Convergent molecular constraint in mammalian carnivores: Selection on liver and kidney
functions during the evolution of more carnivorous diets

Matthew D. Pollard[1,2*], Wynn K. Meyer[3], and Emily E. Puckett[1,2]

[1]Department of Biological Sciences, University of Memphis, Memphis, TN 38152
[2]Center for Biodiversity Research, University of Memphis, Memphis, TN 38152
[3]Department of Biological Sciences, Lehigh University, Bethlehem, PA 18015
[*]Corresponding author

ABSTRACT

Background

Mammalia comprises a great diversity of diet types and associated adaptations. An understanding
of the genomic mechanisms underlying these adaptations may offer insights for improving human
health. Comparative genomic studies of diet that employ taxonomically restricted analyses or
simplified diet classifications may suffer reduced power to detect molecular convergence
associated with diet evolution. Here, we used a quantitative carnivory score and 80 mammalian
species to detect significant correlations between the relative evolutionary rates of genes and
changes in diet. Increases in this carnivory score indicated increasing amounts of animal protein
in a species' diet.

Results

We identified six genes—*ACADSB*, *CLDN16*, *CPB1*, *PNLIP*, *SLC13A2*, and *SLC14A2*—that
experienced significant evolutionary constraint and greater functional importance as increasingly
carnivorous diets evolved. We further considered the biological functions associated with diet
evolution and observed that pathways related to amino acid and lipid metabolism, biological
oxidation, and small molecule transport were evolutionarily constrained in association with
increased carnivory. Liver and kidney functions showed a similar pattern of greater constraint as
carnivory increases.

Conclusions

Our results indicate that, during adaptation to increasing carnivory, selection acts on the liver and
kidneys to maintain sufficient metabolism and excretion of substances found in excess in
carnivorous diets.

KEYWORDS

adaptation, carnivory, convergent evolution, diet, mammal, metabolism

BACKGROUND

As a diversity of mammalian diets arose from the ancestral insectivorous strategy (1), numerous physiological, morphological, and behavioral adaptations also evolved. Understanding the mechanisms of these adaptations may lead to improvements in human health. For example, glucose metabolism in healthy carnivores resembles diabetes in humans and other non-carnivores (2). Polar bears are adapted to persistently high blood cholesterol levels (3), which have been implicated in human cardiovascular disease (4), and some networks underlying polar bear adaptation have been implicated in high fat diet adaptation in humans (5). Thus, comparative genomic studies of diet offer novel insights for medical advancement. Large-scale comparative genomic resources, consisting of data from hundreds of non-model organisms, have been developed to support such research (6, 7).

Previous studies identified many genomic changes accompanying adaptations to carnivorous and herbivorous diets. For example, the convergent evolution of herbivory in the giant and red pandas coincided with adaptive molecular evolution of genes associated with the utilization of nutrients that are scarce in bamboo, as well as limb development genes that facilitated growth of the pseudothumb (8). In cetaceans, positive selection for proteinases and lipases and loss of pancreatic *RNASE1* expression have been attributed to the evolution of carnivory from a herbivorous ancestor (9). Loss of the hormone-receptor pair *INSL5-RXFP4*, which regulates appetite and glucose homeostasis, is thought to be an adaptation to irregular feeding patterns in carnivores (10). Positive selection in carnivores acted on genes associated with successful hunting—such as muscle strength and agility—as well as digestion of fat- and protein-rich foods (11).

While previous studies provided valuable insights into lineage-specific dietary adaptations, studies that incorporate data encompassing a larger number of taxa can identify mechanisms shared across convergent changes in diet. To date, comparative genomic studies that sampled broadly within mammals have used coarse dietary classification systems, such as herbivore, carnivore, and omnivore (10-12). This results in a loss of important dietary information, as species grouped together differ in the proportions of plant and animal matter consumed and may show divergent adaptations (13-16). Thus, the power of comparative genomic studies that investigate the molecular mechanisms of dietary adaptation may be reduced.

The objectives of our study are two-fold. First, we identify genes that are important for convergent

adaptation to increasingly carnivorous or herbivorous diets in mammals. We accomplish this by

detecting significant correlations between gene evolutionary rate shifts and changes in a

continuous diet score mapped across a phylogeny of 80 species. Second, we use convergent

evolutionary rate shifts to elucidate the biological functions associated with carnivorous and

herbivorous adaptation across Mammalia. Our analyses encompass unprecedented taxonomic

breadth and dietary nuance compared to previous comparative genomic studies of diet in

mammals.

METHODS

Preparation of dietary data

To create a continuous categorization of diet, we obtained data from the EltonTraits mammal

dataset (17). Data compiled in EltonTraits came primarily from Walker's Mammals of the World

(18), which describes species' diets based on summaries of existing literature. Qualitative

descriptions of dietary preferences were translated by the EltonTraits authors into numerical values

representing the proportion of diet comprising numerous food types. In this study, we generated a

carnivory score for each species by summing the proportions of vertebrates and invertebrates in

their diet. Thus, our study treats invertivorous species as carnivorous. A score of 0 represents a

completely herbivorous species, and a score of 100 represents a completely carnivorous animal.

Due to the structure of EltonTraits, carnivory scores jumped in steps of 10 from 0 to 100 (Fig. 1;

Additional File 1: Table S1); thus, we analyzed 11 ordinal bins which we hereafter call degree of

carnivory.

Study species and gene alignments

For our analyses of relative evolutionary rates (RERs), we selected 80 species that encompass the

taxonomic and dietary breadth of therian mammals (Fig. 1; Additional File 1: Table S1). We

pruned multiple codon alignments generated with TOGA by the Zoonomia Consortium (6, 19) so

that they included only our chosen species. We then filtered the alignments to remove sequences

not covering 50% of the total aligned sequence length. For alignments that included more than one

sequence per species, we retained the sequence with the highest percent identity to human. We

only analyzed alignments with sequences that survived filtering for at least 60 target species. Our

filtering reduced the number of genes analyzed from 17,439 to 15,117. An overrepresentation

analysis of Gene Ontology (GO) terms indicated that the unanalyzed genes were predominantly

associated with DNA assembly and organization, perception of chemical stimuli, and gene

silencing (Additional File 1: Table S2).

Figure 1. Species selection for comparative genomic analyses of mammalian diet. The carnivory score represents the proportion of the diet composed of animal-based food items for each species, as listed in EltonTraits (17). This score was used as input in our RERconverge analyses and informed selection of foreground species in our tests for positive selection. Branch colors represent the magnitude and direction of change in carnivory score across the phylogeny, as inferred by using fast estimation of maximum likelihood ancestral states (20). Bright yellow and dark purple branches indicate increases and decreases in carnivory score, respectively. Gray dashed branches represent species that were not included in our RERconverge analyses and so were not used to estimate change in carnivory score. Branch length represents the average evolutionary rate across all genes for a given branch, as reported by RERconverge. Most species were included in both the RERconverge and positive selection analyses and are marked as present (gray, red, blue) in the corresponding columns. Species not included in an analysis are marked as absent (white). For the positive selection analyses, species included in the carnivorous (carnivory score ≥90) and herbivorous (carnivory score ≤10) foregrounds are marked in the corresponding column as red and blue, respectively. Scientific names and carnivory scores are provided for each species in Additional File 1: Table S1.

 Associating relative evolutionary rates with the evolution of diet

We used RERconverge in R (21) to identify genes with consistent changes in evolutionary rate

associated with the evolution of the quantitative carnivory score. RERs reveal deviation in

evolutionary rate along a specific branch of the phylogeny, based on genome-wide expectations.

A highly positive RER may indicate positive selection or relaxation of constraint. A highly

negative RER indicates that increased constraint has led to fewer substitutions than expected.

RERconverge estimates the correlation between RER and change in a phenotype across a

phylogeny. A significant negative correlation between RER and change in carnivory score

corresponds to slower evolution among lineages evolving towards increased carnivory, and faster

evolution in lineages leading to less carnivorous species. Increased evolutionary constraint implies

that the gene contributes more to fitness under a particular phenotypic condition, so we focused

our analyses on genes with significant negative correlations when identifying genes associated

with increasing carnivory (22). Conversely, for genes related to increasing herbivory, we looked

at genes with significant positive correlations.

We used the *estimatePhangornTreesAll* wrapper function from RERconverge, which utilizes a

maximum likelihood approach implemented in phangorn (23), to calculate branch lengths for each

gene while fixing the topology of the gene trees to match the maximum clade credibility phylogeny

of Upham et al. (24). These trees were used as input for the RERconverge analyses alongside our

carnivory scores. We winsorized the RERs of each gene so that the three most extreme values at

each end were set to that of the next most extreme RER. This minimized the influence of outliers.

We implemented the default branch length filtering in RERconverge, setting the shortest 5% of

branches across all gene trees to N/A. This resulted in an additional 1,205 genes being filtered for

having fewer than 60 branches remaining in the tree, leaving 13,912 remaining genes in this

analysis.

To evaluate confidence in gene-trait associations inferred by RERconverge, we used a

phylogenetically restricted permutation strategy ('permulations'; 22, 25). We randomly simulated

carnivory scores for each species 100,000 times using a Brownian motion model of evolution.

Then for each simulated set of values, the observed carnivory scores were assigned to species

based on the ranks of the simulated scores. We used these shuffled phenotype sets to calculate

gene-trait associations using RERconverge, generating 100,000 null statistics per gene. We

calculated a new, empirical *P*-value for each gene-trait association based on the proportion of null

statistics that are equally or more extreme than the observed statistic for that association. We

corrected for multiple hypothesis testing using Storey's correction method (26; FDR=0.05). Using

the Mann-Whitney U test for enrichment available in RERconverge, we identified biological

functions associated with the evolution of diet. We constructed tissue-specific gene sets from the

Genotype-Tissue Expression Project (GTEx; 51) data, defining tissue-specificity following the

strategy of Jain and Tuteja (27). We tested for tissue-specific enrichment using these gene sets,

gene pathway enrichment using KEGG and Reactome pathways from MSigDB (28), and

enrichment for abnormal phenotypes using gene sets from the Mammalian Phenotype (MP)

Ontology (29).

Positive selection associated with the evolution of carnivory or herbivory

We tested each gene for positive selection via branch-site models (branch-site neutral versus

branch-site selection) using codeml from PAML (30), as implemented in BASE (31). We also used

BUSTED from the HyPhy software suite (32, 33). These models test for positive selection in a

group of foreground species chosen *a priori*. Terminal branches leading to species with carnivory

scores ≥90 (n=25) and ≤10 (n=24) were selected as foreground for carnivory- and herbivory-

specific analyses, respectively (Fig. 1; Additional File 1: Table S1). Select species with carnivory

scores of 20—specifically the red panda and kinkajou—were included in the herbivore foreground

despite relatively high carnivory scores because they are considered in the broader literature to be

primarily herbivorous (34-38). Nucleotide alignments for each gene were obtained from Zoonomia

(6, 7).

PAML branch-site models do not test for the absence of positive selection in background species,

so these tests alone do not identify genes experiencing positive selection in association with a trait

of interest (39). To confirm that our significant branch-site results corresponded to foreground-

specific positive selection, we removed the foreground species and tested for tree-wide positive

selection using site models (M1a versus M2a) in PAML. Only genes detected as positively selected

by the branch-site model and not the site model with foreground species excluded were retained

(Additional File 2: Fig. S1).

We employed a conservative strategy to generate final lists of positively selected genes. To account

for the impact of gene tree discordance on our results (40), we performed positive selection

analyses using gene trees and the fixed species tree. We used RAxML v8.2.12 (41) with the

GTRGAMMAI nucleotide substitution model to generate gene trees. We only considered a gene

to have experienced diet-associated positive selection when it produced a significant result in both

our codeml and BUSTED analyses, and if this result persisted when using the gene tree and the

species tree (Additional File 2: Fig. S1). As an additional filtering step, we checked that the signals

of positive selection returned by codeml and BUSTED were not caused by relaxation of selection

by using RELAX (42), and excluded any genes showing significant relaxation from our final gene

lists (Additional File 2: Fig. S1). We used overrepresentation analyses to test our final lists for

enrichment of GO terms, gene pathways from the Reactome and KEGG databases, and phenotypes

from the MP Ontology using clusterProfiler and ReactomePA (43, 44). For all overrepresentation

analyses, we used human annotation databases.

RESULTS

Molecular evolutionary constraint associated with dietary change

We identified genes that experienced convergent evolutionary constraint or positive selection in

association with changes in carnivory across a phylogeny of 80 mammal species. Of the 13,912

genes included in our RERconverge analysis, we identified six with a significant negative

correlation between relative evolutionary rate (RER) and change in carnivory score (FDR=0.05;

Table 1; Fig. 2A; Additional File 1: Table S3). These significant correlations are a result of

convergent rate changes in multiple regions of the phylogeny (Additional File 2: Fig. S2). A

negative correlation indicates that these genes evolved slower, implying that they make a greater

contribution to fitness the larger the increase in carnivory score (22). Among genes with this

signature, the products of three (*SLC13A2*, *SLC14A2*, and *CLDN16*) are involved in transport or

resorption in the kidney, two (*CPB1* and *PNLIP*) are secreted pancreatic enzymes, and one

(*ACADSB*) is involved in amino acid metabolism (45-50). Our analysis had greater power to detect

negative associations between RERs and change in carnivory score compared to positive

associations. The results of a Mann-Whitney U test indicated a significant difference in the

distribution of empirical, permulation-based *P*-values for genes with positive and negative

correlations (AUC=0.523, *P*=2.16 x 10^{-6}), with fewer low *P*-values generated for positively

correlated genes (Additional File 2: Fig. S3).

Table 1. Genes with evolutionary rates that are significantly associated with change in carnivory score. Permulation *P*-values represent the proportion of 100,000 permulations that produced a stronger correlation with change in carnivory score than the observed value for each gene. Multiple hypothesis testing corrections were performed by generating *Q*-values using Storey's correction method (26; FDR=0.05). A negative correlation (Rho) indicates that the gene evolves slower and may be of greater functional importance in lineages with larger positive changes in carnivory score.

Gene	Rho	Parametric *P*-value	Parametric *Q*-value	Permulation *P*-value	Permulation *Q*-value
SLC14A2	-0.446	1.54×10^{-8}	2.14×10^{-4}	$<1.00 \times 10^{-5}$*	<0.035*
SLC13A2	-0.358	6.94×10^{-6}	0.037	$<1.00 \times 10^{-5}$*	<0.035*
CLDN16	-0.400	7.93×10^{-6}	0.037	1.00×10^{-5}	0.035
CPB1	-0.325	8.02×10^{-5}	0.150	1.00×10^{-5}	0.035
PNLIP	-0.350	1.85×10^{-5}	0.065	2.00×10^{-5}	0.046
ACADSB	-0.306	3.36×10^{-4}	0.260	2.00×10^{-5}	0.046

* After generating 100,000 null statistics, none produced a stronger correlation with diet than the observed values for *SLC13A2* and *SLC14A2*. However, if the *P*-values are adjusted to the smallest observable non-zero *P*-value (1.00×10^{-5}), they would produce a significant empirical *Q*-value (FDR=0.05).

Figure 2. Top genes and pathways with signatures of diet-associated evolutionary constraint. (*A*) Genes identified by RERconverge as having a significant association between relative evolutionary rate and change in carnivory score. A negative correlation (Rho) indicates that the gene evolves slower, and may be of greater functional importance, the larger the increase in carnivory score. A positive correlation indicates slower evolution with larger decreases in carnivory score. After 100,000 permulations, six genes showed a significant association, and each evolved slower in association with increased carnivory (FDR=0.05). (*B*) Tissues associated with positive and negative correlations, where: 1 = liver, 2 = kidneys, 3 = tibial artery, 4 = pancreas, 5 = small intestine. Some tissues are annotated with the genes found to be individually significant. The annotated tissues are the locations of highest expression for those genes in adult humans, according to the Genotype-Tissue Expression Project (51). The gene sets of red organs were more evolutionarily constrained in lineages with increasing carnivory. Blue indicates more evolutionary constraint in lineages with decreasing carnivory. Gray represents organs that were not significantly enriched but were sites of strongest expression for slowly evolving genes. (*C*) Biological functions showing constraint associated with change in diet. We used RERconverge to test for enrichment of gene sets representing tissues (n=50), gene pathways (n=1,290), and abnormal phenotypes (n=3,560). For tissues, two gene sets were enriched for negative correlations, and one set was enriched for positive correlations. For gene pathways, 26 and 8 gene sets were enriched for negative and positive correlations, respectively. For abnormal phenotypes, four gene sets were enriched for negative correlations.

Each of the six significant genes are most strongly expressed in the liver, kidneys, pancreas, or

small intestine (51). We performed a gene set enrichment analysis to determine if there was a

statistically significant association between change in carnivory score and the rate of evolution of

genes expressed in specific tissues. Our test showed that the liver and kidney cortex gene sets were

significantly enriched and correlated with slower evolution in lineages with positive changes in

carnivory score (FDR=0.05; Fig. 2B,C; Table 2; Additional File 1: S4). In contrast, the tibial artery

was significantly enriched for genes evolving more slowly in lineages with negative changes in

carnivory score.

Table 2. Tissues that are significantly enriched for genes associated with change in carnivory score. Permulation *P*-values represent the proportion of 100,000 permulations that produced a stronger enrichment test statistic than the observed value for each gene set. Multiple hypothesis testing corrections were performed by generating *Q*-values using Storey's correction method (26; FDR=0.05). A negative enrichment statistic indicates that the gene set is enriched for genes evolving slower with increasing carnivory scores.

Tissue	Enrichment Statistic	Parametric *P*-value	Parametric *Q*-value	Permulation *P*-value	Permulation *Q*-value
Tibial Artery	0.111	2.64×10^{-4}	0.002	6.30×10^{-4}	0.032
Liver	-0.158	1.28×10^{-19}	6.38×10^{-18}	0.002	0.037
Kidney Cortex	-0.146	7.42×10^{-7}	1.24×10^{-5}	0.002	0.037

We extended our enrichment analysis to 1,290 gene pathways from the Reactome and KEGG

databases and identified significant enrichment for 34 pathways (FDR=0.05; Fig. 2C; Additional

File 1: Table S5). Of these pathways, 26 were associated with slower evolution in lineages with

larger increases in carnivory. These pathways had functions related to digestion, biological

oxidation, transport of small molecules, heme degradation, and metabolism of amino acids, lipids,

and carbohydrates (Fig. 3). Eight pathways evolved at slower rates in lineages with decreases in

carnivory score. These pathways were associated with disparate functions: cardiovascular disease,

cell motility, signaling by anaplastic lymphoma kinase (ALK) in cancer, and signaling by Hippo,

NOTCH3, and interleukin-17 (Additional File 2: Fig. S4).

Figure 3. Significantly enriched gene pathways (n=26) under greater evolutionary constraint in lineages with increasing carnivory scores. Each circle or square represents a gene pathway. Circles and squares represent pathways from the Reactome and KEGG databases, respectively. The size of the shape represents the magnitude of the difference between the distribution of test statistics for genes in that pathway and the distribution for all other genes. Larger shapes, representing pathways enriched for genes with more negative correlation statistics, indicate pathways that experience greater constraint as carnivory score increases. The width of lines connecting pathways represents the proportion of shared genes in the smaller gene set. Colors represent the broad functional categories that the pathways occupy.

We performed an enrichment analysis on 3,560 gene sets representing abnormal phenotypes from the Mammalian Phenotype Ontology (29). We identified four phenotypes with significant enrichment using both raw and permulation-based empirical *P*-values (FDR=0.1; Fig. 2C; Table 3; Additional File 1: Table S6). All four gene sets were enriched for genes evolving slower as carnivory score increases. Two phenotypes—decreased urine osmolality (MP:0002988) and increased urine calcium level (MP:0005441)—were related to abnormal urine homeostasis, and the other two—abnormal lipid level (MGI:0001547) and abnormal circulating lipid level (MGI:0003949)—were associated with lipid homeostasis. The abnormal urine homeostasis gene sets shared 8 of 82 total genes, with 4—*SLC12A1*, *KCTD1*, *SLC4A1*, and *UMOD*—in the 10 top-ranked genes for both gene sets. The abnormal lipid homeostasis gene sets shared 10 of 134 total genes, with 1 overlapping gene, *BHMT*, in the top 10 for both sets.

Table 3. Phenotype-based gene sets from the Mammalian Phenotype Ontology that are significantly enriched for genes associated with carnivory score. Permulation *P*-values represent the proportion of 100,000 permulations that produced a stronger enrichment statistic than the observed value for each gene set. Multiple hypothesis testing corrections were performed by generating *Q*-values using Storey's correction method (26; FDR=0.1). A negative enrichment statistic indicates that the gene set is enriched for genes evolving slower in lineages with increasing carnivory scores.

Phenotype	Enrichment Statistic	Parametric *P*-value	Parametric *Q*-value	Permulation *P*-value	Permulation *Q*-value
MP:0003949 abnormal circulating lipid level	-0.235	3.30×10^{-5}	0.011	7.00×10^{-5}	0.057
MP:0001547 abnormal lipid level	-0.170	3.62×10^{-9}	1.20×10^{-5}	8.00×10^{-5}	0.057
MP:0005441 increased urine calcium level	-0.311	7.74×10^{-8}	8.53×10^{-5}	8.00×10^{-5}	0.057
MP:0002988 decreased urine osmolality	-0.181	1.01×10^{-5}	0.006	8.00×10^{-5}	0.057

Positive selection

We identified 193 and 172 genes that showed significant positive selection in the most carnivorous

and herbivorous species, respectively (Additional File 1: Tables S7, S8). Among the carnivore-

specific positively selected genes, we identified enrichment for four Reactome pathways related

to *O*-linked glycosylation and one pathway related to pregnenolone biosynthesis (Table 4). The

ADAMTS (a disintegrin and metalloproteinase with thrombospondin motifs) genes driving the

observed enrichment for *O*-linked glycosylation pathways were also components of the only GO

Term that was significantly enriched—metallopeptidase activity (GO:0008237; Table 4). We did

not identify significant enrichment of any phenotypes, gene pathways, or GO Terms in our list of

positively selected genes in herbivores.

Table 4. Gene sets enriched for positive selection in the most carnivorous mammals (carnivory score ≥90). We did not detect enrichment in the most herbivorous mammals (carnivory score ≤10).

Gene Set	# Genes analyzed	Positively selected genes	P-value	Q-value
Reactome Pathways				
O-linked glycosylation	87	*ADAMTS5*, *ADAMTS12*, *ADAMTS14*, *ADAMTS20*, *B4GALT6*, *CHST4*, *LARGE2*, *THSD4*	1.83×10^{-5}	0.008
Defective B3GALTL causes Peters-plus syndrome (PpS)	34	*ADAMTS5*, *ADAMTS12*, *ADAMTS14*, *ADAMTS20*, *THSD4*	7.70×10^{-5}	0.013
O-glycosylation of TSR domain-containing proteins	35	*ADAMTS5*, *ADAMTS12*, *ADAMTS14*, *ADAMTS20*, *THSD4*	8.89×10^{-5}	0.013
Diseases associated with *O*-glycosylation of proteins	49	*ADAMTS5*, *ADAMTS12*, *ADAMTS14*, *ADAMTS20*, *THSD4*	4.50×10^{-4}	0.041
Pregnenolone biosynthesis	12	*CYP11A1*, *FDX2*, *STARD3NL*	4.58×10^{-4}	0.041
GO Terms				
GO:0008237 metallopeptidase activity	158	*ADAMTS5*, *ADAMTS12*, *ADAMTS14*, *ADAMTS20*, *AEBP1*, *CNDP1*, *CPZ*, *PEPD*, *STAMBPL1*, *THSD4*, *TRHDE*	5.75×10^{-6}	0.002

DISCUSSION

We identified genes that are functionally important during mammalian adaptation to increasingly

carnivorous or herbivorous diets using quantitative carnivory scores and a phylogeny of 80 species

sampled from the taxonomic and dietary breadth of Mammalia. Ours is the first comparative

genomic study of diet to use a quantitative variable and to analyze convergence across so many

species. We consistently found stronger signals of convergent genic evolution accompanying

increasing levels of carnivory compared to decreasing carnivory (Table 1; Additional File 1:

Tables S7, S8). Convergence in constraint correlated with increasing carnivory appears to act on

lipid and amino acid metabolism, biological oxidation, and liver and kidney functions (Fig. 2;

Tables 2-4; Additional File 1: Tables S5, S6).

The roles of liver and kidneys in adaptation to carnivory

Multiple lines of evidence support that liver and kidney functions are crucial for the convergent
evolution of increased carnivory. Of the six genes identified by RERconverge as evolving
significantly slower with increasing carnivory scores, three (*SLC13A2*, *SLC14A2*, and *CLDN16*)
and one (*ACADSB*) are respectively most strongly expressed in human kidneys and liver (51).
Further, the kidney cortex and liver gene sets were enriched for genes showing increased
evolutionary constraint in correlation with increasing carnivory scores (Table 2).

The importance of kidney function to carnivory may be mediated by its role in the reabsorption
and secretion of small molecules. Our enrichment analysis identified several pathways related to
small molecule transport, including several containing solute carrier proteins (SLCs) such as
SLC13A2 and SLC14A2, that were under greater constraint the more a lineage increased in
carnivory. Many of these pathways take place in the kidneys. The results of our phenotype-specific
enrichment analysis also support a central role of small molecule transportation in the carnivore
kidney. Of the four MGI phenotype gene sets that were significantly enriched, two of them—
decreased urine osmolality (MP:0002988) and increased urine calcium level (MP:0005441)—are
related to abnormal urine homeostasis, which is a direct consequence of impaired renal function.
Mammals excrete nitrogenous waste in the form of urea, and the urea load that must be excreted
each day largely depends on the protein content of an organism's diet. The most carnivorous
species have the greatest urea loads and produce urine with higher urea concentrations than other
species (52). The need to excrete greater quantities of nitrogenous waste imposes selective pressure
on the carnivore kidney. This is supported by our finding that *SLC14A2* is evolutionarily
constrained in carnivorous lineages, as the urea transporters encoded by this gene are critical to
the urea-dependent urine concentrating mechanism (46).

Liver function is important during adaptation to carnivory due to its role in amino acid and lipid
metabolism. It is the only organ in mammals that can completely metabolize most amino acids,
and it plays an active role in amino acid synthesis (53). Carnivorous diets are rich in proteins and
lipids. Pathways related to their metabolism should therefore be under stronger purifying selection
in carnivores, as lipids and amino acids represent their main energy sources. Among genes strongly
constrained with increasing carnivory, we identified enrichment for genes involved in several
processes related to the metabolism of lipids and assorted amino acids, including many that take

place within the liver. One of these pathways was related to bile acid synthesis. Bile acids facilitate

digestion of dietary fats and allow excess cholesterol to be excreted from the body. Indeed, bile

acid synthesis and excretion represent the major mechanism of cholesterol catabolism and

elimination in mammals (54). Given that carnivores possess lipid-rich diets, lipid metabolism

pathways may be evolutionarily constrained so that sufficient levels of cholesterol homeostasis are

maintained in these species.

Metabolism of amino acids and lipids is associated with biological oxidation, and we found that

several biological oxidation pathways evolved slower in lineages with increasing carnivory scores.

Thus, it is an integral component of carnivory. However, increased constraint on biological

oxidation in lineages with increasing levels of carnivory is an unexpected result, given the

importance of xenobiotic metabolism in herbivores: Many plants employ chemical defenses

against herbivory (55), and herbivores may overcome these defenses via oxidation (56, 57). A

negative correlation between the RERs of biological oxidation genes and carnivory score may be

driven by rapid evolution in increasingly herbivorous lineages. However, we do not detect these

genes in the results of our herbivore-specific positive selection analyses.

Amino acid and lipid metabolism outside of the liver are also associated with adaptation to

increasing carnivory. The evolutionary rates of *CPB1* and *PNLIP*—two genes most strongly

expressed in the pancreas (51)—were significantly negatively correlated with increasing carnivory

scores. The gene for another pancreatic lipase, *PNLIPRP2*, had a marginally significant association

with carnivory score (Rho=-0.311; *Q*=0.059) and may be important to carnivory. Both lipases have

been implicated in the dietary switch to carnivory during the evolution of Cetacea (9, 12). Our

results support previous findings that pancreatic lipases play a role during evolutionary changes in

degree of carnivory. Interestingly, another member of this family of pancreatic lipase genes,

PNLIPRP1, has convergently lost function in multiple herbivorous mammals, suggesting a

relaxation of selective constraint in herbivores compared to carnivores (10). The protein encoded

by this gene, PL-RP1, shows little to no detectable lipase activity and instead acts as a competitive

inhibitor of pancreatic lipase (58). Inactivation of *PNLIPRP1* would therefore enhance fat

digestion capacity in herbivores. However, we observed no significant association between

PNLIPRP1 and carnivory score, likely because the gene alignments used in our study do not

include pseudogenes.

Biological oxidation outside the liver is important for dietary adaptation: our positive selection
analyses showed that a member of the cytochrome P450 gene superfamily, *CYP11A1*, is positively
selected in the most carnivorous species. The protein encoded by *CYP11A1* catalyzes the first stage
of steroid hormone synthesis—the production of pregnenolone from cholesterol via oxidation (59).
The pregnenolone biosynthesis pathway was enriched in our carnivore-specific positive selection
analysis (Table 4), and steroid hormone synthesis showed increased constraint in lineages with
increasing carnivory scores in our analysis of gene evolutionary rates (Additional File 1: Table
S5).

In summary, our results indicate that, during adaptation to more carnivorous diets, purifying
selection acts on functions related to metabolism and elimination of substances found in excess in
animal-based foods. The liver and kidneys have been disproportionately targeted during
carnivorous adaptation to maintain sufficient functioning of these processes.

Implications of carnivorous adaptations for human health
Our results offer insights into diet-related diseases in humans and suggest avenues for new medical
research. Human dietary maladaptation is not driven by high rates of carnivory *per se*: stable
isotopes and archeological evidence indicate that increased meat consumption began early in
human evolution (60, 61) and that pre-agricultural diets were more carnivorous than current ones
(62). Instead, an evolutionarily rapid shift away from pre-agricultural diets in favor of fattier meats
and processed foods has increased chronic disease in modern communities (63). Our findings help
characterize mechanisms of human dietary maladaptation because metabolic challenges posed by
extreme carnivory overlap with those posed by modern processed diets. For example, carnivore
adaptations that allow for lipid-rich diets without disease are medically relevant given a global
increase in the consumption of high-fat foods in human populations (64). In humans, high intakes
of red meat are associated with increased blood cholesterol levels and coronary heart disease (65).
Tightly regulated cholesterol and lipid homeostasis may be an adaptation to avoid such diseases
in carnivores. Our phenotype-specific enrichment analysis supports that lipid homeostasis is a
main feature of successful adaptation to increasing carnivory. Two overlapping significantly
enriched phenotype gene sets—abnormal lipid level (MGI:0001547) and abnormal circulating
lipid level (MGI:0003949)—are related to lipid homeostasis and showed greater importance in

lineages with increasing carnivory scores. Thus, the lipid metabolism genes driving our results
may be important targets for future study.

Evolutionary constraint on the carnivore kidney is relevant to human health due to the elevated
burden of high-protein diets on renal function. High-protein diets have been linked to kidney
damage and reduced renal function in observational human studies (66). In other omnivorous
mammals, experimental evidence has shown that high protein intake causes kidney inflammation
and damage (67, 68). Protein-rich diets have been implicated in kidney stone formation as they
increase the excretion of calcium and oxalate into the urine (69). The link between diet and kidney
stones offers a plausible connection between *SLC13A2*, carnivory, and human health, as defects in
this gene cause low urinary citrate concentrations, leading to the formation of kidney stones (70).
The kidney stone connection also strengthens the link for *CLDN16* because defects in this gene
are associated with elevated urine calcium levels and deposition of calcium salts in the kidneys
(71).

Another constrained pathway in lineages with increasing carnivory is heme degradation. While
nonheme iron is present in both plant- and animal-based foods, heme iron is mainly found in
animal tissues (72). Primarily carnivorous species ingest excess heme, so heme degradation is a
more important process in these species. Excess heme intake causes oxidative damage,
inflammation, and cell death (73), and has been implicated in several diseases, including type-2
diabetes, coronary heart disease, gut dysbiosis, colitis, and cancers (74-76). Cancer risk is highest
among carnivorous mammals (77), and selection for DNA repair mechanisms in carnivores has
been attributed to increased consumption of heme-related reactive oxygen species (11). Increased
disease risk due to heme consumption may drive the increased selective constraint acting on heme
degradation in lineages with increasing levels of carnivory.

Carnivore-specific positive selection acting on *O*-linked glycosylation pathways and
metalloprotease activity may have relevance to human diabetes. Enrichment for these pathways
was primarily driven by four *ADAMTS* genes. *O*-linked glycosylation is a widespread post-
translational modification of ADAMTS metalloproteases (78). The positively selected ADAMTSs
are associated with extracellular matrix (ECM) assembly and degradation in various biological
processes (79-84). In mice, high-fat diets and insulin resistance increase expression of ECM
remodeling genes and encourage collagen deposition, leading to fibrosis in tissues such as skeletal

muscle, liver, and adipose tissue (85-87). High-fat diets and healthy glucose metabolism that

resembles diabetes (2) may increase selective pressure acting on ECM-regulating proteases in

carnivores.

Comprehensive sampling elucidated fundamentally important functions

Our analyses sampled the taxonomic and dietary breadth of Mammalia, incorporating genome-

wide data from 80 species. The signals of convergent molecular evolution that we detected are

driven by multiple instances of dietary convergence across the phylogeny (Additional File 2: Fig.

S2). We therefore isolated genes and biological functions that are important for carnivory and

herbivory in most or all instances that such diets evolved across mammals. Some of our results

overlap with those previously found in studies of fewer species. For example, lipid metabolism

has frequently been identified as a target of selection in carnivores (e.g., 3, 9, 11). However, our

study is the first to emphasize the fundamental importance of kidney and liver function during the

convergent evolution of carnivory.

By including more species in our analyses, we provide a clearer picture of which diet-specific

selection signatures are clade-specific and which are apparent in all carnivores. For example, Kim

et al. (11) found carnivore-specific selection acting on functions such as neuron development,

muscle strength, and agility. The authors attribute their findings to agile hunting behaviors.

However, we did not detect this selection in our broader analysis. Some carnivores in our expanded

sampling are not agile predators and are unlikely to have experienced selection on these functions.

For example, Bryde's whale was included in our analyses and feeds on zooplankton with limited

movement capabilities (88). Bryde's whale does not require the same agility while hunting as the

carnivorans, orca, and Tasmanian devil that were analyzed by Kim et al. (11).

Herbivores showed less signal of convergent genic evolution

We obtained fewer significant results when focusing on selective pressures accompanying

increased herbivory. Our RERconverge analysis did not identify any genes that evolved

significantly slower in association with decreasing carnivory scores, and only eight gene pathways

were enriched for genes with greater functional importance as herbivory increases. These pathways

were related to cell motility, immunity, cardiovascular disease, and signaling by Hippo, NOTCH3,

and ALK (Additional File 1: Table S5). We may have identified fewer signals of molecular

constraint in lineages with increased herbivory because of a difference in power to detect positive

and negative associations between RER and carnivory score. We had reduced power to detect

positive correlations, which represent increasing constraint as carnivory score decreases

(Additional File 2: Fig. S3). Thus, fewer significant results for increases in herbivory may not have

a biological explanation. Alternatively, the weaker signal of molecular constraint may indicate that

genic adaptation is less predictable in response to increased herbivory than in response to increased

carnivory.

The relevance to diet or health of pathways constrained in lineages with decreasing carnivory

scores is generally less obvious than those with the opposite pattern of constraint. These pathways

may represent understudied components of dietary adaptation. For example, Hippo signaling

integrates signals from multiple sources to regulate cell proliferation and differentiation, and can

influence and be influenced by the metabolism of glucose, lipids, and amino acids (89). Given that

multiple metabolic cues are integrated into Hippo signaling, it is unclear why constraint

strengthens with increasing levels of herbivory. NOTCH3 plays an important role during vascular

development and in continued vascular functioning of adult organisms (90-92). Given this,

enrichment for NOTCH3 signaling may be related to enrichment of the tibial artery gene set in the

same direction (Table 2). However, it is unclear why vascular function would be under stronger

evolutionary constraint as herbivory increases. ALK activation is involved in the development of

many cancers (93), but its function beyond cancer is not as well understood. It is thought to play a

role in nervous system development (94), but expression has also been detected in the small

intestine and colon (95). More recently, ALK signaling was implicated in regulating energy

expenditure and weight gain (96), so it might play an important, unidentified role in diet regulation,

and further study could elucidate its relevance.

Despite limited signal and unclear relevance for many results associated with increasing herbivory,

one pathway stood out. The importance of interleukin-17 (IL-17) signaling in lineages adapting to

more herbivorous diets may reflect IL-17's role in gut microbiome regulation. IL-17 encourages

the production of antimicrobial proteins and the migration of neutrophils into infected intestinal

mucosa, maintains intestinal barrier integrity, and limits gut dysbiosis (97-100). Gut microbiomes

are essential for herbivores. The plants consumed by herbivores comprise complex

polysaccharides that cannot be digested by mammalian enzymes. However, microorganisms in the

herbivore gut can ferment these compounds to produce metabolites that are used easily by their

host. The importance of microorganisms for plant consumption has led to convergence in gut

microbiota across mammalian herbivores, while those of carnivores are highly variable (101, 102).

As gut microbes are necessary for successful herbivory, increasing selective constraint should act

on gut homeostasis pathways in lineages becoming more herbivorous.

CONCLUSION

An understanding of the genomic mechanisms underlying mammalian dietary adaptation offers

insights for improving human health. In this work, we analyzed 80 species to identify genes that

experienced convergent molecular evolution during evolutionary changes in degree of carnivory.

Six genes—*ACADSB*, *CLDN16*, *CPB1*, *PNLIP*, *SLC13A2*, and *SLC14A2*—experienced

convergent molecular constraint in lineages that became more carnivorous. During the evolution

of increasing carnivory, purifying selection acted on liver and kidney functions to maintain

metabolism and excretion of substances found in excess in animal-based diets. Some of the

metabolic challenges imposed by extreme carnivory mirror those presented by dietary

maladaptation to modern human diets. Thus, our findings present new avenues for research of diet-

related disease.

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION
File name: **Additional File 1**
File format: Excel spreadsheets (.xlsx)
Title: Table S1
Description: Species selection for comparative genomic analyses of mammalian diet.

Title: Table S2
Description: GO Term overrepresentation in genes that were filtered from downstream analyses
(n=2322).

Title: Table S3
Description: Gene-phenotype evolutionary rate correlation.

Title: Table S4
Description: Tissue enrichment analysis results from RERconverge.

Title: Table S5
Description: Gene pathway enrichment analysis results from RERconverge.

Title: Table S6
Description: Phenotype enrichment analysis results from RERconverge.

Title: Table S7
Description: Genes experiencing positive selection in the most carnivorous mammals (carnivory
scores ≥90).

Title: Table S8
Description: Genes experiencing positive selection in the most herbivorous mammals (carnivory
scores ≤10).

501
File name: **Additional File 2**
File format: Word document (.docx)
Title: Figure S1
Description: Conservative strategy for generating final lists of positively selected genes associated
with carnivory and herbivory in mammals.

Title: Figure S2
Description: Changes in relative evolutionary rates (RERs) across the mammalian phylogeny for
genes significantly correlated with change in carnivory score.
510
Title: Figure S3
Description: Significant differences in the distribution of permulation *P*-values for positive and
negative associations between gene relative evolutionary rates (RERs) and carnivory score

Title: Figure S4
Description: Significantly enriched gene pathways (n=8) under greater evolutionary constraint in
lineages with decreasing carnivory scores.

DECLARATIONS

Ethics approval and consent to participate
Not applicable.

Consent for publication
Not applicable.

Availability of data and materials
Nucleotide and amino acid alignments used in this study were generated by the Zoonomia Consortium (https://zoonomiaproject.org/the-data/). Carnivory scores for species included in this study are available in Additional File 1. Our RERconverge and positive selection results are available in Additional File 1. Code generated for this project is available on GitHub (https://github.com/mdpllard/carnivory-genes). The tissue- and mouse phenotype-specific gene sets generated for our enrichment analyses are available on GitHub.

Competing interests
The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Funding
This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. 2233124 (to WKM).

Authors' contributions
MDP and WKM performed data pre-processing. MDP analyzed the data and interpreted results with EEP and WKM. MDP wrote the manuscript. EEP and WKM edited the manuscript. EEP supervised the study.

Acknowledgements
We thank the administrators of the University of Memphis High Performance Computing (HPC) facilities for support during this study.

LITERATURE CITED

1.   Gill PG, Purnell MA, Crumpton N, Robson Brown K, Gostling NJ, Stampanoni M, et al. Dietary specialization and diversity in feeding ecology of the earliest stem mammals. Nature. 2014;512:303-5.

2.   Schermerhorn T. Normal glucose metabolism in carnivores overlaps with diabetes pathology in non-carnivores. Frontiers in Endocrinology. 2013;4:188.

3.   Liu S, Lorenzen ED, Fumagalli M, Li B, Harris K, Xiong Z, et al. Population genomics reveal recent speciation and rapid evolutionary adaptation in polar bears. Cell. 2014;157(4):785-94.

4.   Ference BA, Ginsberg HN, Graham I, Ray KK, Packard CJ, Bruckert E, et al. Low-density lipoproteins cause atherosclerotic cardiovascular disease. 1. Evidence from genetic, epidemiologic, and clinical studies. A consensus statement from the European Atherosclerosis Society Consensus Panel. European Heart Journal. 2017;28:2459-72.

5.   Fumagalli M, Moltke I, Grarup N, Racimo F, Bjerregaard P, Jørgensen ME, et al. Greenlandic Inuit show genetic signatures of diet and climate adaptation. Science. 2015;349:1343-7.

6.   Zoonomia Consortium. A comparative genomics multitool for scientific discovery and conservation. Nature. 2020;587:240-5.

7.   Christmas MJ, Kaplow IM, Genereux DP, Dong MX, Hughes GM, Li X, et al. Evolutionary constraint and innovation across hundreds of placental mammals. Science. 2023;380:eabn3943.

8.   Hu Y, Wu Q, Ma S, T. M, Shan L, Wang X, et al. Comparative genomics reveals convergent evolution between the bamboo-eating giant and red pandas. PNAS. 2017;114:1081-6.

9.   Wang Z, Xu S, Du K, Huang F, Chen Z, Zhou K, et al. Evolution of digestive enzymes and RNASE1 provides insights into dietary switch of cetaceans. Molecular Biology and Evolution. 2016;33:3144-57.

10.   Hecker N, Sharma V, Hiller M. Convergent gene losses illuminate metabolic and physiological changes in herbivores and carnivores. PNAS. 2019;116:3036-41.

11.   Kim S, Cho YS, Kim H-M, Chung O, Kim H, Jho S, et al. Comparison of carnivore, omnivore, and herbivore mammalian genomes with a new leopard assembly. Genome Biology. 2016;17:211.

12.   Wu Y. Diet evolution of carnivorous and herbivorous mammals in Laurasiatheria. BMC Ecology and Evolution. 2022;22:82.

13.   Pineda-Munoz S, Alroy J. Dietary characterization of terrestrial mammals. Proc. R. Soc. B. 2014;281:20141173.

14.   Pollard MD, Puckett EE. Evolution of degrees of carnivory and dietary specialization across Mammalia and their effects on speciation. Preprint at https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.09.15.460515. 2022.

15.   Reuter DM, Hopkins SSB, Price SA. What is a mammalian omnivore? Insights into terrestrial mammalian diet diversity, body mass and evolution. Proceedings of the Royal Society B. 2023;290:20221062.

16.   Grundler M, Rabosky DL. Complex ecological phenotypes on phylogenetic trees: a Markov process model for comaprative analysis of multivariate count data. Systematic Biology. 2020;69:1200-11.

17.   Wilman H, Belmaker J, Simpson J, de la Rosa C, Rivadeneira MM, Jetz W. EltonTraits 1.0: Species-level foraging attributes of the world's birds and mammals. Ecology. 2014;95:2027.

18.   Nowak RM. Walker's Mammals of the World. 6th ed. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press; 1999. 1936 p.

19.   Kirilenko BM, Munegowda C, Osipova E, Jebb D, Sharma V, Blumer M, et al. Integrating gene annotation with orthology inference at scale. Science. 2023;380:eabn3107.

20.   Revell LJ. phytools: an R package for phylogenetic comparative biology (and other things).
Methods in Ecology and Evolution. 2012;3:317-223.
21.   Kowalczyk A, Meyer WK, Partha R, Mao W, Clark NL, Chikina M. RERconverge: an R
package for associating evolutionary rates with convergent traits. Bioinformatics. 2019;35:4815-
7.
22.   Kowalczyk A, Partha R, Clark NL, Chikina M. Pan-mammalian analysis of molecular
constraints underlying extended lifespan. eLife. 2020;9:e51089.
23.   Schliep KP. phangorn: phylogenetic analysis in R. Bioinformatics. 2011;27:592-3.
24.   Upham NS, Esselstyn JA, Jetz W. Inferring the mammal tree: Species-level sets of
phylogenies for questions in ecology, evolution, and conservation. PloS Biol. 2019;17:e3000494.
25.   Saputra E, Kowalczyk A, Cusick L, Clark N, Chikina M. Phylogenetic permulations: a
statistically rigorous approach to measure confidence in associations in a phylogenetic context.
Molecular Biology and Evolution. 2021;38:3004-21.
26.   Storey JD, Bass AJ, Dabney A, Robinson D. qvalue: Q-value estimation for false discovery
rate control. http://github.com/jdstorey/qvalue2020.
27.   Jain A, Tuteja G. TissueEnrich: Tissue-specific gene enrichment analysis. Bioinformatics.
2019;35:1966-7.
28.   Liberzon A, Subramanian S, Pinchback R, Thorvaldsdóttir H, Tamayo P, Mesirov JP.
Molecular signatures database (MSigDB) 3.0. Bioinformatics. 2011;27:1739-40.
29.   Smith CL, Goldsmith CW, Eppig JT. The Mammalian Phenotype Ontology as a tool for
annotating, analyzing and comparing phenotypic information. Genome Biology. 2005;6:R7.
30.   Yang Z. PAML 4: phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. Molecular Biology and
Evolution. 2007;24:1586-91.
31.   Forni G, Ruggieri AA, Piccinini G, Luchetti A. BASE: a novel workflow to integrate
nonubiquitous genes in comparative genomics analyses for selection. Ecology and Evolution.
2021;11:13029-35.
32.   Murrell B, Weaver S, Smith MD, Wertheim JO, Murrell S, Aylward A, et al. Gene-wide
identification of episodic selection. Molecular Biology and Evolution. 2015;32:1365-71.
33.   Pond SLK, Poon AFY, Velazquez R, Weaver S, Hepler NL, Murrell B, et al. HyPhy 2.5—A
customizable platform for evolutionary hypothesis testing using phylogenies. Molecular Biology
and Evolution. 2020;37:295-9.
34.   Panthi S, Aryal A, Raubenheimer D, Lord J, Adhikari B. Summer diet and distribution of the
red panda (*Ailurus fulgens fulgens*) in Dhorpatan Hunting Reserve, Nepal. Zoological Studies.
2012;51:701-9.
35.   Yonzon PB, Hunter ML. Conservation of the red panda *Ailurus fulgens*. Biological
Conservation. 1991;57:1-11.
36.   Pradhan S, Saha GK, Khan JA. Ecology of the red panda *Ailurus fulgens* in the Singhalila
National Park, Darjeeling, India. Biological Conservation. 2001;98:11-8.
37.   Julien-Laferrière D. Foraging strategies and food partitioning in the neotropical frugivorous
mammals *Caluromys philander* and *Potos flavus*. Journal of Zoology. 1999;247:71-80.
38.   Kays RW. Food preferences of kinkajous (*Potos flavus*): a frugivorous carnivore. Journal of
Mammalogy. 1999;80:589-99.
39.   Kowalczyk A, Chikina M, Clark NL. A cautionary tale on proper use of branch-site models
to detect convergent positive selection. Preprint at https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.10.26.465984.
2021.

40.   Mendes FK, Hahn MW. Gene tree discordance causes apparent substitution rate variation.
Systematic Biology. 2016;65:711-21.
41.   Stamatakis A. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large
phylogenies. Bioinformatics. 2014;30:1312-3.
42.   Wertheim JO, Murrell B, Smith MD, Kosakovsky Pond SL, Scheffler K. RELAX: Detecting
relaxed selection in a phylogenetic framework. Molecular Biology and Evolution. 2015;32:820-
32.
43.   Yu G, Wang L-G, Han Y, He Q-Y. clusterProfiler: an R package for comparing biological
themes among gene clusters. OMICS: A Journal of Integrative Biology. 2012;16:284-7.
44.   Yu G, He Q-Y. ReactomePA: an R/Bioconductor package for reactome pathway analysis and
visualization. Molecular BioSystems. 2016;12:477-9.
45.   Pajor AM. Sodium-coupled transporters for Krebs sycle intermediates. Annual Review of
Physiology. 1999;61:663-82.
46.   Geng X, Zhang S, He J, Ma A, Li Y, Li M, et al. The urea transporter UT-A1 plays a
predominant role in a urea-dependent urine-concentrating mechanism. Journal of Biological
Chemistry. 2020;295:9893-900.
47.   Simon DB, Lu Y, Choate KA, Velazquez H, Al-Sabban E, Praga M, et al. Paracellin-1, a
renal tight junction protein required for paracellular Mg^{2+} resorption. Science. 1999;285:103-6.
48.   Andresen BS, Christensen E, Corydon TJ, Bross P, Pilgaard B, Wanders RJA, et al. Isolated
2-methylbutyrylglycinuria caused by short/branched-chain acyl-CoA dehydrogenase deficiency:
identification of a new enzyme defect, resolution of its molecular basis, and evidence for distinct
acyl-CoA dehydrogenases in isoleucine and valine metabolism. The American Journal of Human
Genetics. 2000;67:1095-103.
49.   Leung LLK, Morser J. Carboxypeptidase B2 and carboxypeptidase N in the crosstalk between
coagulation, thrombosis, inflammation, and innate immunity. Journal of Thrombosis and
Haemostasis. 2018;16:1474-86.
50.   Davis RC, Diep A, Hunziker W, Klisak I, Mohandas T, Schotz MC, et al. Assignment of
human pancreatic lipase gene (PNLIP) to chromosome 10q24-q26. Genomics. 1991;11:1164-6.
51.   The GTEx Consortium. The Genotype-Tissue Expression (GTEx) pilot analysis: Multitissue
gene regulation in humans. Science. 2015;348:648-60.
52.   Liu L, Lei T, Bankir L, Zhao D, Gai X, Zhao X, et al. Erythrocyte permeability to urea and
water: comparative study in rodents, ruminants, carnivores, humans, and birds. Journal of
Comparative Physiology B. 2011;181:65-72.
53.   Hou Y, Hu S, Li X, He W, Wu G. Amino Acid Metabolism in the Liver: Nutritional and
Physiological Significance. In: Wu G, editor. Amino Acids in Nutrition and Health. Advances in
Experimental Medicine and Biology. Cham: Springer; 2020. p. 21-37.
54.   Russell DW. The enzymes, regulation, and genetics of bile acid synthesis. Annual Review of
Biochemistry. 2003;72:137-74.
55.   Berenbaum MR. The chemistry of defense: theory and practice. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.
1995;92:2-8.
56.   Karban R, Agrawal AA. Herbivore offense. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and
Systematics. 2002;33:641-64.
57.   Dearing MD, Foley WJ, McLean S. The influence of plant secondary metabolites on the
nutritional ecology of herbivorous terrestrial vertebrates. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution,
and Systematics. 2005;36:169-89.

58. Lowe ME. The triglyceride lipases of the pancreas. Journal of Lipid Research. 2002;43:2007-
16.
59. Payne AH, Hales DB. Overview of steroidogenic enzymes in the pathway from cholesterol
to active steroid hormones. Endocrine Reviews. 2004;25:947-70.
60. Domínguez-Rodrigo M, Pickering TR, Semaw S, Rogers MJ. Cutmarked bones from Pliocene
archaeological sites at Gona, Afar, Ethiopia: implications for the function of the world's oldest
stone tools. Journal of Human Evolution. 2005;48:109-21.
61. Sponheimer M, Lee-Thorp JA. Isotopic evidence for the diet of an early hominid,
Australopithecus africanus. Science. 1999;283:368-70.
62. Eaton SB, Cordain L. Evolutionary Aspects of Diet: Old Genes, New Fuels. In: Simopoulos
AP, editor. Nutrition and Fitness: Evolutionary Aspects, Children's Health, Programs and Policies.
World Review of Nutrition and Dietetics. 81. Basel: Karger; 1997. p. 26-37.
63. Jew S, AbuMweis SS, Jones PJH. Evolution of the human diet: linking our ancestral diet to
modern functional foods as a means of chronic disease prevention. Journal of Medicinal Food.
2009;12:925-34.
64. Kearney J. Food consumption trends and drivers. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal
Society B. 2010;365:2793-807.
65. Al-Shaar L, Satija A, Wang DD, Rimm EB, Smith-Warner SA, Stampfer MJ, et al. Red meat
intake and risk of coronary heart disease among US men: prospective cohort study. BMJ.
2020;371:m4141.
66. Ko G-J, Rhee CM, Kalantar-Zadeh K, Joshi S. The effects of high-protein diets on kidney
health and longevity. Journal of the American Society of Nephrology. 2020;31:1667-79.
67. Jia Y, Hwang SY, House JD, Ogborn MR, Weiler HA, Karmin O, et al. Long-term high intake
of whole proteins results in renal damage in pigs. The Journal of Nutrition. 2010;140:1646-52.
68. Tovar-Palacio C, Tovar AR, Torres N, Cruz C, Hernández-Pando R. Proinflammatory gene
expression and renal lipogenesis are modulated by dietary protein content in obese Zucker [fa/fa] rats.
American Journal of Physiology-Renal Physiology. 2011;300:F263-F71.
69. Robertson WG, Heyburn PJ, Peacock M, Swaminathan R. The effect of high animal protein
intake on the risk of calcium stone formation in the urinary tract. Clinical Science. 1979;57:285-
8.
70. Okamoto N, Aruga S, Matsuzaki S, Takahashi S, Matsushita K, Kitamura T. Associations
between renal sodium-citrate cotransporter (hNaDC-1) gene polymorphism and urinary citrate
excretion in recurrent renal calcium stone formers and normal controls. International Journal of
Urology. 2007;14:344-9.
71. Konrad M, Hou J, Weber S, Dötsch J, Kari JA, Seeman T, et al. *CLDN16* genotype predicts
renal decline in familial hypomagnesemia with hypercalciuria and nephrocalcinosis. Journal of the
American Society of Nephrology. 2008;19:171-81.
72. Hurrell R, Egli I. Iron bioavailability and dietary reference values. The American Journal of
Clinical Nutrition. 2010;91:1461S-7S.
73. Chiabrando D, Vinchi F, Fiorito V, Mercurio S, Tolosano E. Heme in pathophysiology: a
matter of scavenging, metabolism and trafficking across cell membranes. Frontiers in
Pharmacology. 2014;5:61.
74. Bastide NM, Pierre FHF, Corpet DE. Heme iron from meat and risk of colorectal cancer: a
meta-analysis and a review of the mechanisms involved. Cancer Prevention Research. 2011;4:177-
84.

75.   Hooda J, Shah A, Zhang L. Heme, an essential nutrient from dietary proteins, critically
impacts diverse physiological and pathological processes. Nutrients. 2014;6:1080-102.
76.   Constante M, Fragoso G, Calvé A, Samba-Mondonga M, Santos MM. Dietary heme induces
gut dysbiosis, aggravates colitis, and potentiates the development of adenomas in mice. Frontiers
in Microbiology. 2017;8:1809.
77.   Vincze O, Colchero F, Lemaître J-F, Conde DA, Pavard S, Bieuville M, et al. Cancer risk
across mammals. Nature. 2021;601:263-7.
78.   Wang LW, Dlugosz M, Somerville RPT, Raed M, Haltiwanger RS, Apte SS. *O*-fucosylation
of thrombospondin type 1 repeats in ADAMTS-like-1/punctin-1 regulates secretion. The Journal
of Biological Chemistry. 2007;282:17024-31.
79.   Dubail J, Apte SS. Insights on ADAMTS proteases and ADAMTS-like proteins from
mammalian genetics. Matrix Biology. 2015;44-46:24-37.
80.   Dupuis LE, McCulloch DR, McGarity JD, Bahan A, Wessels A, Weber D, et al. Altered
versican cleavage in ADAMTS5 deficient mice; a novel etiology of maxomatous valve disease.
Developmental Biology. 2011;357:152-64.
81.   Dancevic CM, Fraser FW, Smith AD, Stupka N, Ward AC, McCulloch DR. Biosynthesis and
expression of a disintegrin-like and metalloproteinase domain with thrombospondin-1 repeats-15.
The Journal of Biological Chemistry. 2012;288:37267-76.
82.   McCulloch DR, Nelson CM, Dixon LJ, Silver DL, Wylie JD, Lindner V, et al. ADAMTS
metalloproteases generate active versican fragments that regulate interdigital web regression.
Developmental Cell. 2009;17:687-98.
83.   Glasson SS, Askew R, Sheppard B, Carito B, Blanchet T, Ma H-L, et al. Deletion of active
ADAMTS5 prevents cartilage degradation in a murine model of osteoarthritis. Nature.
2005;434:644-8.
84.   El Hour M, Moncada-Pazos A, Blacher S, Masset A, Cal S, Berndt S, et al. Higher sensitivity
of *Adamts12*-deficient mice to tumor growth and angiogenesis. Oncogene. 2010;29:3025-32.
85.   Choi M-S, Kim Y-J, Kwon E-Y, Ryoo JY, Kim SR, Jung UJ. High-fat diet decreases energy
expenditure and expression of genes controlling lipid metabolism, mitochondrial function and
skeletal system development in the adipose tissue, along with increased expression of extracellular
matrix remodelling- and inflammation-related genes. British Journal of Nutrition. 2015;113:867-
77.
86.   Pincu Y, Linden MA, Zou K, Baynard T, Boppart MD. The effects of high fat diet and
moderate exercise on TGFβ1 and collagen deposition in mouse skeletal muscle. Cytokine.
2015;73:23-9.
87.   Williams AS, Kang L, Wasserman DH. The extracellular matrix and insulin resistance. Trends
in Endocrinology & Metabolism. 2015;26:357-66.
88.   Izadi S, Aguilar de Soto N, Constantine R, Johnson M. Feeding tactics of resident Bryde's
whales in New Zealand. Marine Mammal Science. 2022;38:1104-17.
89.   Ibar C, Irvine KD. Integration of Hippo-YAP signaling with metabolism. Developmental
Cell. 2020;54:256-67.
90.   Domenga V, Fardoux P, Lacombe P, Monet M, Maciazek J, Krebs LT, et al. Notch3 is
required for arterial identity and maturation of vascular smooth muscle cells. Genes &
Development. 2004;18:2730-5.
91.   Hosseini-Alghaderi S, Baron M. Notch3 in development, health and disease. Biomolecules.
2020;10:485.

92. Loerakker S, Stassen OMJA, ter Huurne FM, Sahlgren CM. Mechanosensitivity of Jagged-
Notch signaling can induce a switch-type behavior in vascular homeostasis. PNAS.
2018;115:E3682-E91.
93. Della Corte CM, Viscardi G, Di Liello R, Fasano M, Martinelli E, Troiani T, et al. Role and
targeting of anaplastic lymphoma kinase. Molecular Cancer. 2018;17:30.
94. Palmer RH, Vernersson E, Grabbe C, Hallberg B. Anaplastic lymphoma kinase: signalling in
development and disease. Biochemical Journal. 2009;420:345-61.
95. Morris SW, Kirstein MN, Valentine MB, Dittmer KG, Shapiro DN, Saltman DL, et al. Fusion
of a kinase gene, ALK, to a nucleolar protein gene, NPM, in Non-Hodgkin's lymphoma. Science.
1994;263:1281-4.
96. Orthofer M, Valsesia A, Mägi R, Wang Q-P, Kaczanowska J, Kozieradzki I, et al.
Identification of ALK in thinness. Cell. 2020;181:1246-62.
97. Aujila SJ, Dubin PJ, Kolls JK. Th17 cells and mucosal host defense. Seminars in Immunology.
2007;19:377-82.
98. Ishigame H, Kakuta S, Nagai T, Kadoki M, Nambu A, Komiyama Y, et al. Differential roles
of interleukin-17A and -17F in host defense against mucoepithelial bacterial infection and allergic
responses. Immunity. 2009;30:108-19.
99. Cao AT, Yao S, Gong B, Elson CO, Cong Y. Th17 cells upregulate polymeric Ig receptor
and intestinal IgA and contribute to intestinal homeostasis. The Journal of Immunology.
2012;189:4666-73.
100. Pérez MM, Martins LMS, Dias MS, Pereira CA, Leite JA, Gonçalves ECS, et al. Interleukin-
17/interleukin-17 receptor axis elicits intestinal neutrophil migration, restrains gut dysbiosis and
lipopolysaccharide translocation in high-fat diet-induced metabolic syndrome model.
Immunology. 2018;156:339-55.
101. Muegge BD, Kuczynski J, Knights D, Clemente JC, González A, Fontana L, et al. Diet
drives convergence in gut microbiome functions across mammalian phylogeny and within humans.
Science. 2011;332:970-4.
102. Zoelzer F, Burger AL, Dierkes PW. Unraveling differences in fecal microbiota stability in
mammals: from high variable carnivores and consistently stable herbivores. Animal Microbiome.
2021;3:77.