Uncovering functional deterioration in the rhizosphere microbiome associated with

wheat dwarfing

Monique E. Smith[1,2] *, Vanessa N. Kavamura[1], David Hughes[3], Rodrigo Mendes[4],

George Lund[1], Ian Clark[1] & Tim H. Mauchline[1]

[1] Sustainable Soils and Crops, Rothamsted Research, Harpenden, Hertfordshire, United

Kingdom

[2] Department of Ecology, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Uppsala, Sweden

[3] Intelligent Data Ecosystems, Rothamsted Research, Harpenden, Hertfordshire, United

Kingdom

[4] Laboratory of Environmental Microbiology, Embrapa Environment, Jaguariúna-SP,

Brazil

* To whom correspondence should be addressed:

monique.smith@slu.se

Abstract

Background:

One of the biggest developments of wheat domestication was the development of semi-dwarf

cultivars that respond well to fertilisers and produce higher yields without lodging.

Consequently, this change has also impacted the wheat microbiome, often resulting in

reduced selection of taxa and a loss of network complexity in the rhizospheres of semi-dwarf

cultivars. Given the importance of rhizosphere microbiomes for plant health and

performance, it is imperative that we understand if and how these changes have affected their

function. Here, we use shotgun metagenomics to classify the functional potential of

prokaryote communities from the rhizospheres of tall and semi-dwarf cultivars to compare

the impact of wheat dwarfing on rhizosphere microbiome functions.

Results:

We found distinct taxonomic and functional differences between tall and semi-dwarf wheat

rhizosphere communities and identified that semi-dwarf wheat microbiomes were less

distinct from bulk soil communities. Of the 113 functional genes that were differentially

abundant between tall and semi-dwarf cultivars, 95 % were depleted in semi-dwarf cultivars

and 65 % of differentially abundant reads best mapped to genes involved in staurosporine

biosynthesis (antibiotic product), plant cell wall degradation (microbial mediation of plant

root architecture, overwintering energy source for microbes) and sphingolipid metabolism

(signal bioactive molecules).

Conclusions:

Overall, our findings indicate that green revolution breeding has developed wheat cultivars

with a reduced rhizosphere effect. The consequences of this are likely detrimental to the

development of microbiome-assisted agriculture which will require a strong rhizosphere

selective environment for the establishment of a beneficial plant root microbiome. We believe

our results are of striking importance and highlight that implementation of microbiome facilitated

agriculture as part of a sustainable crop production strategy will require an overhaul of wheat

breeding programmes to consider plant-microbe interactions, especially in the root

environment.

Introduction

As a result of the Green Revolution, we benefit from a huge increase in cereal grain

production. This was largely due to the incorporation of reduced-height (*Rht*) mutant allele

dwarfing genes into modern wheat cultivars (i.e., wheat dwarfing). Nearly all wheat grown

today are semi-dwarf cultivars with increased tillering, larger seed heads producing higher

yields, but on shorter stems to prevent lodging, and respond well to high fertilizer inputs.

However, current high-yielding semi-dwarf crop varieties rely on unsustainable levels of

agrochemical inputs, including synthetic fertilisers, which are environmentally harmful (Van

Grinsven et al., 2013).

While tall heritage cultivars or landraces are mainly grown on marginal fields on organic

farms (Morgounov et al., 2016; Ortman et al., 2023) they are still an important genetic

resource for breeding programs (Escudero-Martinez and Bulgarelli, 2023; Lammerts van

Bueren and Myers, 2012), especially since they show tolerance to extreme weather events

and other stresses (Newton et al., 2011). Wheat domestication gave little to no consideration

to belowground processes; as such, we are only beginning to understand how wheat dwarfing

has impacted the interactions between roots and soil organisms six decades after the first

semi-dwarf wheat was introduced into agriculture (Kavamura et al., 2020; Rossmann et al.,

2020; Tkacz et al., 2020).

The rhizosphere, i.e., the interface between roots and soil, harbours a dynamic community of

microorganisms. These communities play an important role in how plants function, ranging

from beneficial effects, e.g., aiding nutrient acquisition, growth promotion and plant defences

(Mauchline and Malone, 2017; Mendes et al., 2013; Schlaeppi and Bulgarelli, 2015), to

harmful effects, e.g., pathogens such as *Gaeumannomyces tritici* causative agent of take-all

disease in most cereals (Palma-Guerrero et al., 2021). The assembly of rhizosphere

communities are largely determined by the exudates and structure of plant roots (Sasse et al.,

2018; Vives-Peris et al., 2020) which the microbiome itself can modulate (Korenblum et al.,

2020; Pandey et al., 2021), therefore it is not surprising that the domestication of wheat,

including wheat dwarfing, has been shown to influence protist, bacterial, nematode and

fungal rhizosphere communities (Kavamura et al., 2020; Rossmann et al., 2020; Tkacz et al.,

2020). The general trend in these populations is that wheat domestication has reduced

selection processes in the rhizosphere. This is demonstrated by the root microbiome of

ancestral wheat harbouring more unique taxa and more complex microbiomes than the

modern cultivars. Furthermore, modern cultivars can be enriched in fungal pathogens

(Kinnunen-Grubb et al., 2020). Similar trends have also been found in the domestication of

other cereals such as barley (Bulgarelli et al., 2015), soybean (Shi et al., 2019), rice (Sun et

al., 2021) and durum wheat (Spor et al., 2020). While these findings have been important for

our understanding of microbial community dynamics there is now a requirement to

understand microbiome assembly and function for these resources to be harnessed in

sustainable agriculture programmes with less dependence on fertilizer inputs (Busby et al.,

2017; Gruet et al., 2022). Phylogenetic marker gene profiles can hint at the function of these

communities (Kavamura et al., 2020). However, to obtain a comprehensive understanding of

how wheat dwarfing has impacted microbiome function, there is a requirement for holistic

shotgun sequencing methods to be deployed.

Whole shotgun metagenomic sequencing provides a representation of the genomes present in

each sample, allowing the inference of functional potential of a microbial community. This

technique has been used to study the wheat rhizosphere microbiome and identify microbes

that consume plant-derived carbon (Fan et al., 2022), to ascertain differences in microbial

zinc-mobilisation genes between high and low zinc wheat cultivars (Wang et al., 2021a), and

the comparison of antibiotic resistance genes in the rhizospheres of common crops (Yu et al.,

2023). To date, shotgun metagenomics has not corroborated the wheat domestication-driven

changes in rhizosphere communities found using phylogenetic marker gene studies. A

previous attempt was made in Canadian wheat cultivars and found no effect of domestication,

but this study sampled at wheat senescence (Quiza et al., 2021), a time when the structure of

the root microbiome of annual plants has been found to degrade and become dominated by

saprophytes (Mauchline et al., 2015). However, a similar study conducted in durum

(tetraploid) wheat demonstrated that domestication led to a decline in gene diversity and a

shift in microbial functional traits, particularly related to nutrient cycling (Yue et al., 2023).

As yet, the impact of wheat dwarfing on the vegetative stages of hexaploid bread wheat

plants has not yet been explored using shotgun metagenomics.

Given the strong evidence from previous studies that wheat dwarfing impacts the rhizosphere

community structure at a taxonomic level, we predict that the same impact will be observed

for a range of functional genes in these communities. We tested this hypothesis by growing

two tall and two semi-dwarf wheat cultivars alongside unplanted bulk soil control pots under

glasshouse conditions. At flowering stage, we sampled the rhizosphere soil and bulk soil

samples and generated, analysed, and compared the shotgun metagenomic profiles, in terms

of taxonomy and function, of the prokaryote communities from these sample types.

Methods

<u>Wheat cultivars and growth conditions</u>

Wheat cultivars (Table 1) were selected based on previous results by Kavamura *et al*., 2020,

which indicated differences in the root microbiome structure and predicted function between

short and tall cultivars. Soil was collected from Stackyard bare-fallow soil mine

(52.002997°N, 0.613058°W) in January 2019. Soil details are previously described (Reid et

al., 2021). Soil was sieved (2 mm mesh), mixed thoroughly, and stored at 4°C in polythene

bags prior to use. Seeds were surface sterilized as previously described (Robinson et al.,

2016) and were transferred to pre-soaked (sterile distilled water) filter paper in Petri dishes

and germinated for three days in the dark at room temperature. Seedlings were transplanted to

individual wells on a seed tray (1x seedling per well) in Stackyard bare fallow soil and grown

in a glasshouse at Rothamsted Research for two weeks (20 °C, 16 h/day light regime, watered

daily) before vernalization for twelve weeks (4 °C; 8 h light and 16 h dark). After this time, 3

seedlings were transplanted to 6-inch diameter pots (approximately 1 kg soil per pot), with

NPK granules [15% N, 9% P_2O_5, 11% K_2O, 2% MgO with micro-nutrients (B, Cu, Fe, Mn,

Mo, and Zn); Osmocote, United Kingdom] (~5 g per pot) added to the soil surface of each

pot. Five replicate pots were prepared for each wheat variety and three unplanted bulk soil

control pots were also set up using the same soil and fertilisation. Plants were grown in a

glasshouse (20°C, 16 h/day light regime) and watered daily or as required with tap water.

Pots were harvested at the start of flowering (Zadoks growth stage 61; approximately 10

weeks growth post vernalisation; Zadoks et al., 1974), resulting in twenty rhizosphere

samples and three bulk soil samples. Loose soil from the root system of a given pot was

carefully removed. A 10 g subsample of root system was transferred to a 50 ml Falcon tube

and 30 ml sterile water added. Next, samples were shaken vigorously for 10 min using an

orbital shaker to release rhizosphere soil. After this time 4 ml soil suspension was centrifuged

(2 min, RT, 15,000 rpm), supernatant discarded, and remaining soil was flash frozen in liquid

nitrogen and stored at -80 °C.

Table 1. Characteristics of the cultivars used in this study.

Cultivar	Year	Pedigree	Height
Chidham White Chaff	1790	Not recorded	Tall
Red Lammas	1850	Not recorded	Tall
Malacca	1997	Riband*(Rendezvous)*Apostle	Semi-dwarf
Gallant	2009	(Malacca*Charger)*Xi-19	Semi-dwarf

*Table was modified from Kavamura *et al.* (2020).

<u>DNA extraction and sequencing</u>

Genomic DNA was extracted from the bulk soil and rhizosphere soil sample (~0.25 g) using

the Dneasy PowerSoil Pro kit (Qiagen, Venlo, Netherlands) and stored at -80 °C. Extractions

were performed according to the manufacturer's instructions and with the use of the MP

Biomedicals FastPrep-24 machine twice for the bead-beating step at 30 s at 5.5 m s^{-1}. DNA

purity and concentrations were measured with a NanoDrop 1000 spectrophotometer (Thermo

Fisher Scientific, Wilmington, DE, United States), as well as a Qubit 2.0 Fluorimeter using

the dsDNA HS assay kit (Thermo Fisher Scientific). 0.6 µg of DNA for each sample was sent

to Novogene (UK) Company Limited for library preparation and sequencing using Illumina

NovaSeq 6000 platform (HWI-ST1276) using a 150bp paired-end sequencing strategy. An

average of 2.65^8 raw paired reads, ranging between $1.66^8 – 3.46^8$) per sample was obtained.

Reads were quality checked using the FASTX-Toolkit

(http://hannonlab.cshl.edu/fastx_toolkit/index.html; v0.0.14) with a quality threshold of 25,

and Trimmomatic (http://www.usadellab.org/cms/?page=trimmomatic; v0.39; Bolger et al.,

2014) with a minimum length of 80 bp. Quality checked reads were assigned to taxa using

DIAMOND (https://github.com/bbuchfink/diamond; v2.0.13; Buchfink et al., 2015) and

AnnoTree (http://annotree.uwaterloo.ca/annotree/app/downloads.html; v1.2; Gautam et al.,

2022; Mendler et al., 2019) for prokaryote identification. KEGG Orthology (KO) molecular

functional identifiers were assigned by MEGAN6 Ultra (https://software-ab.cs.uni-

tuebingen.de/download/megan6/welcome.html; v6.24.23; Bağcı et al., 2019; Huson et al.,

2016) and used to extract individual gene sequences for each functional KEGG identifier.

Thus, processing resulted in two abundance tables for further analysis, one where reads were

aligned to prokaryote taxa and another to functional genes.

Statistical analysis

Taxa and functional genes were removed if their total count was < 10 reads. Only taxa

assigned to Phyla or lower were kept for further analysis and reads unclassified to functional

genes were removed. This resulted in 5,908,371,442 reads for the taxonomy table and

4,392,129,033 for the functional table and in both cases samples with the most reads roughly

double those with the lowest number of reads.

All statistical analysis and visualisation of results was done in R version 4.3.3 (R core Team,

2024). Alpha and beta diversities were calculated from rarefied data (Weiss et al., 2017)

while differential abundance analysis was done using DESeq2 variance stabilisation

technique (McMurdie and Holmes, 2014) to normalise taxonomy and function abundance

tables. The rarefied tables were calculated by normalizing sequence number to minimum

sample size (159,120,960 and 118,292,681 for taxonomy and function tables respectively) by

random subsampling without replacement using *rarefy_even_depth* function in the phyloseq

package version 1.46 (McMurdie and Holmes, 2013). Rarefaction curve analysis was used to

test that the subsampling of sequences still yielded sufficient resolution of prokaryote

communities and their functional genes (Fig. S1).

To test whether the sample type, including tall wheat rhizosphere, semi-dwarf wheat

rhizosphere and bulk soil, impacted alpha diversity, we obtained observed and Chao1

richness and Shannon diversity from the rarefied taxonomy and functional tables using

estimate_richness function in the phyloseq package. Normality and homogeneity of variances

of alpha diversity measures were tested before performing type 3 one-way ANOVA to

account for unbalanced design due to fewer replicates in the bulk soil samples, and Tukey's

honest significant differences (HSD) with sample type as a main factor.

Beta diversity

Sample differences of the rarefied taxonomy and functional tables were visualised with

principal coordinate analysis (PcoA) plots using Bray Curtis dissimilarity. To statistically test

for differences between sample types we used Permutational Multivariate Analysis of

Variance (PERMANOVA) with Bray Curtis distance matrices using *adonis2* in the vegan

package version 2.6-4 (Oksanen et al., 2024) with 9,999 permutations. Pairwise comparisons

of each group were evaluated with *pairwise.adonis* using a false discovery rate correction for

multiple tests. We evaluated differences among sample variability using homogeneity of

multivariate dispersions tests (*betadisper*), followed by ANOVAs to compare the mean

distance-to-centroid. Pairwise dispersion comparisons were carried out using Tukey's HSD.

Differential abundance analysis

Differential abundances of individual 21,805 taxa and 10,189 functional genes were

calculated using DESeq2 package version 1.42.1 (Love et al., 2014) which is particularly

powerful for small datasets (Li et al., 2022). Maximum-likelihood estimates for the log2-fold

change between conditions associated with each gene or taxa were calculated using a

negative binomial generalized linear model. Contrasts between each level of sample type

were made and tests of significance were conducted using Wald's test, employing $\alpha = 0.05$

and a Benjamin–Hochberg false discovery rate (q) of 0.05 to control type I error rate in the

face of multiple comparisons. Bayesian adaptive shrinkage was then applied to reduce the

log2-fold change towards zero for taxa or genes with low mean counts or a high dispersion in

their count distribution (Stephens, 2017). We then considered taxa or genes to be enriched in

a particular sample type only if the resulting shrunken log2-fold changes were > 1 or < -1, i.e.

double in abundance (Sarno et al., 2023; Semaan et al., 2023).

Differential abundance analysis was done on all genes but for visualisation we only showed

those that were considered enriched in a particular sample type and we compared the results

of the analysis from these against ten housekeeping genes used as a baseline. These

housekeeping genes were selected to cover different parts of the genome and that encode

proteins involved in different metabolic activity, except for the ribosomal genes, similar to

the gene selection in multilocus sequence typing (MLST; Takle et al., 2007; Maiden et al.,

2013). These included signal recognition particle protein (*ffh*), glutamine synthetase (*glnA*),

DNA gyrase (*gyrB*), transcription termination factor Rho (*rho*), 50S ribosomal protein L9

(*rplI*), 50S ribosomal subunit protein L17 (*rplQ*), RNA polymerase (*rpoZ),* DNA

topoisomerase I (*topA*), nucleoside-specific channel-forming protein (*tsx*), ATP synthase F1,

β-subunit (*atpD*).

Results

<u>Alpha diversity</u>

Overall, alpha diversity differences were statistically significant between sample types, i.e.,

bulk soil and rhizosphere soil from semi-dwarf and tall cultivars, for both taxonomy and

function of the prokaryote communities (Fig. 1A, C). Tall cultivars harboured fewer taxa

(observed and chao1) in their rhizospheres than bulk soils and semi-dwarf rhizospheres;

however, when rarefied read abundances were considered, their communities were the most

diverse (Shannon's species diversity). Functional genes followed a similar pattern, though the

differences were less profound. Shannon's diversity was marginally greater in tall

rhizospheres and more genes ascribed to semi-dwarf than tall rhizospheres. Wheat

rhizospheres regardless of cultivar were found to have a higher functional diversity than bulk

soil samples.

Fig. 1. Diversity measures of the taxonomy and function of prokaryote communities.

Alpha diversity is represented in plots A and C, and Principal Coordinate Analysis (PCoA)

plots based on Bray-Curtis dissimilarity demonstrate beta diversity in plots B and D, for

taxonomy and function respectively. Significant differences are shown between sample types,

bulk soil samples (circles) and the rhizospheres of semi-dwarf (squares) and tall (triangles)

wheat. Colours differentiate between the wheat different cultivars.

<u>Beta diversity</u>

We found very similar PERMANOVA results for both taxonomy and function-assigned

genes, whereby a high proportion of variation between samples was explained by sample

type (bulk soil, semi-dwarf and tall wheat rhizospheres; Table 2). Pairwise comparisons

between sample types were all significantly different with the highest R^2 between tall

rhizosphere and bulk soils. This difference is partly explained by significantly different

dispersions between groups for taxonomy and function (ANOVA, F = 11.9, $p < 0.001$; F =

6.8, *p* = 0.006, respectively). *Posthoc* comparisons revealed that all groups differed in

dispersion for taxonomy, but for function, there was less dispersion in the bulk soil samples

compared to semi-dwarf (*padj* = 0.056) and tall (*padj* = 0.004) rhizospheres. Nevertheless,

the PCoA clearly supports the PERMANOVA results that sample type is an important factor

in determining the prokaryote taxonomy and function since they were clustered separately in

multivariate space (Fig. 1B, D). Most of the variation was explained by PCoA 1 for both

taxonomy and functional datasets which demonstrated that, from the cultivars included here,

semi-dwarf wheat cultivars harbour prokaryote community profiles that are more similar to

bulk soil than tall cultivars do. The shift in the prokaryote community was represented by an

increasing relative abundance of Pseudomonadota (Proteobacteria) and Bacteroidota from

bulk soil to rhizosphere soil of semi-dwarf and tall wheats and a higher proportion of

Acidobacteroidota in bulk soil samples (Fig. S2).

Table 2. PERMANOVA and Tukey's pairwise results for both taxonomy and function

of Prokaryote communities. All combinations of sample type, bulk soil (BS) and

rhizosphere soil of semi-dwarf (SD) and tall (T) cultivars, were present. Significant

differences in bold and *p* values of pairwise tests have been adjusted for multiple

comparisons using a false-discovery rate correction.

Variable/	Taxonomy			Function		
pairwise comparison	R^2	F	*p*	R^2	F	*p*
Sample type	0.63	21	**< 0.001**	0.72	25.6	**< 0.001**
BS vs SD	0.55	13.7	**0.004**	0.59	15.5	**0.004**
BS vs T	0.66	21.5	**0.004**	0.76	34.9	**0.004**
SD vs T	0.46	15.6	**< 0.001**	0.56	23.3	**< 0.001**

Differential abundance

Out of 21,805 taxa and 10,189 functional genes, 5,072 (23 %) and 1,719 (17 %) respectively were differentially abundant for at least one contrast between the sample types (Fig. 2; Ward $p < 0.05$, FDR < 0.05, shrunken log2 fold > 1 or < -1). These differentially abundant taxa and functional genes make up 46 % and 5 % of total raw reads, respectively. The primary aim of this work is to compare abundances of genes between wheat genotypes. However, the biggest contrast was between tall rhizosphere and bulk soil prokaryote communities whereby 4,975 taxa and 1,712 functional genes were differentially abundant. Semi-dwarf rhizosphere communities were more similar to bulk soil communities than the tall rhizosphere communities with 1,114 taxa and 194 functional genes differentially abundant, 78 % and 89 % less than the tall vs bulk soil contrast, respectively. Despite this difference, the taxa that were enriched in either the tall or semi-dwarf wheat rhizosphere samples, compared with the bulk soil, belonged mostly to the same three phyla, Pseudomonadota, Bacteroidota and Actinomycetota (Actinobacteria), which when combined, accounted for 95 % and 92 % of the enriched taxa respectively (Fig. S3). Bulk soil samples were enriched in taxa from a wide range of phyla when compared to both rhizosphere types, dominated by Bacillota (Firmicutes), but the highest proportion of taxa belonging to various rare phyla (phyla that contain less than 5 % of all enriched taxa). Interestingly, when assessing the abundances of the differentially abundant functional genes between tall rhizospheres and bulk soil, 19 of the 20 most abundant genes were also more abundant in tall than semi-dwarf rhizospheres (ANOVA, $p < 0.05$; Table S1). The one exception being K07305 (peptide-methionine (R)-S-oxide reductase) which was equally abundant in the rhizosphere of tall and semi-dwarf but has low representation in bulk soil samples. It was found that 13 genes out of these 20 most abundant genes were also more abundant in semi-dwarf rhizospheres compared to bulk soil samples.

Fig. 2. Ternary plots of differentially abundant taxonomy (a) and function (b) of

prokaryote communities. Each point represents a taxa (a) or functional gene (b) and their

position represents the contribution of the indicated sample type, bulk soil, semi-dwarf and

tall rhizospheres, to the total normalised abundance. Taxa or functional genes are

significantly different in abundance for different contrasts (Ward $p < 0.05$, FDR < 0.05,

shrunken log fold changes > 1) and their colours indicate the group they are enriched in (i.e.,

higher abundance). Taxa or functional genes enriched in 'all wheat' samples, i.e., rhizosphere

samples regardless of cultivar type, were determined by contrasts with bulk soil samples and

vice versa for enriched in bulk soil. Enriched in tall rhizospheres was determined compared

with semi-dwarf rhizospheres, regardless of bulk soil and vice versa for semi-dwarf.

Therefore, some points could be characterised by two colours but the comparison between

tall and semi-dwarf rhizospheres is the one presented as this is the most relevant for our

hypothesis. Prokaryote housekeeping genes were included in b as a reference for

differentially abundant functional genes (see methods for a list of housekeeping genes).

There were 1,414 taxa and 113 functional genes that were differentially abundant between

the semi-dwarf and tall rhizosphere communities, most of which (95 %) were enriched in the

tall rhizosphere communities (Fig. 3). The taxa enriched in the tall rhizosphere communities

followed the same pattern as when compared to bulk soil whereby 96 % of reads were from

Pseudomonadota, Bacteroidota and Actinomycetota (Fig. S3). The semi-dwarf rhizosphere

communities were mostly enriched in Bacillota, Pseudomonadota, Spirochaetota and the

highest proportion of enriched taxa belonged to rare phyla (phyla that contain less than 5 %

of all enriched taxa). The differentially abundant functional genes belong to 15 different

functional groups whereby tall rhizospheres had enriched genes belonging to each group

(6,574,723 raw reads) and the six functional genes enriched in the semi-dwarf rhizospheres

belonged to three categories (3,257 raw reads; Fig. 3b). Of the 107 genes enriched in the

rhizospheres of tall wheats, 40% of reads mapped to genes associated with secondary

metabolism, 21% with plant cell wall degradation, 10% with two-component sensor

regulation, 8% with membrane transport, 12% with primary metabolism (other than cell wall

degradation), 2% with secretion systems, 2% to transcriptional regulation and the remaining

5% to quorum sensing, cell cycle, biofilm formation, antibiotic resistance, motility, defence,

and secondary messaging functions (Table 3).

Fig. 3. Differentially abundant taxonomy (a) and function (b) of prokaryote communities between semi-dwarf and tall wheat rhizospheres. Taxa and functional genes have been assigned to Class or functional group (based on KEGG orthology) respectively and the number of differentially abundant taxa or functional genes in each group are listed to the left of each plot. Only significant (Ward $p < 0.05$, FDR < 0.05,) and large (at least double; shrunken log2 fold > 1 or < -1) differences are shown except for the 10 housekeeping genes included for reference against the differentially abundant functional genes.

The reads assigned to the differentially abundant functional genes between tall and semi-dwarf rhizospheres were re-processed though our bioinformatic pipeline and assigned to taxa. This allowed us to look for taxonomic differences and potential important taxa for these functions. Out of the 107 functional genes enriched in tall rhizospheres, 87 % had higher taxa richness in the tall rhizospheres, but only 37 % had higher diversity. This suggests that evenness in these communities may be important whereby dominant taxa could be driving these differences in function (Table 3). This was further evident by the differences in the

community composition, based on the relative abundance of phyla, between tall and semi-

dwarf rhizospheres for each differentially abundant gene (Table S2). In the tall rhizospheres

the dominant phyla or class often contributed to a higher proportion of reads than in the semi-

dwarf rhizospheres, except where a function was only carried out by taxa from a single

phylum.

Table 3. Summaries of the taxa assigned to the 113 functional genes identified as

differentially abundant between tall and semi-dwarf wheat rhizospheres.

NOTE: Table 3 exceeds one A4 page so has been included as an additional file for reviewing

as per journal requirements.

Discussion

We compared the shotgun metagenomic profiles of prokaryote communities from the

rhizospheres of tall and semi-dwarf wheat cultivars and found clear differences associated

with wheat height phenotype. We also confirmed our hypothesis that taxonomic changes

relate to changes in the potential function of these communities, with the main differences

being driven by deterioration of many taxa and functional genes in semi-dwarf rhizospheres.

Furthermore, the addition of unplanted bulk soil controls in our study confirm that the

rhizosphere microbiome of semi-dwarf cultivars differentiates less from bulk soil than

rhizosphere microbiomes derived from tall cultivars in terms of both taxonomy and function.

These observations evidence that the incorporation of mutant *Rht* gene alleles which resulted

in the semi-dwarf phenotype, have reduced the ability of these host plants to select a

rhizosphere microbiome from the bulk soil microbial reservoir.

1) Taxonomic differences

When using shotgun metagenomics in contrast to phylogenetic marker gene analysis, we

identified 10-fold more prokaryote taxa that were differentially abundant between the tall and

semi-dwarf cultivars than in our previous study (Kavamura et al., 2020). Both studies found

that most of the differentially abundant taxa belonged to Pseudomonadota, Bacteroidota and

Actinomycetota and were enriched in the tall cultivars, but our results were to a much larger

extent with 95 % enriched in tall compared with 69 % in Kavamura et al. (2020). We also

found that species richness was higher in the semi-dwarf rhizospheres, supporting the

conclusion that they are less selective than tall wheat. However, species diversity was higher

in tall rhizospheres in our study and not in Kavamura et al. (2020). While the overall trend

was the same in our previous work these minor discrepancies could also be the result of the

different edaphic factors and different growing conditions.

We demonstrated a loss of Bacteroidota through wheat dwarfing both in relative abundance

and in differentially abundant taxa. This has been found in wheat domestication from other

studies (Aleklett et al., 2015; Pérez-Jaramillo et al., 2018; Rossmann et al., 2020) and

Bacteroidota have been shown to be an important phylum for plant pathogen protection and

phosphorus uptake (Lidbury et al., 2021). Domestication has also been shown to enrich

Actinobacteria (Aleklett et al., 2015; Pérez-Jaramillo et al., 2018; Rossmann et al., 2020) and

phyla that are more commonly associated with bulk soil, such as Acidobacteriota and

Verrucomicrobiota (Kavamura et al., 2020). Our results showed a similar trend with

Acidobacteriota and Verrucomicrobiota having a reduced relative abundance in semi-dwarf

and tall rhizospheres compared with bulk soil, (Supplementary Figure 2) but there were taxa

from these phyla enriched in the rhizospheres of tall cultivars and not in semi-dwarf

rhizosphere samples. However, by including unplanted bulk soil controls our study confirms

that the rhizosphere microbiomes of semi-dwarf wheat cultivars are more similar to bulk soils

than the rhizosphere microbiomes of tall cultivars which would indicate less filtering of

Prokaryote taxa in semi-dwarf wheat varieties.

2) <u>Functional gene differences</u>

 Bulk soil vs rhizosphere soils

As described in the results section, 19 of the 20 most abundant genes that are enriched in tall

rhizospheres compared to bulk soils are also more abundant in tall rhizospheres compared to

semi-dwarfs, but to a lesser extent (Table S1). This suggests that the selective ability of semi-

dwarf plants is diminished in comparison to tall wheats, and the rhizosphere microbiomes in

semi-dwarf are a 'middle ground' between bulk soil and tall rhizospheres (Fig. 1D). The one

exception being K07305 (peptide-methionine (R)-S-oxide reductase) which is equally

abundant in the rhizosphere of tall and short microbiomes and much higher compared to bulk

soil samples (approximate mean normalised read count of 500K per sample for each height

class and 48K for bulk soil). This enzyme plays a crucial role in repairing oxidatively

damaged proteins. We hypothesise that its high abundance in the rhizosphere reflects the high

metabolic activity of the rhizosphere with consequential generation of free radicals. It implies

that the high incidence of this gene and presumably expression of the enzyme it encodes is

crucial for rhizosphere competence regardless of wheat genotype. Future studies could also

determine whether expression of this gene is imperative for microbial colonisation of the

plant-root environment.

Tall vs semi-dwarf rhizospheres

Shotgun metagenomic analysis of samples from the rhizosphere of tall and semi-dwarf wheat

cultivars resulted in the detection of clear differential abundance in reads mapping to 113

genes. With 107 genes enriched in the rhizospheres of tall wheats, these results possibly

indicate that the genetic potential of the host plant to influence the root microbiome structure

and function has been reduced as a consequence of wheat dwarfing. We discuss the functions

associated with genes enriched in the rhizospheres of tall wheats (see KEGG IDs in brackets)

under 11 major categories below in order of highest read counts allocated per category. Not

all 107 genes are discussed in detail but see Table 3 and Table S2 for a summary in terms of

read counts and taxonomic information. The six genes enriched in the semi-dwarfs assign to

primary metabolism, membrane transport and motility, but in much fewer read counts (3K

reads) than those enriched in tall cultivars (6.5M reads).

Secondary metabolism

There were 13 differentially abundant genes relating to secondary metabolism with a total of

2.6M reads assigned over all samples. Of these reads, 98% were most similar to genes

associated with biosynthesis of staurosporine (K14266, K19885, K20086, K20090 and

K20088), a natural product antibiotic originally isolated from the bacterium *Streptomyces*

staurosporeus (Omura et al., 1977), with mode of action being through competitive protein

kinase inhibition, with this family of molecules exhibiting anti-cancer potential (Yadav et al.,

2015). In addition, reads were associated with terpenoid and polyketide antibiotic synthesis

(K16397, K16403, K14627, K14368, K21212, K16448 and K15968) as well as bacterial

toxin production (K11009). The high number of differentially abundant genes associated with

antibiotic production could indicate that niche occupancy competition of rhizosphere

microbiome community members in pre-green revolution wheat is driven by an arms race,

which could provide a novel underexploited resource for natural product discovery and the

development of the next generation of antibiotics.

Cell wall degradation

A total of 1.3M reads were found to map to four differentially abundant genes for plant cell

wall degradation (K18651, K18578, K18576 and K18786). Although this function has long

been associated with plant pathology (Kubicek et al., 2014; Wood, 1960), cellulolytic activity

has also been linked to enhanced plant root length by facilitating sloughing-off of root cap

cells from the root tip which assists the growing root in penetrating soil (Campillo et al.,

2004). It has also been found that cell wall degradation is essential for *Rhizobium* symbiotic

infection of legume roots (Robledo et al., 2008). It follows that this function could also be important for microbial colonisation of the plant environment, microbial mediation of plant root architecture and an overwintering energy source for microbes on crop residues. With such high enrichment of these genes in tall wheat rhizospheres therefore demonstrates that a potentially important function to facilitate plant-microbial interactions has been degraded in semi-dwarf wheat.

Primary metabolism

In addition to cell wall degradation, a further 809K reads mapped to genes associated with primary metabolism. These can primarily be subdivided into the metabolism of carbohydrates (380K reads), lipids (340K reads), proteins (46K reads), co-factors/vitamins (27K reads), and enzymes involved in core primary metabolism (15K reads). These observations are congruent with the classes of genes most abundant in membrane transport, and it is unsurprising that genes associated with the metabolism of these primary nutrient sources are abundant in these data; however, it is interesting that they are highly enriched in tall rhizospheres. The most abundant of the differentially abundant primary metabolism genes was associated with sphingolipid metabolism through the action of galactosylceramidase (K01202, 336K reads). Sphingolipids are a class of membrane bound lipid which act as signal bioactive molecules (Wang et al., 2021b). It has been proposed that Bacteroidota, predominant members of the mammalian gut microbiome, utilise sphingolipids as an energy source as well as to mediate signal transduction and stress response pathways, facilitating their persistence in this environment (An et al., 2014). Our dataset found that Actinomycetota made up the highest proportion of taxa with this gene (47%) demonstrating it is not a Bacteroidota specific function in the wheat root environment. It could be the case that microbe-microbe and microbe-plant sphingolipid-based signalling is also crucial in commensal colonisation of the plant root environment as is proposed in the human gut. There were also two genes involved

in propanoate metabolism (K20455, K08325) which is a building block of fatty acids which

are often a component of sphingolipids, the genes for their biosynthesis are highly enriched in

the tall rhizospheres in this dataset and have previously been found to be enriched in the

metabolism pathways of rhizosphere microbiota (Finkel et al., 2017; Pascale et al., 2020;

Zhou et al., 2020).

Furthermore, one of the differentially abundant carbohydrate metabolism genes was

associated with lipopolysaccharide (LPS) biosynthesis (K02847). LPS is an important outer

membrane component of Gram-negative bacteria and mutations in LPS biosynthetic genes

have been shown to impair rhizosphere and root colonisation of maize by *Rhizobium tropici,*

a root nodule bacterium (Ormeño-Orrillo et al., 2012). Finally, we also found K08961, which

encodes a gene for glycosaminoglycan degradation to differentially more abundant in tall

wheat rhizosphere microbiomes. This linear polysaccharide is not present in plant cells,

however it is found in animal as well as bacterial cells, so its function in the root environment

is likely to be implicated in nutrient cycling of microbiome community members.

Sensor regulator

Approximately 640K reads were found to map to differentially abundant genes associated

with two component sensor-regulation systems, most of which (510K reads) were assigned to

serine detection (K05874). In addition, histidine kinase AauS (K17060), which regulates

uptake and metabolism of acidic amino acids in *Pseudomonas putida* (Sonawane et al., 2006)

in a phosphorylation dependent manner, was also in high abundance, along with a sensor

receptor gene for monosaccharides (ribose and galactose; K05876). It will be interesting in

future work to determine the amino acid to sugar ratio and the relative contribution of amino

acids in the root exudates of tall compared to dwarfed wheats and determine whether

detection of these molecules is important for chemoattraction into the root zone as a

prerequisite to rhizosphere colonisation of tall wheat.

Membrane transport

A total of 520K reads mapped to differentially abundant genes associated with membrane

transport and the vast majority (435K reads) were associated with uptake systems. However,

export systems were largely associated with polysaccharide transport, presumably as a

prerequisite to biofilm formation (e.g. K16552, K16553, K16696), though the outer

membrane protein X (K11934), the entericidin toxin peptide and antidote system (K16347,

K16348) and spermidine export system (K11743; which is important at acidic pH such as

that of the rhizosphere (Higashi et al., 2008) are also represented). Regarding import systems,

these were categorised as metal (iron and nickel; K10094, K16088), purine (K10975),

aromatic amino acids (K11734), though the vast majority of these reads were associated with

ATP-binding cassette and MFS sugar uptake systems (alpha-glycosides, arabinose, lactose

and oligogalacturonides) with a total of 280K reads assigned (K02532, K10235, K16210,

K08156). The observation that bacteria in the rhizosphere have a high level of uptake

transport systems has previously been studied in rhizobia (Mauchline et al., 2006), though

this is the first time that an enhancement in these systems is associated with the root

microbiome of pre-green revolution wheats. It is interesting that there was no perceived

difference in abundance detected between tall and short wheats for genes associated with

organic acid uptake systems and implies that the dwarfing of wheat has perhaps not impacted

the root exudation profile of these molecules to the same extent of amino acids and sugars.

It was also found that the ratio of reads associated with amino acid:sugar detection in two

component systems is inversely proportional to the ratio of predicted uptake transport

systems for these substrates. It is possible that as sugars and organic acids are more

ubiquitous in root exudates, that the root microbiome of tall wheats have evolved to invest a

greater proportion of detection mechanisms into amino acid detection. Future work should

509 determine the differential root exudate composition between tall and semi-dwarf wheats and

510 whether these can be positively correlated with the predicted uptake systems.

511 *Biofilm formation and quorum sensing*

512 Approximately 234K reads mapped to genes associated with quorum sensing and biofilm

513 formation. Reads mapping to genes associated with mannose sensitive haemagglutinin

514 (MSHA) pilus biogenesis [*mshJ*, (K12280) *mshK* (K12281), *mshN* (K12284), *mshO*

515 (K12285) and *mshP* (K12286)] are total 83K reads. This molecule has been shown to be

516 crucial for the attachment of *Vibrio cholerae* to environmental surfaces (Marsh and Taylor,

517 1999) and more recently MSHA has also been shown to promote the attachment of

518 *Pseudoalteromonas tunicata* to cellulose surfaces (Dalisay et al., 2006). In addition,

519 approximately 28K reads are assigned to MSHA pilin protein production genes *mshC* and

520 *mshD* (K10926, K10927). These genes are important for biofilm formation, horizontal gene

521 transfer and twitching motility (Toma et al., 2002). It therefore follows that the increased

522 differential abundance of MSHA could reflect their importance for microbial persistence in

523 the tall wheat rhizosphere microbiome.

524 In addition, approximately 106K reads mapped to genes associated with quorum sensing. The

525 most abundant of these, at 56K reads, being assigned as the LuxR family transcriptional

526 regulator gene *cciR* (K19731). A study into the food-borne pathogen *Vibrio parhaemolyticus*

527 revealed that LuxR family regulators influence bacterial growth and biofilm formation and

528 highlighted that the LuxR regulator RobA regulated expression of exopolysaccharides (EPS)

529 synthesis and controlled biofilm formation (Zhong et al., 2021). Our data suggests that

530 transcriptional regulators are also important for biofilm formation in the root environment

531 and that the increased differential abundance in the rhizosphere of tall cultivars is indicative

532 of a tighter control of rhizosphere microbiome assembly in pre green revolution wheat.

Transcriptional regulation

Approximately 142K reads were assigned to transcriptional regulation, and almost 100K are

ascribed to the DeoR family transcriptional regulator (K03477). In *E. coli*, a DeoR family

transcriptional regulator, UlaR, was found to be responsible for suppressing transcription of

the divergent *ulaG* and *ulaABCDEF* operons (which catabolise L-ascorbate), under ascorbate

depleted conditions (Campos et al., 2004). Interestingly, ascorbate has been shown to be

released from plant roots under conditions of salt stress and influences root elongation (Li et

al., 2018; Makavitskaya et al., 2018). It could follow that exudation of ascorbate into the

rhizosphere profoundly affects root microbiome colonisation patterns that are employed by

tall wheat cultivars. In addition, 33K reads were assigned to the AraC L-arginine responsive

activator (K21825). It has previously been shown that arginine is an important environmental

cue for cyclic di-GMP signalling (c-di-GMP) signalling and biofilm formation in

Pseudomonas putida (Barrientos-Moreno et al., 2020), highlighting the potential importance

of detection and utilisation of this amino acid for microbiome assembly in the rhizosphere of

tall wheat. It will be interesting to assess whether tall cultivars produce a greater proportion

of arginine in their exudates than the corresponding short cultivars.

Secretion systems

A total of 76K reads mapped to secretion systems, and interestingly, type III (K13454,

K18380, K18373, K18380), IV (K03202, K12083, K120555) and type VI (K11889, K11909)

secretion systems are predominately over represented in tall wheat rhizosphere, all of which

use machinery to directly breach and deliver secreted proteins across host cell membranes as

opposed to other secretion system types which release toxins into the extracellular milieu

(Green and Mecsas, 2016). In addition, genes associated with pilus assembly proteins for

conjugal transfer (a total of 25K reads; K12059, K12069) were also enriched in tall

rhizospheres and are key to bacterial mating via synthesis of a type IV secretion system

(Shala-Lawrence et al., 2018).

Antibiotic resistance

Approximately 29K reads were assigned to differentially abundant genes involved in

antibiotic resistance (K19216, K18793, K19101, K22335 & K19213). These were related to

beta-lactamase function, which has been shown to be well represented in isolates of the soil

dwelling bacterium *Bacillus subtilis* (Bucher et al., 2019). Evidence suggests that its

production facilitates rhizosphere colonisation by the plant pathogen *Fusarium oxysporum*

(Chang et al., 2021). It is interesting that the number of reads in this category is far exceeded

by the number of reads for antibiotic production (e.g. staurosporine biosynthesis). This could

indicate that microbial strategy for rhizosphere colonisation of tall wheat rhizospheres has an

offensive emphasis, and that some of this capacity is reduced in the short wheat rhizosphere

microbiome.

Motility

There were two differentially abundant genes relating to motility, but the majority of the

reads (23K reads) were assigned to the flagellar chaperone biosynthesis gene *flgN* (K02399).

This gene has been shown to be required for flagellum-based motility in *Bacillus subtilis*

(Cairns et al., 2014) and is involved in the regulation and assembly of the flagellum, and its

enhanced differential abundance in the rhizosphere of tall wheat suggests that it is important

for the colonisation of this environment.

Secondary messaging

Approximately 10K reads were assigned to secondary messaging, especially cyclic di GMP

(c-di-GMP) phosphodiesterase (K20966) which has previously been shown to be important

for the rhizosphere colonisation of wheat by *Pseudomonas fluorescens* (Little et al., 2019).

The activity of c-di-GMP is important for the production of EPS and biofilm formation and

an increase in abundance of c-di-GMP phosphodiesterase activity which is involved in the

reduction of c-di-GMP level implies that biofilm formation in tall cultivars is tightly

regulated.

Conclusions

Our data showed that semi-dwarf wheat has a reduced rhizosphere effect when compared

with tall wheat. In addition, we observed a depletion of a wide range of functional genes in

semi-dwarf wheat, indicating a functional deterioration in the rhizosphere microbiome

associated with wheat dwarfing. Wheat dwarfing of the green revolution has profoundly

influenced the selection and function of the root microbiome, and this is evidenced by

reduced abundance in genes such as those involved in biofilm formation as well as the

sensing of key nutrients and their transport into microbial cells in semi-dwarf wheat.

However, the vast majority of reads map to genes associated with secondary metabolism as

well as cell wall degradation. As such it seems that the root microbiome of tall wheats have

adopted a two-pronged strategy of exclusion of microbial competitor reduction through

antibiotic production (e.g. staurosporine production) as well as the metabolism of plant

derived nutrients. The latter seems to be via utilisation of cell wall constituents as a nutrient

source to establish in this environment as well as through sphingolipid metabolism – it is

unclear to what extent these functions are also important for plant-microbe signalling. The

green revolution combined wheat dwarfing with the application of synthetic chemical

fertilisers. Our previous work has highlighted that application of synthetic fertiliser reduces

the selection of nutrient-solubilising bacteria in the rhizosphere (Reid et al., 2021). It will be

interesting to ascertain the impact of the combination of these factors for global microbiome

function and selection, and to determine the specific contribution of *Rht* mutant alleles in

isogenic wheats to the observed microbiome shifts caused by dwarfing which are highlighted

in this work. Finally, we believe our results are of striking importance and highlight that

implementation of microbiome facilitated agriculture as part of a sustainable crop production strategy

will require an overhaul of wheat breeding programmes to consider plant-microbe interactions,

especially in the root environment.

Declarations

Ethics approval and consent to participate: Not applicable

Consent for publication: Not applicable

Availability of data and material: The datasets generated and analysed during the current

study are available in the NCBI repository, BioProject PRJNA1128034. The BioProject and

associated SRA metadata are publicly available at

https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/bioproject/PRJNA1128034. However, due to a glitch in the

SRA system the samples are only available via individual download until this issue is

resolved, see links below.

BioSample

SAMN42186182   DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep1 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186183   DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep2 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186184   DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep3 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186185   DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep4 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186186   DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep5 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186187   DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep1 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186188   DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep2 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186189   DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep3 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186190   DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep4 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186191   DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep5 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186192   DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep1 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186193   DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep2 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186194   DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep3 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186195   DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep4 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186196   DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep5 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186197   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep1 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186198   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep2 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186199   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep3 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186200   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep4 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186201   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep4 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186202   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep1 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186203   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep2 - BioSample - NCBI

SAMN42186204   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep3 - BioSample - NCBI

SRA

644	SRR29660204	DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep1 - SRA - NCBI
645	SRR29660203	DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep2 - SRA - NCBI
646	SRR29660192	DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep3 - SRA - NCBI
647	SRR29660188	DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep4 - SRA - NCBI
648	SRR29660187	DNA_from_cv.Chidham_rep5 - SRA - NCBI
649	SRR29660186	DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep1 - SRA - NCBI
650	SRR29660185	DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep2 - SRA - NCBI
651	SRR29660184	DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep3 - SRA - NCBI
652	SRR29660183	DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep4 - SRA - NCBI
653	SRR29660182	DNA_from_cv.Gallant_rep5 - SRA - NCBI
654	SRR29660202	DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep1 - SRA - NCBI
655	SRR29660201	DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep2 - SRA - NCBI
656	SRR29660200	DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep3 - SRA - NCBI
657	SRR29660199	DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep4 - SRA - NCBI
658	SRR29660198	DNA_from_cv.Malacca_rep5 - SRA - NCBI
659	SRR29660197	DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep1 - SRA - NCBI
660	SRR29660196	DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep2 - SRA - NCBI
661	SRR29660195	DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep3 - SRA - NCBI

SRR29660194   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep4 - SRA - NCBI

SRR29660193   DNA_from_cv.Red_Lammas_rep5 - SRA - NCBI

SRR29660191   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep1 - SRA - NCBI

SRR29660190   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep2 - SRA - NCBI

SRR29660189   DNA_from_Bulk_Soil_rep3 - SRA - NCBI

Competing interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests

Funding: Rothamsted Research receives strategic funding from the Biotechnology and

Biological Sciences Research Council of the United Kingdom. We acknowledge support

from the Growing Health (BB/X010953/1) Institute Strategic Programme. We also

acknowledge the Bilateral BBSRC-Embrapa grant on "Exploitation of the wheat rhizosphere

microbiome for sustainable wheat production" (BB/N016246/1); "Optimization of nutrients

in soil-plant systems: How can we control nitrogen cycling in soil?" (BBS/E/C/00005196)

and "S2N – Soil to nutrition – Work package 1 – Optimizing nutrient flows and pools in the

soil–plant-biota system" (BBS/E/C/000I0310). The authors also received funding from the

Swedish Research Council (FR2021-02017).

Authors' contributions: T.H.M., R.M. and M.E.S. acquired funding. T.H.M, I.M.C. and

V.N.K. designed the experiments and collected the data. Bioinformatic analysis was

performed by D.H. and M.E.S performed statistical analysis. Results were interpreted by

T.H.M, I.M.C, G.L. and M.E.S. The manuscript was written by M.E.S. and T.H.M. All co-

authors edited and commented on the manuscript.

Acknowledgements: The authors have no further acknowledgements to include.

References

Aleklett, K., Leff, J.W., Fierer, N., Hart, M., 2015. Wild plant species growing closely connected in a subalpine meadow host distinct root-associated bacterial communities. PeerJ 3, e804. https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.804

An, D., Oh, S.F., Olszak, T., Neves, J.F., Avci, F.Y., Erturk-Hasdemir, D., Lu, X., Zeissig, S., Blumberg, R.S., Kasper, D.L., 2014. Sphingolipids from a Symbiotic Microbe Regulate Homeostasis of Host Intestinal Natural Killer T Cells. Cell 156, 123–133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2013.11.042

Bağcı, C., Beier, S., Górska, A., Huson, D.H., 2019. Introduction to the Analysis of Environmental Sequences: Metagenomics with MEGAN, in: Anisimova, M. (Ed.), Evolutionary Genomics: Statistical and Computational Methods. Springer, New York, NY, pp. 591–604. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4939-9074-0_19

Barrientos-Moreno, L., Molina-Henares, M.A., Ramos-González, M.I., Espinosa-Urgel, M., 2020. Arginine as an environmental and metabolic cue for cyclic diguanylate signalling and biofilm formation in Pseudomonas putida. Sci Rep 10, 13623. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-70675-x

Bolger, A.M., Lohse, M., Usadel, B., 2014. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequence data. Bioinformatics 30, 2114–2120. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btu170

Bucher, T., Keren-Paz, A., Hausser, J., Olender, T., Cytryn, E., Kolodkin-Gal, I., 2019. An active β-lactamase is a part of an orchestrated cell wall stress resistance network of Bacillus subtilis and related rhizosphere species. Environmental Microbiology 21, 1068–1085. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.14526

Buchfink, B., Xie, C., Huson, D.H., 2015. Fast and sensitive protein alignment using DIAMOND. Nat Methods 12, 59–60. https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.3176

Bulgarelli, D., Garrido-Oter, R., Münch, P.C., Weiman, A., Dröge, J., Pan, Y., McHardy,

A.C., Schulze-Lefert, P., 2015. Structure and Function of the Bacterial Root

Microbiota in Wild and Domesticated Barley. Cell Host & Microbe 17, 392–403.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chom.2015.01.011

Busby, P.E., Soman, C., Wagner, M.R., Friesen, M.L., Kremer, J., Bennett, A., Morsy, M.,

Eisen, J.A., Leach, J.E., Dangl, J.L., 2017. Research priorities for harnessing plant

microbiomes in sustainable agriculture. PLOS Biology 15, e2001793.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.2001793

Cairns, L.S., Marlow, V.L., Kiley, T.B., Birchall, C., Ostrowski, A., Aldridge, P.D., Stanley-

Wall, N.R., 2014. FlgN Is Required for Flagellum-Based Motility by Bacillus subtilis.

Journal of Bacteriology 196, 2216–2226. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.01599-14

Campillo, E. del, Abdel-Aziz, A., Crawford, D., Patterson, S.E., 2004. Root cap specific

expression of an endo-β-1,4--glucanase (cellulase): a new marker to study root

development in Arabidopsis. Plant Mol Biol 56, 309–323.

https://doi.org/10.1007/s11103-004-3380-3

Campos, E., Baldoma, L., Aguilar, J., Badia, J., 2004. Regulation of Expression of the

Divergent ulaG and ulaABCDEF Operons Involved in l-Ascorbate Dissimilation in

Escherichia coli. Journal of Bacteriology 186, 1720–1728.

https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.186.6.1720-1728.2004

Chang, H.-X., Noel, Z.A., Chilvers, M.I., 2021. A β-lactamase gene of Fusarium oxysporum

alters the rhizosphere microbiota of soybean. The Plant Journal 106, 1588–1604.

https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.15257

Dalisay, D.S., Webb, J.S., Scheffel, A., Svenson, C., James, S., Holmström, C., Egan, S.,

Kjelleberg, S., 2006. A mannose-sensitive haemagglutinin (MSHA)-like pilus

promotes attachment of Pseudoalteromonas tunicata cells to the surface of the green

alga Ulva australis. Microbiology 152, 2875–2883.

https://doi.org/10.1099/mic.0.29158-0

Escudero-Martinez, C., Bulgarelli, D., 2023. Engineering the Crop Microbiota Through Host

Genetics. Annual Review of Phytopathology 61, 257–277.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-phyto-021621-121447

Fan, K., Holland-Moritz, H., Walsh, C., Guo, X., Wang, D., Bai, Y., Zhu, Y., Fierer, N., Chu,

H., 2022. Identification of the rhizosphere microbes that actively consume plant-

derived carbon. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 166, 108577.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2022.108577

Finkel, O.M., Castrillo, G., Herrera Paredes, S., Salas González, I., Dangl, J.L., 2017.

Understanding and exploiting plant beneficial microbes. Curr Opin Plant Biol 38,

155–163. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2017.04.018

Gautam, A., Felderhoff, H., Bağci, C., Huson, D.H., 2022. Using AnnoTree to Get More

Assignments, Faster, in DIAMOND+MEGAN Microbiome Analysis. mSystems 7,

e01408-21. https://doi.org/10.1128/msystems.01408-21

Green, E.R., Mecsas, J., 2016. Bacterial Secretion Systems: An Overview. Microbiology

Spectrum 4, 10.1128/microbiolspec.vmbf-0012–2015.

https://doi.org/10.1128/microbiolspec.vmbf-0012-2015

Gruet, C., Muller, D., Moënne-Loccoz, Y., 2022. Significance of the Diversification of

Wheat Species for the Assembly and Functioning of the Root-Associated

Microbiome. Frontiers in Microbiology 12.

Higashi, K., Ishigure, H., Demizu, R., Uemura, T., Nishino, K., Yamaguchi, A., Kashiwagi,

K., Igarashi, K., 2008. Identification of a Spermidine Excretion Protein Complex

(MdtJI) in Escherichia coli. J Bacteriol 190, 872–878.

https://doi.org/10.1128/JB.01505-07

Huson, D.H., Beier, S., Flade, I., Górska, A., El-Hadidi, M., Mitra, S., Ruscheweyh, H.-J.,

Tappu, R., 2016. MEGAN Community Edition - Interactive Exploration and Analysis

of Large-Scale Microbiome Sequencing Data. PLOS Computational Biology 12,

e1004957. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1004957

Kavamura, V.N., Robinson, R.J., Hughes, D., Clark, I., Rossmann, M., Melo, I.S. de, Hirsch,

P.R., Mendes, R., Mauchline, T.H., 2020. Wheat dwarfing influences selection of the

rhizosphere microbiome. Scientific Reports 10, 1452. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-

020-58402-y

Kinnunen-Grubb, M., Sapkota, R., Vignola, M., Nunes, I.M., Nicolaisen, M., 2020. Breeding

selection imposed a differential selective pressure on the wheat root-associated

microbiome. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 96, fiaa196.

https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiaa196

Korenblum, E., Dong, Y., Szymanski, J., Panda, S., Jozwiak, A., Massalha, H., Meir, S.,

Rogachev, I., Aharoni, A., 2020. Rhizosphere microbiome mediates systemic root

metabolite exudation by root-to-root signaling. Proceedings of the National Academy

of Sciences 117, 3874–3883. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1912130117

Kubicek, C.P., Starr, T.L., Glass, N.L., 2014. Plant Cell Wall–Degrading Enzymes and Their

Secretion in Plant-Pathogenic Fungi. Annual Review of Phytopathology 52, 427–451.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-phyto-102313-045831

Lammerts van Bueren, E.T., Myers, J.R., 2012. Organic Crop Breeding: Integrating Organic

Agricultural Approaches and Traditional and Modern Plant Breeding Methods, in:

Organic Crop Breeding. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, pp. 1–13.

https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119945932.ch1

Li, D., Zand, M.S., Dye, T.D., Goniewicz, M.L., Rahman, I., Xie, Z., 2022. An evaluation of

RNA-seq differential analysis methods. PLOS ONE 17, e0264246.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0264246

Li, X., Makavitskaya, M., Samokhina, V., Mackievic, V., Navaselsky, I., Hryvusevich, P.,

Smolikova, G., Medvedev, S., Shabala, S., Yu, M., Demidchik, V., 2018. Effects of

exogenously-applied L-ascorbic acid on root expansive growth and viability of the

border-like cells. Plant Signaling & Behavior 13, e1514895.

https://doi.org/10.1080/15592324.2018.1514895

Lidbury, I.D.E.A., Borsetto, C., Murphy, A.R.J., Bottrill, A., Jones, A.M.E., Bending, G.D.,

Hammond, J.P., Chen, Y., Wellington, E.M.H., Scanlan, D.J., 2021. Niche-adaptation

in plant-associated Bacteroidetes favours specialisation in organic phosphorus

mineralisation. ISME J 15, 1040–1055. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41396-020-00829-2

Little, R.H., Woodcock, S.D., Campilongo, R., Fung, R.K.Y., Heal, R., Humphries, L.,

Pacheco-Moreno, A., Paulusch, S., Stigliano, E., Vikeli, E., Ward, D., Malone, J.G.,

2019. Differential Regulation of Genes for Cyclic-di-GMP Metabolism Orchestrates

Adaptive Changes During Rhizosphere Colonization by Pseudomonas fluorescens.

Front. Microbiol. 10. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.01089

Love, M.I., Huber, W., Anders, S., 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion

for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biol 15, 550.

https://doi.org/10.1186/s13059-014-0550-8

Maiden, M.C.J., van Rensburg, M.J.J., Bray, J.E., Earle, S.G., Ford, S.A., Jolley, K.A.,

McCarthy, N.D., 2013. MLST revisited: the gene-by-gene approach to bacterial

genomics. Nat Rev Microbiol 11, 728–736. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro3093

Makavitskaya, M., Svistunenko, D., Navaselsky, I., Hryvusevich, P., Mackievic, V.,

Rabadanova, C., Tyutereva, E., Samokhina, V., Straltsova, D., Sokolik, A.,

Voitsekhovskaja, O., Demidchik, V., 2018. Novel roles of ascorbate in plants:

induction of cytosolic Ca2+ signals and efflux from cells via anion channels. Journal

of Experimental Botany 69, 3477–3489. https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/ery056

Marsh, J.W., Taylor, R.K., 1999. Genetic and Transcriptional Analyses of theVibrio cholerae

Mannose-Sensitive Hemagglutinin Type 4 Pilus Gene Locus. Journal of Bacteriology

181, 1110–1117. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.181.4.1110-1117.1999

Mauchline, T.H., Chedom-Fotso, D., Chandra, G., Samuels, T., Greenaway, N., Backhaus,

A., McMillan, V., Canning, G., Powers, S.J., Hammond-Kosack, K.E., Hirsch, P.R.,

Clark, I.M., Mehrabi, Z., Roworth, J., Burnell, J., Malone, J.G., 2015. An analysis of

Pseudomonas genomic diversity in take-all infected wheat fields reveals the lasting

impact of wheat cultivars on the soil microbiota. Environmental Microbiology 17,

4764–4778. https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13038

Mauchline, T.H., Fowler, J.E., East, A.K., Sartor, A.L., Zaheer, R., Hosie, A.H.F., Poole,

P.S., Finan, T.M., 2006. Mapping the Sinorhizobium meliloti 1021 solute-binding

protein-dependent transportome. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences

103, 17933–17938. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0606673103

Mauchline, T.H., Malone, J.G., 2017. Life in earth – the root microbiome to the rescue?

Current Opinion in Microbiology, Environmental microbiology * CRISPRcas9 37,

23–28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mib.2017.03.005

McMurdie, P.J., Holmes, S., 2014. Waste Not, Want Not: Why Rarefying Microbiome Data

Is Inadmissible. PLOS Computational Biology 10, e1003531.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1003531

McMurdie, P.J., Holmes, S., 2013. phyloseq: An R Package for Reproducible Interactive

Analysis and Graphics of Microbiome Census Data. PLOS ONE 8, e61217.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0061217

Mendes, R., Garbeva, P., Raaijmakers, J.M., 2013. The rhizosphere microbiome: significance

of plant beneficial, plant pathogenic, and human pathogenic microorganisms. FEMS

Microbiology Reviews 37, 634–663. https://doi.org/10.1111/1574-6976.12028

Mendler, K., Chen, H., Parks, D.H., Lobb, B., Hug, L.A., Doxey, A.C., 2019. AnnoTree:

visualization and exploration of a functionally annotated microbial tree of life.

Nucleic Acids Research 47, 4442–4448. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkz246

Morgounov, A., Keser, M., Kan, M., Küçükçongar, M., Özdemir, F., Gummadov, N.,

Muminjanov, H., Zuev, E., Qualset, C. o., 2016. Wheat Landraces Currently Grown

in Turkey: Distribution, Diversity, and Use. Crop Science 56, 3112–3124.

https://doi.org/10.2135/cropsci2016.03.0192

Newton, A.C., Akar, T., Baresel, J.P., Bebeli, P.J., Bettencourt, E., Bladenopoulos, K.V.,

Czembor, J.H., Fasoula, D.A., Katsiotis, A., Koutis, K., Koutsika-Sotiriou, M.,

Kovacs, G., Larsson, H., de Carvalho, M.A.A.P., Rubiales, D., Russell, J., Santos,

T.M.M.D., Patto, M.C.V., 2011. Cereal Landraces for Sustainable Agriculture, in:

Lichtfouse, E., Hamelin, M., Navarrete, M., Debaeke, P. (Eds.), Sustainable

Agriculture Volume 2. Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht, pp. 147–186.

https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-0394-0_10

Oksanen, J., Simpson, G.J., Blanchet, F.G., Kindt, R., Legendre, P., Minchin, P.R., O'Hara,

R.B., Solymos, P., Stevens, M.H.H., Szoecs, E., Wagner, H., Barbour, M., Bedward,

M., Bolker, B., Borcard, D., Carvalho, G., De Chirico, M., Durand, S., Antoniazi

Evangelista, H.B., FitzJohn, R., Friendly, M., Furneaux, B., Hannigan, G., Hill, M.O.,

Lahti, L., McGlinn, D., Ouellette, M.-H., Ribeiro Cunha, E., Smith, T., Steir, A., Ter

Braak, C.J.F., Weedon, J., 2024. vegan: Community Ecology Package.

Omura, S., Iwai, Y., Hirano, A., Nakagawa, A., Awaya, J., Tsuchiya, H., Takahashi, Y.,

Asuma, R., 1977. A NEW ALKALOID AM-2282 OF STREPTOMYCES ORIGIN

TAXONOMY, FERMENTATION, ISOLATION AND PRELIMINARY

CHARACTERIZATION. J. Antibiot. 30, 275–282.

https://doi.org/10.7164/antibiotics.30.275

Ormeño-Orrillo, E., Menna, P., Almeida, L.G.P., Ollero, F.J., Nicolás, M.F., Pains

Rodrigues, E., Shigueyoshi Nakatani, A., Silva Batista, J.S., Oliveira Chueire, L.M.,

Souza, R.C., Ribeiro Vasconcelos, A.T., Megías, M., Hungria, M., Martínez-Romero,

E., 2012. Genomic basis of broad host range and environmental adaptability of

Rhizobium tropici CIAT 899 and Rhizobium sp. PRF 81 which are used in inoculants

for common bean (Phaseolus vulgaris L.). BMC Genomics 13, 735.

https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2164-13-735

Ortman, T., Sandström, E., Bengtsson, J., Watson, C.A., Bergkvist, G., 2023. Farmers'

motivations for landrace cereal cultivation in Sweden. Biological Agriculture &

Horticulture 1–22. https://doi.org/10.1080/01448765.2023.2207081

Palma-Guerrero, J., Chancellor, T., Spong, J., Canning, G., Hammond, J., McMillan, V.E.,

Hammond-Kosack, K.E., 2021. Take-All Disease: New Insights into an Important

Wheat Root Pathogen. Trends in Plant Science 26, 836–848.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2021.02.009

Pandey, B.K., Huang, G., Bhosale, R., Hartman, S., Sturrock, C.J., Jose, L., Martin, O.C.,

Karady, M., Voesenek, L.A.C.J., Ljung, K., Lynch, J.P., Brown, K.M., Whalley,

W.R., Mooney, S.J., Zhang, D., Bennett, M.J., 2021. Plant roots sense soil

compaction through restricted ethylene diffusion. Science 371, 276–280.

https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abf3013

Pascale, A., Proietti, S., Pantelides, I.S., Stringlis, I.A., 2020. Modulation of the Root

Microbiome by Plant Molecules: The Basis for Targeted Disease Suppression and

Plant Growth Promotion. Front. Plant Sci. 10. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2019.01741

Pérez-Jaramillo, J.E., Carrión, V.J., de Hollander, M., Raaijmakers, J.M., 2018. The wild side

of plant microbiomes. Microbiome 6, 143. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-018-0519-z

Quiza, L., Tremblay, J., Greer, C.W., Hemmingsen, S.M., St-Arnaud, M., Pozniak, C.J.,

Yergeau, E., 2021. Rhizosphere shotgun metagenomic analyses fail to show

differences between ancestral and modern wheat genotypes grown under low fertilizer

inputs. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 97, fiab071.

https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiab071

R core Team, 2024. R: A language and environment for statistical computing.

Reid, T.E., Kavamura, V.N., Abadie, M., Torres-Ballesteros, A., Pawlett, M., Clark, I.M.,

Harris, J., Mauchline, T.H., 2021. Inorganic Chemical Fertilizer Application to Wheat

Reduces the Abundance of Putative Plant Growth-Promoting Rhizobacteria. Front.

Microbiol. 12. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2021.642587

Robinson, R.J., Fraaije, B.A., Clark, I.M., Jackson, R.W., Hirsch, P.R., Mauchline, T.H.,

2016. Endophytic bacterial community composition in wheat (Triticum aestivum) is

determined by plant tissue type, developmental stage and soil nutrient availability.

Plant Soil 405, 381–396. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-015-2495-4

Robledo, M., Jiménez-Zurdo, J.I., Velázquez, E., Trujillo, M.E., Zurdo-Piñeiro, J.L.,

Ramírez-Bahena, M.H., Ramos, B., Díaz-Mínguez, J.M., Dazzo, F., Martínez-Molina,

E., Mateos, P.F., 2008. Rhizobium cellulase CelC2 is essential for primary symbiotic

infection of legume host roots. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 105, 7064–7069.

https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0802547105

Rossmann, M., Pérez Jaramillo, J., Nessner Kavamura, V., Chiaramonte, J., Dumack, K.,

Fiore-Donno, A.M., Mendes, L., Ferreira, M., Bonkowski, M., Mauchline, T.,

Mendes, R., 2020. Multitrophic interactions in the rhizosphere microbiome of wheat:

from bacteria and fungi to protists. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 96.

https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiaa032

Sarno, J., Domizi, P., Liu, Y., Merchant, M., Pedersen, C.B., Jedoui, D., Jager, A., Nolan,

G.P., Gaipa, G., Bendall, S.C., Bava, F.-A., Davis, K.L., 2023. Dasatinib overcomes

glucocorticoid resistance in B-cell acute lymphoblastic leukemia. Nat Commun 14,

2935. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-023-38456-y

Sasse, J., Martinoia, E., Northen, T., 2018. Feed Your Friends: Do Plant Exudates Shape the

Root Microbiome? Trends in Plant Science 23, 25–41.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2017.09.003

Schlaeppi, K., Bulgarelli, D., 2015. The Plant Microbiome at Work. MPMI 28, 212–217.

https://doi.org/10.1094/MPMI-10-14-0334-FI

Semaan, K., Zarif, T.E., Eid, M., Shah, V., Fortunato, B., Saliby, R.M., Nassar, A.H., Alaiwi,

S.A., Seo, J.-H., Labaki, C., Bakouny, Z., Matar, S., Ahmar, N.E., Laimon, Y.N., Lee,

G.-S.M., Pomerantz, M., Berchuck, J., Signoretti, S., Van Allen, E., Choueiri, T.,

Braun, D., Freedman, M., Baca, S., 2023. Abstract A029: Epigenomic profiling

nominates master transcription factors (TFs) driving sarcomatoid differentiation of

renal cell carcinoma (RCC). Cancer Research 83, A029. https://doi.org/10.1158/1538-

7445.KIDNEY23-A029

Shala-Lawrence, A., Bragagnolo, N., Nowroozi-Dayeni, R., Kheyson, S., Audette, G.F.,

2018. The interaction of TraW and TrbC is required to facilitate conjugation in F-like

plasmids. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 503, 2386–2392.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbrc.2018.06.166

Shi, S., Chang, J., Tian, L., Nasir, F., Ji, L., Li, X., Tian, C., 2019. Comparative analysis of

the rhizomicrobiome of the wild versus cultivated crop: insights from rice and

soybean. Arch Microbiol 201, 879–888. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00203-019-01638-8

Sonawane, A.M., Singh, B., Röhm, K.-H., 2006. The AauR-AauS two-component system

regulates uptake and metabolism of acidic amino acids in Pseudomonas putida. Appl

Environ Microbiol 72, 6569–6577. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00830-06

Spor, A., Roucou, A., Mounier, A., Bru, D., Breuil, M.-C., Fort, F., Vile, D., Roumet, P.,

Philippot, L., Violle, C., 2020. Domestication-driven changes in plant traits associated

with changes in the assembly of the rhizosphere microbiota in tetraploid wheat. Sci

Rep 10, 12234. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-69175-9

Stephens, M., 2017. False discovery rates: a new deal. Biostatistics 18, 275–294.

https://doi.org/10.1093/biostatistics/kxw041

Sun, Y., Tian, L., Chang, J., Shi, S., Zhang, J., Xie, H., Cai, Y., Chen, D., Kuramae, E.E., van

Veen, J.A., Li, W., Tran, L.-S.P., Tian, C., 2021. Rice domestication influences the

composition and function of the rhizosphere bacterial chemotaxis systems. Plant Soil

466, 81–99. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-021-05036-2

Takle, G.W., Toth, I.K., Brurberg, M.B., 2007. Evaluation of reference genes for real-time

RT-PCR expression studies in the plant pathogen Pectobacterium atrosepticum. BMC

Plant Biology 7, 50. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2229-7-50

Tkacz, A., Pini, F., Turner, T.R., Bestion, E., Simmonds, J., Howell, P., Greenland, A.,

Cheema, J., Emms, D.M., Uauy, C., Poole, P.S., 2020. Agricultural Selection of

Wheat Has Been Shaped by Plant-Microbe Interactions. Frontiers in Microbiology 11.

Toma, C., Kuroki, H., Nakasone, N., Ehara, M., Iwanaga, M., 2002. Minor pilin subunits are

conserved in Vibrio cholerae type IV pili. FEMS Immunology & Medical

Microbiology 33, 35–40. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-695X.2002.tb00569.x

Van Grinsven, H.J.M., Holland, M., Jacobsen, B.H., Klimont, Z., Sutton, M. a., Jaap

Willems, W., 2013. Costs and Benefits of Nitrogen for Europe and Implications for

Mitigation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 3571–3579. https://doi.org/10.1021/es303804g

Vives-Peris, V., de Ollas, C., Gómez-Cadenas, A., Pérez-Clemente, R.M., 2020. Root

exudates: from plant to rhizosphere and beyond. Plant Cell Rep 39, 3–17.

https://doi.org/10.1007/s00299-019-02447-5

Wang, S., Guo, Z., Wang, L., Zhang, Y., Jiang, F., Wang, X., Yin, L., Liu, B., Liu, H., Wang,

H., Wang, A., Ren, Y., Liu, C., Fan, W., Wang, Z., 2021a. Wheat Rhizosphere

Metagenome Reveals Newfound Potential Soil Zn-Mobilizing Bacteria Contributing

to Cultivars' Variation in Grain Zn Concentration. Frontiers in Microbiology 12.

Wang, J., Chen, Y.-L., Li, Y.-K., Chen, D.-K., He, J.-F., Yao, N., 2021b. Functions of

Sphingolipids in Pathogenesis During Host–Pathogen Interactions. Front. Microbiol.

12. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2021.701041

Weiss, S., Xu, Z.Z., Peddada, S., Amir, A., Bittinger, K., Gonzalez, A., Lozupone, C.,

Zaneveld, J.R., Vázquez-Baeza, Y., Birmingham, A., Hyde, E.R., Knight, R., 2017.

Normalization and microbial differential abundance strategies depend upon data

characteristics. Microbiome 5, 27. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-017-0237-y

Wood, R.K.S., 1960. Pectic and Cellulolytic Enzymes in Plant Disease. Annual Review of

Plant Biology 11, 299–322. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.pp.11.060160.001503

Yadav, S.S., Prasad, C.B., Prasad, S.B., Pandey, L.K., Singh, S., Pradhan, S., Narayan, G.,

2015. Anti-tumor activity of staurosporine in the tumor microenvironment of cervical

cancer: An *in vitro* study. Life Sciences 133, 21–28.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lfs.2015.04.019

Yu, Y., Zhang, Q., Zhang, Z., Zhou, S., Jin, M., Zhu, D., Yang, X., Qian, H., Lu, T., 2023.

Plants select antibiotic resistome in rhizosphere in early stage. Science of The Total

Environment 858, 159847. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.159847

Yue, H., Yue, W., Jiao, S., Kim, H., Lee, Y.-H., Wei, G., Song, W., Shu, D., 2023. Plant
domestication shapes rhizosphere microbiome assembly and metabolic functions.
Microbiome 11, 70. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-023-01513-1
Zadoks, J.C., Chang, T.T., Konzak, C.F., 1974. A decimal code for the growth stages of
cereals. Weed Research 14, 415–421. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-
3180.1974.tb01084.x
Zhong, X., Lu, R., Liu, F., Ye, J., Zhao, J., Wang, F., Yang, M., 2021. Identification of LuxR
Family Regulators That Integrate Into Quorum Sensing Circuit in Vibrio
parahaemolyticus. Front. Microbiol. 12. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2021.691842
Zhou, X., Wang, J.-T., Zhang, Z.-F., Li, W., Chen, W., Cai, L., 2020. Microbiota in the
Rhizosphere and Seed of Rice From China, With Reference to Their Transmission
and Biogeography. Front Microbiol 11, 995.
https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2020.00995