Topology Testing and Demographic Modeling Illuminate a Novel Speciation Pathway in the

Greater Caribbean Sea Following the Formation of the Isthmus of Panama.

Benjamin M. Titus[1,2,*], H. Lisle Gibbs[2], Nuno Simões[3,4,5], Marymegan Daly[2]

[1]Department of Computational Biology, University of Lausanne, Quartier Sorge, 1015

Lausanne, Switzerland

[2]Department of Evolution, Ecology, and Organismal Biology, The Ohio State University,

Columbus, OH, USA

[3]Facultad de Ciencias, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico-Sisal, Mexico

[4] International Chair for Coastal and Marine Studies in Mexico, Harte Research Institute for Gulf
of Mexico Studies, Texas A&M University, Corpus Christi, TX 78412, USA
13

14   [5] Laboratorio Nacional de Resilencia Costera (LANRESC, CONACYT), 97356 Sisal, Yucata´n,
15   Mexico
16
17   *Correspondence to be sent to: Department of Computational Biology, University of Lausanne,

18   Quartier Sorge, 1015 Lausanne, Switzerland

19   E-mail: bentitus3@gmail.com/benjamin.titus@unil.ch

21   **Keywords**: Phylogeography, Coalescent Modeling, Hybrid speciation, Introgression, Crustacea,

Abstract

Recent genomic analyses have highlighted the prevalence of speciation with gene flow in many

taxa and have underscored the importance of accounting for these reticulate evolutionary

processes when constructing species trees and generating parameter estimates. This is especially

important for deepening our understanding of speciation in the sea where fast moving ocean

currents, expanses of deep water, and periodic episodes of sea level rise and fall act as soft and

temporary allopatric barriers that facilitate both divergence and secondary contact. Under these

conditions, gene flow is not expected to cease completely while contemporary distributions are

expected to differ from historical ones. Here we conduct range-wide sampling for Pederson's

cleaner shrimp (*Ancylomenes pedersoni*), a species complex from the Greater Caribbean that

contains three clearly delimited mitochondrial lineages with both allopatric and sympatric

distributions. Using mtDNA barcodes and a genomic ddRADseq approach, we combine classic

phylogenetic analyses with extensive topology testing and demographic modeling (10 site

frequency replicates x 45 evolutionary models x 50 model simulations/replicate = 22,500

simulations) to test species boundaries and reconstruct the evolutionary history of what was

expected to be a simple case study. Instead, our results indicate a history of allopatric divergence,

secondary contact, introgression, and endemic hybrid speciation driven by the final closure of the

Isthmus of Panama and the strengthening of the Gulf Stream Current ~3.5 million years ago. The

history of this species complex recovered by model-based methods that allow reticulation differs

from that recovered by standard phylogenetic analyses and is unexpected given contemporary

distributions. The geologically and biologically meaningful insights gained by our model

selection analyses illuminate a novel pathway of species formation that resulted from one of the

most biogeographically significant events in Earth's history.

Introduction

Tropical coral reefs harbor levels of biodiversity rivaled only by tropical rainforests, yet do so in an environment with few obvious physical barriers to dispersal and gene flow. Although speciation in the sea is not a fundamentally different biological process than on land, the extent to which dispersal and gene flow drive speciation in both ecosystems can work at different scales (Palumbi 1994; Vermeij and Grosberg 2010; Bowen et al. 2013; 2016; Potkamp and Fransen 2019). Most marine species have pelagic larvae that may raft on ocean currents for weeks, connecting distant populations and resulting in large range and effective population sizes (Palumbi 1994; Vermeij and Grosberg 2010; Bowen et al. 2013; 2016; Álvarez-Noriega et al., 2020). Non-allopatric speciation is thus increasingly expected to play a major role in the generation of tropical marine biodiversity (Choat 2006; Bowen et al. 2013; 2016). However, fast moving ocean currents, expanses of deep water, and periodic episodes of sea level rise and fall may act as soft or temporary allopatric barriers that can facilitate both divergence and secondary contact (Quenouille et al. 2011; Cowman et al. 2013). The result is that many reef-dwelling species co-occur with their close relatives in a setting where gene flow may never fully subside, regardless of speciation mode.

That contemporary distributions may mask complex evolutionary histories creates significant hurdles for understanding the origins of tropical marine biodiversity. Complicating matters is that early studies of single loci (primarily mtDNA) could only capture incomplete evolutionary histories, and phylogenetic approaches that employ multi-locus data often concatenate data and/or deal with incongruent gene tree topologies by constructing species trees that model incomplete lineage sorting (reviewed by Degnan and Rosenberg 2009). As evidence continues to build in marine systems for the pervasiveness of speciation with gene flow (e.g. Hurt et al. 2013; Potkamp and Fransen 2019; Simmonds et al. 2019; Titus et al. 2019a; Prada and

Hellberg 2020), methods that model reticulate processes are key to testing historical

phylogenetic hypotheses and to improving our inferences on the processes that have shaped

tropical marine biodiversity.

In the Greater Caribbean (i.e. Caribbean Sea, Bermuda, Florida Reef Tract), Pederson's

cleaner-shrimp *Ancylomenes pedersoni* (Chace, 1958; Fig. 1a) is a common member of coral reef

communities. An obligate associate of sea anemones, *A. pedersoni* primarily hosts with the

corkscrew anemone *Bartholomea annulata* (Briones-Fourzán et al. 2012; Mascaró et al. 2012;

Huebner et al. 2019). Together, these species form a hub of ecologically important cleaning

stations that are visited by dozens of families of coral reef fishes (e.g. Titus et al. 2015; 2017a;

2019b). Described as a single species throughout its range, molecular studies of mtDNA

barcodes have revealed two sympatric lineages along the Florida Reef Tract- one thought to be

endemic and one thought to be widespread in the Caribbean- and a third endemic lineage in

Bermuda (Titus and Daly 2015, 2017; Titus et al. 2017b). Based solely on a mtDNA

phylogenetic analysis with a (Florida, (Caribbean, Bermuda)) topology, Titus et al. (2017b)

hypothesized that a chance long distance dispersal event from the Caribbean lineage gave rise to

the Bermudan endemic, but were unable to make informed hypotheses regarding the origin of the

Florida/Caribbean divergence or whether gene flow has been important during the diversification

of the clade.

Here we conduct comprehensive range-wide sampling for *A. pedersoni* and use mtDNA

loci and genome-wide approaches to delimit species and disentangle the evolutionary history of

this species complex. We combine classic phylogenetic approaches with model-based simulation

methods to conduct topology testing and make demographic inferences that allow us to evaluate

models that invoke different modes of speciation. We find that regardless of dataset, classic

phylogenetic approaches combined with contemporary distributions fail to fully explain the

history of *A. pedersoni*. In contrast, our model-based approach highlights the complex role gene

flow and hybridization have played in the formation of these species and suggest that historical

and contemporary distributions differ. The geologically and biologically meaningful insight

provided by our model-based analyses ultimately allow us to identify a novel diversification

pathway in the Greater Caribbean following the final formation of the Isthmus of Panama.

Materials and Methods

Sampling and DNA Extraction

Whole individuals of *A. pedersoni* were collected from sea anemones by hand, using

SCUBA, from 14 coral reef field sites in the Greater Caribbean representing the entire

geographic range of the species complex (Fig. 1b; Supplementary Table S1 available on Dryad).

A total of 451 individuals were collected and included in this study. DNA was extracted from

each individual using QIAGEN DNeasy Blood & Tissue Kits, and total genomic DNA was

quantified (ng/µL) using a Qubit 2.0 fluorometer (see Supplementary Methods available on

Dryad).

Sequencing and Dataset Assembly

For each individual we PCR amplified and sequenced a ~650bp long fragment of mtDNA

from the cytochrome *c* oxidase subunit I (COI) DNA barcode (see Supplementary Methods).

Sequences that were newly generated for this study were deposited into GenBank (Table S1).

Following DNA barcoding we sequenced a subset of the 451 individuals using a double digest

restriction site associated DNA sequencing approach (ddRADseq). In total our ddRADseq

libraries included ~10-15 individuals per field locality (N = 151 individuals; see Supplementary

Methods; Table S2 available on Dryad). ddRADseq libraries were prepared using *Eco*-RI-HF

and *PstI*-HF enzymes, Illumina compatible barcodes, and a 400-800 base pair size selection

range. Two individuals of the closely related cleaner shrimp *Periclimenes yucatanicus* were

prepared and included in ddRADseq libraries as outgroup samples. Libraries were pooled and

sequenced across eight Illumina HiSeq 2500 lanes using single-end 100bp sequencing.

mtDNA barcode sequence data were assembled using Sequencher 4.9 (Gene Codes) and

aligned using MUSCLE (Edgar 2004) in Geneious v10.2.3 (Kearse et al. 2012). Previously

published COI sequences from *P. yucatanicus*, *P. rathbunae*, *P. crinoidalis*, *P. perryae*, and *P.*

patae were retrieved from GenBank included as outgroup taxa (see Supplementary Methods).

Raw ddRADseq reads were demultiplexed, aligned, and assembled *de novo* using the

program pyRAD v3.0.66 (Eaton 2014) as there is no reference genome for *A. pedersoni*. Briefly,

we set the clustering threshold (Wclust) to 0.90 to assemble reads into loci and a minimum

coverage depth of seven to call a locus (Mindepth). We required an individual sample to contain

at least 10,000 consensus loci after clustering, and a locus to be present in 75% of all individuals

to be retained in the final dataset. When more than one SNP was present at a locus, only one was

randomly selected to create the final unlinked SNP dataset. Because different downstream

analyses may or may not require outgroups, and because individual variation in sequencing

coverage can influence the number of recovered SNPs, we created three ddRADseq datasets: 1)

Full *A. pedersoni* dataset with no outgroup taxa, 2) Reduced *A. pedersoni* dataset with outgroup

taxa, and 3) Reduced *A. pedersoni* dataset with no outgroup taxa (see Supplementary Methods

and Supplementary Table S2 on Dryad). Raw ddRADseq data were deposited at the NCBI

Sequence Read Archive (SRA) under BioProject PRJNA693691.

Species Delimitation and Phylogenetic Analyses

To test whether Titus et al. (2017b) had identified all *A. pedersoni* species-level diversity

throughout the Greater Caribbean, we conducted species discovery and delimitation analyses for

both single locus and ddRADseq datasets. For COI DNA barcodes, we used two species

discovery approaches: 1) pairwise sequence divergence using the program Automatic Barcode

Gap Discovery (ABGD; Puillandre et al. 2012), and 2) statistical parsimony networks using the

program TCS v2.1 (Clement et al. 2000; see Supplementary Methods). For the full ddRADseq

dataset (Dataset 1), we searched for major genetic partitions in our data with genetic cluster

analyses using discriminate analyses of principle components (DAPC; Jombart et al. 2010) in the

adegenet package (Jombart and Ahmed 2011) in R v3.5.0 (R Core Team 2015). Next, we used

Bayes Factor Delimitation* (BFD*; Leache et al. 2014a) to test competing species delimitation

hypotheses using species trees estimated in SNAPP (Bryant et al. 2012). Specifically, we tested

the current taxonomy of *A. pedersoni* (i.e. one widespread species) versus species delimitations

recovered by single and multi-locus species discovery analyses (i.e. two and three species

models respectively; see Supplementary Methods).

Phylogenetic analyses were then conducted to reconstruct evolutionary relationships

among *A. pedersoni* lineages. Using single locus COI data, we used RAxML 8.9.2 (Stamatkis

2014) and BEAST 1.8.2 (Drummond et al. 2007) to conduct maximum likelihood (ML) and

Bayesian phylogenetic analyses (see Supplementary Methods). Next, we used the reduced

ddRADseq dataset with outgroup taxa (Dataset 2) to conduct species tree analyses using SNAPP

and SVDquartets (Chifman and Kubatko 2014). For both, individuals were assigned to species

based on the results of our species delimitation analyses (see Results). Our species tree analysis

was run for 1,000,000 MCMC generations in SNAPP, and trees were sampled from the posterior

distribution every 100 generations, 10% of which were discarded as burn-in. For SVDquartets,

species tree analyses were conducted in PAUP v4.0 (Swofford 2003) using the multispecies

coalescent model, all possible quartet combinations, and 1000 bootstrap replicates (see

Supplementary Methods).

Topology testing and demographic model selection

Historical and contemporary gene flow can affect species tree topologies and parameter

estimations (e.g., Leache et al. 2014b; Solis-Lemus et al. 2016; Jiao et al. 2020; Rannala et al.

2020), but species tree analyses that use the multi-species coalescent model assume gene tree

discordance is the result of incomplete lineage sorting (ILS) rather than gene flow. Our

mitochondrial gene trees and ddRADseq species trees produced conflicting, yet fully supported,

tree topologies, and genetic clustering analyses suggest ongoing introgression where Floridian

and Caribbean *A. pedersoni* lineages co-occur along the Florida Reef Tract (see Results). To

account for gene flow and the potential for this to bias our species tree reconstruction and

parameter estimates, we incorporated migration parameters into topology testing and

demographic model selection analyses to provide statistically supported inference on the

evolutionary scenarios that may have given rise to the *A. pedersoni* species complex.

Using the reduced ddRADseq dataset without outgroup taxa (Dataset 3), the

multidimensional site frequency spectrum (mSFS), and coalescent simulations in *fastsimcoal2*

(FSC2; Excoffier et al. 2013), we built a comprehensive set of 45 evolutionary models across all

possible species tree topologies that vary in the timing and directionality of migration between

putative species (Fig. 1c; Supplementary Fig. S1 on Dryad). We built twelve models for each

possible species tree topology: (Caribbean, (Florida, Bermuda)), (Florida, (Caribbean,

Bermuda)), and (Bermuda, (Florida, Caribbean)). Models tested for contemporary and ancestral

gene flow between all putative species. We also tested an additional nine evolutionary models

that are not explicitly reliant on hierarchical species tree topologies: three island models testing

all migration combinations, three models with and without migration where the Caribbean,

Florida, and Bermudan species diverged simultaneously forming an unresolved polytomy, and

three hybrid speciation models, with and without migration, where both the Caribbean and

Florida species provided 50% of the genetic material that gave rise to the endemic Bermudan

species (Fig. 1c; Supplementary Fig. S1 on Dryad).

To perform model selection analyses, we constructed a 3-population joint-folded mSFS

for putative *A. pedersoni* lineages from Florida, Caribbean, and Bermuda (see Supplementary

Methods). To deal with missing data and not violate the assumptions of the mSFS we conducted

a down sampling procedure following Smith et al. (2017; see Supplementary Methods). Ten

mSFS replicates were built following this approach to account for possible variation in the down

sampling procedure and to calculate confidence intervals for parameter estimates. We used a

mutation rate of $3.9e^{-9}$ substitutions per site per generation, calculated from the genome of the

crustacean species *Daphnia pulex* (Order Cladocera; Keith et al. 2016), to convert parameter

estimate values to years, effective population sizes, and per generation migration rates.

Parameter estimates were then further scaled by assuming 2 generations per year because *A.*

pedersoni reaches sexual maturity at ~6 months (Gilipin & Chadwick 2017). All model

simulations were repeated 50 times for each mSFS replicate (45 models x 10 mSFS replicates x

50 simulations/model/mSFS replicate = 22,500 simulations). From each of the 50 runs, the run

with the highest composite likelihood was selected for parameter estimation and model selection.

The model with the best fit to the data was selected using Akaike Information Criterion (AIC)

and model probabilities calculated following Burnham and Anderson (2002). Parameter

estimates and 95% confidence intervals were then calculated for the best fit model. All analyses

were conducted on the Owens cluster at the Ohio Supercomputer Center (http://osc.edu).

Finally, we conducted analysis to independently confirm model selection inferences

about introgression and hybridization. Specifically, we used ABBA/BABA tests to confirm

introgression between Floridian and Caribbean lineages along the Florida Reef Tract, and we

conducted hybrid detection analyses using the program HyDe (Blischak et al. 2018) to confirm

that the Bermudan endemic lineage received substantial genomic contributions from both

Floridian and Caribbean lineages (see Supplementary Methods).

Results

Sequencing and Dataset Assembly

After sequencing, alignment, and trimming, we obtained 584 bp of mtDNA *COI*

sequence data across 451 individuals (final alignment available on Dryad). ddRADseq library

preparation and sequencing resulted in a total of 300.6 million sequence reads across 153

individuals (151 *A. pedersoni* plus two *P. yucatanicus*; Table S2 on Dryad), 276.1 million of

which passed quality control filtering and were retained to create the final datasets. Of the 151 *A.*

pedersoni sequenced, 16 were not retained in the final dataset because they did not yield at least

10,000 consensus sequences after clustering (Table S2 on Dryad). Requiring a locus to be

present in 75% of all individuals resulted in final datasets of varying sizes: 1) Full *A. pedersoni*

dataset with no outgroup taxa (N = 135 individuals; 1232 SNPs), 2) Reduced *A. pedersoni*

dataset with outgroup taxa (N = 45 individuals; 2101 SNPs), and 3) Reduced *A. pedersoni*

dataset with no outgroup taxa (N = 43 individuals; 4673 SNPs, see Supplementary Methods and

Supplementary Table S2 on Dryad).

Species Delimitation and Phylogenetic Analyses

Both single locus species delimitation approaches delimit three *A. pedersoni* lineages (Fig

2a). No new COI lineages were recovered using range-wide sampling, although the Caribbean

lineage does show the classic East/West phylogeographic structure at the Mona Passage (Fig 2a).

Phylogenetic analyses in RAxML and BEAST recover the same fully supported mtDNA tree

topology (Florida, (Caribbean, Bermuda)) as Titus et al. (2017; Fig 2a).

Using the full ddRADseq dataset, genetic clustering analyses selected $K = 4$ as the

optimum partitioning scheme (Figs 2b & 2c). These clusters correspond to the species delimited

by COI single locus analyses: Bermuda, Florida, and Caribbean. The DAPC analyses further

partitioned the Caribbean species into East and West clusters, reflecting the same intraspecific

structuring recovered by the COI analyses. Genetic cluster analyses also demonstrate possible

introgression between sympatric COI lineages along the Florida Reef Tract (Fig. 2c). Four

individuals with COI haplotypes belonging to the Floridian Endemic lineage cluster with the

Western Caribbean *A. pedersoni* lineage, while four individuals belonging to the Caribbean COI

haplotype lineage cluster with the Floridian Endemic lineage (Fig. 2c). No individuals outside of

Florida differed in their COI and RADseq cluster groupings. Like the COI data, BFD* species

delimitation analyses picked the three species model as the best fit to the data (Table S4).

Although the species delimitation analyses fully agree with each other, the phylogenetic

analyses between single-locus and genomic data do not. Using species delimitation assignments

supported by BFD*, species tree analyses in both SNAPP and SVDquartets recovered fully

supported species tree topologies of (Caribbean, (Florida, Bermuda)) that are at odds with the

COI phylogenetic tree (Fig 2d).

Topology testing and demographic model selection

Demographic simulations in FSC2 and AIC model selection placed all model support on

a (Caribbean, (Florida, Bermuda)) tree topology, and a demographic history that indicates

ancestral divergence occurred in isolation, followed by contemporary introgression between

sympatric Caribbean and Florida species, and unidirectional contemporary gene flow from both

Caribbean and Florida species to Bermuda (Table 1; Fig. 3). Divergence time estimates place

ancestral divergence between the Caribbean lineage and the MRCA of Florida and Bermuda at

3.52 mya (95% CI = 3.02-4.03 mya; Supplementary Table S5), and divergence between Florida

and Bermuda at 0.20 mya (95% CI = 0.18-0.22 mya; Table S5). Effective population size

estimates were an order of magnitude larger in the Floridian species than for the Caribbean

species (Supplementary Table S5). Effective population sizes estimates were less than 1,000

individuals for the putative Bermuda species (Supplementary Table S5). Per generation

migration rate estimates from both putative Caribbean and Florida species to Bermuda were low

(Supplementary Table S5).

ABBA/BABA tests confirm that shared alleles between Floridian and Caribbean species

found along the Florida Reef Tract are the result of introgression rather than incomplete lineage

sorting (Supplementary Table S6). Hybrid detection analyses in HyDe indicate that the

Bermudan species has a significant signature of hybridization between putative Florida and

Caribbean species at both the population and individual level (Supplementary Table S7). HyDe

estimates that ~48% of the Bermudan species genome comes from the Caribbean *A. pedersoni*

lineage (Supplementary Table S7).

Discussion

Our evolutionary reconstruction of *Ancylomenes pedersoni* highlights the complexity of

the processes that can generate species-level biodiversity. While our topology tests ultimately

agreed with our ddRADseq species tree topology, the demographic insights gained from this

approach underscores the importance of using model-based analyses that account for gene flow

to make improved inferences beyond what is possible with classic phylogenetic methods alone.

Based on our best fit demographic model (Fig. 4), the Floridian and Caribbean *A. pedersoni*

lineages diverged ~3.5 mya without gene flow. This divergence time coincides with the final

closure of the Isthmus of Panama (IOP) and strengthening of the Gulf Stream, a high-volume and

high-velocity ocean current that originates in the Florida Straits and separates the Florida Reef

Tract from the Caribbean Sea (Fig. 1; Huag and Tiedemann 1998; O'Dea et al. 2016). Combined

with a demographic signature of introgression along the Florida Reef Tract occurring more

recently in the evolutionary past, we interpret the initial divergence between these lineages to

have occurred allopatrically across the Florida Straits, with secondary contact coming later when

the Caribbean lineage was able to disperse back across this barrier. Ultimately, the Gulf Stream

facilitated divergence and dispersal in *A. pedersoni*, and carried pelagic larvae from both

Floridian and Caribbean lineages >1500km to Bermuda where they hybridized and remained

isolated enough to warrant status as an endemic hybrid species. The evolutionary history of *A.*

pedersoni is thus far more complex than previously hypothesized by Titus et al. (2017b) and

highlights a novel diversification pathway that has generated species-level diversity across a

relatively small, but biodiverse, marine region.

The formation of the IOP is one of the most globally significant and heavily studied,

natural events in Earth's history (reviewed by O'Dea et al. 2016). While the resulting land bridge

facilitated terrestrial range expansions and faunal interchange between North and South America,

in the oceans, the IOP severed the open seaway between the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans and sent

their respective communities on independent evolutionary trajectories (Knowlton et al., 1993;

Lessios 2008). In the Western Atlantic, the Caribbean Sea became warmer, saltier, and

oligotrophic, thereby facilitating major coral reef development (Lessios 2008). Although a pulse

of ecological speciation in scleractinian corals occurred in the 1 million years following the

formation of the IOP, the IOP fundamentally changed ocean circulation and global climate

patterns, leading directly to northern hemisphere glaciation and a period of marine extinction

(Budd and Johnson 1999). The repeated reduction in shallow water habitat that resulted from the

Pleistocene glacial cycles also decreased sea surface temperatures and drove major extinctions

in Caribbean corals (Budd and Johnson 1999). The result led to major ecological turnover, and

opportunity, in the Greater Caribbean (Budd and Johnson 1999; Budd and Klaus 2001; Prada et

al. 2016). In fact, while the origins of many higher-level taxonomic groups in the Caribbean can

be traced to major vicariant events such as the closure of the Tethys Sea and the formation of the

IOP (Cowman et al. 2013; Bowen et al. 2016), much of the species-level diversity that has

evolved within the Caribbean Sea itself appears to have originated ecologically/sympatrically

rather than allopatrically. Examples are wide-ranging and include reef fishes (Ruber et al. 2003;

Barber and Bellwood 2005; Rocha et al. 2005; Taylor and Hellberg 2005; Rocha et al. 2008;

Tavera et al. 2012), scleractinian corals (Weil and Knowlton 1994; Carlon and Budd, 2007;

Frade et al. 2010), octocorals (Lasker et al. 1983; Prada and Hellberg 2013; Prada et al. 2014;

Prada and Hellberg 2020), crustaceans (Knowlton and Keller 1983, 1985; Hurt et al. 2013), and

sea anemones (Titus et al. 2019a).

In contrast, allopatric speciation within the Greater Caribbean appears to be much rarer.

The Mona Passage between Hispañola and Puerto Rico is identified most frequently as the major

phylogeographic barrier in the region separating Western and Eastern Caribbean regions, but this

break is almost exclusively resolved at the intraspecific level (reviewed by DeBiasse et al.,

2016). Hyper-restricted endemic taxa have been only been described occasionally from the

Meso-American Barrier Reef and Southern Caribbean (Colin, P. 2002; Taylor and Hellberg

2005; 2006; Hurt et al. 2013; D'Aloia et al. 2017). Much of the allopatric diversity that arises in

the Tropical Western Atlantic comes via dispersal from the Greater Caribbean to Brazil where

major freshwater runoff from the Amazon basic creates a major barrier to gene flow between

regions (reviewed by Bowen et al. 2016). This is despite the fact that the formation of the IOP

deflected equatorial currents in the Atlantic northwards through the Caribbean Sea and into the

Gulf of Mexico where the current loops clockwise, mounds slightly, and then is pulled

downwards by gravity through the narrow Florida Straits, strengthening the Gulf Stream, which

can move 30 million cubic meters of water per second at velocities up to 2.5 m/s (Fig 1).

Although a number of phylogeographic studies also identify the Florida Straits as an important

intraspecific phylogeographic barrier, to our knowledge, no examples have demonstrated that

speciation has occurred across this barrier, let alone coincided with the formation of the IOP and

led to downstream endemic hybrid speciation. Instead, the Gulf Stream is often discussed as a

means of explaining the relative homogeneity between Bermudan and Caribbean marine

communities, and the subsequent low rates of Bermudan endemicity although though the nearest

coral reef system is >1500 kilometers away (reviewed by Titus et al. 2017b).

Our data thus uncover a novel example of the evolutionary consequences the formation

of the Isthmus of Panama has had on marine biodiversity. Our study is a particularly important

example for marine evolutionary biologists demonstrating the complexity of the geological,

biological, and physical oceanographic process that generate biodiversity on coral reefs

reinforcing that ocean currents can act as temporal allopatric barriers and downstream dispersal

pathways simultaneously. Finally, although introgressive hybridization is not uncommon in

marine systems, true hybrid speciation is rarely documented, and the importance of these

reticulate evolutionary processes are poorly understood (reviewed by Arnold and Fogarty 2009).

The results of our study argue strongly that methods that model gene flow and reticulate

processes be included regularly into systematic studies in the sea, particularly on the shallow

evolutionary timescales we have worked with here.

Acknowledgements

We thank Erich Bartels, Annelise del Rio, Jose Diaz, Dan Exton, Natalie Hamilton, Alex Hunter,

Anna Klompen Jason Macrander, Spencer Palombit, Stephen Ratchford, Jill Titus, Cory Walter,

Eric Witt, Clay Vondriska, and the Operation Wallacea dive staff for assistance in the field and

laboratory. Alonso Delgado assisted with ddRADseq analyses, and Jordan Satler and Megan

Smith provided valuable advice on simulation analyses and model selection. Bellairs Research

Station, the Bermuda Institute of Ocean Science, Cape Eleuthera Institute, CARMABI, Coral

View Dive Center, Gerace Research Centre, the Honduran Coral Reef Foundation, Mote Marine

Laboratory, Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, and the University of the Virgin Islands

provided valuable logistical support. Specimens were collected under permits: SE/A-88- 15,

PPF/DGOPA-127/14, CZ01/9/9, FKNMS-2012-155, SAL-12-1432A-SR, STT037-14, 140408,

MAR/FIS/17, 19985, and N. PPF/DGOPA-295/17. This research was supported by National

Science Foundation Doctoral Dissertation Improvement Grant DEB-1601645 and Florida Fish

and Wildlife Conservation Commission awards to B.M.T. & M.D. Operation Wallacea,

American Philosophical Society, International Society for Reef Studies Graduate Fellowship,

PADI Foundation Grant, American Museum of Natural History Lerner Gray Funds, and The

Ohio State University Presidential Fellowship provided funding to B.M.T. Field work in Mexico

was financially supported by CONACyTCB-2012-01-177293, CONABIO NE018, and the Harte

Research Institute assigned to NS. Additional funding was provided through the Trautman Fund

of The OSU Museum of Biological Diversity, The Ohio State University, and the National

Science Foundation DEB-1257796 to MD.

References

Álvarez-Noriega, M., Burgess, S.C., Byers, J.E., Pringle, J.M., Wares, J.P. and Marshall, D.J.,
2020. Global biogeography of marine dispersal potential. *Nature Ecology &*
Evolution, *4*(9), pp.1196-1203.

Arnold, M.L. and Fogarty, N.D., 2009. Reticulate evolution and marine organisms: the final
frontier? *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, *10*(9), pp.3836-3860.

Barber, P.H. and Bellwood, D.R., 2005. Biodiversity hotspots: evolutionary origins of
biodiversity in wrasses (Halichoeres: Labridae) in the Indo-Pacific and new world
tropics. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, *35*(1), pp.235-253.

Blischak, P.D., Chifman, J., Wolfe, A.D. and Kubatko, L.S., 2018. HyDe: a Python package for
genome-scale hybridization detection. *Systematic Biology*, *67*(5), pp.821-829.

Bowen, B.W., Rocha, L.A., Toonen, R.J. and Karl, S.A., 2013. The origins of tropical marine
biodiversity. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, *28*(6), pp.359-366.

Bowen, B.W., Gaither, M.R., DiBattista, J.D., Iacchei, M., Andrews, K.R., Grant, W.S., Toonen,
R.J. and Briggs, J.C., 2016. Comparative phylogeography of the ocean
planet. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *113*(29), pp.7962-7969.

Briones-Fourzán, P., Pérez-Ortiz, M., Negrete-Soto, F., Barradas-Ortiz, C. and Lozano-Álvarez,
E., 2012. Ecological traits of Caribbean sea anemones and symbiotic
crustaceans. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, *470*, pp.55-68.

Bryant, D., Bouckaert, R., Felsenstein, J., Rosenberg, N.A. and RoyChoudhury, A., 2012.
Inferring species trees directly from biallelic genetic markers: bypassing gene trees in a
full coalescent analysis. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, *29*(8), pp.1917-1932.

Budd, A.F. and Johnson, K.G., 1999. Origination preceding extinction during late Cenozoic
turnover of Caribbean reefs. *Paleobiology*, *25*(2), pp.188-200.

Budd, A.F. and Klaus, J.S., 2001. The origin and early evolution of the Montastraea "annularis"
species complex (Anthozoa: Scleractinia). *Journal of Paleontology*, *75*(3), pp.527-545.

Burnham, K.P. and Anderson, D.R., 2002. Model selection and multimodal inference: A
practical information theoretic approach. 2nd ed. New York, NY: Springer

Carlon, D.B. and Budd, A.F., 2002. Incipient speciation across a depth gradient in a scleractinian
coral? *Evolution*, *56*(11), pp.2227-2242.

Chace, F.A. Jr. (1958) A new shrimp of the genus Periclimenes from the West Indies.
Proceedings of the Biological Society of Washington, 71, 125–130.
428

429   Choat, J.H., 2006. Phylogeography and reef fishes: bringing ecology back into the
430   argument. *Journal of Biogeography*, *33*(6), pp.967-968.
431

432   Chifman, J. and Kubatko, L., 2014. Quartet inference from SNP data under the coalescent
433   model. *Bioinformatics*, *30*(23), pp.3317-3324.
434

435   Clement, M., Posada, D.C.K.A. and Crandall, K.A., 2000. TCS: a computer program to estimate
436   gene genealogies. *Molecular Ecology*, *9*(10), pp.1657-1659.
437

438   Colin, P.L., 2002. A new species of sponge-dwelling Elacatinus (Pisces: Gobiidae) from the
439   western Caribbean. *Zootaxa*, *106*(1), pp.1-7.
440

441   Cowman, P.F. and Bellwood, D.R., 2013. Vicariance across major marine biogeographic
442   barriers: temporal concordance and the relative intensity of hard versus soft
443   barriers. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, *280*(1768),
444   p.20131541.
445

446   D'Aloia, C.C., Bogdanowicz, S.M., Harrison, R.G. and Buston, P.M., 2017. Cryptic genetic
447   diversity and spatial patterns of admixture within Belizean marine
448   reserves. *Conservation Genetics*, *18*(1), pp.211-223.
449

450   DeBiasse, M.B., Richards, V.P., Shivji, M.S. and Hellberg, M.E., 2016. Shared
451   phylogeographical breaks in a Caribbean coral reef sponge and its invertebrate
452   commensals. *Journal of Biogeography*, *43*(11), pp.2136-2146.
453

454   Degnan, J.H. and Rosenberg, N.A., 2009. Gene tree discordance, phylogenetic inference and the
455   multispecies coalescent. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, *24*(6), pp.332-340.
456

457   Drummond, A.J. and Rambaut, A., 2007. BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling
458   trees. *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, *7*(1), pp.1-8.
459

460   Eaton, D.A., 2014. PyRAD: assembly of de novo RADseq loci for phylogenetic
461   analyses. *Bioinformatics*, *30*(13), pp.1844-1849.
462

463   Edgar, R.C., 2004. MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high
464   throughput. *Nucleic Acids Research*, *32*(5), pp.1792-1797.
465

466   Excoffier, L., Dupanloup, I., Huerta-Sánchez, E., Sousa, V.C. and Foll, M., 2013. Robust
467   demographic inference from genomic and SNP data. *PLoS Genet*, *9*(10), p.e1003905.
468

469   Frade, P.R., Reyes-Nivia, M.C., Faria, J., Kaandorp, J.A., Luttikhuizen, P.C. and Bak, R.P.M.,
470   2010. Semi-permeable species boundaries in the coral genus Madracis: introgression in
471   a brooding coral system. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, *57*(3), pp.1072-1090.
472

473   Haug, G.H. and Tiedemann, R., 1998. Effect of the formation of the Isthmus of Panama on
474   Atlantic Ocean thermohaline circulation. *Nature*, *393*(6686), pp.673-676.
475

476   Huebner, L.K., Shea, C.P., Schueller, P.M., Terrell, A.D., Ratchford, S.G. and Chadwick, N.E.,
477   2019. Crustacean symbiosis with Caribbean sea anemone *Bartholomea annulata*:
478   occupancy modeling, habitat partitioning, and persistence. *Marine Ecology Progress*
479   *Series*, *631*, pp.99-116.
480

481   Hurt, C., Silliman, K., Anker, A. and Knowlton, N., 2013. Ecological speciation in
482   anemone‐associated snapping shrimps (*Alpheus armatus* species complex). *Molecular*
483   *Ecology*, *22*(17), pp.4532-4548.
484

485   Gilpin, J.A. and Chadwick, N.E., 2017. Life-history traits and population structure of Pederson
486   cleaner shrimps *Ancylomenes pedersoni*. *The Biological Bulletin*, *233*(3), pp.190-205.
487

488   Jiao, X., Flouri, T., Rannala, B. and Yang, Z., 2020. The impact of cross-species gene flow on
489   species tree estimation. *Systematic Biology*, *69*(5), pp.830-847.
490

491   Jombart, T., Devillard, S. and Balloux, F., 2010. Discriminant analysis of principal components:
492   a new method for the analysis of genetically structured populations. *BMC*
493   *Genetics*, *11*(1), p.94.
494

495   Jombart, T. and Ahmed, I., 2011. adegenet 1.3-1: new tools for the analysis of genome-wide
496   SNP data. *Bioinformatics*, *27*(21), pp.3070-3071.
497

498   Kearse, M., Moir, R., Wilson, A., Stones-Havas, S., Cheung, M., Sturrock, S., Buxton, S.,
499   Cooper, A., Markowitz, S., Duran, C. and Thierer, T., 2012. Geneious Basic: an
500   integrated and extendable desktop software platform for the organization and analysis of
501   sequence data. *Bioinformatics*, *28*(12), pp.1647-1649.
502

503   Keith, N., Tucker, A.E., Jackson, C.E., Sung, W., Lledó, J.I.L., Schrider, D.R., Schaack, S.,
504   Dudycha, J.L., Ackerman, M., Younge, A.J. and Shaw, J.R., 2016. High mutational
505   rates of large-scale duplication and deletion in *Daphnia pulex*. *Genome Research*, *26*(1),
506   pp.60-69.
507

508   Knowlton, N. and Keller, B.D., 1983. A new, sibling species of snapping shrimp associated with
509   the Caribbean sea anemone *Bartholomea annulata*. *Bulletin of marine science*, *33*(2),
510   pp.353-362.
511

512   Knowlton, N. and Keller, B.D., 1985. Two more sibling species of alpheid shrimps associated
513   with the Caribbean sea anemones *Bartholomea annulata* and *Heteractis lucida*. *Bulletin*
514   *of Marine Science*, *37*(3), pp.893-904.
515

516   Knowlton, N., Weigt, L.A., Solorzano, L.A., Mills, D.K. and Bermingham, E., 1993. Divergence
517   in proteins, mitochondrial DNA, and reproductive compatibility across the Isthmus of
518   Panama. *Science*, *260*(5114), pp.1629-1632.
519

520 Lasker, H.R., Gottfried, M.D. and Coffroth, M.A., 1983. Effects of depth on the feeding
521   capabilities of two octocorals. *Marine Biology*, *73*(1), pp.73-78.
522

523 Leaché, A.D., Fujita, M.K., Minin, V.N. and Bouckaert, R.R., 2014. Species delimitation using
524   genome-wide SNP data. *Systematic Biology*, *63*(4), pp.534-542.
525

526 Leaché, A.D., Harris, R.B., Rannala, B. and Yang, Z., 2014. The influence of gene flow on
527   species tree estimation: a simulation study. *Systematic Biology*, *63*(1), pp.17-30.
528

529 Lessios, H.A., 2008. The great American schism: divergence of marine organisms after the rise
530   of the Central American Isthmus. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and*
531   *Systematics*, *39*, pp.63-91.
532

533 Mascaró, M., Rodríguez-Pestaña, L., Chiappa-Carrara, X. and Simões, N., 2012. Host selection
534   by the cleaner shrimp *Ancylomenes pedersoni*: Do anemone host species, prior
535   experience or the presence of conspecific shrimp matter? *Journal of Experimental*
536   *Marine Biology and Ecology*, *413*, pp.87-93.
537

538 O'Dea, A., Lessios, H.A., Coates, A.G., Eytan, R.I., Restrepo-Moreno, S.A., Cione, A.L.,
539   Collins, L.S., De Queiroz, A., Farris, D.W., Norris, R.D. and Stallard, R.F., 2016.
540   Formation of the Isthmus of Panama. *Science Advances*, *2*(8), p.e1600883.
541

542 Palumbi, S.R., 1994. Genetic divergence, reproductive isolation, and marine speciation. *Annual*
543   *Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, *25*(1), pp.547-572.
544

545 Potkamp, G. and Fransen, C.H., 2019. Speciation with gene flow in marine
546   systems. *Contributions to Zoology*, *88*(2), pp.133-172.
547

548 Prada, C. and Hellberg, M.E., 2013. Long prereproductive selection and divergence by depth in a
549   Caribbean candelabrum coral. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*
550   *Sciences*, *110*(10), pp.3961-3966.
551

552 Prada, C., McIlroy, S.E., Beltrán, D.M., Valint, D.J., Ford, S.A., Hellberg, M.E. and Coffroth,
553   M.A., 2014. Cryptic diversity hides host and habitat specialization in a gorgonian-algal
554   symbiosis. *Molecular Ecology*, *23*(13), pp.3330-3340.
555

556 Prada, C., Hanna, B., Budd, A.F., Woodley, C.M., Schmutz, J., Grimwood, J., Iglesias-Prieto, R.,
557   Pandolfi, J.M., Levitan, D., Johnson, K.G. and Knowlton, N., 2016. Empty niches after
558   extinctions increase population sizes of modern corals. *Current Biology*, *26*(23),
559   pp.3190-3194.
560

561 Prada, C. and Hellberg, M., 2020. Speciation-by-depth on coral reefs: sympatric divergence with
562   gene flow or cryptic transient isolation? *Journal of Evolutionary Biology*.
563

564 Puillandre, N., Lambert, A., Brouillet, S. and Achaz, G., 2012. ABGD, Automatic Barcode Gap
565   Discovery for primary species delimitation. *Molecular Ecology*, *21*(8), pp.1864-1877.
566

567 Quenouille, B., Hubert, N., Bermingham, E. and Planes, S., 2011. Speciation in tropical seas:
568   allopatry followed by range change. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, *58*(3),
569   pp.546-552.
570
571 R Core Team 2015. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. Vienna, Austria: R
572   Foundation for Statistical Computing. https://wwwR-project.org/
573
574 Rannala, B., Edwards, S.V., Leaché, A. and Yang, Z., 2020. The multi-species coalescent model
575   and species tree inference. *Phylogenetics in the Genomic Era*, pp.3.3:1-3.3:21.
576
577 Rocha, L.A., Robertson, D.R., Roman, J. and Bowen, B.W., 2005. Ecological speciation in
578   tropical reef fishes. *Proceedings of the Royal society B: Biological Sciences*, *272*(1563),
579   pp.573-579.
580
581 Rüber, L., Van Tassell, J.L. and Zardoya, R., 2003. Rapid speciation and ecological divergence
582   in the American seven‐spined gobies (Gobiidae, Gobiosomatini) inferred from a
583   molecular phylogeny. *Evolution*, *57*(7), pp.1584-1598.
584
585 Simmonds, S.E., Chou, V., Cheng, S.H., Rachmawati, R., Calumpong, H.P., Mahardika, G.N.
586   and Barber, P.H., 2018. Evidence of host-associated divergence from coral-eating snails
587   (genus *Coralliophila*) in the Coral Triangle. *Coral Reefs*, *37*(2), pp.355-371.
588
589 Smith, M.L., Ruffley, M., Espíndola, A., Tank, D.C., Sullivan, J. and Carstens, B.C., 2017.
590   Demographic model selection using random forests and the site frequency
591   spectrum. *Molecular Ecology*, *26*(17), pp.4562-4573.
592
593 Solís-Lemus, C., Yang, M. and Ané, C., 2016. Inconsistency of species tree methods under gene
594   flow. *Systematic Biology*, *65*(5), pp.843-851.
595
596 Stamatakis, A., 2014. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of
597   large phylogenies. *Bioinformatics*, *30*(9), pp.1312-1313.
598
599 Swofford, D.L., 2004. Paup 4.0 for Macintosh: Phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (software
600   and user's book for Macintosh)
601
602 Tavera, J.J., Acero, A., Balart, E.F. and Bernardi, G., 2012. Molecular phylogeny of grunts
603   (Teleostei, Haemulidae), with an emphasis on the ecology, evolution, and speciation
604   history of New World species. *BMC Eolutionary Biology*, *12*(1), p.57.
605
606 Taylor, M.S. and Hellberg, M.E., 2005. Marine radiations at small geographic scales: speciation
607   in neotropical reef gobies (*Elacatinus*). *Evolution*, *59*(2), pp.374-385.
608
609 Taylor, M.S. and Hellberg, M.E., 2006. Comparative phylogeography in a genus of coral reef
610   fishes: biogeographic and genetic concordance in the Caribbean. *Molecular*
611   *Ecology*, *15*(3), pp.695-707.
612

613   Titus, B.M. and Daly, M., 2015. Fine-scale phylogeography reveals cryptic biodiversity in
614   Pederson's cleaner shrimp, *Ancylomenes pedersoni* (Crustacea: Caridea: Palaemonidae),
615   along the Florida Reef Tract. *Marine Ecology*, *36*(4), pp.1379-1390.
616
617   Titus, B.M. and Daly, M., 2017. Specialist and generalist symbionts show counterintuitive levels
618   of genetic diversity and discordant demographic histories along the Florida Reef
619   Tract. *Coral Reefs*, *36*(1), pp.339-354.
620
621   Titus, B.M., Daly, M. and Exton, D.A., 2015. Temporal patterns of Pederson shrimp
622   (*Ancylomenes pedersoni* Chace 1958) cleaning interactions on Caribbean coral
623   reefs. *Marine Biology*, *162*(8), pp.1651-1664.
624
625   Titus, B.M., Vondriska, C. and Daly, M., 2017a. Comparative behavioural observations
626   demonstrate the 'cleaner'shrimp *Periclimenes yucatanicus* engages in true symbiotic
627   cleaning interactions. *Royal Society Open Science*, *4*(4), p.170078.
628
629   Titus, B.M., Palombit, S. and Daly, M., 2017b. Endemic diversification in an isolated
630   archipelago with few endemics: an example from a cleaner shrimp species complex in
631   the Tropical Western Atlantic. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, *122*(1), pp.98-
632   112.
633
634   Titus, B.M., Blischak, P.D. and Daly, M., 2019a. Genomic signatures of sympatric speciation
635   with historical and contemporary gene flow in a tropical anthozoan (Hexacorallia:
636   Actiniaria). *Molecular Ecology*, *28*(15), pp.3572-3586.
637
638   Titus, B.M., Daly, M., Vondriska, C., Hamilton, I. and Exton, D.A., 2019b. Lack of strategic
639   service provisioning by Pederson's cleaner shrimp (*Ancylomenes pedersoni*) highlights
640   independent evolution of cleaning behaviors between ocean basins. *Scientific*
641   *Reports*, *9*(1), pp.1-9.
642
643   Vermeij, G.J. and Grosberg, R.K., 2010. The great divergence: when did diversity on land
644   exceed that in the sea? *Integrative and Comparative Biology*, *50*(4), pp.675-682.
645
646   Weil, E. and Knowton, N., 1994. A multi-character analysis of the Caribbean coral *Montastraea*
647   *annularis* (Ellis and Solander, 1786) and its two sibling species, *M. faveolata* (Ellis and
648   Solander, 1786) and *M. franksi* (Gregory, 1895). *Bulletin of Marine Science*, *55*(1),
649   pp.151-175.
650

Table 1. Akaike Information Criterion results for models simulated in FSC2 for the *Ancylomenes pedersoni* species complex. Model name refers to variants of those depicted and described in Figure 2. k = number of parameters in the model, AIC = Akaike Information Criterion, Δ_I = change in AIC scores, and w_i = Akaike weights. Prefixes on model names refer to variation in model type and tree topology: A = ((Caribbean, (Florida, Bermuda)); B = ((Florida, (Caribbean, Bermuda)); C = ((Bermuda, (Caribbean, Florida)); Isl = Island Model; Hyb = Hybridization model; Sim = simultaneous divergence model. Models are listed according to their AIC rank and the highest ranked model is highlighted.

Model	k	Log (P)	AIC	Δ_I	Model Likelihood	w_i
i-Mod10	11	-22603.84	45229.67	0	1	1
ii-Mod6	10	-22676.34	45372.69	143.01	8.8e-32	8.8e-32
ii-Mod10	11	-22752.57	45527.15	297.48	2.5e-65	2.5e-65
iii-Mod11	14	-22999.99	46027.99	798.32	4.4e-174	4.4e-174
i-Mod11	12	-23010.73	46045.46	815.79	7.1e-178	7.1e-178
ii-Mod5	11	-23208.93	46439.85	1210.17	1.6e-263	1.6e-263
ii-Mod9	12	-23219.90	46463.79	1234.11	1.0e-268	1.0e-268
ii-Mod11	12	-23288.88	46601.75	1372.08	1.1e-298	1.1e-298
Sim-Mod3	9	-23311.22	46640.44	1410.76	4.5e-307	4.5e-307
ii-Mod7	9	-23322.72	46663.43	1433.75	0	0
iii-Mod7	11	-23331.81	46685.61	1455.93	0	0
iii-Mod6	11	-23350.94	46723.87	1494.19	0	0
ii-Mod3	10	-23421.51	46863.02	1633.34	0	0
ii-Mod2	9	-23503.47	47024.93	1795.25	0	0
ii-Mod4	10	-23510.66	47041.32	1811.64	0	0
Isl-Mod3	6	-23567.15	47146.29	1916.61	0	0
iii-Mod10	8	-23617.00	47249.99	2020.31	0	0
Isl-Mod2	7	-23625.89	47265.79	2036.11	0	0
iii-Mod9	9	-23681.36	47380.72	2151.04	0	0
ii-Mod8	8	-23742.41	47500.83	2271.14	0	0
i-Mod12	9	-23742.79	47543.59	2313.90	0	0
ii-Mod12	9	-23796.70	47611.40	2381.72	0	0
Hyb-Mod2	10	-23804.42	47628.84	2399.16	0	0
iii-Mod8	9	-23821.71	47661.43	2431.75	0	0
ii-Mod1	7	-23910.76	47835.53	2605.85	0	0
Hyb-Mod3	11	-24004.63	48031.26	2801.58	0	0
Sim-Mod2	7	-24593.07	49200.14	3970.46	0	0
Hyb-Mod1	8	-24598.03	49212.06	3982.38	0	0
iii-Mod3	10	-24691.93	49403.87	4174.19	0	0
Sim-Mod1	5	-24723.30	49456.61	4226.93	0	0
iii-Mod5	10	-24742.51	49505.02	4275.34	0	0
i-Mod7	9	-24766.59	49551.18	4321.50	0	0
i-Mod4	10	-24773.07	49566.14	4336.46	0	0
i-Mod5	11	-24789.54	49601.07	4371.39	0	0
i-Mod9	12	-24792.60	49609.20	4379.52	0	0
i-Mod2	9	-24796.43	49610.87	4381.19	0	0
iii-Mod4	9	-24807.98	49633.96	4404.28	0	0
iii-Mod2	8	-24809.91	49635.82	4406.14	0	0
i-Mod3	10	-24809.13	49638.27	4408.59	0	0
i-Mod8	8	-24816.92	49638.27	4420.16	0	0
iii-Mod12	8	-24825.62	49667.25	4437.57	0	0
i-Mod6	10	-24832.44	49684.87	4455.19	0	0
iii-Mod1	7	-24856.22	49726.44	4496.76	0	0
i-Mod1	7	-24919.15	49852.29	4622.61	0	0
Isl-Mod1	6	-25386.13	50784.27	5554.59	0	0

666
Figure 1. A) Representative image of *Ancylomenes pedersoni*. B) Field sampling localities in the Tropical
Western Atlantic 1) Bermuda 2) Ft. Lauderdale, FL, USA, 3) Upper Keys, FL, USA, 4) Middle Keys, FL,
USA, 5) Lower Keys, FL, USA, 6) Mahahual, Mexico, 7) Utila, Honduras, 8) Cayos Cochinos, Honduras,
9) Bocas del Toro, Panama, 10) Curacao, 11) Barbados, 12) St. Thomas, US Virgin Islands, 13) San
Salvador, Bahamas, 14) Eleuthera, Bahamas. Field site circle color indicates geographic range of each
putative speces: orange = endemic Bermudan lineage, red = endemic Floridian plus Caribbean lineages,
and yellow = Caribbean lineage. Ocean currents depicted by white stylized lines. Current strength
corresponds to white line density and length. Directionality of major ocean currents depicted by light blue
dashed lines. Map background and ocean currents visualization from NASA/Goddard Space Flight Center
Scientific Visualization Studio. Ocean currents visualized from current data collected from June 2005 –
December 2007. Double red dashed line demarcates the major phylogeographic break in the Caribbean.
C) Examples of the most parameter rich models used in *fastsimcoal2* simulations. i-iii) Isolation-
migration models on a fixed species tree topology with variation in the timing and directionality of
migration. iv) Isolation-migration models with simultaneous divergence between putative species. v)
Island models. vi) Hybrid speciation model where the Bermudan lineage represents a 50/50 hybrid
between Caribbean and Floridian species. Hybrid models were built with and without ancestral and
contemporary gene migration. C = Caribbean, F = Florida, B = Bermuda. Arrows represent migrations
events in the coalescent (i.e. backwards in time). In total, 45 models were built and simulated by
considering all pairwise combinations of gene flow between species (see main text)

686
Figure 2. A) Results from cytochrome *c* oxidase subunit (*COI*) phylogenetic gene tree reconstruction *of*
Ancylomenes pedersoni. Node labels represent bootstrap and posterior probability values from RAxML
and BEAST. Colored bars represent single locus species delimitation results from 1) Automatic barcode
gap detection (ABGD) and 2) Parsimony haplotype network reconstruction (TCS). B) Scatterplot
depicting K = 4 genetic clusters for *A. pedresoni* throughout the Tropical Western Atlantic using double
digest Restriction Site Associated DNA sequencing (ddRADseq). The best clustering scheme was
determined by discriminant analysis of principal components (DAPC) and Bayesian Information
Criterion. C) Bar plot depicting K = 4 genetic clusters for *A. pedersoni* ddRADseq data using DAPC
analyses: Bermuda (blue), Florida Endemic (Gray), Western Caribbean (Red), and Eastern Caribbean
(purple). * denotes introgressed individuals with FL endemic COI haplotypes. ^ denotes introgressed
inviduals with Western Caribbean COI haplotypes. Sample locality codes are as follows: BD (Bermuda),
PA (Bocas del Toro, Panama), CC (Cayos Cochinos, Honduras), UT (Utila, Honduras), MX (Mahauhal,
Mexico), FT (Ft. Lauderdale, FL, USA), UK (Upper Keys, FL, USA), MK (Middle Keys, FL, USA), LK
(Lower Keys, FL, USA), BH (Eleuthera, Bahamas), SAN (San Salvador, Bahamas), ST (St. Thomas, US
Virgin Islands), BR (Barbados), CU (Curacao, Netherlands Antilles). D) ddRADseq species tree
reconstruction of the three A. pedersoni lineages as delimited by BFD*. Node values represent bootstrap
values andposterior probabilities as determine by SVDquartets and SNAPP.
704

705
706
707

709 Figure 4. Best fit topology and evolutionary model for the *Ancylomenes pedersoni* species complex.
710 Arrows represent migration events in the coalescent (i.e. backwards in time).