Convergent genomic signatures of adaptation to an extreme environment in cyprinoid fishes

Chao Tong[1,*], Miao Li[2]

[1] Department of Biology, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA

[2] Center for Advanced Retinal and Ocular Therapeutics, University of Pennsylvania Perelman School of

Medicine, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, USA

* Corresponding author: Chao Tong, tongchao1990@gmail.com

Abstract

Cyprinoids are a worldwide distributed and diverse group of freshwater fish with more than 3,000 species.

Although primarily freshwater, some cyprinoid species had convergently evolved to thrive in extreme

environments and underlying genetic mechanisms remain unclear. Here, we leveraged 32 cyprinoid fish

genomes to identify common genomic changes associated with convergent adaptation to highly saline

and alkaline water in two East Asian cyprinoid fish species, *Gymnocypris przwalskii* and *Leuciscus*

waleckii, representing two independent extremophile fish lineages. We found that genome-wide rate of

nonsynonymous substitution and signal of intensified selection is higher in extremophile relative to non-

extremophile fish taxa. We further tested gene-wide molecular convergence and found hundreds of genes

tended to experience convergent shifts in selections in extremophile fish taxa, including convergent

acceleration and positive selection. These genes were associated with several key functions, such as

nervous system development, reproduction, ion transport and immune response, and included genes that

previously have been implicated for saline or alkaline tolerance in fish. Additionally, comparative

transcriptomic analyses defined the convergent roles of differentially expressed genes under selection in

extremophile fish taxa during convergent adaptation. Taken together, our work provides insights into the

genomic basis of convergent adaptation to extreme environments in fish.

Key words: Comparative genomics, Convergent evolution, Extreme environment, Fish

Introduction

Convergent evolution is especially common in organisms that have independently adapted to the same environments (Stern 2013; Storz 2016). That is the repeated evolution of similar phenotypic innovations in widely divergent evolutionary lineages. A major motivation in evolutionary biology is to determine the genetic changes that underlie phenotypic convergent evolution. In several known cases, selection repeatedly targets the same genes, such as Prestin in echolocation in bats and marine mammals (Li et al. 2010; Liu et al. 2010), Nav1.4 in toxin resistance in snakes (Feldman et al. 2012), and AgRP2 in stripe patterns in cichlid fishes (Kratochwil et al. 2018). A key feature of these phenotypic convergences is that identical amino acid (AA) substitutions within the same protein-coding gene occurred independently in unrelated taxa. In comparison to convergence in a single gene, numerous comparative genomics studies have identified massive convergent AA substitutions, that are widespread throughout the genome. Examples include, but are not limited to, echolocating mammals (Parker et al. 2013), marine mammals (Foote et al. 2015), flight-degenerate birds (Pan et al. 2019). It is increasingly clear that convergent evolution can also cause convergent shifts in evolutionary selective pressures, including nucleotide substitution rate (Yu et al. 2016; Sun et al. 2018; Wu et al. 2020) and protein evolutionary rate (Partha et al. 2017; Kowalczyk et al. 2020). In addition, recent genome-wide studies suggest molecular convergence can result from concerted gene expression alteration in diverse groups of organisms adaptation to the same environmental stresses (Hao et al. 2019; Greenway et al. 2020). However, the degree to which convergent phenotypic outcomes result from the same genetic changes remains an unanswered question. Thus, new studies employing genome-wide approaches may provide insight into the signatures of convergent evolution in an explosion of available sequenced organisms (Sackton and Clark 2019).

Extremophiles form a fascinating system to study the convergent phenotypic evolution (Brown et al. 2019; Greenway et al. 2020; Xu et al. 2020; Yang et al. 2021). For example, the recent burst of fish genome data has enabled the expansion of molecular convergent analyses in several extremophile fish lineages, such as livebearing fishes convergently adapted to hydrogen sulfide (Brown et al. 2019; Greenway et al. 2020), highland fishes convergently adapted to hypoxia (Yang et al. 2021), while the underlying genomic

mechanisms remain largely unexplored. Cyprinoids are a diverse family that included over 3,000 species

with worldwide distributions (Winfield and Nelson 2012). Although cyprinoids occur primarily in freshwater

habitats, some species can even thrive in extreme environment, such as *Gymnocypris przwalskii* and

Leuciscus waleckii in hypersaline and hyperalkaline water, representing a striking example of convergent

phenotypic evolution that has long interested biologists (Tong et al. 2017; Xu et al. 2017; Tong and Li

2020; Tong et al. 2021). Specifically, *G. przwalskii* (family: Cyprinidae) inhabits Lake Qinghai with high

salinity (up to 13‰) and high alkalinity (up to pH 9.4) on the northeastern Tibetan Plateau, *L. waleckii*

(family: Leuciscidae) survives in Lake Nali Nur with relatively high salinity (up to 6‰) and extreme

alkalinity (up to pH 9.6) on the eastern Inner Mongolian Plateau (fig. 1A). Notably, both extremophile fish

survive in freshwater of connective rivers during the spawning migration (Tong et al. 2017; Xu et al.

2017). For this, several recent genome-wide studies, including ours, have reported the evolutionary

changes associated with hypersaline or hyperalkaline adaptations in a single extremophile fish relative to

other phylogenetically distant teleost fish species (Tong et al. 2017; Xu et al. 2017; Tong and Li 2020;

Tong et al. 2021). However, how phylogenetic background contributes to convergent adaptation to

extremely saline or alkaline environments is largely unclear, in particular in a group of cyprinoid fishes.

Our study aimed to determine whether there are statistically supported common genomic signatures

associated with convergent adaptation to extreme environment in cyprinoid fish. We leveraged a newly

reassembled and 31 relevant available genomes of cyprinoid fish including 30 freshwater and two

extremophile fish species, *L. waleckii* and *G. przwalskii*, representing two independent origins of

extremophiles. We utilized comparative genomics to test whether convergent adaptation to extreme

environment in both extremophile lineages is associated with 1) convergent genome-wide patterns of

molecular evolution; 2) convergent shifts in selections for specific genes; and 3) convergence in gene

expression changes.

Results

Genomes, phylogeny, and independent origins of extremophile fishes

We initially obtained genome data of 44 fish species from 5 major families within suborder Cyprinoidei,

including Cyprinidae, Leuciscidae, Xenocyprididae, Danionidae, Gobionidae (supplementary table S1). In

addition, we reassembled and improved the genome of *L. waleckii* with recently sequenced *L. waleckii*

transcriptomes, chromosome-level genome of closely related species (*L. idus*), and annotated cyprinoid

protein datasets (supplementary table S1). We assessed the completeness of genome contents of these

fish species using BUSCO (https://busco.ezlab.org) and retained a total of 32 high-quality genomes

covering more than 90% Actinopterygii conserved genes (3,640 genes). We further used a combination of

homology and *de novo* approaches to annotate the gene models of reassembled *L. waleckii* genome and

other unannotated cyprinoid genomes, resulting in gene models ranged from 23,906 to 96,703 per

species (supplementary table S1) with an average of 90% of BUSCO Actinopterygii conserved genes.

We used OMA pipeline (Altenhoff et al. 2021) to obtain 17,410 orthologous groups (OGs) and 3,784 core

single-copy orthologs (one to one) that included all 32 cyprinoid species (supplementary table S2). We

reconstructed a genome-scale phylogeny based on the concatenated core single-copy ortholog data,

which was strongly supported for all nodes with 100% bootstrap value, which pinpointed two independent

origins of extremophile in cyprinoids (fig. 1B). We further estimated divergence time for each phylogenetic

node. The divergence time between two *Gymnocypris species* was estimated to be less than one million

years ago, which suggested a recent origin of extremophiles in cyprinoids (fig. 1B).

Convergence in genome-wide patterns of molecular evolution in extremophile fish taxa

First, we ask whether extremophile taxa had convergent genome-wide patterns of molecular evolution

(Non-synonymous/Synonymous rate ratio, dN/dS) compared to non-extremophile taxa. We further took

advantage of the HyPHY pipeline (Kosakovsky Pond, Poon, et al. 2020) to test the hypotheses by

comparing dN/dS between *a priori* defined extremophile branches (focal foreground branches) and non-

extremophile branches (background branches) across the phylogeny with concatenated single-copy

ortholog data. We found that extremophile taxa exhibited significantly higher dN/dS than non-

extremophile taxa (Likelihood ratio test, p < 0.00001) (fig. 1C). Elevation in dN/dS can be caused by

intensified positive selection or relaxed purifying selection. To determine which evolutionary driving force

acting during the convergent phenotypic transition to extremophile, we detected the signal of intensified

selection in extremophile taxa relative to non-extremophile taxa (Likelihood ratio test, p < 0.00001, K =

1.07) using RELAX (Wertheim et al. 2015). In detail, RELAX models the distribution of three categories of

dN/dS — positive selection (dN/dS > 1), neutral evolution (dN/dS = 1), purifying selection (dN/dS < 1) —

across a specified phylogeny, comparing focal foreground (i.e. extremophile) to background (i.e. non-

extremophile) branches and estimating K value that indicates overall relaxation (K < 1) or intensification

(K > 1). Our results further showed that the convergent phenotypic transition to extremophile is caused by

an overall intensification of selection across the whole genome, which is strengthening both purifying

selection and positive selection away from neutrality (fig. 1D, supplementary table S3).

Convergent acceleration in gene-wide rates of molecular evolution in extremophile fish taxa

Next, we ask if there was evidence for convergence in gene-wide rates of molecular evolution, as we

observed convergence in genome-wide acceleration in extremophile fish taxa. We utilized RERconverge

(Kowalczyk et al. 2019), an R package specifically developed to test for the signature of convergent

molecular evolution underlying convergent phenotypic evolution. RERconverge examines the rate of

protein sequence evolution (i.e. relative evolutionary rate, RER) for each gene on every branch across

the specified phylogeny, standardized to the distribution of rates across all genes. Genes for which these

standardized rates are consistently either higher or lower in focal foreground branches (i.e. extremophile

fish branches) compared to background branches (i.e. all remaining branches) are identified as having

experienced acceleration in rate of molecular evolution in extremophile fish branches. By analyzing all

17,410 shared orthologs, we identified 112 genes experiencing convergent acceleration in extremophile

fish branches (Wilcoxon rank sum test, p < 0.05), including calcium channel voltage-dependent gamma 7

subunit (CACNG7), immune-related lectin-like receptor 1 (ILLR1), potassium voltage-gated channel

subfamily S member 2 (KCNS2), sodium- and chloride-dependent taurine transporter (SLC6A6), solute

carrier family 2, facilitated glucose transporter member 1 (SLC2A1) (fig. 2A, supplementary table S4). We

also identified 27 enriched gene ontology (GO, Biological Processes) terms under convergent

acceleration in extremophile fish branches (Benjamini-Hochberg adjusted p < 0.05) (fig. 2B,

supplementary table S4). These significantly enriched GO terms mainly related to nervous system

development including synaptic transmission (GO:0007268), neurotransmitter secretion (GO:0007269),

memory (GO:0007613), ion transport including calcium ion import (GO:0070509), potassium ion

transmembrane transport (GO:0071805), hormone response including cellular response to hormone

stimulus (GO:0032870), and immune response including homophilic cell adhesion (GO:0007156) (fig. 2B,

supplementary table S5).

Convergent signatures of positive selection at the gene level in extremophile fish taxa

We further ask whether there is evidence for convergent positive selection acting on specific genes during

convergent phenotypic transition, as we found the signal of intensified positive selection in extremophile

fish taxa. We utilized three complementary approaches based on branch-site model to identify putative

genes under positive selection in extremophile fish taxa. Specifically, aBS-REL (adaptive Branch-Site

Random Effects Likelihood) (Smith et al. 2015) tests if positive selection (dN/dS > 1) has occurred on a

proportion of branches across the phylogeny, BUSTED (Branch-Site Unrestricted Statistical Test for

Episodic Diversification) (Murrell et al. 2015) detects positive selection acting on at least one site on at

least one branch, while both models cannot detect positive selection acting on specific sites, alignment-

wide. To further test for positive selection at specific individual amino acid site, we used Contrast-FEL

(Kosakovsky Pond, Wisotsky, et al. 2020) to determine whether a specific site in a gene under different

selective pressures (e.g. positive selection, dN/dS > 1) in *a priori* defined focal foreground branches (i.e.

extremophile fish branches) relative to background branches (i.e. all remaining branches). First, we

identified 448 putative positively selected genes (PSGs) in *L. waleckii* and *G. przwalskii* (Holm-Bonferroni

corrected p < 0.05) by aBS-REL. We then used BUSTED to retain 215 PSGs with at least one site on at

least one branch under positive selection (Benjamini-Hochberg adjusted p < 0.05). Finally, we used

Contrast-FEL to identify 214 core-shared PSGs with specific amino acid sites under positive selection

(False discovery rate corrected $p < 0.05$) (fig. 3A, supplementary table S6). These PSGs were

significantly enriched in 184 GO terms (Biological Processes) within four major functional categories

(Fisher's exact test, $p < 0.05$) (fig. 3B, supplementary table S7), including nervous system development

(GO:0051588, regulation of neurotransmitter transport; GO:0099536, synaptic signaling; GO:0007423,

regulation of synapse assembly, GO:0007417: central nervous system development, GO:0050807:

regulation of synapse organization), and ion transport function (GO:0006821, chloride transport;

GO:0071805, potassium ion transmembrane transport; GO:0071470: cellular response to osmotic stress,

GO:0070839: metal ion export), immune response (GO:0002922: positive regulation of humoral immune

response, GO:0060330: regulation of response to interferon-gamma, GO:0071353: cellular response to

interleukin-4), and reproduction (GO:0048599: oocyte development, GO:0009994: oocyte differentiation).

Specifically, most PSGs were lineage-specific and present in either *L. waleckii* or *G. przwalskii*, such as

potassium voltage-gated channel subfamily S member 3 (*KCNS3*), *sodium/calcium exchanger 3* (*NAC3*),

sodium/potassium/calcium exchanger 5 (*NCKX5*), and *solute carrier family 2, facilitated glucose*

transporter member 11 (*GTR11*) (fig. 3C, supplementary table S6). Besides lineage-specific PSGs, we

found few shared PSGs (N = 3) in both extremophile fish taxa, including *extracellular calcium-sensing*

receptor (*CaSR*), *zinc finger MYND domain-containing protein 11* (*ZMYND11*), and *importin subunit*

alpha-1 (*IMA1*) (fig. 3C, supplementary table S6). We further applied GO term enrichment analyses for

PSGs of each extremophile fish lineage. Similarly, we found both PSG datasets were significantly

enriched into four major functional categories (Fisher's exact test, $p < 0.05$), including nervous system

development, ion transport, reproduction, and immune response (fig. 3D, supplementary table S8),

although a small number of overlapping enriched GO terms (N = 12) were present in both extremophile

fish taxa, such as regulation of cellular response to stress (GO:0080135) and transmembrane transport

(GO:0055085) (fig. 3C, supplementary table S9).

Additionally, we sought to identify convergent positively selected AA site (PSS) that occurred in both

extremophile fish taxa. That is the exact same AA sites in both *L. waleckii* and *G. przwalskii* under

positive selection. For this, we inspected AA alignments for all PSGs. We found no convergent PSS in

both extremophile fish taxa. Instead, convergent positive selection on the AA site level appears to be

relatively "loose", that is, extremophile fish taxa harbor different PSS on the exact same gene. For

example, in a calcium ion transport gene, CaSR (fig. 4A), we identified a set of "convergent" positively

selected AA sites (fig. 4A). Specifically, we identified 10 unique PSS in *G. przewalskii* and another two

unique PSS in *L. waleckiil* (fig. 4B). We predicted the protein structure of extremophile fish CaSR based

on the structure of human calcium-sensing receptor (PDB accession: 7DTT) using homology-modelling

approach. Further, we mapped these 12 PSS onto the three-dimensional protein structure of CaSR that

located at venus flytrap domain (VFT), which may affect the activity in ion transport by dimerization.

Convergent roles of differentially expressed genes under selection in extremophile fish taxa

Finally, we sought to determine the convergence of changes in gene expression during convergent

adaptation to extreme environment in cyprinoid fishes. We compared gill, kidney, and liver tissues-specific

transcriptomes between individuals in extremely saline/alkaline and freshwater environments to identify

significantly differentially expressed genes (DEGs) (Benjamini and Hochberg, adjusted $p < 0.05$) for *L.*

waleckii and *G. przwalskii*, respectively. We found a substantial set of common DEGs shared by both

extremophile fish taxa in each tissue (fig. 5A, supplementary table S10). Specifically, we observed 21

common DEGs in gill tissue, such as *ectoderm-neural cortex protein 1* (*ENC1*) and *caspase recruitment*

domain-containing protein 14 (*CARD14*) involved in immune response, showing consistently up-regulated

or down-regulated in extreme environment; a total of 33 DEGs showed similar expression pattern

between two species in kidney, such as *aquaporin 1* (*AQP1*) and *solute carrier family 41 member 1*

(*SLC41A1*) involved water and ion transport process; we also found 17 common DEGs in liver tissue,

such as *apolipoprotein C-II precursor* (*APOC2*) associated with lipid metabolism and *fibrinogen gamma*

chain precursor (FGG) associated with immune response (fig. 5B, supplementary table S10). To further

identify genes that were differentially expressed and experienced convergent shift in selections, we

examined the overlapping results from differentially expressed gene sets and rapidly evolving / positively

selected gene sets. We found a few rapidly evolving genes (N = 5) were significantly differentially

expressed in *G. przwalskii*, such as *sodium- and chloride-dependent taurine transporter* (*SLC6A6*)

associate with ion transport function, *OTU domain-containing protein 5* (*OTUD5*) associated with innate

immune response (fig. 5C, supplementary table S11). Similarly, we found a small number of genes (N =

11) with evidence for both selection and differential expression in *L. waleckii*, such as *heat shock protein*

HSP 90-alpha 1 (*HSP90AA1*) associated with reproduction, *transcription factor CP2-like protein 1*

(*TFCP2L1*) that involved in acid-base and salt-water homeostasis. In addition, we observed a few rapidly

evolving genes were differentially expressed in both kidney and liver tissues, such as an ion transport

gene, *polycystic kidney disease protein 1-like 2* (*PKD1L2*), and another gene, *DNA helicase MCM8*

(*MCM8*) associated with reproduction (fig. 5C, supplementary table S11).

Besides rapidly evolving DEGs, we aslo identified a set of DEGs under positive selection (fig. 5C,

supplementary table S12). We found 5 positively selected DEGs in *G. przwalskii*, such as *reticulon-4*

receptor-like 2 precursor (*RTN4R2*) and *protein crumbs homolog 2* (*CRB2*) that involved in nervous

system development. Moreover, we found 15 positively selected DEGs in *L. waleckii*, such as *neurogenic*

locus notch homolog protein 1 (NOTCH1) and, *EF-hand domain-containing protein D1* (*EFHD1*) which

associated with nervous system development, an ion transport gene, *protocadherin-18* (*PCDH18*), and

inactive serine protease PAMR1 (*PAMR1*) that involved in immune response (fig. 5C, supplementary

table S12).

Discussion

Our results support the three hypotheses and identify common genomic signatures associated with

convergent adaptation to extreme environment in cyprinoid fish. Specifically, we found: 1) convergently

accelerated genome-wide rate of nonsynonymous substitution and signal of intensified positive selection

in extremophile fish lineages; 2) hundreds of genes tended to experience convergent acceleration in rates

of nonsynonymous substitution and convergent positive selection in extremophile fish lineages; 3) a

substantial set of common differentially expressed genes under convergent selection in gill, kidney and

liver tissues of extremophile fish. These genes were associated with several key functions, such as

nervous system development, reproduction, ion transport and immune response. Altogether, these

findings suggest that extremophile fishes may convergently evolve to adapt to extreme environments in a

concerted way through both sequence changes and expression shifts.

Nervous system development

Extreme environments have impacted the physiology of fish in a wide variety of ways (Evans and

Claiborne 2005). Although recent advances in fish genomics have revealed multiple genetic adaptations

in extremophile fishes (Wang and Guo 2019), very few studies have indicated the association between

extreme-environment adaptation and the evolution of genes that involved in nervous system

development. A recent comparative transcriptomic study had identified a set of microtubule regulation

related genes under positive selection that regulate axon formation, and suggested deep-sea fish may

have more developed nervous systems to adapt to high hydrostatic pressure environments (Lan et al.

2018). Intriguingly, our genome-wide analysis identified a set of nervous system development associated

genes that experienced convergent acceleration or convergent positive selection in two extremophile fish

lineages. For example, the gene c*alcium channel voltage-dependent gamma 7 subunit* (*CACNG7*), which

experienced acceleration in *G. przwalskii* and *L. waleckii*, regulates synaptic transmission, and mutation

in CACNG7 has been associated with multiple neurological disease (Burgess and Noebels 1999). The

gene *reticulon-4 receptor-like 2* (*RTN4RL2*), that showed differentially expressed in response to

extremely saline and alkaline in *G. przwalskii* and also experienced positive selection, functions in axon

migration and neuron projection development (Wills et al. 2012). Although we found a small number of

restrictedly overlapping differentially expressed genes under convergent selections in both extremophile

fish lineages, different genes involved in similar conserved nervous system development pathways were

confirmed, indicating that these genes may share similar evolutionary paths in convergent phenotypic

transition to extremophile. Collectively, this finding provides putative genomic evidence for enhanced

nervous systems contributing to extremophile fish in convergent adaptation to extreme environments,

such as extremely saline and alkaline water.

Reproduction and spawning migration

Extreme environments have disruptive effects on endocrine system of fish, can interfer their reproductive functions (Wang and Guo 2019). Notably, extremophile fish *G. przwalskii* and *L. waleckii* are both anadromous and migrate to spawn in rivers (freshwater) (Tong et al. 2017; Xu et al. 2017; Tong et al. 2021). Reproduction in most anadromous fishes is a seasonal phenomenon to ensure the survival of their offsprings, which fish experienced the transition from saline or alkaline water to freshwater (Tian et al. 2019). This spawning migration behavior may require their reproduction system rapidly adapted to the environmental transition. Indeed, our study identified a set of common differentially expressed genes under convergent acceleration in both extremophile fish, as well anadromous fish. For example, the gene *heat shock protein HSP 90-alpha 1* (*HSP90AA1*), regulates spermatogenesis and has the association with spawning migration in another anadromous fish, *Coilia nasus* (Fang et al. 2016). Another differentially expressed gene *DNA helicase MCM8* (*MCM8*), also experienced convergent acceleration, is essential for gametogenesis, and mutation in MCM8 has been associated with ovarian failure (AlAsiri et al. 2015). In addition, we also found key GO terms related to reproduction were under convergent positive selection in extremophile fish. It is possible that rapid evolution of reproduction related genes may facilitate convergent adaptation to extreme environments in anadromous fish.

Ion transport, osmoregulation, and acid-base balance

Extreme environments, such as highly salinity and alkalinity are challenging the osmoregulation system of fish. During the transition from freshwater to highly saline or alkaline water, fish must increase its rate to balance osmotic loss of water to more solute-concentrated environment and actively excrete Na^+ and Cl^- from gill to maintain ionic and osmoregulation (Marshall 2005). Thus, extremophile fish require enhanced physiological abilities including ion transport, osmoregulation, and acid-base balance to respond the increase in salinity and alkalinity of freshwater (Evans et al. 2005; Marshall 2005). Past studies, including ours, have identified key genes associated with osmoregulation and ion transport in *G. przwalskii* and *L.*

waleckii under rapid evolving (aka., acceleration) and positive selection (Tong et al. 2017; Xu et al. 2017;

Tong and Li 2020; Tong et al. 2021). Consistently, we identified a substantial set of ion transport,

osmoregulation, and acid-base balancerelated genes are under convergent selection in both

extremophile fish lineages. For example, the genes in solute carriers family (SLC), that encoded

transmembrane transporters for inorganic ions, amino acids, neurotransmitters, sugars, purines and fatty

acids, and other solute substrates (Dorwart et al. 2008), such as *solute carrier family 41 member 1*

(*SLC41A1*), *sodium- and chloride-dependent taurine transporter* (*SLC6A6*). In addition, we identified

numbers of common differentially expressed genes in tissues of both fish lineages. For example, the

gene *aquaporin 1* (*AQP1*), which has been studied extensively in fish gills adaptation to highly saline

water (Riesch et al. 2015). Besides the molecular convergence at gene-wide level, we also attempted to

identify convergence at amino acid site level and suggest a "loose" pattern of site-specific convergence.

One of representative cases, the gene *extracellular calcium-sensing recepto*r (*CaSR*), regulates the

calcium ion homeostasis (Loretz 2008). We observed different positively selected sites located on the

same candidate gene, which may cooperatively lead the phenotypic convergence in fish. In the

combination of our present results and previous findings, the gene-wide and loose site-wide convergent

of genes involved in ion transport, osmoregulation, and acid-base balance are essential to fish

convergent adaptation to extreme environment.

Immune response

Extremely saline and alkaline stress may cause extensive damage to fish immune system (Bowden 2008;

Sridhar et al. 2020). In *G. przwalskii*, our previous genome-wide studies had identified a set of immune-

related genes that experienced rapidly evolving or positive selection (Tong et al. 2017; Tong and Li 2019;

Tong et al. 2021), while there is no signal of selections on immune-related genes in *L. waleckii* (Xu et al.

2017). Although previous studies seem to suggest inconsistent patterns of molecular evolution on

immune-related genes in extremophile fish adaptation to extreme environment, our present study provide

the evidence of molecular convergence on immune-related genes in both fish lineages relative to other

freshwater cyprinoid fishes. For example, the gene *immune-related lectin-like receptor 1* (*ILLR1*), which

experienced convergent acceleration, plays roles in fish innate immunity (Yang 2009). Another gene

fibrinogen gamma chain precursor (*FGG*), which is one of the common differentially expressed genes,

facilitates the antibacterial immune response in aquatic organisms (Gordy et al. 2015). Besides, we also

identified a set of GO terms under convergent acceleration or convergent positive selection in both

extremophile fish lineages. Thus, this finding indicates that the convergence in genes sequence changes

and gene expression shifts may contribute to fish convergent adaptation to extremely saline and alkaline

environment. Overall, our comparative genomic analyses of cyprinoid fish genomes identify common

changes in gene sequences and expressions putatively associated with convergent adaptation to

extreme environment. Further study should include large scale of genomic data by including more

extremophile fish lineages on multiple regulatory levels to unveil the genetic basis of convergent

adaptation to extreme environments.

Methods and Materials

Data collection

We downloaded the available whole genomes of cyprinoid fishes from online databases, NCBI

(https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/genome) and CNGBdb (https://db.cngb.org/) (updated by January 2022)

(supplementary table S1). We then applied the BUSCO pipeline (Simão et al. 2015) to assess the

completeness of cyprinoid fish genome contents based on the Actinopterygii_odb10 single-copy

orthologous gene set from OrthoDB (https://www.orthodb.org) that included 3,640 conserved genes. We

executed strict criteria to retain the genomes with both genome assemblies and annotated protein-coding

genes covering more than 90% conserved genes for further analyses.

Genome reassembly and reannotation

The genome of *L. waleckii* (GCA_900092035.1) was previously sequenced and assembled (Xu et al.

2017) but with relatively low quality (BUSCO: 74.0% completed Actinopterygii conserved genes)

compared with the other high-quality cyprinoid fish genomes (BUSCO: > 90% completed Actinopterygii

conserved genes) involved in our study. We sought to improve the quality of genome assembly and

reassemble the genome of *L. waleckii*. Specifically, we trimmed the adaptors and low-quality sequencing

reads using Trimmomatic (Bolger et al. 2014). We then *de novo* assemble a draft genome using SPAdes

(Nurk et al. 2013) and improved scaffolds using RagTag (https://github.com/malonge/RagTag) with a

reference chromosome-level genome of *Leuciscus idus* (GCA_021554675.1). We attempted to further

improve the scaffolds using Redundans (https://github.com/Gabaldonlab/redundans) with recently

released sequencing data (Wang et al. 2021), L_RNA_scaffolder (https://github.com/CAFS-

bioinformatics/L_RNA_scaffolder) with transcriptome sequencing data (Xu, Ji, et al. 2013; Xu, Li, et al.

2013), and PEP_scaffolder (https://github.com/CAFS-bioinformatics/PEP_scaffolder) with annotated

cyprinoid fish protein datasets (supplementary table S). Finally, we used BUSCO to assess the

completeness of genome reassembly as previously described.

We took advantage of the combination of homology-based and *de novo* prediction approaches to

annotate the newly reassembled *L. waleckii* draft genome and other draft cyprinoid fish genomes

(supplementary table S). Specifically, we used AUGUSTUS (Stanke et al. 2006) with zebrafish (*Danio*

rerio) as the training set for *de novo* annotation. For homolog-based prediction, we download protein

sequences of annotated cyprinoid fish genomes from NCBI (supplementary table S). The candidate

genes were firstly identified by aligning these protein sequences to draft genomes using BLAT

(github.com/djhshih/blat). We used the MAKER pipeline (Cantarel et al. 2008) to annotate the draft

genomes (Fig. 1b). Finally, we integrated the gene models predicted by both approaches using GLEAN

(Elsik et al. 2007) with default parameters to remove redundant genes.

Ortholog identification

We used the OMA (Altenhoff et al. 2021) pipeline to infer orthologous groups (OGs) among 32 cyprinoid

fish genomes. We included the protein-coding gene dataset from each fish genome and pooled them into

a local protein database. We then conducted paralleled all-against-all alignments using DIAMOND

(https://github.com/bbuchfink/diamond). We identified the putative OGs from the alignments using OMA

with the default setting. Moreover, we further identified one-to-one, one-to-many, and many-to-many

orthologs among these fish species. For each 1:1 orthologous pair, we selected the longest transcripts

associated with recorded OGs for each species as putative single-copy orthologs. Gene ontology (GO)

terms were assigned to single-copy orthologs using Trinotate (https://github.com/Trinotate).

Genome-scale phylogeny construction and divergence time estimation

We used a phylogenomic approach to reconstruct the phylogeny based on large-scale single-copy

orthologs. Specifically, we prepared a dataset that included the amino acid (AA) sequences of 3,784

single-copy orthologs shared by 32 cyprinid fish species and one outgroup species, *Oryzias latipes*. Then,

we performed AA alignments using MUSCLE (https://github.com/rcedgar/muscle) and trimmed gaps

using trimAL (https://github.com/inab/trimal). In addition, we executed strict criteria to retain the AA

alignments of single-copy orthologs with a minimum of 200 AA in length. We assembled a concatenated

dataset including all core shared single-copy orthologs and detected the best-fit model of sequence

evolution using ModelFinder (Kalyaanamoorthy et al. 2017) and reconstructed the maximum likelihood

(ML) phylogenetic tree using RAxML (Stamatakis 2014). Finally, we performed the divergence time

estimation using MCMCtree in PAML package (Yang 2007) with the topology of 4DTV position and

recorded calibration time based on the Timetree (http://www.timetree.org/).

Molecular evolutionary analysis

We prepared the codon alignments of 17,410 single-copy orthologs, derived from AA alignments and the

corresponding DNA sequences using PAL2NAL v.14 (www.bork.embl.de/pal2nal). We estimated two

discrete categories of non-synonymous to synonymous rate ratio (i.e. dN/dS) for extremophile and non-

extremophile fish taxa with the concatenated codon sequences of 3,784 core shared orthologs (genome-

wide) using HyPhy 2.5 (Kosakovsky Pond, Poon, et al. 2020). We then employed a likelihood ratio test for

the comparison of genome-wide dN/dS. To distinguish the evolutionary driving force during the

convergent phenotypic transition from non-extremophile to extremophile, we used RELAX (Wertheim et

al. 2015) to detect the signal of relaxed or intensified selection at genome-wide scale with the

concatenated codon sequence datasets and applied a likelihood ratio test.

We sought to determine whether specific genes experience convergent shifts in selective pressures,

including convergent acceleration and positive selection in extremophile relative to non-extremophile fish

taxa. For convergent acceleration, we estimated the relative evolutionary rate (RER) using the R

package, RERconverge (Kowalczyk et al. 2019), which calculated relative branch lengths by normalizing

branches for focal branches (i.e. extremophile fish branches) to the distribution of branch lengths across

all genes, as previously described (Kowalczyk et al. 2020; Xu et al. 2021). Specifically, we prepared AA

alignments of 17,410 single-copy orthologs shared by up to 33 fish species. We estimated the branch

lengths of each gene tree based on the inferred species tree using the R package, phangorn (Schliep

2011), and calculated RER for each branch within the corresponding gene tree. To correlate RERs with

phenotypes, we applied a correlation analysis over the binary variable of focal foreground branches (i.e.

extremophile fish branches) and employed a Wilcoxon rank-sum test. The genes with significantly higher

RERs ($p < 0.05$) in extremophile fish taxa and positive Rho values as rapidly evolving genes. In addition,

we applied gene set enrichment analysis for the gene list generated from the correlation analysis using

the fastwilcoxGMT and fastwilcoxGMTall functions in RERconverge (Kowalczyk et al. 2019).

For convergent positive selection, we integrated three approaches based on the branch-site (BS) model

test to identify genes under positive selection (i.e. positively selected gene, PSG) in extremophile fish

taxa, including aBS-REL (Smith et al. 2015), BUSTED (Murrell et al. 2015), and Contrast-FEL

(Kosakovsky Pond, Wisotsky, et al. 2020). In brief, we prepared codon alignments of 17,410 single-copy

orthologs shared by up to 33 fish species. We performed the BS models tests for each gene with codon

alignment and pruned gene tree, and then applied the corresponding statistical adjustments as previously

described (Murrell et al. 2015; Smith et al. 2015; Kosakovsky Pond, Wisotsky, et al. 2020). Finally, we

performed the gene ontology enrichment analysis for the PSG repertoire using the R package, topGO

(https://rdrr.io/bioc/topGO).

Protein modelling

We sought to detect convergence in amino acid sites on a specific gene that experienced positive

selection, that is convergent positively selected site (PSS). To determine the potential functional effect of

convergent PSS in a specific gene, we applied a protein structure homology-modelling approach to

generate three-dimensional (3D) protein structure of candidate gene using a protein structure prediction

tool, I-TASSER (https://zhanggroup.org/I-TASSER/). We finally mapped PSS onto the predicted 3D

protein structure using PyMOL 2.4 (https://pymol.org/2/).

Comparative transcriptomics

We retrieved tissue-specific transcriptome sequencing data (gill, kidney, and liver) for *G. przwalskii* (Li et

al. 2021) and *L. waleckii* (Xu, Li, et al. 2013; Chen et al. 2019) in freshwater and extreme envrironments

from NCBI SRA database (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra). Specifically, we collected the tissue-specific

transcriptomes for *G. przwalskii* that sampled from Lake Qinghai (extreme envrionment) and Quanji River

(freshwater), *L. waleckii* that sampled from Lake Dali Nur (extreme environment) and Shali River

(freshwater) (fig. 5A, supplementary table S). We then proceeded the quality control and removed low-

quality reads using Trimmomatic as previously described. We further mapped all reads to protein-coding

genesets of two extremophile fish species using kallisto (https://pachterlab.github.io/kallisto) to obtain

expected counts and transcripts per million (TPM) for each gene. Finally, we performed differential gene

expression analysis by comparing three tissues of fish individuals from extreme saline/alkaline and

freshwater environments using R package, DESeq2 (Love et al. 2014).

References

AlAsiri S, Basit S, Wood-Trageser MA, Yatsenko SA, Jeffries EP, Surti U, Ketterer DM, Afzal S, Ramzan

K, Faiyaz-Ul Haque M, et al. 2015. Exome sequencing reveals MCM8 mutation underlies ovarian

failure and chromosomal instability. *J. Clin. Invest.* 125:258–262.

Altenhoff AM, Train C-M, Gilbert KJ, Mediratta I, Mendes de Farias T, Moi D, Nevers Y, Radoykova H-S,

Rossier V, Warwick Vesztrocy A, et al. 2021. OMA orthology in 2021: website overhaul, conserved

isoforms, ancestral gene order and more. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 49:D373–D379.

Bolger AM, Lohse M, Usadel B. 2014. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data.

Bioinformatics 30:2114–2120.

Bowden TJ. 2008. Modulation of the immune system of fish by their environment. *Fish Shellfish Immunol.*

25:373–383.

Brown AP, McGowan KL, Schwarzkopf EJ, Greenway R, Rodriguez LA, Tobler M, Kelley JL. 2019. Local

ancestry analysis reveals genomic convergence in extremophile fishes. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond.*

B Biol. Sci. 374:20180240.

Burgess DL, Noebels JL. 1999. Voltage-dependent calcium channel mutations in neurological disease.

Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci. 868:199–212.

Cantarel BL, Korf I, Robb SMC, Parra G, Ross E, Moore B, Holt C, Sánchez Alvarado A, Yandell M.

2008. MAKER: an easy-to-use annotation pipeline designed for emerging model organism genomes.

Genome Res. 18:188–196.

Chen B, Xu J, Cui J, Pu F, Peng W, Chen L, Xu P. 2019. Transcriptional differences provide insight into

environmental acclimatization in wild amur ide (Leuciscus waleckii) during spawning migration from

alkalized lake to freshwater river. *Genomics* 111:267–276.

Dorwart MR, Shcheynikov N, Yang D, Muallem S. 2008. The solute carrier 26 family of proteins in

epithelial ion transport. *Physiology* 23:104–114.

Elsik CG, Mackey AJ, Reese JT, Milshina NV, Roos DS, Weinstock GM. 2007. Creating a honey bee

consensus gene set. *Genome Biol.* 8:R13.

Evans DH, Claiborne JB. 2005. The physiology of fishes. CRC press

Evans DH, Piermarini PM, Choe KP. 2005. The multifunctional fish gill: dominant site of gas exchange,

osmoregulation, acid-base regulation, and excretion of nitrogenous waste. *Physiol. Rev.* 85:97–177.

Fang D-A, Duan J-R, Zhou Y-F, Zhang M-Y, Xu D-P, Liu K, Xu P. 2016. Molecular Characteristic, Protein

Distribution and Potential Regulation of HSP90AA1 in the Anadromous Fish Coilia nasus. *Genes*

[Internet] 7. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/genes7020008

Feldman CR, Brodie ED Jr, Brodie ED 3rd, Pfrender ME. 2012. Constraint shapes convergence in

tetrodotoxin-resistant sodium channels of snakes. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 109:4556–4561.

Foote AD, Liu Y, Thomas GWC, Vinař T, Alföldi J, Deng J, Dugan S, van Elk CE, Hunter ME, Joshi V, et

al. 2015. Convergent evolution of the genomes of marine mammals. *Nat. Genet.* 47:272–275.

Gordy MA, Pila EA, Hanington PC. 2015. The role of fibrinogen-related proteins in the gastropod immune

response. *Fish Shellfish Immunol.* 46:39–49.

Greenway R, Barts N, Henpita C, Brown AP, Rodriguez LA, Pena CMR, Arndt S, Lau GY, Murphy MP,

Wu L, et al. 2020. Convergent evolution of conserved mitochondrial pathways underlies repeated

adaptation to extreme environments. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 117:21822–21822.

Hao Y, Xiong Y, Cheng Y, Song G, Jia C, Qu Y, Lei F. 2019. Comparative transcriptomics of 3 high-

altitude passerine birds and their low-altitude relatives. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 116:11851–

11856.

Kalyaanamoorthy S, Minh BQ, Wong TKF, von Haeseler A, Jermiin LS. 2017. ModelFinder: fast model

selection for accurate phylogenetic estimates. *Nat. Methods* 14:587–589.

Kosakovsky Pond SL, Poon AFY, Velazquez R, Weaver S, Hepler NL, Murrell B, Shank SD, Magalis BR,

Bouvier D, Nekrutenko A, et al. 2020. HyPhy 2.5—A Customizable Platform for Evolutionary

Hypothesis Testing Using Phylogenies. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 37:295–299.

Kosakovsky Pond SL, Wisotsky SR, Escalante A, Magalis BR, Weaver S. 2020. Contrast-FEL—A Test for

Differences in Selective Pressures at Individual Sites among Clades and Sets of Branches. *Mol. Biol.*

Evol. 38:1184–1198.

Kowalczyk A, Meyer WK, Partha R, Mao W, Clark NL, Chikina M. 2019. RERconverge: an R package for

associating evolutionary rates with convergent traits. *Bioinformatics* 35:4815–4817.

Kowalczyk A, Partha R, Clark NL, Chikina M. 2020. Pan-mammalian analysis of molecular constraints

underlying extended lifespan. *Elife* [Internet] 9. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.7554/eLife.51089

Kratochwil CF, Liang Y, Gerwin J, Woltering JM, Urban S, Henning F, Machado-Schiaffino G, Hulsey CD,

Meyer A. 2018. Agouti-related peptide 2 facilitates convergent evolution of stripe patterns across

cichlid fish radiations. *Science* 362:457–460.

Lan Y, Sun J, Xu T, Chen C, Tian R, Qiu J-W, Qian P-Y. 2018. De novo transcriptome assembly and

positive selection analysis of an individual deep-sea fish. *BMC Genomics* 19:394.

Liu Y, Cotton JA, Shen B, Han X, Rossiter SJ, Zhang S. 2010. Convergent sequence evolution between

echolocating bats and dolphins. *Curr. Biol.* 20:R53–R54.

Li X, Wu J, Xiao X, Rong Y, Yang H, Li J, Zhou Q, Zhou W, Shi J, Qi H, et al. 2021. Characterization and

complexity of transcriptome in Gymnocypris przewalskii using single-molecule long-read sequencing

and RNA-seq. *DNA Res.* [Internet] 28. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/dnares/dsab005

Li Y, Liu Z, Shi P, Zhang J. 2010. The hearing gene Prestin unites echolocating bats and whales. *Curr.*

Biol. 20:R55–R56.

Loretz CA. 2008. Extracellular calcium-sensing receptors in fishes. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol. A Mol.*

Integr. Physiol. 149:225–245.

Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq

data with DESeq2. *Genome Biol.* 15:550.

Marshall WS. 2005. Ion transport, osmoregulation, and acid-base balance. *The physiology of fishes*:177–

230.

Murrell B, Weaver S, Smith MD, Wertheim JO, Murrell S, Aylward A, Eren K, Pollner T, Martin DP, Smith

DM, et al. 2015. Gene-wide identification of episodic selection. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 32:1365–1371.

Nurk S, Bankevich A, Antipov D, Gurevich AA, Korobeynikov A, Lapidus A, Prjibelski AD, Pyshkin A,

Sirotkin A, Sirotkin Y, et al. 2013. Assembling single-cell genomes and mini-metagenomes from

chimeric MDA products. *J. Comput. Biol.* 20:714–737.

Pan S, Lin Y, Liu Q, Duan J, Lin Z, Wang Y, Wang X, Lam SM, Zou Z, Shui G, et al. 2019. Convergent

genomic signatures of flight loss in birds suggest a switch of main fuel. *Nat. Commun.* 10:2756.

Parker J, Tsagkogeorga G, Cotton JA, Liu Y, Provero P, Stupka E, Rossiter SJ. 2013. Genome-wide

signatures of convergent evolution in echolocating mammals. *Nature* 502:228–231.

Partha R, Chauhan BK, Ferreira Z, Robinson JD, Lathrop K, Nischal KK, Chikina M, Clark NL. 2017.

Subterranean mammals show convergent regression in ocular genes and enhancers, along with

adaptation to tunneling. *Elife* [Internet] 6. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.7554/eLife.25884

Riesch R, Tobler M, Plath M. 2015. Extremophile fishes; Ecology, evolution, and physiology of teleosts in

extreme environments: Ecology, evolution, and physiology of teleosts in extreme environments.

(Riesch R, Plath M, Tobler M, editors.). Springer International Publishing Available from:

http://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-3-319-13362-1

Sackton TB, Clark N. 2019. Convergent evolution in the genomics era: new insights and directions.

Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci. 374:20190102.

Schliep KP. 2011. phangorn: phylogenetic analysis in R. *Bioinformatics* 27:592–593.

Simão FA, Waterhouse RM, Ioannidis P, Kriventseva EV, Zdobnov EM. 2015. BUSCO: assessing

genome assembly and annotation completeness with single-copy orthologs. *Bioinformatics* 31:3210–

3212.

Smith MD, Wertheim JO, Weaver S, Murrell B, Scheffler K, Kosakovsky Pond SL. 2015. Less is more: an

adaptive branch-site random effects model for efficient detection of episodic diversifying selection.

Mol. Biol. Evol. 32:1342–1353.

Sridhar A, Krishnasamy Sekar R, Manikandan DB, Arumugam M, Veeran S, Ramasamy T. 2020. Activity

profile of innate immune-related enzymes and bactericidal of freshwater fish epidermal mucus

extract at different pH. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. Int.* [Internet]. Available from:

http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-11173-5

Stamatakis A. 2014. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large

phylogenies. *Bioinformatics* 30:1312–1313.

Stanke M, Keller O, Gunduz I, Hayes A, Waack S, Morgenstern B. 2006. AUGUSTUS: ab initio prediction

of alternative transcripts. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 34:W435–W439.

Stern DL. 2013. The genetic causes of convergent evolution. *Nat. Rev. Genet.* 14:751–764.

Storz JF. 2016. Causes of molecular convergence and parallelism in protein evolution. *Nat. Rev. Genet.*

17:239–250.

Sun Y-B, Fu T-T, Jin J-Q, Murphy RW, Hillis DM, Zhang Y-P, Che J. 2018. Species groups distributed

across elevational gradients reveal convergent and continuous genetic adaptation to high elevations.

Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 115:E10634–E10641.

Tian F, Liu S, Shi J, Qi H, Zhao K, Xie B. 2019. Transcriptomic profiling reveals molecular regulation of

seasonal reproduction in Tibetan highland fish, Gymnocypris przewalskii. *BMC Genomics* 20:2.

Tong C, Fei T, Zhang C, Zhao K. 2017. Comprehensive transcriptomic analysis of Tibetan

Schizothoracinae fish Gymnocypris przewalskii reveals how it adapts to a high altitude aquatic life.

BMC evolutionary biology 17:74.

Tong C, Li M. 2019. Transcriptomic signature of rapidly evolving immune genes in a highland fish. *Fish*

Shellfish Immunol. 97:587–592.

Tong C, Li M. 2020. Genomic signature of accelerated evolution in a saline-alkaline lake-dwelling

Schizothoracine fish. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* 149:341–347.

Tong C, Li M, Tang Y, Zhao K. 2021. Genomic Signature of Shifts in Selection and Alkaline Adaptation in

Highland Fish. *Genome Biol. Evol.* [Internet] 13. Available from:

http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/gbe/evab086

Wang S, Kuang Y, Liang L, Sun B, Zhao X, Zhang L, Chang Y. 2021. Resequencing and SNP discovery

of Amur ide (Leuciscus waleckii) provides insights into local adaptations to extreme environments.

Sci. Rep. 11:5064.

Wang Y, Guo B. 2019. Adaption to extreme environments: a perspective from fish genomics. *Rev. Fish*

Biol. Fish. 29:735–747.

Wertheim JO, Murrell B, Smith MD, Kosakovsky Pond SL, Scheffler K. 2015. RELAX: detecting relaxed

selection in a phylogenetic framework. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 32:820–832.

Wills ZP, Mandel-Brehm C, Mardinly AR, McCord AE, Giger RJ, Greenberg ME. 2012. The nogo receptor

family restricts synapse number in the developing hippocampus. *Neuron* 73:466–481.

Winfield IJ, Nelson JS. 2012. Cyprinid Fishes: Systematics, biology and exploitation. Springer Science &

Business Media

Wu DD, Yang CP, Wang MS, Dong KZ. 2020. Convergent genomic signatures of high-altitude adaptation

among domestic mammals. *National Science Review* 7:952–963.

Xu H, Ye X, Yang Y, Yang Y, Sun YH, Mei Y, Xiong S, He K, Xu L, Fang Q, et al. 2021. Comparative

Genomics Sheds Light on the Convergent Evolution of Miniaturized Wasps. *Mol. Biol. Evol.*

38:5539–5554.

Xu J, Ji P, Wang B, Zhao L, Wang J, Zhao Z, Zhang Y, Li J, Xu P, Sun X. 2013. Transcriptome
sequencing and analysis of wild Amur Ide (Leuciscus waleckii) inhabiting an extreme alkaline-saline
lake reveals insights into stress adaptation. *PLoS One* 8:e59703.

Xu J, Li J-T, Jiang Y, Peng W, Yao Z, Chen B, Jiang L, Feng J, Ji P, Liu G, et al. 2017. Genomic Basis of
Adaptive Evolution: The Survival of Amur Ide (Leuciscus waleckii) in an Extremely Alkaline
Environment. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 34:145–159.

Xu J, Li Q, Xu L, Wang S, Jiang Y, Zhao Z, Zhang Y, Li J, Dong C, Xu P, et al. 2013. Gene expression
changes leading extreme alkaline tolerance in Amur ide (Leuciscus waleckii) inhabiting soda lake.
BMC Genomics 14:682.

Xu S, Wang J, Guo Z, He Z, Shi S. 2020. Genomic Convergence in the Adaptation to Extreme
Environments. *Plant Commun* 1:100117.

Yang J. 2009. Immune-related lectin-like receptors in zebrafish innate immunity.

Yang L, Wang Y, Sun N, Chen J, He S. 2021. Genomic and functional evidence reveals convergent
evolution in fishes on the Tibetan Plateau. *Mol. Ecol.* 30:5752–5764.

Yang Z. 2007. PAML 4: phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 24:1586–1591.

Yu L, Wang G-D, Ruan J, Chen Y-B, Yang C-P, Cao X, Wu H, Liu Y-H, Du Z-L, Wang X-P, et al. 2016.
Genomic analysis of snub-nosed monkeys (Rhinopithecus) identifies genes and processes related to
high-altitude adaptation. *Nat. Genet.* 48:947–952.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the Field Research Fund of the University of Pennsylvania Biology

Department to C.T.

Author contributions

C.T. conceived and designed this project. C.T. and M.L. performed the comparative genomics analyses.

C.T. wrote the paper. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

 Figure legends

Fig. 1. Genome-scale phylogeny of study cyprinoid fishes and genome-wide pattern of molecular

evolution in extremophile fish taxa. (**A**) Geographical locations of two extremophile fish species, *L.*

waleckii or *G. przwalskii* in eastern Asia. (**B**) A maximum likelihood phylogenetic tree with estimated

divergence time of the 32 cyprinoid fish species included in the study. Phylogenetic tree was inferred from

3,784 core shared single-copy orthologs, that was supported for all nodes with 100% bootstrap values.

(**C**) Bar plot depicting the genome-wide rates of molecular evolution (also known as dN/dS) during the

convergent phenotypic transition from non-extremophile to extremophile in fish. (**D**) Multi-bar plot

depicting the pattern of intensified selection (K > 1) experienced across sites in genomes of extremophile

relative to non-extremophile fish taxa.

Fig. 2. Genes and GO terms under convergent acceleration in both extremophile fishes. (**A**) Two

representative cases of genes under convergent acceleration in extremophile fish branches relative to

non-extremophile fish branches. One is calcium channel, voltage-dependent, gamma subunit 7a

(CACNG7), another is immune-related lectin-like receptor 1 (ILLR1). Extremophile fish branch, non-

extremophile fish branch, and ancestral branch were represented by grey, blue and dark dots,

respectively. (**B**) Bar plot depicting the significantly enriched GO terms under convergent acceleration

(Benjamini-Hochberg adjusted $p < 0.05$), including four major functional categories, nervous system

development, ion transport, immune response, and hormone response.

Fig. 3. Genes and GO terms under convergent positive selection in extremophile fishes. (**A**) Venn

diagram depicting numbers of PSGs in extremophile fishes identified by three branch-site models,

aBSREL, BUSTED and Contrast-FEL. (**B**) REVIGO plot depicting the dominant enriched GO terms for

shared PSGs in both species, including nervous system development, ion transport, reproduction and

immune response. The scale of dot indicating the number of included enriched GO terms under a

dominant GO term, the color scale representing the p value transformed by log10. (**C**) The number of

unique and shared protein-coding genes and enriched GO terms (Biological process) under positive

selection. (**D**) REVIGO plot depicting the dominant enriched GO terms for PSGs in *G. przwalskii* and *L.*

waleckii.

Fig. 4. Predicted protein structure for extracellular calcium-sensing receptor (CaSR) in

extremophile fish. (**A**) Schematic diagram depicting the topology and domain arrangement in CaSR,

including extracellular domain (ECD), seven transmembrane domain (7TM) and intracellular domain

(ICD). ECD includes bilobed venus flytrap (VFT) and nine-cysteines domain of family 3 G protein-coupled

receptor (NCD3G) modules. Dimerization occurs via both covalent (disulfide) and non-covalent bonds

between ECDs of two receptor monomers. (**B**) Positively selected amino acid sites (PSS) in CaSR.

Extremophile and non-extremophile fish species name are highlighted by blue and grey, respectively. The

PSS in extremophile fish taxa were shadowed by dark boxes. (**C**) Three-dimensional (3D) homology

protein structure of *G. przewalskii* CaSR. The PSS residues are labeled, and all located in VFT domain.

Fig. 5. Convergence in changes of gene expressions in extremophile fish taxa. (**A**) Bar plot

depicting the number of differentially expressed genes (DEGs) between freshwater and extremely saline /

alkaline environment for each species. Orange and light blue bars represent the DEGs in gill, kidney and

liver tissues of each species. Dark bar represents the overlapping DEGs (also known as, common DEGs)

between extremophile fish taxa in each tissue. (**B**) Dot plot depicting the expression patterns of common

DEGs between two extremophile fish taxa, including upregulation (LOG2Fold-change > 0) or

downregulation (LOG2Fold-change < 0). (**C**) Multi-plots depicting the overlapping between DEGs in each

tissue and genes under convergent selection in two extremophile fish taxa.

A   Genes under convergent acceleration

Calcium channel voltage-dependent gamma subunit 7 (CACNG7)

rho = 0.3149
P-value = 0.0224

Immune-related lectin-like receptor 1 (ILLR1)

rho = 0.2545
P-value = 0.0344

B   GO terms under convergent acceleration

A Positively selected genes

aBS-REL: 3

Contrast-FEL: 230

214 (overlapping)

BUSTED: 1

B Ontologies for shared positively selected genes

semantic space x

cellular response to interleukin-6

Immune response

cellular response to interleukin-4
positive reg. of humoral immune response

Reproduction

oocyte development
oocyte differentiation

Nervous system development

regulation of synapse assembly
modu. of chemical synaptic transmission
regulation of trans-synaptic signaling

cation homeostasis

transmembrane transport

Ion transport

response to osmotic stress

ion transmembrane transport

chloride transport

ion transport

potassium ion transmembrane transport

metal ion export

semantic space y

C Protein coding genes

9	3	202
G. przwalski	Overlapping	*L. waleckii*
105	12	176

GO terms (Biological processes)

D

Ontologies for positively selected genes in *G. przwalskii*

semantic space x

inorganic anion transmembrane transport

chloride transmembrane transport

Ion transport

calcium ion transport

ion transmembrane transport
calcium ion import

postsynaptic signal transduction

Nervous system development

Reproduction

reg. of androgen receptor signaling pathway

cellular response to salt stress

complement activation

hyperosmotic salinity response

reg. of humoral immune response

reg. of cellular response to osmotic stress

response to interleukin-6

Immune response

Osmoregulation

semantic space y

Ontologies for positively selected genes in *L. waleckii*

inorganic ion homeostasis

magnesium ion homeostasis

ion transmembrane transport

potassium ion transmembrane transport

ion transport
metal ion export

chloride transport

metal ion homeostasis

cation homeostasis

Ion transport

Reproduction

oocyte development
oocyte differentiation

reg. of neurotransmitter transport
synaptic signaling
axon regeneration

axon regeneration

response to interleukin-4
response to interferon-gamma

neuron projection regeneration

Nervous system development

Immune response

semantic space y

A

Extracellular calcium-sensing receptor (CaSR)

VFT
ECD
NCD3G

Outside
Plasm membrane
Inside

7TM
ICD

B

	8	9	10	12	17	19	20	22	23	24	61	62
G. przewalskii	L	D	H	E	N	G	E	F	G	S	N	I
G. eckloni	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
O. stewarti	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. oconnori	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
O. macrolepis	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
P. tetrazona	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
C. auratus	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
C. gibelio	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
C. carpio	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. rhinocerous	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. anshuiensis	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. grahami	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. anophthalmus	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
S. maitianheensis	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
L. rohita	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
L. catla	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
L. waleckiil	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	E	H
L. idus	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
P. promelas	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
P. guichenoti	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
G. rarus	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
C. idella	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
A. grahami	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
M. amblycephala	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
C. alburnus	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
H. molitrix	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
H. nobilis	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
D. dracula	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
D. translucida	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
D. rerio	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
D. aesculapii	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I
D. kyathit	I	N	N	S	N	T	L	Y	R	I	N	I

C

8L
10H
12E
19G
9D
61E
17N
62H
20E
22F
23G
24S

VFT
NCD3G
7TM
ICD