Article: **Bacterial plasmid-associated and chromosomal proteins have fundamentally different properties in protein interaction networks**

Authors and affiliations: Tim Downing[1]*, Alexander Rahm[2].

[1],*Author for Correspondence: School of Biotechnology, Dublin City University, Dublin, Ireland.
Corresponding author. Email: Tim.Downing@dcu.ie. Orcid: 0000-0002-8385-6730.
[2] GAATI Lab, University of French Polynesia, Tahiti, French Polynesia. Email:
Alexander.Rahm@upf.pf. Orcid: 0000-0002-5534-2716.

Abstract

Plasmids facilitate horizontal gene transfer, which enables the diversification of pathogens into new anatomical and environmental niches, implying that plasmid-encoded genes can cooperate well with chromosomal genes. We hypothesise that such mobile genes are functionally different to chromosomal ones due to this ability to encode non-essential functions like antimicrobial resistance and traverse distinct host cells. The effect of plasmid-driven gene gain on protein-protein interaction network topology is an important question in this area. Moreover, the extent to which these chromosomally- and plasmid-encoded proteins interact with proteins from their own groups compared to the levels with the other group remains unclear. Here, we examined the incidence and protein-protein interactions of all known plasmid-encoded genes across representative specimens from most bacteria using all available plasmids. We found that such plasmid-encoded genes constitute ~0.7% of the total number of genes per bacterial sample, and that plasmid genes are preferentially associated with different species but had limited taxonomical power beyond this. Surprisingly, plasmid-encoded proteins had both more protein-protein interactions compared to chromosomal proteins, countering the hypothesis that genes with higher mobility rates should have fewer protein-level interactions. Nonetheless, topological analysis and investigation of the protein-protein interaction networks' connectivity and change in the number of independent components demonstrated that the plasmid-encoded proteins had limited overall impact in >96% of samples. This paper assembled extensive data on plasmid-encoded proteins, their interactions and associations with diverse bacterial specimens that is available for the community to investigate in more detail.

Keywords: AMR, plasmid, genome, protein-protein interaction, network.

Significance statement

It is well-established that plasmids drive new traits in their bacterial hosts, but the extent to which host-plasmid co-evolution is evident at the level of protein-protein interactions remains unclear. To address this, we compiled and analysed all available valid bacterial plasmids and associated proteins to explore the compositional differences between chromosomal and plasmid-encoded proteins and their interaction levels. We found that plasmid-encoded genes were highly correlated across the bacterial samples such that they had a high association with taxonomic context. Contrasting with the complexity hypothesis, plasmid-encoded proteins had far more interactions on average than chromosomal ones, though they had minimal effects on protein-protein interaction network structure. This demonstrated that host-plasmid co-evolution is evident and detectable at the level of protein interactions.

Introduction

Plasmids are short extrachromosomal DNA elements that are typically circular and with variable copy numbers. Conjugative plasmids possess machinery enabling horizontal gene transfer (HGT) between bacterial cells, a key mechanism of bacterial evolution. Plasmid DNA may also transfer infrequently between cells by transformation, vesicles and phages (Canosi et al 1982, Erdmann et al 2017, Zhang et al 2018, Wein & Dagan 2020). This allows plasmid-encoded genes to move between bacterial cells in the same niche (Wein et al 2021), where these genes may allow new phenotypes (Norman et al 2009, Downing 2015, Hall et al 2017, Decano et al 2020). Plasmid-encoded genes encode a wide range of functions, including antimicrobial resistance (AMR), virulence, metabolism, and symbiosis (Ahmer et al 1999, Stasiak et al 2014, San Millan 2018), facilitating spread into new environmental niches (Niehus et al 2015). Importantly, they depend on the environmental context to be beneficial, such that they can be lost when no longer required (Niehus et al 2015).

Mobile genes form part of the accessory genome, distinct from chromosomal genes that typically compose the core genome (Brockhurst et al 2019), though some chromosomal genes may not be universal within a collection, and so are part of the accessory genome. Some genes can be encoded on both plasmids and chromosomes, and there are numerous instances in which beneficial genes have been mobilised to spread from plasmids to chromosomes, such as *bla*CTX-M-15 (Agyekum et al 2016, Huang et al 2017, Irrgang et al 2017, Decano et al 2019a, Decano et al 2019b, Yoon et al 2020, Ludden et al 2020, Bevan et al 2021, Shawa et al 2021). In this study, we examined the broad patterns across bacteria using the categorisation of plasmid-encoded versus chromosomal.

Plasmids impose a metabolic fitness cost on their host cells (San Millan & MacLean 2017, Baltrus 2013, Harrison & Brockhurst 2012) and yet persist widely thanks to infectious spread, stability mechanisms, and chromosomal compensatory mutations (Stalder et al 2017). Plasmids are genetically very diverse, and this is paralleled by extensive variation in AMR gene profiles across bacteria (Ho et al 2020, Coelho et al 2021). The co-evolution of plasmid-encoded genes with chromosomal ones are consequently of keen interest. This matters because a suitable host-recipient genetic background is needed such that the transferred gene can be acquired and replicated (Forsberg et al 2014, Soucy et al 2015, Andam & Gogarten 2011). In addition, donor & recipient cells may be genetically distinct and yet have high HGT rates (Smillie et al 2011, Brito et al 2016), suggesting additional factors affecting gene and plasmid retention to quantify.

HGT depends on the physiological compatibility so that a plasmid-bourne gene can be expressed and useful in the transconjugant recipient cells by interacting with host proteins in a beneficial manner (Porse et al 2018). The complexity hypothesis (Jain et al 1999, Novick & Doolittle 2020) asserts that protein-protein interaction (PPI) network connectivity and HGT rates are negatively correlated. In line with this, previous work on small sets of protein orthologs has found that less essential genes with higher HGT rates have fewer PPIs (Nakamura et al 2004, Aris-Brosou 2005, Puigbo et al 2010). HGT rates are higher for rarer genes like those in the accessory genome on plasmids, and lower for core genes (Dewar et al 2021, Touchon et al 2020). Moreover, gene context and physical gene distance are related to network proximity (Babu et al 2006) such that accessory genes and newly transferred genes are likely to be peripheral in PPI networks, including plasmid-encoded ones, whereas the chromosomal proteins should be more central.

Plasmid properties vary extensively based on the host cell (De Gelder et al 2007, Dunn et al 2021, Alonso-Del Valle et al 2021, Kottara et al 2018, Sheppard et al 2020, Gama et al 2020, Alderliesten et al 2020), suggesting that the interaction between host chromosomal proteins with plasmid-encoded ones is important. The evidence collated so far implies that chromosomes adapt to plasmids more than the reverse, typically by single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) (Stalder et al 2017, Harrison et al 2015, San Millan et al 2014, Hall et al 2020), but sometimes by larger gene deletions (Modi et al 1991, Porse et al 2016, Lee & Marx 2012). This co-evolution of plasmid-encoded and chromosomal proteins

99   means more systematic approaches to examining the extent to which these proteins interact across
100 bacterial species could provide insights into plasmid-host compatibility.
101
In this study, we assessed the hypothesis that chromosomal and plasmid-encoded genes have different
interaction levels based on the host species, PPI context and PPI connectivity. Using a core dataset of
4,363 bacterial samples, we examined PPI network connectivity using PPI data for all chromosomal
proteins and for plasmid-encoded ones. Importantly, HGT is not strongly affected by gene sequence
composition and features (Porse et al 2018), supporting our simple classification of genes as present or
absent here. We examined the changes in PPI network structure based on changes in indirect
connections when plasmid-encoded proteins enter a host's chromosomal PPI network. We identified
distinctive features associated with plasmid-encoded proteins and their PPIs, assessed their
covariation, and thus provide a pilot study of plasmid-related PPIs s across all bacteria.
111

Methods

Protein-protein interaction data extraction

We retrieved PPI information for all available valid bacterial genomes (n=4,445) from STRING
database v12 (Szklarczyk et al 2021) with R v4.0.1 (R Core Team 2021) and RStudio v2022.2.3.492
(RStudio Team 2022) via Bioconductor v3.11 (Ihaka & Gentleman 1996) and packages Rentrez v1.2.2
(Winter 2017), STRINGdb v2.0.1 (Szklarczyk et al 2018), and StringR v1.4.0 (Wickham 2019)
(Figure 1). Of the initial 4,445 potential samples listed, 22 were not accessible and four had more
>300,000 PPIs, suggesting potential accuracy issues and so they were excluded from analysis. The
valid data (n=4,419 samples) was processed and collated using Dplyr v1.0.8 (Wickham et al 2002),
Forcats v0.5.1 (Wickham 2021), Grid v4.4.1, ReadR v2.1.2 (Wickham et al 2022), Readxl v1.4.0
(Wickham & Bryan 2022), Tibble v3.1.6 (Müller & Wickham 2021), TidyR v1.2.0 (Wickham &
Girlich 2022), Tidyverse v1.3.0 (Wickham et al 2019), VennDiagram v1.7.3 (Chen 2022) and Xlsx
v0.6.0. The total number of unique protein names in the entire dataset was 9,551,828, though the true
number of gene clusters is likely smaller due to name inaccuracy and redundancy. Using a STRINGdb
score threshold of >400, we used this data to compute the numbers of unique proteins and pairwise
PPIs on chromosomes: this score threshold of >400 was used throughout this study. These 4,419 post-
QC samples had 3,628.5±1,710.0 (mean±SD) proteins and a mean of 57,105.8±34,698.6 PPIs each.
Not all data was accessible for 56 samples among these 4,419, leaving 4,363 samples. This and
subsequent data below were visualised with R packages ggplot2 v3.3.5 (Wickham 1996) and ggrepel
v0.9.1 (Slowikowski 2021). All reported p values were corrected for multiple testing using the
Benjamini-Hochberg approach in R.

Figure 1. Summary of data sources and analytical steps. The plasmid resources (top right) and protein-
protein interaction (PPI) data from StringDB were ultimately merged based on gene matches. Plasmid-
encoded genes with PPIs were the focus, and gene prevalence and PPI level per sample were
computed, as well as more general patterns across sample based on a range of complementary
methods. Created with BioRender.com.

The accuracy of gene names in annotation is a pervasive issue where previous work has shown
~46±9% of genes can be functionally assigned (Zhou et al 2021). To explore that limiting factor here,

148 we examined the frequency of four-digit (short) gene names to longer ones with five or more digits,
149 after removing any instances of names ending in an underscore or dash or dot followed by any digit.
150 This showed that these samples had a median of 411±410 short names and a median of 2,931±1,744
151 long names each (Figure S1).
152
153 **Identification of plasmid-encoded genes and interactions across bacteria**
154
To get all available plasmid-encoded genes, we collated 32,839 plasmids: 27,939 from Brooks et al
(2019) and 6,642 from PLSDB (v2020_11_19, Galata et al 2019) and retrieved gene annotation for
each plasmid using Genbankr v1.16.0 (Figure 1). We focused on 16,383 with between two and 640
annotated genes (<640 to avoid chromosome-related contigs). We verified that the plasmids were
annotated as plasmids, including 12 with lengths >2 Mb for *Ralstonia solanacearum* and *Rhizobium*
gallicum. A gene was defined as plasmid-encoded if it had been found on a plasmid originating in the
same species, yielding two categories for genes: plasmid-encoded or chromosomal. These plasmids
had a median of 12 unique annotated genes per plasmid and had 8,941 unique plasmid-encoded genes
across 98,534 unique sample-gene associations (Table S1, see full table FigShare doi:
https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525630). Analyses focused on the 288 samples with at least one
plasmid gene, and the 5,538 plasmid-encoded genes detected in at least one sample here.
166
Next, we identified the numbers of PPIs per protein per sample. A PPI was defined as plasmid-related
if either (or both) protein(s) were found on a plasmid, yielding three categories for proteins:
chromosomal, plasmid-related with one plasmid-linked protein in the pair, or exclusively plasmid-
related where both protein pairs were plasmid-encoded – in practise the latter category was rare and
was not investigated in detail here. The numbers of PPIs in which both proteins were exclusively
chromosomal was large (286,364,425) compared to the totals for plasmid-related PPIs (390,592) and
PPIs exclusively on plasmid-encoded proteins (46,772). This meant the fraction of PPIs that were
plasmid-related was 0.136%, and 0.016% of all PPIs were exclusively plasmid-related, and the
remainder chromosomal (99.86%). In the samples with at least one plasmid-related PPI, we used the
probabilities of having a plasmid-related or chromosomal protein like allele frequencies to compare to
the observed frequencies of plasmid-restricted, plasmid-chromosome and chromosome-restricted PPIs
per sample in a manner analogous to Wright's F-statistic (Wright 1951) as $F = 1 - obs/exp$ where
obs was the fraction of plasmid-chromosome PPIs, and *exp* was twice the product of the frequencies of
plasmid-related and chromosomal proteins. This compared the expected probabilities of plasmid-
restricted, plasmid-chromosome and chromosome-restricted PPIs against the observed rates to test for
structure (or absence thereof) between the plasmid-related and chromosomal proteins.
183
184 We examined the taxonomic classifications of the samples across families, orders, classes and phyla
185 using R package taxize v0.9.98 (Chamberlain et al 2020) to examine their scaled pairwise Euclidean
186 distances of the plasmid presence-absence data in a dendrogram from hierarchical clustering from R
187 packages stats v3.6.2 and dendextend v1.15.2 (Galili 2015). This identified totals of 100 families, 46
188 orders, 20 classes and 10 phyla.
189
190 **Screening for correlated bacterial samples and plasmid-encoded genes**
191
We examined patterns of covariance across the set of the samples and 3,023 plasmid-encoded genes
using three approaches. To resolve highly correlated sets of samples, the 1st assessed genes and
sample-gene pairs using principal components analysis (PCA) implemented with R packages stats
v3.6.2 and factoextra v1.0.7 (Kassambara & Mundt 2020). The 2nd was the distributional semantics
method, latent semantic indexing (LSA): the probabilistic version has been used to examine other
bacteria's drug resistance genomic data previously (Rusakovica et al 2014). Here, it applied a classical
vector space model and singular value decomposition to determine the samples' plasmid-encoded
genes: allocating genes to samples with which they are strongly associated. LSA allocated the samples
across the maximum possible 360 dimensions here, which represented the plasmid-encoded genes.
201

The 3rd approach was non-negative matrix factorisation (NMF) (Lee & Seung 1999) to examine the
associations of individual plasmid-encoded genes with individual bacterial samples using R packages
nmf v0.23.0 (Gaujoux & Seoighe 2010) and Biobase v2.52.0 (Huber 2015). This was applied to 331
samples with at least three plasmid-encoded genes and 1,733 plasmid-encoded genes found in at three
samples as presence-absence data. The optimal rank was determined by examining changes in the
cophenetic correlation coefficient across ranks 4-26 for 10 runs per rank to ensure clustering was stable
and to select the maximum rank that retained a high cophenetic coefficient. This reduced the
complexity of the data per sample to six groups (ranks) (cophenetic correlation coefficient maximised
at 0.971). We also examined the covariation of samples with the PPI levels per gene for 481 samples
and 2,363 plasmid-encoded genes where the input data was the number of PPIs per protein per sample
using NMF as above where each protein had at least 30 PPIs across the sample and each sample had at
least ten PPIs in total. The smaller dataset was due to a number of samples and genes with zero
plasmid-related PPIs. The optimal rank was determined as above, and an estimate of seven groups
(ranks) was obtained (cophenetic correlation coefficient maximised at 0.9856).

Topological data analysis of the bacterial protein-protein interaction networks

We developed computationally efficient metrics to investigate the topology of a PPI network, with in
our focus the PPI network's indirect connectivity. Constructing the Vietoris-Rips complex (Vietoris
1927) on the PPI network allows counting "non-trivial loops": loops made of chains of PPIs (the PPIs
are the edges of our Vietoris-Rips complex), such that some of the proteins involved were not directly
connected to each other by a PPI. A pair of such proteins was then indirectly connected by two chains
of PPIs along the loop (each obtained by starting from one protein and following the loop in one of the
two directions until reaching the protein which was not directly connected to it by a PPI). For this
reason, we called a non-trivial loop an "indirect connection".

The number of indirect connections and the number of PPIs are positively correlated, and previously
we observed that the ratio of these two (number of indirect connections divided by number of PPIs)
varies only moderately when we varied the StringDB combined score threshold, which modified the
PPI network topology by reducing the number of PPIs (Decano et al 2020). If the indirect connectivity
of the PPI network was defined as this ratio for one score threshold, it would lose information about
the strength of the PPIs. Therefore, we introduced here a measurement which takes the PPI network
topologies at all thresholds into account; we called it the Persistent Maximum of Non-trivial Loops per
Edge (PMNLE). This is the maximal ratio (number of indirect connections divided by number of PPIs)
which was reached or exceeded across an interval of at least 100 score thresholds. Measuring the
PMNLE by calculating the indirect connections at all score thresholds was computationally inefficient,
so to reduce the ecological impact and computation time 20-fold, we used an approximate PMNLE
(aPMNLE), which was the PMNLE measured only at score thresholds from 400 to 900 with a step of
20. For 16 samples, the scaled deviation between the PMNLE and aPMNLE was small at just 0.02%
with a standard deviation of 0.25% (Table S2).

The PPI networks of the 491 samples with plasmid-encoded proteins were analysed with all proteins,
and then with chromosomal ones only. This used a specialised open-source tool (Rahm 2019) that
constructed the two-dimensional part of the Vietoris-Rips complex by registering the trios of proteins
(namely, triangles consisting of three proteins connected to one another by three PPIs) and then ran
sparse matrix computations with the LinBox library (with LinBox v1.1.6) to obtain the 1st Betti
number, which is the number of indirect connections, and the 0th Betti number, which is the number of
connected components (subnetworks of the PPI network in which each pair of proteins is joined by a
chain of PPIs - hence there is no chain of PPIs joining two distinct connected components).
Additionally, we use the numbers of PPIs, trios, connected components and indirect connections
computed at the combined score threshold 400 for comparison: where unstated, the combined score
threshold used was 400. In many bacteria's PPI networks, the purely chromosomal part determined the
indirect connectivity, i.e., if the aPMNLE for the full PPI network was similar to the aPMNLE of the
chromosomal PPI network, then the influence of the plasmids on the aPMNLE was negligible. We

examined the difference of the former minus the latter of these two aPMNLE values, which we scaled by the aPMNLE of the full PPI network to measure the percentage change when plasmid-linked proteins were removed. The aPMNLE was associated with the numbers of PPIs per sample ($r=0.42$, $p=8e-182$).

Results

We retrieved PPI data from StringDB to compare the properties of plasmid-encoded versus chromosomal proteins, with a view to the potential compatibility and signals of co-evolution for plasmid-chromosome combinations. This focused on the numbers of chromosome-linked PPIs, plasmid-associated PPIs, taxonomical classification based on plasmid gene profiles, relative rate of PPIs, indirect connections, and the effect on PPI network structure.

A positive correlation between the numbers of proteins and the numbers of interactions

We examined the association between the numbers of proteins and PPIs across representatives spanning 4,363 valid bacterial samples based on their unique annotated proteins on StringDB. As expected, the numbers of proteins and PPIs was highly correlated (adjusted r=0.914, p=5.2e-15) (Figure 2, Table S3 – see full data at FigShare https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525708). This suggested that larger chromosomes have more proteins and thus PPIs. It also suggested variation in protein and PPI numbers across bacteria did not skew the association between the numbers of proteins and PPIs, enabling evaluation of features of plasmid-encoded proteins in different samples combinations in more detail.

Figure 2. The number of proteins per bacterial genome (x-axis) was highly predictive of the number of PPIs (y-axis) (adjusted r^2=0.835). The data was for 4,363 bacterial samples, each of which is shown by a blue dot, with a linear model line of best fit shown in red.

Distinct patterns of plasmid-encoded gene retention across bacterial samples

We compared these 4,363 samples' PPI data with the set of 8,941 unique plasmid-linked genes where a gene was defined as plasmid-encoded if it was detected on a plasmid from the same species. 66.2% (5,918) of these genes were not detected, yielding 3,023 detected genes. 491 samples (11.2%) had plasmid-encoded genes, leaving 88.8% (3,872) samples with no such genes detected. In this set of 491, the median number of samples in which a plasmid-encoded gene was found was three (interquartile range four, Figure 3A), and the median number of plasmid-encoded genes per sample was five, with an interquartile range of 12 (Figure 3B). The fraction of plasmid-encoded genes per sample was 0.65±2.5% (27±112 out of 3,927±1,367, mean±SD) in these 491 (Figure 3). Six *E. coli* had a median of 1,035 plasmid-encoded genes per sample and were the only samples with over 400 plasmid-encoded

genes. These results illustrated that most plasmid-encoded genes were rare, with few common ones, and that widely shared plasmid-encoded genes were unusual (Figure S2, see full figure FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525453).

Figure 3. Left: The number of samples in which each plasmid-encoded gene (red) was found was generally small with a median of five. Right: The number of plasmid-encoded genes per sample (grey) had a median of three, including six *E. coli* samples with a median of 1,035 plasmid-encoded genes per sample that represent all samples with >400 genes. These figures excluded samples with no plasmid-encoded genes.

Plasmid-encoded genes are structured and reflect taxonomic groups

The samples were clustered by similarity based on their binary 3,023 unique plasmid-encoded gene data (presence-absence). Taxonomic classifications across the 100 families, 46 orders, 20 classes and ten phyla in these 491 samples showed that the *Enterobacteriaceae* were the most diverse family (n=24 samples, Z=1.49), and that the *Enterobacterales* (n=57, Z=0.77) was the most variable order, with limited changes at the class and order levels. Overall, the plasmid-encoded gene profiles per taxonomic group did not yield an informative taxonomic resolution (Figure S3, see full figure FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525435).

Evidence for this low overall covariation came from PCA of this data where six *E. coli* and three *Ralstonia solanacearum* samples explained most variation across PC1 (34.5%) and PC2 (5.6%) (Figure S4A). These six *E. coli* had far more plasmid-encoded genes compared to the sample with the next highest number (*Ralstonia solanacearum* PSI07 with 347), which in turn exceeded the other samples substantially. Excluding these nine divergent *E. coli* and *R. solanacearum* samples, the remaining 482 samples' PC1 had 7.0% of variation and PC2 had 5.0% (Figure S4C). The plasmid-encoded proteins had a similar rate of covariation across all 491 samples where 16.8% of variation was allocated to PC1, and 14.9% to PC2 (Figure S4B), with higher heterogeneity in the 482 samples (6.8% to PC1, 4.9% to PC2, Figure S4D, see full figure at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525465, and data at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525471). These patterns were largely recapitulated by LSA of

349 all samples, which showed limited variation across the 1st (10.0% of variation) and 2nd (4.1% of
350 variation) dimensions (Figure S5).
351
352 **Plasmid-encoded proteins are rare and collectively interact with diverse chromosomal proteins**
353
We examined the samples' 3,023 unique plasmid-encoded proteins to identify PPIs where one or both
proteins were plasmid-related (termed plasmid-related PPIs here, see data at FigShare doi:
https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19672527) to distinguish them from chromosomal PPIs where no
plasmid-encoded proteins were found, and we also tracked the rarer category of plasmid-related PPIs
where both protein pairs were plasmid-encoded (see data per sample at shorturl.at/mtFNZ). Overall, as
a percentage of all PPIs, plasmid-related PPIs constituted a median of 0.35±4.76% (mean±SD) PPIs
per sample, including 0.02% of all PPIs exclusively involving plasmid-encoded proteins. 3,874
samples had zero detected plasmid-related PPIs, 489 samples had at least one plasmid-related PPI (two
samples had one plasmid-encoded protein with no PPIs). These 489 samples had a median of 169 PPIs
where at least one protein was plasmid-related and a median of 53,947±27,590 chromosomal PPIs per
sample, which was comparable to the rate for all samples (48,834±46,615, Table S3). Their total
number of plasmid-related PPIs had no clear association with the numbers of proteins per sample
(r=0.05), but did with the numbers of chromosomal PPIs per sample (r=0.27, Figure S6). Of these 489
samples, 283 had at least one PPI involving only plasmid-encoded proteins, with a median of five such
PPIs.
369
We examined the plasmid-gene associations across 331 samples that had at least three of the 1,733
plasmid-encoded proteins detected in at least three samples using NMF (Figure S7). This allocated
these samples and proteins to six distinct groups based on their pattern of plasmid-encoded protein
sharing (Figure S8, see full figure at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525492), and
the proteins to these same six groups as mixture coefficients based on their prevalence in the samples
(Figure S9, see full figure at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.1952559). There were
just five samples in rank 3 that were five *E. coli* (all bar *E. coli* 536)*,* which was far below the mean
number of samples per rank (77.3, Figure S10). These were associated with 1,065 plasmid-encoded
genes, far above the average number of proteins per rank (526.2, Figure S11).
379
Similarly, we investigated 2,363 plasmid-encoded proteins' associations based on PPI rates across the
same 481 samples where each protein had >30 PPIs and each sample had >10 PPIs. This allocated
these samples and proteins to seven distinct groups based on their pattern of PPI numbers (Figure S12,
see full figure at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19611276), and these same proteins
to the seven groups as mixture coefficients based on their PPI numbers for each sample (Figure S13,
see full figure at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19611282). Like above, all six *E.*
coli (including *E. coli* 536) were the sole members of a rank (five), and corresponded to 238 proteins'
PPI rates as mixture coefficients (Figure S14), which again was more than the average number of PPI
rates associated with each rank (748, Figure S15).
389
390 **Plasmid-encoded proteins have two-fold higher rates of protein-protein interactions**
391
The mean number of PPIs per protein was 2.2-fold higher for plasmid-related proteins compared to
chromosomal ones using data for all samples, though with large variations (n=13,348 plasmid-related
proteins in 491 samples: 39.0±35.0 vs n=15,450,151 chromosomal proteins in 4,363 samples:
17.6±5.7, mean±SD, t-test p=4.8e-16, Figure 4). This was not due to artefacts in the 489 samples with
plasmid-related PPIs: their rate of chromosomal PPIs at 14.8±3.7 PPIs per protein was similar to the
other samples (Table S3, see data at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19575820).
However, this effect was protein-specific and not consistently discriminatory because these different
groups overlapped considerably (Figure 4C), implying that genomic context was not a major
determinant of PPI rates, and plasmid-related proteins simply had a wider range of PPI levels. To
control for the high variation in PPI rates per plasmid-related protein, we found that 19% (65 out of
345) of samples with sufficient numbers of plasmid-related proteins and PPIs to test quantitatively had

plasmid-encoded proteins with much higher PPI rates per sample (t-test p<0.05), including all six *E.*
coli (Figure S16, see data at FigShare doi: https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.20230299). As an
illustration of PPI network structure, a network centred on the SfmC protein in *E. coli* K12 MG1655
showed high levels of connectivity amongst 20 other proteins (Figure S17, Table S4).

Figure 4. The average number of PPIs per (A) plasmid-related protein (green, 39.0±35.0, mean±SD)
was higher than that for (B) chromosomal proteins (purple, 17.6±5.7), but (C) there was no consistent
evidence for a consistent difference in PPI rates between these two groups (plasmid-related proteins in
green, chromosomal proteins in purple – note log10-scaled y-axis and minor differences in binning per
plot).

Nearly all (>99%) plasmid-encoded proteins had a PPI with a chromosomal protein, whereas only 7%
of plasmid-encoded proteins had a PPI with another plasmid protein in the 489 samples with at least
one plasmid-related PPI. Using the plasmid protein frequency information above, we tested for
structure between plasmid-related proteins and chromosomal ones based on the rates of intergroup
PPIs in a manner analogous to Wright's F-statistic to quantify the difference between the observed and
expected levels of plasmid-chromosome and plasmid-specific PPIs per sample (Wright 1951). We
found a relatively higher rate of plasmid-plasmid PPIs compared to plasmid-chromosome PPIs, which
in turn were much higher than chromosomal PPIs (Figure S18). This suggested that plasmid-encoded
proteins tended to interact with other plasmid proteins more often than would be expected by chance,
indicating PPI network separation of plasmid-encoded and chromosomal proteins. Moreover,

Protein-protein interaction networks are generally robust to the loss of plasmid proteins

To examine the effect of plasmid-encoded proteins on PPI network topology, we examined the
aPMNLE for all proteins and for chromosomal proteins only, such that the difference between these
aPMNLE values indicated plasmid-driven effects (Figure S19). The aPMNLE reflects indirect (or
secondary) connections, which may be reduced when plasmid-related proteins are removed if there are
no alternate paths between remaining chromosomal proteins. However, if there are many PPI paths
between chromosomal proteins, then this high indirect connectivity may indicate robustness within the
PPI network such that the elimination of plasmid-related proteins has no effect (plasmid-related
proteins thus have few indirect connections). Moreover, if plasmid-related proteins tend toward the
PPI network periphery, the total number of indirect connections may not change relative to a larger
drop in the numbers of PPIs, again indicating plasmid-related proteins had few indirect connections. In
contrast, if plasmid-related proteins are central and mixed among chromosomal proteins in the PPI

network, the number of indirect connections and numbers of PPIs will be closely correlated (here, plasmid-related proteins have proportional indirect connection rates).

A majority of samples (96.3%, 471 out of 489 samples) showed no substantive differences in aPMNLE values between all proteins versus chromosomal ones alone, indicating that plasmid-encoded proteins had no large effects on the PPI network structure even though the plasmid-related proteins contributed large numbers of PPIs, consistent with robust networks. This was consistent with the idea that for these 471 samples the plasmid-encoded proteins overall had comparable indirect connection rates with the chromosomal proteins, but perhaps higher relative PPI rates because no evidence of excessive indirect connection numbers was observed.

3.7% (18 out of 489) samples had an aPMNLE for all proteins (including plasmid-encoded ones) exceeding the chromosomal aPMNLE by two standard deviations, indicating that plasmid-encoded proteins increased the indirect connection rates and that these PPI networks were less robust. No samples had a chromosomal aPMNLE that was two standard deviations above the full network aPMNLE, so no plasmid-encoded protein set strongly increased the rate of indirect connections per sample. When compared to the other 471 samples with plasmid genes, these 18 had altered aPMNLE values for chromosomal proteins (t-test p=4.9e-5) but not for all proteins (p=0.82, Figure S20). Furthermore, if the plasmid-encoded proteins were included for each sample, the number of PPI network connected components grew by 71% for the 471 samples with robust networks, whereas for these 18 samples with less robust networks it grew by 327%, indicating that these plasmid-encoded proteins had high PPI rates, fewer indirect connections and were often disconnected from the main network. We also observed these 18 had fewer genes per sample compared to the larger set of 471 (2,314±1,429 vs 4,013±1,336, mean±SD), perhaps because smaller genomes have fewer PPIs overall and so were less robust to plasmid-related protein removal.

To quantify the extent to which plasmid-encoded proteins increased PPI rates but not indirect connections, we compared the correlation between plasmid-related proteins and PPIs per sample in the 489 samples with plasmid-related PPIs, which were positively correlated (r=0.51, p=1e-143, Figure 5A). However, increasing the number of plasmid-encoded proteins did not have the same magnitude of effect on the number of indirect connections per sample (r=0.06, p=1, Figure 5B). Similarly, the latter was negatively associated with the number of plasmid-related PPIs (r=-0.08, p=0.30, Figure 5C). The partial correlations for each pair of variables were similar (0.86, 0.04, -0.10, respectively). For example, the 69 plasmid-encoded proteins of *Serratia marcescens* subsp. marcescens Db11 had 92 plasmid-plasmid PPIs with one another and an additional 2,214 plasmid-chromosome PPIs with (an average of 33.4 PPIs per plasmid protein), compared to 58,857 chromosomal PPIs among the 4,614 chromosomal proteins (12.8 PPIs per chromosomal protein, Table S4, Figure S21). Overall, this implied that plasmid-related proteins tended to be at the PPI network periphery connected to chromosomal proteins, and not mixed usually with the main chromosomal proteins in the PPI networks.

Plasmid-related proteins are generally peripheral to PPI networks

Given that plasmid-related proteins purported to be highly connected but not central to PPI networks mainly composed of chromosomal proteins, we scaled the numbers of indirect connections by protein. We observed a trimodal pattern of indirect connections per protein. In the 489 samples with plasmid-related PPIs, the chromosomal proteins had more indirect connections per protein than plasmid-encoded proteins (average per sample 3.7±2.1 vs 0.9±0.6, t-test p=5.2e-15). Moreover, the indirect connections per protein in these 489 was positively correlated with the number of PPIs per sample for chromosomal (r=0.61, Figure 6A) but not all proteins (r=0.02) due to the effect of plasmid-encoded proteins, confirming that the latter tended not to be mixed among the PPI networks. The chromosomal proteins of those 489 samples in turn had a lower level of indirect connections per protein compared to the 3,874 samples without plasmid-related PPIs (average per sample 3.7±2.1 vs 5.5±3.1, t-test p=5.2e-15). The latter 3,874 samples had higher levels of indirect connections that were positively correlated with the PPIs per sample like the 489's chromosomal proteins (Figure 6B).

497
498
Figure 5. The (A) log10-scaled numbers of plasmid-related proteins per sample (x-axis) was positively
correlated with the numbers of plasmid PPIs per sample (y-axis) (black, r=0.51) in the 489 samples
with plasmid-related PPIs, but less so with (B) the change in the numbers of indirect connections per
sample due to the inclusion of the plasmid-encoded proteins (blue, r=0.06). (C) The log10-scaled
numbers of plasmid PPIs per sample (x-axis) was negatively associated with the numbers of indirect
connections per sample due to the inclusion of the plasmid-encoded proteins (green, r=-0.08). The
lines of best fit for each plot shows the linear correlation of the number of PPIs per sample with the
number of indirect connections per protein. The histograms indicate the marginal densities per axis for
each dataset.
508
509

510
511
Figure 6. The number of PPIs per sample (x-axis) was positively correlated with the number of
indirect connections per protein for (A) chromosomal (red, r=0.61) but not all proteins (including
plasmid-encoded ones, blue, r=0.02) in the 489 samples with plasmid-encoded proteins. (B) The other
samples with no plasmid-encoded proteins had positive correlations (green, r=0.63 and r=0.67) though
with a bimodal pattern (groups of n=2,415 and n=1,336). The lines of best fit for each plot shows the
linear correlation of the number of PPIs per sample with the number of indirect connections per
protein. The histograms indicate the marginal densities per axis for each dataset.

Plasmid-related proteins had a median of 4.4-fold fewer indirect connections per sample than
chromosomal proteins in the set of 489 samples (Figure 7A). We also observed that additional
plasmid-chromosome PPIs constituted 89.7% of all PPIs in these 489, and 93% of plasmid-encoded
proteins had no plasmid-related PPIs. To explain this, consider a PPI network where part of it had four
chromosomal proteins (A, B, C, D) sharing PPIs A-B, B-C, C-D and D-A, so it has one indirect
connection (with a path A-B-C-D, Figure S22). If we added a plasmid protein P to this network such
that it had PPIs with all four proteins, the indirect connection across A-B-C-D would be lost but the
network would gain four PPIs. An alternative model where A, B, C and D had no PPIs with one
another would be less likely because then the addition of P would create PPIs and more indirect
connections, which was not observed in our findings. In addition, if A, B, C and D interact with P then
it is more likely that they are both functionally related and interact with one another.

Finally, we assessed the numbers of PPI network connected components for all proteins versus
chromosomal ones: the latter had fewer connected components compared to all proteins in the 489
samples with plasmid-related PPIs (50.0±34.6 vs 227±95.9, median±SD, Figure 7B). The numbers of
proteins per connected component was more strongly associated with the chromosomal proteins than
for all proteins in relation to the numbers of PPIs (r=0.35 vs 0.01), chromosome-related PPIs (r=0.35
vs 0.00), and proteins per sample (r=0.18 vs 0.00) but not plasmid-related PPIs (r=0.04 vs 0.00, Figure
S23) in these 489. Additionally, these 489 samples had far more connected components compared to
3,872 samples without plasmid-related PPIs (means 222.4 vs 40.5, t-test p=4.8e-15). This highlighted
that when there were more PPIs and proteins present, chromosomal proteins were spread across fewer
connected components, whereas plasmid proteins could be found in more separate connected
components.

Figure 7. The log10-scaled numbers of (A) indirect connections (blue) and (B) connected components
(green) for all (chromosomal and plasmid) proteins (x-axis) related to chromosomal proteins only (y-
axis) for the 489 samples with plasmid-related PPIs. The red lines show the expected rate if (A) the
numbers of indirect connections for all proteins and chromosomal proteins were identical and (B) the
numbers of connected components for all proteins and chromosomal proteins were identical. (A) The
blue line shows the correlation between the numbers of indirect connections for all proteins and
chromosomal proteins (>98% of samples had more indirect connections when plasmid-related proteins
were omitted). (B) The green line shows the correlation between the numbers of connected
components for all proteins and chromosomal proteins (>97% of samples had more connected
components when plasmid-related proteins were retained).

Discussion

Bacterial genome structure has been shaped by HGT more so than gene duplication in many species, such as *E. coli* (Lercher & Pál 2008, Price et al 2008). Mobile plasmid-encoded genes can endow host cells with new phenotypes, including those linked to changed adhesion, AMR and virulence (Lipworth et al 2022), and their fitness effects are associated with specific genetic, regulatory and protein interactions (Hall et al 2017). To further our understanding of how new plasmid-encoded proteins can affect the structure and signalling bacterial PPI networks, we compared the PPI profiles of plasmid-linked and chromosomal proteins across 4,363 representative samples of well-characterised bacteria using data from StringDB to find 491 samples with evidence of plasmid-encoded genes within the same species.

We found that the number of proteins per sample was correlated with the number of PPIs, as anticipated. This allowed further exploration to compare plasmid-encoded proteins with chromosomal ones. Most plasmid-encoded proteins were rare across bacteria, and the total fraction of the genome they constituted varied extensively. We defined plasmid-related PPIs as PPIs where at least one of the interacting proteins had previously been observed on a contig labelled as a plasmid within the same species, separate from chromosomal PPIs where neither protein was plasmid-linked. Only 11.2% of samples (489 out of 4,363) had plasmid-related proteins and PPIs. Even in these samples, plasmid-related genes made up only 0.65% of all genes detected and thus were rare. As a consequence, plasmid-related PPIs made up only 0.14% of all PPIs, and PPIs that were exclusively plasmid-related were very rare (0.016%).

Plasmid-encoded proteins covaried with one another depending on the genetic background of the host cell such that the clustering the samples based on their plasmid-encoded gene similarity identified six groups of covarying plasmid-encoded proteins and bacterial samples, including a specific one for *E. coli* alone. This aligned with existing expectations of plasmid-host co-evolution (Loftie-Eaton et al 2017, Jordt et al 2020). The *Enterobacterales* was the clearly the most variable order, but overall known taxonomical differences were not apparent. Similarly, the PPI rates per protein per sample had even less taxonomical resolution power, showing that the numbers of PPIs per protein was typically a more dynamic feature.

The complexity hypothesis (Jain et al 1999) asserts that proteins undergoing HGT have fewer PPIs and operational cellular processes rather than not informational ones like transcription or translation (Rivera et al 1998, Jain et al 1999, Jain et al 2002). It has been asserted that proteins with many PPIs are less likely to undergo HGT (Wellner et al 2007, Price et al 2008, Cohen et al 2011), but we found that plasmid-linked proteins had two-fold more PPIs on average. Nonetheless, the predictive power of this across chromosomal versus plasmid-related proteins was low, suggesting that there is no intrinsic difference in PPI rates between these groups of proteins. Nuances to the complexity hypothesis have been found before: firstly, the being in a protein complex versus HGT chances (Wellner et al 2007); secondly, the effect of cellular component state, function complexity and function conservation on adaptive evolution potential (Aris-Brosou 2005); thirdly, HGT-linked genes have higher numbers of regulatory factors (Price et al 2008); and fourthly, PPI connectivity has a large effect for proteins with a similar function (Cohen et al 2011). Notably, many previous studies have focused on conserved orthologs, whose genomic contexts and features may differ from genes that are more mobile. Consequently, operational versus informational processes, complex protein functions, an intracellular location, an ancient essential function, and host-recipient genetic distance may be more dominant factors in determining PPI rates than HGT given our results here. An important caveat is that the general trends we observed may not hold for all genera, families or orders.

We found that plasmid-related proteins interacted with large numbers of other chromosomal and plasmid proteins. However, plasmid-related proteins contributed much less indirect (aka secondary) connections, unlike chromosomal proteins. We found evidence of PPI network structure between chromosomal and plasmid-encoded proteins, finding that plasmid proteins had a higher rate of plasmid

rather than chromosomal protein partners than expected. In addition, by using the aPMNLE as a measure of indirect connections, most samples with plasmid-related PPIs (>96%) were robust to the loss of plasmid-encoded proteins. The samples with networks more affected by plasmid-related protein loss had smaller genomes, and thus less redundancy in PPI network paths. Altogether, this was consistent with existing assertions that plasmid-encoded proteins tend to be at the periphery of a PPI network (Lercher & Pál 2008, Price et al 2008), perhaps because plasmids seldom encode essential proteins (Wein et al 2021), though gene essentiality depends on the host (Rousset et al 2021).

Our findings were limited by a number of issues. Firstly, our analysis was based on gene name similarity with the assumption that the redundancy in the annotated plasmid gene names would help alleviate the imprecision in gene naming systems, but this did not mitigate fully the limitation that some proteins were likely misclassified as chromosomal or plasmid-encoded. Secondly, many plasmids and bacterial samples are not annotated consistently, so many gene name matches were undoubtedly missed. Thirdly, we assumed that previous studies' labelling of large contigs as plasmids was correct: we made this (and all other) data accessible so that revisions to plasmid annotation could be made in light of the high number of genes (>500) in certain plasmids (see Table S1): sequence-based plasmid detection tools could help with this task. Fourthly, we obtained gene name data per sample from StringDB (Szklarczyk et al 2018, Szklarczyk et al 2021), and yet 5,918 plasmid-encoded genes were not detected in these samples, which highlighted imprecision either in the plasmid annotation, the sample annotation or (most likely) both. Fifthly, we did not perform sequence alignment nor read mapping to confirm at the sequence level matches, which is a next step following this work. Future work is needed to improve plasmid annotation, genome annotation, contig classification as plasmid or chromosomal and conduct gene comparisons at the sequence level. Future investigations of the effects of plasmid-encoded and chromosomal proteins on PPI networks should focus on specific samples that have known plasmid compositions.

Acknowledgements

The authors thanks Min Jie Lee for certain R code contributions.

Author Contributions

TD – Conceptualization, Methodology, Software, Formal analysis, Investigation, Data Curation, Writing - Original Draft, Writing - Review & Editing, Visualisation, Project administration. AR – Methodology, Software, Formal analysis, Writing - Review & Editing. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

Competing Interests Statement

The authors declare no competing interests.

Data Availability Statement:

Item	Brief description	FigShare link
Table S1	Plasmid-encoded genes and their associated plasmid link(s)	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525630
Table S3	Key features of the bacterial samples	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525708
Figure S2	Heatmap of the bacterial plasmid-encoded genes	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525453
Figure S3	Dendrogram of the bacteria based on plasmid-encoded gene similarity	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525435
Figure S5	Heatmap of the bacteria and plasmid-encoded genes alphabetically sorted	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525465

Data for Figure S5	Presence-absence data with bacteria as rows and genes as columns	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525471
Figure S8	NMF heatmap of the metasample clustering of plasmid genes	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525492
Figure S9	NMF heatmap of the mixture coefficient for the plasmid-encoded genes	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19525591
Figure S12	NMF heatmap of the metasample clustering of plasmid PPI rates	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19611276
Figure S13	NMF heatmap of the mixture coefficient for the plasmid-related PPI rates	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19611282
Data for all PPI analysis	4,363 samples' CSV files for all proteins with gene name, plasmid status and the total number of PPIs per sample	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.19672527
Data for chrom PPI analysis	4,363 samples' CSV files for each sample showing PPIs, associated genes and StringDB identifiers	shorturl.at/mtFNZ
Data for Figure S16	The numbers of chromosomal & plasmid genes for 343 as PDF image files.	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.20230299

653
654 Large datasets available from this study on FigShare, showing the item, description and the
655 corresponding DOI link. See the Supplementary Data for more. The code associated with this paper is
656 available on Github at https://github.com/downingtim/mobilome_2022 and
657 https://github.com/arahm/HomologyLive and data files are there at
658 https://figshare.com/projects/Bacteria_mobilome_2022/136720.
659

References

Agyekum A, et al. 2016. blaCTX-M-15 carried by IncF-type plasmids is the dominant ESBL gene in
Escherichia coli and Klebsiella pneumoniae at a hospital in Ghana. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis.
84(4):328-33. doi: 10.1016/j.diagmicrobio.2015.12.010
Ahmer BM, et al. 1999. The virulence plasmid of Salmonella typhimurium is self-transmissible. J.
Bacteriol. 181, 1364–1368
Alderliesten JB, et al. 2020. Effect of donor-recipient relatedness on the plasmid conjugation
frequency: a meta-analysis. BMC Microbiol. 20(1):135. doi: 10.1186/s12866-020-01825-4
Alonso-Del Valle A, et al. 2021. Variability of plasmid fitness effects contributes to plasmid
persistence in bacterial communities. Nat Commun. 12(1):2653. doi: 10.1038/s41467-021-
22849-y
Anda, M. et al. 2015. Bacterial clade with the ribosomal RNA operon on a small plasmid rather than
the chromosome. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA 112, 14343–14347.
Andam CP, Gogarten JP. 2011. Biased gene transfer in microbial evolution. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 9,
543–555
Aris-Brosou S. 2005. Determinants of adaptive evolution at the molecular level: the extended
complexity hypothesis. Mol Biol Evol. 22(2):200-9. doi: 10.1093/molbev/msi00
Babu M, et al. 2006. Evolutionary dynamics of prokaryotic transcriptional regulatory networks.
Journal of molecular biology 358:614-633
Baltrus DA. 2013. Exploring the costs of horizontal gene transfer. Trends Ecol Evol. 28(8):489-95.
doi: 10.1016/j.tree.2013.04.002
Bevan ER, et al. 2021. Molecular characterization of plasmids encoding blaCTX-M from faecal
Escherichia coli in travellers returning to the UK from South Asia. J Hosp Infect. 114:134-143.
doi: 10.1016/j.jhin.2021.03.030
Brinkmann H, et al. 2018. Horizontal operon transfer, plasmids, and the evolution of photosynthesis in
Rhodobacteraceae. ISME J. 12, 1994–2010.

Brito IL, et al. 2016. Mobile genes in the human microbiome are structured from global to individual
scales. Nature. 2016 535(7612):435–439
Brockhurst MA, Harrison E, Hall JPJ, Richards T, McNally A, MacLean C. 2019. The Ecology and
Evolution of Pangenomes. Curr Biol. 29(20):R1094-R1103. doi: 10.1016/j.cub.2019.08.012
Brooks L, Kaze M, Sistrom M. A Curated, Comprehensive Database of Plasmid Sequences. Microbiol
Resour Announc. 2019 8(1):e01325-18. doi: 10.1128/MRA.01325-18
Canosi U, Lüder G, Trautner TA. SPP1-mediated plasmid transduction. J Virol. 1982 44(2):431-6. doi:
10.1128/JVI.44.2.431-436.1982
Carattoli, A. 2009. Resistance plasmid families in Enterobacteriaceae. Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.
53, 2227–2238.
Chamberlain S, et al. 2020. taxize: Taxonomic information from around the web. R package version
0.9.98, https://github.com/ropensci/taxize.
Chen H. 2022. VennDiagram: Generate High-Resolution Venn and Euler Plots. R package version
1.7.3. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=VennDiagram
Coelho LP, et al. 2021. Towards the biogeography of prokaryotic genes. Nature doi:
https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-04233-4
Cohen O, et al. 2011. The complexity hypothesis revisited: connectivity rather than function
constitutes a barrier to horizontal gene transfer. Mol. Biol. Evol. 28, 1481–1489
Cohen O, Gophna U, Pupko T. 2011. The complexity hypothesis revisited: connectivity rather than
function constitutes a barrier to horizontal gene transfer. Mol Biol Evol. 28(4):1481-9. doi:
10.1093/molbev/msq333
De Gelder L, Ponciano JM, Joyce P, Top EM. 2007. Stability of a promiscuous plasmid in different
hosts: no guarantee for a long-term relationship. Microbiology (Reading). 153(Pt 2):452-463.
doi: 10.1099/mic.0.2006/001784-0
Decano AG, Downing T. 2019. An Escherichia coli ST131 pangenome atlas reveals population
structure and evolution across 4,071 isolates. Scientific Reports doi: 10.1038/s41598-019-
54004-5
Decano AG, et al. 2019. Complete assembly of Escherichia coli ST131 genomes using long reads
demonstrates antibiotic resistance gene variation within diverse plasmid and chromosomal
contexts. mSphere doi: 10.1128/mSphere.00130-19
Decano AG, et al. 2020. Plasmids shape the diverse accessory resistomes of Escherichia coli ST131.
Access Microbiology doi: 10.1099/acmi.0.000179
Dewar AE, et al. 2021. Plasmids do not consistently stabilize cooperation across bacteria but may
promote broad pathogen host-range. Nat Ecol Evol. 5(12):1624-1636. doi: 10.1038/s41559-
021-01573-2
Downing T. 2015. Tackling drug resistant infection outbreaks of global pandemic Escherichia coli
ST131 using evolutionary and epidemiological genomics. Microorganisms 3(2):236-267.
Dunn S, Carrilero L, Brockhurst M, McNally A. 2021. Limited and Strain-Specific Transcriptional and
Growth Responses to Acquisition of a Multidrug Resistance Plasmid in Genetically Diverse
Escherichia coli Lineages. mSystems. 6(2):e00083-21. doi: 10.1128/mSystems.00083-21
Erdmann S, Tschitschko B, Zhong L, Raftery MJ, Cavicchioli R. A plasmid from an Antarctic
haloarchaeon uses specialized membrane vesicles to disseminate and infect plasmid-free cells.
Nat Microbiol. 2017 2(10):1446-1455. doi: 10.1038/s41564-017-0009-2
Forsberg KJ, et al. 2014. Bacterial phylogeny structures soil resistomes across habitats. Nature
509:612-616
Galata V, Fehlmann T, Backes C, Keller A. PLSDB: a resource of complete bacterial plasmids.
Nucleic Acids Res. 2019 47(D1):D195-D202. doi: 10.1093/nar/gky1050
Gama JA, Kloos J, Johnsen PJ, Samuelsen Ø. 2020. Host dependent maintenance of a blaNDM-1-
encoding plasmid in clinical Escherichia coli isolates. Sci Rep. 10(1):9332. doi:
10.1038/s41598-020-66239-8
Galili T. 2015. dendextend: an R package for visualizing, adjusting, and comparing trees of
hierarchical clustering. Bioinformatics. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btv428
Gaujoux R, Seoighe C. 2010. A flexible R package for nonnegative matrix factorization. BMC
Bioinformatics 11:367

Hall JPJ, Brockhurst MA, Harrison E. 2017. Sampling the mobile gene pool: innovation via horizontal gene transfer in bacteria. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci. 372(1735):20160424. doi: 10.1098/rstb.2016.0424

Hall JPJ, Wright RCT, Guymer D, Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2020. Extremely fast amelioration of plasmid fitness costs by multiple functionally diverse pathways. Microbiology (Reading). 166(1):56-62. doi: 10.1099/mic.0.000862

Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2012. Plasmid-mediated horizontal gene transfer is a coevolutionary process. Trends Microbiol. 2012 20(6):262-7. doi: 10.1016/j.tim.2012.04.003

Harrison E, Guymer D, Spiers AJ, Paterson S, Brockhurst MA. 2015. Parallel compensatory evolution stabilizes plasmids across the parasitism-mutualism continuum. Curr Biol. 25(15):2034-9. doi: 10.1016/j.cub.2015.06.024

Ho J, et al. 2020. Systematic review of human gut resistome studies revealed variable definitions and approaches. Gut Microbes. 12(1):1700755. doi: 10.1080/19490976.2019.1700755

Huang W, et al. 2017. Emergence and Evolution of Multidrug-Resistant Klebsiella pneumoniae with both blaKPC and blaCTX-M Integrated in the Chromosome. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 61(7):e00076-17. doi: 10.1128/AAC.00076-17

Huber VJ, et al. 2015. Orchestrating high-throughput genomic analysis with Bioconductor. W. Huber, V.J. Nature Methods 12:115.

Ihaka R, Gentleman R. 1996. R: A Language for Data Analysis and Graphics. Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics. 1996 (5)3:299-314.

Irrgang A, et al. 2017. CTX-M-15-Producing E. coli Isolates from Food Products in Germany Are Mainly Associated with an IncF-Type Plasmid and Belong to Two Predominant Clonal E. coli Lineages. Front Microbiol. 8:2318. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2017.02318

Jain R, Rivera MC, Lake JA. 1999. Horizontal gene transfer among genomes: the complexity hypothesis. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 96(7):3801–3806.

Jain R, Rivera MC, Moore JE, Lake JA. 2002. Horizontal gene transfer in microbial genome evolution. Theor Popul Biol. 61(4):489-95. doi: 10.1006/tpbi.2002.1596

Jordt H, Stalder T, Kosterlitz O, Ponciano JM, Top EM, Kerr B. 2020. Coevolution of host-plasmid pairs facilitates the emergence of novel multidrug resistance. Nat Ecol Evol. 4(6):863-869. doi: 10.1038/s41559-020-1170-1

Kamil Slowikowski. 2021. ggrepel: Automatically Position Non-Overlapping Text Labels with 'ggplot2'. R package version 0.9.1. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ggrepel

Kassambara A, Mundt F. 2020. factoextra: Extract and Visualize the Results of Multivariate Data Analyses. R package version 1.0.7. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=factoextra

Kottara A, Hall JPJ, Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2018. Variable plasmid fitness effects and mobile genetic element dynamics across Pseudomonas species. FEMS Microbiol Ecol. 94(1):fix172. doi: 10.1093/femsec/fix172

Lee DD, Seung HS. 1999. Learning the parts of objects by non-negative matrix factorization. Nature 401:788–791.

Lee MC, Marx CJ. 2012. Repeated, selection-driven genome reduction of accessory genes in experimental populations. PLoS Genet. 8(5):e1002651. doi: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1002651

Lehtinen S, et al. 2021. Evolutionary mechanisms that determine which bacterial genes are carried on plasmids. Evol. Lett. 5, 290–301

Lercher MJ, Pál C. 2008. Integration of horizontally transferred genes into regulatory interaction networks takes many million years. Mol. Biol. Evol. 25:559

Lipworth S, et al. 2022. The mobilome associated with Gram-negative bloodstream infections: A large-scale observational hybrid sequencing based study. MedRxiv doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.04.03.22273290

Loftie-Eaton W, et al. 2017. Compensatory mutations improve general permissiveness to antibiotic resistance plasmids. Nat Ecol Evol. 1(9):1354-1363. doi: 10.1038/s41559-017-0243-2

Ludden C, Decano AG, et al. 2020. Genomic surveillance of Escherichia coli ST131 identifies local expansion and serial replacement of subclones. Microbial Genomics doi: https://doi.org/10.1099/mgen.0.000352

Manzano-Marin A, et al. 2020. Serial horizontal transfer of vitamin-biosynthetic genes enables the
establishment of new nutritional symbionts in aphids' di-symbiotic systems. ISME J. 14, 259–
273.
Modi RI, Wilke CM, Rosenzweig RF, Adams J. 1991. Plasmid macro-evolution: selection of deletions
during adaptation in a nutrient-limited environment. Genetica. 84(3):195-202. doi:
10.1007/BF00127247
Müller K, Wickham H. 2021. tibble: Simple Data Frames. R package version 3.1.6. https://CRAN.R-
project.org/package=tibble
Nakamura Y, et al. 2004. Biased biological functions of horizontally transferred genes in prokaryotic
genomes. Nat. Genet. 36:760–76
Niehus R, et al. 2015. Migration and horizontal gene transfer divide microbial genomes into multiple
niches. Nat. Commun. 6, 8924
Norman A, Hansen LH, Sørensen SJ. 2009. Conjugative plasmids: vessels of the communal gene pool.
Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci. 364(1527):2275-89. doi: 10.1098/rstb.2009.0037
Novick A, Doolittle WF. 2020. Horizontal persistence and the complexity hypothesis. Biology &
Philosophy 35:2.
Pilla G, Tang CM. 2018. Going around in circles: Virulence plasmids in enteric pathogens. Nat. Rev.
Microbiol. 16, 484–495.
Porse A, et al. 2018. Biochemical mechanisms determine the functional compatibility of heterologous
genes. Nat Commun. 9(1):522. doi:10.1038/s41467-018-02944-3
Porse A, Schønning K, Munck C, Sommer MO. 2016. Survival and Evolution of a Large Multidrug
Resistance Plasmid in New Clinical Bacterial Hosts. Mol Biol Evol. 33(11):2860-2873. doi:
10.1093/molbev/msw163
Price MN, Dehal PS, Arkin AP. 2008. Horizontal gene transfer and the evolution of transcriptional
regulation in Escherichia coli. Genome Biol. 9(1):R4. doi: 10.1186/gb-2008-9-1-r4
Puigbo P, Wolf YI, Koonin EV. 2010. The tree and net components of prokaryote evolution. Genome
Biol. Evol. 2, 745–756
R Core Team. 2021. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL https://www.R-project.org
RStudio Team. 2022. RStudio: Integrated Development Environment for R. RStudio, PBC, Boston,
MA URL http://www.rstudio.com
Rahm A. HomologyLive; 2019 https://github.com/arahm/HomologyLive
Rivera MC, Jain R, Moore JE, Lake JA. 1998. Genomic evidence for two functionally distinct gene
classes, Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A, vol. 95 (pg. 6239-6244)
Rousset F, et al. 2021. The impact of genetic diversity on gene essentiality within the Escherichia coli
species. Nat Microbiol. 6(3):301-312. doi: 10.1038/s41564-020-00839-y
Rusakovica J, et al. 2014. Probabilistic latent semantic analysis applied to whole bacterial genomes
identifies common genomic features. J Integr Bioinform. 11(2):243. doi: 10.2390/biecoll-jib-
2014-243
San Millan A, MacLean RC. Fitness Costs of Plasmids: a Limit to Plasmid Transmission. Microbiol
Spectr. 2017 5(5). doi: 10.1128/microbiolspec.MTBP-0016-2017
San Millan A, et al. 2014. Positive selection and compensatory adaptation interact to stabilize non-
transmissible plasmids. Nat Commun. 5:5208. doi: 10.1038/ncomms6208
San Millan A. 2018. Evolution of plasmid-mediated antibiotic resistance in the clinical context. Trends
Microbiol. 26, 978–985
Shawa M, et al. 2021. Novel chromosomal insertions of ISEcp1-blaCTX-M-15 and diverse
antimicrobial resistance genes in Zambian clinical isolates of Enterobacter cloacae and
Escherichia coli. Antimicrob Resist Infect Control. 10(1):79. doi: 10.1186/s13756-021-00941-8
Sheppard RJ, Beddis AE, Barraclough TG. 2020. The role of hosts, plasmids and environment in
determining plasmid transfer rates: A meta-analysis. Plasmid. 108:102489. doi:
10.1016/j.plasmid.2020.102489
Smillie CS, et al. Ecology drives a global network of gene exchange connecting the human
microbiome. Nature. 2011 480(7376):241–4

Soucy SM, et al. 2015. Horizontal gene transfer: building the web of life. Nat. Rev. Genet. 16, 472–
482

Stalder T, Rogers LM, Renfrow C, Yano H, Smith Z, Top EM. Emerging patterns of plasmid-host
coevolution that stabilize antibiotic resistance. Sci Rep. 2017 7(1):4853. doi: 10.1038/s41598-
017-04662-0

Stasiak G, et al. 2014. Functional relationships between plasmids and their significance for metabolism
and symbiotic performance of Rhizobium leguminosarum bv. trifolii. J. Appl. Genet. 55, 515–
527

Szklarczyk D, et al. 2018. STRING v11: protein-protein association networks with increased coverage,
supporting functional discovery in genome-wide experimental datasets. Nucleic acids research
47.D1: D607-D613.

Szklarczyk D, et al. 2021. The STRING database in 2021: customizable protein-protein networks, and
functional characterization of user-uploaded gene/measurement sets. Nucleic Acids Res.
49(D1):D605-D612. doi: 10.1093/nar/gkaa1074

The LinBox Group Exact linear algebra over the Integers and finite rings, version 1.1.6; 2008

Touchon M, et al. 2020. Phylogenetic background and habitat drive the genetic diversification of
Escherichia coli. PLoS Genet. 16(6):e1008866. doi: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1008866

Vietoris L. Über den höheren Zusammenhang kompakter Räume und eine Klasse von
zusammenhangstreuen Abbildungen. Mathematische Annalen 1927; 97:454–472

Wang, X, et al. 2018. Comparative symbiotic plasmid analysis indicates that symbiosis gene ancestor
type affects plasmid genetic evolution. Lett. Appl. Microbiol. 67, 22–31.

Wein T, et al. Essential gene acquisition destabilizes plasmid inheritance. PLoS Genet. 2021
17(7):e1009656. doi: 10.1371/journal.pgen.1009656

Wein T, Dagan T. Plasmid evolution. Curr Biol. 2020 30(19):R1158-R1163. doi:
10.1016/j.cub.2020.07.003

Wellner A, Lurie MN, Gophna U. Complexity, connectivity, and duplicability as barriers to lateral
gene transfer. Genome Biol. 2007;8(8):R156. doi: 10.1186/gb-2007-8-8-r156

Wickham H, Bryan J. 2022. readxl: Read Excel Files. R package version 1.4.0. https://CRAN.R-
project.org/package=readxl

Wickham H, et al. 2019. Welcome to the tidyverse. Journal of Open Source Software, 4(43), 1686,
https://doi.org/10.21105/joss.01686

Wickham H, François R, Henry L, Müller K. 2022. dplyr: A Grammar of Data Manipulation. R
package version 1.0.8. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=dplyr

Wickham H, Girlich M. 2022. tidyr: Tidy Messy Data. R package version 1.2.0. https://CRAN.R-
project.org/package=tidyr

Wickham H, Hester J, Bryan J. 2022. readr: Read Rectangular Text Data. R package version 2.1.2.
https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=readr

Wickham H. 2016. ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis. Springer-Verlag New York.

Wickham H. 2021. forcats: Tools for Working with Categorical Variables (Factors). R package version
0.5.1. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=forcats

Wickham H. 2019. stringr: Simple, Consistent Wrappers for Common String Operations. R package
version 1.4.0. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=stringr

Winter DJ. 2017. rentrez: an R package for the NCBI eUtils API The R Journal 9(2):520-526

Wright S. 1951. The Genetical Structure of Populations. Annals of Eugenics 15:323-354. doi:
http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-1809.1949.tb02451.x

Yoon EJ, et al. 2020. Beneficial Chromosomal Integration of the Genes for CTX-M Extended-
Spectrum β-Lactamase in Klebsiella pneumoniae for Stable Propagation. mSystems.
5(5):e00459-20. doi: 10.1128/mSystems.00459-20

Zhang X, et al. Improvement in the efficiency of natural transformation of Haemophilus parasuis by
shuttle-plasmid methylation. Plasmid. 2018 98:8-14. doi: 10.1016/j.plasmid.2018.07.001

Zhou H, et al. 2021. Functions predict horizontal gene transfer and the emergence of antibiotic
resistance. Sci Adv. 7(43):eabj5056. doi: 10.1126/sciadv.abj5056.

Protein-protein interaction data

4,445 potential samples from StringDB

Quality control

4,363 samples with valid PPI data

Find matching genes

5,918 plasmid-related genes not present

3,023 detected plasmid-encoded genes

Get genes & samples with PPIs

3,870 samples with no plasmid-related PPIs

489 samples with 1+ plasmid-related PPIs
3,023 plasmid-encoded genes with 1+ PPIs

Quantify per sample

Plasmid-associated & chromosomal genes & PPIs

Quantify per protein

Dimensionality reduction: PCA, LSA, NMF
Rates of PPIs per protein & per sample
Effects plasmid-related genes on PPI networks
TDA on indirect connections to get aPMNLE

Plasmid resources

27,939 plasmids from Brooks et al (2019)

6,642 plasmids from PLSDB

Select those with between 2 and 649 valid genes

16,393 unique plasmids

8,941 unique plasmid-encoded genes

For 4363 bacterial samples
All proteins adj_r=0.914
All proteins adj_r2=0.835

A

For 489 samples
All proteins adj_r=0.021
All proteins adj_r2=0.0004
Chrom proteins adj_r=0.608
Chrom proteins adj_r2=0.369

B

For 1336 samples
All proteins adj_r=0.629
All proteins adj_r2=0.396

For 2415 samples
All proteins adj_r=0.673
All proteins adj_r2=0.454

Log10 of number of PPIs per sample