1   Life history strategies explain bacterial activity in the soil carbon cycle

2   Samuel E. Barnett[a*], Nicholas D. Youngblut[a,b*], Chantal N. Koechli[a,c], and Daniel H. Buckley[a]

4   a. School of Integrative Plant Science, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY, USA

5   b. Department of Microbiome Science, Max Planck Institute for Developmental Biology,

6   Tübingen, Germany

c. Department of Biological Sciences, University of the Sciences, Philadelphia, NY, USA

*   Co-first authors

Corresponding author: Daniel H. Buckley

dbuckley@cornell.edu

ORCIDs: 0000-0002-0096-0605, 0000-0002-7424-5276, NA, 0000-0003-1654-2907

Keywords: DNA-SIP, bacterial, soil, carbon cycling, ecology

Author contributions: NDY and DHB conceived of the study, NDY and CNK conducted the

experiment and collected all the data, NDY and DHB analyzed the data, NDY, SEB, and DHB

wrote the manuscript. All authors were involved in editing and reviewing manuscript.

Competing interests: The authors declare no competing interests.

Abstract

Soil microorganisms determine the fate of soil organic matter (SOM), and their activities

comprise a major component of the global carbon (C) cycle. We sought to comprehend the

physiological and ecological mechanisms underpinning microbial contributions to SOM

dynamics by examining the activities of individual microorganisms within a complex soil

system. We determined bacterial activity by using a multi-substrate DNA-stable isotope probing

experiment to track C assimilation dynamics across thousands of bacteria within an agricultural

soil. In this way, we identified 1,286 bacterial taxa assimilating C from SOM. Substrate

bioavailability explained significant variation in mineralization rates and microbial assimilation

dynamics. We show that, while patterns of C assimilation exhibited little phylogenetic

conservation above the species level, these patterns defined functional clusters whose properties

exemplified broad differences in life history strategy, particularly along the copiotroph-

oligotroph continuum. We also show that these functional clusters explain soil community

response to fresh litter, and patterns of microbial biogeography at continental and global scales.

Our results add to the growing body of knowledge indicating that life history theory provides a

useful framework for understanding microbial contributions to terrestrial C-cycling.

Introduction

Soil organic matter (SOM) represents the largest terrestrial pool of organic carbon (C) on Earth [1], and SOM dynamics have major impacts on the global C-cycle. SOM is sensitive to land management [2–4] and climate change [5], and SOM pools influence soil health [6, 7], agricultural productivity [8], and climate stability [6, 9]. However, the mechanisms that promote SOM persistence and loss remain uncertain and this introduces variability into global C-cycle models [10–13]. Microorganisms are dominant drivers of SOM decomposition, stabilization, and mineralization [14], and C-cycle models increasingly seek to incorporate microbial traits to improve predictions of SOM dynamics [15, 16]. For example, microbially explicit C-cycle models, such as MEND [17], MIMICS [18], and CORPSE [19], improve prediction of C-cycle dynamics when compared to models that ignore microbial processing [20].

Soil microbes play a critical role in governing global C flux, but the microbial mechanisms that determine SOM dynamics remain poorly characterized [13]. Microbial contributions to soil C-cycling are typically determined in the aggregate (*e.g.,* soil respiration) without providing mechanistic insight into processes of individual microbes. Determining the functional abilities of individual microbes typically requires laboratory cultivation, but most soil microbes remain uncultivated and poorly characterized [21–23]. In the absence of cultivation, the functions of uncultivated microbes are often inferred by assuming phylogenetic conservation with cultivated representatives [24–26]. However, phylogenetic conservation varies dramatically among microbial traits and functionalities [27], and many soil microbes lack closely related cultivated isolates [28]. Alternatively, microbial functions can be inferred through metagenomic analyses, which indicate the frequency of specific gene families and metabolic pathways in the environment [29, 30].

Inferences based on phylogenetic conservatism and metagenomic analyses predict

'potential function', and not whether a function is realized *in situ*. Microbe-microbe and

microbe-environment interactions alter patterns of gene expression, activity, and growth, and so

potential function tells us little of the 'realized functions' manifesting in soil at any particular

place and time. The realized functions of microbes *in situ* depend on a complex pattern of biotic

and abiotic interactions, and the functions realized at any given place and time might correlate

only weakly with the functional potential of the community inferred from metagenomic analyses

[31, 32].

An alternative approach to predicting microbial activity in the C-cycle is to focus on

microbial life history strategies [33]. Life history strategies describe combinations of traits that

govern energy allocation to growth, resource acquisition, and survival [34, 35]. Since stabilized

SOM is largely composed of the products of microbial anabolic metabolism, microbial growth

dynamics are likely a major determinant of C fate in soil [14]. Life history theory proposes that

fitness optimization imposes tradeoffs on energy allocation [36, 37]. For example, growth rate

and substrate use efficiency correlate negatively in heterotrophic microbes [38]. This growth

versus efficiency tradeoff is foundational to the copiotrophy/oligotrophy hypothesis used to

explain microbial ecological dynamics [39]. Copiotrophs are characterized as microbes that

maximize fitness when nutrient flux across the cell membrane is high, having high maximum

growth rate but low carbon use efficiency. Oligotrophs are characterized as microbes that

maximize fitness when nutrient flux across the membrane is low, having low maximum growth

rate and high carbon use efficiency [40–42]. Growth parameters associated with life history

strategies (*e.g.,* growth rate and carbon use efficiency) can be readily modeled [18] and are of

high relevance to the C-cycle [43, 44]. While much focus in the literature emphasizes

copiotrophs and oligotrophs, many different tradeoffs impact microbial resource allocation to

growth and survival and these tradeoffs likely define diverse microbial life history strategies in

soil. However, direct observation of realized microbial activities as they occur *in situ* is

necessary to inform and refine our understanding of microbial life history strategies in soil.

DNA-stable isotope probing (DNA-SIP) can assess the realized function of microbes

within complex habitats [45] by identifying specific taxa that have incorporated isotopes from a

labeled substrate into their biomass [45]. DNA-SIP can track the assimilation of C from multiple

substrates into thousands of microbial taxa in soil [46–48] with high specificity and sensitivity

[48]. We used multiple-window high-resolution DNA-SIP (MW-HR-SIP) to track bacterial

utilization of C derived from nine distinct substrates that vary in bioavailability and are common

in soils (Fig. 1). We defined bioavailability on the basis of solubility and hydrophobicity, which

predicts sorption to particulate organic matter [49] and substrate availability for transport across

the cell membrane. The substrates include cellulose (a component of plant cell walls), glucose

and xylose (monomers of cellulose and hemicellulose respectively), vanillin (a phenolic acid

derived from lignin), glycerol and palmitic acid (components of plant lipids), an amino acid

mixture (monomers of protein), and lactate and oxalate (major fermentation products from soil

bacteria and fungi). Our multi-substrate design, where only the identity of the ^{13}C-substrate was

varied (Fig. 1), allowed us to systematically investigate substrate C assimilation while

maintaining identical conditions across samples. We hypothesized that bacterial contributions to

the soil C-cycle are governed by microbial life history strategies. We predicted that bacteria

could be grouped into ecologically relevant clusters based on their C assimilation dynamics.

Results and discussion

Substrate bioavailability explains carbon mineralization rates

We tracked C mineralization dynamics for each substrate over 48 days by measuring

$^{13}CO_2$ production. Peak substrate ^{13}C mineralization rates occurred on different days: day 1 for

glucose and amino acids; day 2 for xylose, glycerol, and vanillin; day 3 for lactate; day 7 for

oxalate; day 10 for cellulose; and day 14 for palmitic acid (Fig. 2A). Cumulative ^{13}C

mineralization varied substantially between substrates, being lowest for vanillin (42% C

mineralized to CO_2) and highest for oxalate (88% C mineralized, Fig. 2B). As expected, total C

mineralization ($^{13}C + {}^{12}C$) was similar across all treatments (Fig. S1) since all microcosms

received the same set of substrates and only the identity of the isotopically labeled substrate

varied. These mineralization dynamics were confirmed in an independent experiment with soils

from the same site (Fig. S2).

Since substrate bioavailability can predict degradation rate in soil [50], we used

substrates with differing bioavailability as measured by the octanol-water partition coefficient

(Kow). We found a significant negative correlation between Kow, and maximum mineralization

rate ($R^2 = 0.82$, p-value < 1E-3; Fig. S3A) and a significant positive correlation between Kow

and the day when maximal rates occurred ($R^2 = 0.82$, p-value < 1E-3; Fig. S3B). These findings

confirm that substrates with low bioavailability, such as cellulose (an insoluble polymer) and

palmitic acid (a fatty acid), are degraded slowly, while those with high bioavailability, such as

glucose, xylose, amino acids, and lactate are degraded rapidly. Vanillin (an aromatic molecule)

had intermediate bioavailability allowing it to be mineralized rapidly, however its

hydrophobicity favors adsorption to organic surfaces in soil [51, 52]. Hence, while vanillin in the

aqueous phase degrades rapidly, its sorption to organic matter limits microbial access over time.

Highly oxidized compounds such as oxalate favor allocation of C to catabolic processes,

resulting in greater cumulative mineralization [53, 54].

Bacteria active in C-cycling include non-cultivated representatives

133   The temporal dynamics of microbial C assimilation were assessed by performing MW-

HR-SIP for each of the nine ^{13}C-labeled substrates over 48 days. Sampling times were selected

based on the ^{13}C mineralization dynamics for each substrate. A total of 12,394 unique bacterial

OTUs were observed and 6,613 of these passed independent filtering on the basis of sparsity.

From this set, MW-HR-SIP identified 1,286 "incorporators" (*i.e.,* OTUs with significant

evidence of ^{13}C incorporation into DNA; Fig. 3; supplemental dataset). We also examined

unfractionated DNA (*i.e.,* DNA extracted directly from soil and not subjected to MW-HR-SIP) in

order to evaluate overall change in microbial community composition over time. The majority of

incorporators were also detected in unfractionated DNA (1,153, or about 90%), through 133

incorporators (~10%) were not observed in unfractionated DNA. This result indicates that rare

OTUs, not readily detected in 16S rRNA gene surveys, were active participants in soil C-cycling.

Density gradient centrifugation fractionates DNA by buoyant density and this technique will

often reveal rare taxa not readily observed when sequencing unfractionated soil DNA.

146   Only 13.6% of the incorporators matched known cultivated isolates (*i.e.,* > 97% 16S

rRNA gene sequence identity to known isolates), 59.6% had no closely related isolate (*i.e.,* <

97% 16S rRNA gene sequence identity), and 26.8% were distantly related to any known isolate

(*i.e.,* < 90% 16S rRNA gene sequence identity). C from substrates of low bioavailability (*i.e.,*

cellulose, palmitic acid, and vanillin) were incorporated primarily by non-cultivated OTUs (Fig.

S4). In contrast, C from substrates of high bioavailability (*i.e.,* glucose, xylose, amino acids,

glycerol, oxalate, and lactate) were incorporated primarily by OTUs matching known isolates

(Fig. S4). Microbes adapted for growth on low bioavailability substrates are likely to have traits

(*e.g.,* slow growth, metabolic dependency, surface attachment) that diminish their tolerance for

laboratory growth media and may limit their representation in culture collections [55, 56].

Phylogenetic conservation of C assimilation dynamics

The ecophysiology of bacterial OTUs is often inferred from their phylogenetic

relatedness [57–60]. We therefore sought to determine if C assimilation activity could be

predicted on the basis of phylogeny. We used two methods to test for the phylogenetic

conservation of C assimilation dynamics. First, we calculated the distance in realized activity

between OTUs (*i.e.,* dissimilarity in ^{13}C assimilation dynamics across all nine substrates).

Realized activity was weakly conserved among closely related taxa and this functional distance

increased rapidly with phylogenetic distance (Fig. 4A-B). Even when analyzing ^{13}C assimilation

dynamics from each substrate independently, phylogeny was poor predictor of realized function

(Fig. S5). Second, we used consenTRAIT [59] to measure the phylogenetic depth (*i.e.,* 16S

rRNA gene evolutionary distance; τ_D) at which patterns of ^{13}C assimilation were conserved. We

found τ_D values ranging from ~0.001 to 0.025 across the nine substrates (Fig. 4C), consistent

with τ_D values of carbon substrate utilization measured by Martiny et al. [59]. There was a

significant correlation between τ_D and time of assimilation (linear least squares regression; $R^2 =$

0.62, p-value < 1E-7; Fig. 4C). More specifically, phylogenetic depth was highest for vanillin,

cellulose, and palmitic acid when assimilated at later time points, though the phylogenetic

clustering of bacteria that assimilated C from these substrates was not statistically significant

from random across all time points (consenTRAIT; adjusted p-value ≥ 0.05; Fig. 4C). These

results suggest that the assimilation of C from low bioavailability substrates requires metabolic

capabilities or traits that are more deeply conserved that those capabilities required to assimilate

C from high bioavailability substrates.

Our results indicate that there is little phylogenetic conservation of *in situ* C assimilation

dynamics at taxonomic ranks above the species level (Fig. 4A-B), and that phylogenetic

relatedness is therefore a weak predictor of realized bacterial function in soil C-cycling. This

result stands in contrast to the observation that bacterial metabolic *potential* (*i.e.,* the presence or

absence of genes and pathways) exhibits strong phylogenetic conservation [59]. Our results

demonstrate the discrepancy between '*realized function*' as it occurs in soil and '*potential*

function' encoded in the genome. Realized function is determined by genetic potential (G) and

environmental characteristics (E), and G x E interactions exert powerful controls on trait

expression and fitness in ecological systems. Furthermore, ecological interactions, such as

competition, facilitation, and antagonism likely have profound impacts on the realized function

of microbes in soil [27].

Patterns of C assimilation delineate bacteria across life history strategies

Since phylogenetic relatedness was a weak predictor of substrate assimilation dynamics

in soil, we sought an alternative means to group bacteria into ecologically relevant clusters. We

used unsupervised clustering to group incorporators based on their ^{13}C labeling dynamics. This

approach generated 28 functional clusters (FC) composed of bacteria that shared similar patterns

of C assimilation (Fig. 5A; supplemental dataset). Each FC contained between 15 and 122

incorporators and represented 3 to 13 different phyla.

To better understand the ecological relevance of these clusters, we evaluated the manner

in which 5 properties varied among the 28 FC. These properties were selected as potential

indicators of bacterial life history strategies: predicted rRNA operon (*rrn*) copy number, the

timepoint ^{13}C-labeling was first observed, the number of substrates from which C was

incorporated, the average bioavailability of substrates from which C was incorporated, and the

initial relative abundance in the soil community. We used principal component analysis (PCA) to

differentiate FC on the basis of all five properties (Fig. 5B). The first principal component (PC1)

explained 51% of the variation among FC and was largely defined by bioavailability of the

substrates from which C was assimilated, the time of first labeling, estimated *rrn* copy number,

and initial relative abundance in the community. Linear regression against PC1 revealed a

significant positive relationship with initial relative abundance ($R^2 = 0.66$, p-value < 0.001; Fig.

S6) and *rrn* copy number ($R^2 = 0.44$, p-value < 0.001; Fig. S6), and a significant negative

relationship to bioavailability of the substrates from which C was assimilated ($R^2 = 0.69$, p-value

< 0.001; Fig. S6). We propose that PC1 reflects a continuum of life history strategies ranging

from more oligotrophic to more copiotrophic [39]. FC with low PC1 values are more

oligotrophic in character having low *rrn* copy number and assimilating C slowly from low

bioavailability substrates. FC with high PC1 values are more copiotrophic in character having

high *rrn* copy number and exhibiting rapid assimilation of C from high bioavailability substrates.

The copiotroph-oligotroph framework was first used to describe the life history strategies

of aquatic bacteria. Aquatic oligotrophs thrive at low substrate concentrations where substrate

flux across the membrane is low and this imposes selection for high metabolic efficiency [41, 42,

62–67]. Aquatic oligotrophic habitats are characterized by substrates that have low concentration

at steady state [68]. Under such equilibrium conditions, oligotroph growth rates are governed by

substrate affinity as described by Michaelis-Menton kinetics [41]. Soils, however, represent a

highly dynamic non-equilibrium system in which substrate availability varies over time in

response to nutrient inputs and water availability [69].

Soil drying limits diffusion dramatically, resulting in periods of substrate limitation even

if nutrients are otherwise abundant in bulk soil, while soil wetting enhances diffusive transport of

soluble nutrients. Hence, wetting and drying of soil have major impacts on nutrient availability

dynamics. Insoluble substrates, and those substrates adsorbed to surfaces, are unable to cross the

cytoplasmic membrane. Growth on these substrates is limited by the diffusion of enzymes and

enzyme products between cells and their substrates. As a result, we predict that growth on low

bioavailability substrates favors slow growing oligotrophs, because limitations on diffusion and

transport should select for metabolic efficiency. Furthermore, diffusive fluxes are favored by

intimate contact between organism and substrate. Such close contacts persist in water films that

coat soil aggregates, and remain in place as soils dry and diffusion is limited by increasing

tortuosity. Hence, we predict that oligotrophic activity persists over a wide range of moisture

availability in soils and that such activity is mediated by diverse collections of interacting

organisms. In contrast, we predict that growth on soluble substrates favors copiotrophs, because

these substrates are ephemeral in nature outside of the rhizosphere, being transiently available in

high concentration as a pulsed resource following wetting events. When soils are dry, water-

soluble substrates are poorly available due to diffusional limitation. Wetting provides a flush that

delivers these substrates into pore water where they are more accessible and where diffusion is

less limited because tortuosity is low. The pulsed nature of soluble organic matter in soil pore

water will favor rapid growth when nutrients are transiently present in excess, because the

benefits of high affinity only matter when nutrients are present at low concentration and the

benefits of high efficiency only matter when nutrients are present at steady state.

Copiotroph and oligotroph life history strategists should exhibit different growth

dynamics with the former exhibiting rapid population growth when nutrients are available and

the latter exhibiting slow, less variable growth over time [39]. We examined relative abundance

dynamics for all incorporator OTUs to infer growth dynamics and assessed growth dynamics

across the proposed copiotroph-oligotroph continuum (*i.e.,* PC1). As sequencing data is

compositional [70], we normalized relative abundance values with respect to DNA yield and

predicted *rrn* copy number for each sample. Correction for *rrn* copy number was employed to

prevent overestimation of the initial growth response from fast growing organisms which had

significantly higher *rrn* copy number than slow growing organisms (Fig. 4B, 6A, S6). We note

that, while this normalization method reduces compositionality artifacts and improves

representation of OTU relative abundance dynamics, it likely misestimates true population sizes

by not accounting for differences in genome size nor differential DNA recovery from *Bacteria*,

Archaea, and *Eukarya*. For the most copiotrophic FC (PC1 > 0.10), normalized relative

abundance increased dramatically over time, reaching a maximum at day 3 followed by a rapid

decline (Fig. 6). This dynamic is similar to the "boom and bust" cycles typically observed for

conditionally rare or copiotrophic bacteria [39, 71, 72]. For the most oligotrophic FC (PC1 < -

0.15) the increase in normalized relative abundance was far slower and less dynamic, reaching a

maximum at 30 days (Fig. 6). This slow and steady growth is expected for oligotrophic

organisms that have low population turnover rates and efficient yet slower biomass production

[39]. FC in the middle of the continuum (-0.15 < PC1 < 0.10), demonstrated intermediate growth

dynamics and reached a maximum at day 6 (Fig. 6). We observed an initial transient dip in

normalized relative abundance for the latter two groups. While it is possible that these groups

experienced mortality upon wetting of soil, it seems likely, given the large increase in the

relative abundance of copiotrophic bacteria, that this dip is an artifact of sequencing

compositionality not eliminated by normalization.

We further assessed whether the life history strategies defined along PC1 are

phylogenetically conserved, and whether they explain variations in predicted phenotypic traits

from the ProTRAITS atlas [26]. PC1 explained a small but significant amount of variation in the

phylogenetic composition of FC (Unifrac distance; PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.092$, p-value $= 1E-4$;

Fig. 5C). However, there was little evidence that life history strategy was conserved at large

taxonomic scales (Fig. S7). PC1 explained a small but significant amount of variation in

predicted phenotypic traits (PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.032$, p-value $< 1E-4$; Fig. 5D). These

findings further demonstrate that associations with cultured representatives have low capacity to

predict realized C-cycling function of soil bacteria.

Beyond the copiotroph-oligotroph continuum

While the copiotroph-oligotroph axis (PC1) explained most variation in C assimilation

dynamics, additional variation was described by the PC2 axis (Fig. 5B). Most variation in PC2

occurs at the copiotrophic end (PC1 > 0.1) of the copiotroph-oligotroph continuum, while

oligotrophic taxa (PC1 < -0.015) exhibit little variation in PC2. We hypothesize that this

differentiation of FC along both PC1 and PC2 is explained by Grime's C-S-R life history

framework [35].

The C-S-R framework divides organisms into three strategies (competitors, stress

tolerators, and ruderals). While this framework was originally designed to describe plant life

history strategies, it has recently been applied to microbial systems [73–75]. Ruderal bacteria (R)

would be those that have little investment in resource acquisition, being adapted for rapid growth

in response to non-equilibrium conditions during nutrient pulses and disturbance. Competitive

bacteria (C) can also grow rapidly but are adapted for yield because they allocate more energy to

resource acquisition under steady state conditions. Competitors grow with greater efficiency than

ruderals but their investments in resource acquisition render them more sensitive to disturbance

[75]. In this framework, both ruderals and competitors can be considered copiotrophs because of

their tendency to be favored when substrate bioavailability is high [73], but these strategies

would manifest differently in their temporal dynamics and sensitivity to non-equilibrium states

(*e.g.,* disturbance). The stress tolerator (S) strategy was defined by Grime on the basis of abiotic

stress, but we propose that for soil bacteria this category corresponds to tolerance of metabolic

stress and that these organisms are adapted for life at low energy flux (*i.e.*, conditions that would

result in starvation or dormancy of copiotrophs). In soil, we propose that stress tolerators are

therefore synonymous with oligotrophs.

While PC1 divides the FC along an oligotroph-copiotroph continuum as described

previously, we propose that PC2 divides the FC along a ruderal-competitor continuum. FC with

high PC1 and low PC2 values have very high *rrn* copy number, low initial relative abundance,

and they tend to assimilate C from a low diversity of highly available substrates. FC with high

PC1 and high PC2 values have moderate to high *rrn* copy number, high initial relative

abundance, and they tend to assimilate C from diverse substrates likely indicating diverse

resource acquisition capabilities (Fig. S8).

Life history strategy explains bacterial response to plant residue addition

To further explore the predictive ability of life history strategies to explain microbial C-

cycling dynamics *in situ*, we mapped our incorporator OTUs to data from a Whitman et al. 2016

[76] study examining plant residue decomposition in agricultural soils. We found a significant

positive correlation between an OTU's position on the copiotroph-oligotroph continuum (PC1)

and its response to plant litter addition in agricultural fields (Fig. S9). Copiotrophic FC increased

significantly in abundance within 12 days of fresh litter addition to soil (R^2 = 0.304, p-value =

0.002), and these trends persisted over 82 days (R^2 = 0.211, p-value = 0.014). The increase and

then decline of copiotrophs in response to either fresh litter (Fig S9) or substrate mixture (Fig. 6)

suggests a pattern of community succession when a pulse of C is added to soil, a pattern that has

been observed and discussed previously [77].

C-cycle functionality explains microbial biogeography

We mapped incorporators to global bacterial surveys to determine whether realized C-

cycling activity, as defined by FC membership, explained variation in biogeography of soil

bacteria. We employed RLQ analysis, a multivariate approach that finds correspondence

between organism properties (R) and environmental parameters at various sites (Q; *e.g.,* habitat

or soil pH) based on organismal abundance within sites (L) [78, 79]. We mapped incorporator

OTUs and their FC membership to two 16S rRNA gene surveys of soil bacterial diversity

spanning continental (QIITA study 619) and global scales (QIITA study 928) [80]. FC

membership explained significant variation in microbial relative abundance across

environmental parameters (Table S1; Fig. S10). At continental scales, FC with high PC1 and

high PC2 (competitors) were associated with forest soils, and soils having high organic C and N

(DL; Fig. S10A). At global scales, these FC were positively associated with latitude (DL; Fig.

S10B), likely as a result of the northern concentration of forest ecosystems and soil organic

matter at global scales. The FC that were most strongly associated with tropical and subtropical

broadleaf forests were those that most rapidly assimilated C from cellulose (PE; Fig. S10B). The

FC that were most strongly associated with temperate grasslands, savannas, and shrubland were

generalists that incorporated diverse substrates (DL, PL, and VL; Fig. S10B). FC assigned to the

oligotrophic strategy (low PC1) were most closely associated with desert biomes (PL and VL;

Fig. S10A). These results show that patterns of microbial C-assimilation can be linked to patterns

of microbial biogeography and they suggest that these relationships can be predicted from

microbial ecological characteristics derived from life history theory.

Conclusions

We conducted a multi-substrate DNA-SIP experiment to measure the *in situ* activities of

bacteria in the soil C-cycle. We show that degradation dynamics and patterns of bacterial C

assimilation depended on substrate bioavailability. In total, 1286 bacteria were found to

incorporate C from the nine substrates assayed, and most of these bacteria were distantly related

to cultivated isolates. We found that realized C assimilation dynamics in soil had low

phylogenetic conservation among bacteria and were poorly predicted by phylogenetic affinity to

cultivated isolates. Instead, variation in C assimilation dynamics were explained by ecological

characteristics associated with variation in life history strategies. We also show that shared C

assimilation dynamics and ecological characteristics (*i.e.,* functional clusters) predicted

community level response when plant litter was added to soil and could explain significant

variation in bacterial biogeography. Our results demonstrate that life history strategies are a

cogent way to group bacteria by their realized function. SOM is largely derived from the

products of anabolic microbial metabolism [14], and therefore microbial assimilation and

processing of C over time is a primary determinant of carbon fate in soil. Based on our results,

we hypothesize that C fate in soil is not determined primarily by the metabolic pathways that

enable its catalysis, but rather it is determined by the life history traits that govern microbial

fitness *in situ*. As a result, life history classifications could be useful in predicting the C-cycle

activity of microbial communities [18] and SOM dynamics and fate. While more research is

necessary to better understand the genetic and ecological underpinnings of life history strategies

in soil bacteria, our results add to the growing body of knowledge indicating the importance of

life history theory to bacterially mediated terrestrial C-cycling.

Materials and methods

Soil microcosm experiments

Soil microcosms were designed and incubated with ^{13}C-labeled and unlabeled substrates

as previously described [47] except that C amendment consisted of nine substrates: cellulose,

xylose, glucose, glycerol, vanillin, palmitic acid, amino acid mixture, lactate, and oxalate (SI,

Table S2). For most substrates, Kow was determined from reference values, but operational Kow

values were estimated for cellulose (which is insoluble) and amino acids (which is a mixture) as

described in SI. Each substrate was added at 0.4 mg C g^{-1} soil. Only one of the nine substrates

was ^{13}C-labeled in each treatment while the remainder were unlabeled (Fig. 1). Soil was from

Penn Yan, New York, USA , with site and collection methods previously described [47, 81] and

outlined in SI. ^{13}C and ^{12}C mineralization dynamics were determined based on concentrations of

$^{12}CO_2$ and $^{13}CO_2$ in microcosm headspace measured over time as detailed in SI. Soil from

microcosms were destructively sampled depending on substrate mineralization dynamics over

days 1, 3, 6, 14, 30, and 48 after substrate addition.

DNA extraction and isopycnic centrifugation

DNA extraction and isopycnic centrifugation was conducted as previously described [47]

and detailed in SI. In short, for each treatment, size selected DNA (≥ 4 kb) [82] was centrifuged

in a CsCl density gradient and 100 µl fractions were collected. An aliquot of DNA taken before

isopycnic centrifugation was used for whole microcosm bacterial community sequencing (*i.e.,*

unfractionated DNA).

16S rRNA gene amplification and sequencing

We amplified and sequenced the V4 region of the 16S rRNA gene as previously

described [83] and detailed in SI using dual indexed primers (515f and 806r) developed by

Kozich *et al.* [84]. 16S rRNA amplicon libraries were processed as described previously [47] and

detailed in SI. OTUs were clustered at 97% sequence similarity. Raw sequencing reads can be

accessed at the NCBI Short Read Archive (accession PRJNA668741).

Identifying incorporators

OTUs that incorporated ^{13}C into their DNA (*i.e.,* incorporators) were identified with

MW-HR-SIP [48] using development code for the HTSSIP R package [85]. In short, we used

DESeq2 [86] to identify OTUs significantly enriched in the "heavy" gradient fractions of the

^{13}C-labeled treatments compared to the "heavy" gradient fractions in corresponding ^{12}C-control.

Incorporators were defined as OTUs with a $\log_2$ fold enrichment greater than 0.25 and a

Benjamini-Hochberg adjusted p-value less than 0.1. We used the overlapping BD windows 1.70-

1.73, 1.72-1.75, and 1.74-1.77 g/ml, which were shown via simulations to have the highest

sensitivity across all tested scenarios while not losing specificity [48]. Independent sparsity

filtering was conducted for each BD window to minimize the number of comparisons performed.

The taxonomic novelty of incorporators was determined by aligning OTU representative

sequences to the Silva all-species living tree project small subunit database version 123,

representing all sequenced type strains curated at that time [87]. Alignment was performed using

nucleotide BLAST [88] with an expected value cutoff of 1E-20. Incorporators with no hits $\geq$

97% sequence identity were considered to have no closely related isolates, while those with no

hits $\geq$ 90% were considered to have no related isolates. Statistical analyses were conducted in R

version 3.1.2 [89].

Analyses of phylogenetic conservation

Fasttree v2.1.9 [90] was used to infer a maximum likelihood phylogeny from the 16S

rRNA sequence alignment of representative OTUs. The phylogeny was rooted with *Sulfolobus*

solfataricus DSM1616 (Genbank accession X90478) as the outgroup. Phylogenetic conservation

of realized function was examined both by comparing functional distance with phylogenetic

distance and testing for a phylogenetic signal with a modified version of consenTRAIT [59]

(https://github.com/nick-youngblut/consenTRAIT).

Analysis of functional clusters (FC)

Incorporators were grouped into FC based on their isotopic labelling response as

determined by $\log_2$ fold change in ^{13}C-labeled treatment fractions versus corresponding

unlabeled control fractions. Specifically, clustering was performed by: *i*) calculating pairwise

Gower distances for each OTU pair, *ii*) hierarchically clustering (UPGMA agglomeration

method) based on the resulting distance matrix, *iii*) generating a dendrogram of the hierarchical

associations, *iv*) detecting clusters in the dendrogram using the *cutreeHybrid* function in the

DynamicTreeCut R package [91].

The rRNA operon copy number (*rrn*) of each OTU was predicted as described previously

[92]. Briefly, pplacer v1.1 [93] was used to insert OTU representative sequences into a 16S

rRNA gene reference phylogeny of bacteria with known *rrn*. The resulting phylogeny was used

by guppy v1.1 to predict *rrn* copy numbers of each OTU based on its relatedness to the reference

taxa.

FC function and trait properties were compared using principal component analysis

(PCA) with each property averaged across OTUs within each FC. Functional properties

examined were: number of substrates incorporated, initial relative abundance in soil,

bioavailability of the substrates incorporated, and time of first labeling, and the trait property

used was predicted *rrn* copy number. The two highest principal components were used to

classify FC within life history strategies.

Changes in OTU relative abundance over time (Fig. 6) were assessed following

normalization to minimize compositional data bias. Normalization included two steps:

normalizing for DNA yield and normalizing for predicted *rrn* copy number. The extracted ng

DNA g^{-1} dry weight soil was quantified with the Quant-iT PicoGreen dsDNA Assay Kit (Thermo

Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA). The relative abundance for each OTU in unfractionated

DNA was normalized by first multiplying by sample DNA yield, and then multiplying by a

proportion representing the *rrn* copy number of the OTU relative to the summed copy number of

the community.

Predicting phenotypic traits of FC

Phenotypic traits were predicted for FC using ProTraits [26]. First, incorporator OTUs

were aligned to the microbial 16S rRNA sequence database from the RefSeq Targeted Loci

project using nucleotide BLAST [88] with a sequence identity cutoff of 97%. Alignment matches

were then mapped to the ProTraits 0.9 precision database [26] based on their unique identifier.

Unmapped OTUs were removed from the analysis. Traits were trimmed to just those of interest

including primarily metabolisms. Trait scores were averaged across all mapped incorporators

within each FC. Trait scores were compared across PC1 from the PCA of FC characteristics by

PERMANOVA with averaged phenotypic trait score dissimilarity measured by Bray-Curtis.

Mapping incorporators to independent datasets

Detailed descriptions of the independent datasets and their analysis for this study are

found in SI. In short, OTU count tables, representative 16S rRNA gene sequences, and metadata

was obtained from the authors for Whitman *et al.* 2016 [76] and downloaded from

https://qiita.ucsd.edu/ for QIITA studies 619 (continental dataset) and 928 (global dataset).

Incorporators were mapped to external dataset OTUs separately for each study with the mothur

alignment tool [94] using the Silva reference alignment as a template. To responses of FC to

fresh organic matter addition in Whitman *et al.* 2016 [76] relative abundances of matching OTUs

in each field sample were summed within the FC of their mapped incorporators. Then, the

enrichment of FC in either PyOM or FOM treatment soils compared to control soils were

calculated with DESeq2 [86] with an alternative hypothesis of greater than 1 $\log_2$ fold change

enrichment in treatment. To examine the biogeography of FC at continental (QIITA 619) and

global (QIITA 928) scales, FC were first grouped for simplicity based on bioavailability of their

substrates (D = glucose, xylose, amino acids, glycerol, oxalate, and lactate; V = vanillin; P =

cellulose and palmitic acid) and time of labeling (E = first half of timepoints, L = second half of

timepoints). Then for each QIITA dataset FC designations (R) of mapped OTUs were used in

combination with their OTU count tables (L) and sample metadata (Q) for RLQ and forth corner

analyses [79, 95] as detailed in SI.

Acknowledgements

We thank Chuck Pepe-Ranney, Ashley Campbell, Marquessa Henry, and Braulio Castillo, Anay

Hindupur, and Jillian Waters for their help with experimental design and implementation.

Funding

This material is based upon work supported by the Department of Energy Office of Science,

Office of Biological & Environmental Research Genomic Science Program under Award

Numbers DE-SC0004486 and DE-SC0010558.

References

481   1.   Jobbágy EG, Jackson RB. The vertical distribution of soil organic carbon and its relation

482   to climate and vegetation. *Ecol. Appl.* 2000; 10: 423–436.

483   2.   Brovkin V, Boysen L, Arora VK, Boisier JP, Cadule P, Chini L, *et al.* Effect of

484   anthropogenic land-use and land-cover changes on climate and land carbon storage in

485   CMIP5 projections for the twenty-first century. *J. Clim.* 2013; 26: 6859–6881.

486   3.   Scharlemann JPW, Tanner EVJ, Hiederer R, Kapos V. Global soil carbon: understanding

487   and managing the largest terrestrial carbon pool. *Carbon Manag.* 2014; 5: 81–91.

488   4.   Luo Z, Wang G, Wang E. Global subsoil organic carbon turnover times dominantly

489   controlled by soil properties rather than climate. *Nat. Commun.* 2019; 10: 3688.

490   5.   Bradford MA, Wieder WR, Bonan GB, Fierer N, Raymond PA, Crowther TW. Managing

491   uncertainty in soil carbon feedbacks to climate change. *Nat. Clim. Chang.* 2016; 6: 751–

492   758.

493   6.   Lal R. Soil carbon sequestration impacts on global climate change and food security.

494   *Science* 2004; 304: 1623–1627.

495   7.   Lal R. Soil health and carbon management. *Food Energy Secur. 2016;* 5: 212–222.

496   8.   Reeves DW. The role of soil organic matter in maintaining soil quality in continuous

497   cropping systems. *Soil Tillage Res.* 1997; 43: 131–167.

498   9.   Smith P. Soils as carbon sinks: the global context. *Soil Use Manag.* 2004; 20: 212–218.

499   10.   Heimann M, Reichstein M. Terrestrial ecosystem carbon dynamics and climate

500   feedbacks. *Nature* 2008; 451: 289–292.

11.   Todd-Brown KEO, Randerson JT, Hopkins F, Arora V, Hajima T, Jones C, *et al.*

Changes in soil organic carbon storage predicted by Earth system models during the 21st

century. *Biogeosciences* 2014; 11: 2341–2356.

12.   Luo Y, Keenan TF, Smith M. Predictability of the terrestrial carbon cycle. *Glob. Chang.*

Biol. 2015; 21: 1737–1751.

13.   Wieder WR, Hartman MD, Sulman BN, Wang Y-P, Koven CD, Bonan GB. Carbon cycle

confidence and uncertainty: Exploring variation among soil biogeochemical models.

Glob. Chang. Biol. 2018; 24: 1563–1579.

14.   Schimel J, Schaeffer S. Microbial control over carbon cycling in soil. *Front. Microbiol.*

2012; 3: 348.

15.   Todd-Brown KEO, Randerson JT, Post MW, Hoffman FM, Tarnocai C, Schuur EAG, S.

D. Allison SD. Causes of variation in soil carbon simulations from CMIP5 Earth system

models and comparison with observations. *Biogeosciences* 2013; 10: 1717–1736.

16.   Wieder WR, Allison SD, Davidson EA, Georgiou K, Hararuk O, He Y, *et al.* Explicitly

representing soil microbial processes in Earth system models. *Global Biogeochem.*

Cycles 2015; 29: 1782–1800.

17.   Wang G, Post WM, Mayes MA. Development of microbial-enzyme-mediated

decomposition model parameters through steady-state and dynamic analyses. *Ecol. Appl.*

2013; 23: 255–272.

18.   Wieder WR, Grandy AS, Kallenbach CM, Bonan GB. Integrating microbial physiology

and physio-chemical principles in soils with the MIcrobial-MIneral Carbon Stabilization

(MIMICS) model. *Biogeosciences* 2014; 11: 3899–3917.

19.   Sulman BN, Phillips RP, Oishi AC, Shevliakova E, Pacala SW. Microbe-driven turnover

524   offsets mineral-mediated storage of soil carbon under elevated CO2. *Nat. Clim. Chang.*

525   2014; 4: 1099–1102.

526   20.   Wieder WR, Bonan GB, Allison SD. Global soil carbon projections are improved by

527   modelling microbial processes. *Nat. Clim. Chang.* 2013; 3: 909–912.

528   21.   Hug LA, Baker BJ, Anantharaman K, Brown CT, Probst AJ, Castelle CJ, *et al.* A new

529   view of the tree of life. *Nat. Microbiol.* 2016; 1: 16048.

530   22.   Lloyd KG, Steen AD, Ladau J, Yin J, Crosby L. Phylogenetically novel uncultured

531   microbial cells dominate earth microbiomes. *mSystems* 2018; 3: e00055-18.

532   23.   Steen AD, Crits-Christoph A, Carini P, DeAngelis KM, Fierer N, Lloyd KG, Thrash JC.

533   High proportions of bacteria and archaea across most biomes remain uncultured. *ISME J.*

534   2019; 13: 3126-3130.

535   24.   Langille MGI, Zaneveld J, Caporaso JG, McDonald D, Knights D, Reyes JA, *et al.*

536   Predictive functional profiling of microbial communities using 16S rRNA marker gene

537   sequences. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 2013; 31: 814–821.

538   25.   Aßhauer KP, Wemheuer B, Daniel R, Meinicke P. Tax4Fun: predicting functional

539   profiles from metagenomic 16S rRNA data. *Bioinformatics* 2015; 31: 2882–2884.

540   26.   Brbić M, Piškorec M, Vidulin V, Kriško A, Šmuc T, Supek F. The landscape of

541   microbial phenotypic traits and associated genes. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 2016; 44: 10074–

542   10090.

543   27.   Martiny JBH, Jones SE, Lennon JT, Martiny AC. Microbiomes in light of traits: A

544   phylogenetic perspective. *Science* 2015; 350: aac9323.

28.   Choi J, Yang F, Stepanauskas R, Cardenas E, Garoutte A, Williams R *et al.* Strategies to

improve reference databases for soil microbiomes. *ISME J.* 2017; 11: 829–834.

29.   Fierer N, Leff JW, Adams BJ, Nielsen UN, Bates ST, Lauber CL, *et al.* Cross-biome

metagenomic analyses of soil microbial communities and their functional attributes.

Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 2012; 109; 21390–21395.

30.   Alneberg J, Karlsson CMG, Divne AM, Bergin C, Homa F, Lindh MV, *et al.* Genomes

from uncultivated prokaryotes: a comparison of metagenome-assembled and single-

amplified genomes. *Microbiome* 2018; 6: 173.

31.   Wohl DL, Arora S, Gladstone JR. Functional redundancy supports biodiversity and

ecosystem function in a closed and constant environment. *Ecology* 2004; 85: 1534–1540.

32.   Evans R, Alessi AM, Bird S, McQueen-Mason SJ, Bruce NC, Brockhurst MA. Defining

the functional traits that drive bacterial decomposer community productivity. *ISME J.*

2017; 11: 1680–1687.

33.   Ho A, Di Lonardo DP, Bodelier PLE. Revisiting life strategy concepts in environmental

microbial ecology. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 2017; 93: fix006.

34.   Stearns SC. Life-history tactics: a review of the ideas. *Q. Rev. Biol.* 1976; 51: 3–47.

35.   Grime JP. Evidence for the existence of three primary strategies in plants and its

relevance to ecological and evolutionary theory. *Am. Nat.* 1977; 111: 1169–1194.

36.   Stearns SC. Trade-offs in life-history evolution. *Funct. Ecol.* 1989; 3: 259–268.

37.   Molenaar D, van Berlo R, de Ridder D, Teusink B. Shifts in growth strategies reflect

tradeoffs in cellular economics. *Mol. Syst. Biol.* 2009; 5: 323.

38.   Roller BR, Schmidt TM. The physiology and ecological implications of efficient growth.

ISME J. 2015; 9: 1481–1487.

39.   Fierer N, Bradford MA, Jackson RB. Toward an ecological classification of soil bacteria.

569   *Ecology* 2007; 88: 1354–1364.

570   40.   Button DK. Kinetics of nutrient-limited transport and microbial growth. *Microbiol. Rev.*

571   1985; 49: 270–297.

572   41.   Button DK. Biochemical basis for whole-cell uptake kinetics: specific affinity,

573   oligotrophic capacity, and the meaning of the Michaelis constant. *Appl. Environ.*

574   *Microbiol.* 1991; 57: 2033–2038.

575   42.   Button DK. Nutrient-limited microbial growth kinetics: overview and recent advances.

576   *Antonie van Leeuwenhoek* 1993; 63: 225–235.

577   43.   Li J, Wang G, Allison SD, Mayes MA, Luo Y. Soil carbon sensitivity to temperature and

578   carbon use efficiency compared across microbial-ecosystem models of varying

579   complexity. *Biogeochemistry* 2014; 119: 67–84.

580   44.   Hagerty SB, Allison SD, Schimel JP. Evaluating soil microbial carbon use efficiency

581   explicitly as a function of cellular processes: implications for measurements and models.

582   *Biogeochemistry* 2018; 140: 269–283.

583   45.   Dumont MG, Murrell JC. Stable isotope probing — linking microbial identity to

584   function. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 2005; 3: 499–504.

585   46.   Hungate BA, Mau RL, Schwartz E, Caporaso JG, Dijkstra P, van Gestel N, *et al.*

586   Quantitative microbial ecology through stable isotope probing. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*

587   2015; 81: 7570–7581.

588   47.   Pepe-Ranney C, Campbell AN, Koechli CN, Berthrong S, Buckley DH. Unearthing the

589   ecology of soil microorganisms using a high resolution DNA-SIP approach to explore

590   cellulose and xylose metabolism in soil. *Front. Microbiol.* 2016; 7: 703.

591   48.   Youngblut, ND, Barnett SE, Buckley DH. SIPSim: A modeling toolkit to predict

592   accuracy and aid design of DNA-SIP experiments. *Front. Microbiol.* 2018; 9: 570.

593   49.   Sijm D, Kraaij R, Belfroid A. Bioavailability in soil or sediment: exposure of different

594   organisms and approaches to study it. *Environ. Pollut.* 2000; 108: 113–119.

595   50.   Berg B, Hannus K, Popoff T, Theander O. Changes in organic chemical components of

596   needle litter during decomposition. Long-term decomposition in a Scots pine forest.

597   *Botany* 1982; 60: 1310–1319.

598   51.   Polubesova T, Chen Y, Navon R, Chefetz B. Interactions of hydrophobic fractions of

599   dissolved organic matter with Fe^{3+}- and Cu^{2+}-Montmorillonite. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*

600   2008; 42: 4797–4803.

601   52.   Keiluweit M, Kleber M. Molecular-Level Interactions in soils and sediments: the role of

602   aromatic π-systems. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2009; 43: 3421–3429.

603   53.   Brant JB, Sulzman EW, Myrold DD. Microbial community utilization of added carbon

604   substrates in response to long-term carbon input manipulation. *Soil. Biol. Biochem*. 2006;

605   38: 2219–2232.

606   54.   Manzoni S, Taylor P, Richter A, Porporato A, Ågren GI. Environmental and

607   stoichiometric controls on microbial carbon-use efficiency in soils. *New Phytol.* 2012;

608   196: 79–91.

609   55.   Alain K, Querellou J. Cultivating the uncultured: limits, advances and future challenges.

610   *Extremophiles* 2009; 13: 583–594.

611   56.   Pham VHT, Kim J. Cultivation of unculturable soil bacteria. *Trends in Biotechnol.* 2012;

612   30: 475–484.

613   57.   Lennon JT, Aanderud ZT, Lehmkuhl BK, Schoolmaster DR. Mapping the niche space of

614   soil microorganisms using taxonomy and traits. *Ecology* 2012; 93: 1867–1879.

615   58.   Placella SA, Brodie EL, Firestone MK. Rainfall-induced carbon dioxide pulses result

616   from sequential resuscitation of phylogenetically clustered microbial groups. *Proc. Natl.*

617   *Acad. Sci. USA* 2012; 109: 10931–10936.

618   59.   Martiny AC, Treseder K, Pusch G. Phylogenetic conservatism of functional traits in

619   microorganisms. *ISME J.* 2013; 7: 830–838.

620   60.   Dolan KL, Peña J, Allison SD, Martiny JBH, Phylogenetic conservation of substrate use

621   specialization in leaf litter bacteria. *PLoS One* 2017; 12: e0174472.

622   61.   Evans SE, Wallenstein MD. Climate change alters ecological strategies of soil bacteria.

623   *Ecol. Lett.* 2014; 17: 155–164.

624   62.   Zobell CE, Grant CW. Bacterial utilization of low concentrations of organic matter. *J.*

625   *Bacteriol.* 1943; 45: 555–564.

626   63.   Postgate JR, Hunter JR. The survival of starved bacteria. *Microbiology* 1962; 29: 233–

627   263.

628   64.   Jannasch HW. Growth of marine bacteria at limiting concentrations of organic carbon in

629   seawater. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 1967; 12: 264–271.

630   65.   Kuznetsov SI, Dubinina GA, Lapteva NA. Biology of oligotrophic bacteria. *Annu. Rev.*

631   *Microbiol.* 1979; 33: 377–387.

632   66.   Akagi Y, Simidu U, Taga N. Growth responses of oligotrophic and heterotrophic marine

633   bacteria in various substrate concentrations, and taxonomic studies on them. *Can. J.*

634   *Microbiol.* 1980; 26: 800–806.

67.   Button DK. Nutrient uptake by microorganisms according to kinetic parameters from

theory as related to cytoarchitecture. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 1998; 62: 636–645.

68.   Arnosti C. Microbial extracellular enzymes and the marine carbon cycle. *Ann. Rev. Mar.*

Sci. 2011; 3: 401–425.

69.   Sollins P, Homann P, Caldwell BA. Stabilization and destabilization of soil organic

matter: mechanisms and controls. *Geoderma* 1996; 74: 65–105.

70.   Gloor GB, Macklaim JM, Pawlowsky-Glahn V, Egozcue JJ. Microbiome datasets are

compositional: and this is not optional. *Front. Microbiol.* 2017; 8: 2224.

71.   Shade A, Jones SE, Caporaso JG, Handelsman J, Knight R, Fierer N, Gilbert JA.

Conditionally rare taxa disproportionately contribute to temporal changes in microbial

diversity. *mBio* 2014; 5: e01371-14.

72.   Balmonte JP, Buckley A, Hoarfrost A, Ghobrial S, Ziervogel K, Teske A, Arnosti C.

Community structural differences shape microbial responses to high molecular weight

organic matter. *Environ. Microbiol.* 2019; 21: 557–571.

73.   Prosser JI, Bohannan BJM, Curtis TP, Ellis RJ, Firestone MK, Freckleton RP, *et al.* The

role of ecological theory in microbial ecology. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 2007; 5: 384–392.

74.   Ho A, Kerckhof FM, Luke C, Reim A, Krause S, Boon N, Bodelier PL. Conceptualizing

functional traits and ecological characteristics of methane-oxidizing bacteria as life

strategies. *Environ. Microbiol. Rep.* 2013; 5: 335–345.

75.   Fierer N. Embracing the unknown: disentangling the complexities of the soil

microbiome. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 2017; 15: 579–590.

76.   Whitman T, Pepe-Ranney C, Enders A, Koechli C, Campbell A, Buckley DH, Lehmann

J. Dynamics of microbial community composition and soil organic carbon mineralization

in soil following addition of pyrogenic and fresh organic matter. *ISME J.* 2016; 10: 2918–

2930.

77.   Hu S, van Bruggen AHC. Microbial dynamics associated with multiphasic decomposition

of ^{14}C-labeled cellulose in soil. *Microb. Ecol.* 1997; 33: 134–143.

78.   Dolédec S, Chessel D, ter Braak CJF, Champely S. Matching species traits to

environmental variables: a new three-table ordination method. *Environ. Ecol. Stat.* 1996;

3: 143–166.

79.   Dray S, Choler P, Dolédec S, Peres-Neto PR, Thuiller W, Pavoine S, ter Braak CJF.

Combining the fourth-corner and the RLQ methods for assessing trait responses to

environmental variation. *Ecology* 2014; 95: 14–21.

80.   Bates ST, Berg-Lyons D, Caporaso JG, Walters WA, Knight R, Fierer N. Examining the

global distribution of dominant archaeal populations in soil. *ISME J.* 2011; 5: 908–917.

81.   Berthrong ST, Buckley DH, Drinkwater LE. Agricultural management and labile carbon

additions affect soil microbial community structure and interact with carbon and nitrogen

cycling. *Microb. Ecol.* 2013; 66: 158–170.

82.   Youngblut ND, Buckley DH. Intra-genomic variation in G + C content and its

implications for DNA stable isotope probing. *Environ. Microbiol. Rep.* 2014; 6: 767–775.

83.   Barnett SE, Youngblut ND, Buckley DH. Soil characteristics and land-use drive bacterial

community assembly patterns. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 2019; 96: fiz194.

84.   Kozich JJ, Westcott SL, Baxter NT, Highlander SK, Schloss PD. Development of a dual-

index sequencing strategy and curation pipeline for analyzing amplicon sequence data on

the MiSeq Illumina sequencing platform. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 2013; 79: 5112–

5120.

85.   Youngblut ND, Barnett SE, Buckley DH. HTSSIP: An R package for analysis of high

682   throughput sequencing data from nucleic acid stable isotope probing (SIP) experiments.

683   *PLOS ONE* 2018; 13: e0189616.

684   86.   Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for

685   RNA-seq data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol.* 2014; 15: 550.

686   87.   Yarza P, Richter M, Peplies J, Euzeby J, Amann R, Schleifer KH, *et al.* The All-Species

687   Living Tree project: A 16S rRNA-based phylogenetic tree of all sequenced type strains.

688   *Syst. Appl. Microbiol*. 2008; 31: 241–250.

689   88.   Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. Basic local alignment search

690   tool. *J. Mol. Biol.* 1990; 215: 403–410.

691   89.   R Core Team. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. 2018.

692   90.   Price MN, Dehal PS, Arkin AP. FastTree: Computing large minimum evolution trees

693   with profiles instead of a distance matrix. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 2009; 26: 1641–1650.

694   91.   Langfelder P, Zhang B, Horvath S. Defining clusters from a hierarchical cluster tree: the

695   Dynamic Tree Cut package for R. *Bioinformatics* 2008; 24: 719–720.

696   92.   Kembel SW, Wu M, Eisen JA, Green JL. Incorporating 16S gene copy number

697   information improves estimates of microbial diversity and abundance. *PLoS Comput.*

698   *Biol.* 2012; 8: e1002743.

699   93.   Matsen FA, Kodner RB, Armbrust EV. pplacer: linear time maximum-likelihood and

700   Bayesian phylogenetic placement of sequences onto a fixed reference tree. *BMC*

701   *Bioinformatics* 2010; 11: 538.

702   94.   Schloss PD, Westcott SL, Ryabin T, Hall JR, Hartmann M, Hollister EB, *et al.*

703   Introducing mothur: open-source, platform-independent, community-supported software

704   for describing and comparing microbial communities. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 2009;

705   75: 7537–7541.

706 95.   Dray S, Chessel D, Thioulouse J. Co-inertia analysis and the linking of ecological data

707   tables. *Ecology* 2003; 84: 3078–3089.

708
709
Figure 1: Diagram of the design of the DNA-SIP experiment. This experiment employed soil
microcosms, each amended with all nine C substrates (added at 0.4 mg C per gram of soil), only
one of which was > 99% ^{13}C-labeled in treatment microcosms. Control microcosms had all nine
C substrates added but none were isotopically labeled. Microcosms were destructively sampled
at multiple timepoints (black bars) based on mineralization rates from preliminary experiment.
Headspace samples were taken every 1-7 days. DNA extracted from microcosm soil was used
both for DNA-SIP and whole bacterial community sequencing (unfractionated).
717
718

719
720
721 **Figure 2:** Substrate mineralization dynamics varied based on bioavailability as measured by (A)
722 ^{13}C mineralization rates and (B) cumulative amounts of ^{13}C mineralized. Inset for (A) displays a
723 finer scale representation of the ^{13}C mineralization rates over days 0-14. Error bars represent ±
724 standard deviation among microcosm replicates ($n = 3$).
725

726
Figure 3: The dynamics of ^{13}C-label incorporation varied by substrate across the 1,286 OTUs
that exhibited significant ^{13}C-labelling. OTUs are ordered by their phylogeny with Phyla
indicated by different colors. Each vertical block indicates ^{13}C-labelling results for a single day
as indicated (days 1, 3, 6, 14, 30, and 48). Each column within a block indicates results for a
given ^{13}C-substrate within that day (Glu = glucose, Xly = xylose, Ami = amino acids, Gly =

glycerol, Lac = lactate, Oxa = oxalate, Cel = cellulose, Van = vanillin, Pal = palmitic acid).
Rows indicate the ^{13}C-labelling dynamics for each OTU as follows: colored bars indicate ^{13}C-
labelling, grey bars indicate OTU detection but no evidence of labeling, white bar indicates the
OTU was not detected. The rightmost block (RA x T) shows changes in relative abundance over
time for each OTU in unfractionated soil samples with white being 0% and red being 100%.
Phylum abbreviations are Acido = *Acidobacteria*, Bacter = *Bacteroidetes*, Gemma =
Gemmatimonadetes, Chl-flx = *Chloroflexi*, Firmi = *Firmicutes*, Actino = *Actinobacteria*, Verruc
= *Verrucomicrobia*, Plancto = *Planctomycetes*, and Proteo = *Proteobacteria*.
740
741

742
743
Figure 4: (A) The functional distance (FD) between OTUs, as measured by dissimilarity in
substrate incorporation dynamics, increases rapidly in relation to their phylogenetic distance. The
vertical dashed lines indicate distance values that correspond to estimates of taxonomic ranks for
genus, family, order, class, and phylum (from left to right). (B) Mantel test comparing functional
distance and branch length between OTUs with points colored by significance of correlation
(Mantel's r). (C) Phylogenetic depth (Tau D) of ^{13}C-labeled with respect to substrate and time
derived from consenTRAIT tests. P-values are globally adjusted with the Benjamini-Hochberg
correction. The blue line is the linear least squares regression fit ($R^2 = 0.63$, P-value < 1E-7) and
the grey ribbon represents the standard error.
753

Figure 5: Substrate incorporation dynamics can be used to generate functional clusters (FC) whose collective properties reveal differences in life history strategy. (A) Substrate incorporation dynamics of 28 FC (in rows, sorted by functional similarity) with color indicating the fraction of member OTUs that are ^{13}C-labeled by each substrate on each day (in columns). (B) Principal component analysis (PCA) of FC based on properties associated with life history strategies: number of substrates from which C was assimilated (substrates), the average bioavailability of the substrates from which C was assimilated (Kow), the time of first label incorporation (Day 1st incorp.), the initial relative abundance in soil (Rel. Abund), and rRNA operon copy number (*rrn* copies). Each of the 28 FC are indicated by number. FC variation explained by the first principal component (PC1) segregates FC based upon properties typically associated with the copiotroph (high PC1) to oligotroph (low PC1) continuum. (C) NMDS ordination of FC based on unweighted UniFrac distance indicates that life history strategy (PC1) explains small but significant variation in incorporator phylogeny (PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.092$, p-value = 1E-4). (D) NMDS ordination of FC based on phenotypic traits predicted by ProTraits indicates that life history strategy (PC1) also explains small but significant variation in predicted phenotypic traits (PERMANOVA, $R^2 = 0.032$, p-value < 1E-4).

Figure 6: Microbial growth dynamics vary with respect to life history strategy as inferred by
position along PC1 (Fig. 5). (A) Total DNA and the summed normalized relative abundance of
all ^{13}C-labelled OTUs varied over time, reaching a maximum at day 6 (uppermost panel). The
summed normalized relative abundance of all ^{13}C-labelled OTUs classified by their position
along PC1 (more copiotrophic, PC1 > 0.10; intermediate, -0.015 < PC1 < 0.10; and more
oligotrophic, PC1 < -0.015) varies considerably in soil over time with more copiotrophic taxa
exhibiting boom and bust dynamics (lower panel). (B) Normalized relative abundance of
individual incorporators in soil over time with more copiotrophic OTUs in the top row and more
oligotrophic OTUs in the bottom row. Each OTU is identified along with relevant summary
statistics (substrate assimilated and day of labelling, FC membership, *rrn* copy number, PC1
value, phylum affiliation; substrate abbreviations are defined in Fig. 3).