Functional degeneracy in translationally active *Nitrospira* populations confers resilience to out-selection in partial nitritation activated sludge

Maxwell B.W. Madill[1,+], Yaqian Luo[1,+], Pranav Sampara[1], Ryan M. Ziels[1*]

[1] Department of Civil Engineering, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

[+] Contributed equally to this work.

* Corresponding Author:
Email: ziels@mail.ubc.ca

Abstract

Energy-efficient nitrogen removal in activated sludge wastewater treatment systems could be achieved by oxidizing a part of the influent ammonium to nitrite (partial nitritation; PN) to provide growth substrates for anammox. However, the metabolic and physiological diversity of nitrite oxidizing bacteria (NOB) makes their out-selection a challenge in mainstream activated sludge, warranting measurements of their *in situ* physiology and activity under selective growth pressures. Here, we examined the long-term (~100 day) stability of PN in mainstream activated sludge obtained by treating a portion of return activated sludge with a sidestream flow containing free ammonia (FA) at 200 mg NH_3-N/L. The nitrite accumulation ratio peaked at 42% by day 40 in the reactor with sidestream FA-treatment, while it did not increase in the control reactor without FA added to the sidestream. A subsequent decrease in nitrite accumulation within the FA-treated reactor coincided with shifts in dominant *Nitrospira* 16S rRNA amplicon sequence variants (ASVs). We applied bioorthogonal non-canonical amino acid tagging (BONCAT) coupled with fluorescence activated cell sorting (FACS) to investigate changes in the translational activity of NOB populations throughout sidestream exposure to FA. BONCAT-FACS confirmed that the single *Nitrospira* ASV out-selected in the FA-treated reactor had reduced translational activity following exposure to FA, whereas the two *Nitrospira* ASVs that emerged after process acclimation were not impacted by FA. Thus, functionally degenerate *Nitrospira* populations likely provided resilience to the nitrite-oxidizing community during FA-treatment by shifting activity to physiologically resistant members. These results highlight how *in situ* physiology approaches like BONCAT can resolve ecological niches in the activated sludge microbiome, and how functional degeneracy observed within *Nitrospira* populations likely necessitates a combination of out-selection strategies to achieve stable mainstream PN.

Keywords: partial nitritation, nitrification, activated sludge, microbiome, BONCAT, nitrite oxidation

1. Introduction

Net-energy neutral or positive wastewater treatment can be achieved by decoupling carbon and nitrogen removal in A-B type treatment schemes designed to maximize energy recovery by shunting COD towards anaerobic processes while utilizing carbon and energy efficient biological nitrogen removal (BNR) processes (Cogert et al., 2019). Pairing partial nitritation (PN) with anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox) yields a completely autotrophic BNR process (PN–anammox, or PN-A) that offers significant reductions in COD and aeration requirements compared to conventional BNR (Li et al., 2018). While PN-A shows promise as a B-Stage BNR process to follow upstream carbon-capturing A-stage processes, achieving stable PN in mainstream activated sludge (AS) stands as a major challenge limiting its successful full-scale implementation (Regmi et al., 2014; Xu et al., 2015).

Achieving stable PN relies on operating strategies that consistently repress and wash-out (i.e. out-select) nitrite oxidizing bacteria (NOB) while maintaining ammonium oxidizing bacteria (AOB) within the system (Agrawal et al., 2018; Li et al., 2018). Preliminary success in mainstream NOB out-selection has been achieved using kinetic strategies that control nitrogen (Regmi et al., 2014) and oxygen (Ge et al., 2014; Kornaros et al., 2010; Regmi et al., 2014) substrate levels and/or availabilities to favour the growth kinetics of AOB over NOB. Additionally, several recently-proposed side-stream return activated sludge (RAS) treatment strategies have achieved high efficiencies in selectively inhibiting NOB based on their higher innate sensitivity to free-ammonia (FA) and free-nitrous acid (FNA) compared to AOB (Cao et al., 2017; Duan et al., 2018; Wang et al., 2017). Wang et al. (2017) showed that RAS treatment with FA-rich sidestream wastewater typical of anaerobic digester centrate (210 mg NH_3-N/L) supported successful NOB out-selection in mainstream AS, with nitrite accumulation ratios reaching 80-90%. Despite its potential efficacy for supporting mainstream PN, a limited number of studies have further validated the long-term

stability of FA-based RAS treatment and assessed its impacts on the structure and activity of the

nitrifying microbial community (Duan et al., 2019a; Li et al., 2020).

NOB communities in wastewater treatment often display functional degeneracy, wherein the

nitrite oxidation process is distributed among several phylogenetically diverse taxa with varying

auxiliary metabolic potentials (Daims et al., 2016; Lücker et al., 2015; Spasov et al., 2019). Such

degeneracy may enable NOB communities to resist selective pressures imparted by out-selection

strategies by recruiting functionally redundant, yet physiologically diverse, NOB members (Duan

et al., 2019a; Li et al., 2020; Liu and Wang, 2013). *In situ* assessments of the metabolically active

fraction of nitrifying communities are therefore critical to elucidate the efficacy of mainstream NOB

out-selection strategies. Characterizing the microbial community using 16S ribosomal RNA

(rRNA) gene amplicon sequencing or shotgun metagenomics can illuminate how specific NOB

out-selection strategies alter community structure and functional potential (Nierychlo et al., 2020;

Singer et al., 2017). However, the genomic signature of a microbial community alone is not

necessarily predictive of the underlying *in situ* physiologies of active community members

(Hatzenpichler et al., 2020; Singer et al., 2017). While bulk activity measurements obtained

through metatranscriptomics, metaproteomics, or stable isotope probing can provide compelling

insights into the composition and function of the aggregate active microbial community, these

methods are currently unable to resolve the heterogeneity of community members often observed

at the cellular and/or strain level (Hatzenpichler et al., 2020, 2014).

Next-generation substrate analogue probing approaches have recently emerged as powerful

tools to decipher the *in situ* physiology of active cells based on their uptake of synthetic analogues

of natural biomolecules (Hatzenpichler et al., 2020). Bioorthogonal non-canonical amino acid

tagging (BONCAT) is a nascent SAP approach to study the physiology of active cells in complex

environmental microbiomes (Couradeau et al., 2019; Hatzenpichler et al., 2016, 2014; Reichart

et al., 2020). BONCAT relies on the *in vivo* uptake and incorporation of synthetic amino acids,

such as the alkyne-containing analogue of methionine, homopropargylglycine (HPG), into newly

synthesized proteins via the native translational machinery, and thereby selectively labels the

proteomes of translationally active cells (Hatzenpichler et al., 2014). HPG-labeled cells can

subsequently be identified by tagging their proteins with azide-modified fluorescent dyes via

azide-alkyne click-chemistry, enabling their selective recovery using fluorescence activated cell

sorting (FACS) (Couradeau et al., 2019; Hatzenpichler et al., 2016). To our knowledge, BONCAT,

or its paired approach with FACS (BONCAT-FACS), have yet to be applied to study the active

fractions of microbiomes central to wastewater treatment bioprocesses.

The objective of this study was to assess the stability of RAS treatment with FA as an NOB out-

selection strategy for mainstream PN. We hypothesized that certain members of the active

nitrifying microbial community could acclimate to routine FA exposure. We applied time-series

16S rRNA gene amplicon sequencing in addition to BONCAT-FACS based activity measurements

to elucidate the impact of FA-based RAS treatment on the structure and *in situ* activity of the AS

microbiome in parallel experimental and control sequencing batch reactors.

110
111
112 **2.   Materials and Methods**

113
2.1 Reactor setup, operation and monitoring

Two identical lab-scale sequencing batch reactors (SBRs) with working volumes of 4.28 L were

seeded with AS from a pilot-scale SBR at a WWTP in King County (Washington, USA) (Figure

S1). The SBR cycles lasted 3 h, including 2 min aerobic feeding, 148 min aerobic reaction, 20

min settling, 5 min decanting, and 5 min idle periods. The SBR cycle timing was controlled with

ChronTrol XT timers (ChronTrol Corporation, California), and mixing was provided by overhead

mixers. Reactor temperature was maintained at 20 ± 1 °C using an environmental chamber. The

target solid retention times (SRTs) were kept at 10 days for both SBRs throughout the study by

wasting a determined amount of biomass based on daily measurements of mixed liquor and

effluent total suspended solids (TSS) and volatile suspended solids (VSS). The SBRs were fed

with a synthetic wastewater containing ammonium chloride as the nitrogen source and sodium

acetate and propionic acid as organic carbon sources, producing 24.5 ± 2 mg NH_4-N/L and 100

± 37 mg/L of soluble chemical oxygen demand (sCOD), respectively. Macro and micro element

components of the synthetic wastewater are detailed in the Supplementary Information.

Two operational phases were sequentially conducted: the Start-up Phase and the FA Phase. In

the Start-up Phase, the two SBRs were operated under the same aerobic conditions without FA-

treatment of RAS to achieve similar nitrification performance. The SBRs were fed with 1.07 L of

synthetic wastewater in each SBR cycle using peristaltic pumps (LabF1/YZ1515, Shenchen

Precision Pump, China), resulting in a hydraulic retention time (HRT) of 12 h. The pH was not

controlled but measured within the range of 6.7-7.5. Aeration was provided by an air pump and

dissolved oxygen ranged from 3-8 mg/L in a typical SBR cycle. The Start-up Phase lasted 274

days to establish steady-state conditions.

The FA Phase was commenced on day 275, hereafter referred to as 'day zero', and lasted 94

days. The operational conditions in the FA Phase were similar to those in the Start-up Phase,

except for the following differences (Figure S1). In the FA Phase, 800 mL of mixed liquor was

removed from each SBR at the end of the reaction period of a given cycle every 24 h, and was

thickened to 50 mL by centrifugation. The thickened RAS was incubated in an unstirred 200 mL

beaker containing 100 mL of media with the same composition as the synthetic feed, but with no

COD. For the experimental reactor, hereafter termed the FA-treated SBR, the RAS treatment

solution contained 1060 mg/L NH_4-N, with pH adjusted to 9 using sodium hydroxide to produce a

final FA concentration of 200 mg NH_3-N/L characteristic of anaerobic digester centrate. In the

other reactor, hereafter termed the control SBR, thickened RAS was incubated in the same

medium at a pH of 9 but without ammonium addition. After 24 h of incubation, the 150 mL of

treated RAS was recycled back into the respective SBRs at the start of the next cycle. To maintain

consistent nitrogen loadings in the two SBRs, 0.406 g of ammonium chloride was added to the

control SBR simultaneously with the treated RAS. Monitoring experiments lasting 24 h were

performed approximately every 10 days to measure composite daily nitrite accumulation ratios

(NARs), as described in the Supplementary Information.

During the FA Phase, effluent nutrient samples were collected just before the addition of treated

RAS. Nitrogen species (ammonium, nitrite, and nitrate), orthophosphate, and soluble COD

(sCOD) in effluent samples were monitored three to four times per week. pH and DO were

measured at least three times per week. Analytical methods for bioreactor monitoring are

described in Table S1.

2.2 Microcosms for bioorthogonal non-canonical amino acid tagging (BONCAT)

Three 30 mL samples were collected from each SBR throughout the RAS treatment cycle

commenced on day 94, including: (1) a mixed liquor sample immediately preceding bulk mixed

liquor removal for RAS treatment; (2) a RAS sample after 15 min of side-stream treatment (S1);

and (3) a RAS sample after 24 h of side-stream treatment (S2). The treated RAS samples were

volume-corrected for the thickening process to attain the same biomass concentrations as the

mixed liquor samples. Samples were washed in phosphate buffered saline (1x PBS; filter

sterilized) through centrifugation (3000 rpm, 5 min) and resuspension to remove residual growth

substrates. All samples were incubated in a media consisting of 25% synthetic wastewater in 1x

PBS (vol/vol) without COD or yeast extract, so that NH_4-N was the only exogenous electron donor.

For BONCAT-labeling microcosms, 15 mL portions of each sample were resuspended in 15 mL

of incubation media amended with 1 mM homopropargylglycine (HPG; Click Chemistry Tools,

Arizona) (HPG-positive microcosm), transferred into sterile 125 mL Erlenmeyer flasks, and

incubated on an orbital shaker for 3 h at 20 °C and 200 rpm. Control microcosms (HPG-negative)

for each sample were conducted similarly except without HPG amendment. Following

incubations, microcosm samples were washed three times in 1x PBS to remove unincorporated

HPG, resuspended in 10% (vol/vol) glycerol in PBS, aliquoted into 1 mL and stored at -80°C until

further processing. Details on how the preliminary BONCAT validation microcosms were

conducted are provided in the Supplementary Information.

2.3 BONCAT Sample Preparation and Click-Chemistry

For each microcosm type (R, S1, or S2) for both SBRs, sample preparation and click-chemistry

were conducted using triplicate HPG-positive and duplicate HPG-negative microcosm samples.

Samples were thawed on ice at 4 °C, enzymatically homogenized, subjected to filter-immobilized

click-chemistry labeling with the FAM picolyl azide dye (Click Chemistry Tools) closely following

the procedure of Couradeau et al. (2019), detached from the filter, pre-strained through a 30 um

mesh filter, and counterstained with SYTO59 (10,000x final dilution; ThermoFisher Scientific,

Oregon) to generate the pre-sort samples for FACS. Details of the sample homogenization and

click-chemistry labeling procedures are provided in the Supplementary Information.

2.4 Fluorescence-activated cell sorting (FACS)
186
Fluorescence-activated cell sorting was conducted on a BD FACSJazz™ cell sorter (BD

Biosciences, California) calibrated to detect the FAM picolyl azide dye (excitation = 490

nm/emission = 510 nm) and the SYTO59 counterstain dye (excitation = 622 nm/emission = 645

nm). An overview of the FACS gating procedures is provided in the Supplementary Information.

Briefly, initial gating was established with side-scatter, forward-scatter and trigger pulse width to

exclude large particles and cell aggregates. Sorting gates were set targeting BONCAT-positive

(BONCAT+) cell fractions based on background SYTO59 and FAM fluorescence, allowing less

than 0.5% of false positives (Figures S2-S6). A total of 100k cells were analyzed from each

sample, where cells within the sorting gate (SYTO+, BONCAT+) were sorted into 1.5 mL tubes

containing 400 µL of prepGEM Wash Buffer (ZyGEM^{TM}, Virginia), and stored at -80 °C until further

analysis.

198
199
200 *2.5 DNA Extraction and 16S rRNA gene amplicon sequencing*
201
For time-series analysis of community composition, triplicate 980 µL aliquots of mixed liquor were

routinely collected directly from the SBRs at the end of a cycle and flash frozen at -80 ^{o}C. Mixed

liquor samples were thawed on ice, and DNA was extracted using the FastDNA Spin Kit for Soil

(MP Biomedicals, Santa Ana) with minor modifications (Nierychlo et al., 2020). For each HPG-

positive microcosm type (R, S1, or S2) for both SBRs, 50 µL aliquots were collected from the

triplicate pre-homogenized and pre-sort samples during preparation for FACS, added to 400 µL

of prepGEM Wash Buffer, and stored at -80 ^{o}C. Pre-homogenized samples from HPG-negative

R microcosms and bulk mixed liquor samples were prepared similarly. All pre-homogenized, pre-

sort, and BONCAT-FACS samples were extracted using the prepGEM Bacteria kit (ZyGEM^{TM})

using a low-biomass input procedure overviewed in the Supplementary Information. DNA

concentrations were measured with the Qubit® dsDNA BR and HS Assay Kits and Qubit®

fluorometer (ThermoFisher Scientific, Oregon).

214
16S rRNA gene fragments from all DNA extracts were amplified using barcoded primers, 515F

and 926R (Parada et al., 2016), targeting the V4-V5 hypervariable region of the 16S rRNA gene.

All samples extracted with the prepGEM kit underwent an initial round of 15-cycles of PCR with

non-barcoded 515F and 926R primers due to the low-biomass input. One triplicate set of FastDNA

extracts from day 94 were also pre-amplified to determine potential biases of that step. Amplified

barcoded PCR products were pooled at equimolar concentrations and sequenced on an Illumina

MiSeq in paired-end 300 bp mode at the UBC Biofactorial facility.

Amplicon reads were processed and denoised into amplicon sequencing variants (ASVs) with

DADA2 (Callahan et al., 2016) (v.1.12.1) in the R environment. The script used to generate the

ASV datasets is provided in Supplementary Information. Denoised sequences were taxonomically

classified using the RDB Classifier (Wang et al., 2007) against the MiDAS 3.0 database (Nierychlo

et al., 2020). The raw read files are available via the NCBI Short Read Archive under BioProject

PRJNA693634.

230
231   *2.5 Statistical analysis*
232
Comparisons of reactor nutrient data were performed with t-tests for N-of-1 trials with serial

correlation (Tang and Landes, 2020). Amplicon sequencing data was visualized using the

tidyverse package (Wickham et al., 2019) (v.1.3.0) in the R environment. Principal component

analysis (PCA) of log-transformed cumulative-sum scaled (CSS) ASV read counts was performed

using the metagenomeSeq (Paulson et al., 2013) (v.1.26.3) and vegan (Oksanen et al., 2007)

(v.2.5.6) packages in R. PERMANOVA (adonis) was conducted in vegan with 1000 permutations

to determine significant differences in reactor communities over time. Differential abundance

analysis of ASVs between SBRs and in BONCAT microcosm datasets was performed using

DESeq2 (Love et al., 2014) (v.1.24.0) using parametric fitting, the Wald significance test, and

Benjamin-Hochberg correction for *p* values. FACS data was processed using the flowcore

package (v.1.52.1) (Hahne et al., 2009) in R.

244
245
246

3. Results

3.1 Partial nitritation performance of activated sludge bioreactors

The two SBRs treated simulated mainstream municipal wastewater over two operational phases:

the Start-up Phase and the FA Phase. Steady-state conditions were presumed over the last 30

days of the 270-day Start-up Phase, during which daily effluent concentrations of NH_4-N, NO_3-N,

and NO_2-N were similar in the two SBRs ($p > 0.05$), and averaged 0.1 ± 0.3 mg NH_4-N/L, 19 ± 2

mg NO_3-N/L and 0.0 ± 0.01 mg NO_2-N/L, respectively (Figure 1). The TSS and VSS of mixed liquor

were also similar between the two systems during the Start-up Phase ($p > 0.05$; Figure S7). Thus,

similar stable performance with full nitrification was achieved in both SBRs during the initial Start-

up Phase, indicating effective duplication of operating conditions.

The FA Phase was then commenced on day 0 to assess the efficacy of FA-treatment of RAS for

promoting stable mainstream PN and observe its impacts on microbial community structure and

activity. After 10 days of sidestream RAS treatment, NO_2-N began to increase in effluent of the

FA-treated SBR, but stayed below detection in the control SBR for the remainder of the FA Phase

(Figure 1). By day 40, effluent NO_2-N reached its peak level of 11 mg NO_2-N/L in the FA-treated

SBR. At the same time, NH_4-N accumulated to 3.7 mg NH_4-N/L in the FA-treated SBR between

days 37 and 44, yet stayed below 1.2 mg NH_4-N/L in the control SBR over the entire FA Phase

(Figure 1). The accumulation of NO_2-N in the FA-treated SBR was transient, however, as the

effluent concentration decreased after day 40 and reached a value below detection by day 74

(Figure 1).

Because effluent was sampled from the SBRs on a 24 h basis, and the sidestream-treated RAS

was added once every 24 h, periodic tests were conducted to measure nitrogen species at the

end of individual SBR cycles over the course of 24 h to better estimate nitrite accumulation ratios

(NARs) (Figure S8). After 20 days of FA-treatment, the 24 h average NAR was approximately 10

times higher in the FA-treated SBR versus the control (Figure 1C). The NAR reached its peak of

41.9% by day 37 in the FA-treated SBR, aligning with the observed peak in effluent NO_2-N. The

NAR of the control SBR stayed below 3.2% in the entire FA Phase (Figure 1C). This suggests

that the efficacy of RAS treatment with FA as a strategy to promote PN in mainstream AS is

subject to microbial acclimation, as the extent of nitrite oxidation inhibition was not sustained after

40 days.

281
Figure 1: Influent and effluent nitrogen species over the two experimental phases in (A) free-ammonia (FA) treated sequencing batch reactor (SBR), and (B) control SBR. Shaded orange space represents standard deviation of influent NH_4-N. (C) Nitrite accumulation ratio (NAR, %) of FA-treated and control SBRs over time, based on 24 h monitoring of SBR effluents.

3.2 Microbial community acclimation to FA-treatment

Microbial 16S rRNA gene amplicons were denoised into ASVs to provide a high-resolution

(Callahan et al., 2016; Eren et al., 2015) view of how RAS treatment impacted community

structure. A total of 3.01 million chimera-free quality-filtered merged reads (Table S2) were

denoised into 6,694 ASVs. Over 95% of the 16S rRNA gene amplicons at all time points in both

SBRs were comprised of the 8 phyla: *Proteobacteria*, *Bacteroidetes*, *Chloroflexi*, *Nitrospirae*,

Planctomycetes, *Verrucomicrobia*, *Acidobacteria*, and *Cyanobacteria* (Figure S9). Between 53%

to 70% percent of 16S rRNA amplicons were represented by 20 genera across all samples (Figure

2). Even at the broad genus level of resolution, there were apparent differences in community

profiles between the FA-treated and control SBRs over time (Figure 2), indicating that RAS

treatment altered the structure of the AS microbiome.

297
298 **Figure 2:** Heatmap of log-scaled relative abundance of top 20 most abundant genera in (A) FA-
299 treated SBR and (B) control SBR over the two operational phases. Sequencing results are shown
300 for triplicate DNA extractions on each sampling date. The genera are ordered from highest to
301 lowest cumulative abundance across samples.
302

At the ASV level, FA-treatment of RAS led to significant differences in community structure

between the two SBRs over time (R^2 = 0.54, p < 0.001, adonis). PCA of cumulative sum-scaled

ASV read counts revealed that community profiles in the two SBRs were similar until day 9, after

which the FA-treated SBR community diverged from the control (Figure S10). Differential

abundance analysis showed that there were no statistically different ASVs between the two SBRs

on day 0 (p > 0.01, DESeq2), indicating that they were well replicated in the Non-FA Phase. By

day 46 of the FA-Phase, around the time that nitrite peaked in the FA-treated SBR (Figure 1), the

abundance of 105 ASVs spanning 55 genera were statistically different between the two SBRs (p

< 0.01, DESeq2; Figure S11). The number of ASVs with significant differential abundance

between the SBRs continued to increase to a maximum of 166 on day 75 of the FA Phase (Figure

S11).

Nitrospira and *Nitrosomonas* were the only putative NOB and AOB populations detected in the

SBRs, respectively (Figure 2). Eight *Nitrosomonas* ASVs were detected in both SBRs over the

two experimental phases (Figure S12). Until day 84, the total *Nitrosomonas* abundance was less

than 1% in both SBRs, but increased to over 1.5% in both by day 94 (Figure S12). One

Nitrosomonas ASV (ASV_36) was differentially abundant between the two SBRs on days 75 and

94 (p < 0.01, DESeq2). Three *Nitrospira* ASVs were detected within the two SBRs (Figure 3). In

particular, ASV_8 was the dominant *Nitrospira* ASV in both SBRs during the Start-up Phase

(before day 0), accounting for 3.3%±0.8% of 16S rRNA genes on average (Figure 3). By day 46,

ASV_8 decreased to 1.6%±0.1% in the FA-treated SBR, while it increased to 6.4%±0.3% within

the control. This decrease in ASV_8 abundance coincided with the peak in nitrite concentration

in the FA-treated SBR (Figure 1a). The abundance of ASV_8 did not significantly change after

day 46 for the remainder of the experiment in the FA-treated SBR (p > 0.01, DESeq2). In contrast,

two other *Nitrospira* ASVs (ASV_32 and ASV_47) were sporadically detected in both SBRs at

abundances below 0.4% until day 46, and then increased to a maximum of 1.8%±0.4% and

1.2%±0.3% in the FA-treated reactor by day 84, respectively, but stayed below 0.3% in the control

(Figure 3). The abundance of ASV_32 and ASV_47 were significantly higher in the FA reactor

relative to the control SBR by the end of the experiment, while ASV_8 was significantly lower

(both days 84 and 94; *p* < 0.01, DESeq2).

334
335   **Figure 3:** Relative abundance (total sum scaled, TSS) of three dominant *Nitrospira* ASVs over
336   time in the (A) FA-treated SBR and (B) control SBR. Only *Nitrospira* ASVs detected in more than
337   one sample are shown. Results are shown for triplicate DNA extractions on each day.
338
339
340   *3.3 Substrate analog probing of active nitrifying populations*
341
To decipher the impact of FA-treatment on the activity and *in situ* physiology of nitrifying

populations within mainstream AS, we conducted BONCAT-FACS on samples collected from

nitrifying microcosms seeded with mixed liquor preceding RAS treatment (R), as well as RAS

from the beginning (15 min after start; S1) and end (24 h after start; S2) of the side-stream

treatment process of each SBR (Figure 4). Preliminary validation microcosms confirmed the

sensitivity of BONCAT in labeling only active cells that had incorporated HPG (Figure S6).

Comparison of FACS data (Figures S4 and S5) between the two SBRs revealed that

translationally active (i.e. BONCAT+) cell fractions were significantly ($p < 0.10$) lower in nitrifying

microcosms seeded from the FA-treated SBR (R; 24.1% ± 2.6%, S1; 18.0% ± 3.5%, S2; 20.6% ±

6.3%) relative to corresponding microcosms seeded from the control SBR (R; 30.1% ± 3.8%, p =

0.094, S1; 28.30% ± 4.0%, p = 0.029, S2; 46.1% ± 8.2%, p = 0.015). Within the FA-treated SBR,

the fraction of BONCAT+ cells in the nitrifying microcosm seeded with mixed liquor (R) was

significantly higher than that seeded with RAS exposed to 15 min of FA-treatment (S1; p = 0.078;

Figure 4). However, no further reduction in the fraction of BONCAT+ cells was observed between

microcosms seeded with RAS from the beginning (S1) and end (S2) of the FA-treatment process

(p > 0.10). In contrast, the BONCAT+ cell fraction in the microcosm seeded with post-treated

RAS (S2) of the control SBR was significantly higher compared to those in its mixed liquor (R; p

= 0.059) and at the beginning of its RAS treatment process (S1; p=0.045; Figure 4).

Figure 4: Application of BONCAT-FACS to aerobic nitrifying microcosm samples. (A) Sorting gates were established based on the detection of SYTO+ cells from background particles using unstained HPG-negative cells (top panel), and BONCAT+ cells from non-HPG labelled cells based on their FAM picolyl azide dye fluorescence using SYTO59 stained HPG-negative cells (middle panel), allowing less than 0.5% false positives in each gate. BONCAT+ cell fractions in each HPG-incubated sample were calculated as the fraction of SYTO+ cells residing in the sorting gate (bottom panel). (B) Overview of the FA and control RAS treatment processes showing the origin of samples used to seed the nitrifying microcosms. (C) Comparison of BONCAT+ cell fractions detected in samples prepared from the nitrifying microcosms seeded with mixed-liquor preceding RAS treatment (R), RAS after 15 min of side-stream treatment (S1), and RAS after 24 h of side-stream treatment (S2) from the FA-treated SBR (bottom) and control SBR (top). Black brackets between microcosm types are shown for differences in mean BONCAT+ cell fractions with *p* values < 0.10 , as determined using independent t-tests, with calculated *p* values shown above the brackets.

The microbial community composition observed in the BONCAT+ cell fractions can be attributed

to cellular translational activity, as well as any changes in bulk community composition that

occurred throughout the RAS treatment and sample processing steps upstream of FACS. To

distinguish between these impacts, we conducted 16S rRNA gene amplicon sequencing on

triplicate pre-homogenized and pre-sort samples from each microcosm (Figure S13), in addition

to control samples from HPG-negative microcosms and bulk mixed liquors prepared with different

DNA extraction and PCR amplification procedures (Figure S14). The low-biomass DNA extraction

method (prepGEM kit) and the two-step 16S rRNA gene PCR amplification, both used to prepare

the BONCAT microcosm libraries, showed similar impacts on community composition for both

SBR mixed liquors compared to respective samples prepared for time-series analysis (i.e.

FastDNA Soil kit with one-step PCR; Figure S15). For this reason, community composition

measured in the BONCAT microcosm samples were not compared to time-series samples. Within

the microcosm samples, pre-homogenized samples from microcosms incubated without HPG

were similar to those with HPG, indicating that the addition of 1 mM HPG did not significantly alter

community structure during the 3 h incubation (Figures S16 and S17). Pre-homogenized samples

from the control SBR system microcosms (R, S1 and S2) were generally clustered with the bulk

mixed liquor sampled directly from the SBR (Figure S17). In contrast, pre-homogenized samples

from the FA-treated SBR system microcosms diverged from the bulk SBR community, particularly

in the RAS treatment (S1 and S2) microcosms (Figure S16), suggesting that bulk community

composition was altered by FA-treatment. As expected, the community composition of the

samples after homogenization and click-chemistry labeling (i.e. pre-sort) were not identical to the

pre-homogenized samples, which could be attributed to cell lysis or the removal of extracellular

DNA present in the unfiltered samples (Couradeau et al., 2019) (Figures S16 and S17). Due to

these impacts, the BONCAT+ cell fractions were only compared to their corresponding bulk pre-

sort microcosm samples.

Comparing the abundance of taxa in a BONCAT+ cell fraction to that in its corresponding pre-sort

bulk community can identify changes in translational activity at the population level (Couradeau

et al., 2019; Reichart et al., 2020). For both the FA-treated and control SBRs, the largest distance

between pre-sort bulk community compositions and BONCAT+ cell fractions was observed in

microcosms seeded with S2 biomass from the end of RAS treatment (Figures S16 and S17).

Differential abundance analysis identified only 9 and 1 differentially abundant ASVs ($p < 0.01$,

DESeq2) in the BONCAT+ fractions of the FA-treated and control SBR mixed-liquor seeded (R)

microcosms, respectively, and no differentially abundant ASVs in the BONCAT+ fractions of both

SBR microcosms seeded with S1 biomass from the start of RAS treatment (Figure S18).

Conversely, for microcosms seeded with S2 biomass after 24 h of RAS treatment, 54 and 26

ASVs were differentially abundant in the BONCAT+ fractions of the FA-treated SBR and control

SBR samples, respectively (Figure S18). Within the S2 microcosm BONCAT+ fraction from the

FA-treated SBR, the 54 differentially abundant ASVs spanned 27 known genera, where 35% of

the ASVs were significantly enriched, and 65% were significantly reduced, relative to the pre-sort

bulk community (Figure 5). In contrast, the 26 differentially abundant ASVs identified in the S2

microcosm BONCAT+ fraction from the control SBR, which spanned 13 known genera, were all

(100%) significantly enriched relative to the pre-sort bulk community (Figure 5). These results

suggest that side-stream RAS treatment caused distinct shifts in the translationally active fraction

of the communities in both SBRs, with FA-treatment negatively impacting the activity of a greater

number of taxa compared to a similar anaerobic incubation without FA addition.

Figure 5: Log$_2$ fold-change in abundance of all differentially abundant ASVs detected in comparisons between BONCAT-FACS (i.e. BONCAT+) and corresponding pre-sort fractions prepared from nitrifying microcosms seeded with mixed-liquor preceding RAS-treatment (R), RAS after 15 min of side-stream treatment (S1), and RAS after 24 h of side-stream treatment (S2) from the FA-treated SBR (left panel) and control SBR (right panel). For each microcosm, log$_2$ fold-changes are shown only for differentially abundant ASVs, as determined by comparing ASV abundance in triplicate DNA extracts of each fraction using DESeq2 with an adjusted significance level of $p < 0.01$. Log$_2$ fold-changes that were not significant are set to '0' for visualization purposes. ASVs are ordered based on their phylogenetic distances estimated through multiple sequence alignment using the DECIPHER package (v.2.14.0) (Wright, 2016), and the phylogenetic tree was constructed using a maximum likelihood approach in the phangorn package (v.2.5.5) (Schliep, 2011) in the R environment. Tree tip labels (right side of the heatmap) denote the phylum, family and genus level classifications of each ASV, where NA denotes an unknown taxonomic identity at that level. Tree

436 nodes (left side of heatmap) are coloured according to genus level classification of ASVs, where nodes of
437 unknown classification (NA) are coloured grey.
438

As the BONCAT microcosms were amended with NH_4-N as the sole electron donor, it was

possible to assess the impact of RAS treatment on the translational activity of nitrifying

populations. The three dominant *Nitrospira* ASVs and the top two dominant *Nitrosomonas* ASVs

detected in both SBR BONCAT microcosm sample sets corresponded to the same dominant

ASVs detected in both SBR mixed liquors on day 94 of the time-series sampling, when the

microcosms were established (Figure 6, Figure S19). The two dominant *Nitrosomonas* ASVs

(ASV_31 and ASV_36) were both differentially abundant in the BONCAT+ fractions of S2

microcosms ($p < 0.01$, DESeq2; Figure S19), while the observed differences varied by SBR.

Nitrosomonas ASV_31 was significantly reduced in the BONCAT+ fraction of the S2-seeded

microcosm from the FA-treated SBR, while *Nitrosomonas* ASV_36 was significantly enriched in

the BONCAT+ fraction of the S2-seeded microcosm of the control SBR (Figure S19). Similar to

Nitrosomonas, the only significant differential abundance in BONCAT+ fractions for *Nitrospira*

ASVs occurred in a S2-seeded microcosm (Figure 6). *Nitrospira* ASV_8 was the only differentially

abundant NOB in BONCAT+ fractions of both SBR microcosms, and was significantly reduced in

the S2-seeded microcosm of the FA-treated SBR ($p < 0.01$, DESeq2). These results indicate that

significant reductions in translational activity of nitrifying populations were only observed in RAS

treated with FA.

Figure 6: Normalized read counts of three dominant *Nitrospira* ASVs in triplicate BONCAT+ (i.e. FACS) and corresponding pre-sort (i.e. Pre-sort) libraries generated from samples prepared from nitrifying microcosms seeded with mixed-liquor preceding RAS treatment (R), RAS after 15 min of side-stream treatment (S1), and RAS after 24 h of side-stream treatment (S2) from the FA-treated SBR (bottom) and control SBR (top). Points indicate triplicate normalized read counts per ASV, and the horizontal bars of the same colors represent the sample mean per ASV. The reads were normalized with DESeq2 based on total read-counts per sample. A black bracket between an ASV within two samples represents a significant difference in the mean read abundance, determined with DESeq2 at an adjusted significance level of *p* < 0.01.

Discussion

The results of this study demonstrated how underlying shifts in the structure and *in situ* physiology

of *Nitrospira* populations conferred the nitrite-oxidizing community with resilience to FA-based

RAS treatment, and thus limited the long-term efficacy of this strategy to promote mainstream

PN. We observed that a 24 h treatment of 19% of the RAS stream with 200 mg N/L as FA initially

inhibited NOB activity, achieving a maximum observed NAR of 42%. However, we observed NOB

acclimation to FA-treatment after approximately 40 days, in contrast to the study by Wang et al.

(2017) that observed stable NARs over ~90% for over 100 days using a similar continuous FA

RAS treatment regime (210 mg N/L of FA for 24 hr, 22% RAS treated). NOB acclimation to FA

has been previously reported (Duan et al., 2019a; Li et al., 2020; Turk and Mavinic, 1989), and

was shown to depend on aeration duration in the mainstream AS following FA exposure (Turk

and Mavinic, 1989). However, very few studies have investigated the role of functional

degeneracy of NOB populations in supporting community-level acclimation to FA-treatment in

mainstream AS (Duan et al., 2019a, 2019b; Li et al., 2020). It was suggested that *Nitrospira* were

sensitive to FA inhibition, while *Nitrobacter* were tolerant to FA but sensitive to FNA inhibition,

based on a mainstream AS scenario of alternating FA and FNA RAS treatment (Duan et al.,

2019a). Li et al. (2020) employed continuous RAS treatment with FA in mainstream AS and found

that *Candidatus* Nitrogota replaced *Nitrospira* as the dominant NOB genus. In contrast to these

genus-level community shifts previously reported during NOB community acclimation to FA, we

observed that NOB acclimation could occur via shifts in different *Nitrospira* sequence variants

with varying sensitivities to FA. This indicates that a high-resolution analysis of 16S rRNA gene

amplicons was effective at capturing acclimation of key *Nitrospira* members to FA, and revealed

the importance of niche differentiation at the variant level for maintaining NOB out-selection in

mainstream PN using FA-treatment.

Nitrospira species are well-known to be metabolically versatile, with a wide range of functional

potentials including nitrite oxidation, hydrogen oxidation, urea conversion, formate oxidation,

nitrate reduction, and complete ammonium oxidation (Koch et al., 2014, 2015; Daims et al., 2015;

Bayer et al., 2020). This metabolic diversity likely creates opportunities for functionally degenerate

Nitrospira populations to co-exist within a bioreactor by differentiating in niche space through

auxiliary metabolic specializations, while also sharing a common niche space of nitrite oxidation.

Here, we employed BONCAT-FACS for the first time in a wastewater treatment system, to the

best of our knowledge, which highlighted differing *in situ* physiologies of three *Nitrospira* variants

and resolved their responses to FA-treatment on the level of cellular translational activity.

BONCAT-FACS revealed that transitional activity in *Nitrospira* ASV_8 was significantly reduced

following exposure to FA for 24 h, aligning with the results of the time-series reactor sampling in

which *Nitrospira* ASV_8 was washed out of the FA-treated SBR but remained dominant in the

control. In contrast, ASV_32 and ASV_47 increased in abundance in the FA-treated SBR

coinciding with the decrease in NAR after day 40, where BONCAT-FACS revealed the

translational activity of those variants remained unchanged following FA-treatment. It can

therefore be hypothesized that the out-selection of ASV_8 occurred due to its decreased

translational activity in response to FA-treatment, whereas potentially distinct auxiliary metabolic

potentials of ASV_32 and ASV_47 conferred their physiological resistance to FA, thereby

providing these variants with a competitive growth advantage. More broadly, the FA-treatment

strategy employed in this study acted as a selective pressure that impacted the stability of the

NOB community composition. However, functional degeneracy within the *Nitrospira* sequence

variants likely provided the nitrite-oxidizing community with resilience by shifting activity to

physiologically resistant community members. These results therefore highlight the need to

combine NOB out-selection approaches to effectively reduce the aggregate activity of functionally

degenerate and resistant NOB populations for stable mainstream PN performance. These

findings also underscore the need for broader applications of *in situ* physiology approaches for

elucidating the impacts of NOB out-selection strategies on functionally active NOB members in

PN systems.

Accurately measuring the active biomass fraction in biotreatment systems is critical, as many key

biokinetic models and process mass balances are based on active biomass concentrations

(Henze et al., 2000). However, conventional indirect approaches for quantifying active biomass

based on net substrate utilization and growth yields are unable to resolve the compositional and

functional dynamics of active microbial populations. As enzymes are the key catalysts that drive

the majority of substrate transformations in biological wastewater treatment processes, we posit

that measures of active biomass should be based on the translationally active microbial cell

fraction. The translationally active cell fractions in both SBR microcosms seeded with mixed liquor

measured by BONCAT-FACS (R; 24.1% ± 2.6% in FA-treated, 30.1% ± 3.8% in control) were

less than the active biomass fraction predicted through steady-state modeling (Metcalf & Eddy,

Inc. et al., 2013) (67-77% VSS-basis; Supplementary Information), which is likely because the

microcosms were only supplemented with ammonium as an electron donor. Nonetheless, we

observed many translationally active heterotrophs in the BONCAT microcosms, which could have

remained active through metabolism of internal carbon reserves, endogenous respiration, or

constitutive protein expression. The consistent increase in translational activity across all

differentially abundant ASVs detected in the BONCAT+ fraction of the microcosm seeded with

control SBR RAS following the 24 h incubation could thus have been attributed to fermentative

metabolism on cell decay products. In contrast, the mixed translational responses of differentially

abundant ASVs in the BONCAT+ fraction of the RAS microcosm following incubation with FA

suggests that more complex dynamics between cellular inhibition, decay, and fermentative

metabolism were induced by FA-treatment. This analysis highlights the value of BONCAT as an

in situ physiology approach to directly measure concentrations of translationally active population

members in AS under various reactor configurations, which could be extended to resolve

associations of activity in AS taxa with different substrate preferences (Reichart et al., 2020) or to

validate biokinetic parameters. As higher-resolution process modeling of active populations has

been called for to optimize A-B processes that rely on community modulation and/or interactions

between functional groups (e.g. PN, PN-A) (Agrawal et al., 2018), *in situ* physiology approaches

like BONCAT will likely play a key role in developing the next-generation of wastewater treatment

technologies.

Conclusions

Achieving consistent out-selection of NOB in mainstream AS remains as a key challenge towards the maintenance of stable PN for energy-efficient BNR processes. This study investigated the underlying mechanisms providing nitrite-oxidizing communities in AS bioreactors with resilience to out-selection during the treatment of a fraction of RAS with a sidestream flow containing high concentrations of FA, similar to anaerobic digester centrate. Sidestream FA-treatment of RAS was shown to promote nitrite accumulation in AS under mainstream conditions; however, the effects were transient. The acclimation of the nitrite oxidizing community to repeated FA treatment was attributed to resistant *Nitrospira* populations that increased in abundance over time. The *in-situ* physiological responses of different *Nitrospira* populations were measured throughout FA exposure using BONCAT-FACS activity-based cell sorting, and corroborated their observed time-series abundance dynamics in the AS bioreactor. Therefore, closely-related *Nitrospira* populations co-existing within the same AS bioreactor had differing physiological responses to the applied out-selection pressure, conferring resilience to the nitrite oxidation process and causing deterioration of PN performance. Due to this observed functional degeneracy in *Nitrospira* populations, we recommended the concerted application of multiple NOB out-selection strategies that impact physiologically diverse NOB to achieve stable PN in mainstream AS.

586 **Acknowledgements**

587 This work was supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC)

588 of Canada (Discovery Grant). MM was supported by an NSERC CGS-M fellowship.

590 **Author Information**

591 MM and YL contributed equally to this work.

Supplementary Information

594 The Supplementary Information file contains supplemental notes pertaining to detailed materials

595 and methods, bioinformatics scripts, Tables S1-S12, and Figures S1-20.

596
597
598

References

Agrawal, S., Seuntjens, D., Cocker, P.D., Lackner, S., Vlaeminck, S.E., 2018. Success of mainstream partial nitration/anammox demands integration of engineering, microbiome and modeling insights. Curr. Opin. Biotechnol. 50, 214–221. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2018.01.013

Bayer, B., Saito, M.A., McIlvin, M.R., Lücker, S., Moran, D.M., Lankiewicz, T.S., Dupont, C.L., Santoro, A.E., 2020. Metabolic versatility of the nitrite-oxidizing bacterium Nitrospira marina and its proteomic response to oxygen-limited conditions. ISME J. 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41396-020-00828-3

Callahan, B.J., McMurdie, P.J., Rosen, M.J., Han, A.W., Johnson, A.J.A., Holmes, S.P., 2016. DADA2: High-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. Nat. Methods 13, 581–583. https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.3869

Cao, Y., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M., Daigger, G.T., 2017. Mainstream partial nitration–anammox in municipal wastewater treatment: status, bottlenecks, and further studies. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 101, 1365–1383. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-016-8058-7

Cogert, K.I., Ziels, R.M., Winkler, M.K.H., 2019. Reducing Cost and Environmental Impact of Wastewater Treatment with Denitrifying Methanotrophs, Anammox, and Mainstream Anaerobic Treatment. Environ. Sci. Technol. 53, 12935–12944. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.9b04764

Couradeau, E., Sasse, J., Goudeau, D., Nath, N., Hazen, T.C., Bowen, B.P., Chakraborty, R., Malmstrom, R.R., Northen, T.R., 2019. Probing the active fraction of soil microbiomes using BONCAT-FACS. Nat. Commun. 10, 2770. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-10542-0

Daims, H., Lebedeva, E.V., Pjevac, P., Han, P., Herbold, C., Albertsen, M., Jehmlich, N., Palatinszky, M., Vierheilig, J., Bulaev, A., Kirkegaard, R.H., von Bergen, M., Rattei, T., Bendinger, B., Nielsen, P.H., Wagner, M., 2015. Complete nitrification by Nitrospira bacteria. Nature 528, 504–509. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature16461

Daims, H., Lücker, S., Wagner, M., 2016. A New Perspective on Microbes Formerly Known as Nitrite-Oxidizing Bacteria. Trends Microbiol. 24, 699–712. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2016.05.004

Duan, H., Wang, Q., Erler, D.V., Ye, L., Yuan, Z., 2018. Effects of free nitrous acid treatment conditions on the nitrite pathway performance in mainstream wastewater treatment. Sci. Total Environ. 644, 360–370. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.06.346

Duan, H., Ye, L., Lu, X., Yuan, Z., 2019a. Overcoming Nitrite Oxidizing Bacteria Adaptation through Alternating Sludge Treatment with Free Nitrous Acid and Free Ammonia. Environ. Sci. Technol. 53, 1937–1946. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.8b06148

Duan, H., Ye, L., Wang, Q., Zheng, M., Lu, X., Wang, Z., Yuan, Z., 2019b. Nitrite oxidizing bacteria (NOB) contained in influent deteriorate mainstream NOB suppression by sidestream inactivation. Water Res. 162, 331–338. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2019.07.002

Eren, A.M., Morrison, H.G., Lescault, P.J., Reveillaud, J., Vineis, J.H., Sogin, M.L., 2015. Minimum entropy decomposition: Unsupervised oligotyping for sensitive partitioning of high-throughput marker gene sequences. ISME J. 9, 968–979. https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2014.195

Ge, S., Peng, Y., Qiu, S., Zhu, A., Ren, N., 2014. Complete nitrogen removal from municipal wastewater via partial nitrification by appropriately alternating anoxic/aerobic conditions in a continuous plug-flow step feed process. Water Res. 55, 95–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.01.058

Hahne, F., LeMeur, N., Brinkman, R.R., Ellis, B., Haaland, P., Sarkar, D., Spidlen, J., Strain, E.,

Gentleman, R., 2009. flowCore: a Bioconductor package for high throughput flow
cytometry. BMC Bioinformatics 10, 106. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2105-10-106

Hatzenpichler, R., Connon, S.A., Goudeau, D., Malmstrom, R.R., Woyke, T., Orphan, V.J.,
2016. Visualizing in situ translational activity for identifying and sorting slow-growing
archaeal−bacterial consortia. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 113, E4069–E4078.
https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1603757113

Hatzenpichler, R., Krukenberg, V., Spietz, R.L., Jay, Z.J., 2020. Next-generation physiology
approaches to study microbiome function at single cell level. Nat. Rev. Microbiol.
https://doi.org/10.1038/s41579-020-0323-1

Hatzenpichler, R., Scheller, S., Tavormina, P.L., Babin, B.M., Tirrell, D.A., Orphan, V.J., 2014.
In situ visualization of newly synthesized proteins in environmental microbes using
amino acid tagging and click chemistry: Visualizing new proteins in microbes by click
chemistry. Environ. Microbiol. 16, 2568–2590. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.12436

Henze, M., Gujer, W., Mino, T., Loosdrecht, M.C.M. van, 2000. Activated sludge models ASM1,
ASM2, ASM2d and ASM3. IWA Publishing.

Koch, H., Galushko, A., Albertsen, M., Schintlmeister, A., Gruber-Dorninger, C., Lücker, S.,
Pelletier, E., Paslier, D.L., Spieck, E., Richter, A., Nielsen, P.H., Wagner, M., Daims, H.,
2014. Growth of nitrite-oxidizing bacteria by aerobic hydrogen oxidation. Science 345,
1052–1054. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1256985

Koch, H., Lücker, S., Albertsen, M., Kitzinger, K., Herbold, C., Spieck, E., Nielsen, P.H.,
Wagner, M., Daims, H., 2015. Expanded metabolic versatility of ubiquitous nitrite-
oxidizing bacteria from the genus Nitrospira. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 112, 11371–11376.
https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1506533112

Kornaros, M., Dokianakis, S.N., Lyberatos, G., 2010. Partial Nitrification/Denitrification Can Be
Attributed to the Slow Response of Nitrite Oxidizing Bacteria to Periodic Anoxic
Disturbances. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 7245–7253. https://doi.org/10.1021/es100564j

Li, S., Duan, H., Zhang, Y., Huang, X., Yuan, Z., Liu, Y., Zheng, M., 2020. Adaptation of
nitrifying community in activated sludge to free ammonia inhibition and inactivation. Sci.
Total Environ. 728, 138713. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138713

Li, X., Klaus, S., Bott, C., He, Z., 2018. Status, Challenges, and Perspectives of Mainstream
Nitritation-Anammox for Wastewater Treatment. Water Environ. Res. 90, 634–649.
https://doi.org/10.2175/106143017X15131012153112

Liu, G., Wang, J., 2013. Long-Term Low DO Enriches and Shifts Nitrifier Community in
Activated Sludge. Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 5109–5117.
https://doi.org/10.1021/es304647y

Love, M.I., Huber, W., Anders, S., 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for
RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biol. 15, 550. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13059-014-
0550-8

Lücker, S., Schwarz, J., Gruber-Dorninger, C., Spieck, E., Wagner, M., Daims, H., 2015.
Nitrotoga-like bacteria are previously unrecognized key nitrite oxidizers in full-scale
wastewater treatment plants. ISME J. 9, 708–720.
https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2014.158

Metcalf & Eddy, Inc., Tchobanoglous, G., Burton, F., Stensel, H.D., 2013. Wastewater
Engineering: Treatment and Resource Recovery, 5th ed. McGraw-Hill.

Nierychlo, M., Andersen, K.S., Xu, Y., Green, N., Jiang, C., Albertsen, M., Dueholm, M.S.,
Nielsen, P.H., 2020. MiDAS 3: An ecosystem-specific reference database, taxonomy
and knowledge platform for activated sludge and anaerobic digesters reveals species-
level microbiome composition of activated sludge. Water Res. 115955.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2020.115955

Oksanen, J., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., O'Hara, B., Stevens, M.H.H., Oksanen, M.J., Suggests, M., 2007. The vegan package. Community Ecol. Package 10, 719.

Parada, A.E., Needham, D.M., Fuhrman, J.A., 2016. Every base matters: assessing small subunit rRNA primers for marine microbiomes with mock communities, time series and global field samples. Environ. Microbiol. 18, 1403–1414. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13023

Paulson, J.N., Stine, O.C., Bravo, H.C., Pop, M., 2013. Differential abundance analysis for microbial marker-gene surveys. Nat. Methods 10, 1200–1202. https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.2658

Regmi, P., Miller, M.W., Holgate, B., Bunce, R., Park, H., Chandran, K., Wett, B., Murthy, S., Bott, C.B., 2014. Control of aeration, aerobic SRT and COD input for mainstream nitritation/denitritation. Water Res. 57, 162–171. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.03.035

Reichart, N.J., Jay, Z.J., Krukenberg, V., Parker, A.E., Spietz, R.L., Hatzenpichler, R., 2020. Activity-based cell sorting reveals responses of uncultured archaea and bacteria to substrate amendment. ISME J. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41396-020-00749-1

Schliep, K.P., 2011. phangorn: phylogenetic analysis in R. Bioinformatics 27, 592–593. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btq706

Singer, E., Wagner, M., Woyke, T., 2017. Capturing the genetic makeup of the active microbiome in situ. ISME J. 11, 1949–1963. https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2017.59

Spasov, E., Tsuji, J.M., Hug, L.A., Doxey, A.C., Sauder, L.A., Parker, W.J., Neufeld, J.D., 2019. High functional diversity among *Nitrospira* populations that dominate rotating biological contactor microbial communities in a municipal wastewater treatment plant (preprint). Microbiology. https://doi.org/10.1101/529826

Tang, J., Landes, R.D., 2020. Some t-tests for N-of-1 trials with serial correlation. PLOS ONE 15, e0228077. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0228077

Turk, O., Mavinic, D.S., 1989. Stability of Nitrite Build-Up in an Activated Sludge System. J. Water Pollut. Control Fed. 61, 1440–1448.

Wang, Q., Duan, H., Wei, W., Ni, B.-J., Laloo, A., Yuan, Z., 2017. Achieving Stable Mainstream Nitrogen Removal via the Nitrite Pathway by Sludge Treatment Using Free Ammonia. Environ. Sci. Technol. 51, 9800–9807. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.7b02776

Wang, Q., Garrity, G.M., Tiedje, J.M., Cole, J.R., 2007. Naïve Bayesian Classifier for Rapid Assignment of rRNA Sequences into the New Bacterial Taxonomy. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 73, 5261–5267. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00062-07

Wickham, H., Averick, M., Bryan, J., Chang, W., McGowan, L.D., François, R., Grolemund, G., Hayes, A., Henry, L., Hester, J., Kuhn, M., Pedersen, T.L., Miller, E., Bache, S.M., Müller, K., Ooms, J., Robinson, D., Seidel, D.P., Spinu, V., Takahashi, K., Vaughan, D., Wilke, C., Woo, K., Yutani, H., 2019. Welcome to the Tidyverse. J. Open Source Softw. 4, 1686. https://doi.org/10.21105/joss.01686

Wright, E., S., 2016. Using DECIPHER v2.0 to Analyze Big Biological Sequence Data in R. R J. 8, 352. https://doi.org/10.32614/RJ-2016-025

Xu, G., Zhou, Y., Yang, Q., Lee, Z.M.-P., Gu, J., Lay, W., Cao, Y., Liu, Y., 2015. The challenges of mainstream deammonification process for municipal used water treatment. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 99, 2485–2490. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-015-6423-6