Community composition, and not species richness of microbes, influences decomposer

functional diversity in soil

Shamik Roy[1,2], Jalmesh Karapurkar[1], Pronoy Baidya[1], M. Jose[1], Sumanta Bagchi[1,3] *

1 Centre for Ecological Sciences, Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore 560012, India.

2 School of Biological Sciences, University of East Anglia, Norwich NR4 7TJ, UK

3 Divecha Centre for Climate Change, Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore 560012, India

*Correspondence: sbagchi@iisc.ac.in

ORCID: SR, 0000-0002-9916-5651; SB, 0000-0002-4841-6748; JK, 0000-0003-1125-2468;

PB, 0000-0003-1337-1372; MJ, 0000-0002-1012-0407.

Author contributions: SR, JK, PB and SB conducted fieldwork. SR, MJ and JK conducted lab

analyses. SR and SB analyzed the data. SR and SB wrote the first draft. All authors

contributed to writing the manuscript.

Preprint: https://doi.org/10.1101/2023.04.13.536737

Highlights

• Diversity-function relationships for microbial decomposers remain uncertain.

• Microbial diversity is positively related to functions

• This relationship is robust to herbivore-exclusion.

• Microbial diversity-function relationship can be susceptible to altered precipitation

Summary

1. Diversity-function relationships are well known for producers, and these are also known

to be influenced by consumers at higher trophic levels. However, these are not well

known for microbial decomposers and decomposition processes in soil. Further, it also

remains unknown whether and how consumers such as large mammalian herbivores, who

are a major feature across more than one-third of the world's terrestrial realm, influence

soil microbial decomposer diversity-function relationships.

2. We used a14-year old long-term herbivore-exclusion experiment to answer two

questions: (a) whether microbial functions vary with microbial diversity (both species

richness and composition), and (b) whether herbivores alter the diversity-function

relationships among microbial decomposers. We measured functional richness, and

functional dispersion from the utilization profiles of 30 metabolic substrates. Alongside,

we also measured species richness and species composition of soil microbes.

3. We analysed soils from n=10 paired grazed-and-fenced plots, and sampled them three

times during the growth season of 2019. Data were from 60 16S rDNA gene amplicon

sequences with 7.6 million reads covering 1937 operational taxonomic units (OTU)

across 47 phyla (of which 924 OTUs were identifiable to genus level), and 1800 catabolic

profiles.

4. Functional diversity in soil was positively related to microbial community composition,

but not to species richness. This parallels the diversity-function relationships between

producers and production; it also challenges the prevailing notion of functional

redundancy in hyper-diverse soil microbial communities. Since certain combinations of

species can outperform others, global change factors which can alter microbial

communities may also impact decomposition processes and services. But this coupling

between diversity and functions was unaffected by experimental herbivore-exclusion,

indicating resilience and resistance among decomposers.

5. Structural equation models suggested that the strength of this relationship is favoured by

availability of soil moisture. These also showed microbial functions varied more strongly

with temporal variables (e.g., seasonality) than with spatial variables (e.g., edaphic factors

such as soil texture and pH). Although interpretations can be constrained by which and

how many functions are investigated, the relationship between diversity and functions

was generalizable and robust once 16 or more functions were quantified.

6. While ecosystem functions and services derived from microbial decomposers have

intrinsic resilience and resistance, they respond strongly to variability in water

availability. Decomposition in grazing ecosystems may be particularly susceptible to how

microbial community composition responds to rising precipitation variability under

ongoing and projected climate change.

KEYWORDS:

Biodiversity; Ecosystem function; Functional redundancy; Microbial decomposers; Drylands;

Species richness; Distance-based structural equation model

Introduction

Species diversity begets ecological functions, and high taxonomic diversity promotes functional diversity as well. Oppositely, depending on ecological resilience and resistance, loss of diversity can deplete functions. The empirical evidence for such diversity-function relationships mostly come from producers and their production (Schulze and Mooney, 1993; Loreau et al., 2001; Hooper et al., 2005; Allison and Martiny, 2008; Reich et al., 2012; Tilman et al., 2014). These diversity-function relationships among producers are also known to be modulated by consumers at higher trophic levels (Olff and Ritchie, 1998; Duffy, 2002; Duffy et al., 2007; Cardinale et al., 2011). It is pertinent to ask whether the patterns and processes seen in producers can be extrapolated to decomposers and to decomposition processes. But the answer seems to be contentious as both 'yes' and 'no' have been reported by studies examining diversity-function relationships for decomposers (Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016a; Louca et al., 2016; Wagg et al., 2019; Chen et al., 2022). Generally, experimentally assembled communities in lab conditions tend to show positive diversity-function relationships in decomposers (Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016a; Wagg et al., 2019). In contrast, when natural variation in species richness in ecosystems is weighed against functions, studies tend to find no relationship and this is attributed to functional redundancy in decomposers (Louca et al., 2016; Chen et al., 2022). Such contradictions could be due to few species in experimental studies (c. 10^1 to 10^2 species) (Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016a; Wagg et al., 2019) and many species in observational studies (c. 10^3 species) (Louca et al., 2016; Chen et al., 2022). However, there are indications that microbial community composition—not their species richness, per se—influences decomposition functions in natural communities (Fierer et al., 2013; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2017; Galand et al., 2018). Since this challenges the long-standing assumption of functional redundancy in hyper-diverse communities where multiple taxa could perform the same functions, it is pertinent to

ask whether microbial decomposition process in soil is related (i.e., coupled) to community

composition. However, much of the available evidence comes from metagenomic predictions

of putative functions, rather than from quantification of the functions themselves (Fierer et

al., 2013; Galand et al., 2018). Evaluating the relationship against actual functions is critical

for knowing whether diversity can buffer and ameliorate the effect of stressors that act on

decomposition functions and services.

Decomposition processes run by microbes do not occur in isolation of other trophic

levels. Large mammalian herbivores as consumers of plant production can simultaneously

alter both the quantity and quality of biomass-input to soil. Grazing can influence microbial

community composition and regulate taxonomic profiles of the decomposer community in

soil (Bardgett et al., 2001; Ylänne et al., 2021). Simultaneously, grazing can also influence

functional attributes of soil microbes (Bagchi et al., 2017; Roy and Bagchi, 2022; Roy et al.,

2023). But it remains poorly understood whether grazer influence on microbial functions in

soil is mediated through their effects on microbial community composition, or not. In

addition to grazers, underlying edaphic conditions such as moisture availability (Bagchi et al.,

2017), soil pH (Fierer et al., 2006; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016b), and texture (Girvan et

al., 2003) can also affect microbial decomposers. Moreover, soil microbial communities and

functions can be influenced by seasonality as they undergo a high degree of temporal change

as well (Frossard et al., 2012; Bagchi et al., 2017; Roy et al., 2023). The role of large

mammalian herbivores in different abiotic conditions in mediating the inter-dependency

between the taxonomic and functional aspects of soil microbial diversity can have broad

implications for local, regional, and global biogeochemical cycles (Bardgett and Wardle,

2003; Bagchi et al., 2017; Naidu et al., 2022; Roy and Bagchi, 2022; Roy et al., 2023).

Here we assess microbial diversity-function relationship by measuring the variation in

microbial diversity and functions at regular intervals through the growth season in the Trans-

Himalayan grazing ecosystem of northern India. Specifically, we asked whether: (1)

microbial diversity (both species richness and composition) and functions vary with grazing

and across the growth season (early-, mid-, and late-season); (2) microbial community

composition influences decomposition functions; (3) herbivores alter the relationship

between functions and species composition that can be otherwise mediated by edaphic

conditions and by seasonality.

Methods

Study site and sampling

We used a long-term replicated herbivore-exclusion experiment started in 2005-06 in Spiti

region of Himachal Pradesh in northern India (32° N, 78° E) (Bagchi and Ritchie, 2010a).

We set up replicated herbivore exclosures, each 10×10 m^2, with adjacent paired control

grazed plots. Spiti region is a part of the larger Trans-Himalayan drylands across Central Asia

(Fig. S1). This high-altitude grazing ecosystem (elevation 4400-4800 m) experiences cold

and semiarid climate with temperature dropping below -30 °C in winters. Vegetation growth

season starts in May, peaks in July-August, and senescence begins in September. Vegetation

consists of grasses (e.g., *Festuca*, *Elymus*, *Stipa*), sedges (*Carex*, *Kobresia*), forbs (*Artemisia*,

Arnebia, *Eurotia*), and shrubs (*Caragana*, *Rosa*), while trees are rare or absent. Large

mammalian herbivores comprise of native species (bharal *Pseudois nayaur*, ibex *Capra*

sibirica, and yak *Bos grunniens*) and livestock (goat, sheep, donkey, horse, cattle, and yak-

cattle hybrids) (Bagchi and Ritchie, 2010a, 2010b).

After 14 years of the herbivore-exclusion experiment, in 2019, we sampled soil from

n=10 paired-adjacent plots, in May (early-season), July (peak-season), and September (end-

season). We used a 2.5 cm diameter and 20 cm depth corer for soils meant for microbial

functions and edaphic variables. We packaged a smaller sample in sterilized vials for DNA

analysis.

Soil microbial functions

We measured soil microbial functions and functional diversity using n = 30 metabolic

substrates (Degens and Harris, 1997; Degens, 1998). In this way, we obtained metabolic

profiles from $30 \times 10 \times 3 \times 2 = 1800$ measurements, relative to corresponding controls (Fig. 2).

We used substrates from different chemical groups: amino acids (Alanine, Arginine, Serine,

Asparagine, Glutamine, Glutamate, Histidine), amines (Glucosamine, Putrescine), alcohols

(Xylitol, Mannitol, Sorbitol, Glycerol), carbohydrates (D-Glucose, Xylose, Mannose,

Sucrose, Inositol), carboxylic acids (α-Ketoglutaric acid, Fumaric acid, Succinic acid,

Tartaric acid, Oxalic acid, Malic acid, Ascorbic acid, Citric acid, Malonic acid), an aromatic

compound (Inosine), a phenolic compound (Gallic acid), and a polymer (Polysorbate). We

measured soil respiration after addition of substrate (substrate induced respiration, SIR)

relative to controls (basal respiration) (Degens and Harris, 1997). A substrate was judged to

be catabolized if the corresponding SIR was above the 95% confidence-interval of basal

respiration (i.e., treatment > control). We used the substrate concentrations such that equal

amounts of C was added across all treatments (Degens and Harris, 1997): 100 mM for

carboxylic acids and alcohols; 75 mM for carbohydrates; 40 mM for polymers; 15 mM for

aromatic, amino acids, amines, and phenols. We pre-incubated 5 g soil at 60% water holding

capacity at 28 °C for 24 h. Next, we added 1 ml of substrate solution and incubated soils in

air-tight containers along with of 1.5 ml Cresol Red indicator dye (prepared from 2.5 mM

$NaHCO_3$, 150 mM KCl, 12.5 µg ml^{-1} Cresol Red dye) at 28 °C for 15 h (Rowell, 1995). Next,

we estimated substrate utilization (mg C g^{-1} soil day^{-1} respired as CO_2) from colorimetric

measurement of Cresol Red indicator at 570 nm wavelength, alongside corresponding

controls and standards (Rowell, 1995). Between these 30 substrates we cover a wide range of

metabolic processes that are representative of the microbial repertoire. To ascertain whether

our choice of 30 substrates affords robust information on functional diversity we did a

thought experiment using iterative resampling of subsets from our data. We randomly

sampled 100 combinations of 2 to 29 substrates from the full dataset to generate 2800 subsets

of varying compositions (Naidu et al., 2022). For each subset we asked whether microbial

species composition is related to functional diversity (see statistical analyses below), to

determine how many substrates (and combinations) are necessary for reliable inference.

Soil DNA extraction, amplification, and sequencing

We estimated microbial taxonomic diversity from operational taxonomic units (OTU) in

DNA extracted from soil. We obtained taxonomic profiles from $10\times3\times2=60$ samples, plus

corresponding controls. We used MOBIO Power Soil DNA Extraction Kit (Carlsbad, USA)

following manufacturer's instructions. We amplified the 16S rDNA hyper-variable regions

V3-V4 using 25 ng DNA extract, KAPA HiFi HotStart Ready Mix, and 100 nM of 341F (5'-

CCTACGGGNGGCWGCAG-3') and 785R (5'-GACTACHVGGGTATCTAATCC-3')

primers (Klindworth et al., 2013). Initial denaturation was at 95 °C for 5 min followed by 25

cycles of 95 °C for 30 s, 55 °C for 45 s and 72 °C for 30 s, with a final extension at 72 °C for

7 min. We sequenced amplicons using Illumina MiSeq platform and processed the data using

Mothur (Schloss et al., 2009) to obtain microbial taxonomy data. The raw sequences were

aligned to form contigs, and only contigs with length between 300 bp and 532 bp were

retained because they cover the targeted error-free sequence of the 16S rDNA region with

high confidence. We checked contigs for chimeras and removed them using the UCHIME

algorithm (Edgar et al., 2011). We categorized the contigs into OTUs with 97% sequence

similarity using the SILVA_v138 database (Quast et al., 2013). As an additional level of

quality filtering, we removed the OTUs with cumulative abundance of less than 20 across all

samples in the data set. Controls showed minimal absorbance at 260 nm (<1 ng/μl of DNA)

compared to soil samples (24 to 70 ng/μl of DNA), and we did not sequence them since they

did not show any amplification.

Edaphic variables

Since edaphic factors can influence variation in microbial communities and in decomposer

functions (Fierer and Jackson, 2006; Sinsabaugh et al., 2008), we measured pH, soil

moisture, and soil texture, following standard procedures (Robertson et al., 1999). Briefly, we

measured soil moisture at monthly intervals as volumetric water content with a time domain

reflectometry probe (Spectrum Technologies, USA). We measured pH from 1:2.5 (v/w)

aqueous suspension using a table-top pH meter, and soil texture from 50 g soil in 1000 ml

of $(NaPO_3)_6$ solution using a Bouyoucos hydrometer (Fig. S2).

Statistical analyses

We summarized microbial functions with two indices (i) Functional richness: calculated as

the number of substrates metabolized. (ii) Dispersion: multivariate measure of functional

heterogeneity, estimated as the distance of each sample relative to their respective group

centroid (Anderson et al., 2006). We used 'vegan' library in R 3.6.3 to estimate richness and

dispersion (Oksanen et al., 2019).

We estimated microbial species richness as the number of OTUs in a sample. We

used Generalized Linear Models (GLM) with grazing (grazed/ungrazed) and season (early,

mid, and late) as fixed-effects, alongside plot-identity as the random-effect to assess the

effects of grazing and season on species richness and functional diversity. This GLM

accounts for the paired spatial structure in the data (Pinheiro and Bates, 2000), and we used

'nlme' library in R 3.6.3. We verified whether the data met the assumptions of GLMs from

theoretical and observed quantiles of residuals, and the data did not require any

transformations.

Microbial composition and function

We used ordination with Principal Coordinates Analysis (PCoA) of pair-wise Bray-Curtis

dissimilarity to visualise species composition and decomposer functions across seasons and

grazing treatment in a multivariate space summarized as two axes (Legendre and Legendre,

2012). We used kriging to visualize the relationship between species composition and

microbial functions. Kriging is an interpolation method that helps estimate the value of a

variable (e.g., functional richness) over a continuous space of microbial species composition

using an existing but smaller set of sampled data points (Dale and Fortin, 2014; Li et al.,

2023). We used the first and second axes from PCoA of species composition to interpolate

the values of functional indices for unmeasured values of species composition. Kriging is a

two-step process: first, a variogram is fitted to determine the spatial (species composition

space) covariance structure of the sampled data points; second, interpolate values for the

unsampled locations across a given species composition space from the weights derived from

the spatial covariance structure of the known data points (Dale and Fortin, 2014; Li et al.,

2023). For this, we fitted various variogram models by changing the trend removal parameter

(no trend removal, 1st order, 2nd order), model function (exponential, spherical, gaussian), and

nugget (fixed, unfixed). First step in fitting the variogram model is trend removal. We did

trend removal by fitting a polynomial equation to the predictor values (PCoA axes 1 and 2)

using ordinary least squares, and therefore the variograms are computed using the residuals.

Here, 1st order trend removal will remove linear trends, whereas 2nd order will remove

quadratic trends. Following trend removal, we did model fitting to the empirically determined

semivariogram using any of the three model functions where nugget (y-intercept value) is

either fixed at zero or unfixed (variable). For each microbial functional index there were 18

different combinations (3 trend removal parameters × 3 model functions × 2 nuggets) to build

a variogram model. We selected the final combination for each functional index where the

resulting model had the least sum of squares (Table S1). For all the functional indices we

selected 2nd order trend removal with exponential function and nugget fixed at zero. We

implemented kriging with "geoR" package in R (Ribeiro Jr et al., 2022).

249   Distance-based structural equation models

We used distance-based Structural Equation Models (dbSEM) to evaluate whether and how

species richness and composition relate to functions, and whether grazers affect the

relationship directly or indirectly through edaphic factors. dbSEM is favoured over other

types of path analyses since it offers more robust tests of hypothesized causal relationships

between variables by using the dissimilarity between samples. dbSEM uses pairwise-

dissimilarity matrices for both dependant and predictor variables to disentangle direct and

indirect hypothesized causal relationships (Fourtune et al., 2018; Jabot et al., 2020). We used

permutation based dbSEM where SEM is performed on the input matrices of variables where

rows and columns are randomly permuted to obtain an unbiased P-value for each

hypothesized path as the proportion where permuted path coefficient values are less than or

equal to the observed path coefficient value (Fourtune et al., 2018; Jabot et al., 2020). The

edaphic variables were soil moisture, pH and texture. For soil texture we only included sand

content in the analysis because of autocorrelation with clay and silt content. The paths in the

dbSEM were motivated by processes that shape microbial communities and were known *a-*

priori: (i) Large mammalian herbivores alter microbial communities (Grazing → Species

diversity (species richness, species composition)) (Sankaran and Augustine, 2004; Bagchi et

al., 2017). (ii) Herbivores can regulate decomposition process directly (Grazing → Function

(functional richness, functional composition)), or indirectly through species composition

(Grazing → Species diversity → Function) (Bagchi et al., 2017; Naidu et al., 2022; Roy and

Bagchi, 2022). (iii) Background edaphic variables can influence microbial communities

(Edaphic [pH, sand, moisture] → Species diversity) (Girvan et al., 2003; Fierer and Jackson,

2006; Bagchi et al., 2017). (iv) Variation in background edaphic variables can alter function

directly (Edaphic → Function), or indirectly through influence on species diversity (Edaphic

→ Species diversity → Function) (Girvan et al., 2003; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016b;

Bagchi et al., 2017). (v) both microbial community and functions can vary temporally

(Season → Species diversity, Season → Function) (Bardgett et al., 2005; Frossard et al.,

2012; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2013; Bagchi et al., 2017). (vi) Grazing can also influence

soil moisture (Grazing → Moisture) (Bagchi et al., 2017), that can in-turn influence pH

(Moisture → pH). (vii) Sand content can also alter moisture (Sand → Moisture) and pH

(Sand → pH). We assessed goodness of fit between the model and data with χ^2 test,

comparative fit index (CFI), and Standardized Root Mean Square Error of Approximation

(RMSEA). We accepted the model $P(\chi^2) > 0.05$, CFI ~ 1, and RMSEA < 0.05. We judged the

agreement between data and individual hypothesized paths at $\alpha=0.1$ to account for high

variability in the individual dissimilarity matrices. We implemented paths for dbSEM using

'lavaan' library in R (Rosseel, 2012).

As a thought experiment we evaluated whether our dataset of 30 functions was

adequate to understand if species richness and/or composition affected functions, or not. We

first resampled our microbial function data to obtain datasets with different number of

functions (from 2 functions to 29 functions, i.e., 28 subsets). Since each subset can be

envisioned as a study covering a certain number of functions, we evaluated 100 different

possible combinations thereof (Naidu et al., 2022). So, for each subset, we randomly iterated

100 different combinations of functions, that ultimately generated 2800 datasets (28 subsets ×

100 combinations of each). We then repeated dbSEM analysis for each subset to ask whether

the number of functions can influence interpretation of diversity-function relationships in

each of these 2800 datasets. Specifically, after each dbSEM iteration of a subset, we checked

whether the path connecting species diversity (species richness, and species composition) to

functions (function richness, and functional composition) was significant, or not (α=0.1).

Since, previous evidence for a positive relationship between species composition and

functions come from metagenomic extrapolations of 10^3 predicted functions, this thought

experiment allows us to evaluate whether the relationship holds true for 10^1 actual functions

(and various combinations), or not (Fierer et al., 2013; Galand et al., 2018).

Results

Microbial communities and functions –

We recorded 1937 unique OTUs across 47 known phyla and 7650894 reads. Of these, only

924 OTUs were identified to genus level. Actinobacteriota, Acidobacteriota,

Planctomycetota, Proteobacteria and Verrucomicrobiota were most common (Fig. 1, Fig. S3).

Species richness of OTUs ranged between 494 and 866 per sample (mean 713±80 SD).

Similarly, functional richness (i.e., number of substrates metabolized) ranged between 6 and

30 (mean 21±7 SD, Fig. 1, Fig. S3). Expectedly, microbial activity as SIR was high for

carboxylic acids, and low for amino acids (Fig. 1, Fig. S3).

Seasonality and herbivore-effects on microbial species and functions –

Variation in species (OTUs) richness was neither explained by season (Fig. 2a; $F_{2,45}$=0.02,

P=0.98), nor by grazing (Fig. 2a; $F_{1,45}$=1.61, *P*=0.21). Microbial functional richness varied

with season (Fig. 2b; $F_{2,45}$=38.96, *P*<0.001) but did not vary with grazing (Fig. 2b; $F_{1,45}$=0.01,

P=0.98). Similarly, microbial functional dispersion varied with season (Fig. 2c; $F_{2,45}$=48.89,

P<0.001) but did not vary with grazing (Fig. 2c; $F_{1,45}$=0.01, P=0.92). In multivariate space

summarized with PCoA ordination, microbial species composition varied with season (Fig. 3;

$F_{2,54}$=4.70, P=0.001), but not with grazing (Fig. 3; $F_{1,54}$=1.33, P=0.21). Functional

composition also varied with season (Fig. 3; $F_{2,54}$=4.83, P=0.001), but not with grazing (Fig.

3; $F_{1,54}$=0.87, P=0.55).

Relationship between species composition and functions –

Kriged maps of microbial functions indicated that differences in community composition

were related to differences in functions (Fig. 4), and these were further assessed using

dbSEM (Fig. 5). Overall, dbSEM for functional richness, and functional dispersion (Fig. 5)

indicated good match between the data and hypothesized paths (SRMR=0.005,

RMSEA<0.001, P-value (RMSEA)=0.982, CFI>0.999, χ^2=1.34, P-value (χ^2)=0.512). Path

coefficients suggested a positive relationship between species composition and functional

richness (Species composition $\rightarrow$ Functional richness; path coefficient=0.08, P=0.06; Fig. 5),

but not with functional composition (Species composition $\rightarrow$ Functional composition;

P>0.10; Fig. 5). Species richness did not have any direct or indirect effect on either

functional richness or functional composition (P>0.10; Fig. 5). Soil texture had a positive

effect on species composition (Texture $\rightarrow$ Species composition; path coefficient=0.09,

P=0.001; Fig. 5). Seasonality had positive relationship with species composition (Season $\rightarrow$

Species composition; path coefficient=0.14, P<0.001; Fig. 5), functional composition

(Season $\rightarrow$ Functional composition; path coefficient=0.25, P<0.001; Fig. 5), and soil

moisture (Season $\rightarrow$ Moisture; path coefficient=0.29, P<0.001; Fig. 5), such that as the

season progresses from early- to mid- to late-season, species composition, functional

composition, and soil moisture becomes more dissimilar. But seasonality had a negative

relationship with species richness (Season → Species richness; path coefficient=-0.04,

P=0.08; Fig. 5), such that as the season progresses from early- to mid- to late-season, species

richness between samples becomes more similar. Variation in moisture influenced both the

species composition (Moisture → Species composition; path coefficient=0.12, *P*=0.02; Fig.

5), and species richness (Moisture → Species richness; path coefficient=0.08, *P*=0.09; Fig.

5). In this way seasonality had a direct (Season → Species composition → Function), as well

as indirect effect on the diversity-function relationship through moisture (Season → Moisture

→ Species composition → Function). Variation in pH had a negative relationship with

Species richness (pH → Species richness; path coefficient=-0.07, *P*=0.09; Fig. 5). Grazing

did not influence this relationship directly (Grazing → Species composition → Function), or

indirectly through edaphic factors (Grazing → Edaphic → Species composition → Function).

Through our thought experiment involving iterative resampling of the functional data,

we find that 16 or more substrates in different combinations can provide robust

interpretations of functional diversity (Fig. 6). The relationship between species composition

and functions (Fig. 5) could be inferred as long as there is quantitative information from 16 or

more functions (Fig. 6).

Discussion

While diversity-function relationships in producers, and their modulation by consumers at

higher trophic levels, are well known, they remain uncertain for microbial decomposers and

decomposition functions. Here we investigate whether, or not, microbial taxonomic diversity

is related to microbial decomposition functions and find three key results: (i) soil microbial

communities and functions are more variable across time than over space (Fig. 1 – 3). (ii)

microbial species composition affects functional richness, but not functional composition

(Fig. 4 – 5, Fig. S4). And, (iii) unlike background edaphic variables and seasonality, large

mammalian herbivores do not influence the diversity-function relationship for microbes (Fig.

5). Additionally, a small subset of functions (16 or more substrates) covering an array of

decomposer metabolic processes provide a sufficient sample-size to understand diversity-

function relationships in soil microbes (Fig. 6).

We find temporal variation in microbial community structure and functions to be

more pronounced than spatial heterogeneity (Figs. 2, 3, 5). This is consistent with other

studies where fluctuations in resource availability explained why microbes respond to

temporal variables more than spatial variables (Frossard et al., 2012; Bagchi et al., 2017; Roy

and Bagchi, 2022; Roy et al., 2023). Further, we find a consistent effect of soil moisture and

texture on the decomposer diversity-function relationship (Fig. 5). Moisture and texture can

play an important role in habitat-filtering (Bass-Becking, 1934) as they promote functions

through taxonomic composition (Fig. 5), resulting in the loss of functional redundancies

among decomposers. While the effect of moisture and texture (Fig. 5) is consistent with other

studies across ecosystems (Girvan et al., 2003; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016c), unlike other

studies (Fierer and Jackson, 2006; Sinsabaugh et al., 2008) we find no effect of soil pH on the

relationship. This could be due to relative invariance in soil pH across the sampled plots

(space), but it can vary more substantially between different landscapes and ecosystems.

The lack of spatial heterogeneity in hyper-diverse microbial community structure and

functions can result in functional redundancy. As a case in point, we recorded more than 700

OTUs on average per sample, and 1937 OTUs overall across 7.6 million reads. Therefore,

and understandably, the data did not show any support for the relationship between species

richness and functions (Fig. S4). For instance, where local richness is below 200 OTUs per

sample, there is evidence of coupling and therefore a lack of redundancy (Delgado-Baquerizo

et al., 2016a). But, further along at 700 OTUs per sample (Fig. 3 – 4) microbial diversity can

appear de-coupled from functions (Peter et al., 2011; Louca et al., 2016; Chen et al., 2022).

Thus, not surprisingly, different studies have encountered coupled as well as de-coupled

relationships between microbial species richness and functions (Peter et al., 2011; Delgado-

Baquerizo et al., 2016a; Louca et al., 2016; Chen et al., 2022), and our data emphasize how it

is important to accommodate species composition (Hooper et al., 2005).

The existence of redundancy has often been challenged for hyper-diverse natural

microbial communities (Fierer et al., 2013; Galand et al., 2018). In its stringent form,

functional redundancy states that in a community there exist organisms who perform the

same set of functions and can be easily replaced without any changes in the function (Allison

and Martiny, 2008; Galand et al., 2018). However, this is seldom the case in natural

communities since the environmental thresholds (such as temperature, precipitation) of

different organisms to perform the same set of functions are different. For instance, we find

that seasonality and edaphic factors (moisture and texture) exert strong control over the

diversity-function relationship. Moreover, the notion of functional redundancy is also

dependent on which functions were investigated, and how many (Fig. 6). This is because in

natural communities, microbes can perform multiple functions at once where in one hand,

some of the functions would be shared by other microbes making the function redundant. On

the other hand, some of the functions would be specific to only a select few making the

function specialized and non-redundant. Therefore, instead of complete redundancy our

results suggest partial redundancy. But, since large number of the 1937 OTUs have not yet

been resolved to genus/species level, we do not fully know the identity of microbes that are

responsible for higher functions. However, anticipated technological advances can bridge this

knowledge gap and can foster better interpretations of the relationship (Thompson et al.,

2017).

Given the low resolution of microbial taxonomy is soil, previous studies have often

relied on metagenomic interpretations and extrapolations of putative functions from the

presence/absence of genetic code for various proteins and enzymes (Fierer et al., 2013;

Galand et al., 2018). This does not automatically guarantee that the corresponding functions

are actually performed in a sample because 'everything is everywhere, but environment

selects' (Bass-Becking, 1934). We assessed the diversity-function relationship by measuring

the magnitude of functions, albeit for a small number of 30 functions. But our thought

experiment suggests that interpretations of the relationship is generalizable and reliable for

10^1 functions compared against 10^3 putative functions from the metagenomic approach

(Fierer et al., 2013; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2017; Galand et al., 2018). Further, such

coupled diversity-function relationships for microbes and decomposition agrees with patterns

seen with producers and production where identity of the species is more important than the

number of species (Hooper and Vitousek, 1997; Tilman et al., 1997).

We find that the relationship between microbial diversity and function is robust to the

presence or absence of large mammalian herbivores. This also is in line with resilience and

resistance patterns among producers and their production where herbivore-exclusion does not

impact producer diversity and production (Kohli et al., 2019). However, contrary to the direct

effect of consumers on producers, the mechanisms operating for decomposers might be

different (Bagchi et al., 2017; Naidu et al., 2022; Roy and Bagchi, 2022). There could be

multiple interdependent paths that support such reliance and resistance. First, a balance

between the relative strengths of direct and indirect influence of herbivores can manifest as

no net effect on the decomposer diversity-function relationship (Bagchi and Ritchie, 2010a;

Cherif and Loreau, 2013; Naidu et al., 2022; Roy and Bagchi, 2022; Roy et al., 2023).

Second, the tight coupling between microbial diversity and function could have established

before the start of our decadal-scale herbivore-exclusion experiment due to competition-

cooperation interactions (Morrissey et al., 2019; Lechón-Alonso et al., 2021). Once

established, the interactions among microbial decomposers may withstand the experimental

exclusion of herbivores (resistance), and/or recover quickly from it (resilience) (Allison and

Martiny, 2008; Morrissey et al., 2019; López Zieher et al., 2020). Third, herbivore effects

might be different on other types of decomposers which were not quantified by our study,

e.g., archaea, uni- and multi-cellular eukaryotic decomposers (Bagchi et al., 2017; Roy et al.,

2023).

Overall, we find that differences in microbial community composition affect microbial

functional diversity, whereas microbial species richness alone has no effect (Galand et al.,

2018). This is inconsistent with a key aspect of functional redundancy that posits no

relationship between species diversity (both richness and composition) and functional

diversity (Hooper and Vitousek, 1997; Allison and Martiny, 2008; Galand et al., 2018).

Instead, our results suggest that loss or gain of some species (i.e., composition) in the

microbial community can have larger impacts on microbial functions than others. Therefore,

the potential for species diversity to buffer (i.e., resistance) and ameliorate (i.e., resilience)

the effect of stressors is contingent upon the identities of the species that remain unaffected

by the stressor (Hooper and Vitousek, 1997; Tilman et al., 1997). While microbial diversity-

function relationships appear resistant and/or resilient to the experimental removal of large

mammalian herbivores, they are sensitive to variability in soil moisture which is a major

determinant of most dryland ecosystem processes and services (Allison and Martiny, 2008;

Millard and Singh, 2010; Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2013; Griffiths and Philippot, 2013;

Maestre et al., 2016). Future studies can address how resistance and resilience of microbial

functions dovetail with various aspects of global change including rising inter-annual

variability in precipitation and its intra-annual redistribution. Future changes in soil moisture

availability through continued alteration of precipitation in drylands (Schlaepfer et al., 2017;

Konapala et al., 2020), particularly in the Trans-Himalaya and Central Asia's high-elevation

drylands, might challenge their conservation and sustainable management for ecosystem

functions and services.

Acknowledgements

SR was supported by a graduate fellowship from CSIR-India in IISc, and Discipline Hopping

for Discovery Science grant by NERC-UK in UEA; SB was supported by MHRD-India.

Funding support for fieldwork and lab-analyses were obtained from DST-SERB, DST-FIST,

DBT-IISc. Govt. of Himachal Pradesh and state departments have supported our research in

Spiti. We received generous support from Dorje Chhering, Dorje Chhewang, and Deepak

Shetti, in field and in lab.

References

References

Allison, S.D., Martiny, J.B.H., 2008. Resistance, resilience, and redundancy in microbial
communities. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 105, 11512–11519.
doi:10.1073/pnas.0801925105
Anderson, M.J., Ellingsen, K.E., McArdle, B.H., 2006. Multivariate dispersion as a measure
of beta diversity. Ecology Letters 9, 683–693. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2006.00926.x
Bagchi, S., Ritchie, M.E., 2010a. Introduced grazers can restrict potential soil carbon
sequestration through impacts on plant community composition. Ecology Letters 13,
959–968. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2010.01486.x
Bagchi, S., Ritchie, M.E., 2010b. Herbivore effects on above- and belowground plant
production and soil nitrogen availability in the Trans-Himalayan shrub-steppes.
Oecologia 164, 1075–1082. doi:10.1007/s00442-010-1690-5
Bagchi, S., Ritchie, M.E., 2010c. Herbivore effects on above- and belowground plant
production and soil nitrogen availability in the Trans-Himalayan shrub-steppes.
Oecologia 164, 1075–1082. doi:10.1007/s00442-010-1690-5
Bagchi, S., Roy, S., Maitra, A., Sran, R.S., 2017. Herbivores suppress soil microbes to
influence carbon sequestration in the grazing ecosystem of the Trans-Himalaya.
Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment 239, 199–206.
doi:10.1016/j.agee.2017.01.033
Bardgett, R., Bowman, W., Kaufmann, R., Schmidt, S., 2005. A temporal approach to linking
aboveground and belowground ecology. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 20, 634–641.
doi:10.1016/j.tree.2005.08.005
Bardgett, R.D., Jones, A.C., Jones, D.L., Kemmitt, S.J., Cook, R., Hobbs, P.J., 2001. Soil
microbial community patterns related to the history and intensity of grazing in sub-
montane ecosystems. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 33, 1653–1664.
doi:10.1016/S0038-0717(01)00086-4
Bardgett, R.D., Wardle, D.A., 2003. Herbivore-mediated linkages between aboveground and
belowground communities. Ecology 84, 2258–2268. doi:10.1890/02-0274
Bass-Becking, L.G.M., 1934. Geobiologie of inleiding tot de milieukunde. Den Haag: W.P.
Van Stockum & Zoon.
Cardinale, B.J., Matulich, K.L., Hooper, D.U., Byrnes, J.E., Duffy, E., Gamfeldt, L.,
Balvanera, P., O'Connor, M.I., Gonzalez, A., 2011. The functional role of producer
diversity in ecosystems. American Journal of Botany 98, 572–592.
doi:10.3732/ajb.1000364
Chen, W., Wang, J., Chen, X., Meng, Z., Xu, R., Duoji, D., Zhang, J., He, J., Wang, Z.,
Chen, J., Liu, K., Hu, T., Zhang, Y., 2022. Soil microbial network complexity predicts
ecosystem function along elevation gradients on the Tibetan Plateau. Soil Biology and
Biochemistry 172, 108766. doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2022.108766
Cherif, M., Loreau, M., 2013. Plant-herbivore-decomposer stoichiometric mismatches and
nutrient cycling in ecosystems. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences
280, 20122453. doi:10.1098/rspb.2012.2453
Dale, M.R.T., Fortin, M.-J., 2014. Spatial Analysis: A Guide For Ecologists. Cambridge
University Press.
Degens, B.P., 1998. Microbial functional diversity can be influenced by the addition of
simple organic substrates to soil. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 30, 1981–1988.
doi:10.1016/S0038-0717(98)00070-4
Degens, B.P., Harris, J.A., 1997. Development of a physiological approach to measuring the
catabolic diversity of soil microbial communities. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 29,
1309–1320. doi:10.1016/S0038-0717(97)00076-X

Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Giaramida, L., Reich, P.B., Khachane, A.N., Hamonts, K., Edwards, C., Lawton, L.A., Singh, B.K., 2016a. Lack of functional redundancy in the relationship between microbial diversity and ecosystem functioning. Journal of Ecology 104, 936–946. doi:10.1111/1365-2745.12585

Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Grinyer, J., Reich, P.B., Singh, B.K., 2016b. Relative importance of soil properties and microbial community for soil functionality: insights from a microbial swap experiment. Functional Ecology 30, 1862–1873. doi:10.1111/1365-2435.12674

Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Maestre, F.T., Gallardo, A., Bowker, M.A., Wallenstein, M.D., Quero, J.L., Ochoa, V., Gozalo, B., García-Gómez, M., Soliveres, S., García-Palacios, P., Berdugo, M., Valencia, E., Escolar, C., Arredondo, T., Barraza-Zepeda, C., Bran, D., Carreira, J.A., Chaieb, M., Conceicao, A.A., Derak, M., Eldridge, D.J., Escudero, A., Espinosa, C.I., Gaitán, J., Gatica, M.G., Gómez-González, S., Guzman, E., Gutiérrez, J.R., Florentino, A., Hepper, E., Hernández, R.M., Huber-Sannwald, E., Jankju, M., Liu, J., Mau, R.L., Miriti, M., Monerris, J., Naseri, K., Noumi, Z., Polo, V., Prina, A., Pucheta, E., Ramírez, E., Ramírez-Collantes, D.A., Romao, R., Tighe, M., Torres, D., Torres-Díaz, C., D. Ungar, E., Val, J., Wamiti, W., Wang, D., Zaady, E., 2013. Decoupling of soil nutrient cycles as a function of aridity in global drylands. Nature 502, 672–676. doi:10.1038/nature12670

Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Maestre, F.T., Reich, P.B., Jeffries, T.C., Gaitan, J.J., Encinar, D., Berdugo, M., Campbell, C.D., Singh, B.K., 2016c. Microbial diversity drives multifunctionality in terrestrial ecosystems. Nature Communications 7, 1–8. doi:10.1038/ncomms10541

Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Trivedi, P., Trivedi, C., Eldridge, D.J., Reich, P.B., Jeffries, T.C., Singh, B.K., 2017. Microbial richness and composition independently drive soil multifunctionality. Functional Ecology 31, 2330–2343. doi:10.1111/1365-2435.12924

Duffy, J.E., 2002. Biodiversity and ecosystem function: the consumer connection. Oikos 99, 201–219. doi:10.1034/j.1600-0706.2002.990201.x

Duffy, J.E., Cardinale, B.J., France, K.E., McIntyre, P.B., Thébault, E., Loreau, M., 2007. The functional role of biodiversity in ecosystems: incorporating trophic complexity. Ecology Letters 10, 522–538. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2007.01037.x

Edgar, R.C., Haas, B.J., Clemente, J.C., Quince, C., Knight, R., 2011. UCHIME improves sensitivity and speed of chimera detection. Bioinformatics 27, 2194–2200. doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btr381

Eldridge, D.J., Travers, S.K., Val, J., Wang, J.T., Liu, H., Singh, B.K., Delgado-Baquerizo, M., 2020. Grazing Regulates the Spatial Heterogeneity of Soil Microbial Communities Within Ecological Networks. Ecosystems 23, 932–942. doi:10.1007/s10021-019-00448-9

Fierer, N., Colman, B.P., Schimel, J.P., Jackson, R.B., 2006. Predicting the temperature dependence of microbial respiration in soil: A continental-scale analysis. Global Biogeochemical Cycles 20, GB3026. doi:10.1029/2005GB002644

Fierer, N., Jackson, R.B., 2006. The diversity and biogeography of soil bacterial communities. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 103, 626–631. doi:10.1073/pnas.0507535103

Fierer, N., Ladau, J., Clemente, J.C., Leff, J.W., Owens, S.M., Pollard, K.S., Knight, R., Gilbert, J.A., McCulley, R.L., 2013. Reconstructing the Microbial Diversity and Function of Pre-Agricultural Tallgrass Prairie Soils in the United States. Science 342, 621–624. doi:10.1126/science.1243768

Fourtune, L., Prunier, J.G., Paz-Vinas, I., Loot, G., Veyssière, C., Blanchet, S., 2018. Inferring causalities in landscape genetics: An extension of wright's causal modeling to distance matrices. American Naturalist 191, 491–508. doi:10.1086/696233

Frossard, A., Gerull, L., Mutz, M., Gessner, M.O., 2012. Disconnect of microbial structure
and function: enzyme activities and bacterial communities in nascent stream corridors.
The ISME Journal 6, 680–691. doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.134
Galand, P.E., Pereira, O., Hochart, C., Auguet, J.C., Debroas, D., 2018. A strong link
between marine microbial community composition and function challenges the idea of
functional redundancy. The ISME Journal 12, 2470–2478. doi:10.1038/s41396-018-
0158-1
Girvan, M.S., Bullimore, J., Pretty, J.N., Osborn, A.M., Ball, A.S., 2003. Soil type is the
primary determinant of the composition of the total and active bacterial communities in
arable soils. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 69, 1800–1809.
doi:10.1128/AEM.69.3.1800-1809.2003
Griffiths, B.S., Philippot, L., 2013. Insights into the resistance and resilience of the soil
microbial community. FEMS Microbiology Reviews 37, 112–129. doi:10.1111/j.1574-
6976.2012.00343.x
Hooper, D.U., Chapin, F.S., Ewel, J.J., Hector, A., Inchausti, P., Lavorel, S., Lawton, J.H.,
Lodge, D.M., Loreau, M., Naeem, S., Schmid, B., Setälä, H., Symstad, A.J.,
Vandermeer, J., Wardle, D.A., 2005. Effects of biodiversity on ecosystem functioning:
A consensus of current knowledge. Ecological Monographs 75, 3–35. doi:10.1890/04-
0922
Hooper, D.U., Vitousek, P.M., 1997. The Effects of Plant Composition and Diversity on
Ecosystem Processes. Science 277, 1302–1305. doi:10.1126/science.277.5330.1302
Jabot, F., Laroche, F., Massol, F., Arthaud, F., Crabot, J., Dubart, M., Blanchet, S., Munoz,
F., David, P., Datry, T., 2020. Assessing metacommunity processes through signatures
in spatiotemporal turnover of community composition. Ecology Letters.
doi:10.1111/ele.13523
Klindworth, A., Pruesse, E., Schweer, T., Peplies, J., Quast, C., Horn, M., Glöckner, F.O.,
2013. Evaluation of general 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and
next-generation sequencing-based diversity studies. Nucleic Acids Research 41, e1–e1.
doi:10.1093/nar/gks808
Kohli, M., Borer, E.T., Kinkel, L., Seabloom, E.W., 2019. Stability of grassland production is
robust to changes in the consumer food web. Ecology Letters 22, 707–716.
doi:10.1111/ele.13232
Konapala, G., Mishra, A.K., Wada, Y., Mann, M.E., 2020. Climate change will affect global
water availability through compounding changes in seasonal precipitation and
evaporation. Nature Communications 11, 1–10. doi:10.1038/s41467-020-16757-w
Lechón-Alonso, P., Clegg, T., Cook, J., Smith, T.P., Pawar, S., 2021. The role of competition
versus cooperation in microbial community coalescence. PLOS Computational Biology
17, e1009584. doi:10.1371/journal.pcbi.1009584
Legendre, P., Legendre, L., 2012. Numerical Ecology, 3rd ed. Elsevier. doi:10.2307/2530779
Li, Y., Wang, X., Chen, Y., Gong, X., Yao, C., Cao, W., Lian, J., 2023. Application of
predictor variables to support regression kriging for the spatial distribution of soil
organic carbon stocks in native temperate grasslands. Journal of Soils and Sediments 23,
700–717. doi:10.1007/s11368-022-03370-1
López Zieher, X.M., Vivanco, L., Yahdjian, L., 2020. Soil bacterial communities remain
altered after 30 years of agriculture abandonment in Pampa grasslands. Oecologia 193,
959–968. doi:10.1007/s00442-020-04736-3
Loreau, M., Naeem, S., Inchausti, P., Bengtsson, J., Grime, J.P., Hector, A., Hooper, D.U.,
Huston, M.A., Raffaelli, D., Schmid, B., Tilman, D., Wardle, D.A., 2001. Biodiversity
and Ecosystem Functioning: Current Knowledge and Future Challenges. Science 294,
804–808. doi:10.1126/science.1064088

Louca, S., Parfrey, L.W., Doebeli, M., 2016. Decoupling function and taxonomy in the global
ocean microbiome. Science 353, 1272–1277. doi:10.1126/science.aaf4507
Maestre, F.T., Eldridge, D.J., Soliveres, S., Kéfi, S., Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Bowker, M.A.,
García-Palacios, P., Gaitán, J., Gallardo, A., Lázaro, R., Berdugo, M., 2016. Structure
and Functioning of Dryland Ecosystems in a Changing World. Annual Review of
Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 47, 215–237. doi:10.1146/annurev-ecolsys-
121415-032311
McSherry, M.E., Ritchie, M.E., 2013. Effects of grazing on grassland soil carbon: A global
review. Global Change Biology 19, 1347–1357. doi:10.1111/gcb.12144
Millard, P., Singh, B.K., 2010. Does grassland vegetation drive soil microbial diversity?
Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems 88, 147–158. doi:10.1007/s10705-009-9314-3
Morrissey, E.M., Mau, R.L., Hayer, M., Liu, X.J.A., Schwartz, E., Dijkstra, P., Koch, B.J.,
Allen, K., Blazewicz, S.J., Hofmockel, K., Pett-Ridge, J., Hungate, B.A., 2019.
Evolutionary history constrains microbial traits across environmental variation. Nature
Ecology and Evolution 3, 1064–1069. doi:10.1038/s41559-019-0918-y
Naidu, D.G.T., Roy, S., Bagchi, S., 2022. Loss of grazing by large mammalian herbivores
can destabilize the soil carbon pool. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences
119, 1–7. doi:10.1073/pnas.2211317119
Oksanen, J., Blanchet, F.G., Friendly, M., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., Mcglinn, D., Minchin,
P.R., O'Hara, R.B., Simpson, G.L., Solymos, P., Stevens, M.H.H., Szoecs, E., Wagner,
H., 2019. vegan: community ecology package. R package version 2.5-6.
Olff, H., Ritchie, M.E., 1998. Effects of herbivores on grassland plant diversity. Trends in
Ecology & Evolution 13, 261–265. doi:10.1016/S0169-5347(98)01364-0
Peter, H., Beier, S., Bertilsson, S., Lindström, E.S., Langenheder, S., Tranvik, L.J., 2011.
Function-specific response to depletion of microbial diversity. ISME Journal 5, 351–
361. doi:10.1038/ismej.2010.119
Pinheiro, J., Bates, D., 2000. Mixed-Effects Models in S and S-PLUS, 1st ed, Mixed-Effects
Models in S and S-PLUS. Springer, New York, NY. doi:10.1007/b98882
Quast, C., Pruesse, E., Yilmaz, P., Gerken, J., Schweer, T., Yarza, P., Peplies, J., Glöckner,
F.O., 2013. The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: Improved data
processing and web-based tools. Nucleic Acids Research 41, D590–D596.
doi:10.1093/nar/gks1219
Reich, P.B., Tilman, D., Isbell, F., Mueller, K., Hobbie, S.E., Flynn, D.F.B., Eisenhauer, N.,
2012. Impacts of biodiversity loss escalate through time as redundancy fades. Science
336, 589–592. doi:10.1126/science.1217909
Ribeiro Jr, P.J., Diggle, P., Christensen, O., Schlather, M., Bivand, R., Ripley, B., 2022.
geoR: Analysis of Geostatistical Data. R Package Version 1.9-2.
Robertson, G.P., Coleman, D.C., Bledsoe, C.S., Sollins, P., 1999. Standard soil methods for
long-term ecological research. Oxford University Press, New York, NY.
doi:10.1016/s0016-7061(01)00063-5
Rosseel, Y., 2012. lavaan: An R Package for Structural Equation Modelin. Journal of
Statistical Software 48, 1–36.
Rowell, M.J., 1995. Colorimetric method for CO_2 measurement in soils. Soil Biology and
Biochemistry 27, 373–375. doi:10.1016/0038-0717(94)00218-P
Roy, S., Bagchi, S., 2022. Large Mammalian Herbivores and the Paradox of Soil Carbon in
Grazing Ecosystems: Role of Microbial Decomposers and Their Enzymes. Ecosystems
25, 976–988. doi:10.1007/s10021-021-00696-8
Roy, S., Naidu, D.G.T., Bagchi, S., 2023. Functional substitutability of native herbivores by
livestock for soil carbon stock is mediated by microbial decomposers. Global Change
Biology 29, 2141–2155. doi:10.1111/gcb.16600

Sankaran, M., Augustine, D.J., 2004. Large herbivores suppress decomposer abundance in a semiarid grazing ecosystem. Ecology 85, 1052–1061. doi:10.1890/03-0354

Schlaepfer, D.R., Bradford, J.B., Lauenroth, W.K., Munson, S.M., Tietjen, B., Hall, S.A., Wilson, S.D., Duniway, M.C., Jia, G., Pyke, D.A., Lkhagva, A., Jamiyansharav, K., 2017. Climate change reduces extent of temperate drylands and intensifies drought in deep soils. Nature Communications 8, 1–9. doi:10.1038/ncomms14196

Schloss, P.D., Westcott, S.L., Ryabin, T., Hall, J.R., Hartmann, M., Hollister, E.B., Lesniewski, R.A., Oakley, B.B., Parks, D.H., Robinson, C.J., Sahl, J.W., Stres, B., Thallinger, G.G., Van Horn, D.J., Weber, C.F., 2009. Introducing mothur: Open-source, platform-independent, community-supported software for describing and comparing microbial communities. Applied and Environmental Microbiology 75, 7537–7541. doi:10.1128/aem.01541-09

Schulze, E.-D., Mooney, H.A., 1993. Biodiversity and Ecosystem Function. Springer Verlag, New York.

Sinsabaugh, R.L., Lauber, C.L., Weintraub, M.N., Ahmed, B., Allison, S.D., Crenshaw, C., Contosta, A.R., Cusack, D., Frey, S., Gallo, M.E., Gartner, T.B., Hobbie, S.E., Holland, K., Keeler, B.L., Powers, J.S., Stursova, M., Takacs-Vesbach, C., Waldrop, M.P., Wallenstein, M.D., Zak, D.R., Zeglin, L.H., 2008. Stoichiometry of soil enzyme activity at global scale. Ecology Letters 11, 1252–1264. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2008.01245.x

Tanentzap, A.J., Coomes, D.A., 2012. Carbon storage in terrestrial ecosystems: Do browsing and grazing herbivores matter? Biological Reviews 87, 72–94. doi:10.1111/j.1469-185X.2011.00185.x

Thompson, L.R., Sanders, J.G., McDonald, D., Amir, A., Ladau, J., Locey, K.J., Prill, R.J., Tripathi, A., Gibbons, S.M., Ackermann, G., Navas-Molina, J.A., Janssen, S., Kopylova, E., Vázquez-Baeza, Y., González, A., Morton, J.T., Mirarab, S., Xu, Z.Z., Jiang, L., Haroon, M.F., Kanbar, J., Zhu, Q., Song, S.J., Kosciolek, T., Bokulich, N.A., Lefler, J., Brislawn, C.J., Humphrey, G., Owens, S.M., Hampton-Marcell, J., Berg-Lyons, D., McKenzie, V., Fierer, N., Fuhrman, J.A., Clauset, A., Stevens, R.L., Shade, A., Pollard, K.S., Goodwin, K.D., Jansson, J.K., Gilbert, J.A., Knight, R., Agosto Rivera, J.L., Al-Moosawi, L., Alverdy, J., Amato, K.R., Andras, J., Angenent, L.T., Antonopoulos, D.A., Apprill, A., Armitage, D., Ballantine, K., Bárta, J., Baum, J.K., Berry, A., Bhatnagar, A., Bhatnagar, M., Biddle, J.F., Bittner, L., Boldgiv, B., Bottos, E., Boyer, D.M., Braun, J., Brazelton, W., Brearley, F.Q., Campbell, A.H., Caporaso, J.G., Cardona, C., Carroll, J.L., Cary, S.C., Casper, B.B., Charles, T.C., Chu, H., Claar, D.C., Clark, R.G., Clayton, J.B., Clemente, J.C., Cochran, A., Coleman, M.L., Collins, G., Colwell, R.R., Contreras, M., Crary, B.B., Creer, S., Cristol, D.A., Crump, B.C., Cui, D., Daly, S.E., Davalos, L., Dawson, R.D., Defazio, J., Delsuc, F., Dionisi, H.M., Dominguez-Bello, M.G., Dowell, R., Dubinsky, E.A., Dunn, P.O., Ercolini, D., Espinoza, R.E., Ezenwa, V., Fenner, N., Findlay, H.S., Fleming, I.D., Fogliano, V., Forsman, A., Freeman, C., Friedman, E.S., Galindo, G., Garcia, L., Garcia-Amado, M.A., Garshelis, D., Gasser, R.B., Gerdts, G., Gibson, M.K., Gifford, I., Gill, R.T., Giray, T., Gittel, A., Golyshin, P., Gong, D., Grossart, H.P., Guyton, K., Haig, S.J., Hale, V., Hall, R.S., Hallam, S.J., Handley, K.M., Hasan, N.A., Haydon, S.R., Hickman, J.E., Hidalgo, G., Hofmockel, K.S., Hooker, J., Hulth, S., Hultman, J., Hyde, E., Ibáñez-Álamo, J.D., Jastrow, J.D., Jex, A.R., Johnson, L.S., Johnston, E.R., Joseph, S., Jurburg, S.D., Jurelevicius, D., Karlsson, A., Karlsson, R., Kauppinen, S., Kellogg, C.T.E., Kennedy, S.J., Kerkhof, L.J., King, G.M., Kling, G.W., Koehler, A. V., Krezalek, M., Kueneman, J., Lamendella, R., Landon, E.M., Lanede Graaf, K., LaRoche, J., Larsen, P., Laverock, B., Lax, S., Lentino, M., Levin, I.I., Liancourt, P., Liang, W., Linz, A.M., Lipson, D.A., Liu, Y., Lladser, M.E., Lozada, M., Spirito, C.M., MacCormack, W.P.,

MacRae-Crerar, A., Magris, M., Martín-Platero, A.M., Martín-Vivaldi, M., Martínez,
L.M., Martínez-Bueno, M., Marzinelli, E.M., Mason, O.U., Mayer, G.D., McDevitt-
Irwin, J.M., McDonald, J.E., McGuire, K.L., McMahon, K.D., McMinds, R., Medina,
M., Mendelson, J.R., Metcalf, J.L., Meyer, F., Michelangeli, F., Miller, K., Mills, D.A.,
Minich, J., Mocali, S., Moitinho-Silva, L., Moore, A., Morgan-Kiss, R.M., Munroe, P.,
Myrold, D., Neufeld, J.D., Ni, Y., Nicol, G.W., Nielsen, S., Nissimov, J.I., Niu, K.,
Nolan, M.J., Noyce, K., O'Brien, S.L., Okamoto, N., Orlando, L., Castellano, Y.O.,
Osuolale, O., Oswald, W., Parnell, J., Peralta-Sánchez, J.M., Petraitis, P., Pfister, C.,
Pilon-Smits, E., Piombino, P., Pointing, S.B., Pollock, F.J., Potter, C., Prithiviraj, B.,
Quince, C., Rani, A., Ranjan, R., Rao, S., Rees, A.P., Richardson, M., Riebesell, U.,
Robinson, C., Rockne, K.J., Rodriguezl, S.M., Rohwer, F., Roundstone, W., Safran,
R.J., Sangwan, N., Sanz, V., Schrenk, M., Schrenzel, M.D., Scott, N.M., Seger, R.L.,
Seguinorlando, A., Seldin, L., Seyler, L.M., Shakhsheer, B., Sheets, G.M., Shen, C., Shi,
Y., Shin, H., Shogan, B.D., Shutler, D., Siegel, J., Simmons, S., Sjöling, S., Smith, D.P.,
Soler, J.J., Sperling, M., Steinberg, P.D., Stephens, B., Stevens, M.A., Taghavi, S., Tai,
V., Tait, K., Tan, C.L., Taş, N., Taylor, D.L., Thomas, T., Timling, I., Turner, B.L.,
Urich, T., Ursell, L.K., Van Der Lelie, D., Van Treuren, W., Van Zwieten, L., Vargas-
Robles, D., Thurber, R.V., Vitaglione, P., Walker, D.A., Walters, W.A., Wang, S.,
Wang, T., Weaver, T., Webster, N.S., Wehrle, B., Weisenhorn, P., Weiss, S., Werner,
J.J., West, K., Whitehead, A., Whitehead, S.R., Whittingham, L.A., Willerslev, E.,
Williams, A.E., Wood, S.A., Woodhams, D.C., Yang, Y., Zaneveld, J., Zarraonaindia,
I., Zhang, Q., Zhao, H., 2017. A communal catalogue reveals Earth's multiscale
microbial diversity. Nature 551, 457–463. doi:10.1038/nature24621
Tilman, D., Isbell, F., Cowles, J.M., 2014. Biodiversity and Ecosystem Functioning. Annual
Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 45, 471–493. doi:10.1146/annurev-
ecolsys-120213-091917
Tilman, D., Knops, J., Wedin, D., Reich, P., Ritchie, M., Siemann, E., 1997. The Influence of
Functional Diversity and Composition on Ecosystem Processes. Science 277, 1300–
1302. doi:10.1126/science.277.5330.1300
Wagg, C., Schlaeppi, K., Banerjee, S., Kuramae, E.E., van der Heijden, M.G.A., 2019.
Fungal-bacterial diversity and microbiome complexity predict ecosystem functioning.
Nature Communications 10, 1–10. doi:10.1038/s41467-019-12798-y
Wang, C., Tang, Y., 2019. A global meta-analyses of the response of multi-taxa diversity to
grazing intensity in grasslands. Environmental Research Letters 14, 114003.
doi:10.1088/1748-9326/ab4932
Wilson, C.H., Strickland, M.S., Hutchings, J.A., Bianchi, T.S., Flory, S.L., 2018. Grazing
enhances belowground carbon allocation, microbial biomass, and soil carbon in a
subtropical grassland. Global Change Biology 24, 2997–3009. doi:10.1111/gcb.14070
Ylänne, H., Madsen, R.L., Castaño, C., Metcalfe, D.B., Clemmensen, K.E., 2021. Reindeer
control over subarctic treeline alters soil fungal communities with potential
consequences for soil carbon storage. Global Change Biology 27, 4254–4268.
doi:10.1111/gcb.15722
767
768

FIGURES

Fig. 1

Figure 1. Treemaps summarizing the microbial taxonomic profile (phylum level) and

microbial functional profile (n=30 substrates) in the presence and absence of large

mammalian herbivores averaged for all plots and across the growth season (Early, Mid, and

Late). Area of each cell is proportional to the total abundance of each phylum and catabolic

activity for each substrate, respectively. Number denotes the percentage of the relative

abundance (taxonomy) and relative microbial activity (function). Data are from n=10 paired

grazed-and-fenced plots in Spiti region of Trans-Himalaya in northern India.

Fig. 2

Figure 2. Species richness of soil microbes (a), functional richness (b), and functional

dispersion (c), in the presence and absence of large mammalian herbivores across the growth

season. Species richness (mean ± 95% CI) did not vary between grazed and ungrazed plots,

and with the growth season. Functional richness and functional dispersion did not vary

between grazed and ungrazed plots, but varied across the growth season. Data are from n=10

paired grazed-and-fenced plots in Spiti region of Trans-Himalaya in northern India.

Fig. 3

Figure 3. Summary of ordination by Principal Coordinates Analysis (PCoA) for microbial

communities and decomposer functions in the presence and absence of large mammalian

herbivores, and at different points in the growth season. Overall, both taxonomic and

functional composition of soil microbial decomposers did not vary between grazed and

ungrazed plots, but they varied across the growth season. Data are from n=10 paired grazed-

and-fenced plots in Spiti region of Trans-Himalaya in northern India.

Fig. 4

Figure 4. Kriged maps summarizing the relationship of microbial functional richness (a), and

functional dispersion (b) with microbial species composition, show that microbial

decomposer functions can vary with species composition. The colored space highlights the

interpolation of microbial functions across the extent of microbial species composition from

the study site measured at different points in the growth season. Species composition is

represented as first and second axes of principal coordinate analysis (PCoA). Circles denote

the sampled data points for species composition. Value in the legend indicates the range of

interpolated values of respective functional index.

Fig. 5

Figure 5. Summary of distance-based structural equation model (dbSEM) to evaluate the

influence of grazing, seasons, soil abiotic properties, on the relationship between species

diversity and microbial functions. Values represent standardized path coefficients and asterix

represent statistical significance (***P≤0.01, **P≤0.05, and *P≤0.10). Modelled paths from

grazing (grazed/ungrazed) were non-significant, and are not shown. Diagnostics for the

model was SRMR=0.004, RMSEA<0.001, P-value (RMSEA)=0.982, CFI>0.999, χ^2=1.34,

df=2, P-value (χ^2)=0.512. Overall, there was a positive relationship between microbial

functions and species composition, whereas species richness had no influence on functions.

Fig. 6

Figure 6. Summary of thought experiment to assess how the number of measured functions

can influence the interpretation of diversity-function relationships in (a). Through iterative

resampling of our functional data, we generated 2800 subsets with 100 different possible

combinations of 2 to 29 functions. For each subset, we repeated dbSEM analyses (Fig. 5)

checked for the significance (α=0.1) of path connecting species diversity (species richness,

and species composition) to functions (function richness, and functional composition). We

report the P-value of the above-mentioned paths (Species diversity $\rightarrow$ Function) for each

combination of 2 to 29 functions (mean ± 95 CI across 100 iterations). This thought

experiment reveals that 16 or more functions are sufficient to recapitulate the results seen for

the full dataset of 30 substrates. Conceptual summary of three types of studies on diversity-

function relationships for microbes that accommodate different number of species and

functions (b). Studies on experimentally assembled communities of 10^1 species and 10^1

functions (Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2016a; Wagg et al., 2019), usually encounter a positive

relationship between species richness and functions (i.e., #1). Studies with hyper-diverse

natural communities with 10^3 species (Delgado-Baquerizo et al., 2017; this study), generally

encounter partial redundancy (i.e., #2). Studies with metagenomic interpretations of a large

number of putative functions (Fierer et al., 2013; Louca et al., 2016; Galand et al., 2018;

Chen et al., 2022) also encounter partial redundancy (i.e., #3).

840   **APPENDIX**

841   **Community composition, and not species richness of microbes, influences decomposer**

842   **functional diversity in soil**

843   Shamik Roy, Jalmesh Karapurkar, Pronoy Baidya, M. Jose, Sumanta Bagchi

845   CONTENTS

Fig. S1.

Figure S1. Map of study site showing sampling locations in Spiti region of the Trans-

Himalaya in northern India. Each sample consists of a paired grazed-and fenced plot (10 m ×

10 m).

Fig. S2.

Figure S2. Summary of edaphic conditions – soil pH (a), soil moisture (b), and soil texture

(c), in the presence and absence of large mammalian herbivores (n=10 paired plots). Soils

were near-neutral, showed higher moisture content during early-season (snowmelt), and were

of sandy-loam texture.

Figure S3. Summary of soil microbial communities at the phylum level (covering >=90% of

the total abundance) and microbial functional profiles (n=30 substrates) in the presence and

absence of large mammalian herbivores (n=10 paired plots) across the growth season.

Fig. S4.

Figure S4. Relationship between species richness and functional richness (a), and functional

dispersion (b), in the presence and absence of large mammalian herbivores across the growth

season. Species richness was not related to microbial functions in both grazed and ungrazed

plots across the growth season.

Table S1. Best model for kriging using sum of squares (SSQ)

	Trend	Nugget	Exponential (SSQ)	Spherical (SSQ)	Gaussian (SSQ)
Functional richness	No	Fixed	52551.11	59125.98	59125.98
		Estimated	52745.91	51583.67	59125.98
	1st	Fixed	33433.22	39481.94	39481.94
		Estimated	33433.24	39481.94	39481.94
	2nd	Fixed	**29508.12**	34531.09	34531.09
		Estimated	29508.12	34531.09	34531.09
Functional dispersion	No	Fixed	0.007484251	0.007484251	0.007484251
		Estimated	0.007484251	0.007484251	0.007484251
	1st	Fixed	0.005320591	0.005320591	0.005320591
		Estimated	0.005320591	0.005320591	0.005320591
	2nd	Fixed	**0.004776054**	0.004776054	0.004776054
		Estimated	0.004776054	0.004776054	0.004776054

881   Table S2. Summary of omnibus GLM model: Functions ~ Species richness * Grazing *

882   Season

y-variable	x-variable	F-value	P-value
Functional richness	Species Richness	$F_{1,48}=0.20$	0.653
	Grazing	$F_{1,48}=0.01$	0.944
	Season	$F_{2,48}=36.82$	<0.001
	Taxonomy × Grazing	$F_{1,48}=1.94$	0.169
	Taxonomy × Season	$F_{2,48}=1.25$	0.296
	Grazing × Season	$F_{2,48}=0.28$	0.754
	Taxonomy × Grazing × Season	$F_{2,48}=0.34$	0.716
Functional dispersion	Species Richness	$F_{1,48}=0.07$	0.796
	Grazing	$F_{1,48}=0.01$	0.952
	Season	$F_{2,48}=42.18$	<0.001
	Taxonomy × Grazing	$F_{1,48}=0.11$	0.737
	Taxonomy × Season	$F_{2,48}=0.27$	0.767
	Grazing × Season	$F_{2,48}=0.18$	0.825
	Taxonomy × Grazing × Season	$F_{2,48}=0.51$	0.604

884
885