Metagenomics and Metatranscriptomics Suggest Pathways of 3-Chloroaniline Degradation in Wastewater Reactors

Hari Seshan[1,2,□,§], Ezequiel Santillan[1,2,§], Florentin Constancias[1,☼], Uma Shankari d/o Chandra Segaran[1], Rohan B. H. Williams [1,3] and Stefan Wuertz[1,2,4,*]

[1]Singapore Centre for Environmental Life Sciences Engineering, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore, 637551, Singapore.

[2]Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, U.S.A.

[3]Singapore Centre for Environmental Life Sciences Engineering, National University of Singapore, 119077, Singapore.

[4]School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore, 639798, Singapore.

*Correspondence to: Stefan Wuertz, swuertz@ntu.edu.sg

□ Current affiliation: Tyr Group Pty Ltd, Fortitude Valley, QLD 4006, Australia.

§H.S. and E.S. contributed equally.

☼ Current affiliation: Laboratory of Food Biotechnology, Department of Health Sciences and Technology, ETH Zurich, Switzerland.

Abstract

Biological wastewater treatment systems are often affected by major shifts in influent quality, including the input of various toxic chemicals. Yet the mechanisms underlying adaptation of activated sludge process performance when challenged with a sustained toxin input are rarely studied in a controlled and replicated experimental setting. Three replicate bench-scale bioreactors were subjected to a chemical disturbance in the form of 3-chloroaniline (3-CA) over 132 days, after an acclimation period of 58 days, while three control reactors received no 3-CA input. Nitrification was initially affected by 3-CA but the microbial communities in all three treatment reactors adapted to biologically degrade 3-CA within three weeks of the experiment, resulting in partial nitrification recovery. Combining process and microbial community data from amplicon sequencing with potential functions gleaned from assembled metagenomics and metatranscriptomics data, two putative degradation pathways for 3-CA were identified. The first pathway proceeds via a phenol monooxygenase followed by ortho-cleavage of the aromatic ring, and the second one involves a benzoate dioxygenase and subsequent meta-cleavage of the aromatic ring. The genera *Gemmatimonas*, *OLB8*, and *Taibaiella* correlated significantly with 3-CA degradation. Metagenome-assembled genome data also showed the genus *OLB8* to be differentially enriched in treatment reactors, making it a strong candidate as 3-CA degrader. Using replicated reactors, this study has demonstrated the impact of a sustained stress on the activated sludge community and processes carried out by its members, followed by process recovery. By a combination of techniques, we showed that microbial communities can develop degradative capacity following a sustained xenobiotic input, and that targeted culture-independent approaches can suggest plausible mechanisms for 3-CA degradation and identify the taxa potentially contributing to it.

Keywords: wastewater treatment, xenobiotics, nitrification inhibition, metagenomics, metatranscriptomics

1   Introduction

The activated sludge process in biological wastewater treatment involves a complex microbial community performing several metabolic functions under controlled conditions (Briones and Raskin, 2003). Major shifts in process performance can occur when a disturbance is imposed on a community (Allison and Martiny, 2008) and can impact a wastewater treatment plant's treatment capability over the long-term (Vuono et al., 2015). Such disturbances may be operational (Thompson, 2006; Valipour et al. 2014, Santillan et al., 2020), physical (Hwang et al., 2006; Vargas et al., 2013), or chemical (Kelly et al., 2004; Falk and Wuertz, 2010). While short-term (pulse) disturbances have been studied extensively (Boon et al., 2000; Henriques et al., 2007; Ma et al., 2020), long-term (sustained) disturbances have not. Sustained disturbances provide an opportunity for processes to adapt and recover (Johnston et al., 2019), and studying them may provide insights into means to buffer systems against disruptions of treatment processes (Briones and Raskin, 2003).

The compound 3-chloroaniline (3-CA) is a by-product of the production of herbicides and dyes (Ficara and Rozzi, 2001). It disrupts nitrification by inhibiting ammonia oxidizing bacteria (AOB) (McCarty, 1999; Falk and Wuertz, 2010). Its impact on wastewater treatment has been assessed using pulse inputs ranging from 40 mg/L 3-CA (Ma et al., 2020) to 250 mg/L 3-CA (Boon et al., 2000), continuous inputs up to 120 mg/L 3-CA (Falk and Wuertz, 2010; Zhu et al., 2008), and recurring pulse inputs of 70 mg/L at varying frequencies (Santillan et al., 2019). Biological 3-CA degradation involves its conversion to a chlorocatechol, followed by cleavage of the aromatic ring and channelling into TCA cycle intermediates (Reineke, 1998; Pimviriyakul et al., 2019). Some of these studies reported 3-CA degradation (Zhu et al., 2008; Santillan et al., 2019), but none confirmed the pathway involved or identified the microbial community members contributing to degradation.

Metagenomic and metatranscriptomic analyses allow the examination of gene abundance and expression, respectively, in complex microbial communities like activated sludge. Transcriptomics has been used to elucidate degradation pathways in the context of aromatics degradation in pure culture experiments (Tam et al., 2006; Yan and Wu, 2017; Cauduro et al., 2020; Ma et al., 2020b). Long-term metatranscriptomics sampling has also shown differential abundance and expression of genes related to aromatic-compound degradation in activated sludge bioreactors (Sato et al., 2019; Sun et al., 2019; Yu et al., 2019). However, it is rare to

combine these methods with amplicon sequencing to determine the taxa involved in degradation

and outline possible catabolic pathways. Furthermore, the expression of relevant genes in a

bioprocess can potentially be followed using metatranscriptomics but is rarely exploited in the

context of process engineering.

This study investigated the effect of a sustained xenobiotic disturbance in the form of 3-

CA addition for 132 days on activated sludge wastewater treatment, focusing on process impacts

and 3-CA degradation mechanisms. Of six bench-scale bioreactors that had been acclimated with

activated sludge from a wastewater treatment plant, three received sustained 3-CA input and

three were maintained as controls, with no 3-CA input. The objectives of this study were to: (a)

examine, through intensive nutrient cycling profiles, how the emergence of 3-CA degradation

impacted process recovery and the nitrifier microbial community; (b) identify, via amplicon

sequencing and metagenomics, the taxa most likely responsible for 3-CA degradation; and (c)

identify, via metagenomics and metatranscriptomics, the most likely degradation pathways

involved in 3-CA degradation.

2   Materials and methods

2.1   Experimental design

Six sequencing batch bioreactors were run in parallel, fed on synthetic wastewater, for a

58-day preliminary acclimation period. On day 0 (D0), the inoculum was taken from aeration

tanks of a full-scale water reclamation plant in Singapore, mixed and distributed to all six

reactors (2 L each). Each reactor additionally received 2 L of synthetic wastewater for a working

volume of 4 L. The reactors were run identically on nonstop 12-h cycles during acclimation.

The stages of each 12-h cycle were as follows: 20 min feeding, 180 min anoxic mixing,

440 min aeration (dissolved oxygen, DO, maintained at 1-2 mg/L using a feedback loop with

aeration beginning at 1 L air/min when probes measured DO < 1 mg/L, and stopping when DO >

2 mg/L), 50 min settling and 30 min effluent (supernatant) discharge. 2 L of effluent were

discharged at the end of every cycle and replaced with 2 L of synthetic wastewater at the

beginning of the next 12-h cycle, resulting in a hydraulic retention time of 24 h. The mixed

liquor temperature was maintained at 30□C using water jackets around the reactors and a re-

circulating water heater. Solids were removed regularly from mixed liquor to maintain an SRT of

about 30 d.

The synthetic wastewater fed to all six reactors in the feed phase of each cycle during the

acclimation period was adapted from Hesselmann et al. (1999) and is detailed in Supplementary

Information (SI). When diluted in reactor mixed liquor, it provided 500 mg/L COD and 70 mg/L

Total Nitrogen.

On D59, the 3-CA experiment was started and continued for 132 days. At the start of this

experiment, three reactors were randomly assigned to the treatment group (with 3-CA added to

their feed regularly as described below) and the other three were assigned to the control group

(no 3-CA addition). The reactors were originally numbered 1 through 8, with reactors 6 and 8

being removed from service during acclimation. Reactors 1, 3 and 7 were then randomly selected

to serve as treatment reactors, while 2, 4 and 5 served as controls. Treatment reactors 1, 3 and 7

were subsequently redesignated T1, T2 and T3 respectively, and control reactors 2, 4 and 5 were

redesignated C1, C2 and C3 respectively. This redesignation is used in this paper. Cycle

conditions and other parameters were identical to acclimation phase conditions, except that

treatment reactors were fed differently: the organic constituents in treatment reactors were

reduced by 20%, to a COD of 400 mg/L. The remaining 20% of COD was as 3-CA, resulting in

a mixed liquor 3-CA concentration of 70 mg/L and a total COD concentration (when diluted in

mixed liquor) of 500 mg/L. The three control reactors continued to receive the same 3-CA-free

medium used during acclimation. The 3-CA experiment lasted 132 days, or roughly 4 SRTs. On

D99, a pulse 3-CA load was inadvertently added to control reactor C3 at the same concentration

as the treatment reactors, as detailed in SI. The majority of results from the time points shown in

main figures are either prior to this error, or after its impacts had dissipated. In other words, data

from reactor C3 from after this error were captured after process performance had recovered to

its pre-error levels.

2.2 Mixed liquor sampling for molecular analyses

To assess the changes in community composition, community function, and treatment

performance over the long term, samples of mixed liquor and effluent were taken from all six

reactors at five distinct time points during the experiment; specifically, on D0 (inoculation of all

six reactors), D56 (shortly before 3-CA input began), D63 (shortly after 3-CA input began),

D112, D164 and D176. The last three sampling dates represent periods where 3-CA degradation

had fully developed in treatment reactors. Mixed liquor was collected and processed as described

in Santillan et al. (2021). Mixed liquor was also sampled hourly during a single cycle study (see

Section 2.3) on D171 for RNA extraction and sequencing as described in Section 2.8.

2.3   Sampling for full-cycle process performance assessment

143   To investigate nutrient cycling across all six bioreactors, intensive sampling was carried

144   out during 12-h cycles roughly every two weeks during the experiment (termed cycle studies).

145   Ten cycle studies were conducted throughout the 3-CA experiment, on D59 (first day of 3-CA

146   addition to treatment reactors), D80, D95, D110, D124, D129, D136, D158, D171 and D192.

147   Results from five representative cycle studies (D59, D95, D124, D158 and D192) are presented

148   in main figures, while all cycle study results are in SI (Figures S1 – S5).

149   During a cycle study, samples were taken from all reactors at several time points. The

first cycle study sample was usually of of effluent (supernatant) from the end of the previous

cycle, taken at the end of settling, 30 min before the cycle under study commenced. Mixed liquor

samples were then taken hourly during the anoxic phase, starting 30 min after the cycle started,

up to the anoxic-aerobic interface. During the aerobic phase, mixed liquor was sampled every 90

min (D59 to D129) or every 30 min (D136 to D192), until the beginning of the settling phase.

Then a final effluent sample was taken at the end of the settling phase. All samples were

centrifuged at $8000g$ for 3 min, and the supernatant filtered through a 0.2-µm filter for water

quality analyses as described in Section 2.4.

158   Note that mixed liquor for molecular analysis was not sampled on the same days as for

159   cycle studies. This is because cycle studies were used for short-term assessments, whereas the

160   molecular (DNA) methods were primarily targeted at monitoring long-term community changes.

161   Note however that the dates for long-term sampling are close to cycle study dates.

162   *2.4   Water quality parameters*

163   Water quality parameters were measured as described by Santillan et al. (2021) and

164   detailed in SI.

165   *2.5   DNA extraction*

166   Genomic DNA was extracted and processed as described by Santillan et al. (2021) and

detailed in SI.

2.6   16S rRNA gene amplicon sequencing and bioinformatics

Extracted DNA from D0, D56, D63, D112 and D164 were amplified for the 16S rRNA
gene and the amplicons were sequenced using the Illumina MiSeq (v.3) platform. The
amplification, sequencing and accompanying bioinformatics are described by Santillan et al.
(2021) and detailed in the SI. To allow for consistent scaling of relative ASV abundance, the
read counts of ASVs identified in each sample were normalized to the minimum total read count
seen in any given sample. The relative abundances of ASVs identified in the normalized matrix
were used to identify correlations with 3-CA degradation as described in Section 2.9.1. Whole
microbial community-level analysis of these data is available elsewhere (Santillan et al., 2021).

2.7   Metagenomics sequencing and bioinformatics

Mixed liquor from all six reactors on D176 of the experiment was used for whole
community shotgun metagenome sequencing. Genomic DNA was extracted as described in
Section 2.5 and sequenced at SCELSE on an Illumina HiSeq platform (Illumina, Inc., San Diego,
California, USA). Prior to library preparation, the quality of the DNA samples was assessed on a
Bioanalyzer 2100 using a DNA 12000 Chip (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, California,
USA). Library preparation was performed following Illumina's TruSeq DNA Nano Sample
Preparation protocol, starting with 100 ng of genomic DNA and following sizing instructions for
350bp inserts. During adapter ligation, each library was tagged with one of Illumina's TruSeq LT
DNA barcodes. Library quantification was performed using Invitrogen's Picogreen assay and
average library size was determined by running libraries on an Agilent Bioanalyzer DNA 7500
chip. Library concentrations were normalized to 4 nM and validated by qPCR on an Applied
Biosystems ViiA-7 real-time thermocycler using qPCR primers recommended in Illumina's
qPCR protocol, and Illumina's PhiX control library as standard. Libraries were then pooled and
sequenced across two lanes of an Illumina HiSeq 2500 rapid sequencing run at a read-length of
150-bp paired-end.

In total, around 634 million paired-end reads were generated, averaging 105 ± 3 million
paired-end reads per sample. Functional gene identification and quantification was performed
using the SqueezeMeta pipeline (Tamames and Puente-Sánchez, 2019). Read pairs were co-
assembled using Megahit (Li et al., 2015), generating 2.1 million contigs representing 2,649
million nucleotides. Open reading frames (ORFs) were then predicted from contigs using
Prodigal (Hyatt et al., 2010), from which 12 million ORFs were identified, averaging 2 ± 0.1
million ORFs per sample. Functional annotation was performed using DIAMOND (Buchfink et

al., 2015) against the KEGG database (Kanehisa et al., 2016). Read mapping against contigs was then performed using Bowtie2 (Langmead and Salzberg, 2012) to quantify the abundance of genes among the different samples, and transformed to transcripts per million (TPM) values (Puente-Sánchez et al., 2020). To identify genes involved in 3-CA degradation, the analysis focused on the following KEGG metabolic pathways from the xenobiotics biodegradation and metabolism category: chlorocyclohexane and chlorobenzene degradation (KO: 00361), benzoate degradation (KO: 00362), polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbon degradation (KO: 00624), and aminobenzoate degradation (KO: 00627). 170 genes were recovered in total from these pathways.

Metagenome-assembled genome (MAG) binning was performed using MaxBin2 (Wu et al., 2016), Metabat2 (Kang et al., 2019) and DAS Tool (Sieber et al., 2018) using the above-mentioned co-assembly as well as sample read mapping quantification. MAG genome quality statistics were computed using CheckM (Parks et al., 2015). Overall, 60 MAGs were reconstructed from the dataset at <10% contamination and >80% completeness, the latter exceeding the >50% completeness required for medium-quality MAGs (Bowers et al., 2017). Genome level taxonomy was assigned using GTDB (Chaumeil et al., 2020, release 06-RS202) and functional potential was further estimated using anvio (Eren et al., 2015) against KEGG Orthologs (KOs) (using anvi-setup-kegg-kofams, anvi-run-kegg-kofams, default parameters). Quantification of MAG relative abundance was performed using mean coverage across samples. A summary of the statistics from the metagenomic analyses is available as part of Supplementary Files (SF).

2.8   RNA extraction, sequencing and transcriptomics

To determine the changes in gene expression profiles during a single 12-hour cycle, RNA extraction and subsequent sequencing were performed on each sample taken from a single cycle study on D171. Total RNA extraction methods have been described in Law et al (2016). RNA extractions were performed with Soil/ Fecal RNA Isolation Kit (Zymo Research, Irvine, CA, USA; Catalog# R2040) with some protocol modifications (Law et al, 2016). RNA purity was determined by Thermo Scientific Nanodrop 2000 by calculating an A260/A280 and A260/A230 to screen for contaminants in purified RNA. Extracted RNA concentration was determined by a Qubit 2.0 fluorometer, and RNA integrity (RIN) was measured using the Agilent 2200 Tapestation system, prior to library preparation and sequencing on an Illumina 2500 using a

101 bp paired-end run (Law et al, 2016). Reads of non-ribosomal origin were mapped to
predicted genes in the metagenome assembly, converted to reads per kilobase million RPKM)
and aggregated using the same annotations described above.

2.9   Data Analysis

2.9.1   Identification of ASVs associated with 3-CA degradation

To determine which ASVs from 16S rRNA amplicon sequencing were correlated with 3-
CA degradation in treatment reactors, each ASV from treatment reactors from D64, D112 and
D164 was compared to 3-CA degradation rates in treatment reactors on D59, D110 and D171,
respectively. Same-day comparisons were not possible because 3-CA degradation data were not
taken on the same days where mixed liquor (ML) samples were taken for amplicon sequencing.
However, the variation in 3-CA degradation did not differ widely over time once 3-CA
degradation had been established (Figure 1A; Figure S1), so these comparisons were still
considered valid. Spearman's rank order correlation coefficient was used between the three 3-CA
removal percentages on the three days identified above, and the corresponding normalized ASV
abundances in the three treatment reactors (n = 9: 3 time points × 3 reactors). To assess
correlation significance, *t*-statistics were calculated from the correlation coefficient for each ASV
based on 7 (n − 2) degrees of freedom, and *p*-values were calculated from these *t*-statistics. A
correction for multiple comparisons was applied using the Benjamini-Hochberg procedure
(McDonald, 2014), applying a 10% False Discovery Rate (FDR). The ASVs that remained
significant (adjusted p-value < 0.05) after correction are discussed further in the next section.
This analysis was implemented in Microsoft Excel.

To examine these results visually, the mean normalized abundance of each taxon across
all three treatment reactors on D63, D112 and D164 was plotted on a logarithmic scale against
the respective 3-CA degradation correlation coefficient as calculated above (Figure 3). ASVs
that fell toward the top right of this plot and correlated with relevant degradation genes as
identified below were considered more likely to have participated in 3-CA degradation.

2.9.2   Enrichment of xenobiotics degradation genes

To determine which xenobiotics degradation genes identified from the metagenomics
data set from D176 were differentially enriched, two methods were used in parallel. The first
defined genes that were "differentially enriched" via calculating z-scores, while the second
defined genes that were "significantly enriched" via general linear multivariate models

(GLMMs). The overlap of these two sets produced a subset of genes that was examined more
closely (Figure 4).

To evaluate differential enrichment, a z-score was first calculated from the TPM values
for each gene in each reactor to determine the deviation from the average TPM. The difference in
mean z-score between control and treatment reactors was then calculated, termed D_z. Differential
enrichment in treatment reactors was defined as $D_z \geq 1.4$. This arbitrary cut-off balanced the
selection of genes enriched by 3-CA presence and degradation, against the false elimination of
genes that degraded 3-CA (*i.e.*, reducing type II error probability). Out of the initial 170 genes
included in the analysis, 32 were differentially enriched (Table S1). Of these 32 genes, 7 were
additionally assumed (via qualitative examination) to play a direct role in 3-CA degradation as
identified in Table 1 and are discussed further.

To assess the significance of gene enrichment while also accounting for mean-variance
relationship concerns (Wang et al., 2017), we performed a GLMM analysis on the full set of 170
genes to fit the data to a negative binomial distribution, using the *mvabund* package in R (v.
4.1.9). Both residuals vs fitted and mean-variance plots (available in Supplementary Files)
supported the choice of a negative binomial distribution for the regression model. Univariate p-
values for each of the 170 genes were adjusted for multiple comparisons using a step-down
resampling procedure with a 10% P_{adj} cut-off, resulting in 11 genes being significantly enriched
in treatment reactors. 9 of these 11 genes were also differentially enriched in treatment reactors
($D_z \geq 1.4$) (Figure 4).

The significance of enrichment of each of the 170 genes is plotted against the levels of
differential enrichment visually in Figure 4A, with the differentially enriched genes shown in
greater detail in Figure 4B. Of the 7 differentially enriched genes that we qualitatively identified
as being involved in 3-CA degradation (Table 1, Figure 4), 2 overlapped with the 9 identified
above as being both significantly and differentially enriched (Table 1, Figure 4). All assembled
MAGs were inspected to determine if any of these 7 genes were significantly enriched in
treatment reactors, with negative results. The above differential enrichment (D_z) process was
repeated on MAG coverage between control and treatment reactors on D176, to determine the
taxa relatively enriched in the treatment reactors, and potentially associated with 3-CA
degradation (Table S2).

2.9.3   Differential transcription of xenobiotics degradation genes from metatranscriptomics data

To determine whether the differentially enriched genes were also differentially

transcribed in response to 3-CA input, we checked whether the transcription levels of a given

gene related to 3-CA degradation rose during the aerobic phase of a cycle in treatment reactors

compared to control reactors, and compared to the anoxic phase. The RPKM values for each

relevant gene during a full cycle on D171 were plotted, including local polynomial regression

fitting using the *loess* function from the *ggplot2* package (v.3.3.2) in R, including 95%

confidence intervals.

3   **Results and discussion**

We investigated the effects of a sustained disturbance, caused by the presence of the

xenobiotic compound 3-CA, on process performance, including COD removal, nitrification, and

3-CA persistence/degradation. Additionally, the advent of 3-CA degradation led to the

identification of putative 3-CA degraders and their associated degradation pathways.

3.1   *Impact of 3-CA on process performance*

Nutrient profiles from all six reactors over several 12-h cycle studies revealed the impact

of sustained 3-CA input on community function (Figures 1, 2 and S1 – S5). In the anoxic phase,

control reactors consistently showed COD degradation (Figure 1B, S2B) and nitrate

transformation (Figure 2C, S5B), with a transient nitrite spike (Figure 2B, S4B), indicating a

complete denitrification pathway. Nitrification was also complete in control reactors in the

aerobic phase, with ammonia levels falling to < 5 mg/L (Figure 2A, S3B) (apart from D110,

where an inadvertent 3-CA input into reactor C3 caused a temporary loss of ammonia oxidation),

an accompanying nitrite spike (Figure 2B, S4B), and a subsequent nitrate build-up (Figure 2C,

S5B). In contrast, the treatment reactors initially experienced only partial COD degradation in

the anoxic phase, which began to improve over time, as indicated by the change in COD profiles

from D59 to D192, with COD levels on D124 not significantly different from those of the

control reactors (Welch's *t*-test P = 0.6) at the end of the cycle (Figure 1B, S2A). Ammonia

oxidation was inhibited in treatment reactors in the aerobic phase (Figure 2A, S3A), with

ammonia accrual over multiple consecutive cycles. However, some ammonia oxidation was

observed in treatment reactors starting on D158 (Figure 2A, S3A), accompanied by some nitrite

production in the aerobic phase (Figure 2B, S4A). These results indicated that COD degradation

followed by ammonia oxidation gradually began to recover in treatment reactors, despite
continuing 3-CA input.

Concurrent with COD degradation that developed from D95 onward in treatment reactors
at the beginning of the aerobic phase (Figure 1B, S2A), 3-CA degradation was evident in all
three treatment reactors (Figure 1A, S1), indicating that 3-CA accounted for the portion of COD
degraded in treatment reactors during the aerobic phase. This strongly implies that treatment
reactors had developed the ability to degrade 3-CA in response to sustained input. In turn, other
processes like ammonia oxidation started to recover despite continued 3-CA input, as stated
above. Batch experiments run separately (detailed in SI) showed that 3-CA was being degraded
biologically (Figure S6).

The partial recovery of ammonia oxidation took about 35 days from the start of 3-CA
input. Falk and Wuertz (2010) saw neither 3-CA degradation nor ammonia oxidation recovery
during a 70-day experiment with sustained 3-CA input. However, they used a lower mixed liquor
temperature (20º C versus 30º C in our experiment) and an inoculum from a wastewater
treatment plant in a different region (temperate Davis, California, versus tropical Singapore)
from a different sewershed (university campus, including multiple research facilities versus a
mixed residential-industrial use in Singapore). Santillan et al. (2019) reported 3-CA degradation
in a 35-day experiment with sustained 3-CA input, and partial ammonia oxidation recovery with
less frequent 3-CA pulses. While their inoculum was from the same plant as ours, their reactors
were much smaller, with a working volume of about 20 mL. Ma et al. (2020) reported full
nitrification recovery within 12 days of a pulse 3-CA input (at lower concentrations) in a single-
reactor study, possibly concurrent with the washout of 3-CA from the reactor. Kelly et al. (2004)
reported a 17-day recovery period for total nitrification after a 1-chloro-2,4-dinitrobenzene pulse
addition at a comparable concentration. The resumption of partial nitrification in our study may
be attributed to the long SRT of 30 days. This allowed AOB to acclimate to the sustained 3-CA
input. The onset of 3-CA degradation likely helped this recovery process. Both processes were
aided by the source inoculum and the long SRT. A longer experimental run may have seen
further recovery of ammonia oxidation and possibly of nitrite oxidation as well, but the aim of
this experiment was to investigate the impact of 3-CA input on process performance and
examine the mechanisms of established 3-CA degradation, for which the experimental timeline
was deemed sufficient.

3.2   Organisms and pathways involved in 3-CA degradation

The emergence of 3-CA degradation in treatment reactors led to a search for the degrading organisms and their degradation pathway. Enrichment and isolation of 3-CA-degrading organisms using cultivation methods were unsuccessful (data not shown). We therefore turned to the molecular data collected – taxonomic data from amplicon sequencing, functional gene enrichment data from assembled metagenomics, and gene transcription data from metatranscriptomics – to evaluate potential 3-CA degraders and relevant functional genes.

3.2.1   Organisms associated with 3-CA degradation

Three genera were significantly correlated with 3-CA degradation in all treatment reactors (after correction for multiple comparisons), namely *Gemmatimonas*, *OLB8* and *Taibaiella* (Figure 3). *Gemmatimonas* has been reported in a diverse range of activated sludge systems (Zhang et al., 2012; Ju et al. 2014). Santillan et al. (2019b) found this genus enriched under sustained 3-CA input conditions like those reported here. *OLB8* is not associated with aromatics degradation to our knowledge but belongs to the family *Saprospiraceae*, which is found in high-stress environments like low-temperature sludge (Johnston et al., 2019) and is associated with antibiotics resistance (Luan et al., 2020). Commonly found in activated sludge as a hydrolyser, it may break down complex organics (McIlroy and Nielsen, 2014; Szabó et al., 2017; Kondrotaite et al., 2022). The third genus, *Taibaiella*, has been found in phenol-degrading communities in microbial fuel cells (Shen et al., 2020), in petroleum-contaminated soil (Diallo et al., 2021), and in toxic landfill leachate (El-Fadel et al., 2018), indicating tolerance to xenobiotics, if not the ability to degrade them. Other ASVs that correlated (but not significantly) with 3-CA degradation included *Dokdonella*, *Burkholderia ottowia*, and two species of the order *Sphingobacteriales*. Sun et al. (2019) found *Sphingobacteriales* associated with aromatics degradation genes in phenol-degrading bioreactors. Other *Burkholderia* species degrade phenol (Ma et al., 2020b), and *Dokdonella* is associated with paracetamol (Palma et al., 2018) and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons degradation (Bacosa and Inoue, 2015).

Organisms associated with 3-CA degradation were also examined via differential enrichment of assembled MAGs in treatment reactors. In total, 60 medium quality (>80% completeness, <10% contamination) MAGs were recovered from all six reactors on D176 (Table S2). Of these, 11 were differentially enriched in treatment reactors ($D_z \geq 1.4$) including the genera *JAAEKA01*, *Variibacter*, and *OLB8* and the species *Exiguobacterium_A indicum*. Of the

differentially enriched MAGs, *OLB8* notably also correlated with 3-CA degradation in the
amplicon sequencing data. This was the only organism identified as differentially enriched that
correlated with 3-CA degradation in two independent datasets, making it a highly probable
contender for 3-CA degradation. There were no other MAGs that matched the ASVs found to
correlate with 3-CA degradation, likely because our MAG data represent only those taxa whose
genomes could be assembled to an 80% completion threshold. It was expected that the amplicon
sequencing and metagenomics data would not provide the same results, since they are two
independent DNA-based methods of looking at microbial communities. The lack of complete
overlap in results highlights the importance of applying multiple methods in molecular work.

Using molecular data to identify specific degraders as done in this study is not a common
technique. Researchers attempting to identify degraders of a specific compound or members of a
specific functional group are more likely to use stable isotope probing (Manefield et al., 2004;
Aoyagi et al., 2018), or successive culturing techniques (for example, Chen et al., 2021). These
methods may provide a more reliable means of identifying degrading organisms but involve the
use of labelled isotopes in the feed to bioreactors, or successive rounds of culturing. The present
study did not employ stable isotope probing because it was unclear at the onset of the experiment
that 3-CA degradation would occur. Additionally, it is also unclear if 3-CA was used as a carbon
and energy source, or as a nitrogen source. Cultivation methods were attempted but did not
successfully enrich 3-CA degraders. The use of 'omics data alone to identify degraders is less
common, but allows for a faster, retroactive identification of potential degraders. However, it
comes with its own drawbacks. It is possible that the taxa identified as potential 3-CA degraders
in this study were merely able to adapt to 3-CA toxicity more efficiently than others. This would
enable them to outcompete other organisms in terms of relative abundance. However, their
correlation with the rate of 3-CA degradation makes it more likely that they were associated with
the degradation of the compound.

3.2.2   Differential enrichment of putative 3-CA degrading genes

3-CA is usually degraded by oxidation to a chlorocatechol (upper pathway) by oxidative
deamination, followed by ring cleavage and subsequent degradation into tricarboxylic cycle
intermediates (lower pathway) (Reineke, 1998; Bathe, 2004; Fuchs et al., 2011). We aimed to
identify the upper pathway by searching for a mono- or dioxygenase, and the lower pathway via
a ring cleavage enzyme. We acknowledge that 3-CA degradation may have occurred through a

completely different and novel pathway. However, our investigation into degradation genes is

confined to the most likely pathways for aromatics degradation identified in literature and known

to occur in wastewater treatment systems (Hinteregger et al., 1992; Stockinger et al., 1992;

Kaschabek et al., 1998).

Using assembled metagenomics data from D176, multiple upper and lower pathway

genes were identified via the KEGG database (Aoki and Kanehisa, 2012), of which several were

differentially enriched (and some also significantly enriched) in the treatment reactors (Figure

4A, Table S1). The enzyme involved in the first 3-CA oxidation step would theoretically be

chloroaniline dioxygenase (Krol et al., 2012); unfortunately, its presence could not be validated

because there is no KEGG ortholog for the gene encoding it. Also, chloroaniline dioxygenase

may not have been present in the inoculum because it has a narrow substrate specificity (Krol et

al., 2012) and may therefore not be common in activated sludge metagenomes. Additionally, the

enzyme has previously been found encoded on a plasmid – this would prevent it from being

identified via MAG analysis and may therefore be why it was not seen in our dataset. Other

upper pathway genes were identified as putative contributors to 3-CA degradation, based on their

identification in the 170-gene dataset and their ability to oxidize aromatic compounds (Table 1).

These include benzoate/toluate 1,2-dioxygenase (KEGG ID K05550, *benB-xylY*; and K05549,

benA-xylX), benzene/toluene dioxygenase (K16268, *tcbAB*), 2,4-dichlorophenol 6-

monooxygenase (K10676, *tfdB*) and phenol/toluene 2-monooxygenase (K16249, *dmpK*). All of

them were differentially enriched in treatment reactors ($D_z \geq 1.4$) (Figure 4B), but only K05550

(*benB-xylY*) was significantly enriched (GLMM $P_{adj} < 0.1$) (Figure 4B, Table S1). They all

normally act on their respective eponymous substrates. Whether chlorophenol enzymes can be

induced by chloroaniline (via gene expression alone or enzyme production in the presence of the

compound) is unclear. However, toluene dioxygenase degrades chloroanilines, including 3-CA

(Nitisakulkan et al., 2014), and benzoate dioxygenase is associated with aniline degradation

(Zhang et al., 2021). Furthermore, toluene dioxygenase has broad substrate specificity and can be

induced by chloroanilines (Semak et al., 2012). It is also possible that the degradative enzymes

were mediated by post-translational modifications, which implies that the DNA- and RNA-level

data being used here may not pick them up. Thus, all these enzymes are potential candidates for

initiating 3-CA degradation. Of the 9 genes that were both differentially and significantly

enriched (Table S1), none other than benzoate/toluate 1,2-dioxygenase subunit beta (K05550,

benB-xylY) were identified as an upper pathway dioxygenase. None of these genes were found
within any of the MAGs assembled as part of this study.

For the potential lower degradation pathway, we focused on the relevant ring cleavage
enzyme, because subsequent pathway segment genes are relatively common. The two major ring
cleavage pathways for most chlorinated aromatics involve an ortho-cleavage or a meta-cleavage
enzyme (Reineke, 1998). One enzyme of each type was differentially enriched in the treatment
reactors ($D_z \geq 1.4$) – a catechol 2,3-dioxygenase (K07104, *catE*; associated with meta-cleavage,
potentially via 4-chlorocatechol) and a chlorocatechol 1,2-dioxygenase (K15253, *tfdC*;
associated with ortho-cleavage, via 3- or 4-chlorocatechol) (Figure 4B, Table 1, Table S1). One
of these enzymes (K07104, *catE*) was significantly and differentially enriched (GLMM $P_{adj} <$
0.1) (Figure 4B, Table S1). However, this enzyme is a catechol dioxygenase, not a
chlorocatechol dioxygenase, and catechol dioxygenases are not usually induced by their
chlorinated counterparts (Radianingtyas et al., 2003). Therefore, the metagenomics data did not
conclusively identify which lower pathway gene may have contributed to 3-CA degradation. Of
the 9 genes both differentially and significantly enriched (Figure 4, Table S1), most were
identified as potential lower pathway genes, likely involved with post-cleavage pathway steps.
The metagenomics data indicate that the most likely degradation pathway may have involved a
meta-cleavage pathway via a benzoate/toluate dioxygenase (K05549, *benA-xylX*; K05550, *benB-*
xylY) followed by a catechol dioxygenase (K07104, *catE*). We acknowledge that meta-cleavage
pathways are less common for chlorinated aromatics than ortho-cleavage pathways (Reineke,
1998), but they have indeed been found (Kunze et al., 2009). It is also possible that the more
relevant 3-CA degradation genes existed in the treatment reactors at levels below the detection
limit of the metagenomics method. Additionally, the differential enrichment of one or more of
the above pathway genes may be explained by gene hitchhiking (Oh et al., 2013), or by
association with other degradative or 3-CA-tolerant genes that have not been identified here.

3.2.3   Differential transcription of putative 3-CA degrading genes

Transcriptomics data from all six reactors on D171 were used to determine whether the
upper and lower pathway genes identified above were transcribed in real time during a reactor
cycle. 3-CA-degrading genes would likely be transcribed at higher levels in treatment reactors
during the aerobic phase (when 3-CA removal occurred).

Four upper pathway genes were identified as likely contenders in Section 3.2.2. Of these,

mean transcription levels of 2,4-dichlorophenol 6-monooxygenase (K10676; *tfdB*) were elevated

in treatment reactors during the aerobic phase (Figure 5D). Of the two lower pathway genes

identified earlier, chlorocatechol 1,2-dioxygenase (K15253; *tfdC*) also showed differential

transcription in the treatment reactors during the aerobic phase (Figure 5B). Even though these

genes were not significantly enriched (Table 1), their clear differential transcription makes them

contenders for 3-CA degradation. Transcription levels of other major enzymes identified via

metagenomics data as potential participants in 3-CA degradation (Table 1, Table S1) were not as

clearly higher in treatment reactors during the aerobic phase. While potential intermediates like

3-chlorocatechol or 4-chlorocatechol were not measured in this experiment, the differential

transcription of *tfdB* and *tfdC* in Figures 5D and 5B respectively indicates the formation of a

complete pathway – the upper pathway, encoded by 2,4-dichlorophenol 6-monooxygenase

(K10676, *tfdB*) showing differential transcription with the onset of aeration; and the lower

pathway encoded by chlorocatechol 1,2-dioxygenase (K15253, *tfdC*) differentially transcribed

toward the second half of the aerobic phase. Similarly, Sun et al. (2019) demonstrated

differential transcription of phenol degrading genes in nitrifying activated sludge batch cultures

via an ortho-cleavage pathway. Sato et al. (2019) also found differential enrichment and

transcription of several aromatic degradation genes in response to heavy oil inputs to duplicate

activated sludge reactors. However, all these studies used long-term sampling for gene

transcription. Given the short half-life of mRNA (Selinger et al., 2003), mRNA profiles in a

complex community like activated sludge can change rapidly. This study takes advantage of

short-term sampling to consistently show the changes in mRNA levels of gene products related

to a potential degradation pathway in the short term, within a short 12-hour period (one reactor

cycle). Short-term mRNA studies for degradation dynamics are not common (for example,

Leveau et al., 1999) and have not been done on an activated sludge microbial community, to our

knowledge. Neither has a dichlorophenol monooxygenase been previously associated with

chloroaniline degradation. This would be the first study to find an association between a

chlorophenol monooxygenase and a chloroaniline degradation pathway.

3.2.4   Full 3-CA degradation pathway

Combining the finding of differential transcription of both an upper and a lower pathway

gene in the aerobic phase, together with process data showing 3-CA degradation in replicate

reactors during the aerobic phase, two potential pathways for 3-CA degradation were identified.
From the transcriptomics data, 3-CA degradation was found to occur via a modified ortho-
cleavage pathway involving a dichlorophenol monooxygenase and a chlorocatechol dioxygenase.
However, the metagenomics data present other genes that were differentially and significantly
enriched in treatment reactors, suggesting a different, meta-cleavage pathway via a
benzoate/toluate dioxygenase and a catechol dioxygenase.

It is likely that one or both pathways contributed to 3-CA degradation. While the
metagenomics and transcriptomics data do not yield overlapping results, they add strength to the
study, highlighting the importance of investigating multiple independent methods and using
replicate reactors. However, it must be acknowledged that, although enriched in treatment
reactors, the genes constituting the pathways identified above may not have contributed to 3-CA
degradation, with an entirely different pathway or pathways responsible for actual degradation. It
is worth noting that the use of known degrading genes from existing databases may help identify
known pathways of degradation, but may not shed light on novel or less known pathways.

Since the impacts of 3-CA and its subsequent degradation were clearly seen for the
nitrification process, it is likely that 3-CA had a major impact on AOB and NOB communities.
The changes in nitrifier communities and nitrification genes merit further study.

4   Conclusions

In this study, we ran a controlled experiment to investigate the impact of sustained 3-
chloroaniline input on replicated wastewater-treating bioreactors from a process as well as
microbial community perspective.

•   Full removal of 3-CA was observed in all three treatment reactors (after a three-week
period of sustained input) with the recovery of ammonia oxidation, which was initially
inhibited by 3-CA input.

•   Using a combination of metagenomics and metatranscriptomics, two putative pathways
for 3-CA degradation were identified:

o   The first putative pathway involved a phenol monooxygenase and a subsequent
535   ortho-cleavage enzyme. These genes were both differentially transcribed during
536   the aerobic phase of a cycle and differentially enriched (albeit not significantly).

537   o The second putative pathway included a benzoate/toluate dioxygenase followed
538   by a meta-cleavage enzyme. These genes were both differentially and
539   significantly enriched in the treatment reactors.

• Amplicon sequencing and assembled metagenomics data showed multiple taxa that
correlated significantly with 3-CA degradation and were differentially enriched in
treatment reactors, respectively. The genus *OLB8* was the only taxon identified in both
datasets in this regard, making it a possible actor in 3-CA degradation.

Acknowledgements

This work was funded by the Singapore Ministry of Education and the National Research
Foundation under an RCE grant awarded to the Singapore Centre for Environmental Life
Sciences Engineering (SCELSE). The authors would like to thank Angel Anisa Cokro and Angel
Anika Cokro, Anita Ng and Sean Chew for their help with reactor operation and sample
processing; Larry Liew Chee Wai for his help with sample collection and storage; Daniela
Drautz-Moses and colleagues from the SCELSE sequencing core facility for obtaining short read
sequencing data used in this study; Krithika Arumugam for data processing and bioinformatics;
and Siao Yun Chang and colleagues at Public Utilities Board for providing access to sludge as
inoculum.

Author Contributions

SW and HS conceived the study and SW obtained the funding; HS designed the study
and performed the experiments; and HS and ES performed the molecular work to prepare
samples for sequencing. USCS developed the RNA extraction protocol and extracted RNA. ES
did the bioinformatic analysis on the 16S rRNA gene amplicon sequences; FC performed
metagenomics assembly bioinformatics; and RW analysed the transcriptomics data. HS and ES
interpreted individual data sets; HS wrote the manuscript; and the other authors contributed to
individual sections and edited the draft.

Data Availability

DNA sequencing data are available at NCBI BioProjects under accession numbers PRJNA720804 and PRJNA720805 (upload in progress). See Supplementary Information (SI) for details about the 3-CA degradation batch experiment, the calculation of 3-CA degradation rates in treatment reactors, a list of genes associated with xenobiotics degradation that were differentially enriched in treatment reactors, a list of medium-quality MAGs, and chemical profiles over single 12-h cycles for all reactors measured on ten different days of the study. All other relevant data and statistics related to metagenomics, MAGs, metatranscriptomics, ASVs, and process performance are publicly accessible on FigShare (https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.20130503).

Competing Interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

References

Allison, S. D. and J. B. H. Martiny (2008). Resistance, resilience and redundancy in microbial communities. PNAS 105: 11512-11519.

Aoki, K. F. and M. Kanehisa (2005). Using the KEGG database resource. Current Protocols in Bioinformatics, 11(1), 1-12.

Bacosa, H. P. and C. Inoue, (2015). Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) biodegradation potential and diversity of microbial consortia enriched from tsunami sediments in Miyagi, Japan. Journal of Hazardous Materials, 283, 689-697.

Bathe, S. (2004). Conjugal transfer of plasmid pNB2 to activated sludge bacteria leads to 3-chloroaniline degradation in enrichment cultures. Letters in Applied Microbiology 38(6): 527-531.

Boon, N. et al. (2000). Bioaugmentation of activated sludge by an indigenous 3-chloroaniline-degrading *Comamonas testosteroni* strain, *I2gfp*. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 66(7), 2906-2913.

Bowers, R. M. et al. (2017). Minimum information about a single amplified genome (MISAG) and a metagenome-assembled genome (MIMAG) of bacteria and archaea. Nature Biotechnology 35, 725-731.

Briones, A. and L. Raskin (2003). Diversity and dynamics of microbial communities in engineered environments and their implications for process stability. Current Opinion in Biotechnology 14(3), 270-276.

Buchfink, B. et al. (2015). Fast and sensitive protein alignment using DIAMOND. Nature Methods 12(1), 59-60.

Cauduro, G. P. et al. (2020). Differential Expression and PAH Degradation: What *Burkholderia vietnamiensis G4* Can Tell Us? International Journal of Microbiology, Article ID 8831331.

Chaumeil, P. et al. (2020). GTDB-Tk: a toolkit to classify genomes with the Genome Taxonomy Database, Bioinformatics 36(6), 1925–1927.

Diallo, M. M. et al. (2021). Enhanced biodegradation of crude oil in soil by a developed bacterial consortium and indigenous plant growth promoting bacteria. Journal of Applied Microbiology 130(4), 1192-1207.

El-Fadel, M. et al. (2018)."Impact of SRT on the performance of MBRs for the treatment of high strength landfill leachate. Waste Management, 73, 165-180.

Eren, A. M. et al. (2015). Anvi'o: an advanced analysis and visualization platform for 'omics data. PeerJ 3, e1319.

Falk, M. W. and S. Wuertz (2010). Effects of the toxin 3-chloroaniline at low concentrations on microbial community dynamics and membrane bioreactor performance. Water Research 44(17): 5109-5115.

Ficara, E. and A. Rozzi (2001). pH-stat titration to assess nitrification inhibition. Journal of Environmental Engineering-ASCE 127(8): 698-704.

Fuchs, G. et al. (2011). Microbial degradation of aromatic compounds—from one strategy to four. Nature Reviews Microbiology, 9(11), 803-816.

Henriques, I. D. et al. (2007). Activated sludge inhibition by chemical stressors - a comprehensive study. Water Environment Research, 79(9), 940-951.

Hesselmann, R. P. X. et al. (1999). Enrichment, phylogenetic analysis and detection of a bacterium that performs enhanced biological phosphate removal in activated sludge. Systematic and Applied Microbiology 22(3): 454-465.

Hinteregger C. et al. (1992). Characterization of iso-functional ring-cleaving enzymes in aniline and 3-chloroaniline degradattion by *Pseudomonas acidovorans* CA28. FEMS Microbiology Letters 97: 261–266.

Hwang, C. et al. (2006). Changes in bacterial community structure correlate with initial
operating conditions of a field-scale denitrifying fluidized bed reactor. Applied Microbiology
and Biotechnology 71(5): 748-760.

Hyatt, D. et al. (2010). Prodigal: prokaryotic gene recognition and translation initiation site
identification. BMC Bioinformatics 11(1), 119.

Johnston, J. et al. (2019). Composition and dynamics of the activated sludge microbiome during
seasonal nitrification failure. Scientific Reports, 9(1), 1-15.

Ju, F. et al (2014). Taxonomic relatedness shapes bacterial assembly in activated sludge of
globally distributed wastewater treatment plants. Environmental Microbiology 16(8), 2421-
2432.

Kanehisa, M. et al. (2016). KEGG as a reference resource for gene and protein annotation.
Nucleic Acids Research 44(D1), D457-D462.

Kang, D. D. et al. (2019). MetaBAT 2: an adaptive binning algorithm for robust and efficient
genome reconstruction from metagenome assemblies. PeerJ 7 e7359.

Kaschabek S. R. et al. (1998). Degradation of chloroaromatics: Purification and characterization
of a novel type of chlorocatechol 2,3-dioxygenase of *Pseudomonas putida GJ31*. Journal of
Bacteriology 180:296 –302.

Kelly, R. T. et al. (2004). Chemical Inactivation of Nitrification in Activated Sludge.
Biotechnology and bioengineering, 85(6), 683-694.

Kondrotaite, Z. et al. (2022). Diversity and ecophysiology of the genus OLB8 and other
abundant uncultured Saprospiraceae genera in global wastewater treatment systems.
Frontiers in Microbiology, 13, 917553.

Krol, J. E. et al. (2012). Role of IncP-1 beta Plasmids pWDL7::rfp and pNB8c in Chloroaniline
Catabolism as Determined by Genomic and Functional Analyses. Applied and
Environmental Microbiology 78(3): 828-838.

Kunze, M. et al. (2009). Degradation of chloroaromatics by Pseudomonas putida GJ31:
assembled route for chlorobenzene degradation encoded by clusters on plasmid pKW1 and
the chromosome. Microbiology 155(12), 4069-4083.

Langmead, B. and S. L. Salzberg (2012). Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. Nature
Methods 9(4), 357-359.

Law, Y. et al (2016). Integrative microbial community analysis reveals full-scale enhanced
biological phosphorus removal under tropical conditions. Scientific Reports, 6(1), 1-15.

Leveau, J. H. et al. (1999). Dynamics of multigene expression during catabolic adaptation of
Ralstonia eutropha JMP134 (pJP4) to the herbicide 2, 4☐dichlorophenoxyacetate. Molecular
Microbiology, 33(2), 396-406.

Li, D. et al. (2015). MEGAHIT: an ultra-fast single-node solution for large and complex
metagenomics assembly via succinct de Bruijn graph. Bioinformatics 31(10), 1674-1676.

Luan, X. et al. (2020). Microbial community functional structure in an aerobic biofilm reactor:
Impact of streptomycin and recovery. Chemosphere, 127032.

Ma, B. et al. (2020). Effects of transient 3-chloroaniline shock loading on the performance,
microbial community and enzymatic activity of sequencing batch reactor. Journal of
Environmental Management, 258, 110017.

Ma, Y. et al. (2020b). Time-course transcriptome analysis reveals the mechanisms of
Burkholderia sp. adaptation to high phenol concentrations. Applied Microbiology and
Biotechnology, 104, 5873-5887.

Manefield, M. et al. (2002). RNA stable isotope probing, a novel means of linking microbial
community function to phylogeny. Applied Environmental Microbiology, 68(11), 5367-
5373.

McCarty, G. W. (1999). Modes of action of nitrification inhibitors. Biology and Fertility of Soils
29(1): 1-9.

McDonald, J.H. 2014. Handbook of Biological Statistics (3rd ed.). Sparky House Publishing,
Baltimore, Maryland.

McIlroy, S. J. and Nielsen, P. H. (2014). The Family *Saprospiraceae*. In The prokaryotes: Other
major lineages of bacteria and the Archaea, pp. 863-889. Springer Science+ Business Media,
2014.

Nitisakulkan, T. et al. (2014). Degradation of chloroanilines by toluene dioxygenase from
Pseudomonas putida T57. Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering 117(3): 292-297.

Oh, S. et al. (2013). Microbial community adaptation to quarternary ammonium biocides as
revealed by metagenomics. Environmental Microbiology 15(10): 2850-2864.

Palma, T. L. et al. (2018). Putative role of Flavobacterium, Dokdonella and Methylophilus
strains in paracetamol biodegradation. Water, Air, & Soil Pollution, 229(6), 1-23.

Parks, D. H. et al. (2015). CheckM: assessing the quality of microbial genomes recovered from
isolates, single cells, and metagenomes. Genome Research 25(7). 1043-55.

Pimviriyakul, P. et al. (2019). Microbial degradation of halogenated aromatics: molecular
mechanisms and enzymatic reactions. Microbial Biotechnology, 13(1), 67-86.

Puente-Sánchez, F. et al. (2020). SQMtools: automated processing and visual analysis of 'omics
data with R and anvi'o. BMC Bioinformatics 21(1), 358.

Radianingtyas, H. et al. (2003). Characterization of a soil-derived consortium degrading 4-
Chloraniline. Microbiology, 149, 3279-3287.

Reineke, W. (1998). Development of hybrid strains for the mineralization of chloroaromatics by
patchwork assembly. Annual Review of Microbiology, 52(1): 287-331.

Santillan, E. et al. (2019). Frequency of disturbance alters diversity, function, and underlying
assembly mechanisms of complex bacterial communities. Npj Biofilms and Microbiomes,
5(1): 1-9.

Santillan, E. et al. (2019b). Trait☐based life☐history strategies explain succession scenario for
complex bacterial communities under varying disturbance. Environmental Microbiology
21.10 3751-3764.

Santillan, E. et al. (2020). Press disturbance alters community structure and assembly
mechanisms of bacterial taxa and functional genes in mesocosm-scale bioreactors.
mSystems, 5(4): e00471-00420.

Santillan, E. et al. (2021). Press xenobiotic 3-chloroaniline disturbance favors deterministic
assembly with a shift in function and structure of bacterial communities. ACS ES&T Water,
1(6), 1429-1437.

Sato, Y. et al. (2019). Transcriptome analysis of activated sludge microbiomes reveals an
unexpected role of minority nitrifiers in carbon metabolism. Communications Biology, 2, 1-
8.

Selinger, D. W. et al. (2003). Global RNA half-life analysis in *Escherichia coli* reveals positional
patterns of transcript degradation. Genome Research, 13, 216–223.

Semak, V. et al. (2012). Toluene dioxygenase mediated oxidation of halogen-substituted
benzoate esters. Organic and Biomolecular Chemistry 10(22): 4407-4416.

Shen, J. et al. (2020). Effect of lignite activated coke packing on power generation and phenol degradation in microbial fuel cell treating high strength phenolic wastewater. Chemical Engineering Journal 417, 128091.

Sieber, C. M. K. et al. (2018). Recovery of genomes from metagenomes via a dereplication, aggregation and scoring strategy. Nature Microbiology 3, 836–843.

Stockinger, J. et al. (1992). Mineralization of 3-chloro-4-methylaniline via an ortho-cleavage pathway by *Pseudomonas cepacia* strain *CMA1*. Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology 38(3), 421-428.

Sun, H. et al. (2019). Diverse aromatic-degrading bacteria present in a highly enriched autotrophic nitrifying sludge. Science of the Total Environment, 666, 245-251.

Szabó, E. et al. (2017). Microbial population dynamics and ecosystem functions of anoxic/aerobic granular sludge in sequencing batch reactors operated at different organic loading rates. Frontiers in Microbiology, 8: 770.

Tam, L. T. et al. (2006). Differential gene expression in response to phenol and catechol reveals different metabolic activities for the degradation of aromatic compounds in *Bacillus subtilis*. Environmental Microbiology, 8(8), 1408-1427.

Tamames, J. and F. Puente-Sánchez. (2019). SqueezeMeta, A Highly Portable, Fully Automatic Metagenomic Analysis Pipeline. Frontiers in Microbiology 9, 3349.

Thompson, K. (2006). Characterizing and Managing Salinity Loading in Reclaimed Water Systems. American Water Works Association (AWWA), USA.

Valipour, A. et al. (2014). Performance of high-rate constructed phytoremediation process with attached growth for domestic wastewater treatment: Effect of high TDS and Cu. Journal of Environmental Management 145, 1-8.

Vargas, M. et al. (2013). Effect of long-term starvation conditions on polyphosphate- and glycogen-accumulating organisms. Bioresource Technology 127: 126-131.

Vuono, D. C. et al.. (2015). Disturbance and temporal partitioning of the activated sludge metacommunity. The ISME journal, 9(2), 425-435.

Wang, Y. et al. (2017). mvabund – an R package for model-based analysis of multivariate abundance data. R package version, 3(1).

Wu, Y. et al. (2016). MaxBin 2.0: an automated binning algorithm to recover genomes from multiple metagenomic datasets. Bioinformatics, 32(4), 605–607.

Yan, S. and G. Wu (2017). Reorganization of gene network for degradation of polycyclic
aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) in Pseudomonas aeruginosa PAO1 under several conditions.
Journal of Applied Genetics, 58(4), 545-563.

Yu, K. et al. (2019). An integrated meta-omics approach reveals substrates involved in
synergistic interactions in a bisphenol A (BPA)-degrading microbial community.
Microbiome, 7(1), 1-13.

Zhang, T. et al. (2012). 454 Pyrosequencing reveals bacterial diversity of activated sludge from
14 sewage treatment plants. The ISME Journal 6(6), 1137-1147.

Zhang, W. et al. (2021). Microbial community and function evaluation in the start-up period of
bioaugmented SBR fed with aniline wastewater. Bioresource Technology, 319, 124148.

Zhu, L. et al. (2008). Formation and microbial community analysis of chloroanilines-degrading
aerobic granules in the sequencing airlift bioreactor. Journal of Applied Microbiology
104(1), 152-160.

 Figures and Figure Legends

757
Figure 1. COD and 3-CA concentration profiles from five distinct days of the experiment
showing single 12-h cycles for all six reactors. The points represent the mean concentrations of
triplicate control and treatment reactors. The x-axes represent time from the commencement of
feeding in min in each cycle. The dotted vertical line (at x = 210 min) separates the anoxic and
aerobic phases. Aeration began at 210 min. The y-axes represent (**A**) 3-CA, mg/L and (**B**) COD,
mg/L. Data series in shades of blue represent the mean of triplicate control reactors (no 3-CA)
and data series in shades of red represent the mean of triplicate treatment reactors (3-CA added),
with decreasing brightness over time. Note that the connecting lines between points are used to
distinguish profiles visually and do not represent simulated or measured concentrations.

Figure 2. Ammonium, nitrite and nitrate concentration profiles from five distinct days of the experiment showing single 12-h cycles for all six reactors. The points represent the mean concentrations of triplicate control and treatment reactors. The x-axes represent time from the commencement of feeding in min in each cycle. The dotted vertical line (at x = 210 min) separates the anoxic and aerobic phases. Aeration began at 210 min. The y-axes represent (**A**) ammonium-nitrogen, mg/L NH_4^+-N, (**B**) nitrite nitrogen, NO_2^--N mg/L and (**C**) nitrate nitrogen, mg/L NO_3^--N. Data series in shades of blue represent the mean of triplicate control reactors (no 3-CA) and data series in shades of red represent the mean of triplicate treatment reactors (3-CA added), with decreasing brightness over time. Note that the connecting lines between points are used to distinguish profiles visually and do not represent simulated or measured concentrations.

1000

Figure 3. Relative abundances of the top 180 ASVs identified via 16S rRNA amplicon
sequencing on D63, D112 and D163, plotted against the Spearman's Rank Order
Correlation Coefficient of their respective relative abundances to 3-CA reduction in
treatment reactors on D59, D110 and D171, respectively (n = 9). ASVs with significant
correlation to 3-CA degradation (filled in data points) after a 10% FDR adjustment for
multiple comparisons are identified by name, as are other ASVs with high correlation that
were considered relevant to 3-CA degradation.

1008

1009
Figure 4. Levels of differential enrichment and significant enrichment in treatment
reactors of (A) all 170 xenobiotics degradation genes identified in the metagenomics data
set from D176, and (B) zoomed-in figure of the subset of these 170 genes that was
differentially enriched ($D_z \geq 1.4$). The negative base-10 logarithm of the adjusted p-value
from the GLMM model (significance of enrichment) is plotted against levels of differential
enrichment, D_z, for each gene. The adopted cut-off values for each method used
(differential enrichment cut-off $D_z \geq 1.4$; significant enrichment $-\log_{10}(P_{adj}) \geq 0.1$). Genes
that are only differentially enriched in treatment reactors (23), only significantly enriched
in treatment reactors (GLMM) (2), and genes enriched under both criteria (9), are coloured
separately. Additionally, Figure 4B identifies genes that were both significantly and
differentially enriched, as well as the 7 qualitatively selected genes by KEGG ortholog.

1021

Figure 5. Average reads per kilobase million (RPKM) profiles of nine genes considered relevant to 3-CA degradation from which non-zero RPKM values were derived. RPKM profiles are shown over a single 12-h cycle on D171, averaged for the control (blue time series) and treatment (red time series) reactors for genes represented by KEGG orthologs K07104 (A), K15253 (B), K05550 (C), K10676 (D), K05549 (E), K16249 (F), K06912 (G), K05783 (H) and K18068 (I). The dotted vertical line (at x = 210 min) separates the anoxic and aerobic phases. Aeration began at 210 min. Lines display polynomial regression fitting, while shaded areas represent 95% confidence intervals.

 Tables

1029   **Table 1.** Major putative genes involved in 3-CA degradation as identified qualitatively from metagenomics and transcriptomics
1030   analyses. The full list of putative genes analysed is provided in Table S1.

KEGG Ortholog No.	Gene Name	Enzyme Name	D_z (Differential Enrichment)[1]	P_{adj} (Significant Enrichment)[2]	Differential Transcription[3]
Potential Upper Pathway Genes					
K05550	*benB-xylY*	Benzoate/toluate 1,2-dioxygenase subunit beta	1.95	0.061	N
K05549	*benA-xylX*	Benzoate/toluate 1,2-dioxygenase subunit alpha	1.82	1.000	N
K16268	*todC/bedC2/tcbAB*	Benzene/toluene/chlorobenzene dioxygenase subunit beta	1.86	0.638	N
K10676	*tfdB*	2,4-dichlorophenol 6-monooxygenase	1.48	0.990	Y
K16249	*dmpK/poxA*	phenol/toluene 2-monooxygenase	1.42	1.000	N
Potential Lower Pathway Genes					
K15253	*tfdC*	Chlorocatechol 1,2-dioxygenase	1.54	0.779	Y
K07104	*catE*	Catechol 2,3-dioxygenase	1.65	0.004	N

[1] "Differential enrichment" was assessed based on D_z analysis. Genes with $D_z \geq 1.4$ were considered differentially enriched. Metagenomics
data from D176 were used for this assessment.
[2] "Significant enrichment" was assessed via GLMMs, as described in Section 2.9.2, and a 10% FDR correction for multiple comparisons.
Genes with $P_{adj} < 0.1$ were considered significantly enriched. Metagenomics data from D176 were used for this assessment.
[3] Differential transcription was assessed using time series plots of the transcription levels of the gene as determined from transcriptomics
data during a cycle on D171. A gene was assumed to be differentially transcribed if RPKM levels of a given gene were consistently higher
in treatment reactors during the aerobic phase, as compared to levels in the anoxic phase and/or in control reactors.