**The polyketide pathway in sporopollenin biosynthesis is specific to land plants (Embryophyta)**

Dae-Yeon Suh*, Damanpreet K. Sraan and Neil W. Ashton

Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of Regina, Regina, SK S4S 0A2, Canada

*Author for correspondence: email suhdaey@uregina.ca

Supporting Information

**Abstract**

Sporopollenin (SP) is a complex biopolymer in the outer cell wall of spores and pollen and

provides protection from environmental stresses. Its extraordinary biological and chemical

resistance has defied efforts to elucidate its chemical composition and structure. This led to the

adoption of broad and imprecise definitions of SP, which encouraged claims for its widespread

occurrence among diverse embryophyte and non-embryophyte taxa and also misguided research

on the evolution of SP and its roles during terrestrialisation. We previously proposed a more

precise biochemical definition that can be used as a diagnostic tool to distinguish genuine SP from

other chemically resistant cell wall materials. The definition was centred on the possession of

ASCL (Anther-Specific Chalcone synthase-Like), an embryophyte-specific enzyme of the

polyketide pathway that provides precursors for SP biosynthesis. Herein, we demonstrate that all

five enzymes (CYP703, CYP704, ACOS, ASCL and TKPR) of the polyketide pathway are present

in embryophytes but absent in green algae and propose a new, more comprehensive definition of

SP: "Sporopollenin is a chemically resistant complex heteropolymer present in the outer walls of

spores and pollen grains and is composed partly of hydroxylated polyketides derived from the

conserved polyketide pathway, which typically involves CYP703A, CYP704B, ACOS, ASCL and

TKPR." Furthermore, we examine the evolution of all five enzymes of the polyketide pathway

from ancestral enzymes of primary metabolism. We discuss the co-selection of ACOS, ASCL and

TKPR and also provide evidence that gene dosage of all five genes in the pathway has been

subjected to strict evolutionary control. This study further signifies SP as an evolutionary

innovation unique to the embryophyte lineage and encourages research on possible evolutionary

relationships between genuine embryophyte SP and other 'SP-like materials' in reproductive

bodies including algal zygospores and dinoflagellate cysts.

**Key words:** sporopollenin, CYP450, acyl-CoA synthetase, anther-specific chalcone synthase-like,

tetraketide α-pyrone reductase, plant evolution and terrestrialisation, polyketide pathway, gene

copy number

We previously proposed a new definition of sporopollenin (SP) as follows:

"Sporopollenin is a chemically resistant complex heteropolymer present in the outer walls of

spores and pollen grains and is composed partly of hydroxylated polyketides derived from the

conserved polyketide pathway, which involves ASCL." (Suh & Ashton, 2022).

As a protectant of progeny, SP is extraordinarily resistant to biological and chemical treatments,

and it has been challenging to determine its chemical composition and structure. Hence, prior to

our definition, resistance to acetolysis had been the sole criterion for the identification of SP

(Rowley & Southworth, 1967; Heslop-Harrison, 1969). This imprecise definition resulted in

claims for the existence of SP in algae and various microorganisms and also misguided research

on the evolution of SP and its roles during terrestrialisation (Delwiche *et al*., 1989; Feofilova, 2010;

de Vries & Archibald, 2018).

Recently, genetic and biochemical research has uncovered the biosynthesis pathways for

various SP precursors (Grienenberger & Quilichini, 2021; Xue *et al*., 2023). The polyketide

pathway that comprises five enzymes, CYP703A, CYP704B, ACOS (acyl-CoA synthetase),

ASCL (anther-specific chalcone synthase-like) and TKPR (tetraketide α-pyrone reductase)

provides polyketide SP precursors and is conserved in embryophytes. ASCL belongs to the type

III polyketide synthase family, and previous phylogenetic studies of the family indicated that

ASCL is specific to embryophytes (Jiang *et al*., 2008; Shimizu *et al*., 2017). Indeed, we discovered

at least one *ASCL* gene in representative embryophytes from all lineages that produce spores or

pollen with sporopolleninous exine. In sharp contrast, we failed to find any *ASCL* in the genomes

of all algae species for which data are available, including Charophytes that were considered to

produce SP-like substances. This finding led us to propose the above-mentioned definition for SP

to distinguish genuine SP from other similarly resistant substances and to use *ASCL* as an

identifying marker for the presence of SP in spore and pollen walls. We recognized that there are

other enzymes than ASCL in the polyketide pathway and exploring algal genomes for orthologues

encoding these enzymes has the potential for augmenting our SP definition (Suh & Ashton, 2022).

In this study, we investigated whether CYP703A, CYP704B, ACOS and TKPR are conserved

in embryophytes and whether they are absent in green algae. The cytochrome P450 family had

already been extensively studied and meticulously curated in the P450 database

(https://drnelson.uthsc.edu/, Nelson, 2009). CYP703A is present only in embryophytes, while

CYP704B is found in embryophytes, protists and red algae, but, importantly, not in green algae

(Morant *et al*., 2007; Li *et al*., 2010; Hansen *et al*., 2021). It had been suggested previously that

ACOS and TKPR are embryophyte-specific (de Azevedo Souza *et al*., 2008; Grienenberger *et al*.,

2010). However, information about algal homologues of these enzymes was lacking. Taking

advantage of newly determined genome sequences, we expanded earlier studies and searched for

ACOS and TKPR in the genomes of thirty-five embryophytes representing all major lineages

(Tables S1, S2). Putative ACOS and TKPR sequences collated from BLASTp searches in

Phytozome 13 (https://phytozome-next.jgi.doe.gov/) and other databases were identified based on

phylogenetic clustering with known enzymes (Figs S1, S2). In parallel, for additional support for

enzyme identification, we searched for amino acid residues that are conserved in ACOS but not in

its paralogues. ACOS and 4-coumarate:CoA ligase (4CL), both of which belong to the 4CL family,

catalyze formation of CoA esters. Both enzymes use ATP and CoA as co-substrates, but they differ

in their acid substrates. While ACOS accepts hydroxyfatty acids (provided by CYP703A and

CYP704B) as substrate, 4CL accepts 4-coumaric acid derivatives. Cystal structures of several

4CLs pinpointed active site residues responsible for substrate specificity of the enzyme (Hu *et al*.,

2010; Fig. S3). Sequence alignment of representative enzymes of the 4CL family and comparison

of 4CL crystal structures (e.g., tobacco 4CL2, PDB id, 5BST) with ACOS structure models

(https://swissmodel.expasy.org/; https://alphafold.ebi.ac.uk/) indicated that $Gly^{241}$ and

$S^{339}C(V/I)Tx(S/T)$ (numbering of AtACOS5) are uniquely conserved in ACOS and could serve as

a determinant of ACOS (Fig. S3). We then performed a BLASTp search of all algal genomes in

the PhycoCosm database (https://phycocosm.jgi.doe.gov/phycocosm/home, accessed in February

2024) for algal homologues (E values lower than $e^{-20}$) of ACOS (Table S1) and constructed a

phylogenetic tree with representative embryophyte enzymes of the 4CL family. As shown in Fig.

S1, none of the algal homologues, including 13 from charophytes, is found in the ACOS clade and

none of them possesses the above-mentioned ACOS signature residues (Fig. S3). We concluded

that none of the algae examined has an ACOS.

Similarly, sequences and modeled structures of TKPRs were compared with those of

paralogous DFR (dihydroflavonol 4-reductase) and CCR (cinnamoyl-CoA reductase) to identify

two substrate binding site residues $Arg^{131}$ and $(Ser/Thr)^{188}$ (numbering of AtTKPR2) as

determinants of TKPR (Fig. S4). BLASTp searches yielded a total of 29 algal homologues,

including four from charophytes (Table S2). None of them resides in the TKPR clade (Fig. S2)

and, furthermore, no charophyte homologue has the TKPR signature residues, Arg and (Ser/Thr).

These findings led us to conclude that all of the five enzymes in the polyketide pathway are present

in embryophytes but absent in green algae, and produce polyketide precursors of genuine SP.

Therefore, we propose expanding our definition of SP as follows:

"Sporopollenin is a chemically resistant complex heteropolymer present in the outer walls of

spores and pollen grains and is composed partly of hydroxylated polyketides derived from the

conserved polyketide pathway, which typically involves CYP703A, CYP704B, ACOS, ASCL and

TKPR."

**Evolutionary origin of the polyketide pathway**

Next we searched the literature for studies on the evolutionary origins of the enzymes in the

polyketide pathway. It is generally accepted that enzymes of secondary metabolism have been

derived from pre-existing enzymes in primary metabolism via gene duplication and

neofunctionalisation (Firn & Jones, 2000).

(1) ACOS

The 4CL family belongs to the adenylate-forming enzyme superfamily present in all organisms.

The superfamily shares a common reaction of the formation of an adenylated intermediate as in

the fatty acid activation by fatty acyl-CoA synthetase. 4CL produces CoA esters of

hydroxycinnamic acids which are intermediates in the biosynthesis of a vast array of phenolic

secondary metabolites, including monolignols and flavonoids (Hahlbrock & Scheel, 1989). Based

on kinetic and phylogenetic analysis, it has been suggested that the members of the superfamily

share a common ancestor similar to extant acyl-CoA synthetase in the primary fatty acid

metabolism (Fig. 1) (Linne *et al*., 2007; de Azevedo Souza *et al*., 2008).

(2) ASCL

ASCL belongs to the family of type III polyketide synthases (PKS). Type III PKSs condense a

starter CoA substrate with a number of (mostly three) malonyl-CoA molecules and produce a

variety of polyketide secondary metabolites with different biological functions (Abe & Morita,

2010). There are more than twenty type III PKSs in plants and the most well-known is chalcone

synthase (CHS) that catalyzes the first committed step in flavonoid biosynthesis. Type III PKSs,

along with several condensing enzymes in fatty acid metabolism, belong to the thiolase

superfamily. An earlier phylogenetic study showed that type III PKSs have evolved, along with β-

ketoacyl synthases in fatty acid synthesis, from an ancestral thiolase-like condensing enzyme in lipid metabolism (Fig. 1) (Jiang et al. 2008).

(3) TKPR

TKPR and its paralogues DFR and CCR all belong to the short-chain dehydrogenase/reductase (SDR) superfamily present in all living organisms. DFR plays a role in the biosynthesis of anthocyanins while CCR catalyses the first committed step of lignin biosynthesis (Lacombe *et al*., 1997; Petit *et al*., 2007). Enzymes in the SDR family display similarities to sugar-metabolizing enzymes in bacteria and it has been suggested that an ancestor of the superfamily could have been UDP-galactose-4-epimerase in primary sugar metabolism (Fig. 1) (Baker & Blasco, 1992; Kallberg *et al*., 2002).

(4) CYP703A and CYP704B

The CYP family is one of the largest enzyme families and present in all kingdoms of life. The family is made of many clans and each clan contains individual CYP enzymes. The CYP 71 and 86 clans, to which CYP 703A and 704B belong respectively, are mainly involved in fatty acid metabolism. All extant CYPs are monophyletic, and CYP51 (sterol 14α-demethylase) in sterol biosynthesis is widely accepted as the ancestral progenitor (Yoshida et al. 2000; Lamb et al., 2021).

To summarize, it appears that ACOS, ASCL and TKPR all evolved from ancestral enzymes in primary metabolism in the common ancestor of embryophytes. It could be more than a coincidence that their paralogues play important roles in phenylpropanoid pathways (Fig. 1). It may reflect critical contributions that sporopollenin and phenylpropanoids made during early evolution of land plants.

**ACOS, ASCL and TKPR were co-selected during evolution**

Earlier, we found that the genome of *Zostera marina* (a seagrass) that produces exine-less pollen does not contain *ASCL*, which we attributed to secondary gene loss (Suh & Ashton, 2022). The *Z. marina* genome also lacks an *ACOS*, and it contains one copy of a *TKPR*-like sequence that would produce a truncated TKPR-like protein because of nonsense mutation and pseudogenisation. Also, *Zingiber officinale* produces pollen with a reduced exine with regular discontinuities (Subbarayudu *et al*., 2014). A tBLASTn search against the genome of *Zingiber officinale* Roscoe (taxid:94328) (https://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/, accessed in February 2024) failed to find *ACOS*, *ASCL* or *TKPR*. Therefore, in line with our new and expanded definition, neither *Z. marina* nor *Z. officinale* makes

genuine SP. Based on these data, we also concluded that the three genes of the polyketide pathway
were co-selected during embryophyte evolution; loss of one of these genes would have alleviated
the selective pressure for retention of the remaining genes in the pathway. *CYP703A* and *CYP704B*
genes were found in the *Z. marina* and *Z. officinale* genomes unlike the other three genes in the
polyketide pathway. That they did not suffer gene loss is probably because the CYP enzymes they
encode are required for the biosynthesis of cutin monomers in addition to SP biosynthesis (Li *et*
*al*., 2010).

**Gene dosage: Copy number of the genes in the polyketide pathway**
Lastly, we examined whether the copy number of the five genes in the pathway is controlled. The
*CYP* family underwent diversification bursts (Nelson, 2019) and clans 71 and 86 are the two largest
clans in embryophytes. For instance, the genome of *Physcomitrium patens* has 71 CYPs and 41 of
them are in clan 71. Nonetheless, *CYP703A* is often the only single gene family in the *CYP71* clan
(Nelson, 2019). Also, *CYP704* is often maintained as a single copy or at low copy numbers
(Hansen *et al*., 2021). In the 4CL family, while bona fide *4CL* genes have undergone gene family
expansion, *ACOS* genes are encoded by single-copy genes in most plants (de Azevedo Souza *et*
*al*., 2009). Out of 35 plants we examined, only the genomes of *P. patens* and *Glycine max* have
two copies of *ACOS* and the rest have a single copy (Table S1). Likewise, whereas multiple copies
of *CHS* are found in most plants, only one (bryophytes, lycophytes, gymnosperms) or two copies
of *ASCL* (angiosperms) were found in plant species that we examined (Suh & Ashton, 2022). As
for *TKPR*, we found two copies of *TKPR* in most plant species and a single copy in a few species
including *Ginkgo biloba* and *Spirodela polyrhiza* (Table S2). These data indicate that gene dosage
of all five genes in the pathway has been subjected to strict control during evolution. Indeed, the
genomes of *A. thaliana* and rice contain one copy each of *CYP703*, *CYP704* and *ACOS* and two
copies each of *ASCL* and *TKPR*. The genome of *P. patens* has one copy each of *ACOS* and *ASCL*
and two copies of *TKPR* despite undergoing two whole genome duplications. We argue that the
evolutionary benefits of gene dosage control were maintenance of steady metabolic flux and
avoidance of the accumulation of intermediate(s) that could be prematurely incorporated into SP,
harming its structural integrity.

**Concluding remarks**

All evidence indicates that the polyketide pathway and therefore SP is embryophyte-specific. The
addition of the polyketide pathway in the definition of genuine SP will allow separation of SP from
algaenans and other chemically resistant 'SP-like' algal spore wall substances. This new, expanded
definition of SP should help establish SP as a major evolutionary innovation unique to the
embryophyte lineage that may have contributed to plant terrestrialisation. This study should also
spur research on the genetic and biochemical nature of the algal 'SP-like' spore wall substances
and the possible evolutionary relationships between algal spore wall substances and embryophyte
SP.
190

191   **Acknowledgements**
192   The authors thank William B. Browing (Southern Illinois Univ., USA) for informing us of the
193   absence of *ASCL* in the *Zingiber officinale* genome. This work was funded by the Natural Sciences
194   and Engineering Research Council of Canada Discovery grant to D-YS. (RGPIN-2018-04286).
195   DKS was supported in part by University of Regina Graduate Scholarships.
196

197   **Author contributions**
198   D-YS conceived the concept, DKS collected sequences and constructed phylogenetic trees. D-YS
199   and NWA wrote the manuscript.
200

**References**
**Abe I, Morita H. 2010.** Structure and function of the chalcone synthase superfamily of plant type
III polyketide synthases. *Natural Product Reports* **27:** 809–838.
**de Azevedo Souza C, Barbazuk B, Ralph SG, Bohlmann J, Hamberger B, Douglas CJ. 2008.**
Genome-wide analysis of a land plant-specific *acyl:coenzymeA synthetase* (*ACS*) gene family
in *Arabidopsis*, poplar, rice and *Physcomitrella*. *New Phytologist* **179**: 987–1003.
**de Azevedo Souza C, Kim SS, Koch S, Kienow L, Schneider K, McKim SM, Haughn GW,**
**Kombrink E, Douglas CJ. 2009.** A novel fatty acyl-CoA synthetase is required for pollen
development and sporopollenin biosynthesis in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* **21**: 507–525.
**Baker ME, Blasco R. 1992.** Expansion of the mammalian 3β-hydroxysteroid dehydrogenase/plant
dihydroflavonol reductase superfamily to include a bacterial cholesterol dehydrogenase, a

bacterial UDP-galactose 4-epimerase, and open reading frames in vaccinia virus and fish
lymphocystis disease virus. *FEBS Letters* **301**: 89–93.

**Delwiche CF, Graham LE, Thomson N. 1989.** Lignin-like compounds and sporopollenin in
Coleochaete, an algal model for land plant ancestry. *Science* **245**: 399–401.

**Feofilova EP. 2010.** The fungal cell wall: modern concepts of its composition and biological
function. *Microbiology* **79**: 711–720.

**Ferrer J-L, Austin MB, Sterwart Jr C, Noel JP. 2008.** Structure and function of enzymes
involved in the biosynthesis of phenylpropanoids. *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry* **46**:
356–370.

**Firn RD, Jones CG. 2000.** The evolution of secondary metabolism—a unifying model. *Molecular*
*Microbiology* **37:** 989–994.

**Grienenberger E, Kim SS, Lallemand B, Geoffroy P, Heintz D, de Azevedo Souza C, Heitz**
**T, Douglas CJ, Legrand M. 2010.** Analysis of *TETRAKETIDE α-PYRONE REDUCTASE*
function in *Arabidopsis thaliana* reveals a previously unknown, but conserved, biochemical
pathway in sporopollenin monomer biosynthesis. *Plant Cell* **22**: 4067–4083.

**Grienenberger E, Quilichini TD. 2021.** The toughest material in the plant kingdom: An update
on sporopollenin. *Frontiers in Plant Science* **12**: 703864.

**Hahlbrock K, Scheel D. 1989.** Physiology and molecular biology of phenylpropanoid metabolism.
*Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology* **40:** 347–369.

**Hansen CC, Nelson DR, Møller BL, Werck-Reichhart D. 2021.** Plant cytochrome P450
plasticity and evolution. *Molecular Plant* **14:** 1244–1265.

**Heslop-Harrison J. 1969.** An acetolysis-resistant membrane investing tapetum and sporogenous
tissue in the anthers of certain Compositae. *Canadian Journal of Botany* **47:** 541–542.

**Hu Y, Gai Y, Yin L, Wang X, Feng C, Feng L, Li D, Jiang X-N, Wang D-C. 2010.** Crystal
structures of a *Populus tomentosa* 4-coumarate:CoA ligase shed light on its enzymatic
mechanisms. *Plant Cell* **22:** 3093–3104.

**Jiang C, Kim SY, Suh D-Y. 2008.** Divergent evolution of the thiolase superfamily and chalcone
synthase family. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution* **49**: 691–701.

**Kallberg U, Oppermann U, Jörnvall H, Persson B. 2002.** Short-chain dehydrogenase/reductase
(SDR) relationships: A large family with eight clusters common to human, animal, and plant
genomes. *Protein Science* **11**: 636–641.

**Lacombe E, Hawkins S, Van Doorsselaere J, Piquemal J, Goffner D, Poeydomenge O,**
**Boudet AM, Grima-Pettenati J. 1997.** Cinnamoyl CoA reductase, the first committed enzyme
of the lignin branch biosynthetic pathway: cloning, expression and phylogenetic relationships.
*Plant Journal* **11:** 429–441.

**Lamb DC, Hargrove TY, Zhao B, Wawrzak Z, Goldstone JV, Nes WD, Kelly SL, Waterman**
**MR, Stegeman JJ, Lepesheva GI. 2021.** Concerning P450 evolution: Structural analyses
support bacterial origin of sterol 14α-demethylases. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* **38:** 952–
967.

**Li H, Pinot F, Sauveplane V, Werck-Reichhart D, Diehl P, Schreiber L, Franke R, Zhang P,**
**Chen L, Gao Y *et al.* 2010.** Cytochrome P450 family member CYP704B2 catalyzes the ω-
hydroxylation of fatty acids and is required for anther cutin biosynthesis and pollen exine
formation in rice. *Plant Cell*, **22**: 173–190.

**Linne U, Schäfer A, Stubbs MT, Marahiel MA. 2007.** Aminoacyl-coenzyme A synthesis
catalyzed by adenylation domains. *FEBS Letters* **581:** 905–910.

**Morant M, Jørgensen K, Schaller H, Pinot F, Møller BL, Werck-Reichhart D, Bak S. 2007.**
CYP703 is an ancient cytochrome P450 in land plants catalyzing in-chain hydroxylation of
lauric acid to provide building blocks for sporopollenin synthesis in pollen. *Plant Cell* **19:** 1473–
1487.

**Nelson DR. 2009.** The Cytochrome P450 Homepage. *Human Genomics* **4**: 59–65.

**Nelson DR. 2019.** Cytochrome P450s in the sugarcane *Saccharum spontaneum*. *Tropical Plant*
*Biology* **12:** 150–157.

**Petit P, Granier T, d'Estaintot BL, Manigand C, Bathany K, Schmitter J-M, Lauvergeat V,**
**Hamdi S, Gallois B. 2007.** Crystal structure of grape dihydroflavonol 4-reductase, a key
enzyme in flavonoid biosynthesis. *Journal of Molecular Biology* **368:** 1345–1357.

**Rowley JR, Southworth D. 1967.** Deposition of sporopollenin on lamellae of unit membrane
dimensions. *Nature* **213:** 703–704.

**Subbarayudu S, Shankar Naik B, Sunitibala Devi H, Bhau BS, Shaik Sha Valli Khan P. 2014.**
Microsporogenesis and pollen formation in *Zingiber officinale* Roscoe. *Plant Systematics and*
*Evolution* **300:** 619–632.

**Shimizu Y, Ogata H, Goto S. 2017.** Type III polyketide synthases: Functional classification and
phylogenomics. *Chembiochem* **18:** 50–65.

**Suh D-Y, Ashton NW. 2022.** A sporopollenin definition for the genomics ages. *New Phytologist*
**236**: 2009–2013.

**de Vries J, Archibald JM. 2018.** Plant evolution: landmarks on the path to terrestrial life. *New*
*Phytologist* **217**: 1428–1434.

**Xue JS, Qiu S, Jia X-L, Shen S-Y, Shen C-W, Wang S, Xu P, Tong Q, Lou Y-X, Yang N-Y**
***et al*. 2023.** Stepwise changes in flavonoids in spores/pollen contributed to terrestrial adaptation
of plants. *Plant Physiology* **193:** 627−642.

**Yoshida Y, Aoyama Y, Noshiro M, Gotoh O. 2000.** Sterol 14-demethylase P450 (CYP51)
provides a breakthrough for the discussion on the evolution of cytochrome P450 gene
superfamily. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications* **273:** 799–804.

**Supporting Information**

**Fig. S1** Maximum Likelihood tree of embryophyte ACOS and 4CL sequences and algal
homologues.

**Fig. S2** Maximum Likelihood tree of TKPR and other enzymes of the CCR family and algal
homologues.

**Fig. S3** Multiple sequence alignment of ACOSs, 4CLs and algal homologues.

**Fig. S4** Multiple sequence alignment of representative enzymes of the embryophyte CCR family
and algal homologues.

**Fig. 1.** The origin and evolution of the polyketide pathway in sporopollenin biosynthesis.

The three enzymes (ACOS, ASCL/PKS and TKPR) in the polyketide pathway are shown with

their evolutionarily related enzymes in the phenylpropanoid pathway. Also shown are the enzymes

of primary metabolism proposed to share the same ancestors with the related enzymes in the

polyketide and phenylpropanoid pathways. Related enzymes are indicated by text in the same

colour. For instance, ACOS and 4CL are thought to have evolved from the ancestral form of acyl-

CoA synthetase in fatty acid metabolism and are presented using blue text. 4CL, 4-coumarate:CoA

ligase; ACOS, acyl-CoA synthetase; ANR, anthocyanidin reductase; ASCL, anther-specific

chalcone synthase-like; CCR, cinnamoyl-CoA reductase; CHS, chalcone synthase; DFR,

dihydroflavonol 4-reductase. For further information about the enzymes in the pathways, readers

are referred to Grienenberger & Quilichini (2021) and Ferrer et al. (2008).