1   **Phylogenetic and phenotypic analysis of five subgroups of Ralstonia**
2   **solanacearum phylotype IIB sequevar 4 reveals that the "not pathogenic to**
3   **banana (NPB)" ecotype is polyphyletic.**
4
5   ## Authors

6   Jonathan Beutler, Samuel Holden, Stratton Georgoulis, Darrielle Williams, David J. Norman,
7   Tiffany M. Lowe-Power*
8
9   Affiliations:

Name	Affiliation (current)	Affiliation (time of work)	ORCid
Jonathan Beutler	Faculty of Land and Food Systems, The University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada	Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, Davis, CA 95616	
Samuel Holden		Land and Food Systems, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC, Canada	
Stratton J. Georgoulis		Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, Davis, CA 95616	0000-0002-2733-5463
Darrielle Williams		Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, Davis, CA 95616	
David J. Norman		UF/IFAS Extension, Mid-Florida Research and Education Center, Apopka, FL 32703	
Tiffany M. Lowe-Power		Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, Davis, CA 95616	0000-0003-2681-3563

10
11 *Corresponding author: tlowepower@ucdavis.edu
12

Abstract

The bacterial wilt pathogens in the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex (RSSC) have broad but finite host ranges. Population genetic surveys of RSSC pathogens show that many sequevars (subspecies groups) are predominantly recovered from wilting solanaceous plants. In contrast, strains in the IIB-4 sequevar have been isolated from plants in over a dozen families. We characterized the natural variation in host range of nineteen IIB-4 strains to explore the molecular determinants of host range within the RSSC. We used Illumina sequencing to assemble draft genomes of 12 strains. Based on whole genome phylogenetic analysis, these IIB-4 strains cluster into five subclades. We quantified virulence of each strain on tomato cv. Moneymaker (Solanaceae), banana cv. Dwarf Cavendish (Musaceae), melon cv. Sweet Granite (Cucurbitaceae), and impatiens cv. Beacon Orange (Balsaminaceae). To enable future meta-analyses that identify genetic factors that drive host-range, the raw virulence data is included as a supplemental table. Overall, the virulence patterns correlated with phylogeny. Strains from Martinique, Dominican Republic, Brazil, as well as multiple strains imported into Florida were highly virulent on tomato, melon, and impatiens. Several strains from Peru were highly virulent on tomato and had moderate-to-low virulence on banana, melon, and impatiens. One strain from Colombia was highly virulent on all hosts. Our findings reinforce the phenotypic plasticity within the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex.

Introduction

The *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex is a group of related tropical and temperate

pathogens that cause plant wilt diseases after they invade and colonize the xylem [1, 2].

Collectively, the species complex has a remarkably broad host range, capable of infecting

hundreds of host species in dozens of taxonomic families [3, 4]. However, the breadth in host

range is not uniformly distributed across the species complex. Whereas many clades are

predominantly isolated from Solanaceae family plants (tomato, potato, pepper, etc.)[4], strains

in the *R. solanacearum* phylotype IIB sequevar 4 clade (IIB-4) exhibit a particularly broad host

range [5, 6]. *R. solanacearum* IIB-4 strains have been isolated from 33 plant species in 19

botanical families [4, 6–14]. They are distributed throughout Central and South America, the

ancestral range of phylotype II *Ralstonia*. This lineage is globally invasive as IIB-4 strains have

become established in Malaysia [13] and have been imported into Florida [7].

R. solanacearum IIB-4 have caused several well-studied wilt epidemics. In the 1960s, *R.*

solanacearum IIB-4 caused a high-impact Moko disease epidemic of plantains and bananas in

Colombia and Peru [15, 16]. These Moko isolates were also pathogenic to solanaceous crops:

tomato, pepper, and potato [15]. In the 2000s, a subgroup of *R. solanacearum* IIB-4 from

Martinique were recognized as a novel "not pathogenic to banana (NPB) ecotype" with high

virulence on cucurbits but low virulence to banana [6]. In 2020, a third ecotype of IIB-4 from

Colombia was described [12]; these novel Colombian strains are the only IIB-4 strains that are

known to be avirulent on tomato. Overall, the well-documented natural history of IIB-4 strains

and the diversity of their hosts position *R. solanacearum* IIB-4 as a model clade for investigating

the factors that limit and enable the breadth of host range in bacterial wilt pathogens.

Results

In this study, we quantified the natural variation in virulence of 19 *Ralstonia solanaceaurm* IIB-4

strains against four natural host species from four botanical families. The strains were isolated

from diverse plants and locations (see Table S1). Seven strains were isolated in Peru and

Colombia from 1960-1963. Of these, six were from plantain during an epidemic of Moko

disease, and one from *Heliconia* (Buddenhagen and Elsasser 1962; French et al. 1970). Three

strains were isolated on Anthurium and Heliconia during the Martinique epidemic (Wicker et al.

2007). Seven strains were isolated from ornamentals imported into Florida. Of these, six were

isolated between 1996-2012 from *Pothos*, and one from *Anthurium* in 1997 (Norman et al.

2009). One strain was isolated in 1999 from cucumber in Brazil (Ailloud et al. 2015), and one in

2017 from *Pothos* in the Dominican Republic.

To determine the diversity of these strains, we used Illumina sequencing to assemble draft

genomes of 12 strains. An additional four unpublished genomes were shared by Caitilyn Allen

and Boris Vinatzer. The draft genome assembly of P488 is lower quality than others. The P488

assembly is fragmented into 200 contigs with an N_{50} of ~56 kb while the other assemblies have

40-115 contigs with an N_{50} of 111-414 kb. Full genome assembly statistics are in Table S1. We

collected genomes of five additional IIB-4 strains, the closely related IIB-51 strain CFBP7014,

and two distantly related strains (phylotype I GMI1000 and phylotype IIC K60 [17]) from NCBI.

We constructed a phylogenetic tree using 4,317 genes comparing 369,907 intragenic SNPs (Fig

1). Three of the IIB-4 genomes had longer branch lengths (P488, CFBP6783, and UW179),

consistent with the lower-quality, more fragmented assemblies for these strains. The tree

separated the IIB-4 strains into five branches, which we refer to as subclades A to E. The

Heliconia isolate from 1961 (UW170) was the sole genome on subclade A. Seven *Pothos* and

Anthurium isolates from Florida, and one from the Dominican Republic all clustered in subclade

B. The Brazilian cucumber isolate IBSBF1503 clustered into subclade C with the three strains

from the Martinique epidemic. The four Peruvian strains from the 1960s Moko epidemic

clustered into subclade D. Subclade E contained three Colombian strains isolated from plantain

in the 1960s, three Colombian strains recently isolated from plantain, and one Mexican strain

isolated from potato.

We quantified virulence of 19 IIB-4 strains on four diverse plant species that are documented

natural hosts for *Ralstonia* IIB-4: tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum* cv. Moneymaker), melon

(*Cucumis melo* cv. Sweet Granite), impatiens (*Impatiens walleriana* cv. Beacon Orange), and

banana (AAA *Musa acuminata* cv. Dwarf Cavendish). Tomato, melon, and impatiens were

grown from seed while banana plants were purchased as tissue cultured plantlets. Plants were

grown in growth chambers at 28°C (tomato, melon, and impatiens) or 32°C (banana) with a 12

hr light cycle and 40% humidity. Tomato and melon seeds were sown into Sunshine Mix #1 to a

depth of 1 cm, and impatiens were sown onto the surface of Sunshine Mix and topped with 1

mm vermiculite. Seedlings were transplanted into 3.5" pots with approximately 60 g Sunshine

Mix at 7 days (melon), 14 days (tomato), 21 days post sowing (impatiens), or at the 3-leaf stage

(banana).

We inoculated plants at 21 days post sowing (tomato and melon), 35 days post sowing

(impatiens), or at the 4-leaf stage (banana). We inoculated tomato and impatiens via a standard

cut-petiole approach where the lowest petiole was excised, and a 2 µl droplet of bacterial

suspension (containing approximately 1000 CFU) was placed on the cut surface [18]. Due to

rapid wound responses of cucurbits [19], we inoculated melons by applying a 2 µl droplet of

1000 CFU onto a razor blade and excising a petiole with the infested blade. Banana plants were

inoculated by drenching the soil with a bacterial suspension (50 mL with 5×10^7 to 1×10^8 CFU/g

soil) after the roots were lightly wounded with a 2 cm-wide metal spatula [20]. We rated

symptoms daily for 14 days (Fig. 2). We rated tomato symptoms on a standard 0-4 disease

index (DI) where 0 = no wilt, 1 = 0.1-25% of leaflets wilted, 2 = 25.1-50% of leaflets wilted, 3 =

50.1-75% of leaflets wilted, and 4 = 75.1-100% of leaflets wilted [18]. We measured symptoms

on melon, impatiens, and banana as the percentage of leaves with wilt. Symptom

measurements, area under the disease progress curve (AUDPC), and incidence are displayed in

Table S2.

Although all strains were pathogenic to tomato, three strains had reduced virulence: UW170

(subclade A), UW162 (subclade D), and UW175 (subclade E). Because these strains have been

stored as "waterstocks" (in distilled water at room temperature) for decades, we suspect that

these strains acquired mutations in culture storage that reduced their virulence. The subclade A

strain UW170 was moderately virulent on both tomato and impatiens but caused minor wilt on

only a few banana or melon plants. The subclade D strain UW162 had moderate virulence on

tomato and mild virulence on impatiens, melon, and banana. The subclade E strain UW175 had

moderate virulence on tomato, mild virulence on impatiens and melon, and no virulence on

banana. Similarly, little is known about the IIB-4 strains isolated from Banana in Malaysia [13],

but we predict they could be in subclade D or a represent a novel subclade.

Virulence of strains generally correlated with their phylogenetic relationships. The subclade B

and C strains were avirulent on banana but highly virulent on tomato, impatiens, and melon.

The subclade C strains displayed slightly higher virulence on melon than the subclade B strains.

Three other subclade D strains were highly virulent on tomato and had low-to-moderate

virulence on impatiens, melon, and banana. The subclade E strains included UW70 which was

highly virulent on tomato, melon, and banana. UW70 was more virulent on impatiens than

subclade D strains, but less virulent than the subclade B and subclade C strains.

Discussion

Although many *Ralstonia* isolates only wilt plants efficiently at tropical temperatures, some

Ralstonia isolates can wilt plants at temperate temperatures. Cool-virulence is famously a trait

of the global pandemic lineage of *Ralstonia* (IIB-1 AKA the U.S. Select Agent-regulated "Race 3

Biovar 2" group)[21], but recent studies have shown that multiple lineages of *Ralstonia* can wilt

tomato plants at cool temperatures: IIB-27, III-48, and the focal clade of this study, IIB-4 [22,

23]. Although we carried out this study's virulence assays at warm, tropical temperatures,

several of our isolates, P673 (subclade B), CFBP6783 (subclade C), and UW163 (subclade D) can

wilt tomatoes at cool temperatures (18°C) [22, 23].

Early studies suggested that IIB-4 strains have binary host range profiles with either a "Moko"

profile with pathogenicity to banana/ tomato/ plantain or a "Not Pathogenic to Banana (NPB)"

profile with pathogenicity to tomato/ plantain/ anthurium/ cucurbits [5, 6, 20]. However, this

study shows that the virulence patterns are more complex. First, we show that banana

pathogenesis is rare among the strains tested. The "not pathogenic to banana" phenotype was

shared by the subclade C strains previously described as "not pathogenic to banana" [5] and

strains from subclade A and B. Our results suggest that pathogenesis on banana might be an

acquired trait within the subclade D/E lineage. Consistently, pathogenesis on banana is a

polyphyletic trait shared by distantly related lineages in phylotype IIA, IIB, and IV [24–26]. Our

study did not include any genomes from the recently identified IIB-4 subclade /ecotype from

Colombia that lacks pathogenicity to tomato [12]. If strains from this ecotype cluster

independently from the five subclades of the 24 IIB-4 strains in this study, we propose to name

the newly described ecotype as "subclade F".

One subclade E strain (UW70 also known as "CIP417") was highly virulent on all host species

tested. UW70 was isolated from plantain in Colombia in the 1960s and is closely related to

strains isolated from Plantain in Colombia in 2012 (UA-1591 and UA-1617)[12]. Interestingly,

UW70 was highly virulent on melons, but UA-1591 is reported to be avirulent on cucumber

[12]. Cucurbit pathogenicity has also been documented in phylotype I strains isolated in

Taiwan, Thailand, China, and Japan [27–30].

Overall, our findings reinforce the phenotypic plasticity within the *Ralstonia solanacearum*

species complex broadly. In addition to host range variation within sequevar IIB-4, banana-

virulent strains in IIA-24 and IIA-41 clades vary in their pathogenicity on tomato [25]. A study of

phylotype I *Ralstonia* from Guanxi, China showed that closely related strains shared virulence

on tomato, eggplant, tobacco, and potato but varied in their pathogenicity on pepper,

mulberry, ginger, and cucurbits [27]. Host range patterns in the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species

complex are complicated because they are generalists with limits to their host range. The

genetic and evolutionary drivers of host range in the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex

remains and important and unsolved puzzle.

Data Availability

176 The raw virulence data is available in Table S2. The genome data is available on NCBI (xxxTo be

177 added)

Acknowledgements

We thank Caitilyn Allen for sharing strains used in this study and Caitilyn Allen, Boris Vinatzer,

and Parul Sharma for sharing unpublished genomes. Work was funded by a Henry A. Jastro

Graduate Research Award to J. Beutler; the UC Davis College of Agricultural and Environmental

Sciences and USDA CA-D-PPA-2610-H to T. Lowe-Power; the Plant Agricultural Biology Graduate

Admissions Pathways Program to D. Williams; the USDA Floriculture and Nursery Research

Initiative and the University of Florida Institute of Food and Agricultural Sciences to D. Norman.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.

References

1. **Prior P, Ailloud F, Dalsing BL, Remenant B, Sanchez B, *et al.*** Genomic and proteomic evidence supporting the division of the plant pathogen *Ralstonia solanacearum* into three species. *BMC Genomics* 2016;17:90.

2. **Lowe-Power TM, Khokhani D, Allen C**. How *Ralstonia solanacearum* exploits and thrives in the flowing plant xylem environment. *Trends Microbiol* 2018;26:929–942.

3. **Hayward AC**. Biology and epidemiology of bacterial wilt caused by *Pseudomonas solanacearum*. *Annu Rev Phytopathol* 1991;29:65–87.

4. **Lowe-Power T, Avalos J, Charco Munoz M, Chipman K**. A meta-analysis of the known global distribution and host range of the *Ralstonia* species complex. *bioRxiv*. https://www.biorxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.07.13.189936v1.abstract (2020).

5. **Ailloud F, Lowe T, Cellier G, Roche D, Allen C, *et al.*** Comparative genomic analysis of *Ralstonia solanacearum* reveals candidate genes for host specificity. *BMC Genomics* 2015;16:270.

6. **Wicker E, Grassart L, Coranson-Beaudu R, Mian D, Guilbaud C, *et al.*** *Ralstonia solanacearum* strains from Martinique (French West Indies) exhibiting a new pathogenic potential. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2007;73:6790–6801.

7. **Norman DJ, Zapata M, Gabriel DW, Duan YP, Yuen JMF, *et al.*** Genetic diversity and host range variation of *Ralstonia solanacearum* strains entering North America. *Phytopathology* 2009;99:1070–1077.

8. **Cellier G, Remenant B, Chiroleu F, Lefeuvre P, Prior P**. Phylogeny and population structure of brown rot- and Moko disease-causing strains of *Ralstonia solanacearum* phylotype II. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2012;78:2367–2375.

9. **Hong JC, Norman DJ, Reed DL, Momol MT, Jones JB**. Diversity among *Ralstonia solanacearum* strains isolated from the Southeastern United States. *Phytopathology* 2012;102:924–936.

10. **Cellier G, Moreau A, Chabirand A, Hostachy B, Ailloud F, *et al.*** A duplex PCR assay for the detection of *Ralstonia solanacearum* phylotype II strains in *Musa* spp. *PLoS One* 2015;10:e0122182.

11.   **Gutarra L, Herrera J, Fernandez E, Kreuze J, Lindqvist-Kreuze H**. Diversity, pathogenicity,
and current occurrence of bacterial wilt bacterium *Ralstonia solanacearum* in Peru. *Front*
Plant Sci 2017;8:1221.

12.   **Ramírez M, Moncada RN, Villegas-Escobar V, Jackson RW, Ramírez CA**. Phylogenetic and
pathogenic variability of strains of *Ralstonia solanacearum* causing moko disease in
Colombia. *Plant Pathol* 2020;69:360–369.

13.   **Zulperi D, Sijam K, Ahmad ZAM, Awang Y, Mohd Hata E**. Phylotype classification of
Ralstonia solanacearum biovar 1 strains isolated from banana (*Musa* spp.) in Malaysia.
Archives of Phytopathology and Plant Protection 2014;47:2352–2364.

14.   **Cellier G, Prior P**. Deciphering Phenotypic Diversity of Ralstonia solanacearum Strains
Pathogenic to Potato. *Phytopathology®* 2010;100:1250–1261.

15.   **French ER, Sequeira L, Others**. Strains of Pseudomonas solanacearum from Central and
South America: a comparative study. *Phytopathology* 1970;60:506–512.

16.   **Buddenhagen IW, Elsasser TA**. An insect-spread bacterial wilt epiphytotic of bluggoe
banana. *Nature* 1962;194:164–165.

17.   **Sharma P, Johnson MA, Mazloom R, Allen C, Heath LS, *et al.*** Meta-analysis of the
Ralstonia solanacearum species complex (RSSC) based on comparative evolutionary
genomics and reverse ecology. *Microb Genom*;8. Epub ahead of print March 2022. DOI:
10.1099/mgen.0.000791.

18.   **Khokhani D, Tran TM, Lowe-Power TM, Allen C**. Plant assays for quantifying *Ralstonia*
solanacearum virulence. *Bio-protocol*. https://en.bio-protocol.org/CN/e3028 (2018).

19.   **Zimmermann MR, Hafke JB, van Bel AJE, Furch ACU**. Interaction of xylem and phloem
during exudation and wound occlusion in *Cucurbita maxima*. *Plant Cell Environ*
2013;36:237–247.

20.   **Ailloud F, Lowe TM, Robène I, Cruveiller S, Allen C, *et al.*** *In planta* comparative
transcriptomics of host-adapted strains of *Ralstonia solanacearum*. *PeerJ* 2016;4:e1549.

21.   **Champoiseau PG, Jones JB, Allen C**. *Ralstonia solanacearum* Race 3 Biovar 2 causes
tropical losses and temperate anxieties. *Plant Health Prog*.
https://apsjournals.apsnet.org/doi/abs/10.1094/PHP-2009-0313-01-RV (2009).

22.   **Bocsanczy AM, Achenbach UCM, Mangravita-Novo A, Chow M, Norman DJ**. Proteomic
comparison of *Ralstonia solanacearum* strains reveals temperature dependent virulence
factors. *BMC Genomics* 2014;15:280.

23.   **Bocsanczy AM, Huguet-Tapia JC, Norman DJ**. Comparative Genomics of *Ralstonia*
253   *solanacearum* Identifies Candidate Genes Associated with Cool Virulence. *Front Plant Sci*
254   2017;8:1565.

255   24.   **Ray JD, Subandiyah S, Rincon-Florez VA, Prakoso AB, Mudita IW, *et al.*** Geographic
256   Expansion of Banana Blood Disease in Southeast Asia. *Plant Dis* 2021;105:2792–2800.

257   25.   **Albuquerque GMR, Santos LA, Felix KCS, Rollemberg CL, Silva AMF, *et al.*** Moko disease-
258   causing strains of *Ralstonia solanacearum* from Brazil extend known diversity in
259   paraphyletic Phylotype II. *Phytopathology* 2014;104:1175–1182.

260   26.   **Obrador-Sánchez JA, Tzec-Simá M, Higuera-Ciapara I, Canto-Canché B**. Genetic diversity
261   of *Ralstonia solanacearum* strains from Mexico associated with Moko disease. *Eur J Plant*
262   *Pathol* 2017;149:817–830.

263   27.   **He Y, Chen Y, Zhang Y, Qin X, Wei X, *et al.*** Genetic diversity of Ralstonia solanacearum
264   species complex strains obtained from Guangxi, China and their pathogenicity on plants in
265   the Cucurbitaceae family and other botanical families. *Plant Pathol*. Epub ahead of print
266   May 7, 2021. DOI: 10.1111/ppa.13389.

267   28.   **Yahiaoui N, Chéron J-J, Ravelomanantsoa S, Hamza AA, Petrousse B, *et al.*** Genetic
268   diversity of the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex in the Southwest Indian Ocean
269   Islands. *Front Plant Sci* 2017;8:2139.

270   29.   **Horita M, Tsuchiya K, Suga Y, Yano K, Waki T, *et al.*** Current classification of *Ralstonia*
271   *solanacearum* and genetic diversity of the strains in Japan. *J Gen Plant Pathol*
272   2014;80:455–465.

273   30.   **Lin C-H, Tsai K-C, Prior P, Wang J-F**. Phylogenetic relationships and population structure of
274   *Ralstonia solanacearum* isolated from diverse origins in Taiwan. *Plant Pathol*
275   2014;63:1395–1403.

276   31.   **Bayliss SC, Thorpe HA, Coyle NM, Sheppard SK, Feil EJ**. PIRATE: A fast and scalable
277   pangenomics toolbox for clustering diverged orthologues in bacteria. *Gigascience*;8. Epub
278   ahead of print October 9, 2019. DOI: 10.1093/gigascience/giz119.

279   32.   **Stamatakis A**. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large
280   phylogenies. *Bioinformatics* 2014;30:1312–1313.

281   33.   **Letunic I, Bork P**. Interactive Tree Of Life (iTOL) v5: an online tool for phylogenetic tree
282   display and annotation. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2021;49:W293–W296.

Figures

Fig 1. Maximum likelihood tree describing 27 strains of the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species

complex, based on 369,907 intragenic SNPs. The tree includes 24 IIB-4 strains and three

reference strains from phylotype IIB-51 (CFBP7014), IIC-7 (K60) [17], and I (GMI1000). Isolates

are described as belonging to one of five IIB4 subclades (A-E). 95% bootstrap support is

indicated by a white circle. Some branch lengths were condensed for clarity. SNPs were

identified by grouping orthologous genes across all isolates using PIRATE v1.0.4 with default

parameters and nucleotide-based clustering [31]. Orthologous gene groups identified by PIRATE

were concatenated and reduced to positions present in at least 20 accessions, with at least one

variable nucleotide, by a python script Reduce_alignment.py (github.com/Erysiphe-

graminis/Utilities). These positions were used to generate the tree using RAxML v8.2.12 with

the GTRGAMMA model, Lewis ascertainment bias correction, and 1000 bootstraps [32].

Fig 2. Disease progress of 19 *R. solanacearum* IIB-4 strains on four host species: tomato cv.

Moneymaker (n≥44 plants), melon cv. Sweet Granite (n≥43), impatiens cv. Beacon Orange

(n≥44), and Banana cv. Dwarf Cavendish (n≥19). Each graph represents one strain. Virulence on

tomato was quantified on 0-4 disease index (left Y-axes), and virulence on other hosts was

quantified as a percentage of leaves with wilt (right Y-axes). Symbols represent the mean of 2-3

trials and bars show standard error of the mean (SEM). Strains are grouped based on the

phylogeny from Fig 1. Raw virulence data is available in Table S2.