Plant pathogenic *Ralstonia* phylotypes evolved divergent respiratory strategies and behaviors to thrive in xylem

Alicia N. Truchon* [1, 2, a], Beth L. Dalsing* [1, 2, b], Devanshi Khokhani[1, c, d], April MacIntyre[1, e],

Bradon R. McDonald[2, 3, f], Florent Ailloud[4, g], Jonathan Klassen[3, h], Enid T. Gonzalez-Orta[1, 2, i],

Cameron Currie[3, j], Philippe Prior[4, k], Tiffany M. Lowe-Power[1, 2 #] and Caitilyn Allen[1 #]

* These authors contributed equally to this work

Co-corresponding authors: Caitilyn Allen callen@wisc.edu and Tiffany M. Lowe-Power

tlowepower@ucdavis.edu

[1]Department of Plant Pathology, University of Wisconsin-Madison

[2]Microbiology Doctoral Training Program, University of Wisconsin-Madison

[3]Department of Bacteriology, University of Wisconsin-Madison

[4]UMR PVBMT Peuplements Végétaux et Bioagresseurs en Milieu Tropical, CIRAD, France

[a] Current address: Abbott Laboratories, Chicago, IL USA

[b] Current address: Syngenta Crop Protection LLC, Research Triangle Park NC USA

[c] Current Address: Department of Plant Pathology, University of Minnesota, St Paul MN USA

[d] Current Address: Department of Plant Pathology, University of California Davis, CA USA

[e] Current Address: Valent Biosciences, Libertyville, Illinois, United States

[f] Current Address: Department of Surgery, University of Wisconsin-Madison

[g] Current address: Medical Microbiology and Hospital Epidemiology, Max von Pettenkofer Institute, Faculty of Medicine, LMU Munich, Munich, Germany

[h] Current address: Department of Molecular & Cell Biology, University of Connecticut, CT USA

[i] Current address: Department of Biological Sciences, California State University, Sacramento, Sacramento, California, USA

[j] Current Address: Department of Biochemistry & Biomedical Sciences, McMaster University, Hamilton, ON Canada

[k] Deceased

Running title: Diverse energy strategies in *Ralstonia* plant pathogens

KEYWORDS

Denitrification, denitrifying respiration, vascular wilt, bacterial wilt, endophytic bacteria, niche

partitioning

ABSTRACT (233 words, limited to 250)

Bacterial pathogens in the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex (RSSC) infect the

water-transporting xylem vessels of plants, causing bacterial wilt disease. Strains in RSSC

phylotypes I and III can reduce nitrate to dinitrogen via complete denitrification. The four-step

denitrification pathway enables bacteria to use inorganic nitrogen species as terminal electron

acceptors, supporting their growth in oxygen-limited environments like biofilms or plant xylem.

Reduction of nitrate, nitrite, and nitric oxide all contribute to virulence of a model phylotype I

strain. However, little is known about the physiological role of the last denitrification step, the

reduction of nitrous oxide to dinitrogen by NosZ. We found that phylotypes I and III need NosZ

for full virulence. However, strains in phylotypes II and IV are highly virulent despite lacking

NosZ. The ability to respire by reducing nitrate to nitrous oxide does not greatly enhance growth

of phylotype II and IV strains. These partial denitrifying strains reach high cell densities during

plant infection and cause typical wilt disease. However, unlike phylotype I and III strains, partial

denitrifiers cannot grow well under anaerobic conditions or form thick biofilms in culture or in

tomato xylem vessels. Furthermore, aerotaxis assays show that strains from different phylotypes

have different oxygen and nitrate preferences. Together, these results indicate that the RSSC

contains two subgroups that occupy the same habitat but have evolved divergent energy

metabolism strategies to exploit distinct metabolic niches in the xylem.

IMPORTANCE

Plant pathogenic *Ralstonia spp.* are a heterogeneous globally distributed group of bacteria

that colonize plant xylem vessels. *Ralstonia* cells multiply rapidly in plants and obstruct water

transport, causing fatal wilting and serious economic losses of many key food security crops.

Virulence of these pathogens depends on their ability to grow to high cell densities in the low-

oxygen xylem environment. Plant pathogenic *Ralstonia* can use denitrifying respiration to

generate ATP. The last denitrification step, nitrous oxide reduction by NosZ, contributes to

energy production and virulence for only one of the three phytopathogenic *Ralstonia* species.

These complete denitrifiers form thicker biofilms in culture and in tomato xylem, suggesting

they are better adapted to hypoxic niches. Strains with partial denitrification physiology form

less biofilm and are more often planktonic. They are nonetheless highly virulent. Thus, these

closely related bacteria have adapted their core metabolic functions to exploit distinct micro-

niches in the same habitat.

INTRODUCTION

Bacteria with flexible respiratory metabolisms can grow in environments with fluctuating

electron acceptor availability. Oxygen is the most energetically favorable terminal electron

acceptor (TEA), but it is not always available to environmental microbes in soil or to pathogenic

bacteria in host tissues. Such microbes are often forced to use alternative TEAs (1). Among

alternative TEAs, nitrate (NO_3^-) is commonly available and yields the most reductive power (2).

Nitrate respiration can occur alone when oxygen is limiting, yielding nitrite (NO_2^-) and

generating a proton motive force to make ATP. It can also be coupled with denitrification, the

oxygen-sensitive three-step enzymatic reduction of nitrite to nitric oxide (NO) to nitrous oxide

(N_2O) to dinitrogen gas (N_2). Separate reductases carry out each step of this pathway. Nitrate-

respiring bacteria theoretically gain maximal energy by reducing NO_3^- all the way to N_2, using all

inorganic nitrogen species in this pathway as TEAs.

We previously showed that a plant pathogen, *Ralstonia pseudosolanacearum* GMI1000,

depends on nitrate respiration for colonization and virulence (3). GMI1000 is a member of the

Ralstonia solanacearum species complex (RSSC), a diverse group of bacteria that colonize and

block the water-transporting xylem vessels of higher plants (4). Xylem is a relatively low O_2

environment, containing about 200 μM O_2, which is hypoxic relative to the 9.4 mM O_2 in the

atmosphere (3). However, xylem sap also contains 30 mM NO_3^- , which is the optimal

concentration for growth of strain GMI1000 (3). Respiratory reduction of NO_3^-, NO_2^-, and NO are

all crucial for plant colonization and virulence of GMI1000 (3). However, it has long been

known that strains in the RSSC vary in their ability to carry out the final reduction of N_2O to

inert N_2 gas (5). We wondered whether these closely related bacteria have adapted their core

metabolic functions to exploit distinct micro-niches in the same habitat.

The RSSC contains four phylogenetic lineages, phylotypes I-IV (6). Phylotypes I and III

are closely related and were recently renamed *R. pseudosolanacearum* while phylotypes II and

IV were named *R. solanacearum* and *R. syzygii*, respectively (7). The physiology of the model

phyl. I strain GMI1000 has been extensively studied (3, 8–14), but little is known about core

metabolism in other plant pathogenic *Ralstonia*. Using a genetically diverse panel of RSSC

strains, we showed that phylotypes I and III (hereafter phyl. I/III) are complete denitrifiers that

benefit dramatically from the presence of NO_3^- during oxygen-limited growth (5). All 25 tested

phyl. I/III strains are complete denitrifiers that produce N_2 gas (15, 16). In contrast, 0/35 phyl. II

and 0/8 phyl. IV strains tested produced N_2 gas (5). Despite this substantial difference in energy

metabolism, all RSSC phylotypes include strains that can infect a common host, tomato.

We hypothesized that RSSC phylotypes depend on distinct respiratory mechanisms for

growth *in planta*. Using bioinformatics and functional analyses, we identified intriguing

metabolic and physiological differences that extend beyond the reduction of N_2O to N_2 gas.

Phylotype II and IV strains (hereafter phyl. II/IV) lack the final NosZ-dependent denitrification

step, and they benefit only slightly from any step in the denitrification pathway under low O_2

conditions. Intriguingly, phyl. I/III strains and phyl. II/IV strains also differ in biofilm formation,

taxis towards low oxygen environments, and aggregation in tomato xylem. These functional

differences suggest that despite causing similar wilt disease, these two subgroups have adapted to

exploit different respiratory niches *in planta*.

RESULTS

Denitrification pathway gene content correlates with RSSC phylotypes. We analyzed

the distribution of denitrification genes in 51 genomes reflecting the phylogenomic diversity of

the RSSC (Fig. 1A-B). Except for two insect-transmitted phyl. IV strains that have reduced

genomes (R24 and BDB R229) (17), all genomes contained the *nar* cluster encoding NarK1/2

nitrate transporters and the first reduction step of the pathway (NO_3^- to NO_2^-). All strains also

encoded Ani and Nor enzymes that catalyze the second and third denitrification steps (NO_2^- to

NO to N_2O), except for genome-reduced R24. No members of phyl. II/IV carry the *nosZRDFYL*

cluster that encodes the terminal N_2O reduction. In contrast, all phyl. I and 10/11 phyl. III strains

have this cluster (Fig. 1C).

We wondered if this variation in *nos* content was associated with additional differences in

proteins and regulators involved in nitrate-dependent metabolism under low O_2 conditions. We

explored this hypothesis by comparing amino acid sequences of the enzymes, transporters, and

regulators encoded in the three denitrification gene clusters. We selected one representative

strain from each of the four phylotypes: GMI1000 for phyl. I; K60 for phyl. II; CMR15 for phyl.

III, and PSI07 for phyl. IV (Fig. 1). These four strains are all soil-borne, colonize xylem vessels,

and cause indistinguishable wilt symptoms on tomato plants. The catalytic subunits NarG, AniA,

and NorB were relatively well conserved in all four genomes (Fig. 1C), but the NO_3^- transporters

(NarK1 and NarK2), the NO_3^--responsive regulators (NarX and NarL), and accessory metabolic

proteins (NarJ, NarI, MobB, and RSp1504) had lower sequence identity.

134   Many highly conserved regulators influence NO_3^- metabolism and denitrification in other

135   bacteria (18). All RSSC representatives encoded the potential NO-responsive regulators NnrS

136   (GMI1000 locus RSc3399); NsrR (RSc3397); a predicted O_2 responsive FNR (RSc1283); two

137   FNR-like regulators (RSp0190 and RSc0966, respectively); and the sigma-54 factor RpoN1

138   (RSc0408) (19). In contrast, the NorAR NO binding system (RSp0958 and RSp0959) were only

139   present in phyl. I/III (20) (Fig. S1).

140   **The *nos* N₂O reduction genes are clustered in an apparently horizontally transferred**

141   **element scattered among the Beta-proteobacteria.** We investigated the presence of the

142   *nosZRDFYL* cluster in complete genomes from diverse strains in the subclass Beta-

143   proteobacteria. As we found in the RSSC (Fig. 1A) and as reported in *Neisseria* spp. (21), the

144   presence of the *nos* cluster was highly variable (Fig. S2).

145   In genomes of both phyl. I strain GMI1000 and phyl. III strain CMR15, the *nos* clusters

146   are located near fragments of transposition insertion sequences (IS) (Fig. S3). These remnants

147   are phylotype-specific and lie outside the conserved *nos* region. As is typical of horizontally

148   acquired elements, the *nos* cluster is in different locations in the two genomes. This suggests

149   phyl. I/III strains either acquired this locus through separate events or that genome shuffling

150   occurred after the initial incorporation of the cluster.

151   While the genomic context and the flanking insertion sequences of the *nos* cluster differ

between phyl. I/III strains, the cluster gene content and structure is conserved (Fig. S3). The *nos*

clusters in GMI1000 and CMR15 contain all eight genes associated with NosZ function

(*nosZRDFYLX* and *cco5*) (2, 22–27). Between the IS elements, there are also five conserved

genes that are absent from phyl. II/IV genomes, including a SWKP family type III-secreted

effector of unknown function (RSp1374).

To gain insight into the evolutionary history of the *nos* cluster, we compared 36 bacterial

NosZ protein sequences (Fig. S4). Consistent with multiple horizontal gene transfer (HGT)

events, NosZ protein phylogeny generally does not correspond with whole genome phylogeny.

Instead, the RSSC NosZ sequences cluster with NosZ from close relatives, *Ralstonia pickettii*

and *Cupriavidus metallidurans*. This pattern may indicate a period of vertical inheritance of the

cluster followed by its loss in phyl. II/IV, or that HGT is more frequent between organisms with

higher sequence homology, independent of transposition events.

RSSC strains that encode the *nos* cluster require the last step of denitrification for

full virulence on tomato. Because all described RSSC strains are plant pathogens, but only two

subgroups contain the *nos* locus, we wondered if NosZ contributes to fitness or virulence of phyl.

I/III strains. We previously determined that a Δ*nosZ* mutant of phyl. I strain GMI1000 reached a

slightly lower population size than wild type in tomato stems 3 days after petiole inoculation (3).

However, when we quantified population sizes earlier, at 2 days post inoculation, we found a

larger growth difference (Fig. 2A). This early colonization defect suggested that N_2O reduction

contributes to *in planta* success of phyl. I strain GMI1000.

To investigate the role of N_2O reductase in virulence for this phyl. I strain, we monitored

symptom development following soil-soak inoculations of unwounded plants. This assay

revealed that NosZ, and by extension, complete denitrifying respiration, are needed for full

virulence in GMI1000 (Fig. 2B). To determine if NosZ is also a virulence factor in the closely

related phyl. III, we created a Δ*nosZ* mutant of strain CMR15 and repeated the assay. CMR15

□*nosZ* was similarly reduced in virulence (Fig. 2C). This shows that while strains from all four

RSSC phylotypes wilt and kill tomato plants, only phyl. I/III strains require *nosZ* for full

virulence.

NO_3^- enhances anaerobic growth of complete denitrifiers in the RSSC. To test

whether RSSC phylotypes differ in their denitrification physiology, we selected three

representative strains from each phylotype. Growth assays revealed that the *nos* cluster was

required for complete denitrification to N_2 under anaerobic conditions (Fig. 3A) (5). All tested

phyl. I/III strains grew to a 3 to 4-fold higher cell density when provided with NO_3^- than when

this TEA was absent. In contrast, anaerobic growth of phyl. II/IV strains was unaffected by the

presence of NO_3^-. Notably, □*nosZ* mutants of both GMI1000 and CMR15 still grew better with

NO_3^- than without it [data not shown; (3)]. This indicates that the lack of N_2O reductase activity

alone does not explain the inability of phyl. II/IV strains to use NO_3^- as a TEA under anaerobic

conditions.

To determine if NO_3^- enhances growth of phyl. II/IV strains at any O_2 level, we measured

growth of each representative strain in 0.1, 1.0, 10.0, and 21.0% O_2 with or without 30 mM NO_3^-

(Fig. 4). At the ambient 21.0% O_2, all four RSSC strains were inhibited by NO_3^-, possibly because

of NO_2^- or NO-induced oxidase inhibition (3). Growth of phyl. II K60 was also inhibited by NO_3^-

in 10% O_2. Both phyl. II K60 and phyl. IV PSI07 benefited slightly from the presence of NO_3^-

under hypoxic conditions (1.0% or 0.1% O_2) while phyl. I GMI1000 and phyl. III CMR15 grew

much better in this condition. Overall, the phyl. II/IV strains did not grow as well on NO_3^- as

phyl. I/III strains at any O_2 level.

All phyl. II/IV strains tested encode the NO_3^-, NO_2^-, and NO reductases that catalyze the

first three steps in denitrifying respiration, but comparative transcriptomic analysis revealed that

phyl. II strain UW551 did not express this pathway as highly as phyl. I strain GMI1000 during

growth in tomato stems (28). This suggested that denitrification may be less important for phyl.

II than for phyl. I. To confirm that the Nar NO_3^- reductases in phyl. II/IV strain are functional, we

measured NO_2^- production during anaerobic growth (Fig. 3A). Four of six tested phyl. II/IV

strains produced detectable NO_2^- even though their growth was not enhanced by this metabolic

conversion. After 4 h incubation at high cell densities (10^9 CFU/mL), phyl. II strain K60

accumulated ~40 µM NO_2^- while phyl. I GMI1000 accumulated ~90 µM.

To learn if the predicted NO reductase NorB is functional in phyl. II/IV, and to compare

N_2O production by completely and partially denitrifying strains, we measured N_2O gas produced

by denitrifying cultures of the four phylotype representatives. Consistent with the finding that all

four strains reduce NO_3^- in low oxygen conditions, all strains made detectable quantities of N_2O

(Fig. 3B). Complete denitrifiers produced approximately twice as much N_2O per cell than partial

denitrifiers (P=0.0065).

To determine if phyl. II/IV strains can grow in low O_2 conditions by using fermentation

as an alternative to NO_3^- respiration, we used HPLC to look for fermentation end products in

filtered spent culture of the four representative strains after 24 h growth in either aerobic or

anaerobic conditions. We did not detect acetate, lactate, or other fermentation end products (data

not shown). Moreover, fermentation usually acidifies culture media, and the pH of the RSSC

culture supernatants was unaltered.

Gene enrichment analysis reveals additional metabolic differences between phyl.
I/III and phyl. II/IV strains. To identify metabolic functions that may have co-segregated with
the *nos* cluster and that could explain the observed differences among strains in inorganic
nitrogen respiration, we screened genomes for KEGG categories that are enriched in phyl. I/III
strains vs. phyl. II/IV strains (Fig. S5). This analysis suggested that the genomes of complete and
partial denitrifying strains are enriched in distinct sets of aromatic degradation pathways. Phyl.
II/IV strains were enriched in a Ben/Cat pathway for benzoate/catechol degradation (29). Phyl.
I/III strains showed enrichment of a partial Dmp pathway that is missing the DmpB gene that
catalyzes the ring opening of catechol (30). The KEGG enrichment analysis was performed on
the small set of genomes available in 2015, which was biased towards phyl. II genomes. We
curated high-quality genomes that better represent the genomic diversity of the RSSC and
performed BlastP searches for aromatic degradation enzymes (Fig. 5). This robust analysis
confirms that the Ben/Cat pathway is indeed present in most phyl. II/IV genomes. The partial
Dmp pathway is sporadically present in phyl. I/III genomes and absent from phyl. II/IV
genomes. Overall, the protocatechuate degradation pathway (Pca) (29) is broadly conserved
across the RSSC, as we previously found (31). The hydroxycinnamic acid degradation pathway
(Fcs) (31) is broadly conserved except in the phyl. IIC lineage and the Banana Blood Disease
lineage of genome-reduced phyl. IV strains. The salicylic acid degradation pathway (Nag) (32) is
broadly conserved except in phyl. IIC and most IIA genomes and the Sumatra Disease of Clove
lineage of genome-reduced phyl. IV strains.

Complete and partial denitrifiers in the RSSC have different oxygen preferences. To
better understand oxygen preferences within the RSSC, we stab-inoculated strains into tubes of
VDM soft agar with or without 30 mM NO_3^-. In these tubes, O_2 is available in a diffusion
gradient near the agar surface. After one week, the growth patterns in these culture tubes
indicated that phyl. I/III GMI1000 and CMR15 had a strong preference for anaerobic
environments when NO_3^- was available, while phyl. IV had a subtle preference for lower-than-
atmospheric O_2 levels (Fig. S6). A GMI1000 $\Delta narG$ mutant, which lacks the first denitrification
step, had no tactic response to NO_3^- conditions (data not shown), which is consistent with
dependence of these migration patterns on energy taxis (also known as aerotaxis) (33).

Complete and partial denitrifiers in the RSSC may have adapted to different
ecological niches. Biofilms are typically hypoxic (34), so we hypothesized that phyl. I and III

strains would form more robust biofilms. We tested this hypothesis using the PVC-crystal violet

biofilm assay, which showed that phyl. I/III strains formed thicker biofilms *in vitro* than phyl.

II/IV (Fig. 6B).

Previous SEM studies showed that the complete denitrifier GMI1000 forms dense

biofilms in tomato xylem vessels (35, 36). To determine if all RSSC phylotypes form similarly

dense biofilm *in planta*, we used SEM to image xylem tissue at onset of wilt symptoms. The

complete denitrifying strains in phyl. I/III colonized xylem vessels differently than the phyl.

II/IV partial denitrifiers. Phyl. I GMI1000 and phyl. III CMR15 colonized many xylem vessels

extensively and often formed thick biofilms on vessel walls and in the lumens (Fig. 6A). In

contrast, cells of phyl. II K60 and phyl. IV PSI07 were visible in fewer xylem vessels and often

formed single-cell layers on the vessel walls (Fig. 6A). During SEM sample preparation, stem

cross-sections are washed in a fixative solution. We hypothesized that planktonic or loosely

attached cells may disperse into the solution before the fixative can anchor them in place. To

assess the relative numbers of planktonic and attached cells in plants infected with each strain,

we quantified bacterial populations in homogenized stem samples and then quantified the

unattached cells that streamed from cut stem sections incubated in water. As previously

observed, all four phylotype representatives colonized plants similarly, reaching population sizes

$>1x10^9$ CFU/g stem (Fig. S7A). There was no difference in the proportion of released cells of

phyl I/III strains GMI1000 and CMR15 or of phyl. II K60. More than 90% of these cells

remained in cut stem sections. However, almost twice as many phyl. IV PSI07 cells streamed

from cut stems into the water (Fig. S7B). If PSI07 cells were more often planktonic or loosely

attached, this could explain the relatively few bacteria visible in SEMs of PSI07-infected stems.

Together, the PVC biofilms, *in planta* SEM images, and streaming assay results suggest that

during plant infection, complete denitrification may help phyl. I/III strains form more robust

biofilms on xylem walls.

To assess the effects of bacterial growth on O_2 levels in tomato xylem, we used a

microprobe to directly measure O_2 concentrations in sap from plants colonized by each of the

four representative strains. Bacterial wilt disease significantly reduced O_2 availability in xylem

sap regardless of the infecting RSSC strain. This finding is consistent with our previous

observation that infection by GMI1000 reduced xylem O_2 levels by half relative to healthy plants

(3). The O_2 levels in stagnant water and xylem sap from healthy tomato plants are 230 μM O_2/L,

and around 200 μM O_2/L, respectively (Fig. 7). Sap from early to mid-stage diseased plants

(disease index = 1-3) infected with any of the four representative RSSC strains contained 220 to

95 μM O_2/L. Oxygen levels were lower in sap from late-stage diseased plants, ranging from 175

to 0 μM O_2/L. There was little difference in sap oxygen levels between tested strains (Fig. 7).

This suggests that phyl. II/IV and I/III strains all rapidly consume any available oxygen and thus

experience similarly low O_2 during wilt pathogenesis. Nonetheless, our genomic and functional

analyses indicate that the two groups have adapted to this metabolic challenge in distinct ways.

DISCUSSION

We discovered that the four phylotypes in the RSSC have surprisingly diverse energy

metabolisms. Comparative genomics of diverse RSSC strains revealed that the first three steps of

denitrification are broadly conserved across the RSSC, but only phyl. I/III have the final Nos-

dependent step. These bioinformatic results are consistent with prior physiological studies

showing that only phyl. I/III strains produce N_2 gas (5). Unfortunately, this means that the

official taxonomic revision of RSSC species incorrectly describes the denitrification phenotypes

of *R. pseudosolanacearum* and *R. solanacearum* (7). This warrants correction.

Plant xylem has often been described as a nutrient-poor environment (9). However,

recent quantitative metabolomics and physiological modeling shows that healthy tomato xylem

sap contains enough organic carbon and nitrogen to sustain *Ralstonia*'s rapid growth, including

mM levels of amino acids and 0.1 mM levels of glucose and sucrose (12, 13). Xylem sap should

thus be considered a rich, but incomplete, medium (37). *In vitro* experiments indicate that phyl. I

strain GMI1000 relies primarily on the glutamate, asparagine, aspartate, and glucose in xylem

(12, 13). Catabolism of other sugars contribute slightly to success in xylem (11). Although

GMI1000 can assimilate NO_3^- into organic nitrogen via NasA, NO_3^- assimilation appears to be

most important for *Ralstonia* success in the rhizosphere at the earliest early stage of disease (38).

Our data indicate that for phyl. I/III strains, NO_3^- is primarily a terminal electron acceptor *in*

planta rather than a nitrogenous building block.

If phyl. II/ IV strains lack the Nos enzymes, then why do phyl. I/III strains require *nosZ*

for full virulence on tomato? Pathway blockage could cause the Δ*nosZ* mutants of GMI1000 and

CMR15 to accumulate N_2O. Although N_2O has low toxicity, these mutants may experience

inhibitory N_2O levels *in planta*. However, direct measurements found that these mutants did not

accumulate more N_2O than wildtype *in vitro*. Because all strains produce similar N_2O levels

during anaerobic growth, the most likely explanation is that phyl. I/III strains have become

dependent on Nos enzymes to generate a sufficient proton motive force to support growth *in*

planta. Recently, we showed that levels of the denitrification intermediate NO influence

expression of the type 3 secretion system for phyl. I strain GMI1000 (39). The type 3 secretion

system is a major virulence factor. It is possible that *nosZ* mutants have slightly reduced

expression of type 3 secretion system genes.

Throughout plant infection, RSSC pathogens experience dynamic levels of O_2 and

reactive oxygen/nitrogen species. We found that infection by all representative strains similarly

decreased O_2 levels in tomato xylem sap, leading to anoxia in advanced wilt disease.

Nevertheless, diverse RSSC strains require mechanisms to manage the reactive oxygen and

nitrogen species during plant infections (20, 40–42). Although O_2 levels decrease during

bacterial wilt, some O_2 is present when *Ralstonia* populations are growing explosivly during

early and mid-stage disease. Previously, we showed that a different phyl. II strain (UW551)

requires a high affinity cbb_3-type cytochrome C oxidase for maximal growth *in planta* and in

microaerophilic culture (43). Genomes from representatives of all RSSC phylotypes encode both

major types of terminal oxidase families: proton pumping heme-copper oxidases and non-

pumping *bd*-type oxidases (data not shown; (44)). Nevertheless, it remains unclear if the two

groups of RSSC strains vary in their ability to use oxygen as a TEA.

Because phyl. I/III strains form abundant and thick biofilms on xylem vessel walls, these

strains may experience much lower O_2 levels *in planta* than were reflected in our measurements.

Although O_2 levels in exuded sap reflect the O_2 available to planktonic bacteria *in planta*, such

bulk analyses can mask the spatial heterogeneity within plant hosts. Additionally, we recently

used X-ray microtomography to show that phyl. I strain GMI1000 induces wilt symptoms when

its dense biofilms clog half of the total xylem vessels (4). The SEM images shown here suggest

that phyl. II/IV strains may form biofilms that have more available oxygen.

It is surprising that although all RSSC strains experience low oxygen conditions *in*

planta, phyl. II/IV strains benefit little from the presence of the alternate TEA NO_3^-. We

previously hypothesized that RSSC strains may have an O_2 and NO_3^- -independent mechanism to

obtain energy in VDM, such as amino acid fermentation or Stickland reactions (3). However,

Stickland metabolism is rare outside of *Clostridia* (45), and our data are consistent with the

conclusion that RSSC lack fermentative metabolism and are obligate O_2 and NO_3^- respirors.

These bacteria may have such a high affinity for oxygen that they can scavenge the extremely

small amount of oxygen in the medium during growth in an anaerobic chamber.

346   Differences in denitrification metabolism correlated with phenotypic differences in

aerotaxis behavior and biofilm formation. When allowed to migrate to their preferred oxygen

concentration in soft agar, phyl. I/III strains moved to lower O_2 levels in a NO_3^- dependent

manner. Without NO_3^-, these strains preferred the O_2-rich agar surface. When NO_3^- was present,

they migrated to a deeper, less oxygen-rich band. In contrast, the phyl. II/IV strains were

indifferent to the presence of NO_3^-. Among the RSSC, aerotaxis has only been studied in phyl. II

strain K60 (33).

353   Using a population genetics test, several denitrification-related genes were identified as

354 core RSSC genes under selection (46). The Tajima's D were above 2 for the accessory metabolic

355 proteins NarI and NarJ and the NO_3^--responsive regulators NarL and NarX, suggesting that there

356 could be functionally distinct alleles of these genes within the RSSC population. Except for a

357 robust study of variation in quorum sensing synthases/regulators within the RSSC (47), there has

358 been relatively little investigation of variation of regulators within the RSSC.

359   In addition to differences in denitrifying metabolism, our genomic enrichment analyses

revealed that phyl. I/III and phyl. II/IV vary in their predicted capacity for degrading aromatic

compounds. Aromatic compounds are a major class of plant defense chemicals as well as

possible carbon sources. Several aromatics have been detected and quantified in tomato xylem

sap during infection with phyl. I strain GMI1000: salicylic acid (~20-200 nM), benzoic acid (~10

nM), and coumaric acid (~100 nM) (48). Our analyses found that phyl. II/IV genomes were

differentially enriched in a benzoic acid/catechol degradation pathway (29). The ability to

degrade other aromatic compounds significantly increases *in planta* fitness of phyl. I strain

GMI1000 (31, 32). It remains to be determined whether benzoate/catechol degradation similarly

contributes to *in planta* fitness of phyl. II/IV strains.

369   Across the domain Bacteria, genes encoding energy metabolism are among those most

commonly found in recently horizontally acquired regions (49). The evolution of the RSSC has

clearly been shaped by HGT events, likely boosted by the group's natural competency (50, 51).

Strains in all RSSC phylotypes take up and transfer DNA (51), although phyl. I is the most

recombinogenic of the phylotypes (51–54). The saprophytic life stages of phyl. I/III strains may

have provided opportunities to horizontally acquire the *nos* cluster from other soil residents.

Moreover, survival in the soil may exert selective pressure for complete denitrification. Like the

RSSC, *Bradyrhizobium* isolates vary in the presence/absence of the *nosZ* gene. An elegant

microbial ecology study in Japan found that *nosZ*-minus *Bradyrhizobium* strains dominated in

soil types that have high levels of volcanic ash (55). In contrast, *Bradyrhizobium* strains with the

full denitrification pathway have higher tolerance to flooding (56, 57). Little is known about

whether RSSC lineages vary in their ability to survive in different soil types, but some lineages

persist better in soil than others (58, 59).

CONCLUSIONS

Our genomic, physiological, and virulence studies collectively suggest that RSSC strains

in phyl. I/III and II/IV use different metabolic strategies to reach high cell densities *in planta*.

Phyl. I/III strains benefit from denitrifying respiration during tomato infection, including N_2O

reduction by NosZ. However, phyl. II/IV strains are fully virulent, growing to similar densities in

host stems and causing identical wilt symptoms even though they lack NosZ and cannot

complete denitrifying respiration. Broader genomic and behavioral analyses *in planta* and *in*

vitro suggest that the two groups respond differently to oxygen, a key environmental variable.

The completely denitrifying strains in phyl. I/III grow better under hypoxic conditions *in vitro*

and are more likely to aggregate in biofilms on host plant xylem vessel walls. Phyl. II/IV strains

have respiratory strategies that allow them to exploit environmental and host-associated niches

containing higher oxygen levels. Ongoing studies will test the intriguing hypothesis that these

divergent energy strategies reflect inter-species niche partitioning.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Strains, mutagenesis, and culture conditions. Origins and accession numbers of strains used in

this study are in Table S1. One representative strain for each RSSC phylotype was selected,

based on ability to cause disease on the common host tomato, and on existing experimental data

and closed genome sequences for strains GMI1000, CMR15, K60, and PSI07. The Δ*nosZ*

GMI1000 mutant was generated using SOE-PCR to replace the *nosZ* ORF with a gentamicin

resistance gene cassette as described (3). This mutation was moved into strain CMR15 with

natural transformation (50). All strains were maintained in -80°C glycerol stocks and cultured on

solid CPG plates prior to growth in broth.

Bacterial growth was measured in modified VDM medium (0.5 g KH_2PO_4, 0.5 g K_2HPO_4,

0.234 g $MgSO_4$, 2.5 g casamino acids, 50 mM sodium succinate, +/- 30 mM potassium nitrate) at

28°C under controlled O_2 conditions (3, 60). Bacteria were routinely cultured in rich CPG broth.

Unless otherwise noted, media were inoculated to a starting $O.D._{600}$ of 0.001 (~$1x10^6$ CFU/mL)

and endpoint data were collected 72 h post inoculation. Anaerobic growth was in BD GasPak

systems in 1.7 mL tubes; $O.D._{600}$ was measured spectrophotometrically at the endpoint. Aerobic

assays were incubated in a 28°C shaker at 225 rpm in 96-well plates sealed with Breathe-Easy

membrane (Sigma-Aldrich). All other O_2 conditions were generated in a gas-controlled chamber

(Ruskinn Invivo$_2$400, Sanford, ME) in 96-well plates sealed with breathable tape. For 96-well

plate assays, a Synergy HT microtiter plate reader (Biotek Instruments, Winooski VT) was used

to measure endpoint A_{600}.

To assess bacterial growth under a range of O_2 conditions, we stab-inoculated semi-solid

VDM (0.2% noble agar) with ~$1x10^7$ CFU of each strain. Tubes were incubated at 28°C without

shaking and visually assessed after a week. NO_2^- was quantified (reported as +/-) using Griess

reactions (Molecular Probes, Inc. Eugene, OR) in lysed cell supernatant of anaerobic cultures

following 3 h incubation at high cell densities ($O.D._{600}$ = 1.0; $1x10^9$ CFU/mL) as described (3). N_2

production was visually assessed as presence of gas bubbles over 96 h of anaerobic incubation in

1.7 mL tubes following inoculation at $O.D._{600}$ = 0.001. All assays were replicated 3 times per

treatment per strain.

N$_2$O quantification. Overnight aerobic cultures of representative strains from each phylotype

were diluted to an $O.D._{600}$ of 0.100 (~$1x10^8$ CFU/ml). 100 µl of culture was added to 100 ml of

VDM media containing 10 mM NO_3^- in a 300 ml flask. For these assays NO_3^- concentration was

reduced to 10 mM to avoid saturating the instrument. Flasks were sealed with a double-holed

rubber-stopper with two glass tubes inserted for flushing the headspace and sampling gas. Flasks

were flushed with >3 volumes of N_2 gas to create anaerobic conditions and glass tubes were

stopped with small rubber septa. Media was not deoxygenated, because RSSC cultures rapidly

deoxygenate media biologically (3). Cultures were incubated statically at 28 °C for 24 h, at

which point 100 µl of culture was removed and dilution plated to enumerate CFU/ml. Nitrous

oxide gas generated by denitrification was measured using a needle and syringe to draw out a

300 mL gas sample from the top of the flask, while N_2 gas replaced withdrawn gas just above the

culture level. Gas samples were placed in GC vials, injected into an Agilent 7890A GC System

(Santa Clara, CA, USA) and analyzed as described (61).

Growth in host tomato plants and virulence assays. To measure pathogen growth *in planta*,

21 day-old tomato plants (wilt-susceptible cv. Bonny Best) were inoculated through a cut leaf

petiole with 2000 CFU of RSSC as described (3). Two days post-inoculation, 0.1 g stem tissue

was collected from the midstem directly above the inoculated petiole, ground, and dilution plated

to quantify bacterial population size. These assays contained 10 plants per strain.

To assess relative virulence, unwounded 21-day-old tomato plants were soil-soak

inoculated with 1×10^8 CFU of RSSC per g potting mix as described (3). Symptoms were

assessed daily using a disease index based on percent of leaves wilted (0=healthy, 1=1-25%,

2=26-50%, 3=51-75%, 4=76-100%) (62). Each assay contained 16 plants per treatment, and the

assays were replicated three times.

Phylogenetic analysis. We selected 51 genomes that represent the genomic diversity of the

RSSC (63). Using KBase (64), we built a phylogenetic tree by using the "Insert Set of Genomes

into Species Tree" app, which creates an MSA from 49 well-conserved bacterial proteins and

builds a tree with FastTree2 version 2.1.10 (65).

To expand the analysis beyond the RSSC, all complete genomes of Betaproteobacteria publicly

available on NCBI at the time of this analysis (2012) were compared using MLST based on 31

loci as described (66). The ORFcore pipeline (67) and MUSCLE 3.7 (68) were used to extract,

correct, align, and concatenate amino acid sequences. Fasttree v2.1.3 was used for tree

construction (65). A gene was considered present if it shared >40% (or in the case of NosF

>30%) amino acid identity over at least 70% of the length of the query sequence (*Pseudomonas*

stutzeri CAA37) as determined with blastp in the BLAST+ package. Blastp was also used for

amino acid comparisons across all available NosZ sequences on NCBI at the time of analysis

(2015).

Protein sequence comparisons. Homologs of denitrification pathway genes were detected in

genomes of strains GMI1000, CMR15, K60 and PSI07 using the MicroScope web interface,

BLAST, and OMA (69). The corresponding protein sequences were aligned using MUSCLE

(68) and percentage identity to strain GMI1000 was computed for each locus using the seqinr R

package (70).

FNR binding site predictions. The Virtual Footprint Regulon Analysis program from

PRODORIC predicted intergenic FNR binding sites across RSSC☐genomes☐using a weighted

matrix generated from the *E. coli* FNR binding sequence (71). Sequence logos were generated

with☐Weblogo (72), and the trimmed FNR binding site sequences from all four

phylotypes.☐The PRODORIC Virtual Footprint Promoter Analysis program predicted the

presence of FNR binding sites upstream of genes related to denitrification for three

representative strains. Because its genome was then in draft form, the representative Phyl. II

strain K60 was excluded from this analysis.

KEGG enrichment analysis. All RSSC genome sequences available in 2015 were annotated

using HMMer models for KEGG and Pfam as described (73). Amino acid identity (25% with

50% coverage) was used to cluster sequences *de novo* with proteinorthov5. Gene families over-

represented in Phyl. I/III or Phyl. II/IV strains were identified using Fisher's exact test in the

Python package scipy (74). The significance level was set at $P>0.05$.

Biofilm assays. Biofilm formation of each phylotype representative strain was assessed *in vitro*

using the PVC plate-crystal violet stain assay (33). Values were reported as $O.D._{590}/O.D._{600}$ to

normalize for minor differences in growth rates among strains.

Scanning electron microscopy. Three-week-old Bonny Best tomato plants were inoculated

through a cut leaf petiole with $1x10^2$ CFU with RSSC GMI1000, K60, CMR15, or PSI07. At first

sign of symptoms (DI=1), two thin slices were collected from each mid-stem following surface

sterilization and processed for SEM as described (35). Samples were visualized with a Zeiss

LEO 1530 high-resolution scanning electron microscope (Materials Sciences Center, University

of Wisconsin-Madison). For each strain, 6-8 plants were assessed.

Bacterial streaming assay. Nineteen-day-old tomato plants were inoculated through a cut

petiole with $1x10^3$ CFU of strain GMI1000, K60, CMR15, or PSI07 as described above. At the

first sign of symptoms (DI=1), 1 cm of stem tissue from 0.5 cm below the inoculation site was

excised, cut in half, and floated in 1 ml sterile water in a 24-well microplate. Samples were

incubated for 90 min at room temperature with 85 rpm shaking before the stem section was

removed and the escaped bacteria were quantified as $OD_{600\,nm}$ using a spectrophotometer.

Xylem sap oxygen measurement. Seventeen-day-old tomato plants were soil soak inoculated as described above with 1x10⁸ CFU/ml of either GMI1000, CMR15, K60, PSI07, or water. When symptoms first appeared, disease severity was rated, plants were de-topped and xylem sap rapidly pooled on the cut stem via natural root pressure. An oxygen microsensor probe (Unisense, Aarhus, Denmark) was immediately inserted into the pooled xylem sap and read until the signal was steady for 60 s. For an O_2 saturated water control, air was bubbled through distilled water for 5 min. The anoxic control solution was 0.1 M sodium ascorbate, 0.1 M sodium hydroxide in water. The O_2 content of stagnant deionized water was measured at each sampling point to ensure probe consistency.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We gratefully acknowledge Mick Blue, Robert Anex , and Ian Rowland for HPLC and NMR analysis. Additionally, we thank Matthew Pereyra for SEM technical support. We thank Valley Stewart, Becky Parales, and many Allen lab members for helpful comments and suggestions.

FUNDING

This work was supported by the University of Wisconsin-Madison College of Agricultural and Life Sciences, an NSF Predoctoral Fellowship to Beth L. Dalsing, and NSF project IOS-1258082 to Caitilyn Allen.

REFERENCES

1.   Fischbach MA, Sonnenburg JL. 2011. Eating for two: how metabolism establishes interspecies interactions in the gut. Cell Host Microbe 10:336–347.

2.   Zumft WG. 1997. Cell biology and molecular basis of denitrification. Microbiol Mol Biol Rev 61:533–616.

3.   Dalsing BL, Truchon AN, Gonzalez-Orta ET, Milling AS, Allen C. 2015. *Ralstonia*

solanacearum uses inorganic nitrogen metabolism for virulence, ATP production, and

detoxification in the oxygen-limited host xylem environment. MBio 6:e02471.

4.   Ingel B, Caldwell D, Duong F, Parkinson DY, McCulloh KA, Iyer-Pascuzzi AS, McElrone

AJ, Lowe-Power TM. 2022. Revisiting the source of wilt symptoms: X-ray microcomputed

tomography provides direct evidence that *Ralstonia* biomass clogs xylem vessels.

Phytofrontiers https://doi.org/10.1094/PHYTOFR-06-21-0041-R.

5.   Prior P, Ailloud F, Dalsing BL, Remenant B, Sanchez B, Allen C. 2016. Genomic and

proteomic evidence supporting the division of the plant pathogen *Ralstonia solanacearum*

into three species. BMC Genomics 17:90.

6.   Remenant B, Coupat-Goutaland B, Guidot A, Cellier G, Wicker E, Allen C, Fegan M,

Pruvost O, Elbaz M, Calteau A, Salvignol G, Mornico D, Mangenot S, Barbe V, Médigue

C, Prior P. 2010. Genomes of three tomato pathogens within the *Ralstonia solanacearum*

species complex reveal significant evolutionary divergence. BMC Genomics 11:379.

7.   Safni I, Cleenwerck I, De Vos P, Fegan M, Sly L, Kappler U. 2014. Polyphasic taxonomic

revision of the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex: proposal to emend the

descriptions of *R. solanacearum* and *R. syzygii* and reclassify current *R. syzygii* strains. Int J

Syst Evol Microbiol 2014;64:3087–103.

8.   Genin S, Denny TP. 2012. Pathogenomics of the Ralstonia solanacearum species complex.

Annu Rev Phytopathol 50:67–89.

9.   Lowe-Power TM, Khokhani D, Allen C. 2018. How *Ralstonia solanacearum* exploits and

540   thrives in the flowing plant xylem environment. Trends Microbiol 26:929–942.

541   10.   Peyraud R, Cottret L, Marmiesse L, Gouzy J, Genin S. 2016. A Resource Allocation Trade-

542   Off between Virulence and Proliferation Drives Metabolic Versatility in the Plant Pathogen

543   Ralstonia solanacearum. PLoS Pathog 12:e1005939.

544   11.   Hamilton CD, Steidl OR, MacIntyre AM, Hendrich CG, Allen C. 2021. Ralstonia

545   solanacearum Depends on Catabolism of Myo-Inositol, Sucrose, and Trehalose for

546   Virulence in an Infection Stage–Dependent Manner. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 34:669–

547   679.

548   12.   Gerlin L, Escourrou A, Cassan C, Maviane Macia F, Peeters N, Genin S, Baroukh C. 2021.

549   Unravelling physiological signatures of tomato bacterial wilt and xylem metabolites

550   exploited by Ralstonia solanacearum. Environ Microbiol 23:5962–5978.

551   13.   Baroukh C, Zemouri M, Genin S. 2022. Trophic preferences of the pathogen Ralstonia

552   solanacearum and consequences on its growth in xylem sap. Microbiologyopen 11:e1240.

553   14.   Plener L, Boistard P, González A, Boucher C, Genin S. 2012. Metabolic adaptation of

554   Ralstonia solanacearum during plant infection: a methionine biosynthesis case study. PLoS

555   One 7:e36877.

556   15.   Táncsics, Farkas, Szoboszlay, Szabó. 2013. One-year monitoring of meta-cleavage

557   dioxygenase gene expression and microbial community dynamics reveals the relevance of

558   subfamily I. 2. C extradiol …. Syst Acarol Acarol Spec Publ.

16. Nestler H, Kiesel B, Kaschabek SR, Mau M, Schlömann M, Balcke GU. 2007.

Biodegradation of chlorobenzene under hypoxic and mixed hypoxic-denitrifying conditions.

Biodegradation 18:755–767.

17. Remenant B, de Cambiaire J-C, Cellier G, Jacobs JM, Mangenot S, Barbe V, Lajus A,

Vallenet D, Medigue C, Fegan M, Allen C, Prior P. 2011. *Ralstonia syzygii*, the Blood

Disease Bacterium and some Asian *R. solanacearum* strains form a single genomic species

despite divergent lifestyles. PLoS One 6:e24356.

18. Rodionov DA, Dubchak IL, Arkin AP, Alm EJ, Gelfand MS. 2005. Dissimilatory

metabolism of nitrogen oxides in bacteria: comparative reconstruction of transcriptional

networks. PLoS Comput Biol 1:e55.

19. Ray SK, Kumar R, Peeters N, Boucher C, Genin S. 2015. rpoN1, but not rpoN2, is required

for twitching motility, natural competence, growth on nitrate, and virulence of Ralstonia

solanacearum. Front Microbiol 6:229.

20. Truchon AN, Hendrich CG, Bigott AF, Dalsing BL, Allen C. 2022. NorA, HmpX, and

NorB Cooperate to Reduce NO Toxicity during Denitrification and Plant Pathogenesis in

Ralstonia solanacearum. Microbiol Spectr 10:e0026422.

21. Barth KR, Isabella VM, Clark VL. 2009. Biochemical and genomic analysis of the

denitrification pathway within the genus Neisseria. Microbiology 155:4093–4103.

22. Holloway P, McCormick W, Watson RJ, Chan YK. 1996. Identification and analysis of the

dissimilatory nitrous oxide reduction genes, nosRZDFY, of Rhizobium meliloti. J Bacteriol

178:1505–1514.

580 23. Cuypers H, Viebrock-Sambale A, Zumft WG. 1992. NosR, a membrane-bound regulatory

581   component necessary for expression of nitrous oxide reductase in denitrifying Pseudomonas

582   stutzeri. J Bacteriol 174:5332–5339.

583 24. Dell'acqua S, Moura I, Moura JJG, Pauleta SR. 2011. The electron transfer complex

584   between nitrous oxide reductase and its electron donors. J Biol Inorg Chem 16:1241–1254.

585 25. Saunders NF, Hornberg JJ, Reijnders WN, Westerhoff HV, de Vries S, van Spanning RJ.

586   2000. The NosX and NirX proteins of Paracoccus denitrificans are functional homologues:

587   their role in maturation of nitrous oxide reductase. J Bacteriol 182:5211–5217.

588 26. Wunsch P, Körner H, Neese F, van Spanning RJM, Kroneck PMH, Zumft WG. 2005. NosX

589   function connects to nitrous oxide (N2O) reduction by affecting the CuZ center of NosZ and

590   its activity in vivo. FEBS Lett 579:4605–4609.

591 27. Wunsch P, Herb M, Wieland H, Schiek UM, Zumft WG. 2003. Requirements for Cu(A)

592   and Cu-S center assembly of nitrous oxide reductase deduced from complete periplasmic

593   enzyme maturation in the nondenitrifier Pseudomonas putida. J Bacteriol 185:887–896.

594 28. Jacobs JM, Babujee L, Meng F, Milling A, Allen C. 2012. The *in planta* transcriptome of

595   *Ralstonia solanacearum*: conserved physiological and virulence strategies during bacterial

596   wilt of tomato. MBio 3.

597 29. Harwood CS, Parales RE. 1996. The beta-ketoadipate pathway and the biology of self-

598   identity. Annu Rev Microbiol 50:553–590.

599   30.   Powlowski J, Shingler V. 1994. Genetics and biochemistry of phenol degradation

600   byPseudomonas sp. CF600. Biodegradation 5:219–236.

601   31.   Lowe TM, Ailloud F, Allen C. 2015. Hydroxycinnamic acid degradation, a broadly

602   conserved trait, protects *Ralstonia solanacearum* from chemical plant defenses and

603   contributes to root colonization and virulence. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 28:286–297.

604   32.   Lowe-Power TM, Jacobs JM, Ailloud F, Fochs B, Prior P, Allen C. 2016. Degradation of

605   the plant defense signal salicylic acid protects *Ralstonia solanacearum* from toxicity and

606   enhances virulence on tobacco. MBio 7.

607   33.   Yao J, Allen C. 2007. The plant pathogen *Ralstonia solanacearum* needs aerotaxis for

608   normal biofilm formation and interactions with its tomato host. J Bacteriol 189:6415–6424.

609   34.   Stewart PS, Franklin MJ. 2008. Physiological heterogeneity in biofilms. Nat Rev Microbiol

610   6:199–210.

611   35.   Minh Tran T, MacIntyre A, Khokhani D, Hawes M, Allen C. 2016. Extracellular DNases of

612   *Ralstonia solanacearum* modulate biofilms and facilitate bacterial wilt virulence. Environ

613   Microbiol 18:4103–4117.

614   36.   Khokhani D, Lowe-Power TM, Tran TM, Allen C. 2017. A single regulator mediates

615   strategic switching between attachment/spread and growth/virulence in the plant pathogen

616   *Ralstonia solanacearum*. mBio 8.

617   37.   Georgoulis S, Shalvarjian KE, Helmann TC, Hamilton CD, Carlson HK, Deutschbauer AM,

618   Lowe-Power TM. 2021. Genome-Wide Identification of Tomato Xylem Sap Fitness Factors

619   for Three Plant-Pathogenic *Ralstonia* Species. mSystems 6:e01229-21.

620   38.   Dalsing BL, Allen C. 2014. Nitrate assimilation contributes to *Ralstonia solanacearum* root

621   attachment, stem colonization, and virulence. J Bacteriol 196:949–960.

622   39.   Hendrich CG, Truchon AN, Dalsing BL, Allen C. 2021. Nitric Oxide Regulates the

623   *Ralstonia solanacearum* Type 3 Secretion System. bioRxiv.

624   40.   Flores-Cruz Z, Allen C. 2009. *Ralstonia solanacearum* encounters an oxidative

625   environment during tomato infection. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 22:773–782.

626   41.   Flores-Cruz Z, Allen C. 2011. Necessity of OxyR for the hydrogen peroxide stress response

627   and full virulence in *Ralstonia solanacearum*. Appl Environ Microbiol 77:6426–6432.

628   42.   Colburn-Clifford JM, Scherf JM, Allen C. 2010. *Ralstonia solanacearum* Dps contributes to

629   oxidative stress tolerance and to colonization of and virulence on tomato plants. Appl

630   Environ Microbiol 76:7392–7399.

631   43.   Colburn-Clifford J, Allen C. 2010. A cbb3-type cytochrome C oxidase contributes to

632   Ralstonia solanacearum R3bv2 growth in microaerobic environments and to bacterial wilt

633   disease development in tomato. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 23:1042–1052.

634   44.   Siletsky SA, Borisov VB. 2021. Proton Pumping and Non-Pumping Terminal Respiratory

635   Oxidases: Active Sites Intermediates of These Molecular Machines and Their Derivatives.

636   Int J Mol Sci 22.

45. Pavao A, Graham M, Arrieta-Ortiz ML, Immanuel SRC, Baliga NS, Bry L. 2022.

Reconsidering the in vivo functions of Clostridial Stickland amino acid fermentations.

Anaerobe 76:102600.

46. Eckshtain-Levi N, Weisberg AJ, Vinatzer BA. 2018. The population genetic test Tajima's D

identifies genes encoding pathogen-associated molecular patterns and other virulence-

related genes in *Ralstonia solanacearum*. Mol Plant Pathol 19:2187–2192.

47. Kai K, Ohnishi H, Shimatani M, Ishikawa S, Mori Y, Kiba A, Ohnishi K, Tabuchi M,

Hikichi Y. 2015. Methyl 3-hydroxymyristate, a diffusible signal mediating *phc* quorum

sensing in *Ralstonia solanacearum*. Chembiochem 16:2309–2318.

48. MacIntyre AM, Meline V, Gorman Z, Augustine SP, Dye CJ, Hamilton CD, Iyer-Pascuzzi

AS, Kolomiets MV, McCulloh KA, Allen C. 2022. Trehalose increases tomato drought

tolerance, induces defenses, and increases resistance to bacterial wilt disease. PLoS One

17:e0266254.

49. Nakamura Y, Itoh T, Matsuda H, Gojobori T. 2004. Biased biological functions of

horizontally transferred genes in prokaryotic genomes. Nat Genet 36:760–766.

50. Bertolla F, Van Gijsegem F, Nesme X, Simonet P. 1997. Conditions for natural

transformation of Ralstonia solanacearum. Appl Environ Microbiol 63:4965–4968.

51. Guidot A, Coupat B, Fall S, Prior P, Bertolla F. 2009. Horizontal gene transfer between

Ralstonia solanacearum strains detected by comparative genomic hybridization on

microarrays. ISME J 3:549–562.

52. Wicker E, Lefeuvre P, de Cambiaire J-C, Lemaire C, Poussier S, Prior P. 2012. Contrasting

recombination patterns and demographic histories of the plant pathogen Ralstonia

solanacearum inferred from MLSA. ISME J 6:961–974.

53. Prokchorchik M, Pandey A, Moon H, Kim W, Jeon H, Jung G, Jayaraman J, Poole S,

Segonzac C, Sohn KH, McCann HC. 2020. Host adaptation and microbial competition drive

Ralstonia solanacearum phylotype I evolution in the Republic of Korea. Microb Genom 6.

54. Sharma P, Johnson MA, Mazloom R, Allen C, Heath LS, Lowe-Power TM, Vinatzer BA.

2022. Meta-analysis of the *Ralstonia solanacearum* species complex (RSSC) based on

comparative evolutionary genomics and reverse ecology. Microb Genom 8.

55. Shiina Y, Itakura M, Choi H, Saeki Y, Hayatsu M, Minamisawa K. 2014. Relationship

between soil type and N☐O reductase genotype (nosZ) of indigenous soybean

bradyrhizobia: nosZ-minus populations are dominant in Andosols. Microbes Environ

29:420–426.

56. Saeki Y, Nakamura M, Mason MLT, Yano T, Shiro S, Sameshima-Saito R, Itakura M,

Minamisawa K, Yamamoto A. 2017. Effect of Flooding and the *nosZ* Gene in

Bradyrhizobia on Bradyrhizobial Community Structure in the Soil. Microbes Environ

32:154–163.

57. Salas A, Tortosa G, Hidalgo-García A, Delgado A, Bedmar EJ, Richardson DJ, Gates AJ,

Delgado MJ. 2019. The Hemoglobin Bjgb From Bradyrhizobium diazoefficiens Controls

NO Homeostasis in Soybean Nodules to Protect Symbiotic Nitrogen Fixation. Front

Microbiol 10:2915.

58. Ray JD, Subandiyah S, Prakoso AB, Rincón-Flórez VA, Carvalhais LC, Drenth A. 2022.

Transmission of Blood Disease in Banana. Plant Dis 106:2155–2164.

59. Sequeira L. 1993. Bacterial wilt: past, present, and future, p. 12–12. *In* Aciar Proceedings.

AUSTRALIAN CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH.

60. Hayward AC, El-Nashaar HM, Nvdegger U, Lindo LD. 1990. Variation in nitrate

metabolism in biovars of Pseudomonas solanacearum. J Appl Bacteriol 69:269–280.

61. Collier SM, Ruark MD, Oates LG, Jokela WE, Dell CJ. 2014. Measurement of greenhouse

gas flux from agricultural soils using static chambers. J Vis Exp e52110.

62. Khokhani D, Tran TM, Lowe-Power TM, Allen C. 2018. Plant assays for quantifying

Ralstonia solanacearum virulence. Bio-protocol.

63. Lowe-Power T, Avalos J, Charco Munoz M, Chipman K. 2020. A meta-analysis of the

known global distribution and host range of the *Ralstonia* species complex. bioRxiv.

64. Arkin AP, Cottingham RW, Henry CS, Harris NL, Stevens RL, Maslov S, Dehal P, Ware

D, Perez F, Canon S, Sneddon MW, Henderson ML, Riehl WJ, Murphy-Olson D, Chan SY,

Kamimura RT, Kumari S, Drake MM, Brettin TS, Glass EM, Chivian D, Gunter D, Weston

DJ, Allen BH, Baumohl J, Best AA, Bowen B, Brenner SE, Bun CC, Chandonia J-M, Chia

J-M, Colasanti R, Conrad N, Davis JJ, Davison BH, DeJongh M, Devoid S, Dietrich E,

Dubchak I, Edirisinghe JN, Fang G, Faria JP, Frybarger PM, Gerlach W, Gerstein M,

Greiner A, Gurtowski J, Haun HL, He F, Jain R, Joachimiak MP, Keegan KP, Kondo S,

Kumar V, Land ML, Meyer F, Mills M, Novichkov PS, Oh T, Olsen GJ, Olson R, Parrello

B, Pasternak S, Pearson E, Poon SS, Price GA, Ramakrishnan S, Ranjan P, Ronald PC,

Schatz MC, Seaver SMD, Shukla M, Sutormin RA, Syed MH, Thomason J, Tintle NL,

Wang D, Xia F, Yoo H, Yoo S, Yu D. 2018. KBase: The United States Department of

Energy Systems Biology Knowledgebase. Nat Biotechnol 36:566–569.

65. Price MN, Dehal PS, Arkin AP. 2010. FastTree 2--approximately maximum-likelihood

trees for large alignments. PLoS One 5:e9490.

66. Ciccarelli FD, Doerks T, von Mering C, Creevey CJ, Snel B, Bork P. 2006. Toward

automatic reconstruction of a highly resolved tree of life. Science 311:1283–1287.

67. Klassen JL, Currie CR. 2013. ORFcor: identifying and accommodating ORF prediction

inconsistencies for phylogenetic analysis. PLoS One 8:e58387.

68. Edgar RC. 2004. MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high

throughput. Nucleic Acids Res 32:1792–1797.

69. Altenhoff AM, Škunca N, Glover N, Train C-M, Sueki A, Piližota I, Gori K, Tomiczek B,

Müller S, Redestig H, Gonnet GH, Dessimoz C. 2015. The OMA orthology database in

2015: function predictions, better plant support, synteny view and other improvements.

Nucleic Acids Res 43:D240-9.

70. Charif D, Lobry JR. 2007. SeqinR 1.0-2: A Contributed Package to the R Project for

Statistical Computing Devoted to Biological Sequences Retrieval and Analysis, p. 207–232.

In Bastolla, U, Porto, M, Roman, HE, Vendruscolo, M (eds.), Structural Approaches to

Sequence Evolution: Molecules, Networks, Populations. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Berlin,

Heidelberg.

719 71. Münch R, Hiller K, Barg H, Heldt D, Linz S, Wingender E, Jahn D. 2003. PRODORIC:

720   prokaryotic database of gene regulation. Nucleic Acids Res 31:266–269.

721 72. Crooks GE, Hon G, Chandonia J-M, Brenner SE. 2004. WebLogo: a sequence logo

722   generator. Genome Res 14:1188–1190.

723 73. Murfin KE, Lee M-M, Klassen JL, McDonald BR, Larget B, Forst S, Stock SP, Currie CR,

724   Goodrich-Blair H. 2015. Xenorhabdus bovienii Strain Diversity Impacts Coevolution and

725   Symbiotic Maintenance with Steinernema spp. Nematode Hosts. MBio 6:e00076.

726 74. Virtanen P, Gommers R, Oliphant TE, Haberland M, Reddy T, Cournapeau D, Burovski E,

727   Peterson P, Weckesser W, Bright J, van der Walt SJ, Brett M, Wilson J, Millman KJ,

728   Mayorov N, Nelson ARJ, Jones E, Kern R, Larson E, Carey CJ, Polat İ, Feng Y, Moore

729   EW, VanderPlas J, Laxalde D, Perktold J, Cimrman R, Henriksen I, Quintero EA, Harris

730   CR, Archibald AM, Ribeiro AH, Pedregosa F, van Mulbregt P, SciPy 1.0 Contributors.

731   2020. SciPy 1.0: fundamental algorithms for scientific computing in Python. Nat Methods

732   17:261–272.

    FIGURES

Figure 1. The first three steps of denitrification are well conserved across the RSSC, but only Phyl. I and III have the 6-gene *nos* cluster. A) A phylogenetic tree of 51 RSSC genomes that represent the described genomic diversity of the species complex. The tree was constructed in KBase using the Insert genomes into SpeciesTree app. The Newick file was modified in iToL and Affinity Designer. Denitrification genes were identified using the KBase BlastP app with a 40% identity and 70% length cut-off. **B)** The four-step denitrification pathway enzymes, substrates, and products. **C)** Using strain GMI1000 for comparison, the identity values of orthologous proteins were computed with the R package *seqinr* after aligning amino-acid sequences with MUSCLE. Protein percentage identity of each is color coded according to a 50 to 100% gradient. Phylotype is indicated to the right of each strain name. Note that the three gene clusters shown are not adjacent to each other, but they are all located on the megaplasmid.

Figure 2. Strains that have *nos* genes require the complete denitrification pathway for full virulence on tomato. A) Two and three days after petiole inoculation of 21-day-old wilt-susceptible tomato plants with either wild-type GMI1000 or a Δ*nosZ* deletion mutant, stem sections were harvested and bacterial population sizes in stems were determined by serial dilution plating of ground stem sections. Each circle shows the bacterial population size in a single plant; horizontal bars represent median values; vertical bars indicate standard error of the mean. Data represent ten biological replicates per time point per strain. At both time points, population sizes of GMI1000 and Δ*nosZ* were significantly different (P=0.0066 at 2 dpi) and P=0.0150 at 3 dpi, two-tailed t-test). The 3 dpi data were published previously [3]. **B, C**) Symptom severity of RSSC-susceptible tomato plants was monitored daily following naturalistic soil-soak inoculation with 1×10^8 CFU/g soil of either **B**) wild-type RSSC strain GMI1000 (Phyl. I) and GMI1000 Δ*nosZ* or **C**) wild-type RSSC strain CMR15 (Phyl. III) and CMR15 Δ*nosZ*. Each point indicates average symptom severity; bars in B reflect standard error of the mean of 3 assays, each with 16 plants per treatment (P<0.005, 2-way ANOVA). Representative data from one biological replicate containing 12 plants is depicted in panel C.

Figure 3. Presence of a functional *nos* cluster in RSSC strains correlates with ability to anaerobically grow on nitrate and produce N$_2$O. A) Using three representative strains per phylotype (as labeled on X-axis), cell cultures (O.D.$_{600}$ 0.001) were incubated statically for 72 hours in VDM with or without 30 mM nitrate and endpoint growth was measured spectrophotometrically. Vertical bars represent standard error of the mean. Growth data were used with permission from [5]. In separate tubes, Dinitrogen (N$_2$) gas production was qualitatively monitored for 96 h in separate tubes. Nitrite (NO$_2^-$) was measured using Greiss reactions, using cultures of each strain in VDM inoculated to O.D.$_{600}$ =1.0 and incubated for 3 hours anaerobically. Presence or absence of NO$_2^-$ and N$_2$ are indicated with + and -. Data reflect 3 biological replicates per strain. **B**) Production of N$_2$O gas. Using a representative strain for each

phylotype (GMI1000, K60, CMR15, PSI07), cell cultures (O.D.$_{600}$ = 0.0001) were incubated anaerobically for 24 h in VDM with 10 mM NO$_3^-$. CFU was enumerated at time of gas collection. Data shown reflect 5 or 6 biological replicates. Letters indicate $p < 0.05$ (Brown-Forsyth and Welch ANOVA with multiple comparisons).

Figure 4. Nitrate enhances growth of RSSC strains under low-oxygen conditions, with the biggest impact on phylotypes I and III. Representative strains of each phylotype (A-D) were grown in denitrifying-favoring VDM broth with and without 30 mM nitrate and at various oxygen levels (0.1, 1.0, 10.0, and 21.0% oxygen). A$_{600}$ was measured after 72 h growth at 28°C, with moderate shaking. Bars indicate standard error. Each treatment was repeated a total of 9 times. *$P < 0.05$ by 2-tailed t-test.

786
Figure 5. Variation in aromatic degradation pathways within the RSSC. Top: presence/absence of
aromatic degradation genes across the species complex. Bottom: Summary of the conservation of the
aromatic degradation pathways across distinct phylotypes. The benzoate/catechol degradation pathway
and the hydroxycinnamic acid/protocatechuate pathways converge on the last four Pca enzymes. The
phylogenetic tree was constructed based on 49 conserved genes using the KBase SpeciesTree app. The
presence/absence of each gene was determined through BlastP analysis of the genomes.

Figure 6. Complete denitrifying RSSC strains form more biofilm in culture and occupy different niches in tomato xylem during bacterial wilt disease. A) Using 3-4 representative strains per phylotype, biofilm formation was quantified using the PVC plate-crystal violet assay 96 well plates. Vertical bars represent standard error of 9 biological replicates. **B)** Representative SEM images showing stem cross-sections of tomato plants infected with a representative strain from each phylotype (GMI1000, K60, CMR15, PSI07), as indicated. Susceptible tomato plants (cv. Bonny Best) were soil-soak inoculated with ~1×10^8 CFU/mL bacterial suspension in 80 g soil. At the first sign of disease, stem samples were taken, sliced, fixed, plated with gold, and visualized with a Zeiss LEO 1530 high-resolution scanning electron microscope. SEM images were captured from two biological replicates of plant inoculations each, with three or four plants and two stem slices per plant.

Figure 7. Xylem sap oxygen levels in healthy and RSSC-infected plants. A microsensor was used to measure oxygen levels in the xylem sap that exuded from a freshly-detopped tomato plant inoculated with water (Healthy) or with RSSC phylotype representatives, GMI1000, CMR15, K60, or PSI07. Each circle represents the O_2 level in one plant; N =12-14 plants/condition. Closed circles are levels from plants with mid-stage disease (1-74% leaf area wilted) and open circles are levels from plants with late stage disease (>75% leaf area wilted). Xylem sap from infected plants contained less O_2 than sap from healthy plants (*P*= 0.0443, 0.0015, 0.0125, and 0.0031 for healthy vs. GMI1000, CMR15, K60, and PSI07, respectively, Mann-Whitney test). All tested RSSC strains similarly reduced sap O_2 levels. Xylem sap from healthy plants contained less O_2 than stagnant water (*P*= 0.0005, Mann-Whitney test). Bars show standard error of the mean.

816   **Supplementary Materials**
817
818   **Table S1.** *Ralstonia* spp. strains used in this study.
819

Strain	Phyl	Host	Origin	Accession Number
GMI1000	**I**	**Tomato**	**Guyana**	**Genbank: NC_003295, NC_003296**
Y45	I	Tobacco	China	GenBank: AFWL00000000
F504, FQY_4	I	Tobacco	China	GenBank: NC_020799.1, 021745.1
YC45	I	Ginger	China	GenBank: CP011997.1, CP011998.1
Rs09-161	I	Eggplant	India	GenBank: CM002757.1, CM002758.1
Rs10-244	I	Pepper	India	GenBank: CM002755.1, CM002756.1
R292	I	Mulberry	China	NA
PSS81	I	Tomato	Taiwan	NA
K60	**II**	**Tomato**	**United States**	**GenBank: NCTK00000000**
B50	II	Banana	Brazil	EMBL: PRJEB7421
IBSBF1900	II	Banana	Brazil	EMBL: PRJEB8309
CFBP2957	II	Tomato	French West Indies	EMBL: FP885897, FP885907
UW181	II	Plantain	Venezuela	EMBL: PRJEB8309
Grenada9-1	II	Banana	Grenada	EMBL: PRJEB7428
Po82	II	Potato	Mexico	GenBank: CP002819, CP002820
UW179	II	Banana	Colombia	EMBL: PRJEB7426
UW163	II	Plantain	Peru	EMBL: PRJEB7430
IBSBF1503	II	Cucumber	Brazil	EMBL: PRJEB7433
CFBP6783	II	Heliconia	French West Indies	EMBL: PRJEB7432
CFBP7014	II	Anthurium	Trinidad	EMBL: PRJEB8309
CFBP1416	II	Plantain	Costa Rica	EMBL: PRJEB7434
CIP417	II	Banana	Philippines	EMBL: PRJEB7437
MolK2	II	Banana	Phillipines	GenBank: CAHW01000040
CFBP3858	II	Potato	Netherlands	EMBL: PRJEB8309
UW349	II	Potato	Brazil	GenBank: JQOI00000000.1
UW365	II	Potato	China	GenBank: JQSI00000000.1
IPO1609	II	Potato	Netherlands	GenBank: CU914168, CUP914166
UW551	II	Geranium	Kenya	GenBank: AAKL00000000
UY031	II	NA	Brazil	GenBank: CP012687.1, CP012688.1
UW491	II	Potato	Colombia	GenBank: JQSH00000000.1
RS2	II	Potato	NA	EMBL: PRJEB8309
CMR15	**III**	**Tomato**	**Cameroon**	**EMBL: FP885895, FP885896**
J25	III	Tomato	Kenya	NA
CFBP3059	III	Eggplant	Burkinia Faso	NA
PSI07	**IV**	**Tomato**	**Indonesia**	**EMBL: FP885906, FP885891**
R229	IV	Banana	Indonesia	EMBL: FP854059 to FR854085
KACC10722	IV	NA	South Korea	GenBank: CP014702.1, CP014703.1
R24	IV	Clove	Indonesia	EMBL: FR854086 to FR854092
CFBP6727	IV	Potato	Indonesia	NA
MAFF301558	IV	Potato	Japan	NA

820   NA = not available

821
Figure S1. Denitrification-related regulators and FNR predicted binding sites in genomes of
phylotype representative strains in the RSSC. A) The presence or absence and % amino acid identity
of all denitrification-associated regulators were determined, using the strain GMI1000 genome for
comparison. The *norAR* gene pair is predicted to be nitric oxide-responsive, while *rpoN1* controls gene
expression in response to nitrogen starvation and *nsrR* responds to nitrite/nitric oxide. NnrS in other
systems responds to nitric oxide. The majority of the regulators, particularly FNR-like RSp0190,
RSp0966 and *fnr* (RSc1283), are predicted to be oxygen-responsive. **B)** Predicted binding site consensus
(logo) for the RSSC FNR-like regulon. **C)** Predicted FNR-like regulator binding sites located upstream of
start site for inorganic nitrogen metabolism genes in strains GMI1000, CMR15, and PSI07.

Figure S2. The *nos* cluster, containing the genes required for the last step of denitrification, has
been repeatedly laterally transferred across the Betaproteobacteria. All complete Betaproteobacteria
genomes from NCBI available in 2012 were analyzed. Nos protein sequences were identified using a
strict BlastP threshold for annotation (>40% identity over 70% of the query sequence length for all but
NosF, which had a cut-off of 30% because it is more diverse). *P. stutzeri* CAA37 Nos sequences were
used as the query sequences using blastp in the BLAST+ package. Circles represent the 6 standard
components of the nitrous oxide reductase gene cluster (listed in alphabetical order from *nosD* to *nosZ*)
and 2 additional genes (*nosX* and *cco5*) that often co-segregate. White circles indicate absence of a gene
and black circles indicate its presence. All strains in the RSSC are framed in the black rectangle. Strains
chosen to represent each of the four phylotypes are in color: phylotype I representative, GMI1000, is in
red; phylotype II K60 in blue; phylotype III CMR15 in orange; phylotype IV PSI07 in green.
843
844

845
Figure S3. *R. solanacearum* strains in phylotypes I and III share a highly conserved nitrous oxide
reductase gene cluster (in yellow). All genes near the *nosZ* ORF that lie between two predicted insertion
sequences in phyl. I strain GMI1000 genome (locus tags RSp1362-RSp1378) are aligned to the region in
phyl. III strain CMR15 (CMR15_mp30001-CMR15_mp30026). Genes found only in GMI1000 are in red
while genes in orange are specific to CMR15. Predicted functions based on NCBI and Phyre2 protein
structure modeling are listed in gray italics near each ORF lacking an annotation.

852
853 **Figure S4.** NosZ protein phylogeny. Inset: Full phylogeny of all NosZ protein sequences from uniprot.
854 The clade containing *Ralstonia* is highlighted in red. The clade containing Uniprot proteins from the
855 RSSC is shown in detail; they form a monophyletic clade of highly related sequences.

857
Figure S5. Over-represented KEGG groups in RSSC phylotype I and III strains. HMMer models for
KEGG were used to identify the over-represented KEGG families in *R. solanacearum.* Complete
denitrifiers I and III shown in red and orange respectively, while incomplete denitrifiers II and IV are
shown in blue and green respectively. Presence/absence of overrepresented KEGG families depicted
above as yellow or black respectively. Distantly related bacteria with and without complete denitrification
were used for comparison (right side of figure).
864

865
866 **Figure S6. Oxygen preference assessments of *R. solanacearum* phylotype representatives.** CPG
867 overnight cultures of each strain were pelleted and re-suspended in water to an O.D.$_{600}$ of 1.0. 10uL of
868 these cell suspensions were stab inoculated and slowly released by a pipette into a plastic tube filled with

869 20 mL 0.2% semisolid VDM agar with or without nitrate added. Following one week of 28°C incubation
870 without shaking, tubes were imaged. To the right, diagrams depict the general trends.
871

872
Figure S7. Complete and incomplete RSSC denitrifiers adhere to xylem differently. Representative
tomato-colonizing strains (GMI1000, K60, CMR15, PSI07) were inoculated into tomato stem via cut
petiole inoculation ($1x10^3$ CFU). At the first sign of wilting symptoms, **(A)** total bacterial populations in
the stem were enumerated by dilution plating or **(B)** bacterial attachment to stem xylem was assessed by
measuring planktonic cells that floated or swam out of cut stem tissue. One cm of stem was incubated in
water with 85 rpm shaking. After 90 min, bacterial density in the water was measured by $OD_{600\ nm}$. Letters
indicate $P<0.05$ by ANOVA with Tukey's multiple comparison test; (A) N=14-15 plants and (B) N=16-
25 plants per condition.

884
885
886
887