Enhancing NosZ Activity to Reduce N_2O Emissions from Biological Wastewater Treatment
Systems

*Xueyang Zhou[1,2], Bharat Manna[1,2], Boyu Lyu[1,2], and Naresh Singhal[1,2] ***

[1]Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Auckland, Auckland
1010, New Zealand

[2]Water Research Centre, University of Auckland, Auckland 1010, New Zealand

KEYWORDS: Greenhouse gas mitigation; Aeration strategies; Nitrogen transformation;
Microbial community function; Metabolic regulation; Nitrous oxide reductase activation

ABSTRACT

Nitrous oxide (N_2O) emissions from wastewater treatment plants, with a warming potential
298 times that of CO_2, pose a significant challenge to lowering their carbon footprint. Current
mitigation strategies focus on limiting N_2O formation during nitrification and denitrification
but overlook microbial reduction mechanisms. This study examines the potential for
enhancing nitrous oxide reductase (NosZ) activity to reduce N_2O to N_2. We hypothesize that
strategic oxygen manipulation can enhance N_2O destruction by continuous NosZ expression
and enable NosZ activation in microorganisms with superior NosZ capabilities. We assess
microbial community function and metabolic regulation using metagenomics and
metaproteomics to clarify the effect of intermittent aeration regimes on N_2O emission.
Intermittent aeration with periodic anoxic exposure significantly reduced N_2O emissions with
71% nitrogen removal by enhancing the metabolic activity of *Hyphomicrobium*. NosZ
activity increased by 4- to 6.5-fold after system adaptation to oxygen modulations, compared
to continuous oxic-anoxic cycling without the anoxic phase. The latter resulted in increased
N_2O emissions due to suppressed NosZ activity and higher N_2O production from
Methylobacillus, which uses nitric oxide as an alternative electron acceptor. Our finding that
strategic oxygen manipulation can energize N_2O destruction lays the foundation for
developing next-generation wastewater treatment technologies for mitigating N_2O emissions.

INTRODUCTION

Nitrous oxide (N_2O) emissions from biological nitrogen removal processes, which have a
global warming potential 298 times greater than carbon dioxide, pose a significant challenge
for wastewater treatment plants aiming to achieve carbon neutrality[1–3]. Despite extensive
research, current N_2O mitigation strategies remain constrained by a production-centric focus,
overlooking the transformative potential of microbial reduction mechanisms[4–6]. In contrast to
managing N_2O production during nitrification and denitrification[7–10], the true potential for
mitigation lies in the biological destruction pathway—specifically, the reduction of N_2O to
N_2 by nitrous oxide reductase (NosZ), the only enzyme capable of complete N_2O
elimination[11–15]. This research challenges conventional strategies[1,4,16–19] by exploring how

targeted deoxygenation can unlock the latent N_2O destruction capabilities of microbial
communities[20].

Recent studies reveal a nuanced interplay between oxygen availability and N_2O reduction,
highlighting the metabolic flexibility of denitrifying microorganisms[21,22]. Historical oxygen
manipulation studies show mixed results[23], with some reducing N_2O emissions[4,5,24,25] and
others increasing them[26,27]. These inconsistencies underscore a critical knowledge gap in
understanding the mechanisms linking oxygen variation to N_2O dynamics[4,5,28–30]. We
hypothesize that strategic oxygen manipulation can enhance N_2O destruction through three
key mechanisms: (i) maintaining continuous NosZ expression, (ii) enabling NosZ activation,
and (iii) selectively enhancing microorganisms with superior NosZ capabilities. This
approach shifts from traditional emission management to active microbial-driven N_2O
elimination.

Our study investigates microbial community function and metabolic regulation under
controlled intermittent aeration regimes. We aim to identify key microbial contributors, their
enzymatic pathways, and the regulatory mechanisms governing N_2O production and
reduction under varying oxygen conditions. By bridging fundamental microbial mechanisms
with practical applications, we aim to provide an evidence-based framework for developing
next-generation wastewater treatment technologies for effectively mitigating N_2O emissions
from biological wastewater treatment processes.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Bioreactor Operation. Activated sludge used in this study was sourced from the Māngere
Wastewater Treatment Plant in Auckland, New Zealand. Three identical cylindrical acrylic
bioreactors, each with a 1 L working volume, were operated simultaneously under varying
aeration conditions at 20□. The same activated sludge was used in triplicate to ensure
biological consistency. Each 1 L reactor contained 2.75 g/L of mixed liquor-suspended solids
and was supplemented with 3.84 g/L of $NaHCO_3$ as an inorganic carbon source, along with 1
mL of a trace element solution (Table S1). Over a 48-hour period, 50 mL of concentrated
artificial wastewater (Table S2) was continuously fed into each reactor at an equal rate using
a syringe pump, while magnetic stirring ensured uniform mixing. The bioreactors were
operated under three aeration modes, aimed at suppressing denitrification, inducing N_2O
production, or promoting N_2O reduction, respectively. Each mode was tested at two oxygen
levels, resulting in six conditions: constant aerobic (CA) with steady oxygen levels of 2 and 8
mg/L (Figure 1a, 1b); continuous perturbed (CP) with cyclic oxygen variations of 0-2 and 0-8
mg/L without intermittent anoxic stage (Figure 1c, 1d); and, intermittent perturbed (IP) with
cyclic oxygen variations that include an anoxic stage (Figure 1e, 1f).

N_2O Emissions. Gaseous N_2O emissions were quantified using gas chromatography
(Shimadzu GC-BID/FID 2010 Plus), and dissolved N_2O concentrations were monitored with
online N_2O sensors (Unisense, Denmark). Detailed analytical methods, including sensor
calibration, gas sampling, and data processing procedures, are provided in Supplementary
Materials S1.3.

In-situ N_2O reductase (N_2OR) Activity. In-situ N_2OR activity was assessed by
introducing a saturated N_2O solution into the bioreactor and monitoring the consumption of
dissolved N_2O using an online sensor (Unisense, Denmark). The N_2O consumption rate was
determined by analyzing the time-dependent decrease in dissolved N_2O concentrations.

Metagenomics. DNA was extracted from sludge samples using the DNeasy PowerSoil Kit
(Qiagen, Germany) following the manufacturer's protocol. Samples were collected at the
start of the experiment (six biological replicates) for nitrogen transformer identification and at
the 48-hour mark under dissolved oxygen (DO) 2 and DO8 conditions to construct the
metaproteomics library. The extracted DNA underwent Illumina sequencing on a HiSeq
platform. Details on sample preparation, sequencing procedures, and bioinformatics analysis
using SqueezeMeta[31] are provided in Supplementary Materials S1.4.

Metaproteomics. Protein extraction and analysis were conducted for sludge samples
collected under different aeration conditions. Biological replicates included five from the start
of the experiment, three from 48-hour DO2, and two from 48-hour DO8 conditions. Proteins
were extracted, purified, digested, and analyzed via nano LC-MS/MS using a TripleTOF
6600 mass spectrometer. Protein identification was conducted against a database established
by metagenomics results of the samples using MetaProteomeAnalyzer version 3.4[32]. Full
details of the experimental protocol are available in Supplementary Materials S1.5.

RESULTS

Nitrogen Removal Under Perturbed Aeration. Under CA conditions at both tested DO
concentrations (CA2 and CA8), nitrogen removal was minimal (<3%), indicating the
predominance of aerobic metabolic pathways (Figure S1, S2). CP conditions (CP2 and CP8)
facilitated limited denitrification, resulting in approximately 8% conversion of nitrogen to
gaseous forms (Figure S3, S4). In contrast, IP conditions (IP2 and IP8) enabled significant
nitrogen removal (~71%), driven by enhanced denitrification through strategic oxygen
availability patterns (Figure S5, S6).

Role of Oxygen Modulation in N_2O Dynamics. To understand the role of oxygen
modulation in N_2O dynamics, we analyzed dissolved and gaseous N_2O emissions under three
aeration modes—CA, CP, and IP. The N_2O emissions show distinct trends in dynamics
(Figure 2). IP showed lower dissolved N_2O accumulation and stabilized gaseous emissions
than CP, which was comparable to the N_2O emissions under CA. N_2O transformation
dynamics exhibited three characteristic phases (Figure 2): an initial accumulation phase
(Phase I), a depletion phase (Phase II), and lastly a stabilization phase (Phase III). During
Phase I, the dissolved N_2O concentrations increased across all aeration modes and showed
significant variation among the observed rates for different conditions at 95% confidence
(Table S3). The dissolved N_2O accumulation rates during the initial phase were significantly
lower under IP (0.034 mg/L/h for IP2 and 0.007 mg/L/h for IP8) compared to CP (0.064
mg/L/h for CP2 and 0.089 mg/L/h for CP8). Gaseous N_2O emissions mirrored these trends,
with substantially lower N_2O-N emitted in the first 8 hours under IP (5.99 mg N and 5.08 mg
N under IP2 and IP8, respectively) than CP (9.32 mg N and 12.07 mg N under CP2 and CP8,
respectively). This reduction in initial accumulation suggests that anoxic intervals inherent to
IP strategies effectively limit N_2O production pathways. During Phase II, the N_2O emissions
decreased, in particular for CP2, CP8, and IP2. The depletion rates under IP2 (-0.022 mg/L/h)
were comparable to CP (-0.023 mg/L/h for CP2 and -0.039 mg/L/h for CP8); however, IP
consistently showed lower gaseous emissions throughout this phase (0.73 to 0.21 mg N/hour
under IP2 versus 1.94 to 0.29 mg N/hour under CP2). This trend continued until stabilization
was achieved. Phase III data show that while the dissolved N_2O concentrations were lowest
under IP (0.11–0.26 mg/L for IP2 and 0.036–0.12 mg/L for IP8), gaseous emissions became
negligible across all conditions, signaling an equilibrium between N_2O production and
reduction processes. Moreover, NosZ expression and activation, leading to higher N_2OR

activity and dissolved N_2O consumption rates, were highest under IP (1.23 mg N_2O-N/L/min
and 4.19 mg N_2O-N/L/min for IP2 and IP8, respectively) and showed 4- to 6.5- fold
exceedance over CP conditions with the same oxygen range (Figure 3, Table S4).

Microbial Contributors to N_2O Emissions. Metagenomic and metaproteomic analyses
(Figure 4, Figure S7) identified the key organisms responsible for N_2O dynamics and how
aeration strategies influence their metabolic activities. *Nitrosomonas* is the dominant
ammonia-oxidizing genus that catalyzes the conversion of ammonia to hydroxylamine and
subsequently to nitrite, and *Nitrospira* is the primary nitrite-oxidizing genus for nitrite to
nitrate oxidation (Figure 4); both possess genes for partial denitrification pathways to convert
nitrite to nitric oxide (NO) and N_2O, potentially contributing to N_2O emissions.
Methylobacterium and *Hyphomicrobium* stand out as the two main denitrifying genera
(Figure 4) but possess different denitrification functional genes. *Methylobacterium* contains
genes for NO and N_2O production and lacks genes for N_2O reduction, making it a potential
source of N_2O production. In contrast, *Hyphomicrobium* has a complete set of denitrification-
related genes, which includes the *nosZ* gene, and could contribute to N_2O reduction.

An enzymatic analysis showed significant differences in the abundances of denitrification
enzymes under different aeration conditions (Figure S7). Nitric oxide reductase (NorB) and
NosZ emerged as critical enzymes driving the N_2O dynamics. NorB, responsible for N_2O
production, showed higher abundance under CP, compared to CA and IP, and its activity was
primarily attributed to *Methylobacterium*, a genus within the class Betaproteobacteria (Figure
5). Conversely, NosZ, which facilitates N_2O reduction, was significantly higher under IP and
is primarily associated with *Hyphomicrobium* within the class Alphaproteobacteria (Figure
5). The differences in enzyme abundance under different aeration conditions mirror the
observed N_2O emissions. Since N_2O producers and reducers tend to favor different aeration
modes, oxygen availability under some aeration patterns could influence the interactions
between N_2O producers and reducers, resulting in dynamic changes in the dissolved N_2O
pool.

Mechanisms of N_2O Metabolism. A detailed metaproteome analysis revealed distinct
adaptation strategies employed by *Methylobacillus* and *Hyphomicrobium* under different
aeration patterns. Increasing the oxygen level from 2 to 8 mg/L did not significantly affect
these strategies.

Methylobacillus Adaptations. Under CP conditions, *Methylobacillus* exhibited higher
expression of cytochrome c oxidase cbb3-type and NorB, indicating that N_2O formation
occurs as a metabolic byproduct under limited oxygen availability (Figure 6a). This
adaptation was supported by stabilized NO concentrations of approximately 14 μM (Figure
S8), enabling sustained electron transport chain function through NO utilization. The absence
of NosZ in *Methylobacillus* resulted in its inability to reduce the N_2O it produced. Two-way
ANOVA analysis (Figure S9) showed that aeration mode significantly
influenced *Methylobacterium* metabolism (p = 0.003), while oxygen level had an
insignificant effect (p = 0.74). Overall enzyme expression in *Methylobacterium* declined
under IP conditions compared to CA and CP conditions, contributing to the suppression of
N_2O production (Figure S10).

Hyphomicrobium Adaptations. Hyphomicrobium exhibited elevated enzyme expression
ability under IP conditions (p = 0.008) (Figure S11), contrasting with the metabolic response
patterns observed in *Methylobacterium*. This indicates that *Hyphomicrobium* possesses a
distinct adaptive mechanism to redox fluctuations, including a strong potential for reducing

N$_2$O (Figure S12). Under IP conditions, *Hyphomicrobium* demonstrated comprehensive
metabolic reprogramming (Figure 6b). Enhanced expression of carbon dissimilation enzymes
included upregulation of methanol dehydrogenase (Mdh), methylene-
tetrahydromethanopterin dehydrogenase (MtdB), and NADH dehydrogenase. Upregulation of
nitrate reductase (NarGHJI) and NosZ enhanced energy production and N$_2$O reduction
capabilities under low-oxygen conditions. A key regulatory adaptation
in *Hyphomicrobium* involved upregulating the CRP/FNR family transcriptional regulator,
specifically the dissimilatory nitrate respiration regulator (DNR) (Figure 6b). This regulator
responded to elevated NO concentrations (~21 μM) (Figure S8), coordinating terminal
enzyme expression patterns. Integrating these adaptive mechanisms
enabled *Hyphomicrobium* to effectively utilize NO as a signal, optimizing anaerobic
respiration and N$_2$O reduction under IP conditions.

DISCUSSION

Our investigation into strategic oxygen manipulation in wastewater treatment systems has
revealed complex mechanisms governing N$_2$O transformation. Detailed analyses of N$_2$O
dynamics, enzyme regulation, and metabolic adaptations provide strong evidence supporting
our hypothesis that controlled oxygen availability can enhance community-wide N$_2$O
destruction through three interconnected mechanisms.
Continuous NosZ Expression. Contrary to conventional assumptions about oxygen
sensitivity, we demonstrated that *Hyphomicrobium* maintains continuous NosZ expression
under specific intermittent aeration (IP conditions). Stable enzyme levels were exhibited after
the system adapted to the aerobic-anoxic transition, suggesting metabolic resilience and
adaptability essential for effective N$_2$O mitigation. This finding aligns with observations from
other systems, including mixed microbial communities (e.g., soil microorganisms[33] and
permeable sediments[34]) and specific pure cultures (e.g., *Azospira sp.*[22], *Thauera sp.*[35],
and *Pseudomonas stutzeri*[36]), where NosZ expression occurs due to relaxed regulation of
respiratory genes by oxygen and metabolic flexibility to exploit periodic supplies of electron
acceptors under fluctuating oxygen conditions[37–39].
Enhanced NosZ Activation. Limiting oxygen by introducing an anoxic phase in the IP
cycles significantly enhanced NosZ activation, resulting in markedly higher N$_2$O reduction
rates under IP conditions compared to CA and CP conditions. This suggests a sophisticated
regulatory mechanism in *Hyphomicrobium,* similar to the resilience seen in *Azospira sp.,*
which demonstrates rapid recovery of NosZ activity after oxygen exposure[22,40]. Additionally,
evidence suggests that denitrification proteins expressed under oxic conditions remain
functional, further supporting this adaptability[34]. This tolerance ensures sustained carbon
metabolism and continuous electron flow for energy production, regardless of oxygen
availability[5,41,42], highlighting NosZ's critical role in maintaining robust N$_2$O reduction under
fluctuating environmental conditions[43,44].
Selective Enhancement of NosZ-Containing Microorganisms. The oxygen manipulation
strategy selectively enhanced microorganisms with superior NosZ capabilities,
particularly *Hyphomicrobium*, which leveraged its complete denitrification pathway and
metabolic flexibility to sustain robust N$_2$O reduction even under fluctuating oxygen
conditions[39,45]. In contrast, *Methylobacillus*, which operates with an incomplete
denitrification pathway, relied on cbb3-type cytochrome c oxidase and NorB to maximize the
utilization of electron acceptors[46]. However, this adaptation led to increased N$_2$O production,
highlighting the drawbacks of incomplete denitrifiers in dynamic environments[47,48].
Ecological Dynamics and Community-Wide Impact. The contrasting responses of these
microorganisms emphasize the importance of targeting complete denitrifiers in optimizing

N$_2$O mitigation strategies. The shared utilization of denitrification intermediates among
microbial communities suggests an ecological advantage in enhancing nosZ-containing
species[45]. Given that the potential for N$_2$O reduction often surpasses its production capacity[20],
fostering these organisms can amplify their collective impact, creating a synergistic effect
that reduces N$_2$O emissions and contributes to the overall efficiency of nitrogen cycling
within the microbial ecosystem[49].
Implications for N$_2$O Mitigation Strategies. Implementing strategies solely targeting N$_2$O
production may be suboptimal[50]. While stable oxygen conditions (CA) effectively suppress
N$_2$O production, they lack resilience to sudden oxygen fluctuations, often leading to abrupt
N$_2$O surges[9,51,52]. In contrast, specific IP conditions have been shown to offer superior ways
of reducing N$_2$O emissions[4,5,24]. Our study provides significant evidence that enhancing the
N$_2$O reduction capacity of nosZ-containing microorganisms plays a critical role in buffering
against N$_2$O accumulation, reinforcing the effectiveness of IP strategies. These findings
underscore the importance of designing mitigation approaches that address both N$_2$O
production and reduction mechanisms[53,54]. Targeted enhancement of N$_2$O destruction
represents a promising pathway to optimize mitigation efforts and maintain stable system
performance under variable operational conditions. This research establishes a
comprehensive mechanistic framework for controlling N$_2$O emissions in biological nitrogen
removal systems, demonstrating the effectiveness of strategic oxygen manipulation in
promoting NosZ activity for N$_2$O reduction.

244
245 **Figure 1.** Dissolved oxygen (DO) concentration profiles under six aeration conditions: CA2,
246 CA8, CP2, CP8, IP2, and IP8. Each plot highlights distinct modes of oxygen availability,
247 showcasing constant aerobic (CA), continuous perturbed (CP), and intermittent perturbed (IP)
248 modes at low (2 mg/L) and high (8 mg/L) DO levels.
249

250
251 **Figure 2.** Gaseous and dissolved N_2O concentration dynamics under six aeration conditions:
252 CA2, CA8, CP2, CP8, IP2, and IP8. Gaseous N_2O emissions were measured during 0–8
253 hours, 22–32 hours, and 46–48 hours, while dissolved N_2O concentrations were continuously
254 monitored over 48 hours.
255

Figure 3. In situ N_2O reductase (N_2OR) activity, measured as the rate of dissolved N_2O consumption after 48 hours of exposure to six aeration conditions. Results indicate enhanced N_2OR activity under IP conditions compared to CA and CP modes.

Figure 4. Metagenomic insights into microbial community structure and functional differentiation of nitrogen-transforming genera. (a) Source microorganisms and their contribution to nitrogen transformation-related genes. (b) Functional gene differentiation among nitrogen-transforming genera.

268
Figure 5. Microbial sources of nitric oxide reductase (NorB) and nitrous oxide reductase
(NosZ) identified through metaproteomic analysis. Contributions under CP and IP conditions
illustrate distinct microbial drivers for N₂O production and reduction.

272
273 **Figure 6.** Metabolic regulatory mechanisms of N_2O-related processes in (a) *Methylobacillus*
274 under CP conditions, characterized by upregulation of nitric oxide reductase and cytochrome
275 c oxidase cbb3-type, and (b) *Hyphomicrobium* under IP conditions, showing enhanced
276 electron generation and upregulation of nitrate reductase and nitrous oxide reductase.

278
279
280

Author information
Corresponding authors

*Phone: +64 9 923 4512; fax: +64 9 373 7462; e-mail: n.singhal@auckland.ac.nz.

Funding sources

The study was supported by the Marsden Fund Council from Government funding, managed
by Royal Society Te Apārangi, and a Smart Ideas grant from the Endeavour Fund managed
by the Ministry for Business, Innovation & Employment Hīkina Whakatutuki.

Acknowledgments

We thank Nikki Freed for the assistance with metagenomic sequencing. We thank Martin
Middleditch and George Guo for their assistance with metaproteomics analysis. We also
thank Watercare Services Limited for providing the activated sludge culture from the
Māngere Wastewater Treatment Plant. The authors acknowledge assistance from the New
Zealand eScience Infrastructure (NeSI) high-performance computing facilities and the Centre
for eResearch at the University of Auckland.

REFERENCES

(1) Duan, H.; Zhao, Y.; Koch, K.; Wells, G. F.; Weißbach, M.; Yuan, Z.; Ye, L. Recovery
of nitrous oxide from wastewater treatment: Current status and perspectives. *ACS EST*
Water **2021**, *1* (2), 240–250. https://doi.org/10.1021/acsestwater.0c00140.
(2) Ribera-Guardia, A.; Bosch, L.; Corominas, L.; Pijuan, M. Nitrous oxide and methane
emissions from a plug-flow full-scale bioreactor and assessment of its carbon footprint.
Journal of Cleaner Production **2019**, *212*, 162–172.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.11.286.
(3) Blomberg, K.; Kosse, P.; Mikola, A.; Kuokkanen, A.; Fred, T.; Heinonen, M.; Mulas,
M.; Lübken, M.; Wichern, M.; Vahala, R. Development of an extended ASM3 model
for predicting the nitrous oxide emissions in a full-scale wastewater treatment plant.
Environ. Sci. Technol. **2018**, *52* (10), 5803–5811.
https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.8b00386.
(4) Liu, T.; Liu, S.; He, S.; Tian, Z.; Zheng, M. Minimization of N_2O emission through
intermittent aeration in a sequencing batch reactor (SBR): Main Behavior and
Mechanism. *Water* **2021**, *13* (2), 210. https://doi.org/10.3390/w13020210.
(5) Al-Hazmi, H. E.; Lu, X.; Majtacz, J.; Kowal, P.; Xie, L.; Makinia, J. Optimization of the
aeration strategies in a deammonification sequencing batch reactor for efficient nitrogen

removal and mitigation of N_2O production. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2021**, *55* (2), 1218–
1230. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.0c04229.
(6) Vasilaki, V.; Massara, T. M.; Stanchev, P.; Fatone, F.; Katsou, E. A decade of nitrous
oxide (N_2O) monitoring in full-scale wastewater treatment processes: A critical review.
Water Research **2019**, *161*, 392–412. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2019.04.022.
(7) Law, Y.; Ni, B.-J.; Lant, P.; Yuan, Z. N_2O production rate of an enriched ammonia-
oxidising bacteria culture exponentially correlates to its ammonia oxidation rate. *Water*
Research **2012**, *46* (10), 3409–3419. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2012.03.043.
(8) Shourjeh, M. S.; Mehrani, M. J.; Kowal, P.; Szeląg, B.; Drewnowski, J. Advances in
Analysis, Quantification and modelling of N_2O emission in SBRs under various do set
points. *J. Phys.: Conf. Ser.* **2022**, *2412* (1), 012009. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-
6596/2412/1/012009.
(9) Hu, Z.; Zhang, J.; xie, H.; Li, S.; Wang, J.; Zhang, T. Effect of anoxic/aerobic phase
fraction on N_2O emission in a sequencing batch reactor under low temperature.
Bioresource Technology **2011**, *102* (9), 5486–5491.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2010.10.037.
(10) Kim, S.-W.; Miyahara, M.; Fushinobu, S.; Wakagi, T.; Shoun, H. Nitrous oxide
emission from nitrifying activated sludge dependent on denitrification by ammonia-
oxidizing bacteria. *Bioresource Technology* **2010**, *101* (11), 3958–3963.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2010.01.030.
(11) Hein, S.; Simon, J. Chapter four - Bacterial nitrous oxide respiration: Electron transport
chains and copper transfer reactions. In *Advances in Microbial Physiology*; Poole, R. K.,
Ed.; Advances in Microbial Physiology; Academic Press, 2019; Vol. 75, pp 137–175.
https://doi.org/10.1016/bs.ampbs.2019.07.001.
(12) Graf, D. R. H.; Jones, C. M.; Hallin, S. Intergenomic comparisons highlight modularity
of the denitrification pathway and underpin the importance of community structure for
N_2O emissions. *PLOS ONE* **2014**, *9* (12), e114118.
https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0114118.
(13) Peng, L.; Ni, B.-J.; Erler, D.; Ye, L.; Yuan, Z. The effect of dissolved oxygen on N_2O
production by ammonia-oxidizing bacteria in an enriched nitrifying sludge. *Water*
Research **2014**, *66*, 12–21. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.08.009.
(14) Liu, X.; Zhu, H. Treatment of low C/N ratio wastewater by a carbon cloth bipolar plate
multicompartment electro enhanced bioreactor (CBM-EEB). *ACS Omega* **2020**, *5* (43),
27823–27832. https://doi.org/10.1021/acsomega.0c02828.
(15) Han, D.; Hu, Z.; Li, D.; Tang, R. Nitrogen removal of water and sediment in grass carp
aquaculture ponds by mixed nitrifying and denitrifying bacteria and its effects on
bacterial community. *Water* **2022**, *14* (12), 1855. https://doi.org/10.3390/w14121855.
(16) Duan, H.; Zhao, Y.; Koch, K.; Wells, G. F.; Zheng, M.; Yuan, Z.; Ye, L. Insights into
nitrous oxide mitigation strategies in wastewater treatment and challenges for wider
implementation. *Environ Sci Technol* **2021**, *55* (11), 7208–7224.
https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.1c00840.
(17) Zajac, O.; Zubrowska-Sudol, M. Nitrification kinetics, N_2O emission, and energy use in
intermittently aerated hybrid reactor under different organic loading rates. *Int. J.*
Environ. Sci. Technol. **2023**, *20* (9), 10061–10074. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-022-
04715-6.
(18) Lin, Z.; Ma, K.; Yang, Y. Nitrous oxide emission from full-scale anammox-driven
wastewater treatment systems. *Life* **2022**, *12* (7), 971.
https://doi.org/10.3390/life12070971.

(19) Freyschmidt, A.; Beier, M. Model-Based identification and testing of appropriate
strategies to minimize N$_2$O emissions from biofilm deammonification. *Water Science*
and Technology **2022**, *86* (7), 1810–1820. https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2022.307.
(20) Conthe, M.; Lycus, P.; Arntzen, M. Ø.; Ramos da Silva, A.; Frostegård, Å.; Bakken, L.
R.; Kleerebezem, R.; van Loosdrecht, M. C. M. Denitrification as an N$_2$O sink. *Water*
Research **2019**, *151*, 381–387. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2018.11.087.
(21) Zhou, Y.; Suenaga, T.; Qi, C.; Riya, S.; Hosomi, M.; Terada, A. Temperature and
oxygen level determine N$_2$O respiration activities of heterotrophic N$_2$O-reducing
bacteria: Biokinetic study. *Biotechnology and Bioengineering* **2021**, *118* (3), 1330–1341.
https://doi.org/10.1002/bit.27654.
(22) Suenaga, T.; Riya, S.; Hosomi, M.; Terada, A. Biokinetic characterization and activities
of N$_2$O-reducing bacteria in response to various oxygen levels. *Frontiers in*
Microbiology **2018**, *9*.
(23) Kemmou, L.; Amanatidou, E. Factors Affecting nitrous oxide emissions from activated
sludge wastewater treatment plants—A review. *Resources* **2023**, *12* (10), 114.
https://doi.org/10.3390/resources12100114.
(24) Brotto, A. C.; Annavajhala, M. K.; Chandran, K. Metatranscriptomic investigation of
adaptation in NO and N$_2$O production from a lab-scale nitrification process upon
repeated exposure to anoxic-aerobic cycling. *Front Microbiol* **2018**, *9*, 3012.
https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.03012.
(25) Rodriguez-Caballero, A.; Aymerich, I.; Marques, R.; Poch, M.; Pijuan, M. Minimizing
N$_2$O emissions and carbon footprint on a full-scale activated sludge sequencing batch
reactor. *Water Research* **2015**, *71*, 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.12.032.
(26) Qi, S.; Zhao, Y.; Wang, S.; Zheng, F.; Pan, J.; Fan, L.; Li, Z.; Tan, C.; Hou, W.
Nitrogen removal and N$_2$O emission in biochar-sludge subsurface wastewater
infiltration systems. *Water Environment Research* **2018**, *90* (9), 800–806.
https://doi.org/10.2175/106143017X15131012187935.
(27) Mello, W. Z. de; Ribeiro, R. P.; Brotto, A. C.; Kligerman, D. C.; Piccoli, A. de S.;
Oliveira, J. L. M. Nitrous oxide emissions from an intermittent aeration activated sludge
system of an urban wastewater treatment plant. *Quím. Nova* **2013**, *36*, 16–20.
https://doi.org/10.1590/S0100-40422013000100004.
(28) Yang, R.; Yuan, L.; Wang, R.; He, Z.; Chen, X. New insight on the regulation of N$_2$O
production in aerobic condition: An N$_2$O metabolic perspective based on enzymatic
analysis of nitrous oxide reductase. *Journal of Water Process Engineering* **2021**, *41*,
102090. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jwpe.2021.102090.
(29) Ren, Y.; Ngo, H. H.; Guo, W.; Ni, B.-J.; Liu, Y. Linking the nitrous oxide production
and mitigation with the microbial community in wastewater treatment: A review.
Bioresource Technology Reports **2019**, *7*, 100191.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biteb.2019.100191.
(30) Gruber, W.; Magyar, P. M.; Mitrovic, I.; Zeyer, K.; Vogel, M.; von Känel, L.; Biolley,
L.; Werner, R. A.; Morgenroth, E.; Lehmann, M. F.; Braun, D.; Joss, A.; Mohn, J.
Tracing N$_2$O formation in full-scale wastewater treatment with natural abundance
isotopes indicates control by organic substrate and process settings. *Water Research X*
2022, *15*, 100130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wroa.2022.100130.
(31) Tamames, J.; Puente-Sánchez, F. SqueezeMeta, a highly portable, fully automatic
metagenomic analysis pipeline. *Front. Microbiol.* **2019**, *9*.
https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.03349.
(32) Muth, T.; Behne, A.; Heyer, R.; Kohrs, F.; Benndorf, D.; Hoffmann, M.; Lehtevä, M.;
Reichl, U.; Martens, L.; Rapp, E. The MetaProteomeAnalyzer: A powerful open-source

software suite for metaproteomics data analysis and interpretation. *J. Proteome Res.*
2015, *14* (3), 1557–1565. https://doi.org/10.1021/pr501246w.

(33) Morley, N.; Baggs, E. M.; Dörsch, P.; Bakken, L. Production of NO, N$_2$O and N$_2$ by
extracted soil bacteria, regulation by NO$_2^-$ and O$_2$ concentrations. *FEMS Microbiology*
Ecology **2008**, *65* (1), 102–112. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6941.2008.00495.x.

(34) Marchant, H. K.; Ahmerkamp, S.; Lavik, G.; Tegetmeyer, H. E.; Graf, J.; Klatt, J. M.;
Holtappels, M.; Walpersdorf, E.; Kuypers, M. M. M. Denitrifying community in coastal
sediments performs aerobic and anaerobic respiration simultaneously. *ISME J* **2017**, *11*
(8), 1799–1812. https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2017.51.

(35) Liu, B.; Mao, Y.; Bergaust, L.; Bakken, L. R.; Frostegård, Å. Strains in the genus
Thauera exhibit remarkably different denitrification regulatory phenotypes.
Environmental Microbiology **2013**, *15* (10), 2816–2828. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-
2920.12142.

(36) Miyahara, M.; Kim, S.-W.; Fushinobu, S.; Takaki, K.; Yamada, T.; Watanabe, A.;
Miyauchi, K.; Endo, G.; Wakagi, T.; Shoun, H. Potential of aerobic denitrification by
Pseudomonas Stutzeri TR2 to reduce nitrous oxide emissions from wastewater treatment
plants. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **2010**, *76* (14), 4619–4625.
https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01983-09.

(37) Wang, Z.; Zhang, X.-X.; Lu, X.; Liu, B.; Li, Y.; Long, C.; Li, A. Abundance and
diversity of bacterial nitrifiers and denitrifiers and their functional genes in tannery
wastewater treatment plants revealed by high-throughput sequencing. *PLOS ONE* **2014**,
9 (11), e113603. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0113603.

(38) Wigley, K.; Egbadon, E.; Carere, C. R.; Weaver, L.; Baronian, K.; Burbery, L.; Dupont,
P. Y.; Bury, S. J.; Gostomski, P. A. RNA stable isotope probing and high-throughput
sequencing to identify active microbial community members in a methane-driven
denitrifying biofilm. *Journal of Applied Microbiology* **2022**, *132* (2), 1526–1542.
https://doi.org/10.1111/jam.15264.

(39) Rissanen, A. J.; Ojala, A.; Fred, T.; Toivonen, J.; Tiirola, M. *Methylophilaceae* and
Hyphomicrobium as target taxonomic groups in monitoring the function of methanol-fed
denitrification biofilters in municipal wastewater treatment plants. *Journal of Industrial*
Microbiology and Biotechnology **2017**, *44* (1), 35–47. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10295-
016-1860-5.

(40) Qi, C.; Zhou, Y.; Suenaga, T.; Oba, K.; Lu, J.; Wang, G.; Zhang, L.; Yoon, S.; Terada,
A. Organic carbon determines nitrous oxide consumption activity of clade I and II *nosZ*
bacteria: Genomic and biokinetic insights. *Water Research* **2022**, *209*, 117910.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2021.117910.

(41) Zakem, E. J.; Mahadevan, A.; Lauderdale, J. M.; Follows, M. J. Stable aerobic and
anaerobic coexistence in anoxic marine zones. *ISME J* **2020**, *14* (1), 288–301.
https://doi.org/10.1038/s41396-019-0523-8.

(42) Chen, J.; Strous, M. Denitrification and aerobic respiration, hybrid electron transport
chains and co-evolution. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta (BBA) - Bioenergetics* **2013**,
1827 (2), 136–144. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbabio.2012.10.002.

(43) Martineau, C.; Mauffrey, F.; Villemur, R. Comparative analysis of denitrifying activities
of *Hyphomicrobium nitrativorans*, *Hyphomicrobium denitrificans*, and
Hyphomicrobium zavarzinii. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **2015**, *81* (15),
5003–5014. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00848-15.

(44) Martineau, C.; Villeneuve, C.; Mauffrey, F.; Villemur, R. *Hyphomicrobium*
nitrativorans sp. nov., isolated from the biofilm of a methanol-fed denitrification system
treating seawater at the Montreal Biodome. *International Journal of Systematic and*

Evolutionary Microbiology **2013**, *63* (Pt_10), 3777–3781.
https://doi.org/10.1099/ijs.0.048124-0.

(45) Gao, J.; Li, M. M.; Zhao, G. Thiocyanate increases the nitrous oxide formation process through modifying the soil bacterial community. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture* **2022**, *102* (6), 2321–2329. https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.11570.

(46) Arai, H. Regulation and function of versatile aerobic and anaerobic respiratory metabolism in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Front. Microbiol.* **2011**, *2*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2011.00103.

(47) Toyofuku, M.; Nomura, N.; Kuno, E.; Tashiro, Y.; Nakajima, T.; Uchiyama, H. Influence of the *Pseudomonas quinolone* signal on denitrification in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa. Journal of Bacteriology* **2008**, *190* (24), 7947–7956. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.00968-08.

(48) Beck, D. A. C.; Hendrickson, E. L.; Vorobev, A.; Wang, T.; Lim, S.; Kalyuzhnaya, M. G.; Lidstrom, M. E.; Hackett, M.; Chistoserdova, L. An integrated proteomics/transcriptomics approach points to oxygen as the main electron sink for methanol metabolism in *Methylotenera mobilis. Journal of Bacteriology* **2011**, *193* (18), 4758–4765. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.05375-11.

(49) Palmer, K.; Biasi, C.; Horn, M. A. Contrasting denitrifier communities relate to contrasting N_2O emission patterns from acidic peat soils in arctic tundra. *The ISME Journal* **2012**, *6* (5), 1058–1077. https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2011.172.

(50) Duan, H.; Ye, L.; Erler, D.; Ni, B.-J.; Yuan, Z. Quantifying nitrous oxide production pathways in wastewater treatment systems using isotope technology – A critical review. *Water Research* **2017**, *122*, 96–113. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.05.054.

(51) Zhao, Y.-W.; Du, L.-L.; Hu, B.; Lin, H.-Y.; Liang, B.; Song, Y.-P.; Wang, Y.-Q.; Wang, H.-W.; Li, P.-F.; Wang, A.-J.; Wang, H.-C. Impact of influent characteristics and operational parameters on nitrous oxide emissions in wastewater treatment: Strategies for mitigation and microbial insights. *Current Research in Biotechnology* **2024**, *7*, 100207. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.crbiot.2024.100207.

(52) Tallec, G.; Garnier, J.; Billen, G.; Gousailles, M. Nitrous oxide emissions from secondary activated sludge in nitrifying conditions of urban wastewater treatment plants: Effect of oxygenation level. *Water Research* **2006**, *40* (15), 2972–2980. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2006.05.037.

(53) Pan, Y.; Ni, B.-J.; Bond, P. L.; Ye, L.; Yuan, Z. Electron competition among nitrogen oxides reduction during methanol-utilizing denitrification in wastewater treatment. *Water Research* **2013**, *47* (10), 3273–3281. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2013.02.054.

(54) LaSarre, B.; Morlen, R.; Neumann, G. C.; Harwood, C. S.; McKinlay, J. B. Nitrous oxide reduction by two partial denitrifying bacteria requires denitrification intermediates that cannot be respired. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* **2023**, *90* (1), e01741-23. https://doi.org/10.1128/aem.01741-23.