A Metagenomic Study of Antibiotic Resistance Across Diverse Soil Types and Geographical Locations

Stephanie Pillay[1], Yasin Tepeli[1], Paul van Lent[1], Thomas Abeel[1,2]

[1] Delft Bioinformatics Lab, Delft University of Technology, Delft, the Netherlands

[2] Infectious Disease and Microbiome Program, Broad Institute of MIT and Harvard, Cambridge, USA

Correspondence: Thomas Abeel (T.Abeel@tudelft.nl)

Abstract

Background: Soil naturally harbours antibiotic resistant bacteria and is considered to be a reservoir for

antibiotic resistance. The overuse of antibiotics across human, animal, and environmental sectors has

intensified this issue leading to an increased acquisition of antibiotic resistant genes by bacteria in soil. Various

biogeographical factors, such as soil pH, temperature, and pollutants, play a role in the spread and emergence

of antibiotic resistance in soil. In this study, we utilised publicly available metagenomic datasets from four

different soil types (rhizosphere, urban, natural, and rural areas) sampled from nine distinct geographic

locations to explore the patterns of antibiotic resistance in soils from different regions.

Results: *Bradyrhizobium* was predominant in vegetation soil types regardless of soil pH and temperature.

ESKAPE pathogen *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* was prevalent in rural soil samples. Antibiotic resistance gene

families such as 16s rRNA with mutations conferring resistance to aminoglycoside antibiotics, OXA β-

lactamase, ANT(3"), and the RND and MFS efflux pump gene were identified in all soil types, with their

abundances influenced by anthropogenic activities, vegetation, and climate in different geographical locations.

Plasmids were more abundant in rural soils and were linked to aminoglycoside resistance. Integrons and

integrative elements identified were associated with commonly used and naturally occurring antibiotics,

showing similar abundances across different soil types and geographical locations.

Conclusion: Antimicrobial resistance in soil may be driven by anthropogenic activities and biogeographical

factors, increasing the risk of bacteria developing resistance and leading to higher morbidity and mortality

rates in humans and animals.

Keywords: Metagenomics, Soil types, Antibiotic resistance, Mobile genetic elements, Biogeographical factors

Introduction

Antimicrobial resistance (AMR) has contributed to approximately 4.95 million deaths worldwide (Ramtahal *et al.*, 2022). The continuous use of antibiotics in clinical and environmental sectors such as animals, soil and water has led to the development of resistant bacteria, which can spread between humans, animals, and the environment (Ramtahal *et al.*, 2022). As a result, antibiotic resistance has been identified as a major driver of mortality and one of the most critical environmental issues (Wang *et al.*, 2021).

Soil is a large reservoir of microbial diversity and a majority of antibiotics used in clinical and non-clinical sectors have been isolated from soil microorganisms (Wang *et al.*, 2021). Interestingly, environmental bacteria in soil possessed antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) pre-dating the discovery of antibiotics which ensured their survival in the natural environment (Song *et al.*, 2021, Ordine *et al.*, 2023). Despite the natural presence of ARGs in the soil microbiome, anthropogenic activity has impacted the intrinsic resistome. Fertilisation of crops, irrigation, excessive use of xenobiotics in crops, antibiotic use in livestock production and deforestation can alter the microbial community in the soil and disseminate ARGs throughout the environment (Ordine *et al.*, 2023). This makes soil a reservoir for both intrinsic and acquired antibiotic resistance due to the mixture of ARGs from indigenous microbes and those introduced by human activities (Song *et al.*, 2021, Wang *et al.*, 2021).

Biogeographical patterns can also influence antibiotic resistant bacteria and ARGs in the soil (Song *et al.*, 2021). Factors such as pH, temperature, moisture, and nutrients can affect ARG profiles and microbial composition. Soils with a neutral pH, low temperature, high moisture content and nutrient-rich will have an increased abundance and diversity of bacteria as well as a diverse range of ARGs (Wu *et al.*, 2023). These factors promote the spread of antibiotic resistance by mobile genetic elements (MGEs) which enables non-pathogenic and pathogenic bacteria to acquire resistance increasing the risk of bacterial infections in humans and animals (Han *et al.*, 2022).

Additionally, the soil microbiome and ARGs can differ across soil types. Natural and pristine soil is largely unaffected or undisturbed by human activity or external sources, serving as a reference point for understanding microbial communities and ARGs with little anthropogenic selection pressure (Van Goethem *et al.*, 2018). The rhizosphere soil surrounds the plant roots and is influenced by root secretions and agricultural

practices. Urban soil encompasses anthropogenic soil near forests, parks, gardens, and residential areas, while

rural soil includes non-urban areas like small villages, towns, and settlements. Soil with more human activity is

expected to contain a mixture of environmental and pathogenic bacteria; and resistance genes that confer

resistance to clinically relevant antibiotics, heavy metals, biocides and disinfecting agents (Cytryn, 2013). It

should be noted that similar soil types from different geographical locations will not necessarily have similar

microbial communities or ARGs as agricultural activities, travel, environmental contamination, antibiotic usage,

soil management practices, population and socioeconomic conditions differ between countries (Manyi-Loh *et*

al., 2018). These factors have complex and interrelated effects on antibiotic resistance in soil.

Since soil encompasses different environmental conditions with distinct microbial environments, it is

important to understand how these factors interact and contribute to AMR to develop effective mitigation

strategies (Manyi-Loh *et al.,* 2018, Wu *et al.,* 2023). In this study, we analysed metagenomic sequences from

four different soil types: natural, urban, rhizosphere, and rural soil collected from nine different geographical

locations i.e., South Africa, Singapore, China, Israel, Botswana, Chile, Germany, El Salvador, and Antarctica. We

aim to determine the differences in microbial composition between each soil type sampled from these various

geographical locations. Furthermore, we investigate the differences in antibiotic resistance genes and mobile

genetic elements (plasmids, integrons and integrative elements) identified in each soil type with regards to

geographical location.

Methods

Data sources

Whole metagenomic datasets were obtained from NCBI SRA (https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra). These

datasets represented various soil types: natural soil (NS), urban soil (US), rhizosphere soil (RHS) and rural soil

(RS) from different geographical locations (South Africa, Singapore, China, Israel, Botswana, Chile, Germany, El

Salvador, and Antarctica) sampled over the last 10 years. Only metagenomic sequences that were sequenced

using Illumina, had a read base count over 1e+09 and an average read length over 150bp were included.

Detailed information about the metagenomes retrieved from the database is included in Supplementary Table

1 and presented in summarized form in Table 1.

Table 1: Summary of included studies, respective sample source, location and sample size. Study identifiers

start with the soil abbreviation: natural soil (NS), urban soil (US), rhizosphere soil (RHS) and rural soil (RS).

Study	Sample source	Location	Number of samples	Citation
NS1	Deep forest	China	3	(Zheng *et al.*, 2021)
NS2	Mountain	China	5	(Liao *et al.*, 2022)
NS3	Desert	Israel	12	(Bay *et al.*, 2020)
NS4	Desert	Chile	11	(Hwang *et al.*, 2021)
NS5	Antarctic	Antarctica	27	(Franco *et al.*, 2022)
US1	Forest park, residential areas, hospital areas	China	10	(Zheng *et al.*, 2021)
US2	Road verge, park	China	10	(Liao *et al.*, 2022)
US3	Nature reserve	Germany	8	(Mantri *et al.*, 2021)
RHS1	Greenhouse	Singapore	13	(Bandla *et al.*, 2020)
RHS2	Soybean farm	South Africa	12	(Babalola *et al.*, 2022)
RHS3	Peanut and maize farm	China	21	(Dong *et al.*, 2022)
RS1	Rural village	El Salvador	25	(Pehrsson *et al.*, 2016)
RS2	Rural village	Botswana	1	(Brooks *et al.*, 2023)

Bioinformatic analysis

Quality control of reads was conducted using FastQC v.0.11.9 (Andrews, 2010) and filtered with Trimmomatic

v.0.39 (Bolger *et al.*, 2014). Reads were trimmed for quality and adapter contamination using Trimmomatic

with the following parameters specified: *ILLUMINACLIP: adapters.fa:2:30:10 LEADING:3 TRAILING:3*

MINLEN:30 SLIDINGWINDOW: 4:20. The microbiome was analysed using Kraken2 v.2.1.0 (Wood *et al.*, 2019)

with the minikraken2 microbial database (2019, 8GB). Species confirmation and abundance estimation were

performed with Bracken v.2.6.2 (Lu *et al.*, 2017). The relative abundances of bacterial genera were used to

determine the microbial populations in each soil type. Statistical significance of the microbiome between

studies in a soil type was assessed using the non-parametric Wilcoxon rank sum test and Friedman's ANOVA

with SPSS software (IBM SPSS Statistics). Differences in the microbiome were considered statistically

significant at p < 0.05. The Beta diversity of the microbiome among soil types was visualized using non-metric

multidimensional scaling (NMDS) analysis with Bray-Curtis dissimilarity in the R package vegan v.2.6-4.

The filtered reads were *de novo* assembled using metaSPAdes v.3.15.2 (Nurk *et al.*, 2017) on meta mode with

default parameters. The assembled metagenomes were annotated to determine the antibiotic resistance gene

families and drug classes using the Comprehensive Antimicrobial Resistance Database Resistance gene

identifier (CARD - RGI) v.3.1.2 with default settings including loose matches and the -low_quality -clean

options (Jia *et al.*, 2016). The version of the database was consistent throughout the analysis. Moreover, the

studies in each soil type were compared by analysing the relative abundance of annotated antibiotic resistance

genes. This comparison was based on normalizing the data using the total number of datasets in each study

indicating their respective proportions.

De novo metagenomic assembled contigs were aligned to detect integrons and integrative elements by

aligning them to the INTEGRALL database (Moura *et al.*, 2009) and the ICEberg database (Liu *et al.*, 2019).

Alignments were done using BWA-mem v.0.7.10 with default parameters (Li & Durbin, 2009) which generated

a SAM file. To filter out soft and hard clipped reads and undesirable alignments, the SAM files were processed

using the Samclip tool with default parameters to remove alignments that could generate downstream issues.

The resulting SAM file was then converted to a BAM file using SAMtools version v.1.9 (Li & Durbin, 2009).

Contigs that aligned with databases were considered integrons and integrative conjugative elements. Contigs

were classified as plasmid-originating using Plasclass v.0.1.1 (Pellow *et al.*, 2020), with a minimum length

threshold of > 1000 and a probability threshold of > 0.75 for contigs to be considered plasmid-originating. To

determine if the detected plasmids were linked to antibiotic resistance gene families, the plasmid-originating

contigs were compared to previously identified contigs carrying antibiotic resistance genes and matched to

corresponding AMR drug classes.

132 Results and discussion

133 Microbial communities are dependent on their habitat.

134 To identify the bacterial communities within different types of soil from different locations (Supplementary

135 Table 1), we performed taxonomic classification. Soil hosts a diverse range of microbial communities

136 influenced by abiotic and biotic characteristics, microbial abundances, activity, and community composition.

137 Consequently, there is no "typical" soil microbiome, and bacterial relative abundances vary by soil type (Fierer,

138 2017).

Figure 1: Heatmap showing the relative abundances of bacterial genera over 2% in each study from each soil type. The y-axis indicates the genera, and the x-axis represents the soil studies (Table 1). Each soil type is divided by the dashed black line and the abundances of bacterial genera are indicated by the intensity of grey.

Bacteria in natural soils are influenced by their habitat and environmental conditions (Supplementary Table 2). In Figure 1, *Bradyrhizobium* dominates the deep forest areas (NS1 and NS2), whereas bacteria like *Rubrobacter*, known for its thermophilic traits, are found in desert-like conditions (NS4), as confirmed by Connon *et al.* (2007) Pajares & Bohannan (2016) and Zheng *et al.* (2021). The microbial communities detected were statistically different between each of the natural studies indicating environmental influence ($p < 0.05$). Climate, pH, temperature and rainfall may all influence the abundances and types of bacteria found soil as discussed by Chase *et al.,* (2021).

Streptomyces was prevalent across all urban studies; however, the overall microbial community differed significantly between these urban studies ($p < 0.05$) (Figure 1 and Supplementary Table 3). As expected, higher abundances of *Bradyrhizobium, Mycobacterium,* and *Rhodopseudomonas* were observed in urban soil obtained from the nature reserve (US3). These bacteria thrive in areas with more vegetation and reduced anthropogenic activity, such as nature reserves, compared to residential and forest park areas (Wong *et al.,* 2014, Gorovtsov *et al.,* 2020, Glushakova *et al.,* 2021).

Plant growth-promoting bacteria such as *Streptomyces, Burkholderia, Pseudomonas,* and *Bradyrhizobium* were found in less than 12% abundance across different rhizosphere soil studies (Figure 1 and Supplementary Table 4). Overall, these microbial communities were different in each of the rhizosphere soil studies ($p < 0.05$). These bacteria also assist in protecting plants against pathogens by producing antibiotics (Kashyap et al., 2019; de Sousa et al., 2022; Liu et al., 2022). *Bradyrhizobium,* which aids in nitrogen fixation and plant growth, is found at an 8% abundance in RHS1, 2% in RHS2 and 4% in RHS3 (Fierer, 2017). Soil in RHS1 and RHS3 consisted of crops supplemented with nitrogen-phosphorus-potassium (NPK) fertiliser (Supplementary Table 1). Despite this, these studies showed a higher abundance of *Bradyrhizobium* compared to RHS2, which was not supplemented. This contradicts previous studies suggesting that *Bradyrhizobium* will be present in a low abundance when nitrogen fertilisers are used (Okubo *et al.,* 2013, Yan *et al.,* 2017).

168 Lastly, in rural soil studies (p < 0.05), *Pseudomonas, Escherichia, Streptomyces,* and *Klebsiella* were prevalent,

169 including the ESKAPE (*Enterococcus faecium, Staphylococcus aureus, Klebsiella pneumoniae, Acinetobacter*

170 *baumannii, Pseudomonas aeruginosa,* and *Enterobacter* species) pathogens *Klebsiella pneumonia* and

171 *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* (Figure 1 and Supplementary Tables 5 and 6 respectively). The high prevalence of

172 these pathogens in rural areas is attributed to anthropogenic factors, such as the presence of domestic

173 animals, open defecation, and inadequate sanitation (Brooks et al., 2023). These conditions contribute to

174 antibiotic resistance hotspots in rural areas, as domestic animals spread faecal matter, and open sewage

175 drains and insufficient sanitation increases the selection pressure for antibiotic resistance (Nadimpalli *et al.,*

176 2020).

177 Overall, these results demonstrate that the bacterial composition and abundance within each soil type may be

178 influenced by a myriad of factors, including environmental conditions, nutrients, temperature, oxygen

179 availability, and pH types within the specific geographical location (Pajares & Bohannan, 2016, Fierer, 2017, de

180 Sousa *et al.,* 2022). Understanding the composition of microbial communities is critical for comprehending soil

181 health and potential risks associated with antibiotic resistance in various environments.

182 Natural, urban and rhizosphere soil types have similar microbial communities.

To assess the differences between microbial communities, present in different types of soil from different

geographical locations (Table 1), we analysed the beta-diversity. Additionally, we aimed to determine if the

geographical locations influence the microbial communities in each soil type. The beta-diversity quantifies the

"distance" between microbial communities using the Bray-Curtis index and can be visualized by non-metric

multidimensional scaling (NMDS). A smaller distance between samples from different countries and soil types

indicates a greater similarity in microbial composition. Figure 2 shows the NMDS plots for each type of soil

from their respective countries.

Figure 2: Non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) visualising the dissimilarity (Beta-diversity) between

microbial communities from different soil types from different countries (Table 1). Each soil type is

represented by a different shape (natural = circle, rhizosphere = triangle, rural = square, urban = cross) and

each country or region is colour-coded (Antarctica = light blue, Botswana = dark blue, Chile = light green, China

= dark green, El Salvador = pink, Germany = red, Israel = salmon, Singapore = orange, South Africa = lilac). The

samples that have smaller distances between them are circled in blue.

Figure 2 shows that most samples cluster together regardless of the soil type or geographical location. Natural,

rhizosphere, urban, and many rural soil samples are closely grouped, suggesting similar microbial communities

across these soil types. This similarity may be related to vegetation and varying levels of anthropogenic activity

(Pajares & Bohannan, 2016, Zheng *et al.*, 2021). However, some rural samples from El Salvador differ which

could be due to human activity or soil around latrine toilets and clothes washing areas. This can limit plant-

promoting bacteria and support enteric pathogens (Pehrsson *et al.*, 2016, Brooks *et al.*, 2023). Samples from

specific studies like RS1 (El Salvador), NS2 (China), NS4 (Chile) and NS5 (Antarctica) are further apart, indicating

variations in the microbial composition. Such differences within the same study may result from spatial

variability in the soil environment, even when sampling sites are only a few centimetres apart (Fierer, 2017).

Anthropogenic activities, vegetation, and climate play a role in the selection and prevalence

of antibiotic resistance genes.

To understand the connection between AMR gene families and the different types of soil, we examined the

presence and abundance of AMR gene families in the assembled metagenomes (contigs) from each study

within their respective soil type (Table 1). While AMR gene families are naturally present in soil environments,

external factors like livestock and human activities can influence their types and abundance (Hernández *et al.*,

2023).

Figure 3: Heatmap showing the abundance of AMR gene families present over 5% in each study within each

soil type. The y-axis indicates the AMR gene families, and the x-axis represents the soil studies (Table 1). Each

soil type is divided by a dashed black line and the abundances of AMR gene families are indicated by the

intensity of grey.

Overall, more than 0.001% of contigs contained AMR gene families in each study. We identified five AMR gene

families that were abundant (Figure 3). Two of which are associated with acquired resistance: 23S rRNA, which

confers resistance to macrolides, and 16S rRNA, which confers resistance to aminoglycosides. Intrinsic

resistance gene families include the major facilitator superfamily (MFS) and resistance-nodulation-cell division

(RND) antibiotic efflux pumps, and the OXA beta-lactamase gene family, which is associated with acquired and

intrinsic resistance (Poirel *et al.*, 2010, Garcia *et al.*, 2022). These gene families confer resistance to macrolides,

and beta-lactams including carbapenems, cephalosporins, and penams (Supplementary Table 7).

Figure 3 shows that the 23S rRNA mutation conferring resistance to macrolide antibiotics were more prevalent

in urban soils as compared to the natural, rhizosphere and rural soils. Specifically, in US2 from China, 85% of

the detected AMR gene families were the 23S rRNA gene with this mutation, with other urban studies like US1

had 58% abundance. In contrast, natural soil studies such as NS1 and NS2 had lower abundances of 33% and

52%, respectively. Urban soil samples were collected from areas with high human activity (forest parks,

residential zones, and road verges) which have greater antibiotic pollution and selective pressures promoting

the proliferation of antibiotic resistant bacteria, as detailed by Osbiston *et al.* (2021).

The MFS and RND efflux pump gene families were detected across all types of soil except for US2 and RS2

(Figure 3). Efflux pumps are key for intrinsic resistance, providing bacteria with a baseline level of resistance by

actively expelling a broad range of antibiotics from their cells (Garcia *et al.*, 2022). In our study, RS1 exhibited a

high abundance of these efflux pump gene families, with 17% for RND and 13% for MFS (Figure 3 and

Supplementary Table 7). The presence of these efflux pump gene families in rural soils may also be influenced

by factors such as animal feedlots, domestic sewage, and human-excrement-irrigated vegetable fields (Cheng

et al., 2020). Additionally, vegetation, flora and fauna influences the presence of efflux pump gene families, as

discussed by Martinez *et al.* (2009) and Pasqua *et al.* (2019).

Lastly, we found the OXA beta-lactamase gene family present in all rhizosphere and natural soil studies, except

US2 and RS2, with a high abundance in US3 (7%) and RHS3 (7%) (Figure 3 and Supplementary Table 7). The

OXA beta-lactamase gene family has been shown to confer both acquired and intrinsic resistance and can be

found in all soil types; from primitive natural soils with little to no anthropogenic activity to urban

environments (Djenadi *et al.*, 2018, Han *et al.*, 2022). Previous research also suggests that the climate affects

the abundance of ARGs, with beta-lactam resistance genes being more common in warmer areas (Li *et al.*,

2022). However, our study found similar AMR gene families across all soil types, regardless of temperature.

Plasmids linked to aminoglycoside resistance are common in all soil types.

To investigate the presence of plasmids and their connection to antibiotic drug classes in different soil types,

we analysed the percentage of contigs classified as plasmids in each study and their association with antibiotic

drug classes. Although AMR is a natural occurrence in soil, human activity has led to increased contamination

with antibiotics and ARGs in the soil. Soil plasmids can transfer these ARGs from one bacterial host to another

integrating into plant and animal cells and spreading AMR (Meng *et al.*, 2022).

Firstly, less than 1% of contigs were classified as plasmids in each study from every soil type. Further analysis

linking detected plasmids to AMR drug classes revealed that, except RHS2, RHS3, RS2 and US2, all studies had

more than 0.01% of plasmids associated with AMR drug classes. Notably, RS1 had 1.8% of plasmids linked to

AMR. A high percentage of plasmids is common in rural communities due to unregulated access to antibiotics,

limited clean water and human and animal activities. These conditions increase the risk of exposure to

plasmids and ARGs from effluents, contaminated soils, and waste, enhancing plasmid accumulation and

horizontal gene transfer compared to natural and urban soils (Pehrsson *et al.*, 2016, Brooks *et al.*, 2023).

Secondly, we examined the association between plasmids and specific antibiotic drug classes (Supplementary

Table 8). Overall, all studies from different soil types, except RHS2, RHS3, US2 and RS2, contained plasmids

associated with aminoglycoside, carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam, glycopeptide and peptide drug classes.

Details on the abundances of plasmids linked to AMR drug classes and the individual AMR gene families can be

found in Supplementary Table 8.

Plasmids encoding naturally occurring antibiotics were identified in natural and urban soil studies. Among the

natural soil types, NS1 showed a high abundance of plasmids associated with aminoglycosides (13%) and

carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam (16%) drug classes. These high abundances were consistent with other

natural studies (Supplementary Table 8). Similar to NS1, US1 had a high abundance of plasmids associated with

aminoglycosides (13%), carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam (25%) along with fluoroquinolones (13%),

glycopeptide (25%), macrolide (13%) and tetracycline (13%) drug classes. Additionally, US3 had plasmids linked

to similar antibiotic drug classes: aminoglycosides (16%), carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam (11%),

glycopeptide (12%) and peptides (9%). In our study, the natural and urban studies, sampled from forests and

deserts for natural soils and residential areas and forest parks for urban soils, showed higher abundances of

plasmids associated with naturally occurring antibiotics such as aminoglycosides, glycopeptides, and beta-

lactams (Zhao *et al.*, 2019, Meng *et al.*, 2022). These abundances may also be influenced by heavy metals and

other contaminants in the soil types as noted by Zhao *et al.* (2019).

Amended rhizosphere soil (RHS1) showed a high abundance of plasmids associated with AMR drug classes.

Specifically, aminoglycoside (17%), carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam (8%), glycopeptide (10%) and

sulphonamide (10%) resistance plasmids were detected in rhizosphere soils. Although plasmids were detected

in RHS2 and RHS3, none were associated with previously identified ARGs. Amended soils, such as rhizosphere

soils and natural soils are nutrient-rich environments that can facilitate the spread of AMR through plasmids

(van Elsas & Bailey, 2002, Perry & Wright, 2013).

Lastly in rural soils, RS2, a single sample study, did not contain any plasmids associated with AMR. However,

RS1 had a high abundance of plasmids linked to aminoglycoside (24%), carbapenem; cephalosporin; penam

(9%) and sulphonamide (39%) resistance. This is consistent with a study from a rural village in India that found

resistance to carbapenems, cephalosporins, penams, sulphonamides, tetracyclines, and quinolones, with *E. coli*

carrying plasmids for resistance to quinolones, cephalosporins, and colistin. This study suggested that the local

antibiotic use patterns supports the persistence of plasmids with ARGs (Purohit *et al.*, 2017).

While antibiotics and ARGs naturally occur in soil, their transmission to different environments through

plasmids is concerning, especially in environments with increased anthropogenic activity. This contributes to

the spread of AMR to both pathogenic and non-pathogenic bacteria, posing a significant threat to the natural

environment and human health (Meng *et al.*, 2022).

AMR genes associated with integrons that are highly abundant were selected due to the

constant use of antibiotics.

To identify the presence of integrons and their association with AMR gene families, we classified integrons

from the metagenomic contigs present in each soil study. Furthermore, we linked the classified integrons with

AMR gene families to determine the differences between soil studies. Integrons are mobile genetic elements

that capture and express ARGs, particularly among gram-negative pathogenic bacteria. Integrons are present

in all environments and can serve as markers for tracing sources of pollution (Gillings, 2014).

We used the assembled metagenomic contigs to determine the percentage of classified integrons

(Supplementary Table 9). In all soil types studied, less than 0.001% of contigs were identified as integrons. The

integrons that were found were classified into their respective classes of 1, 2 and 3 (Supplementary Table 9).

Class 1 integrons made up a higher percentage (> 11%) of the integrons we found between all soil types from

all studies. Class 3 integrons constitutes a range of 2% to 5% of integrons found while class 2 integrons had a

lower percentage of 1% to 2%. The remainder of the integrons were unclassified. These high abundances of

class 1 and class 3 in all types of soil regardless of country are expected as class 1 and 3 integrons are found in

Proteobacteria in soil environments whereas class 2 integrons are commonly found in marine environments.

Overall, integrons are found in diverse environments which include forest soil, desert soil, Antarctic soil and

plant surfaces (Gillings, 2014).

In our study, we identified class 1, 2 and 3 integrons and their association with AMR genes (Supplementary

Tables 10 and 11). We found a high abundance of class 1 integrons associated with disinfecting agents and

sulphonamide resistance in all types of soil. The high abundance of the *qacE* gene with class 1 integrons can be

traced back to the use of quaternary ammonium compounds which were first used as hospital disinfecting

agents in 1930 and have become a part of the class 1 integron, known to be highly abundant in soils (Gillings,

2014, Cheng *et al.*, 2020). Similarly, sulphonamides were the first true antibiotic to be used in the 1930s and

have been selected for and can be commonly found in class 1 integrons (Gillings, 2014).

A high abundance of class 2 integrons was associated with aminoglycoside resistance (*aadB*) which ranged

from 15% in the RS1 to 75% in NS3 and NS4, and 83% in RHS3 and US1 (Supplementary Tables 10 and 11).

Aminoglycoside antibiotics were originally isolated from soil bacteria and commonly used in agriculture,

increasing their presence in soil environments, potentially affecting plant-soil microbial communities. They

also enter soils through human waste, municipal wastewater systems, and clinical use. These direct and

indirect exposures contributes to the detection of aminoglycoside resistance genes in various soil types, often

associated with class 1 and class 2 integrons (Blau *et al.,* 2018, Coates *et al.,* 2022). Previous studies have

shown that the *aadB* aminoglycoside resistance gene is frequently associated with class 1, 2, and 3 integrons

and is present in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa, Salmonella* spp., *Acinetobacter baumannii, Klebsiella* spp., and

Escherichia coli which are present in our study (Sabbagh *et al.,* 2021). Additionally, Jones *et al.,* (2005) showed

that the *aadB* gene, associated with class 1 integrons, had a close association with the bla_{SHV} gene conferring

resistance to penicillin and cephalosporins. This association was not seen in our study. Lastly, class 3 integrons

were predominantly associated with the *qacE* gene, which provides resistance to disinfectants. Over 55% of

class 3 integrons in all soil studies were linked to the *qacE* gene, with 100% in NS4, 97% in RHS2, and 97% in

US3. Similarly to class 1 integrons, the *qacE* gene are commonly found in class 3 integrons as it is considered to

be a conserved segment and had been selected for in the past (Sabbagh *et al.,* 2021).

Integrative and mobilizable elements were identified in each type of soil.

Finally, we used the assembled metagenomic contigs to determine the percentage of integrative elements.

Integrative elements consist of integrative and conjugative elements (ICE), integrative and mobilizable

elements (IME) and cis-integrative and mobilizable elements (CIME) that are self-transmittable and can carry

and spread ARGs to other bacterial hosts (Delavat *et al.,* 2017).

We found that all the studies across all soil types had less than 0.1% of contigs classified as integrative

elements. ICE elements were the most prevalent integrative element compared to IMEs and CIMEs. In the RS2

study, 100% of the integrative elements were CIMEs, while other studies had less than 20% CIMEs. The

abundance of ICEs in all studies across all soil types was over 70%, with no ICE elements found in RS2.

The most prominent ICE families among all studies in all soil types were *Tn4371* (>12%), *SXT/R391* (>5%) and

ICEclc (>8%) (Supplementary Table 12). These ICE families are commonly found in soil and aid in the

degradation of pollutants (Obi *et al.,* 2018, Hirose *et al.,* 2021, Roman *et al.,* 2021). Additionally, we identified

different SGI1 IME families present in the different studies within the different types of soil (Supplementary

Table 13). SGI1 has been characterized as a *Salmonella* genomic island that can spread multi-drug resistance to

human and animal pathogens (Cummins *et al.,* 2020).   Bacteria carrying these integrative elements have a

higher potential for spreading infections thus facilitating the spread of AMR to other environments (Delavat *et*

al., 2017). This underscores the importance of continuously monitoring mobile genetic elements in different

soil types.

Conclusion

We analysed publicly available metagenomic data to investigate the microbial population, antibiotic resistance

genes and mobile genetic elements in rhizosphere, urban, natural, and rural soils sampled from South Africa,

Singapore, China, Israel, Botswana, Chile, Germany, El Salvador, and Antarctica to understand the spread of

antibiotic resistance in different soil environments.

Our study revealed that plant-promoting bacteria such as *Bradyrhizobium,* dominates soil rich in vegetation

and nutrients such as the rhizosphere and natural soil regardless of geographic location. Urban soils contain a

mix of plant-promoting bacteria and pollutant-degrading bacteria, such as *Arthrobacter,* while rural village soils

harbour a combination of environmental bacteria and opportunistic pathogens like *E. coli.* Bacteria in the soil

are dependent on physiological (temperature, mixing of soil profiles, water change, soil compaction), chemical

(heavy metal, soil pH, polyaromatic hydrocarbons) and biological (artificial vegetation, faecal contamination)

factors. As such, more pathogenic bacteria especially those on the ESKAPE pathogen list are dominant in areas

with high human activity. These bacteria can carry antibiotic resistant genes that may spread to domestic and

food animals, vegetation, water sources and humans leading to untreatable infections in all sectors.

Antibiotic resistant gene families detected in this study i.e., 23S rRNA with mutation conferring resistance to

macrolide antibiotics, major facilitator superfamily (MFS) antibiotic efflux pump, resistance-nodulation-cell

division (RND) antibiotic efflux pump, OXA beta-lactamase, ANT(3'') and 16s rRNA with mutation conferring

resistance to aminoglycoside antibiotics in soil. These genes favour the development of multi-drug resistance,

posing a threat to antibiotic effectiveness. While antibiotic resistant gene families such as the RND and MFS

efflux pump gene families occur naturally in soil, anthropogenic activity, vegetation, and climate may play a

role in the emergence of AMR and the acquisition of ARGs. Additionally, plasmids associated with AMR gene

families like OXA beta-lactamase facilitates the spread of resistance from soil to various environments like

water, humans or animals.

Integrons detected in this study were linked to commonly used antibiotics in all soil types, suggesting that the

overuse of antibiotics contributes to the spread and emergence of antibiotic resistant bacteria. These bacteria

may also possess adaptive strategies provided by integrative elements, *SXT/R391, Tn4371, ICEclc* and IMEs

which can potentially carry accessory genes i.e., ARGs. Integrative elements allow bacteria in the soil to

stabilise and adapt to environmental conditions and human activity as well as favouring gene transfer and the

spread of AMR.

To fully understand the emergence and spread of AMR in the environment, factors such as geographical

location, biogeographical patterns, and soil type must be considered. By analysing MGEs and ARGs in diverse

soil types from different countries, we can gain insights into how AMR spreads and adapt strategies to manage

it effectively. Future research should focus on collecting more rural soil data and considering additional factors

such as antibiotic usage, residues, industrial practices, and local regulations to address AMR and

environmental pollution.

Declarations

Competing interests

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial

relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Funding

This work is based on the research supported wholly/in part by the National Research Foundation of South

Africa (Grant Numbers: 120192).

Authors' Contributions

SP and TA designed experiments. SP conducted all experiments, analysed data and wrote the manuscript. YIT

and PL assisted in data analysis. SP, YIT, PL and TA proof-read and edited the manuscript.

References

Andrews S (2010) Babraham bioinformatics-FastQC a quality control tool for high throughput sequence data.

URL: https://www bioinformatics babraham ac uk/projects/fastqc.

Babalola OO, Ajiboye TT & Ayangbenro AS (2022) Microbiome of Soybean (Glycine max L.) Rhizosphere from

Free State, South Africa. *Microbiology Resource Announcements* **11**: e00288-00222.

Bandla A, Pavagadhi S, Sridhar Sudarshan A, Poh MCH & Swarup S (2020) 910 metagenome-assembled

genomes from the phytobiomes of three urban-farmed leafy Asian greens. *Scientific Data* **7**: 278.

Bay SK, McGeoch MA, Gillor O, Wieler N, Palmer DJ, Baker DJ, Chown SL & Greening C (2020) Soil bacterial

communities exhibit strong biogeographic patterns at fine taxonomic resolution. *Msystems* **5**: e00540-00520.

Blau K, Casadevall L, Wolters B, Van den Meersche T, Kreuzig R, Smalla K & Jechalke S (2018) Soil texture-

depending effects of doxycycline and streptomycin applied with manure on the bacterial community

composition and resistome. *FEMS microbiology ecology* **94**: fix145.

Bolger AM, Lohse M & Usadel B (2014) Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data.

Bioinformatics **30**: 2114-2120.

Brooks K, Eze J, Onalenna O & Rahube TO (2023) Analysis of antibiotic resistance from a rural community and

wastewater contaminated environment linked to human and animal activities. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*

Advances 100232.

Chase AB, Weihe C & Martiny JB (2021) Adaptive differentiation and rapid evolution of a soil bacterium along a

climate gradient. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **118**: e2101254118.

Cheng J, Tang X & Liu C (2020) Occurrence and distribution of antibiotic resistance genes in various rural

environmental media. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* **27**: 29191-29203.

Coates J, Bostick KJ, Jones BA, Caston N & Ayalew M (2022) What is the impact of aminoglycoside exposure on

soil and plant root-associated microbiota? A systematic review protocol. *Environmental Evidence* **11**: 1-9.

Connon SA, Lester ED, Shafaat HS, Obenhuber DC & Ponce A (2007) Bacterial diversity in hyperarid Atacama

Desert soils. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences* **112**.

Cummins ML, Hamidian M & Djordjevic SP (2020) Salmonella genomic island 1 is broadly disseminated within

gammaproteobacteriaceae. *Microorganisms* **8**: 161.

Cytryn E (2013) The soil resistome: The anthropogenic, the native, and the unknown. *Soil biology &*

biochemistry **63**: 18-23.

de Sousa LP, Guerreiro-Filho O & Mondego JMC (2022) The Rhizosphere Microbiomes of Five Species of Coffee

Trees. *Microbiology Spectrum* **10**: e00444-00422.

Delavat F, Miyazaki R, Carraro N, Pradervand N & van der Meer JR (2017) The hidden life of integrative and

conjugative elements. *FEMS microbiology reviews* **41**: 512-537.

Djenadi K, Zhang L, Murray AK & Gaze WH (2018) Carbapenem resistance in bacteria isolated from soil and

water environments in Algeria. *Journal of Global Antimicrobial Resistance* **15**: 262-267.

Dong Q, Zhao X, Zhou D, Liu Z, Shi X, Yuan Y, Jia P, Liu Y, Song P & Wang X (2022) Maize and peanut

intercropping improves the nitrogen accumulation and yield per plant of maize by promoting the secretion of

flavonoids and abundance of Bradyrhizobium in rhizosphere. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **13**: 957336.

Fierer N (2017) Embracing the unknown: disentangling the complexities of the soil microbiome. *Nature*

Reviews Microbiology **15**: 579-590.

Franco AL, Adams BJ, Diaz MA, Lemoine NP, Dragone NB, Fierer N, Lyons WB, Hogg I & Wall DH (2022)

Response of Antarctic soil fauna to climate-driven changes since the Last Glacial Maximum. *Global Change*

Biology **28**: 644-653.

Garcia ÍR, de Oliveira Garcia FA, Pereira PS, Coutinho HDM, Siyadatpanah A, Norouzi R, Wilairatana P, de

Lourdes Pereira M, Nissapatorn V & Tintino SR (2022) Microbial resistance: The role of efflux pump

superfamilies and their respective substrates. *Life Sciences* **295**: 120391.

Gillings MR (2014) Integrons: past, present, and future. *Microbiology and Molecular Biology Reviews* **78**: 257-

277.

Glushakova A, Lysak L, Belov A, Ivanova A, Lapygina E, Prokofieva T & Umarova A (2021) Local monitoring of

saprotrophic bacterial complexes of urban soils in Syktyvkar in 2019 and 2020. *Moscow University Soil Science*

Bulletin **76**: 84-88.

Gorovtsov A, Rajput V, Pulikova E, Gerasimenko A, Ivanov F, Vasilchenko N, Demidov A, Jatav H & Minkina T

(2020) Soil Microbial Communities in Urban Environment. *Advances in Environmental Research; Nova Science*

Publisher: Hauppauge, NY, USA.

Han B, Ma L, Yu Q, Yang J, Su W, Hilal MG, Li X, Zhang S & Li H (2022) The source, fate and prospect of

antibiotic resistance genes in soil: A review. *Frontiers in Microbiology* **13**.

Hernández M, Roy S, Keevil CW & Dumont MG (2023) Identification of diverse antibiotic resistant bacteria in

agricultural soil with H218O stable isotope probing combined with high-throughput sequencing. *Environmental*

Microbiome **18**: 34.

Hirose J, Watanabe T, Futagami T, Fujihara H, Kimura N, Suenaga H, Goto M, Suyama A & Furukawa K (2021) A

new ICE clc subfamily integrative and conjugative element responsible for horizontal transfer of biphenyl and

salicylic acid catabolic pathway in the PCB-degrading strain Pseudomonas stutzeri KF716. *Microorganisms* **9**:

2462.

Hwang Y, Rahlff J, Schulze-Makuch D, Schloter M & Probst AJ (2021) Diverse viruses carrying genes for

microbial extremotolerance in the Atacama Desert hyperarid soil. *Msystems* **6**: 10.1128/msystems. 00385-

00321.

Jia B, Raphenya AR, Alcock B, Waglechner N, Guo P, Tsang KK, Lago BA, Dave BM, Pereira S & Sharma AN

(2016) CARD 2017: expansion and model-centric curation of the comprehensive antibiotic resistance database.

Nucleic acids research gkw1004.

Jones LA, McIver CJ, Kim M-J, Rawlinson WD & White PA (2005) The aadB gene cassette is associated with bla

SHV genes in Klebsiella species producing extended-spectrum β-lactamases. *Antimicrobial agents and*

chemotherapy **49**: 794-797.

Li H & Durbin R (2009) Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows–Wheeler transform.

bioinformatics **25**: 1754-1760.

Li Z, Sun A, Liu X, Chen Q, Bi L, Ren P, Shen J, Jin S, He J & Hu H (2022) Climate warming increases the

proportions of specific antibiotic resistance genes in natural soil ecosystems. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*

430: 128442-128442.

Liao H, Li H, Duan C-S, Zhou X-Y, An X-L, Zhu Y-G & Su J-Q (2022) Metagenomic and viromic analysis reveal the

anthropogenic impacts on the plasmid and phage borne transferable resistome in soil. *Environment*

International **170**: 107595.

Liu M, Li X, Xie Y, Bi D, Sun J, Li J, Tai C, Deng Z & Ou H-Y (2019) ICEberg 2.0: an updated database of bacterial

integrative and conjugative elements. *Nucleic acids research* **47**: D660-D665.

Lu J, Breitwieser FP, Thielen P & Salzberg SL (2017) Bracken: estimating species abundance in metagenomics

data. *PeerJ Computer Science* **3**: e104.

Mantri SS, Negri T, Sales-Ortells H, Angelov A, Peter S, Neidhardt H, Oelmann Y & Ziemert N (2021)

Metagenomic sequencing of multiple soil horizons and sites in close vicinity revealed novel secondary

metabolite diversity. *Msystems* **6**: 10.1128/msystems. 01018-01021.

Manyi-Loh C, Mamphweli S, Meyer E & Okoh A (2018) Antibiotic use in agriculture and its consequential

resistance in environmental sources: potential public health implications. *Molecules* **23**: 795.

Martinez JL, Sánchez MB, Martínez-Solano L, Hernandez A, Garmendia L, Fajardo A & Alvarez-Ortega C (2009)

Functional role of bacterial multidrug efflux pumps in microbial natural ecosystems. *FEMS microbiology*

reviews **33**: 430-449.

Meng M, Li Y & Yao H (2022) Plasmid-mediated transfer of antibiotic resistance genes in soil. *Antibiotics* **11**:

525.

Moura A, Soares M, Pereira C, Leitão N, Henriques I & Correia A (2009) INTEGRALL: a database and search

engine for integrons, integrases and gene cassettes. *Bioinformatics* **25**: 1096-1098.

Nadimpalli ML, Marks SJ, Montealegre MC, Gilman RH, Pajuelo MJ, Saito M, Tsukayama P, Njenga SM, Kiiru J &

Swarthout J (2020) Urban informal settlements as hotspots of antimicrobial resistance and the need to curb

environmental transmission. *Nature microbiology* **5**: 787-795.

Nurk S, Meleshko D, Korobeynikov A & Pevzner PA (2017) metaSPAdes: a new versatile metagenomic

assembler. *Genome research* **27**: 824-834.

Obi CC, Vayla S, De Gannes V, Berres ME, Walker J, Pavelec D, Hyman J & Hickey WJ (2018) The integrative

conjugative element clc (ICEclc) of Pseudomonas aeruginosa JB2. *Frontiers in microbiology* **9**: 1532.

Okubo T, Fukushima S, Itakura M, Oshima K, Longtonglang A, Teaumroong N, Mitsui H, Hattori M, Hattori R &

Hattori T (2013) Genome analysis suggests that the soil oligotrophic bacterium Agromonas oligotrophica

(Bradyrhizobium oligotrophicum) is a nitrogen-fixing symbiont of Aeschynomene indica. *Applied and*

environmental microbiology **79**: 2542-2551.

Ordine JVW, De Souza GM, Tamasco G, Virgilio S, Fernandes AFT, Silva-Rocha R & Guazzaroni M-E (2023)

Metagenomic insights for antimicrobial resistance surveillance in soils with different land uses in Brazil.

Antibiotics **12**: 334.

Osbiston K, Oxbrough A & Fernández-Martínez LT (2021) Antibiotic resistance levels in soils from urban and

rural land uses in Great Britain. *Access Microbiology* **3**.

Pajares S & Bohannan BJ (2016) Ecology of nitrogen fixing, nitrifying, and denitrifying microorganisms in

tropical forest soils. *Frontiers in microbiology* **7**: 1045.

Pasqua M, Grossi M, Zennaro A, Fanelli G, Micheli G, Barras F, Colonna B & Prosseda G (2019) The varied role

of efflux pumps of the MFS family in the interplay of bacteria with animal and plant cells. *Microorganisms* **7**:

285.

Pehrsson EC, Tsukayama P, Patel S, Mejía-Bautista M, Sosa-Soto G, Navarrete KM, Calderon M, Cabrera L,

Hoyos-Arango W & Bertoli MT (2016) Interconnected microbiomes and resistomes in low-income human

habitats. *Nature* **533**: 212-216.

Pellow D, Mizrahi I & Shamir R (2020) PlasClass improves plasmid sequence classification. *PLoS computational*

biology **16**: e1007781.

Perry JA & Wright GD (2013) The antibiotic resistance "mobilome": searching for the link between

environment and clinic. *Frontiers in microbiology* **4**: 138.

Poirel L, Naas T & Nordmann P (2010) Diversity, epidemiology, and genetics of class D β-lactamases.

Antimicrobial agents and chemotherapy **54**: 24-38.

Purohit MR, Chandran S, Shah H, Diwan V, Tamhankar AJ & Stålsby Lundborg C (2017) Antibiotic resistance in

an Indian rural community: a 'One-Health'observational study on commensal coliform from humans, animals,

and water. *International journal of environmental research and public health* **14**: 386.

Ramtahal MA, Amoako DG, Akebe AL, Somboro AM, Bester LA & Essack SY (2022) A Public Health Insight into

Salmonella in Poultry in Africa: A Review of the Past Decade: 2010–2020. *Microbial Drug Resistance* **28**: 710-

733.

Roman VL, Merlin C, Baron S, Larvor E, Le Devendec L, Virta MP & Bellanger X (2021) Abundance and

environmental host range of the SXT/R391 ICEs in aquatic environmental communities. *Environmental*

Pollution **288**: 117673.

Sabbagh P, Rajabnia M, Maali A & Ferdosi-Shahandashti E (2021) Integron and its role in antimicrobial

resistance: A literature review on some bacterial pathogens. *Iranian Journal of Basic Medical Sciences* **24**: 136.

Song M, Song D, Jiang L, Zhang D, Sun Y, Chen G, Xu H, Mei W, Li Y & Luo C (2021) Large-scale biogeographical

patterns of antibiotic resistome in the forest soils across China. *Journal of Hazardous Materials* **403**: 123990.

van Elsas JD & Bailey MJ (2002) The ecology of transfer of mobile genetic elements. *FEMS Microbiology*

Ecology **42**: 187-197.

Van Goethem MW, Pierneef R, Bezuidt OK, Van De Peer Y, Cowan DA & Makhalanyane TP (2018) A reservoir of

'historical' antibiotic resistance genes in remote pristine Antarctic soils. *Microbiome* **6**: 1-12.

Wang F, Fu Y-H, Sheng H-J, Topp E, Jiang X, Zhu Y-G & Tiedje JM (2021) Antibiotic resistance in the soil

ecosystem: A One Health perspective. *Current Opinion in Environmental Science & Health* **20**: 100230.

Wong W-T, Tseng C-H, Hsu S-H, Lur H-S, Mo C-W, Huang C-N, Hsu S-C, Lee K-T & Liu C-T (2014) Promoting

effects of a single Rhodopseudomonas palustris inoculant on plant growth by Brassica rapa chinensis under

low fertilizer input. *Microbes and environments* **29**: 303-313.

Wood DE, Lu J & Langmead B (2019) Improved metagenomic analysis with Kraken 2. *Genome biology* **20**: 1-13.

Wu J, Wang J, Li Z, Guo S, Li K, Xu P, Ok YS, Jones DL & Zou J (2023) Antibiotics and antibiotic resistance genes

in agricultural soils: A systematic analysis. *Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology* **53**: 847-

864.

Yan J, Chen W, Han X, Wang E, Zou W & Zhang Z (2017) Genetic diversity of indigenous soybean-nodulating

rhizobia in response to locally-based long term fertilization in a Mollisol of Northeast China. *World Journal of*

Microbiology and Biotechnology **33**: 1-9.

Zhao Y, Cocerva T, Cox S, Tardif S, Su J-Q, Zhu Y-G & Brandt KK (2019) Evidence for co-selection of antibiotic

resistance genes and mobile genetic elements in metal polluted urban soils. *Science of the Total Environment*

656: 512-520.

Zheng Y, Yu S, Wang G, Xie F, Xu H, Du S, Zhao H, Sang X, Lu J & Jiang W (2021) Comparative microbial

antibiotic resistome between urban and deep forest environments. *Environmental Microbiology Reports*.

Zheng Y, Yu S, Wang G, Xie F, Xu H, Du S, Zhao H, Sang X, Lu J & Jiang W (2021) Comparative microbial

antibiotic resistome between urban and deep forest environments. *Environmental Microbiology Reports* **13**:

503-508.