TITLE
Host and antibiotic jointly select for greater virulence in *Staphylococcus aureus*

AUTHORS
Michelle Su*[1], Kim L. Hoang*[1], McKenna Penley[2], Michelle H. Davis[1], Jennifer D. Gresham[2,3], Levi T. Morran[2], Timothy D. Read[1]

*these authors contributed equally

AFFILIATIONS
1. Emory University School of Medicine, Division of Infectious Diseases, Atlanta, Georgia, USA
2. Department of Biology, Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia, USA
3. Science Department, Penn State Scranton, Dunmore, Pennsylvania, USA

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR
TDR: tread@emory.edu

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
The authors are grateful for insightful discussion with members of the Read and Morran labs, and Shaun Brinsmade for reading the manuscript. We thank Carmen Alvarez, Jason Chen, and Emily Stevens for help with experimental protocols.

FUNDING
MS was supported by the Antimicrobial Resistance and Therapeutic Discovery Training Program funded by NIAID T32 award AI106699. TDR was supported by National Institutes of Health (NIH) AI139188 and AI158452. KLH and TDR were supported by the Office of Advanced Molecular Detection, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Cooperative Agreement Number CK22-2204 through contract 40500-050- 23234506 from the Georgia Department of Public Health. LTM was supported by a National Science Foundation Division of Environmental Biology (NSF-DEB) grant 1750553.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS
MS, LTM, and TDR conceptualized the project. MS, KLH, MP, MHD, and JDG conducted the experiments. KLH and MS analyzed the data and drafted the manuscript. All authors contributed to manuscript revision.

CONFLICTS OF INTERESTS
The authors declare no conflicts of interests.

ABSTRACT

Widespread antibiotic usage has resulted in the rapid evolution of drug-resistant bacterial pathogens and poses significant threats to public health. Resolving how pathogens respond to antibiotics under different contexts is critical for understanding disease emergence and evolution going forward. The impact of antibiotics has been demonstrated most directly through *in vitro* pathogen passaging experiments. Independent from antibiotic selection, interactions with hosts have also altered the evolutionary trajectories and fitness landscapes of pathogens, shaping infectious disease outcomes. However, it is unclear how interactions between hosts and antibiotics impact the evolution of pathogen virulence. Here, we evolved and re-sequenced *Staphylococcus aureus,* a major bacterial pathogen, varying exposure to host and antibiotics to tease apart the contributions of these selective pressures on pathogen adaptation. After 12 passages, *S. aureus* evolving in *Caenorhabditis elegans* nematodes exposed to a sub-minimum inhibitory concentration of antibiotic (oxacillin) became highly virulent, regardless of whether the ancestral pathogen was methicillin-resistant (MRSA) or methicillin-sensitive (MSSA). Host and antibiotic exposure selected for reduced drug susceptibility in MSSA lineages while increasing MRSA total growth outside hosts. We identified mutations in genes involved in complex regulatory networks linking virulence and metabolism, including *codY*, *agr*, and *gdpP*, suggesting that rapid adaptation to infect hosts may have pleiotropic effects. In particular, MSSA populations under selection from host and antibiotic accumulated mutations in the global regulator gene *codY*, which controls biofilm formation in *S. aureus.* These populations had indeed evolved more robust biofilms—a trait linked to both virulence and antibiotic resistance—suggesting evolution of one trait can confer multiple adaptive benefits. Despite evolving in similar environments, MRSA and MSSA populations proceeded on divergent evolutionary paths, with MSSA populations exhibiting more similarities across replicate populations. Our results underscore the importance of considering multiple and concurrent selective pressures as drivers of pervasive pathogen traits.

KEYWORDS

INTRODUCTION

Antibiotic resistance is a global crisis [1]. Pathogens that evolve resistance and are able to survive antibiotic therapy can go on to cause disease and transmit to other hosts; hence antibiotic resistance and virulence are intertwined. Selective pressures like antibiotic usage and host defenses have independently been shown to alter the evolution of pathogen traits [1–5]. However, pathogens face multiple selective pressures in their environment, and selection by concurrent forces can interact synergistically to alter evolutionary rates and trajectories relative to individual pressures alone [6,7]. It is unclear how virulence evolves in the face of simultaneous selective pressures and whether this trait is constrained or facilitated by antibiotic resistance. These dynamics are even less understood in the early stages of disease emergence, where pathogens face a different suite of selection dynamics than pathogens having reached equilibrium [8,9]. Identifying conditions under which antibiotic resistance and virulence evolve in novel host populations will shed light on how diseases emerge and potential mitigation measures.

The strength of selection impacts pathogen evolution [10–13]. While antibiotic therapy administers concentrations that should kill all pathogen cells, low concentrations of antibiotics (sub-minimum inhibitory concentration, or sub-MIC) exist in a variety of settings, including in natural environments (e.g., water bodies and soil) due to pollution and biological waste [1]. In the host, antibiotic concentrations can decline over time due to metabolism and barriers to absorption, and sub-MIC levels can arise as a result of pathogens attaining increased drug resistance [14–16]. Sub-MICs allow susceptible populations to continue dividing, affording opportunities for mutations conferring greater resistance to emerge [15]. Ultimately, selection by sub-MICs can lead to highly resistant pathogens [10,17], which tend to incur less fitness costs compared to those under selection by high antibiotic concentrations [18]. Importantly, mutations not related to antibiotic resistance can arise, such as those involved in adaptation to the growth environment [19]. Low concentrations of antibiotics can also alter expression of virulence factors *in vitro* across a broad range of pathogens [20–23], suggesting that they can affect virulence during infection. Sub-MIC antibiotics therefore have the potential to alter the early stages of disease emergence in host populations, particularly for those pathogens that can spend parts of their life history outside the host. However, there is a knowledge gap in the interaction between antibiotics and pathogen evolution *in vivo* [16].

The host can exert strong selection on pathogens, especially during the period when a new organism is infected (e.g., a zoonotic transition). Infection of new host individuals tends to bottleneck pathogen populations [24,25]. These bottlenecks can confer a fitness advantage to resistant bacteria in the face of low antibiotic concentrations [26]. In addition to defenses like the immune system, the host differs drastically in nutrient availability than rich media [16]. For example, *Staphylococcus aureus* passaged through macrophage cell lines had increased pathogen survival as well as resistance to antibiotics; these traits were lost when the pathogen was exposed to nutrient-rich media [27]. Similarly, the human defensive peptide b-defensin 3 can maintain reduced susceptibility of *S. aureus* to the antibiotic vancomycin [28]. While sub-MIC antibiotic exposure and host factors have been shown to independently shape pathogen evolution, it is unclear how the collective actions of both selective pressures affect the evolution of virulence and antibiotic resistance.

Staphylococcus aureus causes a variety of diseases, including skin and bone infection, food poisoning, and bacteremia across hospital and community settings [29]. In 2017, more than 119,000 bloodstream infections caused by *S. aureus* occurred in the United States with a mortality rate of 18% [30]. While methicillin-resistant (MRSA) and methicillin-sensitive (MSSA) *S. aureus* both produce similar levels of toxins, MRSA populations have maintained virulence while becoming increasingly multi-drug resistant [31]. Treatment of MRSA with beta-lactam antibiotics

119 can generate adverse responses from the immune system [32]. Furthermore, sub-MIC
120 concentrations of these antibiotics can affect *S. aureus* virulence by increasing production of
121 toxins and adhesion molecules *in vitro* [33]. Thus, interactions between antibiotics and host
122 factors have the potential to drive *S. aureus* virulence evolution.
123
Experimental evolution has been used to elucidate how different selective pressures impact
pathogen evolution. *In vitro* studies have yielded insights into the phenotypes and genetic loci
generated by longer-term antibiotic selection through passaging experiments lasting hundreds of
generations [10,18,28,34]. Conversely, *in vivo* studies have focused on transmitting pathogens
through individual hosts for a single to a handful of passages [26,35,36]. Experimental evolution
in hosts nonetheless remains severely underutilized but has considerable potential to address
key questions regarding the impact of host populations on the evolution of virulence and antibiotic
resistance [16]. In this study, we take advantage of the suitability of a multicellular host,
Caenorhabditis elegans nematodes, to study designs of high replication across an appreciable
temporal scale. The *S. aureus* used here was originally isolated from a skin and soft tissue
infection of a human inmate and thus is a novel pathogen to *C. elegans*. Nonetheless, *S. aureus*
can kill nematodes by colonizing the host intestine and lysing cells, inducing expression of
defense genes in nematodes with roles conserved in humans [37]. Virulence screens in *C.*
elegans using *S. aureus* transposon libraries also showed overlapping results to other infection
models [38,39], with the degree of *S. aureus* virulence in *C. elegans* reflecting disease severity of
human infections [40,41]. Experimentally evolving *S. aureus* in *C. elegans* thus allows us to track
the early stages of virulence and antibiotic resistance evolution in novel host populations with the
potential to identify clinically-relevant genomic regions underlying evolved traits.
142
Here, we directly test the impact of host and sub-MIC antibiotic exposure on pathogen evolution.
Selection exerted by two concurrent forces may impede the pathogen's response to one or both
forces [6]. Adaptation may require resources to be expended toward either virulence or antibiotic
resistance, leading to a trade-off between these traits [42]. Alternatively, weaker selection from
sub-MIC antibiotics may interact synergistically with hosts and facilitate the evolution or
maintenance of high virulence and antibiotic resistance. Sub-MIC antibiotics can favor no-cost
mutations [18], wherein pathogens can rapidly adapt without affecting other traits [8]. Because
emerging pathogens tend to be far from the optimum of the fitness landscape, we expect
pleiotropic or large-effect mutations to play a role [43]. We took advantage of the tractability of the
system to determine how virulence, fitness, and antibiotic resistance are connected and how
multiple selective pressures shape the evolutionary trajectory of two *S. aureus* isolates differing
only in their antibiotic susceptibility.
155
Carriage of Staphylococcal cassette chromosome *mec* (SCC*mec*), which encodes *mecA* and
provides resistance against beta-lactam antibiotics, is a major mechanism for existing antibiotic
resistance in *S. aureus*. We passaged two *S. aureus* isogenic strains, one with existing resistance
(*mecA+*, MRSA) and one with a transposon insertion in *mecA* (*mecA-*, MSSA) under selection by
C. elegans and a sub-MIC level of oxacillin, a beta-lactam antibiotic that has replaced methicillin
as a therapy for Staphylococcal infections. We then quantified the ability of evolved pathogens to
kill hosts as the metric for virulence. We also ascertained whether populations maintained their
ability to hemolyze red blood cells—an indicator of virulence expression in both humans and
nematodes. Because growth outside the host is important for transmission of opportunistic
pathogens, we quantified the *in vitro* growth and MIC of evolved pathogens. Finally, we identify
mutations potentially underlying evolved traits.
167

RESULTS
Host and sub-MIC antibiotic exposure selected for the greatest virulence in both MRSA and MSSA.

We experimentally evolved two *S. aureus* isogenic variants of USA300 JE2 [44], MRSA and MSSA, with or without a host and sub-MIC antibiotic exposure. The ancestral MRSA and MSSA isolates did not differ in terms of total growth without oxacillin, but exhibited a slight decline in sub-MIC oxacillin (Figures 1A and 1B; χ_1^2 = 6.39, P = 0.01). For each ancestor, we passaged six independently evolving populations under each condition 12 times, for a total of 48 evolved *S. aureus* populations (Figure 1C).

Figure 1. Experimental evolution design. A) Growth curves and B) total growth of ancestral
MRSA and MSSA populations *in vitro* with and without sub-MIC oxacillin. Different letters
indicate significant differences. C) MRSA and MSSA were passaged 12 times with or without
hosts, in the presence or absence of a sub-MIC of the antibiotic oxacillin. Each treatment
consisted of six independently evolving replicate populations. Experimental evolution treatment
abbreviations are indicated in the purple and yellow boxes. Error bars indicate standard errors.
186
To assess the changes in virulence of evolved *S. aureus*, we measured the mortality of *C. elegans*
infected with evolved pathogens. While the MRSA and MSSA ancestors caused similar levels of
host mortality (dotted and dashed lines in Figure 2A), there was a significant treatment effect for
evolved pathogens (Figure 2A, χ^2_7 = 460.43, P < 0.001). For the MRSA genotype, host and
oxacillin exposure selected for the greatest virulence (P < 0.001 for all Tukey's post-hoc tests of
+host+ox *vs*. other treatments). Conversely, pathogens evolved in the absence of either pressure
exhibited attenuated virulence (-host-ox *vs.* +host-ox: P < 0.001; -host-ox *vs.* -host+ox: P < 0.001).
These populations also had significantly greater variance (Levene's test for homogeneity of
variance $F_{3,20}$ = 4.06, P = 0.021) compared to those under selection from host and oxacillin
(Tukey's post-hoc test P = 0.026), and those under solely host selection (P = 0.045). For MSSA,
host and oxacillin exposure similarly favored greater virulence over the other three conditions (P
< 0.001 for all Tukey's post-hoc tests of +host+ox *vs*. other treatments). There was no difference
between variances (Levene's test for homogeneity of variance $F_{3,20}$ = 0.99, P = 0.417).
200
We also characterized the hemolytic activity of evolved populations, which correlates with the
ability to secrete extracellular toxins and virulence [45]. At least one population from most
treatments had lost the ancestral ability to hemolyze sheep's blood (Figure 2B). Sub-MIC oxacillin
maintained hemolytic activity (χ^2_1 = 5.82, P = 0.016), suggesting that constant exposure to low
concentrations of oxacillin favored retention of extracellular toxicity. While hemolysis was not
necessary for increased host-killing, this ability was correlated with greater nematode mortality
(Figure 2C; Kruskal-Wallis χ^2_1 = 3.97, P = 0.046). As virulence was still heightened in pathogens
unable to destroy red blood cells (e.g., MSSA pathogens evolving without host or oxacillin caused
greater than 90% mean mortality despite none being hemolysis-positive), other virulence factors
may be compensating for the absence of hemolysis.
211

Figure 2. Evolution of virulence is facilitated by exposure to both host and sub-MIC antibiotic. A) Virulence in terms of *C. elegans* mortality. Dashed lines indicate respective ancestral virulence. Different letters indicate significant differences. B) Virulence in terms of the ability to hemolyze sheep's blood. The y-axis indicates the number of evolved populations for each category. C). Host mortality from A) grouped by hemolysis status in B). Error bars indicate standard errors. *P < 0.05

Host and sub-MIC antibiotic promoted growth of MRSA outside hosts and reduced drug susceptibility in MSSA.

We measured the *in vitro* growth of evolved populations to evaluate how pathogen fitness outside the host had been impacted. In media without oxacillin, there were no significant differences in total growth between treatments (Figure 3A; χ_7^2 = 9.24, P = 0.24). However, in sub-MIC oxacillin, MRSA populations under selection from both pressures exhibited the greatest growth (Figure 3B; χ_7^2 = 106.16, P < 0.001), with some achieving more growth than those in the absence of oxacillin. Similarly, MSSA populations exposed to host and sub-MIC oxacillin exhibited a moderate increase in growth compared to other combinations of selective pressures.

We then determined the MICs of evolved populations to ascertain how host and sub-MIC exposure affected the evolution and maintenance of antibiotic resistance. For the MRSA genotype, all but two populations retained the ancestral level of oxacillin resistance (16ug/mL oxacillin; Figure 3C). During evolution in hosts without antibiotic selection, two populations lost their resistance and exhibited similar susceptibility as the MSSA ancestor (0.25ug/mL). For the

MSSA genotype, host and oxacillin exposure selected for decreased antibiotic sensitivity (Fisher's exact test P < 0.001; pairwise post-hoc P < 0.05 for +host+ox *vs.* all other treatments), up to 8-fold the ancestral MIC. These results suggested sub-MIC exposure combined with host factors potentiated the increase in antibiotic resistance in MSSA. One population under selection from solely the host also had an increased MIC, supporting previous evidence showing non-antibiotic selective pressures, such as a host in our study, can select for reduced antibiotic susceptibility [46].

Figure 3. **Host and sub-MIC antibiotic selection facilitated pathogen growth in antibiotics**. Pathogen *in vitro* growth A) without oxacillin and B) in sub-MIC oxacillin. Different letters indicate significant differences. C). Oxacillin MIC of evolved populations. The y-axis indicates the number of evolved populations for each category. Error bars indicate standard errors. **P < 0.01

Parallel evolution of regulators of virulence and antibiotic resistance across evolved populations.

We conducted whole-genome sequencing of populations to identify mutations arisen from host and antibiotic selection. Below we focus on mutations that had swept to fixation (Figure 4A); Figures S1 and S2 summarize mutations that were below 100% frequency in each population. Populations evolved from the MSSA ancestor had significantly fewer mutations (excluding those intergenic or synonymous) than MRSA populations (Figure S3; χ_1^2 = 5.28, P = 0.022). Sub-MIC oxacillin selection also resulted in more mutations (χ_1^2 = 5.92, P = 0.015).

Between pathogens with the highest virulence—those under selection from both selective pressures—populations arisen from MRSA had mutations in 25 genes and intergenic regions, while those from MSSA had mutations in 12 genes and intergenic regions. Both treatments had

mutations in virulence regulators *codY* [47] and *saeRS* [48] suggesting some shared pathways to
heightened virulence among the two treatments, but mutations in these genes did not occur
across all replicate populations. These treatments also had mutations in *gdpP* and *pbpA*, which
have been implicated in resistance to beta-lactam antibiotics [49,50], with *gdpP* playing a role in
MSSA resistance to oxacillin in particular [51]. Five out of six populations evolved from the MSSA
ancestor had a mutation in either gene, which may have contributed to the reduced oxacillin
sensitivity in these populations.
270
Regulatory genes were enriched with mutations (Figure 4A; one-sample Poisson test P < 0.001
for MRSA and MSSA genotypes). These included *agr*, *saeRS,* and *codY*. *agr* is a quorum sensor
that regulates the expression of virulence factors [52]. Out of the 22 mutations in *agr* (15 in *agrA*
and seven in *agrC*), 14 arose from the MRSA ancestor, 18 arose in the absence of oxacillin
selection, and 10 arose under host selection. All 22 mutations were found in populations that have
lost the ability to hemolyze red blood cells. Three of four mutations in *saeRS*—another known
virulence regulator—were found in populations evolved from the MRSA ancestor. By contrast, of
the eight *codY* mutations, all were from host-associated populations, six were in populations
arisen from MSSA, and seven were from populations under oxacillin selection. In contrast to the
other two regulators, *codY* is a transcriptional repressor found in gram-positive bacteria that
controls virulence by monitoring nutrient levels in the environment [47].
282
More mutations were fixed in genes associated with resistance to beta-lactam antibiotics (*pbpA,*
pbpB, graSR, gdpP) [49,53] in populations evolved from MRSA (10 mutations) than those from
MSSA (5 mutations). Mutations in these genes only occurred in populations exposed to oxacillin.
Nine populations experienced large scale deletions that included the entire SCC*mec* cassette.
Five deletions only encompassed SCC*mec* (23.7 kb), and four deletions were much larger (54.7
kb) and included the Arginine Catabolic Mobile Element (ACME) [44]. Out of these nine
populations, six evolved from the MSSA ancestor, and seven are from host-associated
populations. *arcA*, part of the arginine-deiminase system encoded by ACME, also had a 99-base
pair deletion in one population evolved from the MRSA ancestor. Deletion of ACME has been
shown to enhance the competitive fitness of *S. aureus* USA300 *in vivo* [54]. The two MRSA
populations that lost their resistance (Figure 3C) had SCC*mec* deletions, suggesting that
resistance could be more costly when evolving in a host. In general, the loss of SCC*mec* and
ACME was associated with an increase in total growth from the ancestor outside the host (Figure
4B; one-sample t-test t = 2.73, df = 8, P = 0.026).
297
Mutations in other metabolic genes included those in *brnQ1, purR,* and *gpmA*. Sixteen of the 20
brnQ1 mutations were most common in populations that evolved in the absence of host selection,
and thus potentially resulting from adaptation to the environment outside the host. The other
mutations, however, were found in the pathogens under host selection and have well-known roles
in virulence [55,56]. Three of the four *purR* mutations were found in populations evolved from the
MRSA ancestor exposed to sub-MIC oxacillin, and both *gpmA* mutations were found in
populations evolved from the MSSA ancestor in the absence of oxacillin.
305

A

Tv

Extra

A B B C

A B B B

REGULATORY GENE

IMPLICATED IN VIRULENCE

IMPLICATED IN ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE

BC tra

murP
Na+/proline symporter
peptide ABC transporter substrate–binding protein
teichoic acid ABC transporter ATP–binding protein

NUMBER OF POPULATIONS

Cellular maintenance

N–acetylmuramoyl–L–alanine amidase
nusA
recA
rpoB

Mobile genetic element

ACME and SCCmec
SCCmec

+host +ox
+host -ox
-host +ox
-host -ox
+host +ox
+host -ox
-host +ox
-host -ox

MRSA   MSSA

B

CHANGE FROM ANCESTRAL GROWTH CURVE AREA

*

-20

without
sub–MIC
oxacillin

with
sub–MIC
oxacillin

IN VITRO GROWTH

C

CHANGE FROM ANCESTRAL PATHOGEN–INDUCED MORTALITY

-20

-40

***   **   *

agr *alr* *argR* *brnQ1* *codY* *gdpP* *graSR* *pbpA* *pbpB* *purR* *saeRS*

GENE

309
Figure 4. Regulatory genes likely played an important role in pathogen adaptation. A)
Mutations swept to fixation, excluding intergenic and synonymous mutations, grouped by
general function. The size of each point indicates how many populations had acquired at least
one mutation in the gene. Colored shapes next to genes indicate whether these genes are
regulatory or have been implicated in virulence or antibiotic resistance in the literature. B) *In*
vitro growth of populations with SCC*mec* and ACME deletions with or without sub-MIC oxacillin.
C) Change from ancestral pathogen-induced mortality *vs*. mutations. D) Hemolysis status *vs*.
mutations. E) Oxacillin MIC *vs*. mutations. F) Biofilm production of evolved populations. Different
letters indicate significant differences. The column widths in D and E corresponds to the number
of mutations. Error bars indicate standard errors. All evolved populations were sequenced
except for one population from the -host-ox treatment. *P < 0.05, **P < 0.01

321
Mutations in antibiotic resistance genes are associated with heightened virulence.
We correlated mutations arising in specific genes with measured traits to identify loci potentially
underlying evolved phenotypes. We focused on genes where two or more mutations (excluding
intergenic or synonymous mutations) had fixed during the experiment regardless of treatment
(Figure 4C). Mutations in three genes were associated with significant increases in virulence from
the ancestor: *codY* (one-sample t-test = 19.56, df = 7, P < 0.001), *gdpP* (one-sample t-test =
17.02, df = 3, P = 0.002), and *pbpA* (one-sample t-test = 7.54, df = 3, P = 0.012). Mutations in *agr*
in general were not associated with changes in overall virulence, but greater host mortality was
correlated with *agr* mutations arising from MSSA ancestor compared to the MRSA ancestor
(Wilcoxon rank sum exact test P = 0.045).

332
Mutations in specific genes had a significant association with the ability to hemolyze red blood
cells (Figure 4D; Fisher's exact test P < 0.001). There was a greater proportion of populations
with *agr* mutations unable to hemolyze red blood cells compared to *alr* (P = 0.036)*, argR* (P =
0.006)*, codY* (P = 0.005)*, gdpP* (P = 0.006)*,* and *purR* (P = 0.006). There were also significant
differences between the mutations associated with oxacillin resistance in populations evolved
from the MSSA ancestor (Figure 4E; Fisher's exact test P = 0.0015), where a greater proportion
of populations with mutations in *codY* had reduced oxacillin susceptibility compared to *brnQ1* (P
= 0.043). Exposure to oxacillin maintained hemolysis in evolved populations (Figure 2B),
suggesting low concentrations of oxacillin exerted negative selection on the *agr* locus.
342
Because mutations in *codY* appeared to be important for both virulence (Figure 4C) and antibiotic
resistance (Figure 4E), we hypothesized that traits controlled by *codY* were responsible for the
traits observed in MSSA populations under selection from both pressures. A potential mechanism
underlying changes in virulence and antibiotic sensitivity in MSSA may involve biofilm formation.
Biofilm is implicated in *S. aureus* pathogenesis as well as in dampening the efficacy of antibiotic
treatment [34]. In *C. elegans*, *S. aureus* biofilm enhances virulence and protects the pathogen
from host innate immune defenses [57]. Both sub-MIC level of beta-lactam antibiotics and null-
mutants of *codY* induce robust biofilm formation and hemolysis activity [14,58,59]. Taken
together, exposure to sub-MIC level of oxacillin and acquisition of potentially deleterious
mutations in *codY* may underlie both increased virulence and reduced antibiotic susceptibility.
Our findings partially supported this hypothesis: biofilm formation did not significantly differ for the
MRSA genotype (χ^2_3 = 7.24, P = 0.06). By contrast, biofilm production differed between treatments
for the MSSA genotype (Figure 4F; χ^2_3 = 17.91, P < 0.001), with populations exposed to both
selective pressures forming more biofilm than those evolved without host (Tukey's post-hoc test
P < 0.001) or either pressure (P = 0.014), but not those evolved in solely sub-MIC oxacillin (P =
0.095).
359
MRSA and MSSA exhibited divergent phenotypic and genomic evolution during
adaptation
We conducted principal component analysis on the evolved traits (virulence, growth in media with
or without sub-MIC oxacillin, and biofilm production) in MRSA and MSSA populations to determine
the impact of selective pressures on overall pathogen phenotypic evolution (Figures 5A and 5B).
We found a significant effect of treatment for the MRSA genotype (PERMANOVA $F_{(3,23)}$ = 8.40, r^2
= 0.557, P < 0.001), where populations exposed to host and sub-MIC oxacillin formed a distinct
cluster from all other treatments (P = 0.012 for all pairwise comparisons). The MSSA genotype
had a marginally non-significant effect of treatment (PERMANOVA $F_{(3,23)}$ = 2.14, r^2 = 0.243, P =
0.062). Populations evolved from the MRSA ancestor had similar trajectories for growth in sub-
MIC oxacillin and virulence, whereas biofilm production and virulence were more correlated for
populations evolved from the MSSA ancestor.
372
To determine how host and sub-MIC antibiotic shaped pathogen genomic evolution, we built
phylogenies using mutations that arose from the MRSA and MSSA ancestors (Figures 5C and
D). We compared Euclidean distances calculated from the frequency of each mutation to
determine the genetic distance from the ancestor—how fast each population was evolving—and
the genetic distance between populations within each treatment—how much each population had
diverged from one another [60,61]. There was no significant difference between treatments for
MRSA populations in terms of genetic distance to the ancestor (Figure S4A; $F_{(3,20)}$ = 2.39, P:
0.099), suggesting that populations generally exhibited similar evolutionary rates. By contrast,
MSSA populations had a significant effect of treatment (Figure S4B; $F_{(3,19)}$ = 10.44, P < 0.001),
where populations under selection from solely the host had greater genetic distance from the

ancestor than populations under selection from solely oxacillin (Tukey's post-hoc test P < 0.001)
or under neither selective pressure (P = 0.004).
385
Populations within each treatment tended to exhibit more genetic similarity for MSSA than for
MRSA (Figures 5C and 5D). For MRSA, treatments varied in how divergent populations were
(Figure S4C; Kruskal-Wallis χ^2_3 = 21.09, P < 0.001), where populations exposed to both selective
pressures diverged more than populations in the other three treatments (Dunn's post-hoc test P
< 0.05 for all pairwise comparisons). Likewise, populations within MSSA treatments also differed
in how much they varied genetically (Figure S4D; $F_{(3,51)}$ = 54.20, P < 0.001). Populations under
solely host selection had greater divergence than all other treatments (Tukey's post-hoc test P <
0.001 for all pairwise comparisons). By contrast, populations under selection solely from sub-MIC
oxacillin diverged the least from each other (P < 0.05 for all pairwise comparisons). These findings
altogether suggest that even concentrations well below the MIC differentially impacts sensitive
and resistant pathogens.
397
398

400
401   **Figure 5**. **MRSA and MSSA underwent distinct evolutionary trajectories.** Principal
402   component analysis of traits evolved from A) MRSA and B) MSSA ancestors. Phylogenetic tree
403   constructed from frequencies of mutations in populations evolving from C) MRSA and D) MSSA
404   ancestors. Scale bar indicates Euclidean distance.
405

DISCUSSION
While antibiotics have existed for millennia, the mass production and overuse of antibiotics by
humans in the last century have exerted unprecedented selection on pathogens unlike anything
they have experienced in nature [62]. In addition to antibiotics, pathogens face numerous
selective pressures such as host defenses and competitors [2,63,64]. Opportunistic pathogens
are especially likely to encounter diverse selective pressures due to their ability to proliferate
outside a host. In this study, we evolved *S. aureus* with or without pre-existing antibiotic resistance

under different combinations of host and sub-MIC antibiotics to explore the evolution of virulence and antibiotic resistance. Our experimental design allowed us to tease apart the contributions of the host, sub-MIC antibiotics, and their interaction to demonstrate that adaptation to novel hosts did not require trade-offs in pathogen traits. Indeed, selection from both host and antibiotics actually resulted in rapid pathogen adaptation, potentially creating the conditions under which a pathogen may emerge in new hosts.

Simultaneous selection from the host and sub-MIC antibiotic favored the greatest virulence and growth in antibiotics, indicating that interactions between these pressures can shape both traits. Sub-MIC antibiotics can facilitate adaptation to high drug concentrations and to the growth environment (e.g., media) [15,19]. At the cellular level, sub-MIC antibiotics can affect *S. aureus* by directly binding to virulence factors or modulating virulence regulators [14]. Exposure to sub-MIC can thus mediate traits involved in host infection such as virulence. Our results further provided evidence for potential links between responses to antibiotic selection and virulence. Mutations genes involved in resistance to antibiotics were correlated with increased virulence, suggesting that adaptation to antibiotics may allow for virulence to evolve. Furthermore, in the absence of oxacillin selection, populations lost their ability to hemolyze red blood cells, supporting previous findings that antibiotics can influence expression of virulence factors [14,15].

Likewise, host factors contributed to antibiotic resistance. All populations initially sensitive to oxacillin exhibited increased MICs when under selection from both host and sub-MIC oxacillin. One population evolving under selection from either solely sub-MIC antibiotics or solely the host exhibited decreased oxacillin sensitivity, which is consistent with previous studies examining hosts [26] and sub-MIC [10,19] exposure separately. The pathogens in these studies evolved for much longer than our study, suggesting that having a host accelerated the evolution of antibiotic resistance, potentially due to bottlenecks that favor resistant isolates [26]. Evolution in hosts also contributed to pathogen growth outside hosts, an important trait for opportunistic pathogens as persistence in the environment increases the likelihood of contact with new hosts. Ultimately, exposure to hosts and antibiotics together could create a feedback loop where both evolutionary pressures select for better adaptation in the other, resulting in highly virulent and resistant pathogens that can persist outside hosts.

Several mutations arose in genes with primary roles in metabolism, such as *codY*. It is becoming clear that pathogen metabolism plays a central role in its virulence [65,66] and antibiotic resistance [67]. For example, mutations in chromosomal- and plasmid-encoded metabolic genes are widely prevalent among *E. coli* strains and protect them against antibiotic challenges [68,69]. Furthermore, antibiotics can directly select for reduced metabolic rates to dampen the deleterious effects of drugs [69], and increased resistance is more likely to evolve at high nutrient concentrations [70]. Similarly, metabolic efficiency can alter virulence [65], while resource limitations can hinder the evolution of virulence [71]. In *S. aureus*, CodY de-represses expression of virulence factors under resource-depleted conditions in order to acquire nutrients through the lysing of host cells [47]. Our genomic data were consistent with the observation that *codY* may be mediating virulence through control of *agr*: MSSA populations under selection from both host and sub-MIC oxacillin exhibited the greatest virulence and was one of the two treatments without mutations in *agr*. These results suggested that the *codY* mutations in these populations may be deleterious, rendering CodY less efficient in repressing *agr*-mediated virulence as a result. As resources likely differ in abundance and type between hosts and media, our findings illustrated the importance of taking into consideration the environment in which pathogens evolve when evaluating traits of interest.

Regulatory genes in general acquired more mutations than by chance. This finding supported
previous work showing that regulatory elements were more likely to acquire phenotype-altering
mutations, especially in negative regulators (e.g., *codY*) [72]. Pleiotropic genes like regulators
may increase the capacity to adapt to multiple environments. Because *C. elegans* is a novel host
to *S. aureus*, selection is more likely to act on genes that have large initial gains in the fitness
landscape, such as those that have pleiotropic effects [43]. Indeed, mutations in several metabolic
regulators (*codY, purR, gpmA*) and virulence regulators (*saeRS*) were mainly associated with
host infection. The resulting phenotypes of these mutations, such as increased biofilm production,
can then confer multiple benefits like increased virulence and antibiotic resistance. While host
and sub-MIC oxacillin selection favored robust biofilms, we also found that oxacillin by itself also
increased biofilm formation, suggesting low antibiotic concentrations contributed significantly to
the evolution of drug-sensitive populations. The loci underlying biofilm formation may be different
in these two treatments, since mutations in *codY* did not appear in populations under solely
oxacillin selection (biofilm is a polygenic trait in *S. aureus* [73]). Changes in genes of large effects
like global regulators can thus act as mediators between different traits that altogether allow the
pathogen to rapidly adapt to new and stressful environments.
479
Antibiotic resistance did not impede the evolution of virulence. Antibiotic resistance tends to be
costly in the absence of antibiotics; this cost can subsequently constrain evolution of traits
requiring cellular resources, such as virulence [42]. However, mutations conferring resistance can
have little to no costs, depending on the pathogen species and drugs, and costs can be offset by
compensatory mutations [74]. Sub-MIC levels favor low-cost mutations [18], therefore virulence
and antibiotic resistance may not trade-off during disease emergence [8]. Virulence may
alternatively be costly in the presence of antibiotic resistance—populations evolved from the
MRSA ancestor without either selective pressure exhibited the lowest virulence. The
corresponding MSSA populations did not have a similar decline in virulence, suggesting that
relaxed selection attenuated virulence for populations with existing resistance.
490
Recent work has shown that diverse genotypes of one pathogen species converge on similar
phenotypes when facing similar selective pressures [75]. Here, we showed that antibiotic
resistance status can lead otherwise isogenic pathogens to use different adaptive strategies.
Initially susceptible pathogens, facing novel selection from host and antibiotics, exhibited reduced
phenotypic and genomic variation over evolutionary time and thus may have had a limited number
of pathways to adapt to new environments. By contrast, resistant populations had greater
variance and thus may have had more routes to utilize. Overall, the potential for low-cost [8,18]
and pleiotropic mutations [43] may have created ideal conditions for a novel pathogen to establish
in host populations regardless of its susceptibility to antibiotics. Our work demonstrated that
responding to multiple pressures can result in rapid adaptation to new hosts and even evolution
of traits not under selection, emphasizing the importance of non-canonical pathways (e.g.,
metabolism) in shaping these traits. Integrating multiple traits, such as virulence, antibiotic
resistance, and fitness may be critical in identifying the factors that facilitate host shifts and
persistence of drug-resistant pathogens.

REFERENCES

1. Larsson DGJ, Flach CF. Antibiotic resistance in the environment. Nature Reviews Microbiology. Nature Research; 2022. pp. 257–269. doi:10.1038/s41579-021-00649-x

2. Hoang KL, Read TD, King KC. Incomplete immunity in a natural animal-microbiota interaction selects for higher pathogen virulence. Curr Biol. 2024;34: 1–7.

3. Kubinak JL, Ruff JS, Hyzer CW, Slev PR, Potts WK. Experimental viral evolution to specific host MHC genotypes reveals fitness and virulence trade-offs in alternative MHC types. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2012;109: 3422–3427. doi:10.1073/pnas.1112633109

4. Herren CM, Baym M. Decreased thermal niche breadth as a trade-off of antibiotic resistance. ISME J. 2022;16: 1843–1852. doi:10.1038/s41396-022-01235-6

5. Toprak E, Veres A, Michel JB, Chait R, Hartl DL, Kishony R. Evolutionary paths to antibiotic resistance under dynamically sustained drug selection. Nat Genet. 2012;44: 101–105. doi:10.1038/ng.1034

6. Merlo LMF, Sprouffske K, Howard TC, Gardiner KL, Caulin AF, Blum SM, et al. Application of simultaneous selective pressures slows adaptation. Evol Appl. 2020;13: 1615–1625. doi:10.1111/eva.13062

7. Sharma M, Quader S, Guttal V, Isvaran K. The enemy of my enemy: multiple interacting selection pressures lead to unexpected anti-predator responses. Oecologia. 2020;192: 1–12. doi:10.1007/s00442-019-04552-4

8. Visher E, Evensen C, Guth S, Lai E, Norfolk M, Rozins C, et al. The three Ts of virulence evolution during zoonotic emergence. Proc R Soc B Biol Sci. 2021;288. doi:10.1098/rspb.2021.0900

9. Day T, Kennedy DA, Read AF, Gandon S. Pathogen evolution during vaccination campaigns. PLoS Biol. 2022;20: e3001804. doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.3001804

10. Wistrand-Yuen E, Knopp M, Hjort K, Koskiniemi S, Berg OG, Andersson DI. Evolution of high-level resistance during low-level antibiotic exposure. Nat Commun. 2018;9. doi:10.1038/s41467-018-04059-1

11. Oz T, Guvenek A, Yildiz S, Karaboga E, Tamer YT, Mumcuyan N, et al. Strength of selection pressure is an important parameter contributing to the complexity of antibiotic resistance evolution. Mol Biol Evol. 2014;31: 2387–2401. doi:10.1093/molbev/msu191

12. Mahrt N, Tietze A, Künzel S, Franzenburg S, Barbosa C, Jansen G, et al. Bottleneck size and selection level reproducibly impact evolution of antibiotic resistance. Nat Ecol Evol. 2021;53: 1275. doi:10.1038/s41588-021-00939-3

13. Cisneros-Mayoral S, Graña-Miraglia L, Perez-Morales D, Peña-Miller R, Fuentes-Hernández A. Evolutionary History and Strength of Selection Determine the Rate of Antibiotic Resistance Adaptation. Mol Biol Evol. 2022;39. doi:10.1093/molbev/msac185

14. Chen J, Zhou H, Huang J, Zhang R, Rao X. Virulence alterations in staphylococcus aureus upon treatment with the sub-inhibitory concentrations of antibiotics. Journal of Advanced Research. Elsevier B.V.; 2021. pp. 165–175. doi:10.1016/j.jare.2021.01.008

15. Andersson DI, Hughes D. Microbiological effects of sublethal levels of antibiotics. Nature Reviews Microbiology. Nature Publishing Group; 2014. pp. 465–478. doi:10.1038/nrmicro3270

16. Windels EM, Van Den Bergh B, Michiels J. Bacteria under antibiotic attack: Different strategies for evolutionary adaptation. PLoS Pathog. 2020;16: 1–8. doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1008431

17. Gullberg E, Cao S, Berg OG, Ilbäck C, Sandegren L, Hughes D, et al. Selection of resistant bacteria at very low antibiotic concentrations. PLoS Pathog. 2011;7: 1–9. doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1002158

18. Westhoff S, Van Leeuwe TM, Qachach O, Zhang Z, Van Wezel GP, Rozen DE. The evolution of no-cost resistance at sub-MIC concentrations of streptomycin in Streptomyces coelicolor. ISME J. 2017;11: 1168–1178. doi:10.1038/ismej.2016.194

19. Pereira C, Warsi OM, Andersson DI. Pervasive Selection for Clinically Relevant
Resistance and Media Adaptive Mutations at Very Low Antibiotic Concentrations. Mol
Biol Evol. 2023;40: 1–13.
20. Braga PC, Dal Sasso M, Sala MT. Sub-MIC concentrations of cefodizime interfere with
various factors affecting bacterial virulence. J Antimicrob Chemother. 2000;45: 15–25.
doi:10.1093/jac/45.1.15
21. El-Houssaini HH, Elnabawy OM, Nasser HA, Elkhatib WF. Influence of subinhibitory
antifungal concentrations on extracellular hydrolases and biofilm production by Candida
albicans recovered from Egyptian patients. BMC Infect Dis. 2019;19: 1–9.
doi:10.1186/s12879-019-3685-0
22. Khan F, Lee JW, Javaid A, Park SK, Kim YM. Inhibition of biofilm and virulence properties
of Pseudomonas aeruginosa by sub-inhibitory concentrations of aminoglycosides. Microb
Pathog. 2020;146. doi:10.1016/j.micpath.2020.104249
23. Haddadin RNS, Saleh S, Al-Adham ISI, Buultjens TEJ, Collier PJ. The effect of
subminimal inhibitory concentrations of antibiotics on virulence factors expressed by
Staphylococcus aureus biofilms. J Appl Microbiol. 2010;108: 1281–1291.
doi:10.1111/j.1365-2672.2009.04529.x
24. Klemm EJ, Gkrania-Klotsas E, Hadfield J, Forbester JL, Harris SR, Hale C, et al.
Emergence of host-adapted Salmonella Enteritidis through rapid evolution in an
immunocompromised host. Nat Microbiol. 2016;1: 1–6. doi:10.1038/nmicrobiol.2015.23
25. Bacigalupe R, Tormo-Mas MÁ, Penadés JR, Ross Fitzgerald J. A multihost bacterial
pathogen overcomes continuous population bottlenecks to adapt to new host species. Sci
Adv. 2019;5: 1–15. doi:10.1126/sciadv.aax0063
26. McVicker G, Prajsnar TK, Williams A, Wagner NL, Boots M, Renshaw SA, et al. Clonal
Expansion during Staphylococcus aureus Infection Dynamics Reveals the Effect of
Antibiotic Intervention. PLoS Pathog. 2014;10. doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1003959
27. Alves J, Vrieling M, Ring N, Yebra G, Pickering A, Prajsnar TK, et al. Experimental
evolution of Staphylococcus aureus in macrophages: dissection of a conditional adaptive
trait promoting intracellular survival. Projan SJ, editor. MBio. 2024.
doi:10.1128/mbio.00346-24
28. Fait A, Andersson DI, Ingmer H. Evolutionary history of Staphylococcus aureus
influences antibiotic resistance evolution. Curr Biol. 2023;33: 3389-3397.e5.
doi:10.1016/j.cub.2023.06.082
29. Tsouklidis N, Kumar R, Heindl SE, Soni R, Khan S. Understanding the Fight Against
Resistance: Hospital-Acquired Methicillin-Resistant Staphylococcus Aureus vs.
Community-Acquired Methicillin-Resistant Staphylococcus Aureus. Cureus. 2020.
doi:10.7759/cureus.8867
30. Kourtis AP, Hatfield ; Kelly, Baggs J, Mu ; Yi, See I, Epson E, et al. Vital signs:
epidemiology and recent trends in methicillin-resistant and in methicillin-susceptible
Staphylococcus aureus bloodstream infections-United States. Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.
2019;68: 214–219. Available: https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr
31. Cameron DR, Howden BP, Peleg AY. The interface between antibiotic resistance and
virulence in staphylococcus aureus and its impact upon clinical outcomes. Clin Infect Dis.
2011;53: 576–582. doi:10.1093/cid/cir473
32. Müller S, Wolf AJ, Iliev ID, Berg BL, Underhill DM, Liu GY. Poorly cross-linked
peptidoglycan in MRSA due to mecA induction activates the inflammasome and
exacerbates immunopathology. Cell Host Microbe. 2015;18: 604–612.
doi:10.1016/j.chom.2015.10.011
33. Hodille E, Rose W, Diep BA, Goutelle S, Lina G, Dumitrescu O. The Role of Antibiotics in
Modulating Virulence in Staphylococcus aureus. 2017. doi:10.1128/CMR
34. Long DR, Penewit K, Lo HY, Almazan J, Holmes EA, Bryan AB, et al. In Vitro Selection

Identifies Staphylococcus aureus Genes Influencing Biofilm Formation. Infect Immun.
2023;91. doi:10.1128/iai.00538-22

35. Erler S, Cotter SC, Freitak D, Koch H, Palmer-Young EC, de Roode JC, et al. Insects'
essential role in understanding and broadening animal medication. Trends Parasitol.
2024;40: 338–349. doi:10.1016/j.pt.2024.02.003

36. Higazy D, Pham AD, van Hasselt C, Høiby N, Jelsbak L, Moser C, et al. In vivo evolution
of antimicrobial resistance in a biofilm model of Pseudomonas aeruginosa lung infection .
ISME J. 2024;18: 1–12. doi:10.1093/ismejo/wrae036

37. Irazoqui JE, Troemel ER, Feinbaum RL, Luhachack LG, Cezairliyan BO, Ausubel FM.
Distinct pathogenesis and host responses during infection of C. elegans by P. aeruginosa
and S. aureus. PLoS Pathog. 2010;6: 1–24. doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1000982

38. Begun J, Sifri CD, Goldman S, Calderwood SB, Ausubel FM. Staphylococcus aureus
virulence factors identified by using a high-throughput Caenorhabditis elegans-killing
model. Infect Immun. 2005;73: 872–877. doi:10.1128/IAI.73.2.872-877.2005

39. Bae T, Banger AK, Wallace A, Glass EM, Åslund F, Schneewind O, et al. Staphylococcus
aureus virulence genes identified by bursa aurealis mutagenesis and nematode killing.
2004. Available: https://www.pnas.org

40. Wu K, Conly J, McClure JA, Elsayed S, Louie T, Zhang K. Caenorhabditis elegans as a
host model for community-associated methicillin-resistant Staphylococcus aureus. Clin
Microbiol Infect. 2010;16: 245–254. doi:10.1111/j.1469-0691.2009.02765.x

41. Wu K, Zhang K, McClure J, Zhang J, Schrenzel J, Francois P, et al. A correlative analysis
of epidemiologic and molecular characteristics of methicillin-resistant Staphylococcus
aureus clones from diverse geographic locations with virulence measured by a
Caenorhabditis elegans host model. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis. 2013;32: 33–42.
doi:10.1007/s10096-012-1711-x

42. Ferenci T. Trade-off mechanisms shaping the diversity of bacteria. Trends Microbiol.
2016;24: 209–223. doi:10.1016/j.tim.2015.11.009

43. Bomblies K, Peichel CL. Genetics of adaptation. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2022;119.
doi:10.1073/pnas.2122152119

44. Diep BA, Gill SR, Chang RF, Phan TH Van, Chen JH, Davidson MG, et al. Complete
genome sequence of USA300, an epidemic clone of community-acquired meticillin-
resistant Staphylococcus aureus. Lancet. 2006;367: 731–739. doi:10.1016/S0140-
6736(06)68231-7

45. Cheung GYC, Duong AC, Otto M. Direct and synergistic hemolysis caused by
Staphylococcus phenol-soluble modulins: Implications for diagnosis and pathogenesis.
Microbes Infect. 2012;14: 380–386. doi:10.1016/j.micinf.2011.11.013

46. Koch G, Yepes A, Förstner KU, Wermser C, Stengel ST, Modamio J, et al. Evolution of
resistance to a last-resort antibiotic in staphylococcus aureus via bacterial competition.
Cell. 2014;158: 1060–1071. doi:10.1016/j.cell.2014.06.046

47. Brinsmade SR. CodY, a master integrator of metabolism and virulence in Gram-positive
bacteria. Current Genetics. Springer Verlag; 2017. pp. 417–425. doi:10.1007/s00294-
016-0656-5

48. Montgomery CP, Boyle-Vavra S, Daum RS. Importance of the global regulators agr and
SaeRS in the pathogenesis of CA-MRSA USA300 infection. PLoS One. 2010;5: 1–9.
doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0015177

49. Bilyk BL, Panchal V V., Tinajero-Trejo M, Hobbs JK, Foster SJ. An interplay of multiple
positive and negative factors governs methicillin resistance in *Staphylococcus aureus*.
Microbiol Mol Biol Rev. 2022;86. doi:10.1128/mmbr.00159-21

50. Poon R, Basuino L, Satishkumar N, Chatterjee A, Mukkayyan N, Buggeln E, et al. Loss of
GdpP function in *Staphylococcus aureus* leads to β-lactam tolerance and enhanced
evolution of β-lactam resistance. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 2022;66.

doi:10.1128/AAC.01431-21

51. Giulieri SG, Guérillot R, Kwong JC, Monk IR, Hayes AS, Daniel D, et al. Comprehensive
genomic investigation of adaptive mutations driving the low-level oxacillin resistance
phenotype in staphylococcus aureus. MBio. 2020;11: 1–18. doi:10.1128/mBio.02882-20

52. Novick RP. Autoinduction and signal transduction in the regulation of staphylococcal
virulence. Mol Microbiol. 2003;48: 1429–1449. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2958.2003.03526.x

53. Meehl M, Herbert S, Götz F, Cheung A. Interaction of the GraRS two-component system
with the VraFG ABC transporter to support vancomycin-intermediate resistance in
Staphylococcus aureus. Antimicrob Agents Chemother. 2007;51: 2679–2689.
doi:10.1128/AAC.00209-07

54. Diep BA, Stone GG, Basuino L, Graber CJ, Miller A, Des Etages SA, et al. The arginine
catabolic mobile element and staphylococcal chromosomal cassette mec linkage:
Convergence of virulence and resistance in the USA300 clone of methicillin-resistant
Staphylococcus aureus. J Infect Dis. 2008;197: 1523–1530. doi:10.1086/587907

55. Radin JN, Kelliher JL, Solórzano PKP, Grim KP, Ramezanifard R, Slauch JM, et al.
Metal-independent variants of phosphoglycerate mutase promote resistance to nutritional
immunity and retention of glycolysis during infection. PLoS Pathog. 2019;15: 1–21.
doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1007971

56. Sause WE, Balasubramanian D, Irnov I, Copin R, Sullivan MJ, Sommerfield A, et al. The
purine biosynthesis regulator PurR moonlights as a virulence regulator in Staphylococcus
aureus. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2019;116: 13563–13572.
doi:10.1073/pnas.1904280116

57. Begun J, Gaiani JM, Rohde H, Mack D, Calderwood SB, Ausubel FM, et al.
Staphylococcal biofilm exopolysaccharide protects against Caenorhabditis elegans
immune defenses. PLoS Pathog. 2007;3: 526–540. doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.0030057

58. Kuroda H, Kuroda M, Cui L, Hiramatsu K. Subinhibitory concentrations of β-lactam
induce haemolytic activity in Staphylococcus aureus through the SaeRS two-component
system. FEMS Microbiol Lett. 2007;268: 98–105. doi:10.1111/j.1574-6968.2006.00568.x

59. Majerczyk CD, Sadykov MR, Luong TT, Lee C, Somerville GA, Sonenshein AL.
Staphylococcus aureus CodY negatively regulates virulence gene expression. J
Bacteriol. 2008;190: 2257–2265. doi:10.1128/JB.01545-07

60. Ford SA, Williams D, Paterson S, King KC. Co-evolutionary dynamics between a
defensive microbe and a pathogen driven by fluctuating selection. Mol Ecol. 2017;26:
1778–1789. doi:10.1111/mec.13906

61. Betts A, Gray C, Zelek M, Maclean RC, King KC. High parasite diversity accelerates host
adaptation and diversification. Science (80-). 2018;360: 907–911.

62. Spagnolo F, Trujillo M, Dennehy JJ. Why do antibiotics exist? MBio. 2021;12.
doi:10.1128/mBio.01966-21

63. Cobey S. Pathogen evolution and the immunological niche. Ann N Y Acad Sci.
2014;1320: 1–15. doi:10.1111/nyas.12493

64. Bashey F. Within-host competitive interactions as a mechanism for the maintenance of
parasite diversity. Philos Trans R Soc B Biol Sci. 2015;370. doi:10.1098/rstb.2014.0301

65. Lindsay RJ, Holder PJ, Talbot NJ, Gudelj I. Metabolic efficiency reshapes the seminal
relationship between pathogen growth rate and virulence. Ecol Lett. 2023;26: 896–907.
doi:10.1111/ele.14218

66. Feinbaum RL, Urbach JM, Liberati NT, Djonovic S, Adonizio A, Carvunis AR, et al.
Genome-wide identification of Pseudomonas aeruginosa virulence-related genes using a
Caenorhabditis elegans infection model. PLoS Pathog. 2012;8: 11.
doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1002813

67. Zampieri M, Enke T, Chubukov V, Ricci V, Piddock L, Sauer U. Metabolic constraints on
the evolution of antibiotic resistance. Mol Syst Biol. 2017;13: 1–14.

doi:10.15252/msb.20167028

68.   Palomino A, Gewurz D, DeVine L, Zajmi U, Moralez J, Abu-Rumman F, et al. Metabolic
genes on conjugative plasmids are highly prevalent in Escherichia coli and can protect
against antibiotic treatment. ISME J. 2023;17: 151–162. doi:10.1038/s41396-022-01329-
1

69.   Lopatkin AJ, Bening SC, Manson AL, Stokes JM, Kohanski MA, Badran AH, et al.
Clinically relevant mutations in core metabolic genes confer antibiotic resistance. Science
(80-). 2021;371. doi:10.1126/science.aba0862

70.   Windels EM, Cool L, Persy E, Swinnen J, Matthay P, Van Den Bergh B, et al. Antibiotic
dose and nutrient availability differentially drive the evolution of antibiotic resistance and
persistence. ISME J. 2024;18. doi:10.1093/ismejo/wrae070

71.   Pak D, Kamiya T, Greischar MA. Proliferation in malaria parasites: How resource
limitation can prevent evolution of greater virulence. Evolution (N Y). 2024;78: 1287–
1301. doi:10.1093/evolut/qpae057

72.   Lind PA, Farr AD, Rainey PB. Experimental evolution reveals hidden diversity in
evolutionary pathways. Elife. 2015;2015: 1–17. doi:10.7554/eLife.07074

73.   Zapotoczna M, O'Neill E, O'Gara JP. Untangling the diverse and redundant mechanisms
of *Staphylococcus aureus* biofilm formation. PLoS Pathog. 2016;12: 1–6.
doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1005671

74.   Melnyk AH, Wong A, Kassen R. The fitness costs of antibiotic resistance mutations. Evol
Appl. 2015;8: 273–283. doi:10.1111/eva.12196

75.   Filipow N, Mallon S, Shewaramani S, Kassen R, Wong A. The impact of genetic
background during laboratory evolution of Pseudomonas aeruginosa in a cystic fibrosis-
like environment . Evolution (N Y). 2023;78: 566–578. doi:10.1093/evolut/qpad189

76.   Stiernagle T. Maintenance of *C. elegans*. WormBook. 2006; 2006.
doi:10.1895/wormbook.1.101.1

77.   Vega NM, Gore J. Stochastic assembly produces heterogeneous communities in the
Caenorhabditis elegans intestine. PLoS Biol. 2017;15: 1–20.
doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.2000633

78.   Wahl LM, Gerrish PJ, Saika-Voivod I. Evaluating the impact of population bottlenecks in
experimental evolution. Genetics. 2002;162: 961–971. doi:10.1093/genetics/162.2.961

79.   Penley M, Morran L. Assessment of Caenorhabditis elegans Competitive Fitness in the
Presence of a Bacterial Parasite. Bio-Protocol. 2018;8: 1–14.
doi:10.21769/bioprotoc.2971

80.   Blazanin M. gcplyr: an R package for microbial growth curve data analysis. bioRxiv. 2023;
2023.04.30.538883. Available:
https://www.biorxiv.org/content/10.1101/2023.04.30.538883v1%0Ahttps://www.biorxiv.org
/content/10.1101/2023.04.30.538883v1.abstract

81.   CLSI. Performance standards for antimicrobial susceptibility testing: CLSI approved
standard M100-S23 2013.

82.   Petit RA, Read TD. Bactopia: a Flexible Pipeline for Complete Analysis of Bacterial
Genomes. mSystems. 2020;5. doi:10.1128/msystems.00190-20

83.   Deatherage DE, Barrick JE. Identification of mutations in laboratory-evolved microbes
from next-generation sequencing data using breseq. Engineering and Analyzing
Multicellular Systems: Methods and Protocols. 2014. pp. 165–188. doi:10.1007/978-1-
4939-0554-6

84.   Souvorov A, Agarwala R, Lipman DJ. SKESA: Strategic k-mer extension for scrupulous
assemblies. Genome Biol. 2018;19: 1–13. doi:10.1186/s13059-018-1540-z

85.   Lees JA, Kremer PHC, Manso AS, Croucher NJ, Ferwerda B, Serón MV, et al. Large
scale genomic analysis shows no evidence for pathogen adaptation between the blood
and cerebrospinal fluid niches during bacterial meningitis. Microb Genomics. 2017;3.

760   doi:10.1099/mgen.0.000103

86.   Ibarra JA, Pérez-Rueda E, Carroll RK, Shaw LN. Global analysis of transcriptional
regulators in Staphylococcus aureus. BMC Genomics. 2013;14. doi:10.1186/1471-2164-
14-126

87.   Oksanen J, Simpson G, Blanchet F, Kindt R, Legendre P, Minchin P, et al. vegan:
Community Ecology Package. 2024.

88.   Martinez Arbizu P. pairwiseAdonis: Pairwise multilevel comparison using adonis. 2020.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
Bacteria and nematode strains
Staphylococcus aureus USA300 JE2 (NR-46543) and USA300 JE2 *mecA*-tn (Transposon Mutant NE1868) from the Nebraska Transposon Mutant Library were acquired from BEI resources (https://www.beiresources.org/). To ensure true isogenic ancestors, the *mecA*-tn was transduced into the USA300 JE2 background, selecting for the erythromycin resistance marker on the Mariner transposon, and the insertion site was confirmed by polymerase chain reaction. Transposon maintenance was confirmed by testing for resistance to erythromycin (5µg/mL) or by genome sequencing when available. In cases where transposon loss was verified by genome sequencing, strains were tested and shown to maintain sensitivity to oxacillin. As the primary function of the transposon was to knock out *mecA* function, loss of the transposon should not confound subsequent analyses as antibiotic sensitivity was maintained.

Caenorhabditis elegans strain N2 Bristol and *Escherichia coli* strain OP50 were provided by the Caenorhabditis Genetics Center, which is funded by the NIH Office of Research Infrastructure Programs (P40 OD010440). Nematodes were maintained on Nematode Growth Medium Lite (US Biological, Swampscott, MA) according to WormBook protocols [76].

Experimental evolution
Selection for increased virulence of *S. aureus* (USA300 JE2 or USA300 JE2 *mecA*-tn) in *C. elegans* was performed by passaging *S. aureus* from dead hosts 24 hours post-infection. Half of the *S. aureus* populations were additionally subjected to antibiotic pressure during the passages before and after *C. elegans* selection with sub-MIC oxacillin exposure (0.03125µg/mL). This concentration was tested against both ancestral strains and did not substantially inhibit growth of the methicillin-sensitive USA300 JE2 *mecA*-tn strain.

For each passage of experimental evolution, *S. aureus* was grown in Brain Heart Infusion (BHI) broth with 4µg/mL colistin (to prevent *E. coli* contamination from the nematode intestine) ± 0.03125µg/mL oxacillin and incubated at 37˚C overnight, shaking at 250rpm. The next day, 200µL of the overnight *S. aureus* culture was plated onto BHI agar and incubated at 28˚C overnight. Approximately 1500 *C. elegans* were plated and allowed to consume *S. aureus* for 24 hours before 30 dead nematodes were picked from each plate. Nematodes were identified as dead by a lack of response to tapping by a platinum wire [2,60]. Bacterial extraction methods were adapted from [77]. In brief, picked dead nematodes were washed once with M9 buffer supplemented with 0.1% Triton X-100, once with M9 buffer, then subjected to a 1:1000 bleach-M9 buffer solution for 15 minutes. Nematodes were then washed twice with M9 buffer and ground with a motorized pestle to extract *S. aureus* from the host intestine. *S aureus* populations evolving without hosts were obtained from nematode-free bacterial lawns with a loop. Populations of *S. aureus* were grown as previously before freezing and storage at -80˚C. Twenty-five percent of each frozen culture was used as inoculum for the next round of experimental evolution. Preliminary experiments determined colony-forming units per milliliter dropped by approximately 50% after freezing. To maintain population diversity, the inoculum amount (25%), adjusted for freezing, was chosen to be within the dilution ratio presented in [78] that minimizes the chance that rare beneficial mutations are lost. Twelve rounds of passage were completed for 2 *S. aureus* genotypes x 2 host treatments x 2 antibiotic treatments x 6 replicates = 48 populations. Whole populations were frozen for subsequent analyses.

Mortality assay
Nematodes were age-synchronized as in [79] and grown on *E.coli* OP50 until L4 larval stage (48 hours at 20˚C). Nematodes were subsequently washed off, counted, and approximately 200 individuals were plated on *S. aureus* lawns on BHI plates. Another set of nematodes were plated

on *E. coli* OP50 to estimate the total number of nematodes. Plates of *S. aureus* were prepared
24 hours prior by plating 200μL of an overnight population culture on BHI agar and grown at 28˚C.
After two days at 20˚C, plates were scored by counting live nematodes. Host mortality data were
analyzed using a generalized linear model with a binomial distribution and followed by Tukey
multiple-comparison tests to determine pairwise differences. To compare variances across
treatments, we conducted Levene's test for homogeneity of variance. All statistical analyses,
including those below, were conducted in R (version 4.2.0).
826
Hemolysis phenotype assay
Populations of *S. aureus* were streaked onto Trypticase Soy Agar II with 5% sheep's blood plates
and incubated overnight at 37˚C. Bacteria were assessed as either hemolysis positive or negative
depending on whether there was a complete clearing around the colonies. We did not cross-
streak with RN4220, which produces beta-hemolysin, and allows for detection of delta-hemolysin.
Therefore, our assay mainly detects alpha-toxin and phenol-soluble modulins. Hemolysis data
were analyzed using a generalized linear model with a binomial distribution. To determine whether
there was an association between hemolysis status and host mortality, we compared the host
mortality means of hemolysis-positive vs. hemolysis-negative pathogens using a Kruskal–Wallis
test.
837
***In vitro* growth assay**
Overnight cultures of each evolved population was diluted 1:1000 in BHI broth, then 200μl of each
dilution was added to 96-well plates, covered with a Breathe-Easy sealing membrane (Sigma) to
minimize evaporation. The optical density at 600nm at 37˚C with shaking at 282 cycles per minute
was recorded every 10 minutes for 16 hours (1000 minutes) using a BioTek Synergy HTX
Multimode Reader. We randomly assigned each of the 48 evolved populations to the inner wells
of the 96-well plates, with at least three technical replicates per population. Each plate also
included technical replicates of each ancestor. Each ancestral strain was assayed with four
technical replicates per plate across four plates. These steps were repeated for media with
0.03125μg/mL oxacillin. We used the R package *gcplyr* [80] to calculate the area under the curve
of density, a metric that quantifies the overall bacterial growth. We compared the growth of
populations across treatments using the mean area under the curve of the technical replicates for
each population. We used a linear model followed by Tukey multiple-comparison tests to
determine pairwise differences between the ancestors, and linear mixed models for evolved
populations grown with or without oxacillin.
853
Antimicrobial susceptibility assay
Antimicrobial susceptibility testing for oxacillin was done according to Clinical & Laboratory
Standards Institute (CLSI) standard protocols for broth microdilution [81]. In brief, populations
were streaked from frozen stock and re-streaked the next day. From the second day culture,
populations were resuspended in normal saline to a 0.5 McFarland standard. Then, these cultures
were diluted 1:20 in normal saline before 10μL was added to 90μL of CAMHB + 2% NaCl with the
appropriate concentration of oxacillin. Plates were incubated at 35˚C without shaking and read at
24 hours. For statistical analysis of populations evolved from the MSSA ancestor, we set a
threshold such that anything above the ancestral susceptibility level (0.25ug/ml) was considered
a decrease in oxacillin sensitivity. We then compared the proportion of populations exhibiting a
decrease in oxacillin sensitivity with those that had not using Fisher's exact test with false
discovery rate-adjusted (FDR) p-values.
866
Biofilm assay
Overnight cultures of each population were diluted 1:40 in BHI broth containing 0.5% glucose,
then 100μl of each dilution was added to the inner wells of 96-well plates (NEST Biotechnology,

flat-bottom, tissue culture-treated). Plates were incubated for 24 hours at 20˚C, the temperature
that nematodes experience during infection. Each well was washed three times with 200µl of
phosphate-buffered saline (PBS) to remove non-adherent cells. We then stained cells with 125µl
of 0.1% crystal violet for 20 minutes, followed by washing each well twice with 200µl PBS. We
then resuspended the crystal violet in 125µl of 30% acetic acid. After incubation for 10 minutes,
we measured the optical density at 595nm using a BioTek Synergy HTX Multimode Reader. We
randomly assigned each of the 48 evolved populations to the inner wells of the 96-well plates,
with at least three technical replicates per population. Each plate also included technical replicates
of each ancestor. We standardized the mean of technical replicates for each population against
the respective ancestor within each plate to control for variation across plates. We used mixed
linear models followed by Tukey multiple-comparison tests to assess pairwise differences
between treatments.
882
883   **Whole-genome shotgun sequencing and variant annotation**
884   Bacterial genome DNA was extracted from whole populations using Wizard Genomic DNA
885   Purification Kit (Promega). Genome sequencing of these DNA samples was performed at the M-
886   Gen center using a paired-end library preparation method based on Illumina Nextera and
887   sequenced on the NextSeq 550.
888
The raw data was quality trimmed and adapters removed using illumina-cleanup
(https://github.com/rpetit3/illumina-cleanup) or with bactopia [82]. Mutations were called based on
comparison to the reference USA300 JE2 genome (BioProject: PRJNA224116, BioSample:
SAMN06677988, Assembly: GCF_002085525.1) using breseq [83]. The presence of large-scale
deletions and other genetic changes were confirmed by analysis of de novo assembled genomes
performed by the SKESA assembler software [84]. The ancestral populations were almost
identical to the reference genome used except for three mutations that were not found in any
evolved populations. Another three mutations in *bioD1, cls* and *ccdC* were present in all
populations derived from the MSSA ancestor and likely occurred in the first passage from the
frozen culture before experimental evolution was performed. We therefore removed these six
mutations from the analysis.
900
The number of mutations (excluding synonymous or intergenic regions) across treatments were
analyzed using a generalized linear model with a Poisson distribution. For mutation enrichment
analysis, we followed the steps as described previously [85]. Briefly, we calculated the "mutation
rate" for each ancestor by dividing the total number of mutations by the reference genome size.
We multiplied the mutation rate by the total length of regulatory genes [86] with mutations in our
study to generate the expected number of mutations for these genes. We then conducted single-
tailed Poisson tests to determine whether the actual number of mutations in regulatory genes was
greater than expected.
909
910   For phenotypes *vs.* mutations, we considered only mutations occurring at least twice throughout
911   the experiment. For host mortality *vs.* mutations and growth rate *vs.* SCC*mec* and ACME, we
912   conducted a one sample t-test for each evolved pathogen against its respective ancestor. P-
913   values were adjusted using the FDR. For hemolysis status *vs.* mutations and oxacillin MIC *vs.*
914   mutations, we conducted Fisher's exact tests with Bonferroni corrections.
915
916   **Principal component analysis**
917   We conducted a principal component analysis on the phenotypes quantified in evolved
918   populations using the prcomp function in R for each *S. aureus* genotype. We performed
919   permutational analysis of variances (PERMANOVA, 999 permutations) to test for differences
920   between treatments using adonis2 of the *vegan* package [87] and pairwiseAdonis [88].

Genetic distance

We generated a matrix of Euclidian genetic distances (the square root of pairwise differences)
using the frequencies of mutations that arose for each *S. aureus* genotype, from which we
constructed phylogenies [60,61]. We used pairwise differences between the ancestor and each
evolved populations to compare rates of evolution across treatments, and pairwise differences
between replicate populations within each treatment to compare the degree of divergence across
treatments. We compared rates of evolution for MRSA and MSSA treatments, and degree of
divergence for MSSA treatments, using linear models followed by Tukey multiple-comparison
tests. We compared the degree of divergence for MRSA treatments using a Kruskal–Wallis test
followed by Dunn's post-hoc test.

SUPPLEMENTAL FIGURES

Figure S1. Count of all mutations (from 10-100% frequency) arisen in evolved populations.

Figure S2. Mutations at frequencies between 0.1 and < 1, excluding synonymous or intergenic mutations, in each evolved population. Points with darker shades indicate more than one mutation present. All mutations in MRSA +host +ox populations between 0.1 and < 1 are all either synonymous or intergenic.

Figure S3. Count of mutations swept to fixation in evolved populations.

Figure S4. Genetic distance between the ancestor and evolved populations for A) MRSA and B) MSSA genotypes. Genetic distance between replicate populations within each treatment for C) MRSA and D) MSSA genotypes. Different letters indicate significant differences. Error bars indicate standard errors.