1

Emergence of *Prochlorococcus* in the Tonian oceans and the initiation of Neoproterozoic

oxygenation

Hao Zhang[1,2^], Sishuo Wang[2^], Tianhua Liao[2], Sean A. Crowe[3], Haiwei Luo[2,4,5*]

[1]Shenzhen Research Institute, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shenzhen 518000, China

[2]Simon F. S. Li Marine Science Laboratory, School of Life Sciences and State Key Laboratory of Agrobiotechnology, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, Hong Kong SAR

[3]Departments of Microbiology and Immunology, and Earth, Ocean, and Atmospheric Sciences, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada

[4]Earth and Environmental Sciences Programme, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, Hong Kong SAR

[5]Institute of Environment, Energy and Sustainability, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, Hong Kong SAR

[^] These authors contributed equally to this study

[*]**Corresponding author:** Haiwei Luo

Email: haiweiluo@cuhk.edu.hk

Competing Interest Statement: The authors declare no competing interests.

Key words: *Prochlorococcus*, Neoproterozoic oxygenation event, molecular dating, plastid, cyanobacteria

Abstract

Prochlorococcus are the smallest and most abundant photosynthetic organisms on Earth, contributing up to 50% of the chlorophyll in the oligotrophic oceans. Despite being important in regulating the carbon cycle in today's ocean, the ecological significance of *Prochlorococcus* in Earth's history remains elusive. Our new robustly calibrated molecular clock analysis reveals that *Prochlorococcus* emerged in the deep photic zone of the Tonian (1,000-720 Mya) oceans. The classical light-harvesting antenna complex in Cyanobacteria, i.e., the phycobilisome, was replaced in *Prochlorococcus* by the chlorophyll☐based antenna, enabling more efficient use of blue light that penetrates into deeper water. Importantly, *Prochlorococcus* colonization of deep water enhanced access to phosphate, which was abundant in upwelled seawater, but likely scarce in the Tonian surface ocean, promoting expansion of *Prochlorococcus,* displacement of incumbent low-light adapted anoxygenic photoferrotrophs, and associated increases in photosynthetic oxygen production. Colonization of deeper waters would also have improved access to ammonium, leading to the neutral loss of nitrate utilization genes. Our research thus documents the conspicuous emergence of new photosynthetic bacterial lineages in the run-up to the Neoproterozoic oxygenation event, implying an additional layer of eco-evolutionary complexity during this pivotal interval in Earth's history.

Introduction

Prochlorococcus host more than half of the chlorophyll biomass in oligotrophic oceans

(Partensky and Garczarek, 2010). As key primary producers in the modern ocean,

Prochlorococcus fix as much as four gigatons of carbon each year and are the foundation of

the marine carbon cycle and food web (Flombaum et al., 2013). The success of

Prochlorococcus in today's oceans has been attributed to multiple physiological features.

Importantly, *Prochlorococcus* use divinyl chlorophyll (DVChl) for harnessing light energy

(Ralf and Repeta, 1992). DVChl harvests blue light much more efficiently than the more

common monovinyl chlorophyll used by other cyanobacterial lineages and it thus enables

Prochlorococcus to thrive in the deepest layers of the euphotic zone, where blue light

dominates (Ito and Tanaka, 2011). *Prochlorococcus* is also the smallest photosynthetic

organism on Earth (Partensky et al., 1999). As a result, their high surface-to-volume ratio

provides enhanced nutrient acquisition efficiency, which together with effective blue-light

absorption promotes photosynthesis by *Prochlorococcus* in oligotrophic tropical and

subtropical oceans (Partensky et al., 1999). In today's ocean, *Prochlorococcus* is also the

dominant phototroph in more nutrient-rich, oxygen-depleted anoxic marine zones (AMZ) in

the eastern tropical North and South Pacific Oceans (Goericke et al., 2000; Lavin et al., 2010).

Since the AMZ lineages represent the earliest-split branches of *Prochlorococcus*, it has been

proposed that *Prochlorococcus* emerged in low-oxygen environments and, by extension,

contributed to early ocean oxygenation (Ulloa et al., 2021).

The emergence of an early branch of *Prochlorococcus* (named SBE-LCA) during the

Cryogenian based on our recent study (Zhang et al. 2021) implies the origin of the total

Prochlorococcus group earlier in the Proterozoic Eon. Such an earlier origin then suggests

that *Prochlorococcus* might have contributed to the cyanobacterial dominated primary

production that supported marine biogeochemical cycles and underpinned dynamic ocean

chemistry in the run-up to the Sturtian Snowball Earth glaciation. This was an important

period in Earth's history that ultimately led to an Earth system succession and the rise of

eukaryotes with algae emerging as key primary producers before the end of the Cryogenian

(Brocks et al. 2017). Deciphering the potential role, if any, that *Prochlorococcus* might have

played depends critically on an accurate estimate of the origin time for *Prochlorococcus*.

By far, however, the divergence time of *Prochlorococcus* remains contentious from ~200

Mya to ~1,000 Mya (Sánchez-Baracaldo et al., 2014; Sánchez-Baracaldo, 2015;

Schirrmeister et al., 2015; Sánchez-Baracaldo et al., 2017; Boden et al., 2021; Fournier et al.,

2021; Martinez-Gutierrez et al., 2023). The discrepancies in *Prochlorococcus* divergence

times are likely caused by variable use of fossils and other time calibrations and the use of

alternative gene sets, clock models, and tree topologies (Warnock et al., 2012; Duchêne et al.,

2014; dos Reis et al., 2015) (see Supplementary Discussion). Despite their importance, these

factors were rarely tested rigorously thus making it difficult to evaluate the accuracy of age

estimates in previous studies. Importantly, even if all these factors are well tested and

controlled, the rarity of cyanobacterial fossils poses a notable challenge in determining the

antiquity of *Prochlorococcus*, particularly considering the lack of maximum age information

when only cyanobacterial fossils were used (Zhang et al., 2021). Indeed, applying maximum

age constraints at the calibration nodes strongly impacts posterior age estimates of

uncalibrated lineages (Hedges et al., 2018; Morris et al., 2018; Wang and Luo, 2021).

However, informative maximum age constraints are typically missing from microbial fossils

and can only be found in some animal and plant fossils. Moreover, the recent availability of

several genome sequences of uncultivated basal *Prochlorococcus* lineages (Ulloa et al., 2021)

requires re-estimation of the antiquity of *Prochlorococcus*, which should also include an

evaluation of the factors that influence the accuracy of posterior ages.

Here, we leverage the abundant plant and algal fossils and the well-established plant

plastid endosymbiosis theory to develop a new pipeline that systematically tests the factors

that influence the accuracy of posterior ages and thus yields robust estimates of

Prochlorococcus antiquity. The plant plastid endosymbiosis theory states that the origin of all

plastids in photosynthetic eukaryotes, except for the photosynthetic amoeba *Paulinella*

(Marin et al., 2005), can be traced back to an ancient primary endosymbiosis involving a

eukaryote and a cyanobacterium (Gray, 1992; Bhattacharya and Medlin, 1995; Keeling, 2013;

Ponce-Toledo et al., 2017). Plant plastid endosymbiosis theory thus ties the evolutionary

histories of cyanobacteria to those of photosynthetic eukaryotes. Eukaryotic fossils are indeed

being increasingly used in dating the evolution of Cyanobacteria (Shih et al., 2016; Sánchez-

Baracaldo et al., 2017; Fournier et al., 2021). Our strategy builds on these by: 1) using more

fossil-based age constraints (including maximum age constraints) on eukaryotic lineages with

more complete taxonomic sampling including lineages that have undergone secondary

endosymbiosis; and 2) applying a Bayesian sequential dating approach to better constrain the

divergence time of eukaryotic lineages thereby propagating more accurate time information

to Cyanobacteria, including *Prochlorococcus*. Note that the Bayesian sequential method used

here is different from the commonly used secondary dating method (using time estimates

from previous studies as calibrations) (Heckman et al., 2001; Aoki et al., 2013; Chriki-Adeeb

and Chriki, 2016) for two reasons. First, the time prior used in sequential dating analysis

follows a specific probability distribution, but secondary calibrations ignore the uncertainties

on age estimates. Second, the sequential dating analysis contains two steps each based on a

distinct set of molecular data, while secondary dating analysis largely relies on the same

molecular dataset (gene alignments) (dos Reis et al., 2018). These joint analyses led us to

conclude that *Prochlorococcus* arose in the Tonian (1,000-720 Mya) oceans. Further,

population genetic analysis implies that *Prochlorococcus* was born through a founder effect,

and this strengthens the idea that *Prochlorococcus* emerged in the deep photic zone, a unique

niche separated from upper waters where its ancestors (i.e., the last common ancestor of

Prochlorococcus and its sister clade in the genus *Synechococcus*) thrived.

Results and Discussion

Prochlorococcus originated in the Tonian ocean

We implemented a Bayesian sequential dating method that takes advantage of the

abundant fossil records (Fig. 1a; Fig. S1a) available from photosynthetic eukaryotes to

calibrate the evolution of Cyanobacteria. In our implementations, the posterior ages of

eukaryotic lineages derived from the first-step of the sequential analysis were used as the

time priors to calibrate Cyanobacteria evolution where only a few time constraints are

available. To achieve this goal, we first implemented the genome-scale dating analysis of the

eukaryotic lineages and confirmed that the posterior ages of the crown eukaryotic group were

consistent with the previous estimates at ~1.6 Gya (Parfrey et al., 2011; Betts et al., 2018;

Wang and Luo, 2021) (Fig. S1b). We then compared the posterior age distributions of

eukaryotic nodes from the first-step analysis to the distributions of the effective time prior on

the corresponding nodes in the second-step analysis. The nearly identical distributions found

in the comparisons suggest that the Bayesian sequential dating approach works well in these

cases (Fig. S2).

Our dating analysis implies that the last common ancestor (LCA) of *Prochlorococcus*

(denoted as "Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA") emerged within the Tonian period at 878 Mya (95%

HPD: 987-767 Mya) (Fig. 1b). Meanwhile, the LCA of *Prochlorococcus* clades HL, LL and

AMZI/II (denoted as "Proch-AMZI/II-LCA") evolved at 787 Mya (95% HPD: 896-687 Mya),

which coincided with the early stage of the Neoproterozoic Oxygenation Event (NOE; 800-

550 Mya) (Fig. 1b). In this case, the branch leading to the LCA of *Prochlorococcus* HL, LLI,

and LLII/III clades (denoted as "SBE-LCA" to keep consistency with (Zhang et al., 2021))

spanned the time that encompassed the duration of the Neoproterozoic Snowball Earth events

(645-635 Mya for Marinoan glaciation and 717-659 Mya for Sturtian glaciation), supporting

the main conclusion of the previous study, which used the traditional cyanobacterial fossil-

based strategy (Zhang et al., 2021).

To validate the evolutionary timeline of *Prochlorococcus*, we performed a series of tests

by using different molecular data, clock models, fossil calibrations and species tree

topologies. The posterior ages estimated with all these alternative settings are largely

consistent with that estimated with the focal strategy (detailed above) and fully support the

origin of *Prochlorococcus* (Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA) in the Tonian period (1,000-720 Mya),

even when the maximum root age changed from 3.8 Gya to 4.5 Gya (Fig. S3). Moreover, the

emergence of Proch-AMZI/II-LCA was consistently estimated to occur in the early stages of

the NOE (800-550 Mya) (Fig. S4), and that the branch leading to the SBE-LCA encompasses

the Snowball Earth events in all the dating analyses (Fig. S5; see Supplementary Results).

<u>The emergence of *Prochlorococcus* is associated with a founder effect</u>

The method for inferring selection efficiency in deep time was developed (Zhang, 2000)

and recently improved (Luo et al., 2017), which involves nonsynonymous substitutions only

and compares the rate of nonsynonymous substitutions leading to replacements of

physicochemically dissimilar amino acids (i.e., radical changes; d_R) to the rate of

nonsynonymous substitutions leading to replacements of physicochemically similar amino

acids (i.e., conservative changes; d_C). Since radical changes are more likely to be deleterious

than conservative changes (E. Zuckerkandl, 1965; Dayhoff, 1972), an excess of the radical

changes in a deeply branching lineage compared to its sister lineage suggests random fixation

of deleterious mutations by genetic drift in the former. Using this method, we found a

significant increase of the d_R/d_C ratio across the genomic regions in the branch leading to

Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA relative to the branch leading to the LCA of *Synechococcus* clade 5.1

(Fig. 2a), indicating that the emergence of *Prochlorococcus* was accompanied by a significant

reduction of the efficiency of purifying selection and a potentially severe reduction in the

effective population size (N_e), allowing for an accelerated accumulation of deleterious

mutations through genetic drift.

We propose that the colonization of the deep photic zone by *Prochlorococcus* started by a

seed population that obtained the ability to use divinyl chlorophylls. Therefore, the reduced

N_e upon the emergence of *Prochlorococcus* was likely caused by a "founder effect", which

suggests that a new population was established by a few individuals from a larger ancestral

population (Barton et al., 1984). Note that this mechanism is different from population

bottleneck, which is often caused by the environmental disasters. The latter has been used to

explain the reduced N_e occurring on the branch leading to SBE-LCA (Zhang et al., 2021).

That conclusion is confirmed here with the inclusion of new SAG genomes, as the d_R/d_C

values in the branch leading to SBE-LCA were significantly elevated compared to the those

in the branches leading to *Prochlorococcus* LLIV and AMZ clades (Fig. 2b)

Prochlorococcus genomic changes and niche adaptation

As the only phytoplankton group using divinyl chlorophyll (DVChl) for harvesting light

energy (Ralf and Repeta, 1992), *Prochlorococcus* lost the gene *bciB* that performs the

conversion of DVChl to MVChl (monovinyl chlorophyll) at Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA, thereby

promoting the accumulation of DVChl in their membranes (Ito et al., 2008). Compared to the

MVChl used by *Synechococcus*, DVChl more efficiently absorbs blue light that penetrates to

deeper waters than other photosynthetically active radiation (Ito and Tanaka, 2011). Likewise,

the gain of the *PcCao* gene for the synthesis of chlorophyll b (Satoh and Tanaka, 2006) in

Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA also enables *Prochlorococcus* ancestors to efficiently harvest blue

light at exceedingly low intensities characteristic of deep waters (Hess et al., 2001) (Fig. 1b).

These genomic changes would have enabled *Prochlorococcus* ancestors to explore the deep

photic zone, a niche where its *Synechococcus* ancestor would not thrive.

We infer that dwelling in deeper waters confers competitive advantages upon

Prochlorococcus. A well-known advantage emerges under conditions of strong phosphorus (P)

limitation, whereby deep-dwelling low-light adapted phototrophs gain first access to

upwelling phosphorus (Jones et al., 2015; Ozaki et al., 2019). The low-light advantage

conferred on the earliest *Prochlorococcus* cells through the adoption of divinyl chlorophyll

would have enhanced their access to P, relative to contemporary algae and its own ancestors.

It would also have increased access to NH_4^+ upwelling from deeper anoxic waters obviating

the need for nitrate assimilation (Michiels et al., 2017) (Fig. 1c).

Unlike most cyanobacteria, which use the phycobilisome as the photosynthetic antenna,

the main light-harvesting antenna of *Prochlorococcus* is made up of prochlorophyte

chlorophyll-binding (Pcb) protein (Biller et al., 2015). By reconstructing the gene

evolutionary paths with *Prochlorococcus* SAGs included, we found that the phycobilisome

genes (*apcACDEF*, *cpcEFG*, and *cpeCES*) were present in both Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA and

Proch-AMZI/II-LCA and lost at SBE-LCA. Using the same approach, we found that the

cholorophyll-binding protein (encoded by *pcbD*) was obtained at Proch-AMZI/II-LCA. The

replacement of the photosynthetic antenna thus did not co-occur with the emergence of

Prochlorococcus. We note that gene absence in SAGs could result from the incomplete nature

of the SAG genomes, however, in this case, simultaneous absence of the *pcbD* gene in all the

five SAGs that are more than 80% complete seems unlikely.

The phycobilisome constitutes as much as 50%-60% of the soluble proteins in

Synechococcus (Grossman et al., 1993). The loss of the phycobilisome was thought to reduce

nitrogen (N) investments by at least 40% in *Prochlorococcus* (Ting et al., 2002). Therefore,

the losses of phycobilisome genes was once considered to be favored by *Prochlorococcus*

conferred advantages to inhabiting oligotrophic oceans (Ting et al., 2002). However, since the

colonization of *Prochlorococcus* in the deep photic zone of the Tonian ocean conferred them

advantages in acquiring the limiting nutrients like ammonium and phosphate upwelled from

the deep ocean (Jones et al., 2015; Michiels et al., 2017; Ozaki et al., 2019), the loss of the

phycobilisome in *Prochlorococcus* was unlikely driven by selection for metabolic efficiency.

Instead, as the chlorophyll☐based light☐harvesting complex gradually became the primary

photosynthetic antenna in *Prochlorococcus*, the phycobilisome genes were more likely

subject to relaxed purifying selection and thus neutral losses.

Despite the absence of the nitrate utilization genes in most *Prochlorococcus* isolates,

some uncultivated *Prochlorococcus* lineages contain these genes (Martiny et al., 2009;

Berube et al., 2015; Berube et al., 2019). By including *Prochlorococcus* SAGs that contain

the assimilatory nitrate transporter gene (*nrtB*) and the assimilatory nitrate reductase gene

(*narB*) in our reconstructions, we inferred the presence of both genes in Proch-AMZI/II/III-

LCA and Proch-AMZI/II-LCA and the losses of these genes at SBE-LCA (Fig. 1b). The

absence of nitrate utilization genes (*narB* and *nrtB*) in cultured *Prochlorococcus* strains has

been attributed to biased taxon sampling, since the *Prochlorococcus* were primarily cultured

from ocean regions where P instead of N is the primarily limiting nutrient (Berube et al.,

2015). However, phylogenetic analysis that included both *Prochlorococcus* and

Synechococcus showed topological congruence of the *narB* gene tree with the species tree,

suggesting vertical *narB* gene inheritance (Berube et al., 2019). By including

Prochlorococcus SAGs that contain the assimilatory nitrate transporter gene (*nrtB*) and the

assimilatory nitrate reductase gene (*narB*) in our reconstructions, we inferred the presence of

both genes in Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA and Proch-AMZI/II-LCA and the losses of these genes

at SBE-LCA (Fig. 1b). The mechanism underlying the loss of nitrate utilization genes in

Prochlorococcus was once attributed to relaxed selection efficiency due to the low level of

nitrate caused by intensive denitrification and anammox (anaerobic ammonium oxidation)

activity (Canfield et al., 2008; Johnston et al., 2009). However, since *Prochlorococcus*

originated in the deep photic zone where ammonium would likely have been supplied

through upwelling (Fig. 1c) (Michiels et al., 2017), the loss of the nitrate utilization genes in

early *Prochlorococcus* is more likely to be the result of a switch of its N source from nitrate

to ammonium, which was again a neutral process.

In addition to the nitrate utilization genes, we inferred the losses of molybdopterin

biosynthesis genes at SBE-LCA. Since these genes are known to co-locate with the nitrate

reductase genes in *Synechococcus* (Rubio et al., 1998; Palenik et al., 2003), they may

function as the cofactor of nitrate reductase in *Prochlorococcus*. Therefore, the loss of nitrate

reductase in *Prochlorococcus* likely rendered the molybdopterin dispensable and thus led to

the losses of molybdopterin biosynthesis genes (*moaABCDE*, *mobA* and *moeA*) at SBE-LCA.

<u>Geochemical context that supports the emergence of *Prochlorococcus* in Tonian ocean</u>

A Tonian, pre-Sturtian, age for the emergence of the *Prochlorococcus* lineage would

have been set against the backdrop of dynamic ocean chemistry characterized by a variably

oxygenated surface ocean that was co-populated by diverse microbial eukaryotes, including

phytoplankton and the earliest metazoans (Erwin et al., 2011) (Fig. 1c). Multi-proxy data,

collected from geographically diverse sites, converge on Tonian deep oceans that were

pervasively anoxic across 60-80% of the ocean floor, or more (Tahata et al., 2015; Lau et al.,

2017). The deep anoxic oceans were predominantly ferruginous in nature, albeit with

evidence for transient, spatially restricted euxinia, and possibly even brief (<0.5 Myr)

episodes of pervasive deep ocean oxygenation (Stolper and Keller, 2018; Tostevin and Mills,

2020). Surface waters, by contrast, were modestly, though perhaps increasingly, oxygenated

across the Tonian with evidence for the episodic and persistent intrusion of anoxic deep

waters into the surface oceans (Zhang et al., 2022; Clarkson et al., 2023), with corresponding

implications for nutrient cycling and availability and for marine life in the euphotic zone.

In this way, the emergence of the *Prochlorococcus* would have restricted the flux of

nutrients to surface waters and limited the contributions of higher-light adapted

phytoplankton like algae to primary production. This is supported through the biomarker

record, which indicates a dominance of cyanobacterial primary production until after the

Sturtian glaciation (Brocks, 2018). It is also supported by the Tonian N-isotope record, which

implies a limited contribution from nitrate assimilation to primary production at this time

(Kang et al., 2023). Importantly, the adaptation of the *Prochlorococcus* LCA to lower-light

would also allow it to better compete with low-light adapted anoxygenic phototrophs that

would likely have populated anoxic regions of the Tonian euphotic zone with strong potential

to cause ocean oxygenation (Johnston et al., 2009; Jones et al., 2015; Ozaki et al., 2019).

Competition between oxygenic photosynthetic cyanobacteria and anoxygenic phototrophs

that oxidize ferrous iron (photoferrotophs), is known to limit photosynthetic oxygen

production (Jones et al., 2015; Ozaki et al., 2019). Whereas the accumulation of O_2 produced

through photosynthesis ultimately depends on organic matter burial (Berner, 1991), oxygen

production fluxes through organic matter burial scale with the fraction of total photosynthetic

production that is oxygenic rather than anoxygenic (Johnston et al., 2009; Ozaki et al., 2019).

In this way, the capacity of the *Prochlorococcus* LCA to grow in deeper waters would have

enhanced its ability to access upwelling phosphorus thereby increasing the oxygenic fraction

of total photosynthesis with potential to initiate a positive feedback on oxygenation (Ozaki et

al., 2019).

<u>Implications for Neoproterozoic biogeochemical cycling</u>

In accordance with previous research (Ulloa et al., 2021), our analysis suggests that

Prochlorococcus diverged before transitioning from the use of the phycobilisome to the

chlorophyll☐based light☐harvesting complex. Therefore, while the divinyl pigment synthesis

gene was obtained at the earliest *Prochlorococcus* (i.e., Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA) to enable

their exploration of the deep photic zone, our analyses imply that *Prochlorococcus* would not

have strongly influenced the Neoproterozoic Earth system until the emergence of Proch-

AMZI/II-LCA lineage during which the photosynthetic antenna was replaced. Our dating

analysis shows that the emergence of this lineage indeed broadly coincides with geochemical

signals for the early stages of Neoproterozoic Oxygenation Event (NOE).

The NOE is widely considered the second stage of Earth's protracted oxygenation history,

during which atmospheric and marine oxygen concentrations rose to levels exceeding those

that characterized the proceeding mid-Proterozoic (Och and Shields-Zhou, 2012; Lyons et al.,

2014). This rise in atmospheric oxygen ultimately promoted the emergence of large and

complex animal life (Knoll and Nowak, 2017). The initiation of the NOE was previously

linked to eukaryotic algae (Lyons et al., 2014; Brocks et al., 2017) or marine

picocyanobacteria (Sánchez-Baracaldo et al., 2014; Braakman et al., 2017). Our results show

support for the latter assumption and indicate that early *Prochlorococcus* may have played a

role in enhancing oxygen production, with potential to initiate the NOE, which was likely

ultimately accelerated through increasing efficiency in the biological carbon pump driven by

a progressively a larger role for eukaryotes. Such an elevated role for eukaryotes is clearly

marked in the geologic record through an increase in sterane-hopane ratios following the

Sturtian glaciation (Brocks et al., 2017). Pre-Sturtian, Tonian oxygenation, was thus likely

driven by bacterially dominated carbon cycling, the timing of which strongly coincides with

the emergence of low-light adapted *Prochlorococcus*, their ensuing colonization of the deep

photic zone, and capacity to displace incumbent anoxygenic photoferrotrophs thereby

increasing oxygen production. This hypothesis could be further tested through geochemical

analyses that help refine estimates for Tonian ocean oxygen contents and through

biogeochemical models that can quantify the potential effects of *Prochlorococcus* emergence

on the global carbon and oxygen cycles. Note that the inference of the roles of

Prochlorococcus in facilitating Neoproterozoic biogeochemical cycle relies on the accurate

molecular dating analysis. Given the heavy debate about the antiquity of Cyanobacteria,

including *Prochlorococcus*, we have extensively discussed the previous dating analyses and

pointed out their methodological deficiencies (see details in Supplementary Discussion).

Concluding remarks

We have integrated molecular clocks, evolutionary genetic analyses, and comparative

genomics along with knowledge of paleo-geochemistry to reconstruct the early evolution of

Prochlorococcus and infer their possible impact on the evolution of the Neoproterozoic Earth

system. The abundant fossil calibrations 'borrowed' from photosynthetic eukaryotes and the

new and robust molecular dating pipeline pinpoint the origin of *Prochlorococcus* to the

Tonian oceans. Comparative genomics suggests that gains and losses of a few important

genes conferred the early ancestral *Prochlorococcus* with an unprecedented ability to absorb

the blue light that effectively penetrates water, empowering early *Prochlorococcus* to

colonize the deep photic zone, a niche distinctly different from the better illuminated surface

waters supporting other phytoplankton groups including its *Synechococcus* ancestor and early

Eukaryotes. The use of the evolutionary genetic proxy, d_R/d_C, implies that the earliest

Prochlorococcus had a highly reduced effective population size compared to its

Synechococcus ancestor, likely reflecting a founder effect and strengthening the idea that the

deep photic zone was an ecological niche uniquely accessible to the earliest *Prochlorococcus*.

This niche differentiation allowed the earliest *Prochlorococcus* to avoid fierce competition

with its *Synechococcus* ancestor and other phytoplankton groups and gave them easy access

to phosphate that otherwise strongly limited primary productivity in the Tonian oceans. While

all of these co-existing planktonic groups are likely to have contributed to the NOE, the

emergence of *Prochlorococcus* in a previously uncolonized habitat with a unique light regime

and a higher phosphate accessibility, followed by the acquisition of a more efficient light-

harvesting system, may have facilitated a potentially rapid population expansion, which

ultimately enhanced the oxygen production in Tonian oceans and facilitated the initiation of

the Neoproterozoic Oxygenation Event.

Materials and Methods

The nuclear-encoded and plastid-encoded protein sequences of eukaryotic representatives

were obtained from Dicots PLAZA (5.0) database and NCBI RefSeq release of plastid

database and were used for the first-step and the second-step Bayesian sequential dating

analysis, respectively. The genomic sequences of Cyanobacteria (including *Prochlorococcus*

SAGs), Vampirovibrionia and Sericytochromatia were also used for the second-step

sequential dating analysis, which were obtained from GenBank and Integrated Microbial

Genomes (IMG) database (Supplementary Data 1).

For the first-step sequential dating analysis, the orthologous gene families shared by

eukaryotic species were identified by searching against a pre-compiled eukaryotic nuclear

gene dataset (Strassert et al., 2021). Since genome-scale dating of eukaryotic lineages is very

slow with fully partitioned molecular data and is prone to have reduced coverage probability

(the probability that the 95% HPD interval of posterior ages contains the true age) due to the

large number of partitions (Angelis et al., 2018), we clustered the eukaryotic gene families

into 1-, 3-, 5-, 7-, and 9-partitions by using Gaussian Mixture Model (GMM) clustering

method based on their estimated evolutionary rates (see details in Supplementary Methods).

The 5-partition data was finally adopted for the first-step dating analysis because of the

lowest Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) value (Fig. S1b) and the high similarity between

the derived distributions of posterior ages and effective time prior (Fig. S2). The eukaryotic

fossil-based calibrations used in this first-step dating analysis were adapted from published

studies (Fig. S1a; Table S1; See details in Supplementary Methods).

For the second-step sequential dating analysis, the orthologous gene families were firstly

identified by searching against a pre-compiled plastid marker gene dataset (Ponce-Toledo et

al., 2017) and then sorted by ΔLL (i.e., the difference in log-likelihood values of the gene tree

constructed with and without the backbone species tree topology) and evolutionary rate

difference (Supplementary Data 2) (Fig. S6). In addition to the fossil-based calibrations

adapted from published studies, we used the posterior age distributions derived from the first-

step dating analysis to calibrate the overlapping nodes in the species tree containing both

eukaryotes and Cyanobacteria (Fig. S1c; Table S1; Table S2). Note that we placed the

cyanobacterial-fossil based calibrations at the total group of Nostocales and Pleurocapsales

by taking into account the incomplete taxon sampling of their early-split lineages, as well as

the possibility that their fossils belong to the stem lineages rather than the crown groups. In

this way, we allow for the posterior ages of crown Nostocales and Pleurocapsales groups to

be younger than the known fossil records.

Our molecular dating analysis was conducted using MCMCTree with the best-fit clock

model, which was selected using the program "mcmc3r" following published studies

(McGowen et al., 2019; Wang and Luo, 2021). For calibrations and species tree topology that

remain disputed, we took all the possibilities in our analysis for comparison (Fig. S4). We

also tested the necessity for using Bayesian sequential dating approach and hard bound

calibration strategy in our analysis (Fig. S7; see details in Supplementary Discussion) and

tested the convergence of the posterior age estimates (Fig. S8).

The gains and losses of *Prochlorococcus* orthologous gene families were inferred with a

gene tree-species tree reconciliation approach according to our recent studies (Zhang et al.,

2024). The best-fit reconciliation tool was selected through a comprehensive simulation-

based benchmarking analysis [see Fig. S5 in (Zhang et al., 2024)]. In our implementations,

we performed the reconstruction first without using the SAGs to avoid the false prediction of

genomic events due to the relatively low completeness of the SAGs (e.g., 81.9% for AMZI-

B-ETNP) and then used the same reconstruction methods to validate these evolutionary

events when SAGs were included.

The reduction of *Prochlorococcus* selection efficiency in ancient time was inferred by

comparing the genome-wide d_R/d_C (i.e., the relative rate of radical versus conservative

nonsynonymous substitutions) between the target lineage and its sister lineage based on our

recent study (Luo et al., 2017) (see details in Supplementary Methods).

Code availability

The custom scripts used to analyze the data are available in the online GitHub repository

(https://github.com/luolab-cuhk/Prochl-NOE).

Acknowledgements

This work is supported by the Natural Science Foundation of China (42293294), the Hong

Kong Research Grants Council (RGC) General Research Fund (GRF) (14110820), the

Natural Science Foundation of Guangdong Province, China (2022A1515010844 to HZ), the

China Postdoctoral Science Foundation (2021M702296 to HZ), and the CUHK Direct Grant

(4053551).

References

Angelis, K., Álvarez-Carretero, S., Dos Reis, M., and Yang, Z. (2018) An Evaluation of Different Partitioning Strategies for Bayesian Estimation of Species Divergence Times. *Syst Biol* **67**: 61-77.

Aoki, S., Ito, M., Iwasaki, W.J.M.b., and evolution (2013) From β-to α-proteobacteria: the origin and evolution of rhizobial nodulation genes nodIJ. **30**: 2494-2508.

Barton, N.H., Charlesworth, B.J.A.r.o.e., and systematics (1984) Genetic revolutions, founder effects, and speciation. **15**: 133-164.

Berner, R.A. (1991) A model for atmospheric CO 2 over Phanerozoic time. *American Journal of Science* **291**: 339-376.

Berube, P.M., Rasmussen, A., Braakman, R., Stepanauskas, R., and Chisholm, S.W. (2019) Emergence of trait variability through the lens of nitrogen assimilation in Prochlorococcus. *eLife* **8**: e41043.

Berube, P.M., Biller, S.J., Kent, A.G., Berta-Thompson, J.W., Roggensack, S.E., Roache-Johnson, K.H. et al. (2015) Physiology and evolution of nitrate acquisition in Prochlorococcus. *Isme j* **9**: 1195.

Betts, H.C., Puttick, M.N., Clark, J.W., Williams, T.A., Donoghue, P.C., Pisani, D.J.N.e., and evolution (2018) Integrated genomic and fossil evidence illuminates life's early evolution and eukaryote origin. **2**: 1556-1562.

Bhattacharya, D., and Medlin, L.J.J.P. (1995) Phylogeny of plastids A review based on comparisons of small subunit ribosomal RNA coding regions. **31**: 487-496.

Biller, S.J., Berube, P.M., Lindell, D., and Chisholm, S.W. (2015) Prochlorococcus: the structure and function of collective diversity. *Nature Reviews Microbiology* **13**: 13.

Boden, J.S., Konhauser, K.O., Robbins, L.J., and Sánchez-Baracaldo, P. (2021) Timing the evolution of antioxidant enzymes in cyanobacteria. *Nature Communications* **12**: 1-12.

Braakman, R., Follows, M.J., and Chisholm, S.W. (2017) Metabolic evolution and the self-organization of ecosystems. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **114**: E3091-E3100.

Brocks, J.J. (2018) The transition from a cyanobacterial to algal world and the emergence of

animals. *Emerging topics in life sciences* **2**: 181-190.

Brocks, J.J., Jarrett, A.J., Sirantoine, E., Hallmann, C., Hoshino, Y., and Liyanage, T. (2017) The rise of algae in Cryogenian oceans and the emergence of animals. *Nature* **548**: 578.

Canfield, D.E., Poulton, S.W., Knoll, A.H., Narbonne, G.M., Ross, G., Goldberg, T., and Strauss, H. (2008) Ferruginous conditions dominated later Neoproterozoic deep-water chemistry. *Science* **321**: 949-952.

Chriki-Adeeb, R., and Chriki, A.J.E.B. (2016) Estimating divergence times and substitution rates in Rhizobia. **12**: EBO. S39070.

Clarkson, M.O., Sweere, T.C., Chiu, C.F., Hennekam, R., Bowyer, F., and Wood, R.A.J.E.-S.R. (2023) Environmental controls on very high δ238U values in reducing sediments: Implications for Neoproterozoic seawater records. 104306.

Dayhoff, M.O. (1972) A model of evolutionary change in proteins. *Atlas of protein sequence and structure* **5**: 89-99.

dos Reis, M., Gunnell, G.F., Barba-Montoya, J., Wilkins, A., Yang, Z., and Yoder, A.D. (2018) Using phylogenomic data to explore the effects of relaxed clocks and calibration strategies on divergence time estimation: primates as a test case. *Systematic biology* **67**: 594-615.

dos Reis, M., Thawornwattana, Y., Angelis, K., Telford, Maximilian J., Donoghue, Philip C.J., and Yang, Z. (2015) Uncertainty in the Timing of Origin of Animals and the Limits of Precision in Molecular Timescales. *Current Biology* **25**: 2939-2950.

Duchêne, S., Lanfear, R., and Ho, S.Y.W. (2014) The impact of calibration and clock-model choice on molecular estimates of divergence times. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **78**: 277-289.

E. Zuckerkandl, L.P. (1965) Evolutionary divergence and convergence in proteins. In *Evolving genes and proteins*: Elsevier, pp. 97-166.

Erwin, D.H., Laflamme, M., Tweedt, S.M., Sperling, E.A., Pisani, D., and Peterson, K.J. (2011) The Cambrian conundrum: early divergence and later ecological success in the early history of animals. *Science* **334**: 1091-1097.

Flombaum, P., Gallegos, J.L., Gordillo, R.A., Rincón, J., Zabala, L.L., Jiao, N. et al. (2013) Present and future global distributions of the marine Cyanobacteria Prochlorococcus and

Synechococcus. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **110**: 9824-9829.

Fournier, G., Moore, K., Rangel, L., Payette, J., Momper, L., and Bosak, T. (2021) The

Archean origin of oxygenic photosynthesis and extant cyanobacterial lineages. *Proceedings*

of the Royal Society B **288**: 20210675.

Goericke, R., Olson, R., and Shalapyonok, A. (2000) A novel niche for Prochlorococcus sp.

in low-light suboxic environments in the Arabian Sea and the Eastern Tropical North Pacific.

Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers **47**: 1183-1205.

Gray, M.W.J.I.r.o.c. (1992) The endosymbiont hypothesis revisited. **141**: 233-357.

Grossman, A.R., Schaefer, M.R., Chiang, G.G., and Collier, J.L. (1993) The phycobilisome, a

light-harvesting complex responsive to environmental conditions. *Microbiology and*

Molecular Biology Reviews **57**: 725-749.

Heckman, D.S., Geiser, D.M., Eidell, B.R., Stauffer, R.L., Kardos, N.L., and Hedges, S.B.J.s.

(2001) Molecular evidence for the early colonization of land by fungi and plants. **293**: 1129-

1133.

Hedges, S.B., Tao, Q., Walker, M., and Kumar, S.J.P.o.t.N.A.o.S. (2018) Accurate timetrees

require accurate calibrations. **115**: E9510-E9511.

Hess, W.R., Rocap, G., Ting, C.S., Larimer, F., Stilwagen, S., Lamerdin, J., and Chisholm,

S.W. (2001) The photosynthetic apparatus of Prochlorococcus: insights through comparative

genomics. *Photosynthesis Research* **70**: 53-71.

Ito, H., and Tanaka, A. (2011) Evolution of a divinyl chlorophyll-based photosystem in

Prochlorococcus. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **108**: 18014-18019.

Ito, H., Yokono, M., Tanaka, R., and Tanaka, A. (2008) Identification of a novel vinyl

reductase gene essential for the biosynthesis of monovinyl chlorophyll in Synechocystis sp.

PCC6803. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* **283**: 9002-9011.

Johnston, D.T., Wolfe-Simon, F., Pearson, A., and Knoll, A.H. (2009) Anoxygenic

photosynthesis modulated Proterozoic oxygen and sustained Earth's middle age. *Proceedings*

of the National Academy of Sciences **106**: 16925-16929.

Jones, C., Nomosatryo, S., Crowe, S.A., Bjerrum, C.J., and Canfield, D.E.J.G. (2015) Iron

oxides, divalent cations, silica, and the early earth phosphorus crisis. **43**: 135-138.

Kang, J., Gill, B., Reid, R., Zhang, F., and Xiao, S. (2023) Nitrate limitation in early
Neoproterozoic oceans delayed the ecological rise of eukaryotes. *Science advances* **9**:
eade9647.

Keeling, P.J. (2013) The number, speed, and impact of plastid endosymbioses in eukaryotic
evolution. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* **64**: 583-607.

Knoll, A.H., and Nowak, M.A. (2017) The timetable of evolution. *Science Advances* **3**:
e1603076.

Lau, K.V., Macdonald, F.A., Maher, K., and Payne, J.L. (2017) Uranium isotope evidence for
temporary ocean oxygenation in the aftermath of the Sturtian Snowball Earth. *Earth and*
planetary science letters **458**: 282-292.

Lavin, P., González, B., Santibáñez, J.F., Scanlan, D.J., and Ulloa, O. (2010) Novel lineages
of Prochlorococcus thrive within the oxygen minimum zone of the eastern tropical South
Pacific. *Environmental microbiology reports* **2**: 728-738.

Luo, H., Huang, Y., Stepanauskas, R., and Tang, J. (2017) Excess of non-conservative amino
acid changes in marine bacterioplankton lineages with reduced genomes. *Nature*
microbiology **2**: 17091.

Lyons, T.W., Reinhard, C.T., and Planavsky, N.J. (2014) The rise of oxygen in Earth's early
ocean and atmosphere. *Nature* **506**: 307.

Marin, B., M. Nowack, E.C., and Melkonian, M. (2005) A Plastid in the Making: Evidence
for a Second Primary Endosymbiosis. *Protist* **156**: 425-432.

Martinez-Gutierrez, C.A., Uyeda, J.C., and Aylward, F.O.J.E. (2023) A timeline of bacterial
and archaeal diversification in the ocean. **12**: RP88268.

Martiny, A.C., Kathuria, S., and Berube, P.M. (2009) Widespread metabolic potential for
nitrite and nitrate assimilation among Prochlorococcus ecotypes. *Proceedings of the National*
Academy of Sciences **106**: 10787-10792.

McGowen, M.R., Tsagkogeorga, G., Álvarez-Carretero, S., dos Reis, M., Struebig, M.,
Deaville, R. et al. (2019) Phylogenomic Resolution of the Cetacean Tree of Life Using Target
Sequence Capture. *Systematic Biology* **69**: 479-501.

Michiels, C.C., Darchambeau, F., Roland, F.A., Morana, C., Llirós, M., García-Armisen, T. et

al. (2017) Iron-dependent nitrogen cycling in a ferruginous lake and the nutrient status of Proterozoic oceans. *Nature geoscience* **10**: 217-221.

Morris, J.L., Puttick, M.N., Clark, J.W., Edwards, D., Kenrick, P., Pressel, S. et al. (2018) The timescale of early land plant evolution. **115**: E2274-E2283.

Och, L.M., and Shields-Zhou, G.A. (2012) The Neoproterozoic oxygenation event: Environmental perturbations and biogeochemical cycling. *Earth-Science Reviews* **110**: 26-57.

Ozaki, K., Thompson, K.J., Simister, R.L., Crowe, S.A., and Reinhard, C.T. (2019) Anoxygenic photosynthesis and the delayed oxygenation of Earth's atmosphere. *Nature communications* **10**: 3026.

Palenik, B., Brahamsha, B., Larimer, F., Land, M., Hauser, L., Chain, P. et al. (2003) The genome of a motile marine Synechococcus. **424**: 1037-1042.

Parfrey, L.W., Lahr, D.J., Knoll, A.H., and Katz, L.A.J.P.o.t.N.A.o.S. (2011) Estimating the timing of early eukaryotic diversification with multigene molecular clocks. **108**: 13624-13629.

Partensky, F., and Garczarek, L. (2010) Prochlorococcus: advantages and limits of minimalism. *Annual Review of Marine Science* **2**: 305-331.

Partensky, F., Hess, W.R., and Vaulot, D. (1999) Prochlorococcus, a marine photosynthetic prokaryote of global significance. *Microbiol Mol Biol Rev* **63**: 106-127.

Ponce-Toledo, R.I., Deschamps, P., López-García, P., Zivanovic, Y., Benzerara, K., and Moreira, D. (2017) An Early-Branching Freshwater Cyanobacterium at the Origin of Plastids. *Curr Biol* **27**: 386-391.

Ralf, G., and Repeta, D.J. (1992) The pigments of Prochlorococcus marinus: The presence of divinylchlorophyll a and b in a marine procaryote. *Limnology and Oceanography* **37**: 425-433.

Rubio, L.M., Flores, E., and Herrero, A.J.J.o.b. (1998) The narA locus of Synechococcus sp. strain PCC 7942 consists of a cluster of molybdopterin biosynthesis genes. **180**: 1200-1206.

Sánchez-Baracaldo, P. (2015) Origin of marine planktonic cyanobacteria. *Scientific reports* **5**: 17418.

Sánchez-Baracaldo, P., Ridgwell, A., and Raven, J.A. (2014) A neoproterozoic transition in

the marine nitrogen cycle. *Current Biology* **24**: 652-657.

Sánchez-Baracaldo, P., Raven, J.A., Pisani, D., and Knoll, A.H. (2017) Early photosynthetic eukaryotes inhabited low-salinity habitats. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*: 201620089.

Satoh, S., and Tanaka, A. (2006) Identification of chlorophyllide a oxygenase in the Prochlorococcus genome by a comparative genomic approach. *Plant and cell physiology* **47**: 1622-1629.

Schirrmeister, B.E., Gugger, M., and Donoghue, P.C. (2015) Cyanobacteria and the Great Oxidation Event: evidence from genes and fossils. *Palaeontology* **58**: 769-785.

Shih, P.M., Hemp, J., Ward, L.M., Matzke, N.J., and Fischer, W.W. (2016) Crown group Oxyphotobacteria postdate the rise of oxygen. *Geobiology* **15**: 19-29.

Stolper, D.A., and Keller, C.B.J.N. (2018) A record of deep-ocean dissolved O2 from the oxidation state of iron in submarine basalts. **553**: 323-327.

Strassert, J.F.H., Irisarri, I., Williams, T.A., and Burki, F. (2021) A molecular timescale for eukaryote evolution with implications for the origin of red algal-derived plastids. *Nat Commun* **12**: 1879.

Tahata, M., Sawaki, Y., Yoshiya, K., Nishizawa, M., Komiya, T., Hirata, T. et al. (2015) The marine environments encompassing the Neoproterozoic glaciations: evidence from C, Sr and Fe isotope ratios in the Hecla Hoek Supergroup in Svalbard. *Precambrian research* **263**: 19-42.

Ting, C.S., Rocap, G., King, J., and Chisholm, S.W. (2002) Cyanobacterial photosynthesis in the oceans: the origins and significance of divergent light-harvesting strategies. *Trends in microbiology* **10**: 134-142.

Tostevin, R., and Mills, B.J.J.I.F. (2020) Reconciling proxy records and models of Earth's oxygenation during the Neoproterozoic and Palaeozoic. **10**: 20190137.

Ulloa, O., Henríquez-Castillo, C., Ramírez-Flandes, S., Plominsky, A.M., Murillo, A.A., Morgan-Lang, C. et al. (2021) The cyanobacterium Prochlorococcus has divergent light-harvesting antennae and may have evolved in a low-oxygen ocean. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **118**.

Wang, S., and Luo, H. (2021) Dating Alphaproteobacteria evolution with eukaryotic fossils.

Nature Communications **12**: 3324.

Warnock, R.C., Yang, Z., and Donoghue, P.C.J.B.l. (2012) Exploring uncertainty in the

calibration of the molecular clock. **8**: 156-159.

Zhang, F., Stockey, R.G., Xiao, S., Shen, S.-z., Dahl, T.W., Wei, G.-Y. et al. (2022) Uranium

isotope evidence for extensive shallow water anoxia in the early Tonian oceans. *Earth and*

planetary science letters **583**: 117437.

Zhang, H., Hellweger, F.L., and Luo, H. (2024) Genome reduction occurred in early

Prochlorococcus with an unusually low effective population size. *Isme j* **18**.

Zhang, H., Sun, Y., Zeng, Q., Crowe, S.A., and Luo, H. (2021) Snowball Earth, population

bottleneck and Prochlorococcus evolution. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological*

Sciences **288**: 20211956.

Zhang, J. (2000) Rates of conservative and radical nonsynonymous nucleotide substitutions

in mammalian nuclear genes. *J Mol Evol* **50**: 56-68.

Figure Legends

Fig. 1 **The evolutionary timeline of *Prochlorococcus* estimated with plastid-based**

strategy. (a) The diagram shows the phylogenetic relations among Cyanobacteria and

eukaryotic species. The green solid line, black solid line and green dashed line in the

cladogram leading to the tip of oxygenic Cyanobacteria, anoxygenic Vampirovibrionia and

Sericytochromatia and eukaryotic species, respectively. The calibrated nodes in molecular

clock analysis are marked with orange circle (see calibration justifications in Supplementary

Methods). (b) (left) The *Prochlorococcus* evolutionary timeline estimated with the focal

molecular dating strategy using Bayesian sequential dating approach based on the 5-partition

eukaryotic genome-scale data (in the first step dating analysis) and fully partitioned 12-gene

dataset "T30" (in the second step dating analysis) under independent rate clock model. The

posterior age distribution is provided next to the ancestral node. The atmospheric oxygen

level at the geological time scale is adapted from Lyons et al., 2014, which is represented by

the percent of present atmospheric oxygen level (PAL). The vertical bars with green, orange

and blue colors represent the time of Tonian, the time of NOE, and the time of Sturtian (left)

and Marinoan (right) glaciation, respectively. (right) Phyletic pattern of key gene families.

Solid square, solid circle and open circle next to each analyzed genome represent multi-copy

gene family, single-copy gene family and absence of the gene family, respectively, in the

extant genomes. Gene families marked with asterisk (*) were consistently estimated to be

gained or lost by using both AnGST and GeneRax. (c) Diagram illustrating the

biogeochemical environments when *Prochlorococcus* arose from its *Synechococcus* ancestor.

Fig. 2   Diagram illustrating the schemes and the results of d_R/d_C comparison. The

genome-wide means of d_R/d_C values at the ancestral branches ('Target') leading to (a) Proch-

AMZI/II/III-LCA and (b) SBE-LCA compared with that at the sister lineages ('Control').

The d_R/d_C values were classified based on the physicochemical classification of the amino

acids by charge or by volume and polarity, and were either GC-corrected by codon frequency

(blue), GC-corrected by amino acid (AA) frequency (red) or uncorrected (gray). Error bars of

d_R/d_C represent the standard error of the mean.

Fig. 1

Fig. 2

(a)

- GC-corrected (codon frequency)
- GC-corrected (AA frequency)
- Uncorrected

Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA

◄ SBE-LCA

Proch-AMZI/II/III-LCA

HL II

HL I

LL I

LL II/III

LL IV

AMZ

Syne 5.1

Syne 5.2

Target

Control

Ref.

Charge

Target   Control

Volume&Polarity

Target   Control

(b) SBE-LCA

HL II

HL I

LL I

LL II/III

LL IV

AMZ

Syne 5.1

Syne 5.2

Target

Control

Reference

Charge

Target   Control

Volume&Polarity

Target   Control