

1           **Obesity status and its relative factors of captive Asian elephants**  
2           **(*Elephas maximus*) in China based on body condition assessment**

3

4           Yinpu Tang<sup>a</sup>, Ting Jia<sup>b</sup>, Fangyi Zhou<sup>a</sup>, Liang Wang<sup>a</sup> and Li Zhang<sup>a\*</sup>

5           <sup>a</sup> Key Laboratory for Biodiversity Science and Ecological Engineering, Ministry of  
6           Education; College of Life Sciences, Beijing Normal University, Beijing 100875,  
7           China

8           <sup>b</sup> Beijing Key Laboratory of Captive Wildlife Technologies, Beijing Zoo, Beijing  
9           100044, China

10

11          \*Corresponding author

12          Li Zhang

13          Key Laboratory for Biodiversity Science and Ecological Engineering, Ministry of  
14          Education; College of Life Sciences, Beijing Normal University, Beijing 100875,  
15          China

16          Tel: 010-58809888

17          E-mail: [asterzhang@bnu.edu.cn](mailto:asterzhang@bnu.edu.cn)

18

19

20

21          Running title: Body condition of captive elephants in China

22

23 **Abstract**

24 Obesity is a common health problem in captive wildlife. Since the obesity status of  
25 captive Asian elephants (*Elephas maximus*) in China has not previously been  
26 investigated, we recorded seven relevant variables (sex, age, daily feed supply,  
27 proportion of high-calorie feed, outdoor enclosure area, outdoor time, and foot disorder)  
28 related to obesity in 204 captive Asian elephants through field investigation of 43  
29 elephant-raising facilities. Assessment of obesity was based on visual body condition  
30 scoring for each individual. It revealed that obesity was prevalent for captive Asian  
31 elephants (especially elephants in zoos) in China. Over 70% of captive Asian elephants  
32 in China were overweight or in obesity to various degrees. Statistical analysis showed  
33 that for elephants in zoos, insufficient outdoor time might be the primary potential cause  
34 of obesity. We suggested facilities to extend the outdoor time and control the supply of  
35 high-calorie feed (e.g., fruits, vegetables, pellets, etc.) for captive elephants, thereby  
36 alleviating obesity through increased exercise and a suitable energy intake. Moreover,  
37 all facilities should implement positive reinforcement training to facilitate regular  
38 physical examinations, including foot health checks and blood sampling. This training  
39 would improve the ability to collect more precise information relating to elephant health,  
40 obesity, and the evaluation of animal welfare.

41

42 **Keywords :** animal welfare; Asian elephant (*Elephas maximus*); captive wildlife;  
43 obesity; visual body condition assessment; foot health check

44

45 **Introduction**

46 Asian elephants (*Elephas maximus*), the largest terrestrial animal in Eurasia, are listed as  
47 Endangered (EN) on the IUCN Red List and CITES Appendix I. In the wild, Asian elephants are  
48 distributed in 13 countries in South and Southeast Asia, with a total population of 48,323 to 51,680  
49 (Menon & Tiwari 2019). Approximately 16,000 Asian elephants live in captivity (e.g., zoos, wildlife  
50 sanctuaries, etc.) or semi-captivity (e.g., timber enterprises, in private, etc.) and are mostly used for  
51 transport or as draught animals, only about 8.75% (< 1,400) living in zoos (Clubb & Mason 2002;  
52 Robinson *et al* 2012; Brown 2019).

53 Many studies have shown that captive elephants are prone to a variety of health problems, leading  
54 to a significant reduction in lifespan. Meanwhile, due to the low reproductive rate, zoo-elephant  
55 populations are not self-sustaining (Wiese 2000; Clubb & Mason 2002; Clubb *et al* 2008; Thitaram  
56 2012). Consequently, the state of the reproductive health of captive Asian elephants and influential  
57 factors have always been the focus of breeding management and care (Schmidt 1982; Schaftenaar  
58 & Hildebrandt 2006; Kumar *et al* 2014; Pushpakumara *et al* 2016).

59 However, compared to physical injury or infectious disease, obesity, as a common health problem  
60 of wild animals in captivity, rarely received sufficient attention from caregivers (Schwitzer &  
61 Kaumanns 2001; Klimentidis *et al* 2011). In general, from the perspective of energy budget, an  
62 organism's obesity status mostly depends on the nutritional intake and amount of exercise (Swinburn  
63 *et al* 2004; Shaw *et al* 2006). Therefore, an unsuitable diet and insufficient exercise tend to cause  
64 obesity in captive Asian elephants (Fowler 2008). According to a survey by the Association of Zoos  
65 and Aquariums (AZA) of the USA, among the 108 captive Asian elephants in 65 North American  
66 zoos, 75% of the females and 65% of the males are overweight or in obesity to various degrees  
67 (Morfeld *et al* 2016). Studies on captive Asian elephants in European and American zoos as well as

68 Asian elephants engaged in Thai tourism suggest that obesity may indicate metabolic disorders in  
69 the body, which in turn are highly correlated with low fertility in both sexes (Taylor & Poole, 1998;  
70 Norkaew *et al* 2018; Norkaew *et al* 2019). In contrast, during a study of free-ranging Asian elephants  
71 in Sri Lanka, it was observed that appropriate body condition and sufficient physical exercise  
72 contribute to the breeding success of females. Moreover, relative body weight (kg/cm at shoulder)  
73 in elephants was positively correlated with reproductive output (Dastig 2002).

74 The history of raising Asian elephants in Chinese zoos can be traced back to 1907 (Yang *et al* 2002).  
75 Subsequently, the first instance of breeding Asian elephants in human cares took place in 1966  
76 (Zhang 2018). Since the 1980s, China has begun to import a large number of Asian elephants from  
77 abroad (Zhang 2018). The population of captive Asian elephants has increased rapidly with the  
78 successful breeding of Asian elephants in various facilities. However, compared to European  
79 countries and the United States, China still has many shortcomings regarding the research and  
80 management of Asian elephants in captivity. One example of a knowledge gap is understanding  
81 obesity and its harm to captive Asian elephants. This study aimed to explore the relationship  
82 between potential related factors and the obesity status of captive Asian elephants in China. In  
83 addition, this study further summarized and discussed the main challenges faced by captive Asian  
84 elephants in China, and provided operational suggestions and physical conditions to improve their  
85 welfare status.

86

## 87 **Materials and methods**

### 88 *Ethics statement*

89 All the data collected in this study were for scientific purposes. Both Endangered Species Scientific

90 Commission, P.R.China (ESSC, P.R.C) and Chinese Association of Zoological Gardens (CAZG)  
91 reviewed all the procedures and approved permits for this study conducted in the elephant-raising  
92 facilities below. Our study adopted observation-based methods without direct contact with animals  
93 or using tissue samples, and approval from an Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee or  
94 equivalent animal ethics committee was therefore not required.

### 95 *Animals*

96 We recorded a total of 204 captive Asian elephants ( $\text{♂}:\text{♀}=88:116$ , about 64% of the living captive  
97 Asian elephant population in China) from January 2017 to April 2019 by on-site investigation of 43  
98 facilities (including 42 zoos and Wild Elephant Valley in Xishuangbanna, see in “*Study areas*”). By  
99 interviewing staff members (veterinarians, curators, and caregivers) and consulting animal archives  
100 during our investigation, we recorded the sex and age of each elephant. However, the age of 31  
101 individuals ( $\text{♂}:\text{♀}=13:18$ ) was unknown (**Figure 1**).

### 102 *Study areas*

#### 103 *Zoos*

104 A total of 42 zoos were visited on-site in this study, distributed in 25 provinces, municipalities, and  
105 autonomous regions. Each zoo usually opens at 9:00 and closes at 17:00 every day. When the  
106 weather is warm, elephants are allowed on display in outdoor enclosures during opening hours and  
107 return indoors when zoos are closed. Due to the lack of outdoor heating equipment, most zoos  
108 (especially those located in Northern China) no longer exhibit elephants outdoors when the  
109 temperature turns cold (e.g.,  $\leq 15^{\circ}\text{C}$ ) every year, and resume outdoor exhibitions until when it gets  
110 warmer next year. Caregivers provide each elephant with a certain amount of feed every day, which  
111 is divided into two meals in the morning and afternoon.

112 *Wild Elephant Valley*

113 The Wild Elephant Valley (100°51'33.2172"E, 22°10'39.3636"N) is located in Xishuangbanna  
114 National Nature Reserve, Yunnan province. As a tourist attraction and an elephant rescue center, it  
115 has a mixed population of imported elephants, which are trained for performance, as well as captive-  
116 born and rescued elephants. Except for performance time (about two hours every day), elephants  
117 here are allowed to forage and roam into a nearby natural forest region of 340 mu (approximately  
118 226,666.67 m<sup>2</sup>, including 8,000 m<sup>2</sup> of surface water and 2,800 m<sup>2</sup> of local villages) during the day  
119 accompanied by their mahouts. Elephants here are provided with four tons of fresh grasses (mainly  
120 elephant grasses *Cenchrus purpureus*, sometimes with rye grasses *Leymus chinensis* and corn stalks,  
121 and 100 kilograms of seasonal fruits in total every day. During feeding hours, elephants usually  
122 form small groups (four to ten individuals) by themselves. Members of the same group eat the same  
123 pile of feed together, separating from other groups.

124 ***Obesity status assessment - body condition scoring***

125 Due to the lack of training and equipment in most study areas, we could hardly weigh their elephants  
126 directly. Consequently, we used the result of visual body condition assessment, a widely used  
127 method to evaluate the overall condition of animals, to represent the obesity status of elephants.  
128 This method was first adopted to assess the physical condition of large livestock such as cows and  
129 horses and has since been extended to wildlife, both in natural habitats and captivity (Carroll &  
130 Huntington 1988; Edmonson *et al* 1989; Schiffmann *et al* 2017; Sun *et al* 2021). In this study, we  
131 assessed each elephant's body condition score (BCS) based on the criteria by Fernando *et al* (2009)  
132 (**Table 1**) and hypothesized that a higher BCS implied higher obesity status of an elephant (Chusyd  
133 *et al* 2019).

134 Photographs and videos of elephants from various angles were taken during the investigation of  
135 each facility. Selected images (photographs and video screenshots) for body condition assessment  
136 had to fulfill the following requirements: (i) clear, identifiable individual; (ii) standing or moderate  
137 walking body position of each elephant to allow reliable assessment; (iii) sufficient recognition of  
138 prominent bone structures (skull, pectoral girdles in shoulders, vertebral column, ribs, pelvic girdles,  
139 and backbone); and (iv) adequate resolution for recognition of the generic wrinkles on the skin  
140 surface. Finally, (v) distinct patterns of shade or masses of hay, straw, and other substrates on the  
141 back of the elephant could make any assessment impossible. Likewise, bright lateral rays of sunlight  
142 could also reduce the image contrast and disturb the evaluation. Such documents were excluded  
143 from the study. All the elephant images were scored by the first author. Each individual was scored  
144 twice based on images both on the left and right sides, and an average score of the same individual  
145 on both sides was rounded up as the BCS of this individual. Here we considered that individuals  
146 with  $BCS \geq 7$  were in obesity.

#### 147 *Potential relative factors of BCS*

148 Including sex and age, we investigated seven potential relative factors of BCS (**Table 2**) in total,  
149 five of which were associated with diet and exercise.

#### 150 *Potential relative factors of BCS associated with diet*

151 There were two potential relative factors of BCS associated with diet: daily feed supply (kg) and  
152 the proportion of high-calorie feed (%).

153 Our investigation showed that for all 43 facilities, the feed of elephants was mainly divided into  
154 three categories: (i) herb forage, including various grasses and hays (e.g., Chinese rye grass, Sudan  
155 grass, medick, straw, etc.); (ii) juicy fodder (seasonal fruits and vegetables); and (iii) pellet feed, the

156 main ingredients of which were corn kernels, wheat bran, soybean meal. Here we defined “high-  
157 calorie feed” as the sum of juicy fodder and pellet feed. For elephants in zoos, we collected the  
158 weight of three categories of feed above daily supplied for each elephant by interviewing staff  
159 members and consulting feeding documentation, then calculated the daily feed supply and the  
160 proportion of high-calorie feed of each elephant (**Table 2A**). For elephants in the Wild Elephant  
161 Valley, since it was challenging to ensure the exact daily feed supply for each elephant, we  
162 hypothesized that its daily total feed supply was distributed equally to each elephant (**Table 2B**).  
163 Here we hypothesized that both a larger daily feed supply and a higher proportion of high-calorie  
164 feed could associate with higher BCS in an elephant.

165 *Potential relative factors of BCS associated with exercise*

166 There were three potential relative factors of BCS associated with exercise: outdoor enclosure area  
167 (m<sup>2</sup> per elephant), outdoor time (months per year), and foot disorder.

168 To avoid unnecessary stress on the elephants, we refrained from direct contact with them during our  
169 investigation. Therefore, it was challenging to calculate precise data on the exercise amount of  
170 elephants by recording walking distances through activity-tracking bracelets (Chusyd *et al* 2021) or  
171 measuring elephants' oxygen consumption through wearable air-collecting apparatus (Langman *et*  
172 *al* 1995). However, we hypothesized that compared to narrow indoor enclosures, larger outdoor  
173 enclosures with longer outdoor time could provide elephants with more space to move and display  
174 their natural behaviors, thereby increasing their amount of exercise and energy consumption.  
175 Additionally, foot disorders could affect elephants' mobility, which would lead to a decrease in their  
176 amount of exercise and energy consumption.

177 For each facility, we investigated its outdoor enclosure for elephants (**Table 2**). The outdoor



178 enclosure area was measured by selecting the corresponding region on the map in Google Earth Pro  
179 7.3.2.5766. It was noted that local villages and surface waters were excluded from the calculation  
180 when determining the outdoor enclosure areas for elephants in the Wild Elephant Valley. The  
181 outdoor time for elephants in zoos was recorded by interviewing staff members and consulting  
182 monthly exhibiting documentation. Meanwhile, for each elephant, we took close-up shots of its four  
183 feet and recorded whether it had one or more of the following visible foot disorders: (i) overgrown  
184 nails; (ii) nail cracks; (iii) overgrown cuticles, and (iv) joint deformation (**Figure 2, Table 2**). If any  
185 of these four visible disorders were not observed in each foot of an elephant, then we considered  
186 that this elephant's feet were in healthy appearance (**Figure 2A**).

187 Here we hypothesized that both a larger outdoor enclosure area and a longer outdoor time could  
188 associate with lower BCS in an elephant while having foot disorders might associate with higher  
189 BCS.

#### 190 *Statistical analysis*

191 All statistical analyses were conducted using R version 4.2.2. In all calculations, sex was one of the  
192 categorical variables, with males and females encoded as 1 and 0 respectively. Individuals with  
193 unknown ages were excluded from the dataset.

194 To explore the relationship between BCS and its potential relative factors, we employed the package  
195 'prcomp' to perform a principal component analysis (PCA) including seven independent variables  
196 (sex, age, daily feed supply, proportion of high-calorie feed, outdoor enclosure area, outdoor time,  
197 and foot disorder) and BCS. Calculated component scores and loadings were visualized using a  
198 biplot.

199 For further analysis, we employed the package 'lmer' to construct a stepwise multivariable linear

200 mixed model (LMM) with the eight variables (sex, age, facility category, daily feed supply,  
201 proportion of high-calorie feed, outdoor enclosure area, outdoor time, and foot disorder) as fixed  
202 effects and different facilities as random effects. The optimal model selection was determined using  
203 the Akaike information (AIC) criterion. Next, we examined the interaction effects between variables  
204 in the optimal model and derived the optimal interaction model. Finally, in conjunction with  
205 significance tests, we assessed the significance of the relationships between BCS and its potential  
206 relative factors.

207

## 208 **Results**

### 209 *Overview of captive Asian elephants' body condition in China*

210 We evaluated the BCS of 204 captive Asian elephants from 43 facilities in China (**Table 3**), and it  
211 suggested that 72.55% of elephants were in obesity to various degrees ( $BCS \geq 7$ ). Compared to  
212 elephants in the Wild Elephant Valley, elephants in zoos had significantly higher BCS (Independent-  
213 Samples T-Test,  $p < 0.001$ ) on average.

### 214 *Relationship between BCS and its potential relative factors*

215 The PCA analysis reduced the dataset from eight variables (seven independent variables and BCS)  
216 to two principal components. The first principal component (PC1) and the second principal  
217 component (PC2) accounted for 38.73% and 16.76% of the variance respectively. Therefore, the  
218 biplot of PC1 and PC2 represented more than half of the dataset's variance (**Figure 3**). It suggested  
219 a positive correlation between BCS and the proportion of high-calorie feed. In contrast, there were  
220 strong negative correlations between the outdoor enclosure area and BCS, as well as between the  
221 outdoor time and BCS.

222 For all individuals of known age ( $n = 173$ ), the optimal linear model selected by stepwise regression  
223 included three BCS predictor variables: sex ( $p < 0.01$ ), outdoor enclosure area ( $p < 0.001$ ), and  
224 outdoor time ( $p < 0.001$ ) (**Table S1**). ANOVA revealed that the BCS regression models with the  
225 interaction of sex and outdoor enclosure area, as well as outdoor time as independent variables, or  
226 the interaction of sex and outdoor time and outdoor enclosure area as independent variables, were  
227 statistically equivalent (**Table S2**). Considering that facilities generally do not keep any sex of  
228 elephants indoors during suitable weather conditions, we constructed a mixed regression model with  
229 BCS as the dependent variable, including four BCS predictor variables: (i) sex; (ii) outdoor  
230 enclosure area; (iii) outdoor time; and (iv) the interaction between sex and outdoor enclosure area  
231 ('sex'  $\times$  'outdoor enclosure area') as the fixed effects, whereas different facilities as the random  
232 effects. The results suggested that both outdoor enclosure area and outdoor time, along with the  
233 interaction between sex and outdoor enclosure area, were significantly negatively correlated with  
234 BCS ( $p < 0.05$ ) (**Table 4**), indicating that both larger outdoor enclosure area and longer outdoor time  
235 are associated with lower BCS.

236 Taking into account the considerable disparity in outdoor enclosure areas between elephants in the  
237 Wild Elephant Valley and those of elephants in the zoo, we employed the same approach to select  
238 BCS predictors for individuals of known age in zoos ( $n = 144$ ) (**Table S3**). The results indicated  
239 that only outdoor time exhibited a significant negative correlation with BCS ( $p < 0.01$ ) (**Table 5**).

240

## 241 **Discussion**

242 In this study, we examined the relationship between potential related factors and the obesity status  
243 of captive Asian elephants in China by body condition assessment and linear regression. Study

244 results indicated that longer outdoor time was related to lower BCS of an elephant. Here we  
245 conducted the following discussion for various factors associated with diet and exercise, as well as  
246 situations of elephants in different facilities.

247 ***Enclosures, exhibition, and obesity of captive elephants in zoos***

248 Linear regression showed that for all individuals of known age, both outdoor enclosure area and  
249 outdoor time were significantly negatively correlated with BCS. However, for elephants in zoos, no  
250 significant correlation between outdoor enclosure area and BCS was observed. One of the possible  
251 reasons for this is that outdoor enclosures provided by zoos for elephants are generally too small in  
252 China.

253 For welfare considerations, facilities should provide outdoor enclosures as large as possible and  
254 enrichment for elephants, which may encourage elephants to display natural behaviors and increase  
255 their amount of exercise to alleviate or avoid obesity (Hacker *et al* 2018). A study on captive Asian  
256 elephants in European zoos showed that females in smaller enclosures are more prone to obesity  
257 (Schiffmann *et al* 2018). Although CAZG has not imposed strict requirements on outdoor enclosure  
258 areas for captive elephants, it has recommended that the outdoor enclosure area should not be less  
259 than 170 m<sup>2</sup> for each elephant on average (Zhang *et al* 2018). Despite these guidelines, our  
260 investigation revealed that nearly half (48.82%) of elephants in zoos still did not reach CAZG's  
261 recommended standard. Since it is difficult for most zoos to expand outdoor enclosures in the short  
262 term, we suggest that it is crucial and practical for Chinese zoos to improve the utilization rate of  
263 limited outdoor enclosures for elephants through diverse enrichment, for instance, pools, sand pits,  
264 wallows, stumps for tickling, shade canopies, and foraging devices, etc. Moreover, it is also notable  
265 to maintain a suitable population size of elephants for a zoo. Since elephants have intricate social

266 structures and emotions, housing only one elephant in captivity could have detrimental effects on  
267 its mental health over time. Conversely, an overcrowded population (e.g., housing over ten elephants  
268 in the same enclosure) could lead to cramped living space for each elephant.

269 Multiple studies indicated that inactivity and long-term indoor living significantly increase the risk  
270 of degenerative lesions in the musculoskeletal system of captive elephants, aggravating obesity and  
271 even leading to disability or euthanasia (Greco *et al* 2016; Miller *et al* 2016; Bansiddhi *et al* 2020).

272 For the relationship between outdoor time and the obesity status of captive elephants, a study on  
273 captive Asian elephants in North American zoos has shown that staff-directed walking exercise of  
274 14 hours or more per week can effectively reduce the risk of obesity (Morfeld *et al* 2016). However,  
275 another study based on a 10-month observation of captive Asian elephants in a British zoo revealed  
276 that among the 6.5-hour outdoor exhibition every day, adult elephants spent most of their outdoor  
277 time feeding, standing still, or resting, and spent only 6.1-19.2% of outdoor time walking (Rees  
278 2009). Here we suggest that staff members could take measures to extend the outdoor time of captive  
279 elephants, for instance, providing elephants with options to freely enter and exit indoors during  
280 closing hours of zoos. Additionally, facilities may install outdoor heat sources to extend the outdoor  
281 time of elephants in lower environmental temperatures.

### 282 *Diet and obesity of captive elephants*

283 Although statistical analysis showed that both daily feed supply and the proportion of high-calorie  
284 feed were insignificantly related to BCS, since we could not measure the exact feed intakes of  
285 elephants in this study, further research is required to determine the effects of diet on obesity of  
286 captive elephants in China. It is recommended that the cellulose content in captive elephant feed  
287 should be no less than 30%, and herb forage should be no less than 70% of the total mass of daily

288 feed to avoid indigestion (Ullrey *et al* 1997; Romain *et al* 2014). The supply of high-calorie feed  
289 (fruits, vegetables, pellets, etc.) should be controlled with proper supplementation of required trace  
290 elements based on specific situations to avoid obesity caused by overeating and intestinal gas caused  
291 by excessive protein intake (Hatt & Clauss 2006). However, our investigation revealed that the  
292 proportion of high-calorie feed was over 30% in the diet of over a quarter (27.45%) of elephants.  
293 Furthermore, some zoos used to add starchy foods such as pumpkins and sweet potatoes to their  
294 elephant feed in winter. Considering that elephants stay indoors all day during this period, it might  
295 be related to the higher BCS because of reduced exercise and increased nutrient intake. Here we  
296 suggest that staff members could control the supply of high-calorie feed, use feeding devices as  
297 enrichment, and try temporally unpredictable feeding schedules, which might contribute to the body  
298 weight management of captive elephants (Holdgate *et al* 2016; Scott & LaDue 2019).

### 299 ***Foot health of captive Asian elephants in China***

300 Although statistical analysis showed that foot disorder was insignificantly related to BCS, our  
301 investigation indicated that 58.24% of zoo elephants had foot disorders of varying degrees. A study  
302 in European zoos revealed that time spent indoors and on hard surfaces was positively correlated  
303 with the risk of foot disorders, while natural, soft ground (e.g., sand flooring) could alleviate this  
304 situation (Wendler *et al* 2019). However, all 42 investigated zoos used hard cement floors in their  
305 indoor spaces. To guarantee the health of feet, European and North American zoos provide their  
306 elephants with regular foot health checks based on protected contact and positive reinforcement  
307 training (Laule & Whittaker 2009). Unfortunately, less than 25% of the 42 zoos have corresponding  
308 devices (such as erected training walls) and relevant technical personnel for regular foot health  
309 checks. Moreover, many hidden foot lesions need to be diagnosed by CT scanning or the elephant's

310 posture during locomotion instead of simply observing the appearance at the initial stage  
311 (Panagiotopoulou *et al* 2016; Regnault *et al* 2017). It implied that the foot health problems of captive  
312 elephants in China might be much more serious than observed. To improve this situation, we suggest  
313 facilities enhance staff members' awareness of the importance of foot health for captive elephants.  
314 Moreover, it is also necessary to promote positive reinforcement training in captive elephants for  
315 regular foot health checks.

### 316 *Elephants in the Wild Elephant Valley*

317 According to our investigation and statistical analysis, there were significantly lower BCS on  
318 average and no visible foot disorders for elephants in the Wild Elephant Valley, which might be  
319 attributed to local environmental and husbandry conditions similar to wild Asian elephant habitats.  
320 Nevertheless, we suggested that long-term engagement in performance might harm the mental  
321 health of elephants, leading to stereotypical behavior. Furthermore, since captive elephants in the  
322 Wild Elephant Valley were not completely isolated from local wild elephant populations, some  
323 pathogens (e.g., EEHVs) carried by captive elephants might spread during their roaming in natural  
324 forests and cause the infection of wild individuals (Yang *et al* 2022).

### 325 *Animal welfare implications*

326 This study was the first relevant research on the obesity status and foot health of captive Asian  
327 Elephants in China. Honestly, there were still a series of limitations in our study. For instance, our  
328 investigation did not include all captive Asian elephants in China. Restricted by the veterinary  
329 conditions of elephant-raising facilities, we could not obtain tissue samples for further biochemical  
330 metabolic examination of obesity. Although body condition assessment may not be able to examine  
331 the obesity status of elephants more accurately than direct weighing and measuring serum leptin

332 (Chusyd *et al* 2021), we hoped that our study could arouse the attention of relevant facilities on the  
333 welfare problems, including obesity, of captive Asian elephants in China. We also hoped that our  
334 work could inspire the future husbandry management of captive elephants in China and provide a  
335 reference for follow-up studies on welfare issues in captive megaherbivores.

336

### 337 ***Conclusion***

338 Our study indicated that insufficient outdoor time might be the primary potential cause of the  
339 prevalent high BCS of captive Asian elephants in China. Here we suggested elephant-raising  
340 facilities to take measures to extend the outdoor time of elephants. Moreover, a suitable diet with  
341 feeding enrichment and regular foot health checks might also contribute to the body weight  
342 management of captive elephants.

343

### 344 **Declaration of interest**

345 All authors declare that no conflict of interest exists.

346

### 347 **Acknowledgements**

348 Thanks for the funding support and permission to work with each elephant-raising facility from  
349 CAZG. We were also very grateful for the cooperation of all 43 elephant-raising facilities. As the  
350 first nationwide welfare-related study of captive elephants in China, we sincerely hoped to keep this  
351 cooperative relationship and work together to improve the welfare of captive elephants in the future.

352

### 353 **Supplemental materials**



354 Table S1-S3 were presented in ‘Supplemental tables.docx’. The dataset for statistical analysis and  
355 the operation process of R was presented in ‘data\_AW\_submission.csv’ and ‘Analysis outputs of  
356 R.pdf’ respectively.

357

## 358 **References**

- 359 **Arivazhagan C and Sukumar R** 2008 Constructing age structures of Asian elephant populations:  
360 A comparison of two field methods of age estimation. *Gajah* 29: 11-16.
- 361 **Bansiddhi P, Brown JL and Thitaram C** 2020 Welfare Assessment and Activities of Captive  
362 Elephants in Thailand. *Animals* 10(6): 919 <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10060919>
- 363 **Brown JL** 2019 Update on Comparative Biology of Elephants: Factors Affecting Reproduction,  
364 Health and Welfare. In: Comizzoli P, Brown J and Holt W (eds) *Reproductive Sciences*  
365 *in Animal Conservation, Second Edition* pp 243-273. Springer.  
366 [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-23633-5\\_9](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-23633-5_9)
- 367 **Carroll CL and Huntington PJ** 1988 Body condition scoring and weight estimation of horses.  
368 *Equine Vet J* 20: 41-45. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2042-3306.1988.tb01451.x>
- 369 **Chusyd DE, Brown JL, Golzarri-Arroyo L, Dickinson SL, Johnson MS, Allison DB and**  
370 **Nagy TR** 2019 Fat mass compared to four body condition scoring systems in the Asian  
371 elephant (*Elephas maximus*). *Zoo Biology* 38: 424-433. <https://doi.org/10.1002/zoo.21508>
- 372 **Chusyd DE, Nagy TR, Golzarri-Arroyo L, Dickinson SL, Speakman JR, Hambly C, Johnson**  
373 **MS, Allison DB and Brown JL** 2021 Adiposity, reproductive and metabolic health, and  
374 activity levels in zoo Asian elephant (*Elephas maximus*). *J Exp Biol* 224(2): jeb219543.  
375 <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.219543>
- 376 **Clubb R and Mason G** 2002 *A review of the welfare of zoo elephants in Europe*. RSPCA: West  
377 Sussex, UK.
- 378 **Clubb R, Rowcliffe M, Lee P, Mar KU, Moss C and Mason GJ** 2008 Compromised  
379 survivorship in zoo elephants. *Science* 322: 1649.  
380 <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1164298>
- 381 **Dastig B** Birth and reproduction rate in a herd of captive Asian elephants at the Pinnawela  
382 Elephant Orphanage (Sri Lanka). In: *A research update on elephants and rhinos*.  
383 *Proceedings of the International Elephant and Rhino Symposium* pp 7-11. Vienna.
- 384 **Edmonson A, Lean I, Weaver L, Farver T and Webster G** 1989 A body condition scoring chart  
385 for Holstein dairy cows. *Journal of dairy science* 72: 68-78.  
386 [https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302\(89\)79081-0](https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(89)79081-0)
- 387 **Fernando P, Janaka H, Ekanayaka SK, Nishantha H and Pastorini J** 2009 A simple method  
388 for assessing elephant body condition. *Gajah* 31: 29-31.
- 389 **Fowler ME** 2008 Multisystem Disorders In: Fowler ME and Mitoka SK *Biology, medicine, and*  
390 *surgery of elephants* pp 243-252 John Wiley & Sons.
- 391 **Greco BJ, Meehan CL, Miller LJ, Shepherdson DJ, Morfeld KA, Andrews J, Baker AM,**  
392 **Carlstead K and Mench JA** 2016 Elephant Management in North American Zoos:

- 393 Environmental Enrichment, Feeding, Exercise, and Training. *pLoS One* 11: e0152490.  
394 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0152490>
- 395 **Hacker CE, Miller LJ and Schulte BA** 2018 Examination of enrichment using space and food  
396 for African elephants (*Loxodonta africana*) at the San Diego Zoo Safari Park. *Animal*  
397 *Welfare* 27: 55-65. <https://doi.org/10.7120/09627286.27.1.055>
- 398 **Hatt JM and Clauss M** 2006 Feeding Asian and African elephants *Elephas maximus* and  
399 *Loxodonta africana* in captivity. *International Zoo Yearbook* 40: 88-95.  
400 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1748-1090.2006.00088.x>
- 401 **Holdgate MR, Meehan CL, Hogan JN, Miller LJ, Soltis J, Andrews J and Shepherdson DJ**  
402 2016 Walking Behavior of Zoo Elephants: Associations between GPS-Measured Daily  
403 Walking Distances and Environmental Factors, Social Factors, and Welfare Indicators.  
404 *pLoS One* 11: e0150331. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0150331>
- 405 **Klimentidis YC, Beasley TM, Lin HY, Murati G, Glass GE, Guyton M, Newton W,**  
406 **Jorgensen M, Heymsfield SB, Kemnitz J, Fairbanks L and Allison DB** 2011 Canaries  
407 in the coal mine: a cross-species analysis of the plurality of obesity epidemics. *Proc Biol*  
408 *Sci* 278: 1626-1632. <https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2010.1890>
- 409 **Kumar V, Palugulla Reddy V, Kokkiligadda A, Shivaji S and Umopathy G** 2014 Non-invasive  
410 assessment of reproductive status and stress in captive Asian elephants in three south  
411 Indian zoos. *Gen Comp Endocrinol* 201: 37-44.  
412 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygcen.2014.03.024>
- 413 **Langman VA, Roberts TJ, Black J, Maloiy GMO, Heglund N C, Weber JM, Kram R and**  
414 **Taylor CR** 1995 Moving cheaply: energetics of walking in the African elephant. *Journal*  
415 *of Experimental Biology* 198(3): 629-632. <https://doi.org/10.1242/jeb.198.3.629>
- 416 **Laule G and Whittaker M** 2009 Protected contact and elephant welfare. *An elephant in the*  
417 *room: the science and well-being of elephants in captivity: Tufts Centre for Animals and*  
418 *Public Policy*.
- 419 **Menon V and Tiwari SK** 2019 Population status of Asian elephants *Elephas maximus* and key  
420 threats. *International Zoo Yearbook* 53: 17-30. <https://doi.org/10.1111/izy.12247>
- 421 **Miller MA, Hogan JN and Meehan CL** 2016 Housing and Demographic Risk Factors Impacting  
422 Foot and Musculoskeletal Health in African Elephants [*Loxodonta africana*] and Asian  
423 Elephants [*Elephas maximus*] in North American Zoos. *pLoS One* 11(7): e0155223.  
424 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0155223>
- 425 **Norkaew T, Brown JL, Bansiddhi P, Songird C, Thitaram C, Punyapornwithaya V,**  
426 **Punturee K, Vongchan P, Somboon N and Khonmee J** 2018 Body condition and  
427 adrenal glucocorticoid activity affects metabolic marker and lipid profiles in captive  
428 female elephants in Thailand. *pLoS One* 13(10):  
429 e0204965. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0204965>
- 430 **Norkaew T, Brown JL, Bansiddhi P, Songird C, Thitaram C, Punyapornwithaya V,**  
431 **Punturee K, Vongchan P, Somboon N and Khonmee J** 2019 Influence of season,  
432 tourist activities and camp management on body condition, testicular and adrenal steroids,  
433 lipid profiles, and metabolic status in captive Asian elephant bulls in Thailand. *pLoS One*  
434 14(3): e0210537. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0210537>
- 435 **Panagiotopoulou O, Pataky TC, Day M, Hensman MC, Hensman S, Hutchinson JR and**  
436 **Clemente CJ** 2016 Foot pressure distributions during walking in African elephants

- 437 (*Loxodonta africana*). *Royal Society Open Science* 3: 160203.  
438 <https://doi.org/10.1098/rsos.160203>
- 439 **Pushpakumara PGA, Rajapakse RC, Perera BMAO and Brown JL** 2016 Reproductive  
440 performance of the largest captive Asian elephant (*Elephas maximus*) population in Sri  
441 Lanka. *Animal Reproduction Science* 174: 93-99.  
442 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anireprosci.2016.09.010>
- 443 **Rees PA** 2009 Activity Budgets and the Relationship Between Feeding and Stereotypic Behaviors  
444 in Asian Elephants (*Elephas maximus*) in a Zoo. *Zoo Biology* 28: 79-97.  
445 <https://doi.org/10.1002/zoo.20200>
- 446 **Regnault S, Dixon JJI, Warren-Smith C, Hutchinson JR and Weller R** 2017 Skeletal  
447 pathology and variable anatomy in elephant feet assessed using computed tomography.  
448 *Peerj* 5: e2877. <https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.2877>
- 449 **Robinson MR, Mar KU and Lummaa V** 2012 Senescence and age-specific trade-offs between  
450 reproduction and survival in female Asian elephants. *Ecology Letters* 15: 260-266.  
451 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2011.01735.x>
- 452 **Romain S, Angkawanish T, Bampenpol P, Pongsopawijit P, Sombatphuthorn P, Nomsiri R**  
453 **and Silva-Fletcher A** 2014 Diet Composition, Food Intake, Apparent Digestibility, and  
454 Body Condition Score of the Captive Asian Elephant (*Elephas Maximus*): A Pilot Study  
455 in Two Collections in Thailand. *Journal of Zoo and Wildlife Medicine* 45(1): 1-14.  
456 <https://doi.org/10.1638/2011-0261R3.1>
- 457 **Schaftenaar W and Hildebrandt TB** 2006 *Veterinary guidelines for reproduction-related*  
458 *management in captive female elephants*. Elephant TAG Veterinary Advisors
- 459 **Schiffmann C, Clauss M, Hoby S and Hatt JM** 2017 Visual body condition scoring in zoo  
460 animals— composite, algorithm and overview approaches in captive Asian and African  
461 elephants. *Journal of Zoo and Aquarium Research* 5(1): 1-10.  
462 <https://doi.org/10.19227/jzar.v5i1.252>
- 463 **Schiffmann C, Clauss M, Pastorini J, Wendler P, Ertl N, Hoby S, Hatt J-M and Fernando P**  
464 2018 Body condition scores in European zoo elephants (*Elephas maximus* and *Loxodonta*  
465 *africana*)—Status quo and influencing factors. *Journal of Zoo and Aquarium Research*  
466 6(3): 91-103. <https://doi.org/10.19227/jzar.v6i3.355>
- 467 **Schmidt MJ** 1982 Studies on Asian elephant reproduction at the Washington Park Zoo. *Zoo*  
468 *Biology* 1: 141-147. <https://doi.org/10.1002/zoo.1430010208>
- 469 **Schwitzer C and Kaumanns W** 2001 Body weights of ruffed lemurs (*Varecia variegata*) in  
470 European zoos with reference to the problem of obesity. *Zoo Biology* 20: 261-269.  
471 <https://doi.org/10.1002/zoo.1026>
- 472 **Scott NL and LaDue CA** 2019 The behavioral effects of exhibit size versus complexity in  
473 African elephants: A potential solution for smaller spaces. *Zoo Biology* 38: 448-457.  
474 <https://doi.org/10.1002/zoo.21506>
- 475 **Shaw K, Gennat H, Rourke P and Del Mar C** 2006 Exercise for overweight or obesity.  
476 *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*: CD003817.  
477 <https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.cd003817.pub3>
- 478 **Sun YK, Chen Y, Diaz-Sacco JJ and Shi K** 2021 Assessing population structure and body  
479 condition to inform conservation strategies for a small isolated Asian elephant (*Elephas*  
480 *maximus*) population in southwest China. *pLoS One* 16(3): e0248210.

- 481 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0248210>
- 482 **Swinburn BA, Caterson I, Seidell JC and James WPT** 2004 Diet, nutrition and the prevention  
483 of excess weight gain and obesity. *Public Health Nutrition* 7: 123-146.
- 484 <https://doi.org/10.1079/PHN2003585>
- 485 **Taylor VJ and Poole TB** 1998 Captive breeding and infant mortality in Asian elephants: A  
486 comparison between twenty western zoos and three eastern elephant centers. *Zoo Biology*  
487 17: 311-332. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1098-2361\(1998\)17:4%3C311::AID-](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1098-2361(1998)17:4%3C311::AID-ZOO5%3E3.0.CO;2-C)  
488 [ZOO5%3E3.0.CO;2-C](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1098-2361(1998)17:4%3C311::AID-ZOO5%3E3.0.CO;2-C)
- 489 **Thitaram C** 2012 Breeding management of captive Asian elephant (*Elephas maximus*) in range  
490 countries and zoos. *Japanese Journal of Zoo and Wildlife Medicine* 17: 91-96.  
491 <https://doi.org/10.5686/jjzwm.17.91>
- 492 **Ullrey DE, Crissey SD and Hintz HF** 1997 *Elephants: nutrition and dietary husbandry*.  
493 Nutrition Advisory Group East Lansing, MI.
- 494 **Wendler P, Ertl N, Flugger M, Sos E, Schiffmann C, Clauss M and Hatt JM** 2019 Foot Health  
495 of Asian Elephants (*Elephas Maximus*) in European Zoos. *Journal of Zoo and Wildlife*  
496 *Medicine*, 50(3): 513-527. <https://doi.org/10.1638/2018-0228>
- 497 **Wiese RJ** 2000 Asian elephants are not self-sustaining in North America. *Zoo Biology* 19: 299-  
498 309. [https://doi.org/10.1002/1098-2361\(2000\)19:5%3C299::AID-ZOO2%3E3.0.CO;2-Z](https://doi.org/10.1002/1098-2361(2000)19:5%3C299::AID-ZOO2%3E3.0.CO;2-Z)
- 499 **Yang N, Bao M, Zhu B, Shen Q, Guo X, Li W, Tang R, Zhu D, Tang Y, Phanlen DN and**  
500 **Zhang L** 2022 Elephant Endotheliotropic Herpesvirus 1, 4 and 5 in China: Occurrence in  
501 Multiple Sample Types and Implications for Wild and Captive Population  
502 Surveillance. *Viruses* 14(2): 411. <https://doi.org/10.3390/v14020411>
- 503 **Yang X (Ed.)** 2002 Animals in experimental farm during late Qing dynasty. In: *Beijing Zoo*  
504 *Chronicle* p 77 China Forestry Press. (in Chinese)
- 505 **Zhang E, Li X and Gu Y** 2018 Behavior management of elephants. In: Chinese Association of  
506 Zoological Gardens (CAZG) *Behavior Management of Wild Animals in Captivity* pp 380-  
507 395 China Architecture & Building Press. (in Chinese)
- 508 **Zhang L** 2018 Current status and relevant problems of captive Asian elephants in China. In:  
509 *Conservation Research of Asian elephants in China* p 61-66 China Science Publishing &  
510 Media. (in Chinese)

511

## 512 Captions

513 **Table 1** Criteria of visual body condition scoring (BCS) used in this study to evaluate Asian  
514 elephants (*Elephas maximus*) for obesity (from Fernando et al 2009)

515 **Table 2** Overview of seven potential relative factors of BCS for elephants in different facilities. (A)  
516 Zoos; (B) Wild Elephant Valley

517 **Table 3** Overview of captive Asian elephants' body condition score (BCS) in China

518 **Table 4** Significance test of BCS predictor variables for all individuals of known age (n = 173)

519 **Table 5** Significance test of BCS predictor variables of BCS for individuals of known age in zoos

520 (n = 144)

521 **Figure 1** Age structure of 224 captive Asian elephants recorded from zoos and Wild Elephant Valley

522 in China from January 2017 to April 2019. Classification of age groups was referred to the criteria

523 in Arivazhagan & Sukumar (2008).

524 **Figure 2** Samples of visible foot disorders of captive Asian elephants (*Elephas maximus*) recorded

525 during on-site investigation. (A) feet in healthy appearance; (B) overgrown nails; (C) nail cracks;

526 (D)overgrown cuticles; (E) joint deformation.

527 **Figure 3** Biplot of principal component analysis (PCA) of BCS and its potential relative factors for

528 all individuals of known age (n = 173). Points in the plot represented individual elephants, and

529 eigenvectors show relations between the variables. Eigenvectors pointing in similar directions are

530 positively correlated in the first two principal components, whereas eigenvectors pointing in

531 opposite directions are negatively correlated. The length of each eigenvector represents its

532 contribution to the corresponding variable.

**Table 1 Criteria of visual body condition scoring (BCS) used in this study to evaluate Asian elephants (*Elephas maximus*) for obesity (from Fernando *et al* 2009)**

Score	Characters
1	All ribs (shoulder to pelvis) visible, some ribs prominent (spaces in between sunken in)
3	Some ribs visible (spaces in between not sunken in), shoulder and pelvic girdles prominent
5	Ribs not visible, shoulder and pelvic girdles visible
7	Backbone visible as a ridge, shoulder and pelvic girdles not visible
9	Back rounded, thick rolls of fat under neck

\* When body condition of an elephant is intermediate between two criteria, an intermediate point score (i.e. 2, 4, 6, 8 points) should be assigned. To accommodate the possibility of greater variation, the range of scores extend from 0 to 10.

**Table 2 Overview of seven potential relative factors of BCS for elephants in different facilities**

**A. Zoos**

<b>Sex</b>	<b>Age (year, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Daily Feed Supply (kg, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Proportion of High-Calorie Feed (%, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Outdoor Enclosure Area (m<sup>2</sup> per elephant, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Outdoor Time (months per year, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Proportion of Foot Disorder</b>
Both	29.27±0.092 (n=144)	136.56±0.302 (n=170)	24.05±0.065 (n=170)	307.38±2.038 (n=170)	8.19±0.011 (n=170)	58.24% (99/170)
Male	30.31±0.218 (n=62)	144.15±0.784 (n=73)	23.79±0.152 (n=73)	388.98±5.919 (n=73)	8.18±0.025 (n=73)	50.68% (37/73)
Female	28.49±0.161 (n=82)	130.84±0.472 (n=97)	24.24±0.113 (n=97)	245.96±2.576 (n=97)	8.20±0.021 (n=97)	63.92% (62/97)

**B. Wild Elephant Valley**

<b>Sex</b>	<b>Age (year, Mean ± SE)</b>	<b>Daily Feed Supply (kg, on average)</b>	<b>Proportion of High-Calorie Feed (%, on average)</b>	<b>Outdoor Enclosure Area (m<sup>2</sup> per elephant, on average)</b>	<b>Outdoor Time (months per year)</b>	<b>Proportion of Foot Disorder</b>
Both	25.86±0.417 (n=29)					
Male	29.67±0.938 (n=12)	120.56 (n=34)	2.44 (n=34)	6349.02 (n=34)	12 (n=34)	0.00% (0/34)
Female	23.18±0.720 (n=17)					

**Table 3 Overview of captive Asian elephants' body condition score (BCS) in China**

<b>Facility</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>BCS Mean <math>\pm</math> SE</b>	<b>BCS Median</b>	<b>Proportion of BCS <math>\geq</math> 7</b>
All	Both (n=204)	7.07 $\pm$ 0.007	7	72.55%
	Male (n=88)	6.84 $\pm$ 0.017	7	69.32%
	Female (n=116)	7.24 $\pm$ 0.010	7	75.00%
Zoo	Both (n=170)	7.43 $\pm$ 0.006	7	82.35%
	Male (n=73)	7.33 $\pm$ 0.013	7	80.82%
	Female (n=97)	7.51 $\pm$ 0.010	7	83.51%
Wild Elephant Valley	Both (n=34)	5.26 $\pm$ 0.044	5.5	23.53%
	Male (n=15)	4.47 $\pm$ 0.100	4	13.33%
	Female (n=19)	5.89 $\pm$ 0.061	6	31.58%



**Table 4 Significance test of BCS predictor variables for all individuals of known age (n = 173)**

<b>Fixed Effects</b>	<b>Estimate</b>	<b>SE</b>	<b>df</b>	<b>t-value</b>	<b>p-value (&gt; t )</b>
(Intercept)	9.373e+00	3.697e-01	1.139e+02	25.350	< 2e-16 ***
Sex	-1.034e-01	1.822e-01	4.780e+01	-0.567	0.57311
Outdoor Enclosure Area	-1.378e-04	4.868e-05	1.572e+02	-2.831	0.00524 **
Outdoor Time	-2.133e-01	4.296e-02	9.380e+01	-4.964	3.08e-06 ***
'Sex'×'Outdoor Enclosure Area'	-2.540e-04	8.103e-05	4.838e+00	-3.134	0.02702 *

-Significance Code: '\*\*\*\*' ~ p < 0.001; '\*\*' ~ p < 0.01; '\*' ~ p < 0.05

**Table 5 Significance test of BCS predictor variables of BCS for individuals of known age in zoos (n = 144)**

<b>Fixed Effects</b>	<b>Estimate</b>	<b>SE</b>	<b>df</b>	<b>t-value</b>	<b>p-value (&gt; t )</b>
(Intercept)	9.01193	0.45191	24.58927	19.942	< 2e-16 ***
Outdoor Time	-0.18904	0.05397	22.61886	-3.503	0.00195 **

-Significance Code: '\*\*\*\*' ~ p < 0.001; '\*\*' ~ p < 0.01





