Clostridioides difficile colonization is not mediated by bile salts and requires

Stickland fermentation of proline in an *in vitro* model of infection

Xiaoyun Huang[1], April E. Johnson[1], Thomas A. Auchtung[1], Hugh C. McCullough[1], Armando I.

Lerma[1], Sigmund J. Haidacher[2,3], Kathleen M. Hoch[2,3], Thomas D. Horvath[2,3], Anthony M.

Haag[2,3], and Jennifer M. Auchtung[1]*

*Address correspondence to Jennifer M. Auchtung, jauchtung2@unl.edu

[1]Department of Food Science and Technology and Nebraska Food for Health Center, University

of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, NE 68588 USA

[2]Department of Pathology and Immunology, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX USA

[3]Texas Children's Microbiome Center, Department of Pathology, Texas Children's Hospital,

Houston, TX USA

Present address: Xiaoyun Huang, Fermenich Incorporated, Princeton, NJ USA; Thomas

Auchtung, Synbiotic Health, Lincoln, NE USA; Hugh McCullough, Department of Biological

Systems Engineering, Lincoln, NE USA

Xioayun Huang and April Johnson contributed equally to this work. Author order determined by

majority of ten coin flips.

Keywords: Stickland fermentation, bile metabolism, microbiota, antibiotic disruption

ABSTRACT

Treatment with antibiotics is a major risk factor for *Clostridioides difficile* infection, likely due to

depletion of the gastrointestinal microbiota. Two microbiota-mediated mechanisms thought to

limit *C. difficile* colonization include conversion of conjugated primary bile salts into secondary

bile salts toxic to *C. difficile* growth, and competition between the microbiota and *C. difficile* for

limiting nutrients. Using a continuous flow model of the distal colon, we investigated how

treatment with six clinically-used antibiotics influenced susceptibility to *C. difficile* infection in 12

different microbial communities cultivated from healthy individuals. Antibiotic treatment

reduced microbial richness; disruption varied by antibiotic class and microbiota composition, but

did not correlate with *C. difficile* susceptibility. Antibiotic treatment also disrupted microbial bile

salt metabolism, increasing levels of the primary bile salt, cholate, and decreasing levels of the

secondary bile salt, deoxycholate. However, decreased levels of deoxycholate did not correlate

with increased *C. difficile* susceptibility. Further, bile salts were not required to inhibit *C. difficile*

colonization. We tested whether amino acid fermentation contributed to persistence of *C.*

difficile in antibiotic-treated communities. *C. difficile* mutants unable to use proline as an electron

acceptor in Stickland fermentation due to disruption of proline reductase (Δ*prdB*) had

significantly lower levels of colonization than wild-type strains in four of six antibiotic-treated

communities tested. This data provides further support for the importance of bile salt-

independent mechanisms in regulating colonization of *C. difficile.*

IMPORTANCE

C. difficile is one of the leading causes of hospital-acquired infections and antibiotic-associated

diarrhea. Several potential mechanisms through which the microbiota can limit *C. difficile*

infection have been identified and are potential targets for new therapeutics. However, it is

unclear which mechanisms of *C. difficile* inhibition represent the best targets for development of

new therapeutics. These studies demonstrate that in a complex *in vitro* model of *C. difficile*

infection, colonization resistance is independent of microbial bile salt metabolism. Instead, the

ability of *C. difficile* to colonize is dependent upon its ability to metabolize proline, although

proline-dependent colonization is context-dependent and is not observed in all disrupted

communities. Altogether, these studies support the need for further work to understand how

bile-independent mechanisms regulate *C. difficile* colonization.

INTRODUCTION

Clostridioides difficile is one of the leading causes of nosocomial infections due to its

transmissibility as environmentally-resistant spores and its ability to infect patients who have

been treated with antibiotics (1, 2). Many classes of antibiotics can disrupt the colonic microbiota

(3–5); disruption can decrease production of inhibitory metabolites (6–9) and reduce

competition for limiting nutrients (10–13), providing favorable conditions for *C. difficile* infection.

Although multiple mechanisms for colonization resistance have been identified, an

understanding of the hierarchical importance of these mechanisms in *C. difficile* colonization and

disease is just beginning to emerge.

Microbial bile salt metabolism has been extensively studied for its role in limiting *C. difficile*

colonization. The primary bile salts cholate and chenodeoxycholate are synthesized in the liver

and are conjugated to glycine or taurine to improve solubility (14). Once secreted into the

intestine, microbial enzymes begin modifying these bile salts, removing conjugated amino acids

and dehydroxylating primary bile salts into secondary bile salts (14). *C. difficile* spore germination

is stimulated by cholate-family bile salts (cholate, taurocholate, glycocholate, deoxycholate) and

inhibited by chenodeoxycholate-family bile salts (15, 16), although there is variation in these

responses between strains (17). Germination is enhanced by amino acid (15, 18) and calcium co-

germinants, which act synergistically with bile salts to enhance germination (19). Secondary bile

salts (deoxycholate, lithocholate) inhibit growth of vegetative *C. difficile* in vitro (7, 15, 20), and

low levels of secondary bile salts correlate with *C. difficile* infection in humans (21, 22) and in

mouse models (7, 23, 24).

However, recent studies have demonstrated that our understanding of the role of bile salts

in *C. difficile* colonization resistance may be incomplete. *C. difficile* spore colonization and

fulminant disease was observed in *Cypb8b1*^{-/-} mice unable to make cholate-family bile salts (25),

and resistance to *C. difficile* colonization was observed even though these mice do not produce

the secondary bile salts deoxycholate or lithocholate. *Clostridium scindens*, a microbe inferred to

inhibit *C. difficile* through dehydroxylation of primary bile salts to secondary bile salts (24), was

also shown to inhibit *C. difficile in vitro* through production of tryptophan-derived antibiotics (9)

and other uncharacterized metabolites (26) and to potentially compete with *C. difficile* for

nutrients required for growth in *Cypb8b1*^{-/-} monocolonized mice (25). In addition, both cholate

and deoxycholate were shown to induce similar *C. difficile* stress responses, although 10X higher

concentrations of cholate were used to observe these effects (27).

Competition for nutrients between commensal microbes and *C. difficile* has long been postulated as a mechanism for colonization resistance, with Wilson and colleagues utilizing continuous-flow culture systems to demonstrate competition between the microbiota and *C. difficile in vitro* (28, 29). *C. difficile* can metabolize mucin monosaccharides *in vitro* (30), and preferentially expresses pathways for degradation of mucin monosaccharides in mouse models (31, 32), indicating that metabolism of mucin monosaccharides may be a niche open to *C. difficile* during infection. Similarly, *C. difficile* metabolism of carbohydrates and sugar alcohols from the host and its diet may be another niche open to *C. difficile* during infection, as expression of genes in these metabolic pathways increase during infection in germ-free and antibiotic-treated mice (11, 31, 32). In addition to carbohydrate metabolism, *C. difficile* also efficiently utilizes amino acids through Stickland fermentation (33), which is a metabolic pathway limited primarily to proteolytic Clostridial species (34), providing a unique metabolic niche within the GI tract. Increasing evidence from human (10, 35) and mouse (11, 13, 25, 31, 32, 36) studies points to Stickland fermentation with proline as an electron acceptor as a preferred nutritional niche for *C. difficile* in the GI tract.

Previously, we described an *in vitro* minibioreactor array (MBRA) model for characterization of *C. difficile* colonization resistance in the presence of human fecal microbial communities under nutritional conditions that simulate the distal colon (37), that has subsequently been used to characterize microbes that inhibit *C. difficile* colonization and/or toxin production (38–40). In this study, we used the MBRA model to investigate how treatment with six clinically-used antibiotics differentially impacted susceptibility to *C. difficile* infection in microbial communities cultivated from 12 healthy individuals. As expected, we observed that antibiotic treatment reduced

microbial diversity, although the extent of antibiotic-mediated disruption varied across individual

communities and was not well correlated with susceptibility to *C. difficile* infection. Antibiotic

treatment also reduced microbial metabolism of cholate to deoxycholate, although there was no

correlation between deoxycholate levels and susceptibility to *C. difficile* infection. To further test

whether bile salts contributed to *C. difficile* colonization resistance, we cultivated fecal

communities in the presence and absence of bovine bile. Similar to what was observed by Aguirre

et al. (25) in *Cypb8b1*$^{-/-}$ mice, we observed bile salts were not required for *C. difficile* colonization

resistance and that the low level of *C. difficile* spore germination that occurred in the absence of

bile was sufficient to allow colonization of antibiotic-treated communities by *C. difficile* spores.

Using a *C. difficile* mutant unable to utilize proline as an electron acceptor during Stickland

fermentation due to a mutation in proline reductase (Δ*prdB* (41))*,* we demonstrated that proline

reduction was required for *C. difficile* to colonize a subset of antibiotic-disrupted microbial

communities. These results can serve as a foundation for further mechanistic characterization of

the hierarchical importance of different nutritional environments in limiting *C. difficile*

colonization.

RESULTS

Loss of microbial diversity is not sufficient to promote *C. difficile* colonization. Previously, we

demonstrated that microbial communities cultured from the fecal samples of healthy individuals

in MBRAs can resist colonization by *C. difficile*; treatment with clindamycin could induce

susceptibility to *C. difficile* colonization in these complex fecal communities (37). To better

understand how this model can be used to measure effects of antibiotics on microbiota

disruption and *C. difficile* colonization, we compared treatment with six individual antibiotics (Fig.

1A) on microbial community composition and *C. difficile* susceptibility of communities cultured

Figure 1: **Alterations in microbiota diversity and levels of *C. difficile* varied by type of antibiotic administered.** (A) Antibiotics administered during experiment. (B) Experimental timeline indicating points where samples were collected; time is indicated relative to the point of *C. difficile* challenge (Day 0). In (C)-(G), samples were collected from duplicate reactors inoculated with one of twelve healthy human fecal samples and treated as indicated. (C) Microbiota richness (Observed OTUs with $\geq$ 97% identity) and (D) diversity (Inverse Simpson measure) were determined from 16S rRNA gene sequences. Microbiota richness from Day -7 and Day 0 are reported in Supplementary Figure S1. (E) *C. difficile* levels on Day 3 and 7 of infection. Boxes represent the interquartile range (IQR), cross lines represent the median values, whiskers indicate 1.5X IQR, and data outside this range were indicated by discrete points. Statistical significance of differences from untreated samples was determined by Kruskal-Wallis testing with Dunn's correction for multiple comparisons. *, $p<0.05$; **, $p<0.01$; ***, $p<0.001$; ****, $p<0.0001$. In (F)-(G), the change in richness from baseline (Day -7) on (F) Day -2 and (G) Day 0 were plotted as a function of $\log_{10}$ *C. difficile* levels on Day 3 of infection. Simple linear regression was used to evaluate the relationship between the variables.

from twelve different healthy individuals. These antibiotics were selected because they are all used clinically, but vary in antimicrobial spectrum. Fourteen independent bioreactors were inoculated with each fecal sample and allowed to stabilize in continuous culture for seven days. Reactors were treated in duplicate with one of six antibiotics twice daily for five days (Figure 1B); two reactors served as untreated controls. Two days after the end of antibiotic treatment, communities were challenged with vegetative cells of *C. difficile* strain 2015 (CD2015), a ribotype 027 clinical isolate (37). Samples were collected prior to administration of antibiotics, at the end of antibiotic treatment, and two days later, just prior to *C. difficile* challenge, for analysis of microbial community composition by 16S rRNA gene sequencing. Samples were additionally collected for analysis of *C. difficile* levels on days 3 and 7 post-infection.

Prior to antibiotic treatment (Day -7), there were no differences in richness (Figure 1C) or

microbial diversity between treatment groups (Supplementary Figure 1A). Treatment with

antibiotics significantly reduced microbiota richness for all antibiotics tested at the end of

antibiotic treatment (Day -2; Figure 1C), with median richness declining from 1.2-fold (cefaclor)

to 1.5-fold (clindamycin). Microbial diversity declined significantly following treatment with just

three antibiotics – clindamycin, ceftriaxone, and augmentin (Figure 1D), which was consistent

with the largest declines in microbial richness. Richness and diversity had partially recovered two

days following antibiotic treatment (Figure 1C; Supplementary Figure S1), although communities

treated with clindamycin, ceftriaxone, and augmentin still exhibited significantly lower microbial

richness compared to untreated controls (Figure 1C, Day 0).

C. difficile susceptibility, measured as levels of *C. difficile* detected on day 3 or day 7 following

challenge with *C. difficile* cells, varied across different antibiotic treatments (Figure 1E) and fecal

donors (Supplementary Figure S2). Of the twelve fecal samples tested, untreated communities

from seven fecal samples were resistant to colonization (<10^4 *C. difficile* colony forming units

(CFU)/mL at both time points in both replicates), untreated communities from four communities

exhibited variable susceptibility to colonization (>10^4 CFU/mL in one or more replicates/time

points), and untreated communities from one fecal samples was susceptible to colonization (>10^4

CFU/mL in both replicates/time points). Clindamycin was the only antibiotic that significantly

increased levels of *C. difficile* colonization above levels observed in untreated communities

(Figure 1E), with communities from nine of twelve fecal samples exhibiting median levels of

colonization >10^4 CFU/mL following clindamycin-treatment (Supplementary Figure S2).

Susceptibility to infection varied across communities from different fecal samples that were

treated with other antibiotics (Supplementary Figure S2). We tested whether changes in richness

from baseline following antibiotic treatment (Day -2) or on the day of *C. difficile* challenge (Day

0) were correlated with levels of *C. difficile* on day 3 (Figure 1F-1G) or day 7 of infection

(Supplementary Figure S3); we found that there were no significant correlations between

changes in richness and susceptibility to *C. difficile* colonization. When we tested for taxa whose

differences in abundance at Day 0 correlated with susceptibility to *C. difficile* colonization

(Supplementary Figure S4), we observed that five taxa were significantly higher in resistant

communities and three taxa were significantly lower in resistant communities.

Antibiotic treatment alters bile salt metabolism. Bioreactor medium (BRM3) contains bovine

bile as a complex source of bile salts. Analysis of bioreactor medium indicated that cholate family

bile salts predominated, with approximately 36% taurocholate (198 µM), 34% glycocholate (190

µM), 10% cholate (56 µM), and 2% deoxycholate (13 µM) of total bile salts measured

(Supplementary Figure S5A-B). To understand how microbiota cultivation and antibiotic

treatment altered bile salt pools in bioreactor cultures, we focused on quantification of the amino

acid conjugated primary bile salt, taurocholate, the primary bile salt, cholate, and the secondary

bile salt, deoxycholate across the communities described in Figure 1. We observed that

microbiota cultivation led to a >500-fold decrease in taurocholate, a 3-fold decrease in cholate,

and a 20-fold increase in deoxycholate in spent culture supernatant compared to fresh medium

(Supplementary Figure S5C). Treatment with four antibiotics – augmentin, ceftriaxone,

    clindamycin, and fidaxomicin - significantly shifted the composition of bile salts compared to

Figure 2: Cholate, deoxycholate, and taurocholate levels in untreated and antibiotic-treated bioreactors. Levels of (A) cholate, (B) deoxycholate, and (C) taurocholate were measured from the communities described in Figure 1 at the end of antibiotic treatment (Day -2) and just prior to *C. difficile* challenge (Day 0). Boxes represent the IQR, cross lines represent median values, and whiskers indicate 1.5 X IQR; data outside this range were indicated by discrete points. Significance of differences from untreated samples was determined by Kruskal-Wallis testing with Dunn's correction for multiple comparisons. *, $p < 0.05$; **, $p < 0.01$; ***, $p < 0.001$; ****, $p < 0.0001$. Relative proportions of bile salts were reported because the coefficient of variation in untreated samples was lower compared to absolute concentrations (Supplementary Figure S5D); absolute concentrations are reported in Supplementary Figure S6A-C. Simple linear regression of (D) percent cholate and (E) percent deoxycholate on Day 0 relative to levels of *C. difficile* on Day 3 of infection.

untreated communities, with significant increases in cholate and decreases in deoxycholate two days prior to *C. difficile* challenge (Figure 2A-2B). No significant differences in taurocholate were observed across communities treated with antibiotics (Figure 2C). As with microbial diversity measures, bile salt levels had recovered two days following antibiotic treatment and there was no significant correlation between levels of cholate on Day 0 of infection and *C. difficile* colonization on Day 3 (Figure 2D) or Day 7 (Supplementary Figure S6D) of infection.

Previous studies have found that deoxycholate inhibits the growth of vegetative *C. difficile* cells (7, 15, 20), with inhibitory concentrations ranging from $0.01 – 0.1\%$ (250 - 2500 μM). The median concentration of deoxycholate measured in untreated communities on the day of *C.*

difficile challenge was 602 µM (Supplementary Figure S6B); median concentrations in antibiotic

treated communities ranged from 431 µM (augmentin) to 608 µM (clindamycin), but were not

significantly different than those observed in untreated communities on Day 0. Because both *C.*

difficile susceptibility and deoxycholate levels varied by fecal donor and antibiotic treatment, we

tested whether *C. difficile* levels observed on Day 3 or Day 7 of infection correlated with

deoxycholate levels on Day 0. We found no correlation between deoxycholate levels on the day

of *C. difficile* challenge and the levels of *C. difficile* on Day 3 (Figure 2E) or Day 7 (Supplementary

Figure S6E-F) and that 18% of communities with high *C. difficile* levels (>10^5 CFU/mL) on Day 7 of

infection had deoxycholate levels $\geq$1000 µM on Day 0 of infection.

Bile was not required for *C. difficile* colonization resistance *in vitro*. While the previous results

were consistent with the hypothesis that secondary bile salts do not mediate colonization

resistance in communities cultured in bioreactors, we could not rule out effects of other bile salts

that were not measured. To test whether bile salts were required, we monitored colonization

resistance of microbial communities established from five fecal samples cultured in parallel in

media with and without added bile. Specifically, replicate bioreactors were established for each

fecal sample in media either containing or lacking bovine bile. Triplicate communities were

treated with clindamycin as previously described (42), while the remaining three replicates for

each type of media were left untreated (Figure 3A). Communities were challenged with

vegetative cells of CD2015 and *C. difficile* levels were monitored over time. We found *C. difficile*

colonization was similarly suppressed in communities cultured in the presence or absence of bile

and that treatment with clindamycin led to similar levels of *C. difficile* colonization (Figure 3B).

Bile was not required for _C. difficile_ spores to colonize _in vitro_. Cholate family bile salts are

known to greatly enhance _C. difficile_ spore germination during _in vitro_ culture (15, 43, 44),

Figure 3. Bile acids were not required for colonization resistance and did not enhance colonization in communities of human fecal microbes cultured in bioreactors. (A) Experimental timeline indicating points where samples were collected; time is indicated relative to the point of _C. difficile_ challenge. (B) _C. difficile_ levels in untreated and clindamycin-treated communities cultured in the presence and absence of bile. (C) _C. difficile_ levels in clindamycin-treated communities challenged with _C. difficile_ vegetative (V) cells or spores (S). (D) _C. difficile_ levels in clindamycin-treated communities cultured in the presence or absence of bile challenged with _C. difficile_ spores. Boxes represent the IQR, cross lines represent the median values, whiskers indicate 1.5 X IQR; data outside this range were indicated by discrete points. Significance of

differences from untreated samples was determined by Kruskal-Wallis testing with Dunn's

correction for multiple comparisons. *, $p < 0.05$; **, $p < 0.01$; ***, $p < 0.001$; ****, $p < 0.0001$.

although they are not required for spore germination in a mouse model of infection (25).

Previously, we reported that we were unable to colonize a clindamycin-treated microbial

community cultured in an MBRA model with *C. difficile* spores (37). Because these studies were

performed using a microbial community formed from pooling twelve fecal donors, we tested the

ability of the spores to colonize clindamycin-treated communities established from five individual

fecal samples. We found that the majority of clindamycin-treated communities could be

colonized following challenge with *C. difficile* spores (Figure 3C), although communities from one

fecal sample were colonized at a lower frequency by spores than by vegetative cells

(Supplementary Figure S7). We then tested whether bile salts were required for *C. difficile* spores

to colonize clindamycin-treated fecal microbial communities cultured in MBRAs. We observed

that colonization by spores was not significantly different between communities cultured in

media with and without bile (Figure 3D).

Because cholate family bile salts were previously reported to enhance germination, we

compared the ability of media with and without bile to enhance colony formation of spores in

pure culture. Consistent with previous observations (15, 43), incubation of CD2015 spores in

bioreactor medium containing bile for one hour enhanced colony formation by germinated *C.*

difficile spores by >400-fold compared to incubation in the presence of bioreactor medium

without bile (Figure 4). We next tested how spent culture medium collected from clindamycin-

treated communities cultured in the presence or absence of bile would impact spore

germination. Low levels of spore germination were observed in spent culture medium from fecal

communities cultured in the presence and absence of bile (Figure 4). Altogether, this data

indicates that the levels of bile salts present in spent culture medium from communities cultured

in the presence of bile do not have significant impacts on germination. Further, while the levels

of spore germination and colony formation in spent culture medium are low, these low levels of

germination would result in ~10^3 vegetative cells, a level previously shown to infect antibiotic

disrupted communities (37).

Figure 4. Low levels of spore germination in spent culture medium from communities cultured

in the presence of bile. Germination of CD2015 spores was determined in filter-sterilized spent

culture medium from clindamycin-treated fecal communities cultured in the presence or absence

of bile. Spores were incubated in medium for one hour followed by enumeration on agar medium

with or without added taurocholate to determine the percent germination on taurocholate.

Fresh bioreactor medium made with or without bovine bile were included as controls. Boxes

represent the IQR, cross lines represent the median values, and whiskers indicate 1.5 X IQR; data

outside this range were indicated by discrete points. Significance of differences between samples

were determined by one-way ANOVA with Brown-Forsythe correction for unequal variances and

Dunnett's correction for multiple comparisons. ns, $p > 0.05$; ****, $p < 0.0001$.

299 **Proline metabolism was required for *C. difficile* to colonize a subset of fecal samples *in vitro*.**

300 Proteolytic metabolism through Stickland fermentation has previously been reported as an

301 important nutritional niche for *C. difficile* in human (10, 35) and mouse models of infection (11,

302 13, 25, 31, 32, 36). As bioreactor medium contains low levels of fermentable carbohydrates and

303 does not contain mucin-associated monosaccharides, we hypothesized that Stickland

304 Fermentation with proline as an electron acceptor could be important for colonization of

305 antibiotic-disrupted fecal communities. To test this hypothesis, we compared the colonization of

306 mutants defective in the ability to metabolize proline ($\Delta prdB$::CT (41)) to a wild type (wt) strain.

307 Fecal samples from six healthy individuals were cultured in replicate bioreactors, treated with

308 clindamycin, and challenged with wt or $\Delta prdB$ strains using the approach described in Fig. 3A.

309

310 **Figure 5. *C. difficile* $\Delta prdB$ mutants fail to persist in most clindamycin-treated communities.** (A)

311 Levels of wt (*prdB*+) and $\Delta prdB$ (*prdB*-) strains were measured over time following introduction

312 into fecal communities treated with clindamycin as outlined in Figure 3A. Data reported are

313 pooled from all six fecal samples tested. (B) Levels of wt and $\Delta prdB$ strains measured on day 5 of

314 infection from each of the six fecal samples tested (FS515, FS228, FS235, FS685, FS133, and

315 FS583).

Overall, we observed that fecal communities challenged with Δ*prdB* mutants showed decreasing

levels of colonization over time, with significantly lower levels observed on day 3 and 5 of

infection compared to wild type (Figure 5A). However, the ability of wt and Δ*prdB* strains to

colonize was dependent upon the fecal community tested (Figure 5B). Wild-type strains

colonized five of the six clindamycin-disrupted communities (FS515, FS228, FS235, FS685, FS133)

whereas Δ*prdB* strains failed to colonize two of these susceptible communities (FS228, FS235).

In the other three susceptible communities, there was either a lack of Δ*prdB* colonization in the

majority of replicates tested (FS515: 10/12 replicates; FS685; 8/13 replicates), or there was no

difference between levels of wt and Δ*prdB* colonization levels (FS133). Based on these results,

we conclude that Stickland fermentation with proline as an electron acceptor can play an

important role in the ability of *C. difficile* to persist in complex communities *in vitro*, but this is

dependent upon the composition of the fecal community and its ability to limit *C. difficile*

colonization through other mechanisms.

DISCUSSION

The factors that govern whether or not an individual exposed to *C. difficile* will go on to develop

symptomatic disease are complex. While it is clear that disruption of the GI microbiota is a key

risk factor for infection and disease, the extent to which different microbes interact with each

other and the host to limit *C. difficile* infection and disease progression are not completely

understood. Developing tools that allow microbe and metabolite interactions to be investigated

in the absence of a host can help to provide insights into whether mechanisms that inhibit or

promote *C. difficile* colonization are more likely to be causative or correlative. This level of

understanding is necessary as new therapeutic approaches that more narrowly target *C. difficile*,

such as defined microbial consortia are developed.

To gain greater insights into factors that govern *C. difficile* colonization resistance in a fecal

MBRA model, we investigated how six different clinically-used antibiotics impacted the ability of

the microbiota to resist *C. difficile* colonization. As expected, we observed that antibiotic

treatment led to loss of microbial richness, although the extent of microbiota disruption varied

both by the class of antibiotic tested and by the composition of the microbial community.

Consistent with previous meta-analyses of human antibiotic exposure and risk for *C. difficile*

infection in non-hospitalized patients (45, 46), clindamycin was most strongly associated with

susceptibility to infection in antibiotic-treated communities, with ten of twelve communities

tested showing susceptibility following treatment. However, the magnitude of microbiota

disruption across antibiotic treatments did not correlate with susceptibility to *C. difficile*

infection, with some communities with significant losses in richness resisting *C. difficile* infection

and other communities with modest richness losses exhibiting susceptibility to infection. This

data provides further support for the hypothesis that *C. difficile* colonization resistance is likely

due to the presence of specific microbes and their functions that limit *C. difficile* colonization

rather than overall microbiota diversity.

Due to the compositional diversity between fecal communities tested, there were relatively

few conserved taxa whose presence or absence correlated with susceptibility to *C. difficile*

infection, which is consistent with the model that differences in microbiota function rather than

composition are important for understanding *C. difficile* susceptibility. Similar to previous studies,

however, levels of *Clostridium scindens* and *Bacteroides thetaiotaomicron* were higher in

resistant communities.

To better understand which microbiota functions may be important for colonization

resistance in this model, we investigated two mechanisms previously proposed to regulate *C.*

difficile colonization: microbial metabolism of bile acids and Stickland fermentation with proline

as an electron acceptor. We observed that microbial communities cultured in bioreactors were

able to convert the taurocholate in bovine bile into deoxycholate. Treatment with antibiotics had

no significant impacts on levels of taurocholate. Microbes encoding bile salt hydrolases, which

remove taurine and glycine from primary bile salts (14), are broadly distributed amongst

members of the GI microbiota (47), which may have contributed to the ability of this function to

persist during antibiotic treatment.

In contrast, enzymes necessary to perform 7α-dehydroxylation of cholate to deoxycholate

are restricted to a smaller subset of the GI microbiota, primarily members of the Clostridiales

family and the *Clostridium* genus (48). Treatment with augmentin, ceftriaxone, clindamycin, and

fidaxomicin significantly increased levels of cholate and decreased levels of deoxycholate

compared to untreated controls, although levels were not significantly different from untreated

communities two days following the cessation of antibiotics. There was also no correlation

between levels of cholate or deoxycholate and susceptibility to *C. difficile* infection, indicating

that secondary bile salt mediated inhibition was unlikely to be a mechanism preventing

colonization in this model. This was further supported by experiments investigating colonization

resistance in the presence and absence of bile, which demonstrated bile was not required for *C.*

difficile colonization resistance.

Lack of inhibition by secondary bile salts was surprising, as levels of deoxycholate measured

in spent culture medium (431 - 608 μM) were within the range shown to inhibit *C. difficile* growth

in pure culture *in vitro* (250 - 2500 μM; (7, 15, 20)). Nevertheless, 18% of communities with high

C. difficile levels (>10^5 CFU/mL) on Day 7 of infection had deoxycholate levels $\geq$ 1000 μM on Day

0 of infection, suggesting inhibitory effects observed in pure culture may not be the same in

complex culture in the presence of other microbes. Further studies are needed to understand

whether the presence of other microbes could mitigate some of the toxic effects of deoxycholate

on *C. difficile* growth.

We also observed that spores were capable of infecting communities treated with

clindamycin and this was independent of the presence of bile. Consistent with what has been

previously reported, low levels of germination were observed in the absence of bile and in spent

culture medium cultured in the presence or absence of bile. However, these low levels of

germination would result in ~10^3 vegetative cells, a level previously shown to infect antibiotic

disrupted communities cultured in bioreactors (37). This data provides further support to prior

studies that have proposed that control of *C. difficile* germination and growth (12, 25) through

restoration of microbial bile salt metabolism may not be sufficient to limit *C. difficile* colonization.

While levels of bile salt did not correlate with susceptibility to infection, the ability of *C.*

difficile to metabolize proline as an electron acceptor for Stickland fermentation was required for

persistence in the majority of disrupted communities tested. These results are consistent with

evidence from human (10, 35) and mouse (11, 13, 25, 31, 32, 36) studies that point to Stickland

fermentation with proline as an electron acceptor as a preferred nutritional niche for *C. difficile*

in the GI tract. Stickland fermentation is a metabolic pathway limited primarily to proteolytic

Clostridial species (34). This includes microbes such as *C. scindens*, which can compete with *C.*

difficile for proline (25), dehydroxylate primary bile salts to secondary bile salts (24), and can

produce a bacteriocin that limits *C. difficile* growth (9). Identifying microbes that effectively

compete with *C. difficile* for proline and other amino acids following antibiotic treatment may be

one approach to limit *C. difficile* colonization.

It is unclear which metabolites were supporting *C. difficile* growth in antibiotic-treated

communities where Δ*prdB* mutants persisted at higher levels over time. Stickland fermentation

with glycine as an electron acceptor is one potential niche that could have been utilized by Δ*prdB*

mutants. Alternatively, *C. difficile* may have utilized carbohydrate fermentation pathways.

Further studies are needed to more fully understand how *C. difficile* colonizes disrupted

communities.

Altogether, these studies highlight the importance of improving our understanding of bile-

independent mechanisms regulating *C. difficile* colonization. While it is clear that Stickland

fermentation of amino acids with proline as an electron acceptor is important for *C. difficile*

persistence in many disrupted communities, other nutritional niches should also be explored.

Studies similar to those described here, examining variations in fecal microbial communities and

environmental conditions, will further clarify the hierarchical importance of different nutritional

environments in limiting *C. difficile* colonization.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Fecal sample collection and preparation. Fecal samples were collected from 18 healthy individuals who had not been treated with oral antibiotics within the previous six months. Samples were collected from children aged 4-17 (n=3), adults aged 18-65 (n=12), and older adults aged >65 (n=2). Similar numbers of male and female participants agreed to provide samples. However, only donor age categorization (child, adult, older adult) remained linked to specific fecal samples following de-identification. Studies were designed to collect samples across the age span rather than specifically powered to evaluate differences in community composition by age. All adult participants provided consent to participate in the study. Children provided assent to participate along with parental consent to participate. Protocols for collection and use of fecal samples were reviewed and approved by Institutional Review Boards at Baylor College of Medicine (protocol number H-38014) and University of Nebraska-Lincoln (protocol numbers 18585 and 20186).

Samples were self-collected by participants in commode specimen collection containers, sealed in a plastic bag containing a gas pack (BBL GasPak Anaerobe sachet), packed in ice packs, placed in a sealed container, and returned to the lab within 24 hours as previously described (37). Fecal samples were manually homogenized and subdivided under anaerobic conditions (Anaerobic Chamber with 5% H_2, 5%CO_2, 90% N_2 atmosphere) and frozen at -80°C until later resuspended at 25% w/v in reduced phosphate buffered saline (PBS). Fecal suspensions were vortex-mixed for 5 min at $\geq$ 2500 rpm, centrifuged at 200 X g for 5 min to settle large particulates, and the supernatants were either used immediately or amended with 7.5% dimethylsulfoxide

and preserved at -80°C until use. Previous work had shown that freezing samples at -80°C did not

significantly change the composition of communities cultured in bioreactors (49).

Bioreactor experiments. MBRAs were assembled and operated under anoxic conditions (5% H_2,

5% CO_2, 90% N_2) at 37°C as described previously (37). MBRAs are strips of six independent

continuous flow bioreactors that operate at a 15 mL volume and are continuously stirred with

small magnetic stir bars positioned over a stir plate. Each independent reactor in the array

contains three ports, one for delivery of fresh medium at a slow continuous rate, one for removal

of waste, and a sample port for sampling of medium and bacteria in suspension. Bioreactor

medium version 3 (BRM3;(39)), which simulates nutritional conditions of the distal colon was

used for all studies, with the exception of studies testing the effect of bovine bile, when this

component was excluded from BRM3. Fecal suspensions from individual donors were inoculated

into sterile, anoxic BRM3 medium at 1% w/v final concentration and allowed to grow for 16-24

hr in batch, prior to initiation of continuous flow of medium at 1.875 mL/hr (16 hr retention time

for 15 mL bioreactors). Communities were allowed to equilibrate under continuous flow for 1 or

6 days as indicated in figures. Antibiotics were either administered twice daily to individual

bioreactors or added directly to source medium as indicated in figures. Research grade antibiotics

were obtained from the following sources: augmentin (5:1 amoxicillin sodium salt to potassium

clavulanate; Research Products International); azithromycin dihydrate (Thermo Scientific

Chemicals); cefaclor (Thermo Scientific Chemicals); ceftriaxone sodium salt hemiheptahydrate

(Thermo Scientific Chemicals); clindamycin phosphate (TCI America); and fidaxomicin (Apexbio

Technology, LLC). Antibiotic concentrations used for twice daily dosing were estimated based

upon previously published measurements in human feces and/or bile (50–56), although

fidaxomicin dosing was limited by its maximal solubility. Clindamycin concentrations used in

media were previously described (40). One day following cessation of antibiotics, *C. difficile*

spores or vegetative cells was administered to reactors at ~ 1 X 10^5 CFU/mL (vegetative cells) or

1 X 10^6 CFU/mL (spores) and levels were enumerated over time. Samples were collected from

bioreactors at the time points indicated using a sterile needle and syringe to collect bacteria in

suspension. When appropriate, an aliquot of this sample was used to enumerate *C. difficile* by

serial dilution and plating on taurocholate cefoxitin cycloserine fructose agar (TCCFA (37)) or

TCCFA supplemented with 50 μg/mL rifampicin and 20 μg/mL erythromycin when CD2015 was

enumerated. Sample were centrifuged at ~3000 X *g* for 5 min to pellet cells. Supernatants were

removed, and pellets and supernatants were stored at $\leq$ -20°C.

Microbial community analysis by 16S rRNA gene sequencing. DNA was extracted from cell

pellets using the BioSprint 96 One-For-All Vet processing kit (Qiagen) according to instructions

with the following modifications. Prior to extraction, cells were resuspended in Buffer ASL

(Qiagen) and added to sterile deep well plates (Axygen) containing 0.1 mm Zirconia beads

(BioSpec Products). Cells were disrupted by bead beating for 2 minutes at 1800 rpm on a FastPrep

96 homogenizer (MP Biomedicals). DNA was amplified in duplicate with Phusion polymerase

using barcoded primers 515F and 806R that target the 16S rRNA gene as previously described

(39, 49), then sequenced on an Illumina MiSeq using 2 x 250 kits according to manufacturer's

protocol. Fastqs were processed by mothur 1.41.3, removing chimeras identified by uchime,

mapping sequences against Silva release 132, and clustering OTUs at 99% identity using the

OptiClust algorithm (57–59). To remove sample bleedover, the median + quartile value for a given

OTU in 47 negative controls were removed from all samples prior to rarefaction. The level of

rarefaction was chosen to maximize the number of samples and the reads/sample. Following

removal of bleedover, bioreactor samples were rarefied to 6332 reads/sample. When necessary,

the identity of OTUs were manually confirmed by BLAST (60).

Bile salt measurements by liquid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry (LC-MS/MS).

Quantitative analysis of the bile salt levels contained in conditioned-BRM3 culture media sample

supernatants was performed by the Texas Children's Microbiome Center Metabolomics and

Proteomics Mass Spectrometry Laboratory (TCMC-MPMSL) using previously published

methods(61, 62). Briefly, conditioned-BRM3 growth media samples were removed from the fecal

communities cultured in the individual bioreactors using sterile needles and syringes. Samples

were added into sterile tubes, and the bacterial cells were pelleted by centrifugation at 3,000 X

g for 5 min. Clarified supernatants were then sterile filtered using 96-well 0.2 μM

polyvinyldifluoride (PVDF) filter plates by centrifugation at 200 X g for 5 min. The 96-well, deep

well plates used to capture sample filtrates were covered with silicone cap mats and the capped

samples were wrapped in parafilm to ensure the fixture of the capmats during shipment. The

cell-free conditioned media samples were stored frozen at -80°C pending shipment to the TCMC-

MPMSL. The cell-free conditioned media samples were shipped frozen on dry ice, and upon

receipt by the TCMC-MPMSL, were stored at -80°C until analysis.

All cell-free conditioned media samples were thawed at ambient temperature on a

laboratory benchtop. Once thawed, the entire sample volume was transferred into individual 0.6

or 1.5 mL Eppendorf tubes, and all samples were vortex-mixed using a multi-tube vortexer.

Preliminary work indicated that 10-fold and 1,000-fold dilutions were suitable to measure the

TCA content, and the CA and DCA content, respectively, in each of the cell-free conditioned media

samples using a common linear dynamic range of 0.977-1,000 ng/mL for CA, DCA, and TCA – the

two different dilution procedures for each metabolite were described previously (62). These

sample dilution steps were performed using a working internal standard (WIS) solution prepared

in 1:1 methanol: water that contained 250 ng/mL each of D4-CA and D4-DCA as described (62).

A 5 μL volume of sample was injected onto the SCIEX QTRAP 6500-based LC-MS/MS system, and

bile acid concentrations in the conditioned media samples were back calculated using the

regression parameters of the standard curve as described previously (62).

A broad screen of the bile acids/salt content of a fresh preparation of BRM3-based

bioreactor medium (with bovine bile) was performed using another previously reported targeted

metabolomics method that is capable of quantitatively measuring 16 bile acids/salts (63). This

expanded method can quantify the bile acid/salt content of microbial media samples: CA,

glycocholic acid (GCA), TCA, beta-muricholic acid (β-MCA), DCA, glycodeoxycholic acid (GDCA),

taurodeoxycholic acid (TDCA), chenodeoxycholic acid (CDCA), glycochenodeoxycholic acid

(GCDCA), taurochenodeoxycholic acid (TCDCA), ursodeoxycholic acid (UDCA),

glycoursodeoxycholic acid (GUDCA), tauroursodeoxycholic acid (TUDCA), lithocholic acid (LCA),

glycolithocholic acid (GLCA), and taurolithocholic acid (TLCA). Briefly, samples were prepared by

diluting a 10 μL volume of a thawed cell-free, conditioned BRM3 media sample in a 90 μL volume

of a WIS solution that contains deuterated analogs of each of the analytes listed above at

concentrations of 250 nM for each prepared in 1:1 methanol: water (63). The samples were

prepared directly in glass autosampler vials and the samples were vortex-mixed briefly prior to

injecting a 10 µL volume onto the SCIEX QTRAP 6500-based LC-MS/MS system. Bile acid/salt

concentrations in the fresh BRM3 medium samples were back calculated using the linear

regression parameters of the standard curve as described previously (63).

Data visualization and statistical analysis. The statistical tests used to evaluate significance of

differences are listed for each figure legend. Except where indicated, significance of differences

between groups was evaluated with Kruskal-Wallis testing with Dunn's correction for multiple

comparisons. One-way ANOVA with Brown and Forsythe correction for unequal variances and

Dunnet's correction for multiple comparisons was also used as indicated. These analyses were

performed in Graphpad Prism version 10.2.2, which was also used to generate graphs. LEfSe (64)

was used to identify OTUs whose abundance differed significantly between susceptible and

resistant communities. LEfSe analysis was performed using Mothur version 1.44.0.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Robert Britton (Baylor College of Medicine) for access to data collected in his laboratory

by J.M.A that contributed to Figure 3B. We thank former University of Nebraska-Lincoln

undergraduate students Keegan Schuchart, Yining He, and Austin Johnson for technical

assistance.

J.M.A., X.H., and A.E.J. were responsible for conceptualization and design of the studies. Data

collection was performed by X.H., A.E.J., T.A.A., A.I.L, H.C.M., S.J.H., T.D.H., and J.M.A. Analysis

was performed by X.H., A.E.J., T.A.A, S.J.H., K.M.H., T.D.H., A.M.H. and J.M.A. J.M.A. and A.M.H

acquired funding for the studies. The initial draft of the manuscript was written by A.E.J. and

J.M.A., and all authors revised, edited, and approved the final manuscript. The Texas Children's

Hospital Department of Pathology provides salary support to the Texas Children's Microbiome

Center-Metabolomics and Proteomics Mass Spectrometry Laboratory staff, and purchased all of

the reagents, the consumables and durable supplies, and the LC–MS/MS equipment described.

Sequence analysis was completed utilizing the Holland Computing Center, which receives

support from the UNL Office of Research and Economic Development and the Nebraska

Research Initiative.

DATA AVAILABILITY

16S rRNA gene data has been deposited in NCBI's Sequence Read Archive under BioProject ID

PRJNA729569.

ETHICS APPROVAL

Protocols for collection and use of fecal samples were reviewed and approved by Institutional

Review Boards at Baylor College of Medicine (protocol number H-38014) and University of

Nebraska-Lincoln (protocol numbers 18585 and 20186).

FUNDING

This work was partially supported by funding from the Centers for Disease Control awards 200-

2017-96080 and 75D301-18C-02909 (J.M.A. and A.M.H.), the National Institute of General

Medical Sciences awards P20GM103420 and P20GM113126 (J.M.A. received seed funding

through the Nebraska Prevention for Obesity Diseases and the Nebraska Center for Integrated

Biomolecular Communication, respectively), the Nebraska Tobacco Settlement Biomedical

Research Development Fund (J.M.A.) and the Agricultural Research Division at the University of

Nebraska-Lincoln (J.M.A.).

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

585   J.M.A. and T.A.A. have a significant financial interest in Synbiotic Health. T.D.H. is a member of

586   the Editorial Advisory board and is contracted as an Associate Editor for a Cell Press Journal called

587   STAR Protocols. There are no other conflicts of interest to declare.

REFERENCES

1.   Guh AY, Mu Y, Winston LG, Johnston H, Olson D, Farley MM, Wilson LE, Holzbauer SM,

Phipps EC, Dumyati GK, Beldavs ZG, Kainer MA, Karlsson M, Gerding DN, McDonald LC.

2020. Trends in U.S. Burden of Clostridioides difficile infection and outcomes. N Engl J Med

382:1320–1330.

2.   Magill SS, O'Leary E, Janelle SJ, Thompson DL, Dumyati G, Nadle J, Wilson LE, Kainer MA,

Lynfield R, Greissman S, Ray SM, Beldavs Z, Gross C, Bamberg W, Sievers M, Concannon C,

Buhr N, Warnke L, Maloney M, Ocampo V, Brooks J, Oyewumi T, Sharmin S, Richards K,

Rainbow J, Samper M, Hancock EB, Leaptrot D, Scalise E, Badrun F, Phelps R, Edwards JR.

2018. Changes in prevalence of health care–associated infections in U.S. hospitals. N Engl J

Med 379:1732–1744.

3.   Patangia DV, Anthony Ryan C, Dempsey E, Paul Ross R, Stanton C. 2022. Impact of

antibiotics on the human microbiome and consequences for host health.

Microbiologyopen 11:e1260.

4.   Baggs J, Jernigan JA, Halpin AL, Epstein L, Hatfield KM, McDonald LC. 2017. Risk of

subsequent sepsis within 90 days after a hospital stay by type of antibiotic exposure. Clin

Infect Dis 66:1004–1012.

5.   Vardakas KZ, Trigkidis KK, Boukouvala E, Falagas ME. 2016. Clostridium difficile infection

following systemic antibiotic administration in randomised controlled trials: a systematic

review and meta-analysis. Int J Antimicrob Agents 48:1–10.

6.   Zhang Y, Limaye PB, Renaud HJ, Klaassen CD. 2014. Effect of various antibiotics on

modulation of intestinal microbiota and bile acid profile in mice. Toxicol Appl Pharmacol

277:138–145.

7.   Theriot CM, Bowman AA, Young VB. 2016. Antibiotic-induced alterations of the gut

microbiota alter secondary bile acid production and allow for Clostridium difficile spore

germination and outgrowth in the large intestine. mSphere 1:e00045-15.

8.   Seekatz AM, Theriot CM, Rao K, Chang Y-M, Freeman AE, Kao JY, Young VB. 2018.

Restoration of short chain fatty acid and bile acid metabolism following fecal microbiota

transplantation in patients with recurrent Clostridium difficile infection. Anaerobe 53:64–

73.

9.   Kang JD, Myers CJ, Harris SC, Kakiyama G, Lee I-K, Yun B-S, Matsuzaki K, Furukawa M, Min

H-K, Bajaj JS, Zhou H, Hylemon PB. 2019. Bile acid 7α-dehydroxylating gut bacteria secrete

antibiotics that inhibit *Clostridium difficile*: role of secondary bile acids. Cell Chem Biol

26:27-34.e4.

10.   Battaglioli EJ, Hale VL, Chen J, Jeraldo P, Ruiz-Mojica C, Schmidt BA, Rekdal VM, Till LM,

Huq L, Smits SA, Moor WJ, Jones-Hall Y, Smyrk T, Khanna S, Pardi DS, Grover M, Patel R,

Chia N, Nelson H, Sonnenburg JL, Farrugia G, Kashyap PC. 2018. *Clostridioides difficile* uses

amino acids associated with gut microbial dysbiosis in a subset of patients with diarrhea.

Sci Transl Med 10:eaam7019.

11.   Fletcher JR, Erwin S, Lanzas C, Theriot CM. 2018. Shifts in the gut metabolome and

Clostridium difficile transcriptome throughout colonization and infection in a mouse

model. mSphere 3:e00089-18.

12.   Bustin KA, Abbas A, Wang X, Abt MC, Zackular JP, Matthews ML. 2023. Characterizing

metabolic drivers of *Clostridioides difficile* infection with activity-based hydrazine probes.

Front Pharmacol 14:1074619.

13.   Girinathan BP, DiBenedetto N, Worley JN, Peltier J, Arrieta-Ortiz ML, Immanuel SRC, Lavin

R, Delaney ML, Cummins CK, Hoffman M, Luo Y, Gonzalez-Escalona N, Allard M,

Onderdonk AB, Gerber GK, Sonenshein AL, Baliga NS, Dupuy B, Bry L. 2021. In vivo

commensal control of *Clostridioides difficile* virulence. Cell Host Microbe 29:1693-1708.e7.

14.   Ridlon JM, Kang D-J, Hylemon PB. 2006. Bile salt biotransformations by human intestinal

bacteria. J Lipid Res 47:241–259.

15.   Sorg JA, Sonenshein AL. 2008. Bile salts and glycine as cogerminants for *Clostridium*

difficile spores. J Bacteriol 190:2505–2512.

16.   Sorg JA, Sonenshein AL. 2009. Chenodeoxycholate Is an inhibitor of *Clostridium difficile*

spore germination. J Bacteriol 191:1115–1117.

17.   Heeg D, Burns DA, Cartman ST, Minton NP. 2012. Spores of *Clostridium difficile* clinical

isolates display a diverse germination response to bile salts. PLoS ONE 7:e32381.

18.   Shrestha R, Sorg JA. 2018. Hierarchical recognition of amino acid co-germinants during

Clostridioides difficile spore germination. Anaerobe 49:41–47.

19.   Kochan TJ, Shoshiev MS, Hastie JL, Somers MJ, Plotnick YM, Gutierrez-Munoz DF, Foss ED,

Schubert AM, Smith AD, Zimmerman SK, Carlson PE, Hanna PC. 2018. Germinant synergy

facilitates *Clostridium difficile* spore germination under physiological conditions. mSphere

3:e00335-18.

20.   Usui Y, Ayibieke A, Kamiichi Y, Okugawa S, Moriya K, Tohda S, Saito R. 2020. Impact of

deoxycholate on *Clostridioides difficile* growth, toxin production, and sporulation. Heliyon

6:e03717.

21.   Allegretti JR, Kearney S, Li N, Bogart E, Bullock K, Gerber GK, Bry L, Clish CB, Alm E,

Korzenik JR. 2016. Recurrent *Clostridium difficile* infection associates with distinct bile acid

and microbiome profiles. Aliment Pharmacol Ther 43:1142–1153.

22.   Weingarden AR, Chen C, Bobr A, Yao D, Lu Y, Nelson VM, Sadowsky MJ, Khoruts A. 2014.

Microbiota transplantation restores normal fecal bile acid composition in recurrent

Clostridium difficile infection. Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol 306:G310–G319.

23.   Theriot CM, Koenigsknecht MJ, Carlson PE, Hatton GE, Nelson AM, Li B, Huffnagle GB, Z Li

J, Young VB. 2014. Antibiotic-induced shifts in the mouse gut microbiome and

metabolome increase susceptibility to *Clostridium difficile* infection. Nat Commun 5:3114.

24.   Buffie CG, Bucci V, Stein RR, McKenney PT, Ling L, Gobourne A, No D, Liu H, Kinnebrew M,

Viale A, Littmann E, van den Brink MRM, Jenq RR, Taur Y, Sander C, Cross JR, Toussaint NC,

Xavier JB, Pamer EG. 2015. Precision microbiome reconstitution restores bile acid

mediated resistance to *Clostridium difficile*. Nature 517:205–208.

25.   Aguirre AM, Yalcinkaya N, Wu Q, Swennes A, Tessier ME, Roberts P, Miyajima F, Savidge T,

Sorg JA. 2021. Bile acid-independent protection against *Clostridioides difficile* infection. 10.

PLoS Pathog 17:e1010015.

26.   Saenz C, Fang Q, Gnanasekaran T, Trammell SAJ, Buijink JA, Pisano P, Wierer M, Moens F,

Lengger B, Brejnrod A, Arumugam M. 2023. *Clostridium scindens* secretome suppresses

virulence gene expression of *Clostridioides difficile* in a bile acid-independent manner.

Microbiol Spectr 11:e03933-22.

27. Sievers S, Metzendorf NG, Dittmann S, Troitzsch D, Gast V, Tröger SM, Wolff C, Zühlke D,

Hirschfeld C, Schlüter R, Riedel K. 2019. Differential view on the bile acid stress response

of *Clostridioides difficile*. Front Microbiol 10:258.

28. Wilson KH, Freter R. 1986. Interaction of *Clostridium difficile* and *Escherichia coli* with

microfloras in continuous-flow cultures and gnotobiotic mice. Infect Immun 54:354–358.

29. Wilson KH, Perini F. 1988. Role of competition for nutrients in suppression of *Clostridium*

difficile by the colonic microflora. Infect Immun 56:2610–2614.

30. Engevik MA, Engevik AC, Engevik KA, Auchtung JM, Chang-Graham AL, Ruan W, Luna RA,

Hyser JM, Spinler JK, Versalovic J. 2021. Mucin-degrading microbes release

monosaccharides that chemoattract *Clostridioides difficile* and facilitate colonization of the

human intestinal mucus layer. ACS Infect Dis 7:1126–1142.

31. Janoir C, Deneve C, Bouttier S, Barbut F, Hoys S, Caleechum L, Chapeton-Montes D, Pereira

FC, Henriques AO, Collignon A, Monot M, Dupuy B. 2013. Adaptive strategies and

pathogenesis of *Clostridium difficile* from in vivo transcriptomics. Infect Immun 81:3757–

3769.

32. Jenior ML, Leslie JL, Young VB, Schloss PD. 2017. *Clostridium difficile* colonizes alternative

nutrient niches during infection across distinct murine gut microbiomes. mSystems

2:e00063-17.

33. Bouillaut L, Self WT, Sonenshein AL. 2013. Proline-dependent regulation of *Clostridium*

difficile Stickland metabolism. 4. J Bacteriol 195:844–854.

34. Pavao A, Graham M, Arrieta-Ortiz ML, Immanuel SRC, Baliga NS, Bry L. 2022. Reconsidering

the in vivo functions of *Clostridial* Stickland amino acid fermentations. Anaerobe

76:102600.

35. Robinson JI, Weir WH, Crowley JR, Hink T, Reske KA, Kwon JH, Burnham C-AD, Dubberke

ER, Mucha PJ, Henderson JP. 2019. Metabolomic networks connect host-microbiome

processes to human *Clostridioides difficile* infections. J Clin Invest 129:3792–3806.

36. Fletcher JR, Pike CM, Parsons RJ, Rivera AJ, Foley MH, McLaren MR, Montgomery SA,

Theriot CM. 2021. *Clostridioides difficile* exploits toxin-mediated inflammation to alter the

host nutritional landscape and exclude competitors from the gut microbiota. Nat Commun

12:462.

37. Robinson CD, Auchtung JM, Collins J, Britton RA. 2014. Epidemic *Clostridium difficile*

strains demonstrate increased competitive fitness compared to nonepidemic isolates.

Infect Immun 82:2815–2825.

38. Spinler JK, Auchtung J, Brown A, Boonma P, Oezguen N, Ross CL, Luna RA, Runge J,

Versalovic J, Peniche A, Dann SM, Britton RA, Haag A, Savidge TC. 2017. Next-generation

probiotics targeting *Clostridium difficile* through precursor-directed antimicrobial

biosynthesis. Infect Immun 85:e00303-17.

39. Auchtung JM, Preisner EC, Collins J, Lerma AI, Britton RA. 2020. Identification of simplified

microbial communities that inhibit *Clostridioides difficile* infection through

dilution/extinction. mSphere 5:e00387-20.

40.   Mahnic A, Auchtung JM, Poklar Ulrih N, Britton RA, Rupnik M. 2020. Microbiota in vitro

modulated with polyphenols shows decreased colonization resistance against

Clostridioides difficile but can neutralize cytotoxicity. Sci Rep 10:8358.

41.   Lopez CA, Beavers WN, Weiss A, Knippel RJ, Zackular JP, Chazin W, Skaar EP. 2019. The

immune protein Calprotectin impacts *Clostridioides difficile* metabolism through zinc

limitation. mBio 10:e02289-19.

42.   Collins J, Robinson C, Danhof H, Knetsch CW, van Leeuwen HC, Lawley TD, Auchtung JM,

Britton RA. 2018. Dietary trehalose enhances virulence of epidemic *Clostridium difficile*.

Nature 553:291–294.

43.   Wilson KH. 1983. Efficiency of various bile salt preparations for stimulation of *Clostridium*

difficile spore germination. J Clin Microbiol 18:1017–1019.

44.   Francis MB, Allen CA, Shrestha R, Sorg JA. 2013. Bile acid recognition by the *Clostridium*

difficile germinant receptor, CspC, is important for establishing infection. PLoS Pathog

9:e1003356.

45.   Zhang J, Chen L, Gomez-Simmonds A, Yin MT, Freedberg DE. 2022. Antibiotic-specific risk

for community-acquired *Clostridioides difficile* infection in the United States from 2008 to

2020. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 66:e01129-22.

46.   Brown KA, Khanafer N, Daneman N, Fisman DN. 2013. Meta-analysis of antibiotics and the

risk of community-associated *Clostridium difficile* infection. Antimicrob Agents Chemother

57:2326–2332.

47.   Song Z, Cai Y, Lao X, Wang X, Lin X, Cui Y, Kalavagunta PK, Liao J, Jin L, Shang J, Li J. 2019.

736   Taxonomic profiling and populational patterns of bacterial bile salt hydrolase (BSH) genes

737   based on worldwide human gut microbiome. Microbiome 7:9.

738   48.   Kim KH, Park D, Jia B, Baek JH, Hahn Y, Jeon CO. 2022. Identification and characterization

739   of major bile acid 7α-dehydroxylating bacteria in the human gut. mSystems 7:e00455-22.

740   49.   Auchtung JM, Robinson CD, Britton RA. 2015. Cultivation of stable, reproducible microbial

741   communities from different fecal donors using minibioreactor arrays (MBRAs).

742   Microbiome 3:42.

743   50.   Neu HC. 1974. Antimicrobial activity and human pharmacology of amoxicillin. J Infect Dis

744   129:S123–S131.

745   51.   Owen AW, Faragher EB. 1986. Biliary pharmacokinetics of ticarcillin and clavulanic acid. J

746   Antimicrob Chemother 17:65–70.

747   52.   Brogard J-M, Pinget M, Comte F, Adloff M, Lavillaureix J. 2009. Biliary excretion of cefaclor:

748   experimental and clinical study. Chemotherapy 28:189–199.

749   53.   Pletz MWR, Rau M, Bulitta J, De Roux A, Burkhardt O, Kruse G, Kurowski M, Nord CE, Lode

750   H. 2004. Ertapenem pharmacokinetics and impact on intestinal microflora, in comparison

751   to those of ceftriaxone, after multiple dosing in male and female volunteers. Antimicrob

752   Agents Chemother 48:3765–3772.

54.   Kager L, Liljeqvist L, Malmborg AS, Nord CE. 1981. Effect of clindamycin prophylaxis on the

colonic microflora in patients undergoing colorectal surgery. Antimicrob Agents

Chemother 20:736–740.

55.   Steinbakk M, Lingaas E, Carlstedt-Duke B, Høverstad T, Midtvedt A-C, Norin KE, Midtvedt

T. 1992. Faecal concentration of ten antibiotics and influence on some microflora-

associated characteristics (MACs). Microb Ecol Health Dis 5:269–276.

56.   Sears P, Crook DW, Louie TJ, Miller MA, Weiss K. 2012. Fidaxomicin attains high fecal

concentrations with minimal plasma concentrations following oral administration in

patients with *Clostridium difficile* infection. Clin Infect Dis 55:S116-120.

57.   Schloss PD, Westcott SL, Ryabin T, Hall JR, Hartmann M, Hollister EB, Lesniewski RA,

Oakley BB, Parks DH, Robinson CJ, Sahl JW, Stres B, Thallinger GG, Van Horn DJ, Weber CF.

2009. Introducing mothur: open-source, platform-independent, community-supported

software for describing and comparing microbial communities. Appl Environ Microbiol

75:7537–7541.

58.   Kozich JJ, Westcott SL, Baxter NT, Highlander SK, Schloss PD. 2013. Development of a dual-

index sequencing strategy and curation pipeline for analyzing amplicon sequence data on

the MiSeq Illumina sequencing platform. Appl Environ Microbiol 79:5112–5120.

59.   Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, Peplies J, Glöckner FO. 2013.

The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-

based tools. Nucleic Acids Res 41:D590–D596.

60.   Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. 1990. Basic local alignment search

tool. J Mol Biol 215:403–410.

61.   Horvath TD, Haidacher SJ, Oezguen N, Hoch KM, Auchtung JM, Haag AM. 2020.

Ruggedness testing of liquid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry system

components using microbiome-relevant methods and matrices. J Microbiol Methods

177:106020.

62.   Horvath TD, Haidacher SJ, Hoch KM, Auchtung JM, Haag AM. 2020. A high-throughput LC-

MS/MS method for the measurement of the bile acid/salt content in microbiome-derived

sample sets. MethodsX 7:100951.

63.   Engevik MA, Thapa S, Lillie IM, Yacyshyn MB, Yacyshyn B, Percy AJ, Chace D, Horvath TD.

2024. Repurposing dried blood spot device technology to examine bile acid profiles in

human dried fecal spot samples. Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol 326:G95–G106.

64.   Segata N, Izard J, Waldron L, Gevers D, Miropolsky L, Garrett WS, Huttenhower C. 2011.

Metagenomic biomarker discovery and explanation. Genome Biol 12:R60.