculated
with two isolates (ERS036, ERS040), they only suffered significant mortality when

inoculated with ERS040 (AAF–Nectriaceae) (Table **1**). Furthermore, for those tree

species that were susceptible to the same multi-host pathogen, the impact from attack

differed among species. For example, isolate ERS036 (B–Nectriaceae) caused significant

morbidity on *C. elastica, Cochlospermum vitifolium,* and *Dalbergia retusa*, but only

caused significant mortality on *C. vitifolium* (Table **1**).

Plant traits and disease susceptibility

408   When considering all 27 fungal isolates tested (pathogens and non-pathogens), the

proportion of morbid seedlings was influenced by a tree species' seed size, spatial

distribution relative to annual rainfall, and shade tolerance (Fig. **4a-d**; Tables **S6**, **S7**).

Shade-intolerant tree species were more likely to exhibit disease than shade-tolerant

species ($P = 0.003$; Fig. **4a,b**; Table **S6**). For both groups, the probability of disease

decreases with increasing seed size, but to a greater extent for shade-intolerant species (P

$= 0.014$; Fig. **4a,b**; Table **S6**). Tree species restricted to, or more abundant in, drier sites

(dry-site) were more likely to exhibit disease than those restricted to, or more abundant

in, wetter sites (wet-site) ($P = 0.042$; Fig. **4c,d**; Table **S7**). While we found no correlation

between seed size and disease risk for wet-site species, disease risk decreases with

increasing seed size for dry-site species (Fig. **4c,d**; Table **S7**).

Discussion

421   Pathogens are believed to shape the distributions and abundances of their hosts,

effects often ascribed to host-specialized pathogens (Comita *et al*., 2014). However, there

is increasing evidence that multi-host pathogens are prevalent in natural plant

communities (Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Gallery *et al*., 2007; Gilbert & Webb,

2007; Kluger *et al*., 2008; Hersh *et al*., 2012; Schweizer *et al*., 2013; Sarmiento *et al*.,

2017; Spear & Mordecai, 2018). These multi-host pathogens may contribute to the

maintenance of these communities via host-specific impacts (disease severity differs

among a pathogen's hosts), a form of effective specialization (Augspurger & Wilkinson

2007; Benítez *et al*., 2013; Sarmiento *et al*., 2017). Using a multifaceted approach, we

identified fungal pathogens attacking seedlings in the forests of Panama, and show that

they can attack phylogenetically dispersed hosts. Furthermore, we demonstrate that tree

species differ in their susceptibility to pathogens, with trees adapted to environments with

low and/or inconsistent disease pressure being more susceptible to disease. Collectively,

these results suggest that generalist pathogens contribute to the maintenance of local and

regional plant diversity.

Pathogens and their impacts

We observed 66 OTUs, but only four were observed >10 times (Figs **1, S3a**; Table

S4). The relative rarity of the OTUs, coupled with a non-asymptomatic taxon

accumulation curve, indicate incomplete sampling and a diverse community of seedling-

associated fungi (Fig. **S3**). The most frequently isolated fungal genera (e.g.,

Colletotrichum; Fig. **1**) and those with experimentally confirmed pathogenicity (e.g.,

Clonostachys; Table **1**) include previously identified phytopathogens (Nguyen *et al*.,

2016).

Seven of the 10 pathogenic isolates caused significant mortality for at least one tree

species during the inoculation experiments (Table **1**), reinforcing the importance of

pathogens as a selective pressure and source of nonrandom seedling mortality that can

directly shape plant community composition (Green *et al*., 2014). We also observed

pathogen-caused stem damage, stunting, and wilting. These nonlethal infections can also

be a structuring force by compromising a seedling's ability to survive future stressors

(Ditommaso & Watson, 1995).

Seventeen of the 27 fungal isolates tested appear to be nonpathogenic; however, some

categorized as nonpathogenic may be pathogenic under optimal conditions. These

isolates may not have caused disease in our experiments because we failed to: (1) test

them against a susceptible host (each isolate was only tested against 3–28 tree species, a

fraction of the species locally present); (2) test them against susceptible individuals of a

host species, attributable to intraspecific genotypic variation in resistance; or (3) replicate

the environmental conditions necessary for disease development (Barrett *et al.*, 2009;

Álvarez-Loayza *et al*., 2011). Additionally, while many of the fungi tested infect multiple

tissue types (Table **1**; Fig. **S4d**), (4) some isolates deemed nonpathogenic based on root

inoculation may only colonize leaves or stems. Experimental challenges two through four

may also explain why the 10 pathogenic isolates did not generate significant disease on

the host species from which they were originally isolated (Fig. **3**).

Pathogens can infect phylogenetically dispersed hosts

The host associations of the fungi isolated from symptomatic seedlings, in combination with the results of our inoculation experiments, provide support for our hypothesis that seedling pathogens in these tropical forests are often multi-host (Figs **1, 3**; Table **1**). We speculate that our study underestimates the true breadth of the host ranges of the observed multi-host fungi, as we sampled and tested a small fraction of the >824 tree species present locally (Pyke *et al*., 2001). We cannot assess host specialization for the 33 singleton OTUs and some may be strict specialists. Moreover, host-specialized fungi may have gone unobserved due to our culture-based approach, which limited sampling and excluded biotrophic fungi, generally exhibiting greater specificity than necrotrophs (Agrios, 2005). That said, multi-host pathogens of seedlings, leaves, and seeds were also observed in previous Panama-based studies (Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Gilbert & Webb, 2007; Schweizer *et al*., 2013; Sarmiento *et al*., 2017).

In general, a given fungal OTU was isolated from heterofamilial tree species, host use was phylogenetically overdispersed, and pairwise similarities in community composition of seedling-associated fungi were unrelated to pairwise phylogenetic distances between tree species (Figs **1, 2**; Tables **S4**, **S5**). Together these results suggest that, contrary to our second hypothesis, there is no phylogenetic signal to host range for these multi-host seedling pathogens. The absence of a significant phylogenetic signal is consistent with one Panama-based study of foliar pathogens (Schweizer *et al*., 2013), but conflicts with other studies in temperate and tropical plant communities (Gilbert & Webb, 2007; Gilbert *et al*., 2012; Parker *et al*., 2015; Chen *et al*., 2019). Our study did not include as many congeneric or confamilial host pairs as Gilbert and Webb (2007) or Gilbert *et al*. (2012), potentially hindering our ability to detect a signal. Alternatively, pathogen host use may track phylogenetically labile plant defenses (Kursar *et al*., 2009) rather than phylogenetically conserved defenses (Fine *et al*., 2006). Parallel evolution of similar defenses in unrelated lineages would explain why the pathogens in this and other studies can infect many distantly related tree species.

The positive relationships between OTU isolation frequency and the number of hosts observed during our survey and inoculation experiments (Fig. **S5**) suggest that host generalists are abundant members of the pathogen community and that, if sampling was

expanded, a given fungal OTU would be detected in additional tree species. Many

seedling pathogens, including the soil-borne fungi and oomycetes causing seedling

damping-off, are passively dispersed (e.g., by splashing rain), with limited dispersal

distances (Madden, 1997). Thus, the ability to infect a wide range of hosts, particularly

spatially aggregated hosts, would increase a pathogen's likelihood of persistence. For

pathogens with limited dispersal, host use may be more tightly linked with plant habitat

associations than phylogenetic relatedness, making them more likely to infect tree species

that commonly co-occur spatially and temporally (Roy, 2001). Furthermore, just as

selection should favor multi-host pathogens in species-rich assemblages, selection should

favor true generalists, whose host ranges are decoupled from plant relatedness, in plant

communities that are phylogenetically overdispersed on the small spatial scale relevant to

dispersal-limited pathogens (Swenson *et al.*, 2007; Swenson *et al.*, 2012; Pearse *et al.*,

2013).

Tree species share pathogens, but are differentially impacted

A given plant species is often infected by multiple microorganisms and these

microorganisms are frequently shared within a plant community (Hersh *et al.*, 2012;

Sarmiento *et al.*, 2017; Spear & Mordecai, 2018). We observed overlap among the fungal

communities of distantly related tree species (Fig. **1**; Table **S5**), a pattern likely to

intensify with increased sampling. The presence of a particular fungus in the seedlings of

multiple tree species does not mean that those hosts are equally likely to be infected by

that fungus. Pathogens may disproportionally infect certain hosts based on availability,

defense traits, and/or habitat (Ferrer & Gilbert, 2003).

Disease progression among susceptible hosts is mediated by multiple factors,

including defense traits. Based on our inoculation experiments, tree species were

differentially impacted by shared pathogens (Fig. **3**; Table **1**), in support of our third

hypothesis and consistent with the host-specific impacts of multi-host pathogens

previously observed (Davidson *et al.*, 2000; Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Hersh *et al.*,

2012; Sarmiento *et al.*, 2017). Most of the tree species we tested were seemingly resistant

to the 10 pathogenic isolates (Fig. **3**), but that does not preclude their susceptibility to

numerous untested fungi. Moreover, these tree species may actually be susceptible to

infection by the pathogenic isolates in our study, but their resistance mechanisms prevent

extensive pathogen colonization and symptom development. In which case, these

resistant tree species may act as reservoir hosts that facilitate the persistence of pathogens

within the community (Haas *et al*., 2011).

Plant traits and disease susceptibility

Disease pressure varies spatially, particularly across environmental gradients

(Augspurger, 1984a; Brenes-Arguedas *et al*., 2009; Defossez *et al*., 2011; Haak *et al*.,

2012; Hersh *et al*., 2012; Spear *et al*., 2015). For plants adapted to areas with low and/or

inconsistent disease pressure, such as areas with higher light, lower humidity, and

inconsistent precipitation (Augspurger, 1984a; Spear *et al*., 2015), the allocation costs of

physical and chemical defenses may outweigh the benefits and vice versa for plants

adapted to areas with high and/or consistent disease pressure (Coley & Barone, 1996;

Strauss & Agrawal, 1999; Endara & Coley, 2010). Consistent with variable selective

pressures, and previous field and greenhouse studies (Augspurger, 1984b; Augspurger &

Kelly, 1984; McCarthy-Neumann & Kobe, 2008), seedlings of shade-intolerant tree

species and tree species restricted to, or more abundant in, drier forests (dry-site species)

were more likely to suffer disease than seedlings of shade-tolerant and wet-site tree

species in our inoculation experiments (Fig. **4**; Tables **S6**, **S7**). Engelbrecht *et al*. (2007)

found no correlation between a species' light requirements and its occurrence in drier

versus wetter sites, but evergreen trees are more common in wetter sites, while deciduous

trees dominate drier sites (Santiago *et al*., 2004). Shade-tolerant and evergreen tree

species, both with long-lived leaves, tend to invest more in pest defenses than shade-

intolerant and deciduous species (Coley & Barone, 1996; Santiago *et al*., 2004).

For shade-tolerant, shade-intolerant, and dry-site tree species, the probability of

disease decreases with increasing seed size (Fig. **4**). This is perhaps unsurprising as large-

seeded species can invest more in defenses and better compensate for lost tissue

(Armstrong & Westoby, 1993; Green & Juniper, 2004). Our results are inconsistent with

two Panama-based studies (Augspurger, 1984a; Augspurger & Kelly, 1984), which found

no correlation between seed size and pathogen susceptibility, possibly because they only

included wind-dispersed species while our analyses included wind- and vertebrate-

dispersed species (average seed dry masses: 1.9 - 686 versus 3 - 2334 mg).

Consequences for plant communities

Neither disturbance nor microhabitat specialization are considered sufficient to

maintain the hyperdiversity of tropical forests (Leigh *et al*., 2004). While host-specialized

pests are commonly touted as the drivers of diversity maintenance (Leigh *et al*., 2004;

Comita *et al*., 2014), we show that generalist pathogens are frequently responsible for

seedling death and disease. The host-specific impacts of multi-host pathogens and

differences among tree species in pathogen susceptibility observed by this and other

studies (Augspurger & Wilkinson, 2007; Hersh *et al*., 2012; Spear *et al*., 2015) suggest

that generalized pathogens may also influence plant community composition by unevenly

affecting seedling recruitment. First, variability in host competence may maintain plant

community diversity by creating a dilution effect (Ostfeld & Keesing, 2000). Overall

disease risk should be lowered if the most competent host(s) is/are rare within the

community because pathogen transmission would be slowed between individuals of

susceptible species. Accordingly, the presence of less competent hosts should protect

poorly defended host species from pathogen-caused local extinction. Second, generalist

pathogens with host-specific impacts may alter direct and indirect competition among co-

occurring species (Alexander & Holt, 1998; Barrett *et al*., 2009; Mordecai, 2011). Host-

generalized pathogens could promote coexistence if a competition-defense tradeoff exists

among plant species and superior competitors are more susceptible (Mordecai, 2011).

Finally, interspecific variation in host susceptibility to generalist pathogens may maintain

diversity because disease-sensitive trees (e.g., shade-intolerant and dry-site spp.) are

excluded from disease-prone habitats (e.g., wetter, aseasonal forests and low-light

understories). By reinforcing resource partitioning and limiting the geographic

distributions of species, generalist pathogens contribute to the spatial turnover of plant

species and the maintenance of local and regional forest diversity.

Acknowledgments

This research was funded by Simons Foundation Award 429440, Center for Tropical

Forest Science, Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Garden Club of America,

University of Utah's Global Change and Sustainability Center, and A. Herbert and

Marian W. Gold Scholarship. Additional logistical support and facilities were provided

by the Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, S. Mangan, and the Arnold Lab at

University of Arizona. We thank J. Sertich, D. Martinez, B. Wolfe, J. Ibarra, H. Espinosa,

C. Swatek, M. Schmoker, D. Sandberg, J. Shaffer, and C. Gonzalez for field and lab

assistance; R. Perez for help with tree species identification; J. Wright, G. Gilbert, S.

Mangan, A. E. Arnold, S. Higginbotham, T. Kursar, and P. Coley for advice; T. Brenes-

Arguedas for sharing her culture collection, and N. Anaya and G. LaRosa, who

contributed to that collection; Parque Natural Metropolitano, D. Roubik, Barro Colorado

Nature Monument, and the Ministerio de Ambiente for authorizing this research; and four

anonymous reviewers for comments that improved this manuscript.

Author Contributions

ERS designed and conducted the research, analyzed the data, and wrote the first draft of

the manuscript, ERS and KDB contributed to manuscript revisions and approved the final

version.

References

Abarenkov K, Zirk A, Piirmann T, Pöhönen R, Ivanov F, Nilsson RH, Kõljalg U.

2020. Full UNITE+INSD dataset for Fungi. UNITE Community.

10.15156/BIO/786372

Agrawal AA. 2007. Macroevolution of plant defense strategies. *Trends in Ecology &*

Evolution **22**: 103–109.

Agrios GN. 2005. *Plant pathology*, 5th edn. San Diego, CA, USA: Elsevier Academic

Press.

Albert A, Anderson JA. 1984. On the existence of maximum likelihood estimates in

logistic regression models. *Biometrika* **71**: 1–10.

Alexander HM, Holt RD. 1998. The interaction between plant competition and disease.

Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics **1**: 206–220.

Álvarez-Loayza P, White JF Jr, Torres MS, Balslev H, Kristiansen T, Svenning JC,

Gil N. 2011. Light converts endosymbiotic fungus to pathogen, influencing

seedling survival and niche-space filling of a common tropical tree, *Iriartea*

deltoidea. *PloS ONE* **6**: e16386.

Armstrong DP, Westoby M. 1993. Seedlings from large seeds tolerated defoliation

better: a test using phylogeneticaly independent contrasts. *Ecology* **74**: 1092–

1100.

Augspurger CK. 1984a. Seedling survival of tropical tree species: interactions of

dispersal distance, light-gaps, and pathogens. *Ecology* **65**:1705–1712.

Augspurger CK. 1984b. Light requirements of neotropical tree seedlings: a comparative

study of growth and survival. *Journal of Ecology* **72**: 777–795.

Augspurger CK, Kelly CK. 1984. Pathogen mortality of tropical tree seedlings:

experimental studies of the effects of dispersal distance, seedling density, and

light conditions. *Oecologia* **61**: 211–217.

Augspurger CK, Wilkinson HT. 2007. Host specificity of pathogenic *Pythium* species:

Implications for tree species diversity. *Biotropica* **39**: 702–708.

**Bagchi R, Gallery RE, Gripenberg S, Gurr SJ, Narayan L, Addis CE, Freckleton

RP, Lewis OT. 2014.** Pathogens and insect herbivores drive rainforest plant

diversity and composition. *Nature* **506**: 85–88.

Barrett LG, Kniskern JM, Bodenhausen N, Zhang W, Bergelson J. 2009. Continua

of specificity and virulence in plant host–pathogen interactions: causes and

consequences. *New Phytologist* **183**: 513–529.

Bartoń K. 2020. MuMIn: Multi-Model Inference. R package version 1.43.17. [WWW

document] URL https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=MuMIn [accessed 2 June

2020].

Bell T, Freckleton RP, Lewis OT. 2006. Plant pathogens drive density-dependent

seedling mortality in a tropical tree. *Ecology Letters* **9**: 569–574.

Benítez MS, Hersh MH, Vilgalys R, Clark JS. 2013. Pathogen regulation of plant

diversity via effective specialization. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **28**: 705–

711.

**Benson DA, Cavanaugh M, Clark K, Karsch-Mizrachi I, Lipman DJ, Ostell J,

Sayers EW. 2012.** GenBank. *Nucleic Acids Research* **41**: D36–D42.

Blüthgen N, Menzel F, Blüthgen N. 2006. Measuring specialization in species

interaction networks. *BMC Ecology* **6**: 9.

Bradley DJ, Gilbert GS, Parker IM. 2003. Susceptibility of clover species to fungal
infection: the interaction of leaf surface traits and environment. *American Journal*
of Botany **90**: 857–864.

Brenes-Arguedas T, Coley PD, Kursar TA. 2009. Pests versus drought as determinants
of plant distribution along a tropical rainfall gradient. *Ecology* **90**: 1751–1761.

Brenes-Arguedas T, Roddy AB, Coley PD, Kursar TA. 2011. Do differences in
understory light contribute to species distributions along a tropical rainfall
gradient? *Oecologia* **166**: 443–456.

Chao A, Chazdon RL, Colwell RK, Shen T. 2005. A new statistical approach for
assessing similarity of species composition with incidence and abundance data.
Ecology Letters **8**: 148–159.

Chen H. 2018. VennDiagram: Generate High-Resolution Venn and Euler Plots. R
package version 1.6.20. [WWW document] URL https://CRAN.R-
project.org/package=VennDiagram [accessed 25 November 2020].

Chen L, Swenson NG, Ji N, Mi X, Ren H, Guo L, Ma K. 2019. Differential soil fungus
accumulation and density dependence of trees in a subtropical forest. *Science* **366**:
124–128.

Coley PD, Barone JA. 1996. Herbivory and plant defenses in tropical forests. *Annual*
Review of Ecology and Systematics **27**: 305–335.

Comita LS, Muller-Landau HC, Aguilar S, Hubbell SP. 2010. Asymmetric density
dependence shapes species abundances in a tropical tree community. *Science* **329**:
330–332.

Comita LS, Queenborough SA, Murphy SJ, Eck JL, Xu K, Krishnadas M, Beckman
N, Zhu Y. 2014. Testing predictions of the Janzen–Connell hypothesis: a meta-
analysis of experimental evidence for distance-and density-dependent seed and
seedling survival. *Journal of Ecology* **102**: 845–856.

Connell JH. 1971. On the role of natural enemies in preventing competitive exclusion in
some marine animals and in rain forest trees. In: Boer PJD, Gradwell GR, eds.
Dynamics of numbers in populations. Wageningen, Netherlands: Centre for
Agricultural Publication and Documentation, 298–312.

Davidson JM, Rehner SA, Santana M, Lasso E, Urena de Chapet O, Herre EA.

2000. First report of *Phytophthora heveae* and *Pythium* spp. on tropical tree

seedlings in Panama. *Plant Disease* **84**: 706–706.

Defossez E, Courbaud B, Marcais B, Thuiller W, Granda E, Kunstler G. 2011. Do

interactions between plant and soil biota change with elevation? A study on *Fagus*

sylvatica. *Biology Letters* **7**: 699–701.

Ditommaso A, Watson AK. 1995. Impact of a fungal pathogen, *Colletotrichum*

coccodes on growth and competitive ability of *Abutilon theophrasti*. *New*

Phytologist **131**: 51–60.

Dormann CF. 2011. How to be a specialist? Quantifying specialisation in pollination

networks. *Network Biology* **1**: 1–20.

Dormann CF, Gruber B, Fruend J. 2008. Introducing the bipartite Package: analysing

ecological networks. *R News* **8**: 8–11.

Endara MJ, Coley PD. 2011. The resource availability hypothesis revisited: a meta-

analysis. *Functional Ecology* **25**: 389–398.

Engelbrecht BM, Comita LS, Condit R, Kursar TA, Tyree MT, Turner BL, Hubbell

SP. 2007. Drought sensitivity shapes species distribution patterns in tropical

forests. *Nature* **447**: 80–82.

Fine PVA, Miller ZJ, Mesones I, Irazuzta S, Appel HM, Stevens MHH, Sääksjärvi I,

Schultz JC, Coley PD. 2006. The growth-defense trade-off and habitat

specialization by plants in Amazonian forests. *Ecology* **87**: S150–S162.

Firth D. 1993. Bias reduction of maximum likelihood estimates. *Biometrika* **80**: 27–38.

Ferrer A, Gilbert GS. 2003. Effect of tree host species on fungal community

composition in a tropical rain forest in Panama. *Diversity and Distributions* **9**:

455–468.

Gallery RE, Dalling JW, Arnold AE. 2007. Diversity, host affinity, and distribution of

seed-infecting fungi: A case study with *Cecropia*. *Ecology* **88**: 582–588.

Gilbert GS, Magarey R, Suiter K, Webb CO. 2012. Evolutionary tools for

phytosanitary risk analysis: phylogenetic signal as a predictor of host range of

plant pests and pathogens. *Evolutionary Applications* **5**: 869–878.

Gilbert GS, Webb CO. 2007. Phylogenetic signal in plant pathogen-host range.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA **104**: 4979–4983.

Gillett JB. 1962. Pest pressure, and underestimated factor in evolution. *Systematics*

Association Publication **4**: 37–46.

Green PT, Harms KE, Connell JH. 2014. Nonrandom, diversifying processes are

disproportionately strong in the smallest size classes of a tropical forest.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA **111**: 18649–18654.

Green PT, Juniper PA. 2004. Seed mass, seedling herbivory and the reserve effect in

tropical rainforest seedlings. *Functional Ecology* **18**: 539–547.

Grünwald NJ, Martin FN, Larsen MM, Sullivan CM, Coffey MD, Hansen EM,

Parke JL. 2011. *Phytophthora*-ID.org: A sequence-based *Phytophthora*

identification tool. *Plant Disease* **95**: 337–342.

Haak DC, McGinnis LA, Levey DJ, Tewksbury JJ. 2012. Why are not all chilies hot?

A trade-off limits pungency. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological*

Sciences **279**: 2012–2017.

Haas SE, Hooten MB, Rizzo DM, Meentemeyer RK. 2011. Forest species diversity

reduces disease risk in a generalist plant pathogen invasion. *Ecology Letters* **14**:

1108–1116.

Harms KE, Wright SJ, Calderon O, Hernandez A, Herre EA. 2000. Pervasive

density-dependent recruitment enhances seedling diversity in a tropical forest.

Nature **404**: 493–495.

Hersh MH, Vilgalys R, Clark JS. 2012. Evaluating the impacts of multiple generalist

fungal pathogens on temperate tree seedling survival. *Ecology* **93**: 511–520.

Higgins KL, Coley PD, Kursar TA, Arnold AE. 2011. Culturing and direct PCR

suggest prevalent host generalism among diverse fungal endophytes of tropical

forest grasses. *Mycologia* **103**: 247–260.

Hofstetter V, Buyck B, Eyssartier G, Schnee S, Gindro K. 2019. The unbearable

lightness of sequenced-based identification. *Fungal Diversity* **96**: 243–284.

Huot B, Yao J, BMontgomery BL, He SY. 2014. Growth–defense tradeoffs in plants: a

balancing act to optimize fitness. *Molecular Plant* **7**: 1267–1287.

Janzen DH. 1970. Herbivores and the number of tree species in tropical forests.

American Naturalist **104**: 501–528.

Kang S, Mansfield MA, Park B, Geiser DM, Ivors KL, Coffey MD, Grünwald NJ,

Martin FN, Lévesque CA, Blair JE. 2010. The promise and pitfalls of sequence-

based identification of plant-pathogenic fungi and oomycetes. *Phytopathology*

100: 732–737.

Kembel SW, Cowan PD, Helmus MR, Cornwell WK, Morlon H, Ackerly DD,

Blomberg SP, Webb CO. 2010. Picante: R tools for integrating phylogenies and

ecology. *Bioinformatics* **26**: 1463–1464.

Kindt R, Coe R. 2005. *Tree diversity analysis. A manual and software for common*

statistical methods for ecological and biodiversity studies. Nairobi, Kenya: World

Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF).

Klinke S. 2019. plot.matrix: Visualizes a Matrix as Heatmap. R package version 1.4.

[WWW document] URL https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=plot.matrix

[accessed 2 June 2020].

Kluger CG, Dalling JW, Gallery RE, Sanchez E, Weeks-Galindo C, Arnold AE.

2008. Host generalists dominate fungal communities associated with seeds of four

neotropical pioneer species. *Journal of Tropical Ecology* **24**: 351–354.

Kõljalg U, Nilsson RH, Abarenkov K, Tedersoo L, Taylor AFS, Bahram M, Bates

ST, Bruns TD, Bengtsson-Palme J, Callaghan TM *et al.* 2013. Towards a

unified paradigm for sequence-based identification of fungi. *Molecular Ecology*

22: 5271–5277.

Kosmidis I. 2019. brglm: Bias Reduction in Binary-Response Generalized Linear

Models. R package version 0.6.2. [WWW document] URL https://cran.r-

project.org/package=brglm [accessed 2 June 2020].

Kosmidis I, Firth D. 2009. Bias reduction in exponential family nonlinear models.

Biometrika **96**: 793–804.

Kursar TA, Dexter KG, Lokvam J, Pennington RT, Richardson JE, Weber MG,

Murakami ET, Drake C, McGregor R, Coley PD. 2009. The evolution of

antiherbivore defenses and their contribution to species coexistence in the tropical

tree genus *Inga*. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* **106**:
18073–18078.

Leigh EG, Davdar P, Dick CW, Puyravaud J-P, Terborgh J, ter Steege H, Wright
SJ. 2004. Why do some tropical forests have so many species of trees? *Biotropica*
36: 447–473.

Lesnoff M, Lancelot R. 2012. aod: Analysis of Overdispersed Data. R package version
1.3.1. [WWW document] URL http://cran.r-project.org/package=aod [accessed 2
June 2020].

Liu Y, Yu S, Xie Z, Staehelin C. 2012. Analysis of a negative plant–soil feedback in a
subtropical monsoon forest. *Journal of Ecology* **100**: 1019–1028.

Lücking R, Aime MC, Robbertse B, Miller AN, Ariyawansa HA, Aoki T, Cardinali
G, Crous PW, Druzhinina IS, Geiser DM. 2020. Unambiguous identification of
fungi: where do we stand and how accurate and precise is fungal DNA barcoding?
IMA Fungus **11**: 1–32.

Madden LV. 1997. Effects of rain on splash dispersal of fungal pathogens. *Canadian*
Journal of Plant Pathology **19**: 225–230.

Mangan SA, Schnitzer SA, Herre EA, Mack KM, Valencia MC, Sanchez EI, Bever
J. 2010. Negative plant-soil feedback predicts tree-species relative abundance in a
tropical forest. *Nature* **466**: 752–755.

May RM. 1991. A fondness for fungi. *Nature* **352**: 475-476.

McCarthy-Neumann S, Kobe RK. (2008). Tolerance of soil pathogens co-varies with
shade tolerance across species of tropical tree seedlings. *Ecology* **89**: 1883–1892.

Mordecai EA. 2011. Pathogen impacts on plant communities: Unifying theory, concepts,
and empirical work. *Ecological Monograph* **81**: 429–441.

Mordecai EA. 2012. Soil moisture and fungi affect seed survival in California grassland
annual plants. *PloS ONE* **7:** e39083.

Nguyen NH, Song Z, Bates ST, Branco, S, Tedersoo L, Menke J, Schilling JS,
Kennedy PG. 2016. FUNGuild: an open annotation tool for parsing fungal
community datasets by ecological guild. *Fungal Ecology* **20**: 241–248.

Oksanen J, Blanchet FG, Friendly M, Kindt R, Legendre P, McGlinn D, Minchin
PR, O'Hara RB, Simpson GL, Solymos P *et al*. 2019. vegan: Community

Ecology Package. R package version 2.5-6. [WWW document] URL

https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=vegan [accessed 2 June 2020].

Ostfeld RS, Keesing F. 2000. Biodiversity and disease risk: the case of Lyme disease.

Conservation Biology **14**: 722–728.

Packer A, Clay K. 2000. Soil pathogens and spatial patterns of seedling mortality in a

temperate tree. *Nature* **404**: 278–281.

Paradis E, Schliep K. 2018. ape 5.0: an environment for modern phylogenetics and

evolutionary analyses in R. *Bioinformatics* **35**: 526–528.

Parker IM, Saunders M, Bontrager M, Weitz AP, Hendricks R, Magarey R, Suiter

K, Gilbert GS. 2015. Phylogenetic structure and host abundance drive disease

pressure in communities. *Nature* **520**: 542–544.

Paton S. 2019a. Barro Colorado Island, Lutz tower 1m_Air Temperature. The

Smithsonian Institution. Dataset. https://doi.org/10.25573/data.10042394.v7

Paton S. 2019b. Barro Colorado Island, Lutz tower 1m_Relative Humidity. The

Smithsonian Institution. Dataset. https://doi.org/10.25573/data.10042400.v7

Pearse WD, Jones FA, Purvis A. 2013. Barro Colorado Island's phylogenetic

assemblage structure across fine spatial scales and among clades of different ages.

Ecology **94**: 2861–2872.

Pyke CR, Condit R, Aguilar S, Lao S. 2001. Floristic composition across a climatic

gradient in a neotropical lowland forest. *Journal of Vegetation Science* **12**: 553–

566.

Quinn GP, Keough MJ. 2002. *Experimental design and data analysis for biologists*.

New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press.

R Core Team. 2020. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R

Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.

Robbertse B, Strope PK, Chaverri P, Gazis R, Ciufo S, Domrachev M, Schoch CL.

2017. Improving taxonomic accuracy for fungi in public sequence databases:

applying 'one name one species' in well-defined genera with

Trichoderma/*Hypocrea* as a test case. *Database* **2017**: bax072.

Rossi J-P. 2011. rich: an R package to analyse species richness. *Diversity* **3**: 112–120.

Roy BA. 2001. Patterns of association between crucifers and their flower-mimic
829   pathogens: host jumps are more common than coevolution or cospeciation.
830   *Evolution* **55**: 41–53.

831 **Ruxton GD, Neuhäuser M. 2010.** When should we use one-tailed hypothesis testing?
832   *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* **1**: 114–117.

833 **Santiago LS, Kitajima K, Wright SJ, Mulkey SS. 2004.** Coordinated changes in
834   photosynthesis, water relations and leaf nutritional traits of canopy trees along a
835   precipitation gradient in lowland tropical forest. *Oecologia* **139**: 495–502.

836 **Sarmiento C, Zalamea PC, Dalling JW, Davis AS, Stump SM, U'Ren JM, Arnold**
837   **AE. 2017.** Soilborne fungi have host affinity and host-specific effects on seed
838   germination and survival in a lowland tropical forest. *Proceedings of the National*
839   *Academy of Sciences, USA* **114**: 11458–11463.

840 **Schweizer D, Gilbert GS, Holl KD. 2013.** Phylogenetic ecology applied to enrichment
841   planting of tropical native tree species. *Forest Ecology and Management* **297**: 57–
842   66.

843 **Spear ER. 2017.** Phylogenetic relationships and spatial distributions of putative fungal
844   pathogens of seedlings across a rainfall gradient in Panama. *Fungal Ecology* **26**:
845   65–73.

846 **Spear ER, Coley PD, Kursar TA. 2015.** Do pathogens limit the distributions of tropical
847   trees across a rainfall gradient? *Journal of Ecology* **103**: 165–174.

848 **Spear ER, Mordecai EA. 2018.** Foliar pathogens of California grasses are multi-host
849   and spatially widespread: implications for grassland diversity. *Ecology* **99**: 2250–
850   2259.

851 **Strauss SY, Agrawal AA. 1999.** The ecology and evolution of plant tolerance to
852   herbivory. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **14**: 179–185.

853 **Swenson NG, Enquist BJ, Thompson J, Zimmerman JK. 2007.** The influence of
854   spatial and size scale on phylogenetic relatedness in tropical forest communities.
855   *Ecology* **88**: 1770–1780.

856 **Swenson NG, Erickson DL, Mi X, Bourg NA, Forero-Montaña J, Ge X, Howe R,**
857   **Lake JK, Liu X, Ma K *et al*. 2012.** Phylogenetic and functional alpha and beta
858   diversity in temperate and tropical tree communities. *Ecology* **93**: S112–S125.

Talley SM, Coley PD, Kursar TA. 2002. Anti-fungal leaf surface metabolites correlate
with fungal abundance in sagebrush populations. *Journal of Chemical Ecology*
28: 2141–2168.

Vavrek MJ. 2011. fossil: palaeoecological and palaeogeographical analysis tools.
Palaeontologia Electronica **14**: 1T.

Wickham H. 2007. Reshaping data with the reshape package. *Journal of Statistical*
Software **21**: 1–20.

Wickham H. 2011. The split-apply-combine strategy for data analysis. *Journal of*
Statistical Software **40**: 1–29.

Wickham H. 2016. *ggplot2: elegant graphics for data analysis*. New York, NY, USA:
Springer-Verlag.

Yadeta KA, Thomma, BPHJ. 2013. The xylem as battleground for plant hosts and
vascular wilt pathogens. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **4**: 97.

Yang S. 2020. otuSummary: summarizing OTU table regarding the composition,
abundance and beta diversity of abundant and rare biospheres. R package version
0.1.1. [WWW document] URL https://CRAN.R-
project.org/package=otuSummary [accessed 2 June 2020].

Zanne AE, Tank DC, Cornwell WY, Eastman JM, Smith SA, FitzJohn RG,
McGlinn DJ, O'Meara BC, Moles AT, Reich PB *et al*. 2014. Three keys to the
radiation of angiosperms into freezing environments. *Nature* **506**: 89–92.

Supporting Information

Fig. S1 Examples of disease in the forests of Panama.

Fig. S2 Details of shadehouse-based inoculation experiments.

Fig. S3 Rank abundance plot and OTU accumulation curve.

Fig. S4 Overlap in fungal OTUs among sampling years, methods used to obtain
symptomatic seedlings, isolation media, and tissue sampled.

Fig. S5 Correlation between OTU host range and isolation frequency.

Table S1 Taxonomic assignments, traits, sampling effort, and observed OTUs for tree

species evaluated in our survey and experiments.

Table S2 Methodological details pertaining to the multi-year collection of symptomatic

seedlings, and microbial isolation and sequencing.

Table S3 Average light levels, air temperatures, and relative humidities of the

shadehouses used for the inoculation experiments versus ambient conditions.

Table S4 Estimated taxonomic placement, isolation frequency, number of observed

hosts, estimated host specialization, and phylogenetic pattern of host use of the OTUs.

Table S5 Overlap in seedling-associated OTUs among tree species.

Table S6 Results of the beta-binomial generalized linear regression with the proportion

of diseased seedlings as a function of seed size and shade tolerance.

Table S7 Average estimates based on the best-ranked beta-binomial generalized linear

regressions with the proportion of diseased seedlings as a function of seed size and spatial

distribution relative to annual rainfall.

Methods S1 Methods used to estimate the taxonomic placements of the 66 OTUs and

assign nomenclature.

Figure 1. Host associations of the fungi and oomycetes isolated from symptomatic

seedlings (full dataset: *n* = 211 isolates). The 26 host tree species (left) are arranged

according to their phylogenetic relationships. The estimated taxonomic placement of each

of the 66 microbial OTUs (right) is preceded by a unique letter identifier. Because our

OTU grouping strategy (99% sequence similarity) often differed from that of the UNITE

database, distinct OTUs in our study sometimes share the same nomenclature based on

the species hypothesis of the best-matching reference sequence in UNITE (e.g., Z and

AAG). For the non-singleton OTUs, nomenclature is followed by an L or M, indicating

low or moderate estimated specialization (d'). The width of each line represents the

number of times a given OTU was isolated from seedlings of a given tree species. For

both tree species and OTUs, font size is scaled to the number of interactions. OTUs with

significant and marginally significant phylogenetic patterns of host use (Table S4) are

marked with stars, solid indicating clustered and open indicating overdispersed. The six

fungal OTUs with members that exhibited statistically significant ($\alpha = 0.10$)

pathogenicity during the inoculation experiments are listed in red.

Figure 2. Estimated pairwise similarities of OTU communities are unrelated to pairwise

phylogenetic distances (time of independent evolution in Myr). The blue circles and solid

line (GLM: Est. ± SE = 0.002 ± 0.003, z-value = 0.60, P = 0.55) are based on the full

dataset, while the green triangles and dotted line (GLM: Est. ± SE = 0.002 ± 0.004, z-

value = 0.36, P = 0.72) are based on subset B, only tree species and OTUs observed ≥3

times.

Figure 3. Pathogenicity and host ranges of the 27 fungal isolates tested, and susceptibility of the 35 tree species tested, based on seedling morbidity. Fungal isolates are grouped according to their OTU (horizontal axis). Tree species are arranged based on their phylogenetic relationships (vertical axis). OH (original host) denotes the tree species from which an isolate originated. Tree species-by-isolate combinations for which

944 evidence of pathogenicity was observed (proportion of inoculated seedlings with

945 symptoms > proportion in paired control group) are depicted in shades of yellow (pale for

946 minimal) to red (dark for substantial). Combinations for which there was no evidence of

947 pathogenicity (proportion of inoculated seedlings with symptoms ≤ proportion in paired

948 control group) are depicted in black and shades of green. Gray cells represent an untested

949 combination. For 20 of the 285 combinations tested, we observed significant

950 pathogenicity (***, $P \leq 0.001$; **, $P \leq 0.01$; *, $P \leq 0.05$; †, $P \leq 0.10$; Table **1**).

Figure 4. Relationships between disease susceptibility and seed size and shade tolerance (a,b), and seed size and spatial distribution relative to annual rainfall (c,d). Shade-intolerant tree species (red) are more likely to experience disease than shade-tolerant species (blue) ($P = 0.003$), and for both groups the probability of disease decreases with increasing seed size (a,b) (Table **S6**). Dry-site tree species (orange) are more likely to experience disease than wet-site species (green) ($P = 0.042$; Table **S7**). For dry-site species (orange) the probability of disease decreases with increasing seed size (c,d) (Table **S7**). The shaded areas represent 95% confidence intervals.

Table 1. The 20 fungal isolate-by-tree species combinations for which significant pathogenicity was observed based on the presence/absence of (i) general morbidity and (ii) mortality in the inoculated versus control seedlings, analyzed with bias-reduced generalized linear models assuming binomial error distributions (probit link) and using α = 0.10 because small sample sizes limited our power to detect treatment effects.

OTU–Estimated taxonomic placement (isolate, origin tree sp. & tissue, no. of tree spp. tested)	Susceptible tree species	n		Disease metric	Prop. rel. to control	Est (SE)	z	P
		Cntrl	Inoc					
	D. retusa[1]	5	5	morbidity	0.8	2.17 (1.04)	2.08	0.038
				mortality	1	2.93 (1.2)	2.45	0.014
	G. standleyana	10	10	morbidity	0.6	1.61 (0.65)	2.47	0.014
B–Nectriaceae sp. (ERS034, TT root, 28)	J. copaia[1]	10	10	morbidity	0.6	2 (0.83)	2.41	0.016
				mortality	0.6	2 (0.83)	2.41	0.016
	L. seemannii[1]	5	5	morbidity	1	2.93 (1.2)	2.45	0.014
				mortality	1	2.93 (1.2)	2.45	0.014
	C. elastica	10	10	morbidity[8]	0.8	2.25 (0.71)	3.17	0.002
B–Nectriaceae sp. (ERS036, CL stem[2], 13)	C. vitifolium	10	10	morbidity[9]	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079
				mortality	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079
	D. retusa	10	10	morbidity[10]	0.5	1.36 (0.64)	2.12	0.034

G–*Clonostachys rosea*, Bionectriaceae (ERS011, VS stem[3], 17)	*C. longifolium*	5	5	morbidity	0.6	1.68 (1.02)	1.66	0.098
G–*C. rosea* (ERS012, PT leaf[4], 15)	*C. aromatica*	5	5	morbidity[11,12]	0.6	1.68 (1.02)	1.66	0.098
G–*C. rosea* (ERS019, VS root, 12)	*L. seemannii*	10	10	morbidity	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079
				mortality	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079
	T. tuberculata	8	9	morbidity	0.56	1.8 (0.87)	2.07	0.038
				mortality	0.44	1.54 (0.87)	1.78	0.076
C–*Mycoleptodiscus suttoni*, Muyocopronaceae (ERS029, VS stem[5], 13)	*A. glabra*	12	12	morbidity	0.75	2.46 (0.8)	3.08	0.002
				mortality	0.58	2.03 (0.79)	2.58	0.010
	D. retusa	10	10	morbidity	0.7	1.89 (0.67)	2.83	0.005
				mortality	0.8	2.53 (0.85)	2.98	0.003
	G. americana	10	10	morbidity	0.5	1.36 (0.64)	2.12	0.034
	P. limonensis	10	10	morbidity	0.4	1.53 (0.83)	1.84	0.065
				mortality	0.4	1.53 (0.83)	1.84	0.065
C–*M. suttoni* (ERS033, RA stem[6], 16)	*L. seemannii*	10	10	morbidity[13]	0.9	2.89 (0.88)	3.27	0.001
				mortality	0.9	2.89 (0.88)	3.27	0.001
AAF–Nectriaceae sp. (ERS040, ANE stem[7], 12)	*C. elastica*	10	9	morbidity[14]	0.9	2.84 (0.9)	3.18	0.002
				mortality	0.89	2.83 (0.89)	3.18	0.002
AE–*Pestalotiopsis* sp., Sporocadaceae (ERS031, TT root, 18)	*B. utile*	10	10	morbidity	0.4	1.53 (0.83)	1.84	0.065
				mortality	0.4	1.53 (0.83)	1.84	0.065
	G. americana	10	10	morbidity	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079
				mortality	0.4	1.13 (0.64)	1.76	0.079

I–Sordariomycetes sp. (ERS032, HC stem, 14)	*C. aromatica*	5	5	morbidity	0.6	1.68 (1.02)	1.66	0.098

See Table **S1** for the full names of the tree species. Prop. rel. to control is the proportion of inoculated seedlings with the disease

metric minus the proportion in the paired control group. We considered an isolate pathogenic if, for at least one tree species, a

significantly greater proportion of inoculated seedlings were symptomatic than paired control seedlings.

[1] Experiment end date = date all inoculated seedlings had died (i.e., used truncated observations of paired control seedlings).

[2,3,4,5,6,7]See **Fig. S1j,t,f,q,r,v**, respectively, for photos.

[8,9,10,11,12,13,14] See **Fig. S2r,n,k,g,h,m,s**, respectively, for photos.