Host ecology regulates interspecies recombination in bacteria of the genus *Campylobacter*

Evangelos Mourkas[1], Koji Yahara[2], Sion C. Bayliss[1], Jessica K. Calland[1], Håkan Johansson[3], Leonardos Mageiros[1], Zilia Y. Muñoz-Ramirez[4], Grant Futcher[1], Guillaume Méric[1#], Matthew D. Hitchings[5], Santiago Sandoval-Motta[4], Javier Torres[4], Keith A. Jolley[6], Martin C. J. Maiden[6], Patrik Ellström[7], Jonas Waldenström[3], Ben Pascoe[1,8], Samuel K. Sheppard[1,6]*

[1]The Milner Centre for Evolution, Department of Biology and Biochemistry, University of Bath, Bath BA2 7AY, UK; [2]Antimicrobial Resistance Research Center, National Institute of Infectious Diseases, Tokyo, 162-8640, Japan; [3]Centre for Ecology and Evolution in Microbial Model Systems, Linnaeus University, Kalmar, 391 82, Sweden; [4]Unidad de Investigacion en Enfermedades Infecciosas, UMAE Pediatria, Instituto Mexicano del Seguro Social; [5]Swansea University Medical School, Swansea University, Singleton Park, Swansea, SA2 8PP, UK; [6]Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3PS, UK; [7]Department of Medical Sciences, Zoonosis Science Centre, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden; [8]Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Chiang Mai University, Chiang Mai 50100, Thailand

*Corresponding authors: Samuel K. Sheppard; s.k.sheppard@bath.ac.uk

[#]Present address: Cambridge Baker Systems Genomics Initiative, Baker Heart and Diabetes Institute, 75 Commercial Rd, Melbourne 3004, Victoria, Australia; Department of Infectious Diseases, Central Clinical School, Monash University, Melbourne, Victoria 3004, Australia.

Keywords: *Campylobacter*, genus, species, niche, adaptation, host, evolution.

Running title: Comparative genomics of the *Campylobacter* genus

Abstract

Horizontal gene transfer (HGT) can allow traits that have evolved in one bacterial species to transfer to another. This has potential to rapidly promote new adaptive trajectories such as zoonotic transfer or antimicrobial resistance. However, for this to occur requires gaps to align in barriers to recombination within a given time frame. Chief among these barriers is the physical separation of species with distinct ecologies in separate niches. Within the genus *Campylobacter* there are species with divergent ecologies, from rarely isolated single host specialists to multi-host generalist species that are among the most common global causes of human bacterial gastroenteritis. Here, by characterising these contrasting ecologies, we can quantify HGT among sympatric and allopatric species in natural populations. Analysing recipient and donor population ancestry among genomes from 30 *Campylobacter* species we show that cohabitation in the same host can lead to a 6-fold increase in HGT between species. This accounts for up to 30% of all SNPs within a given species and identifies highly recombinogenic genes with functions including host adaptation and antimicrobial resistance. As described in some animal and plant species, ecological factors are a major evolutionary force for speciation in bacteria and changes to the host landscape can promote partial convergence of distinct species through HGT.

Introduction

It is well established that bacteria do not conform to a strict clonal model of reproduction but engage in regular horizontal gene transfer (HGT) [1]. This lateral exchange of DNA can confer new functionality on recipient genomes, potentially promoting novel adaptive trajectories such as colonization of a new host or the emergence of pathogenicity [2]. In some cases, gene flow can occur at such magnitude, even between different species [3, 4], that one may question why disparate lineages do not merge and why distinct bacterial species exist at all [5]. An answer to this lies in considering the successive processes that enable genes from one strain to establish in an entirely new genetic background.

The probability of HGT is governed by the interaction of multiple factors, including exposure to DNA, the susceptibility of the recipient genome to DNA uptake, and the impact of recombined DNA on the recipient strain. These factors can be broadly defined in three functional phases and HGT can only occur when gaps align in each successive ecological, mechanistic and adaptive barriers within a given time frame (Figure 1). In the first phase, the quantity of DNA available to recipient strains is determined by ecological factors such as the distribution, prevalence and interactions of donor and recipient bacteria, as well as the capacity for free DNA to be disseminated among species/strains. In the second phase, there are mechanistic barriers to HGT imposed by the homology dependence of recombination [6] or other factors promoting DNA specificity - such as restriction-modification, CRISPR interference or antiphage systems [7–11] - that can act as a defence against the uptake of foreign DNA (mechanistic barriers) [12, 13]. Finally, the effect that HGT has on the fitness of the recipient cell in a given selective environment (adaptive barrier) will determine if the recombinant genotype survives for subsequent generations [2, 14].

Understanding how ecology maintains, and potentially confines, distinct strains and species has become increasingly important in the light of global challenges such as the emergence and spread of zoonotic pathogens [15]. A typical approach to investigating this is to consider spillover of particular strains or clones from one host to another (clonal transmission). This is an important phenomenon and may be influenced by anthropogenic change, such as habitat encroachment or agricultural intensification [16]. However, in many cases, important phenotypes, including antimicrobial resistance (AMR) [17–19], can be conferred by relatively few genes. In such cases, it may be important to consider how cohabiting strains and species can potentially draw genes from a common pangenome pool [20–23] and how

genes, rather than clones, can transition between segregated populations (gene pool
transmission). To investigate the impact of ecological segregation (ecological barriers) on this
gene pool transmission, in natural populations, requires quantification of HGT among
sympatric and allopatric bacteria.

Species within the genus *Campylobacter* are an ideal subject for considering how ecology
influences the maintenance of genetically distinct species for several reasons. First,
Campylobacter are a common component of the commensal gut microbiota of reptiles [24,
25], birds [26, 27] and mammals [28] but, being microaerophilic, do not survive well outside
of the host. This creates island populations that have some degree of ecological isolation.
Second, because at least 12 species have been identified as human pathogens [29] and *C.*
jejuni and *C. coli* among the most common global causes of bacterial gastroenteritis [30],
large numbers of isolate genomes have been sequenced from potential reservoir hosts as part
of public health source tracking programs [31, 32]. Third, within the genus there are species
and strains that inhabit one or multiple hosts (ecological specialists and generalists [16, 26,
33–37]). As a single host can simultaneously carry multiple lineages [38], possibly occupying
different sub-niches within that host [39], there is potential to compare allopatric and
sympatric populations. Finally, high magnitude interspecies admixture (introgression)
between *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* isolated from agricultural animals suggests that host ecology
plays a role in the maintenance of species [40–43].

Here, we quantify HGT among 600 genomes from 30 *Campylobacter* species using a
'chromosome painting' approach [44–46] to characterize shared ancestry among donor and
recipient populations. Specifically, we investigate the role of ecological barriers to
interspecies gene flow. By identifying recombining species pairs within the same and
different hosts we can describe interactions where co-localization enhances gene flow,
quantify the impact of ecological barriers in these populations and distinguish highly
recombinogenic genes that are found in multiple genetic backgrounds. This provides
information about the evolutionary forces that gave rise to species and the extent to which
ecological barriers maintain them as discrete entities.

Results
Host restricted and host generalist *Campylobacter* species

Isolate genomes were taken from publicly available databases to represent diversity within
the genus *Campylobacter,* including environmental isolates from the closely related
Arcobacter and *Sulfurospirillum* species to provide phylogenetic context within the
Campylobacteraceae family (Figure 2a–figure supplement 1). In total, there were 631
isolates from 30 different *Campylobacter* species (Figure 2a) and 64 different sources,
isolated from 31 different countries between 1964 and 2016 (Supplementary File 1). Among
the isolates, 361 were *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* and could be classified according to 31 Clonal
Complexes (CCs) based upon sharing four or more alleles at seven housekeeping genes
defined by multi-locus sequence typing (MLST) (Supplementary File 1) [47] and were
representative of known diversity in both species [16, 33]. The obligate human commensal
and pathogen *C. concisus* (n=106 isolates), comprised 2 genomospecies (GSI, n=32 and
GSII, n=74), as previously described [48] (Supplementary File 1). The collection also
included 52 *C. fetus* isolate genomes, including 3 subspecies: *C. fetus subsp. fetus* (n=8), *C.*
fetus subsp. venerealis (n=23) and *C. fetus subsps. testudinum* (n=21) (Supplementary File 1)
[49]. Two clades were observed in *C. lari* (Figure 2a–figure supplement 2) which could
correspond to previously described subspecies based on 16S rRNA sequencing [50].

A maximum-likelihood phylogeny of the *Campylobacter* genus was reconstructed on a gene-
by-gene concatenated sequence alignment of 820 gene families shared by >95% of all
isolates, with a core genome of 903,753 base pairs (Figure 2a). The phylogeny included
species which appear to be restricted to one host or environment, including *C. iguanorium*
[51] and *C. geochelonis* [52] (reptiles), *C. lanienae* [53] (pigs), *C. hepaticus* [54] (chicken
liver), *C. lari* group [55] (marine birds and environment) and *C. pinnipediorum* [56] (seals)
species, most of which were discovered recently (Figure 2a–figure supplement 3). There was
no evidence that phylogeography was reflected in the observed population structure for
Campylobacter isolates from multiple hosts and countries. (Figure 2–figure supplement 4).
This is unsurprising as it is well known that host associated genetic variation transcends
phylogeographic structuring in *Campylobacter* [35]. While some low-level local gene flow
can be identified within a given country [57], this is vastly outweighed by recombination
within particular host niches [36], particularly in small isolate collections such as those for
some of the species in this study.

Host restricted species had lower diversity possibly linked to low sample numbers, with *C.*
hepaticus having the lowest diversity (Figure 2–figure supplement 2) with 8/10 genomes

associated with isolates from the same outbreak [54]. For other species there was evidence of

a broad host range (ecological generalists) (Figure 2b). For example, highly structured *C.*

jejuni and *C. coli* isolates were sampled from seven and six host sources respectively (Figure

2–figure supplements 2-3, Supplementary File 1). For *C. fetus* there was distinct separation

between mammal-associated *C. fetus* subsp *fetus* and *C. fetus* subsp *venerealis* and reptile-

associated *C. fetus* subsp *testudinum* (Figure 2–figure supplement 2) as previously described

[49]. Unsurprisingly, a large proportion of the isolates in this study were from humans, likely

reflecting intensive sampling. *C. jejuni* (27.52%; n=60/218), *C. coli* (14.68%; n=32/218) and

C. concisus (44.5%; n=97/218) were all common among human clinical samples. However,

less common species were also present, with nearly half of all *Campylobacter* species

(44.83%, n=13/29) isolated from humans at least once (Figure 2b, Supplementary File 1).

Agricultural animals were also a common source accounting for more than 1/3 of the isolates

(38.35%; 242/631), with 10/30 *Campylobacter* species isolated from more than one source

(Figure 2b, Supplementary File 1).

164　Evidence of interspecies recombination in the core and accessory genome

Genome size varied between 1.40 and 2.51 Mb (Figure 3–figure supplement 1) (mean 1.73)

and the number of genes (per isolate) ranged from 1,293 to 2,170 (mean 1,675) (Figure 3a–

figure supplement 2). The pangenome for the genus comprised 15,649 unique genes, found in

at least one of the 631 isolates (Figure 3b–source data 1), with 820 genes (5.24 % of the

pangenome) shared by >95% of all isolates (core genome), across 30 species (Figure 3b–

source data 1). We excluded species with fewer than 3 isolates in subsequent analysis. For the

remaining 15 species the core genome ranged in size from 1,116 genes in *C. lari* to 1,700 in

C. geochelonis (Figure 3a right panel–source data 1). Differences were also noted in the size

of accessory genomes, with *C. concisus* (mean: 981 genes)*, C. hyointestinalis* (mean: 946

genes)*, C. showae* (mean: 1,160 genes), *C. geochelonis* (mean: 1,021 genes) and *C. fetus*

(mean: 912 genes) containing the highest average number of accessory genes (Figure 3a left

panel–source data 1). Functional annotation of all 14,829 accessory genes showed that 71%

(10,561) encoded hypothetical proteins of unknown function due to the lack of homology

with well-characterized genes (Figure 3–figure supplement 3) [58]. Remaining genes were

related to metabolism, DNA modification, transporters, virulence, inner

membrane/periplasmic, adhesion, regulators, metal transport and antimicrobial resistance

(Figure 3–figure supplement 3).

To further understand genetic differentiation within and between species, we generated

genus-wide similarity matrices for the core and accessory genomes (Figure 3c-d–source data

1). For the core genome, pairwise average nucleotide identity (ANI) was calculated for

shared genes in all possible genome pairs (Figure 3c–source data 1) using FastANI [59]. On

average, isolates of the same species shared >95% similarity (Figure 3c–source data 1), with

decreasing genetic similarity (between 85% and 90%) over greater phylogenetic distances.

The number of core genome SNPs ranged from 983 to 230,264 for the 15 *Campylobacter*

species with ≥ 3 isolates in our dataset, with *C. coli* and *C. concisus* having the greatest mean

SNP numbers (Figure 3–figure supplement 4a) indicating considerable diversity within these

species. In contrast *C. hepaticus* and *C. geochelonis* had low mean SNP numbers with 986

and 4,310, respectively. This is likely related to low sample numbers with isolates either

sampled in close proximity [52] or from a single outbreak [54].

The core genome similarity matrix provided initial evidence of interspecies gene flow

(introgression). This can be observed as elevated nucleotide identity between *C. jejuni* and

clade 1 *C. coli* (Figure 3c–source data 1), consistent with previous studies [40, 42, 43].

Further evidence of introgression came from pairwise ANI comparison of genus-wide core

genes, in all isolates of the 15 major *Campylobacter* species, to the *C. jejuni* genome (Figure

3–figure supplement 4b). In the absence of gene flow, isolates from the two species should

have an approximately unimodal ANI distribution reflecting accumulation of mutations

throughout the genome. This was largely the case but for some species, low nucleotide

divergence suggested recent recombination with *C. jejuni*. There was also evidence of

interspecies accessory genome recombination. Presence/absence patterns in the accessory

genome matrix show considerable accessory gene sharing among several species that was

inconsistent with the phylogeny (Figure 3d–source data 1). This is well illustrated in *C.*

lanienae where much of the accessory genome was shared with other *Campylobacter* species

(Figure 3d–source data 1).

Enhanced interspecies recombination among cohabiting species.

For *Campylobacter* inhabiting different host species there is a physical barrier to HGT.

However, when there is niche overlap, interspecies recombination can occur, for example

between *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* inhabiting livestock [33, 40, 42]. To understand the extent to

which inhabiting different hosts impedes interspecies gene flow we quantified recombination

among *Campylobacter* species where isolates originated from same host (x_1, y) and different
hosts (x_2, y) (Figure 4a).

ChromoPainterV2 software was used to infer tracts of DNA donated from multiple donor
groups, belonging to the same CC but isolated from different hosts to recipient groups
(Materials and Methods). Among 27 combinations of multiple donor groups and recipient
groups, overall, there were more recombining SNPs within hosts than between hosts (Figure
4b) and for 10/27 species pairs there was evidence of enhanced within species recombination
$(x_1 \rightarrow y > x_2 \rightarrow y$; Figure 4c). To assess the robustness of the analysis we included the effect of
randomization and repeated the analysis by assigning random hosts for every strain (Figure
4–figure supplement 1). In the 10 pair species comparisons where $x_1 \rightarrow y > x_2 \rightarrow y$, we detected
174,594 within-host recombining SNPs (mapped to 473 genes; 28.8% of NCTC11168 genes)
and 109,564 between-host recombining SNPs (mapped to 395 genes; 24.05% of NCTC11168
genes). From the 473 within-host recombining genes, 45 genes contained the highest number
(>95th percentile) of recombining SNPs (Figure 4–figure supplements 2–3, Supplementary
File 2). These genes have diverse inferred functions including metabolism, cell wall
biogenesis, DNA modification, transcription, and translation (Supplementary File 2).

Interspecies recombination was observed for isolates sampled from chickens between
generalist lineages CC21 and CC45 (donors; *C. jejuni*) and generalist CC828 (recipient; *C.*
coli). These lineages appear to have high recombination to mutation (*r/m*) ratio as inferred by
ClonalFrameML (Supplementary File 3). DNA from generalist *C. jejuni* CC45 was
introduced into three *Campylobacter* species, including *C. hepaticus* (chicken), *C. concisus*
GSI and GSII (clinical) and *C. ureolyticus* (clinical) (Figure 4c–figure supplement 2–3,
Supplementary File 4). Clonal complex 45 had the highest *r/m* ratio from all other lineages or
species involved in the comparisons (Supplementary File 3). There was increased
recombination in genomes sampled from cattle between *C. jejuni* CC61 (donor; *C. jejuni*) and
C. fetus and *C. hyointestinalis* (recipients) with 71.75% of all within-host recombining SNPs
from all 10 comparisons detected in these two pairs (Figure 4c–figure supplement 2–3,
Supplementary File 4). Agricultural associated *C. jejuni* CC61 and *C. fetus* subsp. *venerealis*
involved in these comparisons were among the lineages and subspecies with the highest *r/m*
ratios (Supplementary File 3). The cattle-associated CC61 has previously been described as
highly recombinant, and has been associated with rapid clonal expansion and adaptation in
cattle [16].

The within-host mobilome

Bacteria inhabiting the same niche may benefit from functionality conferred by similar gene combinations. Recombination can promote the dissemination of adaptive genetic elements among different bacterial species. Therefore, we postulated that the genes that recombine most among species (>95th percentile) will include those that are potentially beneficial in multiple genetic backgrounds. To investigate this, we quantified mobility within the genome identifying recombining SNPs found in more than one species comparison (Figure 5a). These SNPs mapped to 337 genes (20.52% of the NCTC11168 genes; 2.15% of the pangenome) (Figure 5a, Supplementary File 5). We found that 32 of those genes (9.49%) have also been found on plasmids (Supplementary File 5). A total of 16 genes showed elevated within-host interspecies recombination in more than five species pairs (Figure 5c, Supplementary File 5). Genes included *cmeA* and *cmeB* which are part of the predominant efflux pump CmeABC system in *Campylobacter*. Sequence variation in the drug-binding pocket of the *cmeB* gene has been linked to increased efflux function leading to resistance to multiple drugs [60]. Many of the same antimicrobial classes are used in human and veterinary medicine and this may be linked to selection for AMR *Campylobacter,* that are commonly isolated from livestock [61]. To investigate this further, we compared the genomes of all 631 isolates in our dataset to 8,762 known antibiotic resistance genes from the Comprehensive Antibiotic Resistance Database (CARD) [62], ResFinder [63] and the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) databases. Homology (>75%) was found for 42 AMR determinants associated with multi-drug efflux pumps, aminoglycosides, tetracyclines and β-lactams (Figure 5b–figure supplement 1–source data 1). Species that contained >40% isolates from livestock, including *C. jejuni*, *C. coli*, *C. lanienae*, *C. hepaticus*, *C. hyointestinalis* and *C. fetus* contained far more AMR determinants (Figure 5d–figure supplement 1–source data 1). AMR genes are often collocated in the genome [64] and our analysis revealed several gene clusters (Figure 5–figure supplement 2) that have been described in previous studies [64, 65]. These findings are consistent with HGT-mediated circulation of AMR genes among different *Campylobacter* species and support hypotheses that ecology drives gene pool transmission [2, 64].

Campylobacter host transmission and virulence have been linked with biofilm formation and changes into surface polysaccharides [66, 67]. The *carB* gene showed elevated within-host interspecies recombination in eight species pair comparisons (Figure 5c, Supplementary File

5). This gene encodes a carbamoylphosphate synthase that has been associated with
biosynthesis of substrates for many polysaccharides and is known to contain transposon
insertion sites upstream of its genomic position [67]. Other genes with elevated within-host
interspecies transfer (>7 species pairs) included *typA* (Figure 5c, Supplementary File 5)*, a*
translator regulator for GTPase and *gltX* (Figure 5c)*, a glutamate-tRNA ligase*, promoting
survival under stress conditions [68, 69]. Other genes included *gidA* and *hydB* associated with
virulence [70] and hydrogenase enzyme activity (respiratory pathway in *C. concisus,* 69),
respectively. By considering genes that overcome barriers to interspecies recombination and
establish in multiple new genetic backgrounds, it may be possible to infer important
phenotypes that allow bacteria to adapt to different hosts and environments.

Discussion
Phylogenetic reconstruction of the genus *Campylobacter* revealed a highly structured
population. Distinct core genome clustering largely supported known classification for
species, subspecies (*C. fetus,* [49]), genomospecies (*C. concisus,* [48]) and clades (*C. coli*
[42]). Also consistent with previous studies, certain species are principally associated with a
specific host niche. For example, *C. fetus subsp testudinum*, *C. iguanorium, C. geochelonis*
were only sampled from reptile species, and *C. pinnipediorum* was only sampled from seals.
However, for several species there was clear evidence for host generalism, including *C.*
jejuni, C. coli and *C. lari,* all of which were sampled from multiple hosts [26, 72]. It is clear
that the hosts with the greatest diversity of *Campylobacter* species were agricultural animals
(and humans) (Figure 2–figure supplement 3). While this undoubtedly reflects oversampling
of these sources to some extent, the cohabitation of species in the same host niche potentially
provides opportunities for interspecies HGT.

Initial evidence of interspecies gene flow came from comparison of average nucleotide
identity (ANI) and the accessory genome gene presence/absence for all isolates. In each case,
patterns of genetic similarity largely mirrored the phylogeny. However, consistent with
previous studies [40], there was clear evidence of elevated homologous and non-homologous
recombination between some species. For example, core genome ANI was higher between *C.*
jejuni and *C. coli* clade 1, compared to other *C. coli* clades (Figure 3c–source data 1). The
evidence for non-homologous gene sharing was even more striking with accessory genome
sharing across considerable genetic distances (Figure 3d–source data 1), exemplified by *C.*
lanienae which shares accessory genes with most other *Campylobacter* species.

To quantify the extent to which ecological barriers influenced interspecies gene flow, it was

necessary to focus on donor-recipient species pairs where there was evidence of elevated

HGT in the same (sympatry) compared to different (allopatry) hosts. Perhaps unsurprisingly,

this was not the case for all species comparisons. Interacting factors could lead to genetic

isolation even when species inhabit the same host. First, rather than being a single niche, the

host represents a collection of subniches with varying degrees of differentiation. For example,

gut-associated bacteria in the same intestinal tract have been shown to occupy different

microniches [73] and more striking segregation may be expected between *C. hepaticus*

inhabits the liver in poultry [54] and gut-dwelling *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* in the same host.

Second, there is potential for the resident microbiota to influence the colonization potential of

different *Campylobacter* species and therefore the opportunity for genetic exchange, for

example through succession [74] and inhibition of transient species by residents, as seen in

some other bacteria [75–77] in humans.

Continued exposition of the microecology of subniches is important but for 10 species

comparisons there was clear evidence of enhanced within-host gene flow allowing

quantitative analysis of ecological barriers to gene flow. Specifically, there was on average a

3-fold increase in recombination among species pairs inhabiting the same host. In some

cases, this was greater, with 5-6 times more recombination among cohabiting species *C.*

jejuni and *C. hyointestinalis/C. fetus* in cattle. In absolute terms, this equates to

approximately 30% of all recorded SNPs in the recipient species being the result of

introgression. To place this in context, if greater than half (51%) of the recorded SNPs

resulted from interspecies recombination then the forces of species convergence would be

greater than those that maintain distinct species. If maintained over time, these relative rates

could lead to progressive genetic convergence unless countered by strong genome-wide

natural selection against introgressed DNA.

Quantitative SNP-based comparisons clearly ignore one very important factor. Specifically,

that recombined genes that do not reduce the fitness of the recipient genome (provide an

adaptive advantage) will remain in the population while others will be purged through natural

selection. Therefore, by identifying genomic hotspots of recombination and the putative

function of genes that recombine between species it is possible to understand more about

micro-niche segregation and the host adapted gene pool. Of the 35 genes with evidence of

enhanced within host HGT in ≥5 species pairs, several were linked to functions associated

with proliferation in, and exploitation of, the host. For example, the *carB* gene, encoding the

large subunit of carbamoylphosphatase associated with polysaccharide biosynthesis,

recombined in eight cohabiting species pairs and is potentially linked to enhanced virulence

and growth [67]. In addition, other highly mobile genes, including *typA* and *gltX* are

associated with survival and proliferation in stress conditions [68, 69], and *hydB* is linked to

NiFe hydrogenase and nickel uptake that is essential for the survival of *C. jejuni* in the gut of

birds and mammals [78].

Some genes showed evidence of elevated recombination in a specific host species. For

example, the *glmS* and *napA* genes in cohabiting *Campylobacter* species in cattle. In many

bacteria, analogs of *glmS* have multiple downstream integration specific sites (Tn7) [79]

which may explain the mobility of this gene. Explaining the mobility of *napA* is less straight

forward, but this gene is known to encode a nitrate reductase in *Campylobacter* [80] in

microaerobic conditions which may be ecologically significant as the accumulation of nitrate

in slurry, straw and drainage water can be potentially toxic to livestock mammals [81].

Factors such as host physiology, diet, and metabolism undoubtedly impose selection

pressures upon resident bacteria and the horizontal acquisition of genes provides a possible

vehicle for adaptation. However, the widespread use of antimicrobials by humans, pets and

livestock production [82, 83], provides another major ecological barrier to niche colonization.

We found that *gyrA* was among the most recombinogenic genes in *Campylobacter* in

chickens. This is important as a single mutation in this gene is known to confer resistance to

ciprofloxacin [84]. While the rising trend in fluoroquinolones resistance in *Campylobacter*

from humans and livestock [85] may result from spontaneous independent mutations, it is

likely that it is accelerated by HGT. However, there is currently no clear evidence for the

transfer of resistant versions of *gyrA*. Interspecies recombination of AMR genes has been

observed between *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* isolates from multiple sources including livestock,

human and sewage [64]. Consistent with this, we found AMR genes present in strains from

12 *Campylobacter* species in multiple hosts (Figure 5–figure supplement 2). In some cases,

strains from phylogenetically closely related species (*C. fetus* and *C. hyointestinalis*) isolated

from cattle, shared the same AMR gene cluster (*tet44* and *ant(6)-Ib*) described before in *C.*

fetus subsp. *fetus* [65], indicating the circulation of colocalized AMR genes among related

species and host niche gene pools. Strikingly, the efflux pump genes *cmeA* and *cmeB*,

associated with multidrug resistance (MDR) were highly mobile among *Campylobacter*
species with evidence of elevated within host interspecies recombination in >7 species pairs.
Furthermore, the *gltX* gene, which when phosphorylated by protein kinases promotes MDR
[69], was also among the most introgressed genes. While a deeper understanding of gene
interactions, epistasis and epigenetics would be needed to prove that the lateral acquisition of
AMR genes promotes niche adaptation, these data do suggest that HGT may facilitate
colonization of antimicrobial-rich host environments, potentially favouring the spread of
genes into multiple genetic backgrounds.
394
In conclusion, we show that species within the genus *Campylobacter* include those that are
host restricted as well as host generalists. When species cohabit in the same host, ecological
barriers to recombination can be perforated leading to considerable introgression between
species. While the magnitude of introgession varies, potentially reflecting microniche
structure with the host, there is clear evidence that ecology is important in maintaining
genetically distinct species. This parallels evolution in some interbreeding eukaryotes, such
as Darwin's Finches, where fluctuating environmental conditions can change the selection
pressures acting on species inhabiting distinct niches, potentially favouring hybrids [86, 87].
Consistent with this, the host landscape is changing for *Campylobacter,* with intensively
reared livestock now constituting 60-70% of bird and mammal biomass on earth respectively
[88]. This creates opportunities for species to be brought together in new adaptive landscapes
and for genes to be tested from multiple genetic backgrounds. By understanding the ecology
of niche segregation and the genetics of bacterial adaptation we can hope to improve
strategies and interventions to reduce the risk of zoonotic transmission and the spread of
problematic genes among species.
410

Materials & Methods
Isolate genomes
A total of 631 *Campylobacter*, 17 *Arcobacter*, seven *Sulfurospirillum* and five *Helicobacter*
genomes were assembled from previously published datasets (Supplementary File 1). Isolates
were sampled from clinical cases of campylobacteriosis and faeces of chickens, ruminants,
wild birds, wild mammals, pets and environmental sources. Genomes and related metadata
were uploaded and archived in the BIGS database [89]. Quality control was performed based
on the genome size, number of contigs, N50 and N95 contig length using the integrated tools
in BIGS database. All assembled contigs were further screened for contamination and

completeness using CheckM [90] (Supplementary File 1). All assembled genomes can be
downloaded from FigShare (doi: 10.6084/m9.figshare.15061017). Comparative genomics
analyses focused on the *Campylobacter* genomes representing 30 species including: *C. avium*
(n=1); *C. coli* (n=143); *C. concisus* (n=106); *C. corcagiensis* (n=1); *C. cuniculorum* (n=2); *C.*
curvus (n=2); *C. fetus* (n=52); *C. geochelonis* (n=3); *C. gracilis* (n=2); *C. helveticus* (n=1); *C.*
hepaticus (n=10); *C. hominis* (n=1); *C. hyointestinalis* (n=16); *C. iguanorium* (n=3); *C.*
insulaenigrae (n=1); *C. jejuni* (n=218); *C. lanienae* (n=26); *C. lari* (n=13); *C. mucosalis*
(n=1); *C. ornithocola* (n=1); *C. peloridis* (n=1); *C. pinnipediorum* (n=9); *C. rectus* (n=1); *C.*
showae (n=3); *C. sputorum* (n=1); *C. subantarcticus* (n=3); *C. upsaliensis* (n=3); *C.*
ureolyticus (n=4); *C. volucris* (n=2); *Campylobacter sp* (n=1) (Supplementary File 1).
Genomes belonging to *C. jejuni* and *C. coli* species were selected to represent a wide range of
hosts, sequence types, and clonal complexes and reflect the known population structure for
these two species. For other *Campylobacter* species, all genomes that were publicly available
at the time of this study were included in the analysis. (Supplementary File 1).
434

435 Pangenome characterization and phylogenetic analysis
Sequence data were analysed using PIRATE, a fast and scalable pangenomics tool which
allows for orthologue gene clustering in divergent bacterial species [91]. Genomes were
annotated in Prokka [92], using a genus database comprising well annotated *C. jejuni* strains
NCTC11168, 81116, 81-176 and M1, and plasmids pTet and pVir in addition to the already
existing databases used by Prokka [92]. Briefly, annotated genomes were used as input for
PIRATE. Non-redundant representative sequences were produced using CD-HIT and the
longest sequence was used as a reference for sequence similarity interrogation using
BLAST/DIAMOND. Gene orthologues were defined as "gene families" and were clustered
in different MCL thresholds, from 10 to 98 % sequence identity (10, 20, 30, 40, 50, 60, 70,
80, 90, 95, 98). Higher MCL thresholds were used to identify allelic variation within different
loci. An inflation value of 4 was used to increase the granularity of MCL clustering between
gene families. BLAST high-scoring pairs with a reciprocal minimum length of 90% of the
query/subject sequence were excluded from MCL clustering to reduce the number of spurious
associations between distantly related or conserved genes [93]. This information was used to
generate gene presence/absence and allelic variation matrices. A core gene-by-gene multiple
sequence alignment [89] was generated using MAFFT [94] comprising genes shared >95% of
isolates. Phylogenetic trees, based on core gene-by-gene alignments, were reconstructed

using the maximum-likelihood algorithm implemented in RAxML v8.2.11 [95] with
GTRGAMMA as substitution model.
455

Quantifying core and accessory genome variation

The degree of genetic differentiation between species was investigated gene-by-gene as in
previous studies [40, 96] by calculating the average nucleotide identity (ANI) of all 631
Campylobacter genomes using FastANI v.1.0 [59]. The analysis generated a lower triangular
matrix with the lowest ANI value at 75% (as computed by FastANI). A comparable gene
presence/absence matrix was produced using PIRATE and was further used to generate a
heatmap of accessory genome similarity based upon gene presence or absence. Subsequently,
all *Campylobacter* genomes were screened for the presence of antimicrobial resistance genes
against the CARD [62], ResFinder [63] and NCBI databases. All *Campylobacter* genomes
were further screened for the presence of phage, conjugative elements and plasmid DNA
using publicly available online databases to investigate the effect of other transfer
mechanisms. First, we used the PHAge Search Tool Enhanced Release (PHASTER) [97] to
identify and annotate prophage sequences within our genomes. A total of 86% (254/297) of
the genomes used in chromosome painting were found to have DNA sequence of phage
origin. Second, we used Iceberg 2.0 [98] for the detection of integrative and conjugative
elements, identifying 32 ICEs in 19% (56/297) of the genomes used in the chromosome
painting analysis. Finally, we used MOB-suite software for clustering, reconstruction and
typing of plasmids from draft assemblies [99, 100]. A positive hit was defined when a gene
had >75% nucleotide identity over >50% of the sequence length showing that 32 genes
identified in the recombination analysis have also been located on plasmids. A gene
presence/absence matrix for every antimicrobial resistance gene was generated for every
genome. Genomes carrying AMR genes were screened to characterize the location of
adjacent genes using SnapGene software (GSL Biotech; available at snapgene.com), as
previously described [64]. The number of core SNPs was identified using SNP-sites (v2.3.2)
[101].
481

Inference of recombination

Each combination of a recipient group and multiple donor groups (belonging to the same CC
but isolated from different hosts) was selected to compare the extent of interspecies
recombination into the recipient genomes. Each donor group consisted of 8 isolates to avoid
the influence of difference in sample size on estimation of the extent of interspecies

recombination. Each recipient group included at least 4 isolates. We excluded *C. jejuni* and

C. coli clade 1 genomes isolated from seals and water, as these most likely represent spillover

events and not true host segregated populations. Briefly, we conducted a pairwise genome

alignment between reference genome NCTC11168 and one of the strains included in the

donor-recipient analysis using progressiveMauve [102]. This enabled the construction of

positional homology alignments for all genomes regardless gene content and genome

rearrangements, which were then combined into a multiple whole-genome alignment, as

previously described [103]. ChromoPainterV2 software was used to calculate the amount of

DNA sequence that is donated from a donor to a recipient group [45]. Briefly, for each donor-

recipient pair, SNPs in which >90% recipient individuals had recombined with the donor

group were considered in the analysis. These SNPs were mapped to genomic regions and

specific genes were identified. A total of 258,444 (96.83%) recombining SNPs mapped to

558 genes of the NCTC11168 reference strain with >90% probability of copying from a

donor to a recipient strain. Genes containing the highest number of recombining SNPs were

considered for subsequent analyses (>95th percentile) (Supplementary File 2).

ClonalFrameML[104] was used to infer the relative number of substitutions introduced by

recombination (*r*) and mutation (*m*) as the ratio *r/m* as previously described [16].

Data availability

Genomes sequenced as part of other studies are archived on the Short Read Archive

associated with BioProject accessions: PRJNA176480, PRJNA177352, PRJNA342755,

PRJNA345429, PRJNA312235, PRJNA415188, PRJNA524300, PRJNA528879,

PRJNA529798, PRJNA575343, PRJNA524315 and PRJNA689604. Additional genomes

were also downloaded from NCBI [105] and pubMLST (http://pubmlst.org/campylobacter).

Contiguous assemblies of all genome sequences compared are available at the public data

repository Figshare (doi: 10.6084/m9.figshare.15061017) and individual project and

accession numbers can be found in Supplementary File 1.

References

1.   Smith JM, Dowson CG, Spratt BG. Localized sex in bacteria. *Nature* 1991; **349**: 29–

31.

2.   Sheppard SK, Guttman DS, Fitzgerald JR. Population genomics of bacterial host

adaptation. *Nat Rev Genet* 2018; **19**: 549–565.

3.   Shapiro BJ, Leducq J-B, Mallet J. What Is Speciation? *PLOS Genet* 2016; **12**:

e1005860.

4.   Doolittle WF, Zhaxybayeva O. On the origin of prokaryotic species. *Genome Res*
2009; **19**: 744–756.

5.   Doolittle WF, Papke RT. Genomics and the bacterial species problem. *Genome Biol*
2006; **7**: 116.

6.   Fraser C, Hanage WP, Spratt BG. Recombination and the nature of bacterial
speciation. *Science* 2007; **315**: 476–80.

7.   Budroni S, Siena E, Hotopp JCD, Seib KL, Serruto D, Nofroni C, et al. *Neisseria*
meningitidis is structured in clades associated with restriction modification systems
that modulate homologous recombination. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2011; **108**: 4494–4499.

8.   Oliveira PH, Touchon M, Rocha EPC. Regulation of genetic flux between bacteria by
restriction–modification systems. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2016; **113**: 5658–5663.

9.   Doron S, Melamed S, Ofir G, Leavitt A, Lopatina A, Keren M, et al. Systematic
discovery of antiphage defense systems in the microbial pangenome. *Science (80-)*
2018; **359**: eaar4120.

10.   Nandi T, Holden MTG, Didelot X, Mehershahi K, Boddey JA, Beacham I, et al.
Burkholderia pseudomallei sequencing identifies genomic clades with distinct
recombination, accessory, and epigenetic profiles. *Genome Res* 2015; **25**: 129–141.

11.   Marraffini LA, Sontheimer EJ. CRISPR Interference Limits Horizontal Gene Transfer
in Staphylococci by Targeting DNA. *Science (80-)* 2008; **322**: 1843–1845.

12.   Thomas CM, Nielsen KM. Mechanisms of, and Barriers to, Horizontal Gene Transfer
between Bacteria. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2005; **3**: 711–721.

13.   Eggleston AK, Mitchell AH, West SC. In Vitro Reconstitution of the Late Steps of
Genetic Recombination in *E. coli*. *Cell* 1997; **89**: 607–617.

14.   Zhu P, van der Ende A, Falush D, Brieske N, Morelli G, Linz B, et al. Fit genotypes
and escape variants of subgroup III *Neisseria meningitidis* during three pandemics of
epidemic meningitis. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2001; **98**: 5234–5239.

15.   Boni MF, Lemey P, Jiang X, Lam TT-Y, Perry BW, Castoe TA, et al. Evolutionary
origins of the SARS-CoV-2 sarbecovirus lineage responsible for the COVID-19
pandemic. *Nat Microbiol* 2020; **5**: 1408–1417.

16.   Mourkas E, Taylor AJ, Méric G, Bayliss SC, Pascoe B, Mageiros L, et al. Agricultural
intensification and the evolution of host specialism in the enteric pathogen
Campylobacter jejuni. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2020; **117**: 11018–11028.

17.   Johnson AP, Woodford N. Global spread of antibiotic resistance: the example of New

Delhi metallo-*β*-lactamase (NDM)-mediated carbapenem resistance. *J Med Microbiol*

2013; **62**: 499–513.

18. Schwarz S, Johnson AP. Transferable resistance to colistin: a new but old threat. *J*

Antimicrob Chemother 2016; **71**: 2066–70.

19. Baker KS, Dallman TJ, Field N, Childs T, Mitchell H, Day M, et al. Horizontal

antimicrobial resistance transfer drives epidemics of multiple *Shigella* species. *Nat*

Commun 2018; **9**: 1462.

20. Young JPW. Bacteria Are Smartphones and Mobile Genes Are Apps. *Trends*

Microbiol 2016; **24**: 931–932.

21. McInerney JO, Whelan FJ, Domingo-Sananes MR, McNally A, O'Connell MJ.

Pangenomes and Selection: The Public Goods Hypothesis. *The Pangenome*. 2020.

Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp 151–167.

22. Vos M, Eyre-Walker A. Are pangenomes adaptive or not? *Nat Microbiol* 2017; **2**:

1576.

23. Werren JH. Selfish genetic elements, genetic conflict, and evolutionary innovation.

Proc Natl Acad Sci 2011; **108**: 10863–10870.

24. Giacomelli M, Piccirillo A. Pet reptiles as potential reservoir of *Campylobacter*

species with zoonotic potential: TABLE 1: *Vet Rec* 2014; **174**: 479.2-479.

25. Fitzgerald C, Tu Z chao, Patrick M, Stiles T, Lawson AJ, Santovenia M, et al.

Campylobacter fetus subsp. *testudinum* subsp. nov., isolated from humans and reptiles.

Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2014; **64**: 2944–2948.

26. Griekspoor P, Colles FM, McCarthy ND, Hansbro PM, Ashhurst-Smith C, Olsen B, et

al. Marked host specificity and lack of phylogeographic population structure of

Campylobacter jejuni in wild birds. *Mol Ecol* 2013; **22**: 1463–1472.

27. Atterby C, Mourkas E, Méric G, Pascoe B, Wang H, Waldenström J, et al. The

Potential of Isolation Source to Predict Colonization in Avian Hosts: A Case Study in

Campylobacter jejuni Strains From Three Bird Species. *Front Microbiol* 2018; **9**.

28. Leatherbarrow AJH, Griffiths R, Hart CA, Kemp R, Williams NJ, Diggle PJ, et al.

Campylobacter lari: genotype and antibiotic resistance of isolates from cattle, wildlife

and water in an area of mixed dairy farmland in the United Kingdom. *Environ*

Microbiol 2007; **9**: 1772–1779.

29. Man SM. The clinical importance of emerging *Campylobacter* species. *Nat Rev*

Gastroenterol Hepatol 2011; **8**: 669–685.

30. Kaakoush NO, Castaño-Rodríguez N, Mitchell HM, Man SM. Global Epidemiology of

Campylobacter Infection. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 2015; **28**: 687–720.

31.   Sheppard SK, Dallas JF, MacRae M, McCarthy ND, Sproston EL, Gormley FJ, et al.
591   *Campylobacter* genotypes from food animals, environmental sources and clinical
592   disease in Scotland 2005/6. *Int J Food Microbiol* 2009; **134**: 96–103.

593   32.   Sheppard SK, Dallas JF, Strachan NJC, MacRae M, McCarthy ND, Wilson DJ, et al.
594   *Campylobacter* genotyping to determine the source of human infection. *Clin Infect Dis*
595   2009; **48**: 1072–8.

596   33.   Sheppard SK, Colles FM, McCarthy ND, Strachan NJC, Ogden ID, Forbes KJ, et al.
597   Niche segregation and genetic structure of *Campylobacter jejuni* populations from
598   wild and agricultural host species. *Mol Ecol* 2011; **20**: 3484–90.

599   34.   Dearlove BL, Cody AJ, Pascoe B, Méric G, Wilson DJ, Sheppard SK. Rapid host
600   switching in generalist *Campylobacter* strains erodes the signal for tracing human
601   infections. *ISME J* 2016; **10**: 721–729.

602   35.   Sheppard SK, Colles F, Richardson J, Cody AJ, Elson R, Lawson A, et al. Host
603   Association of *Campylobacter* Genotypes Transcends Geographic Variation. *Appl*
604   *Environ Microbiol* 2010; **76**: 5269–5277.

605   36.   Sheppard SK, Cheng L, Méric G, de Haan CPA, Llarena A-K, Marttinen P, et al.
606   Cryptic ecology among host generalist *Campylobacter jejuni* in domestic animals. *Mol*
607   *Ecol* 2014; **23**: 2442–2451.

608   37.   Woodcock DJ, Krusche P, Strachan NJC, Forbes KJ, Cohan FM, Méric G, et al.
609   Genomic plasticity and rapid host switching can promote the evolution of generalism:
610   a case study in the zoonotic pathogen *Campylobacter*. *Sci Rep* 2017; **7**: 9650.

611   38.   Colles FM, Dingle KE, Cody AJ, Maiden MCJ. Comparison of *Campylobacter*
612   Populations in Wild Geese with Those in Starlings and Free-Range Poultry on the
613   Same Farm. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2008; **74**: 3583–3590.

614   39.   Colles FM, McCarthy ND, Bliss CM, Layton R, Maiden MCJ. The long-term
615   dynamics of *Campylobacter* colonizing a free-range broiler breeder flock: an
616   observational study. *Environ Microbiol* 2015; **17**: 938–946.

617   40.   Sheppard SK, Didelot X, Jolley KA, Darling AE, Pascoe B, Meric G, et al. Progressive
618   genome-wide introgression in agricultural *Campylobacter coli*. *Mol Ecol* 2013; **22**:
619   1051–64.

620   41.   Taylor AJ, Méric G, Yahara K, Pascoe B, Mageiros L, Mourkas E, et al. Cross-species
621   evolutionary rewiring in the enteric bacterium *Campylobacter*; *bioRxiv* 2021;
622   2021.03.15.435406.

42. Sheppard SK, McCarthy ND, Falush D, Maiden MCJ. Convergence of *Campylobacter*

Species: Implications for Bacterial Evolution. *Science (80-)* 2008; **320**: 237–239.

43. Sheppard SK, McCarthy ND, Jolley KA, Maiden MCJ. Introgression in the genus

Campylobacter: generation and spread of mosaic alleles. *Microbiology* 2011; **157**:

1066–1074.

44. Thorell K, Yahara K, Berthenet E, Lawson DJ, Mikhail J, Kato I, et al. Rapid

evolution of distinct *Helicobacter pylori* subpopulations in the Americas. *PLOS Genet*

2017; **13**: e1006730.

45. Lawson DJ, Hellenthal G, Myers S, Falush D. Inference of Population Structure using

Dense Haplotype Data. *PLoS Genet* 2012; **8**: e1002453.

46. Yahara K, Furuta Y, Oshima K, Yoshida M, Azuma T, Hattori M, et al. Chromosome

Painting In Silico in a Bacterial Species Reveals Fine Population Structure. *Mol Biol*

Evol 2013; **30**: 1454–1464.

47. Dingle KE, Colles FM, Wareing DR, Ure R, Fox AJ, Bolton FE, et al. Multilocus

sequence typing system for *Campylobacter jejuni. J Clin Microbiol* 2001; **39**: 14–23.

48. Kirk KF, Méric G, Nielsen HL, Pascoe B, Sheppard SK, Thorlacius-Ussing O, et al.

Molecular epidemiology and comparative genomics of *Campylobacter concisus* strains

from saliva, faeces and gut mucosal biopsies in inflammatory bowel disease. *Sci Rep*

2018; **8**: 1902.

49. Iraola G, Forster SC, Kumar N, Lehours P, Bekal S, García-Peña FJ, et al. Distinct

Campylobacter fetus lineages adapted as livestock pathogens and human pathobionts

in the intestinal microbiota. *Nat Commun* 2017; **8**: 1367.

50. Debruyne L, On SLW, De Brandt E, Vandamme P. Novel *Campylobacter lari*-like

bacteria from humans and molluscs: description of *Campylobacter peloridis* sp. nov.,

Campylobacter lari subsp. *concheus* subsp. nov. and *Campylobacter lari* subsp. *lari*

subsp. nov. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2009; **59**: 1126–32.

51. Gilbert MJ, Kik M, Miller WG, Duim B, Wagenaar JA. *Campylobacter iguaniorum*

sp. nov., isolated from reptiles. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2015; **65**: 975–982.

52. Piccirillo A, Niero G, Calleros L, Pérez R, Naya H, Iraola G. *Campylobacter*

geochelonis sp. nov. isolated from the western Hermann's tortoise (*Testudo hermanni*

hermanni). *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2016; **66**: 3468–3476.

53. Logan JMJ, Burnens A, Linton D, Lawson AJ, Stanley J. *Campylobacter lanienae* sp.

nov., a new species isolated from workers in an abattoir. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol*

2000; **50**: 865–872.

54.   Van TTH, Elshagmani E, Gor MC, Scott PC, Moore RJ. *Campylobacter hepaticus* sp.

nov., isolated from chickens with spotty liver disease. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2016;

66: 4518–4524.

55.   Miller WG, Yee E, Chapman MH, Smith TPL, Bono JL, Huynh S, et al. Comparative

genomics of the *Campylobacter lari* group. *Genome Biol Evol* 2014; **6**: 3252–66.

56.   Gilbert MJ, Miller WG, Leger JS, Chapman MH, Timmerman AJ, Duim B, et al.

Campylobacter pinnipediorum sp. nov., isolated from pinnipeds, comprising

Campylobacter pinnipediorum subsp. *pinnipediorum* subsp. nov. and *Campylobacter*

pinnipediorum subsp. *caledonicus* subsp. nov. *Int J Syst Evol Microbiol* 2017; **67**:

1961–1968.

57.   Pascoe B, Méric G, Yahara K, Wimalarathna H, Murray S, Hitchings MD, et al. Local

genes for local bacteria: Evidence of allopatry in the genomes of transatlantic

Campylobacter populations. *Mol Ecol* 2017; **26**: 4497–4508.

58.   Pascoe B, Williams LK, Calland JK, Meric G, Hitchings MD, Dyer M, et al.

Domestication of *Campylobacter jejuni* NCTC 11168. *Microb genomics* 2019; **5**.

59.   Jain C, Rodriguez-R LM, Phillippy AM, Konstantinidis KT, Aluru S. High throughput

ANI analysis of 90K prokaryotic genomes reveals clear species boundaries. *Nat*

Commun 2018; **9**: 5114.

60.   Yao H, Shen Z, Wang Y, Deng F, Liu D, Naren G, et al. Emergence of a Potent

Multidrug Efflux Pump Variant That Enhances *Campylobacter* Resistance to Multiple

Antibiotics. *MBio* 2016; **7**: 1–11.

61.   Livermore DM. Introduction: the challenge of multiresistance. *Int J Antimicrob Agents*

2007; **29**: S1–S7.

62.   Jia B, Raphenya AR, Alcock B, Waglechner N, Guo P, Tsang KK, et al. CARD 2017:

expansion and model-centric curation of the comprehensive antibiotic resistance

database. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2017; **45**: D566–D573.

63.   Zankari E, Hasman H, Cosentino S, Vestergaard M, Rasmussen S, Lund O, et al.

Identification of acquired antimicrobial resistance genes. *J Antimicrob Chemother*

2012; **67**: 2640–2644.

64.   Mourkas E, Florez☐Cuadrado D, Pascoe B, Calland JK, Bayliss SC, Mageiros L, et al.

Gene pool transmission of multidrug resistance among *Campylobacter* from livestock,

sewage and human disease. *Environ Microbiol* 2019; **21**: 4597–4613.

65.   Abril C, Brodard I, Perreten V. Two Novel Antibiotic Resistance Genes, tet(44) and

ant(6)-Ib, Are Located within a Transferable Pathogenicity Island in *Campylobacter*

fetus subsp. *fetus*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2010; **54**: 3052–3055.

66.   Szymanski CM, Logan SM, Linton D, Wren BW. *Campylobacter* – a tale of two

protein glycosylation systems. *Trends Microbiol* 2003; **11**: 233–238.

67.   McLennan MK, Ringoir DD, Frirdich E, Svensson SL, Wells DH, Jarrell H, et al.

Campylobacter jejuni Biofilms Up-Regulated in the Absence of the Stringent

Response Utilize a Calcofluor White-Reactive Polysaccharide. *J Bacteriol* 2008; **190**:

1097–1107.

68.   Margus T, Remm M, Tenson T. Phylogenetic distribution of translational GTPases in

bacteria. *BMC Genomics* 2007; **8**: 1–18.

69.   Semanjski M, Germain E, Bratl K, Kiessling A, Gerdes K, Macek B. The kinases

HipA and HipA7 phosphorylate different substrate pools in *Escherichia coli* to

promote multidrug tolerance. *Sci Signal* 2018; **11**.

70.   Mikheil DM, Shippy DC, Eakley NM, Okwumabua OE, Fadl AA. Deletion of gene

encoding methyltransferase (*gidB*) confers high-level antimicrobial resistance in

Salmonella. *J Antibiot (Tokyo)* 2012; **65**: 185–192.

71.   Benoit SL, Maier RJ. Site-directed mutagenesis of *Campylobacter concisus* respiratory

genes provides insight into the pathogen's growth requirements. *Sci Rep* 2018; **8**:

14203.

72.   Cody AJ, McCarthy ND, Bray JE, Wimalarathna HML, Colles FM, Jansen van

Rensburg MJ, et al. Wild bird-associated *Campylobacter jejuni* isolates are a

consistent source of human disease, in Oxfordshire, United Kingdom. *Environ*

Microbiol Rep 2015; **7**: 782–788.

73.   Hayashi H, Takahashi R, Nishi T, Sakamoto M, Benno Y. Molecular analysis of

jejunal, ileal, caecal and recto-sigmoidal human colonic microbiota using 16S rRNA

gene libraries and terminal restriction fragment length polymorphism. *J Med Microbiol*

2005; **54**: 1093–1101.

74.   Lu J, Idris U, Harmon B, Hofacre C, Maurer JJ, Lee MD. Diversity and succession of

the intestinal bacterial community of the maturing broiler chicken. *Appl Environ*

Microbiol 2003; **69**: 6816–24.

75.   Stecher B, Chaffron S, Käppeli R, Hapfelmeier S, Freedrich S, Weber TC, et al. Like

will to like: abundances of closely related species can predict susceptibility to

intestinal colonization by pathogenic and commensal bacteria. *PLoS Pathog* 2010; **6**:

e1000711.

76.   van Elsas JD, Chiurazzi M, Mallon CA, Elhottova D, Kristufek V, Salles JF. Microbial

diversity determines the invasion of soil by a bacterial pathogen. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U*

S A 2012; **109**: 1159–64.

77.   Nowrouzian FL, Wold AE, Adlerberth I. *Escherichia coli* strains belonging to

phylogenetic group B2 have superior capacity to persist in the intestinal microflora of

infants. *J Infect Dis* 2005; **191**: 1078–83.

78.   Howlett RM, Hughes BM, Hitchcock A, Kelly DJ. Hydrogenase activity in the

foodborne pathogen *Campylobacter jejuni* depends upon a novel ABC-type nickel

transporter (NikZYXWV) and is SlyD-independent. *Microbiology* 2012; **158**: 1645–

1655.

79.   Choi K-H. Applications of Transposon-Based Gene Delivery System in Bacteria. *J*

Microbiol Biotechnol 2009; **19**: 217–28.

80.   Pittman MS, Elvers KT, Lee L, Jones MA, Poole RK, Park SF, et al. Growth of

Campylobacter jejuni on nitrate and nitrite: electron transport to NapA and NrfA via

NrfH and distinct roles for NrfA and the globin Cgb in protection against nitrosative

stress. *Mol Microbiol* 2007; **63**: 575–590.

81.   Alexander J, Benford D, Cockburn A, Cravedi J, Dogliotti E, Domenico A Di, et al.

Nitrite as undesirable substances in animal feed ☐ Scientific Opinion of the Panel on

Contaminants in the Food Chain. *EFSA J* 2009; **7**: 1–47.

82.   Teuber M. Veterinary use and antibiotic resistance. *Curr Opin Microbiol* 2001; **4**:

493–499.

83.   Price LB, Koch BJ, Hungate BA. Ominous projections for global antibiotic use in

food-animal production. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2015; **112**: 5554–5.

84.   Luo N, Sahin O, Lin J, Michel LO, Zhang Q. In Vivo Selection of *Campylobacter*

Isolates with High Levels of Fluoroquinolone Resistance Associated with *gyrA*

Mutations and the Function of the CmeABC Efflux Pump. *Antimicrob Agents*

Chemother 2003; **47**: 390–394.

85.   Sproston EL, Wimalarathna HML, Sheppard SK. Trends in fluoroquinolone resistance

in *Campylobacter*. *Microb Genomics* 2018; **4**: 1–8.

86.   Mallet J. Hybrid speciation. *Nature* 2007; **446**: 279–283.

87.   Grant PR, Grant BR. Hybridization of Bird Species. *Science (80-)* 1992; **256**: 193–

197.

88.   Bar-On YM, Phillips R, Milo R. The biomass distribution on Earth. *Proc Natl Acad*

Sci 2018; **115**: 6506–6511.

89.   Sheppard SK, Jolley KA, Maiden MCJ. A Gene-By-Gene Approach to Bacterial

Population Genomics: Whole Genome MLST of *Campylobacter*. *Genes (Basel)* 2012;

3: 261–277.

90. Parks DH, Imelfort M, Skennerton CT, Hugenholtz P, Tyson GW. CheckM: assessing

the quality of microbial genomes recovered from isolates, single cells, and

metagenomes. *Genome Res* 2015; **25**: 1043–1055.

91. Bayliss SC, Thorpe HA, Coyle NM, Sheppard SK, Feil EJ. PIRATE: A fast and

scalable pangenomics toolbox for clustering diverged orthologues in bacteria.

Gigascience 2019; **8**: 1–9.

92. Seemann T. Prokka: rapid prokaryotic genome annotation. *Bioinformatics* 2014; **30**:

2068–2069.

93. Sahl JW, Caporaso JG, Rasko DA, Keim P. The large-scale blast score ratio (LS-BSR)

pipeline: a method to rapidly compare genetic content between bacterial genomes.

PeerJ 2014; **2**: e332.

94. Katoh K. MAFFT: a novel method for rapid multiple sequence alignment based on fast

Fourier transform. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2002; **30**: 3059–3066.

95. Stamatakis A. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of

large phylogenies. *Bioinformatics* 2014; **30**: 1312–1313.

96. Didelot X, Achtman M, Parkhill J, Thomson NR, Falush D. A bimodal pattern of

relatedness between the *Salmonella* Paratyphi A and Typhi genomes: convergence or

divergence by homologous recombination? *Genome Res* 2007; **17**: 61–8.

97. Arndt D, Grant JR, Marcu A, Sajed T, Pon A, Liang Y, et al. PHASTER: a better,

faster version of the PHAST phage search tool. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2016; **44**: W16–

W21.

98. Liu M, Li X, Xie Y, Bi D, Sun J, Li J, et al. ICEberg 2.0: an updated database of

bacterial integrative and conjugative elements. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2019; **47**: D660–

D665.

99. Robertson J, Nash JHE. MOB-suite: software tools for clustering, reconstruction and

typing of plasmids from draft assemblies. *Microb genomics* 2018; **4**.

100. Robertson J, Bessonov K, Schonfeld J, Nash JHE. Universal whole-sequence-based

plasmid typing and its utility to prediction of host range and epidemiological

surveillance. *Microb Genomics* 2020; **6**: 1–12.

101. Page AJ, Taylor B, Delaney AJ, Soares J, Seemann T, Keane JA, et al. SNP-sites:

rapid efficient extraction of SNPs from multi-FASTA alignments. *Microb Genomics*

2016; **2**: e000056.

102. Darling AE, Mau B, Perna NT. progressiveMauve: Multiple Genome Alignment with
Gene Gain, Loss and Rearrangement. *PLoS One* 2010; **5**: e11147.
103. Yahara K, Nakayama S, Shimuta K, Lee K, Morita M, Kawahata T, et al. Genomic
surveillance of *Neisseria gonorrhoeae* to investigate the distribution and evolution of
antimicrobial-resistance determinants and lineages. *Microb Genomics* 2018; **4**: 1–3.
104. Didelot X, Wilson DJ. ClonalFrameML: Efficient Inference of Recombination in
Whole Bacterial Genomes. *PLOS Comput Biol* 2015; **11**: e1004041.
105. NCBI Resource Coordinators. Database resources of the National Center for
Biotechnology Information. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2016; **44**: D7–D19.
802

803   **Acknowledgements**

804   This work was supported by Wellcome Trust grants 088786/C/09/Z and Medical Research
805   Council (MRC) grants MR/M501608/1 and MR/L015080/1 awarded to S.K.S. The
806   computational calculations were performed at the Human Genome Center at the Institute of
807   Medical Science (University of Tokyo) and at the National Institute of Genetics.
808

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Figure legends

Figure 1. Barriers to horizontal gene transfer in bacteria. A series of barriers must be
surmounted for DNA to transmit from one species to another. These are broadly defined in
three categories. At a given time, alignment of holes in successive barriers is necessary for
HGT to occur. Here we focus on ecological barriers that are influenced by multiple factors
that reflect the physical isolation of bacteria in separate niches.

Figure 2. Population structure and host ecology in the genus *Campylobacter*. a,
Phylogenetic tree of 631 *Campylobacter* isolates from 30 species reconstructed using a gene-
by-gene concatenated alignment of 820 core genes (shared by >95% of isolates) and an
approximation of the maximum-likelihood algorithm (ML) implemented in RAxML. The
species name is indicated adjacent to the associated sequence cluster. The scale bar indicates
the estimated number of substitutions per site. **b**, Isolation source of *Campylobacter* species
with n≥3 isolates.

Figure 3. Core and accessory genome variation in the genus *Campylobacter*. a, Overall

distribution of the total number of accessory genes (left) and core genes (right) per isolate for

each *Campylobacter* species (where n≥3 isolates). The number of accessory genes is shown

as boxplots (min to max). **b**, Venn diagram of pangenomes among different *Campylobacter*

species (n≥9). The number of core genes shared by all species is illustrated in the center. **c**,

Pairwise average nucleotide identity comparison calculated for all 631 *Campylobacter*

isolates based upon 820 core genes shared by >95% of isolates. ANI values <75% are not

calculated by FastANI [59]. **d**, Pairwise accessory genome similarity based upon gene

presence or absence at 2,168 non-core loci. The heatmaps coloring ranges from yellow

(minimum) to red (maximum). The matrices are ordered according to the phylogenetic tree

presented in figure 2a. Different colours correspond to *Campylobacter* species with ≥3

isolates.

Figure 4. Elevated within-host interspecies recombination and donor-recipient

comparisons. a, A hypothesis depicting the relationships between *Campylobacter* species, *C.*

jejuni (x_1, x_2) and *C. coli* (y), when found in the same or in different hosts. **b**, Number of

recombining SNPs within and between host as inferred by chromosome painting analysis for

all donor recipient species comparisons. The error bar represents the standard error of the

mean (SEM). **c**, The figure shows the number of donated SNPs in 10 donor-recipient pair

species comparisons. The proportion (%) of recombining SNPs with >90% probability of

copying from a donor to a recipient genome is illustrated in the *y* axis. All donor groups are

shows in the *x* axis. All coloured boxes correspond to comparison where donors and

recipients are found in the same host.

Figure 5. The mobilome of the *Campylobacter* genus. a, The graph illustrates the

proportion of recombining genes in 10 different species comparisons. The number of species

pairs in which the gene was found to recombine is shown on the *x* axis and the number of

genes in each category is given on the *y* axis and. The exact number of genes found in each

group comparison is shown on the top of each box. **b**, Number of *Campylobacter* species

harbouring AMR genes that belong to efflux pumps and four different antibiotic classes

which are shown on the *x* axis. **c**, The circos plot indicates the 16 genes involved in

recombination in >5 donor-recipient pair species comparisons. Gene matches are indicated by

joining lines, coloured differently for each gene. Gene names are shown around the perimeter

for each *Campylobacter* species. **d**, The circos plot indicates the sharing of AMR genes

associated with efflux pumps and four antibiotic classes among *Campylobacter* species.
Presence of at least one gene (not necessarily the same gene) conferring resistance to a
specific antibiotic class is indicated by joining lines, coloured differently for each drug class.
Efflux pumps (i), β-lactams (ii), tetracyclines (iii), aminoglycosides (iv) and lincosamides (v)
are shown around the perimeter for each *Campylobacter* species.

Figure 2–figure supplement 1. Population structure of the *Campylobacteraceae* family.
Phylogenetic tree of 506 isolates that belong to the *Campylobacteraceae* family with
Helicobacter pylori used as an outgroup. Different colors correspond to main species with
number of isolates greater than three. The Tree was reconstructed using a gene-by-gene
concatenated alignment of 799 core genes shared by >95% by all isolates and an
approximation of the maximum-likelihood algorithm (ML) implemented in RAxML. The
scale bar indicates the estimated number of substitutions per site.

Figure 2–figure supplement 2. Core genome species trees. Single-species trees for nine
Campylobacter species with >4 isolates demonstrating the diversity for among species. The
scale bars indicate the estimated number of substitutions per site. (*) The scale for the tree
corresponding to *C. hepaticus* is 10 times smaller than the rest.

Figure 2–figure supplement 3. Overview of host-associations of *Campylobacter* species.
Abundance and diversity of 631 *Campylobacter* isolates in each host and environment.
Different colours correspond to main species with number of isolates ≥ three. The number of
isolates is shown on the *y* axis while the various isolation sources on the *x* axis.

Figure 2–figure supplement 4. Core genome species trees. Single-species trees for *C. jejuni*,
C. coli and *C. fetus* species which contain isolates from multiple hosts and countries. The
scale bars indicate the estimated number of substitutions per site.

Figure 3–figure supplement 1. Genome size variation of the *Campylobacter* genus. The
frequency distribution of the genome size of all *Campylobacter* genomes used in this study is
shown as a histogram. The number of genomes is shown on the *y* axis while the genome size
(in bp) on the *x* axis.

Figure 3–figure supplement 2. Gene variation in the genus *Campylobacter*. Overall
distribution of the total number of genes per isolate for each *Campylobacter* species (where
n≥3 isolates). The number of genes is shown as boxplots (min to max).

Figure 3–figure supplement 3. Accessory gene function in all main *Campylobacter*
species. The different gene functions are depicted on the *y* axis, while the number of shared
accessory genes on the *x* axis. Different colours corresponding to different *Campylobacter*
species.

Figure 3–figure supplement 4. Core genome allelic variation and the effect of
recombination. a, Number of SNPs per genome of the main *Campylobacter* species (where
n≥3 isolates) in the core genome alignment. The horizontal line in each plot represents the
mean value while the upper and lower lines the standard deviation. **b**, Average nucleotide
identity for pairwise comparisons of 820 core genes for 605 genomes of 15 main
Campylobacter species. Different colours corresponding to different *Campylobacter* species.

Figure 4-figure supplement 1. Probability of the recipient genomes sharing DNA with each
donor groups is illustrated as box whiskers (white) for every donor-recipient comparison for
all 10 pairs that supported our hypothesis. The analysis where the host data were randomized
across all isolates is illustrated as box whiskers (red). The probability of copying DNA from a
donor to a recipient genome is shown on the *y* axis. The midline in the box whiskers indicates
the mean and the error bars the standard deviation.

Figure 4-figure supplement 2. Genome position of genes containing recombining SNPs.
Genes and their corresponding number of recombining SNPs, inferred by Chromosome
Painting analysis for all 10 species comparisons, and mapped to the NCTC11168 reference
genome. Genes from within-host (red) and between-host (white) pair comparisons are shown
for each comparison. Donors are isolates from chicken (triangle), cattle (square), wild bird
(cross), pig (star), clinical (circle) and water (snowflake) samples. The dashed line indicates
the 95th percentile for every individual group comparison.

Figure 4-figure supplement 3. Genes ranked in ascending order of the number of
recombining SNPs they contain as inferred by Chromosome Painting analysis for all ten
species comparisons. Genes from within-host (red) and between-host (white) are shown for

each comparison. Donors are isolates from chicken (triangle), cattle (square), wild bird
(cross), pig (star), clinical (circle) and water (snowflake) samples.

Figure 5-figure supplement 1. Presence of antimicrobial resistance genes in the
Campylobacter genus. The phylogenetic tree was reconstructed using a gene-by-gene
concatenated alignment of 820 core and soft-core genes and an approximation of the
maximum-likelihood algorithm (ML) implemented in RAxML. The designated colour
scheme was used for each species in the first column. The second column indicates whether
the strain is isolated from an agricultural animal (grey). Remaining columns indicate presence
of AMR genes (black). The scale represents the number of substitutions per site.

Figure 5-figure supplement 2. Genetic organization of AMR genes in *Campylobacter*.
The presence of each AMR gene, highlighted in different colours, is shown for representative
genomes from *C. jejuni*, *C. coli*, *C. lanienae*, *C. hyointestinalis* and *C. fetus subspecies fetus*
sampled from different agricultural animals. The number of isolate genomes containing each
genomic arrangement is indicated in parenthesis.

Supplementary File 1. Isolate information about the genomes used in this study.

Supplementary File 2. Within-host highly (>95th percentile) recombining genes.

Supplementary File 3. Recombination parameters as calculated by ClonalFrameML.

Supplementary File 4. Quantifying recombination between co-habiting species using
ChromoPainter.

Supplementary File 5. Genes involved in interspecies recombination in 10 species
comparisons.

Figure 3–source data 1. This file contains the numerical values on which the graphs in
Figure 3 are based.

Figure 5–source data 1. This file contains the numerical values on which the graphs in
Figure 5b-d are based.

ECOLOGICAL BARRIER
Host biogeography, distribution, prevalence behaviour and interactions. Sub-niche segregation.

MECHANISTIC BARRIER
Factors promoting DNA specificity including homology dependence of recombination, restriction-modification systems.

ADAPTIVE BARRIER
Fitness of the recombinant genotype in a given niche.

HGT

a

C. hepaticus
C. jejuni   *C. coli*
C. cunniculorum
C. upsaliensis
C. helveticus
C. peloridis

C. subantarcticus
C. lari
C. ornithocola
C. insulaenigrae
C. volucris

C. avium

0.35

C. showae
C. curvus

C. concisus
C. mucosalis

C. pinnipediorum
C. iguanorium

C. fetus
subs testudinum
C. fetus subs fetus
C. fetus subs venerealis

C. hyiontestinalis
C. lanienae

C. sputorum

C. geochelonis
C. ureolyticus
C. corcagiensis
C. hominis
C. gracilis

C. coli clade 1 (n=103)	*C. pinnipediorum* (n=9)
C. coli clade 2 (n=19)	*C. lari* (n=13)
C. coli clade 3 (n=18)	*C. geochelonis* (n=3)
C. jejuni (n=218)	*C. ureolyticus* (n=4)
C. concisus (n=106)	*C. upsaliensis* (n=3)
C. fetus (n=52)	*C. showae* (n=3)
C. lanienae (n=26)	*C. subantarcticus* (n=3)
C. hepaticus (n=10)	*C. iguanorium* (n=3)
C. hyointestinalis (n=16)	

b

a

Species

Number of accessory genes

0 500 700 900 1100

Number of core genes (>95%)

0 400 800 1200 1600

b

C.hyointestinalis

C.fetus

C.jejuni

C.lanienae

Core genome
820 genes
(95%)

C.lari

C.concisus

C.pinnipediorum

C.hepaticus

C.coli

Pangenome
15,649 genes

c Core genome

d Accessory genome

ANI similarity (%)

100 95 85 75

Shared presence matrix similarity

2168 0

■ *C. coli* clade 1 (n=103)	■ *C. lanienae* (n=26)	■ *C. ureolyticus* (n=4)
■ *C. coli* clade 2 (n=19)	■ *C. hepaticus* (n=10)	■ *C. upsaliensis* (n=3)
■ *C. coli* clade 3 (n=18)	■ *C. hyointestinalis* (n=16)	■ *C. showae* (n=3)
■ *C. jejuni* (n=218)	■ *C. pinnipediorum* (n=9)	■ *C. subantarcticus* (n=3)
■ *C. concisus* (n=106)	■ *C. lari* (n=13)	■ *C. iguanorium* (n=3)
■ *C. fetus* (n=52)	■ *C. geochelonis* (n=3)	