Student-led experimental evolution reveals novel biofilm regulators of adaptation to

multiple niches

AUTHORS

Abigail M. Matela[12], Colton W. Siatkowski[12], Changhua Yan[12], Sachin Thiagarajan[1], Vaughn S.

Cooper[12]

[1]University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, [2]Center for Evolutionary Biology and Medicine,

Department of Microbiology and Molecular Genetics, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

ABSTRACT

We established a research-education partnership, EvolvingSTEM, that currently provides

thousands of secondary school students the opportunity to conduct authentic research

experiments centered on microbial evolution each year. Providing high school students access

to research experiences not only improves learning and can have positive and long-lasting

impacts on their attitudes towards science, but also gives them the opportunity to make

impactful scientific contributions. Through EvolvingSTEM, students evolve populations of

Pseudomonas fluorescens in a bead model that includes daily cycles of bacterial dispersal,

attachment, and biofilm growth and observe heritable changes in colony morphology. Genome

sequencing of 70 mutants that they picked identified parallel mutations in genes known to

regulate biofilm growth (*wsp, yfiBNR, morA, fuzY*) and uncovered novel adaptations: loss-of-

function mutations in phosphodiesterase PFLU0185 that did not alter colony morphology and

mutations affecting periplasmic disulfide bond formation producing small colonies. PFLU0185

mutants rapidly and consistently reached high frequencies and phenotyping revealed roles in

cyclic di-GMP regulation, biofilm formation, and motility, prompting us to name this gene *bmo*

(<u>b</u>iofilm and <u>mo</u>tility <u>regulator</u>). Competition experiments and microscopy demonstrated *bmo*

mutants employ generalist strategies and coexist with their ancestor and specialist mutants

through niche differentiation. Consequently, phenotypic diversity is maintained, with smooth

(ancestral and *bmo*) colonies consistently outnumbering wrinkly and fuzzy variants. This study

advances our understanding of biofilm genetic architecture while demonstrating that student-led

research can uncover mechanisms of microbial adaptation relevant to *Pseudomonas* infection

biology.

IMPORTANCE

Bacterial biofilms dominate microbial life, yet their evolutionary genetics remain incompletely understood. Extensive replication of experiments that employ similar, but not identical, biofilm selection models can provide valuable insights into mechanisms of adaptation. We demonstrate that this can be achieved through university-education partnerships that engage secondary school students in authentic research. Student-led experiments revealed that loss-of-function mutations in a conserved phosphodiesterase, PFLU0185/*bmo*, dominate evolved populations without changing colony morphology. This finding, combined with diverse, less frequent mutants that alter colony morphology informs the process of biofilm niche differentiation. This work also demonstrates the power of distributed research networks for discovering new genetic pathways of adaptation. Students gained authentic research experience, potentially inspiring them to become scientists, while identifying mutants adapted to discrete conditions that maintain diversity within biofilms. This synergy between education and discovery offers a scalable model for addressing complex biological questions while developing scientific literacy in diverse classrooms.

INTRODUCTION

Despite being the dominant form of microbial life, our understanding of the ecology, evolution, and genetic controls of adaptation within biofilms is still developing. What we and many others have learned is that bacteria evolve rapidly and conspicuously, often by producing new colony morphologies, when selected to improve surface growth in experimental models as well as in clinical and environmental settings (Stewart & Franklin, 2008; Poltak & Cooper, 2011; Traverse et al., 2013; Ellis et al., 2015; Nadell et al., 2016). This dynamic can be captured in simple experiments conducted by secondary school students that not only improves their learning experiences but also provides them the opportunity to contribute to cutting-edge scientific research (Cooper et al., 2019; Spiers, 2014; Taylor et al., 2024).

We might expect that interactions in biofilms would be complex as cells engineer their environment by secreting polymers that bind them to a surface and protect them from stresses, competitors, or predators. Two overlapping processes can explain the origin and maintenance of phenotypic diversity within biofilms. The first is environmental structure itself, which allows multiple phenotypically equivalent mutants to arise and coexist in different regions (Kassen & Rainey, 2004). The second is ecological interactions made possible by structure, for example, when an early adhering population facilitates the attachment of different types (Habets et al., 2006; Harris et al., 2021). However, the genetic and phenotypic outcomes of these processes are less clear but broadly important in natural and engineered systems, such as wastewater treatment (Røder et al., 2016) and in the clinic (Trubenová et al., 2022). For example, high-biofilm forming bacterial and fungal mutants often arise during chronic infections, are associated with increased resistance to antibiotics and immune phagocytes, and worsen patient outcomes (Hall-Stoodley et al., 2004; Flemming & Wuertz, 2019; Pestrak et al., 2018). There is a need to broadly characterize the spectrum of genotypes and phenotypes that generate biofilm diversity. Experimental evolution of microbial populations under conditions favoring biofilm combined with contemporary genomic analysis can be a powerful screen of these traits.

Our laboratory previously developed an *in vitro* model to study evolution throughout the entire biofilm life cycle of surface attachment, biofilm assembly, dispersal, and re-colonization (Poltak & Cooper, 2011). In short, bacteria are cultured in test tubes that contain growth media and a polystyrene bead, which serves as a surface for bacteria to colonize and form a biofilm.

The biofilm-covered bead is then transferred to a new test tube with fresh media and a sterile

bead. Beads are serially transferred to select for biofilm-adapted mutants that can disperse from

the old bead and recolonize and assemble a new biofilm on the new bead every 24 hours. This

model has been used by us to better understand the dynamics of biofilm evolution and

associated ecological diversification in multiple species (*Burkholderia cenocepacia*,

Acinetobacter baumannii, *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*) under various environmental stressors

(e.g., nutrients, antibiotics) (Poltak & Cooper, 2011; Traverse et al., 2013; Cooper et al., 2014;

Ellis et al., 2015; O'Rourke et al., 2015; Flynn et al., 2016; Turner et al., 2018; Santos-Lopez et

al., 2019; Scribner et al., 2020; Mhatre et al., 2020; Harris et al., 2021). The bead model has

also been adapted by many others to address similar questions and is routinely paired with

whole genome sequencing of mutant clones and evolved populations to identify causes of new

phenotypes (Henriksen et al., 2022; Oakley et al., 2021; Trampari et al., 2021). A surprising

finding from these studies is the extent of genetic parallelism rather than a diverse array of

pathways to adaptation. Despite the intuition that the biofilm life cycle is both structured and

heterogeneous, and the observation of various colony phenotypes, mutations in relatively few

genes encoding major biofilm regulators accounted for most of the adaptations (Mhatre et al.,

2020; Santos-Lopez et al., 2019).

One possible explanation for convergent evolution in the biofilm bead model is that each

study was conducted by one or few investigators using well controlled conditions, thereby

focusing selection on limited traits. Higher experimental replication by many different

researchers could address this concern. For this reason and many others related to improving

learning and access to authentic research, we adapted the bead model for use in secondary

school classrooms (Cooper et al., 2019). In this research-education partnership, students work

with the harmless plant probiotic bacterium, *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain SBW25, which is

both a model of this environmentally relevant species and shares many orthologs with the

opportunistic pathogen *P. aeruginosa*. This program is called EvolvingSTEM and now engages

thousands of students a year in authentic microbiology research in grades 6-12 in more than 20

schools in several U.S. states. Previous research on *P. fluorescens* SBW25 identified biofilm-

related adaptations to static culture conditions, where populations rapidly evolve to form a

biofilm mat at the oxygen-rich, air-liquid interface (Koza et al., 2017). The evolved populations

diversified into three distinct colony morphologies: (1) smooth and round (the ancestral

phenotype), (2) wrinkly, and (3) fuzzy (Rainey & Travisano, 1998). It is this rapid evolution to

produce pellicles that encouraged us to use *P. fluorescens* with our bead model to study its

adaptation to biofilm growth with students.

The most conspicuous new colony morphology seen in previous experiments is the

wrinkly phenotype. This phenotype commonly results from mutations in one of three genetic

pathways – *wsp*, *yfiBNR* (or *aws*), and *morA* (or *mws*) – that regulate the production of a

secondary messenger, bis-(3'-5')-cyclic dimeric guanosine monophosphate (cyclic di-GMP)

(McDonald et al., 2009). Cyclic di-GMP controls biofilm formation by regulating the activity of

several downstream genes and proteins (Jenal et al., 2017). The production of cyclic di-GMP is

regulated by the opposing activity of two enzyme families: diguanylate cyclases (DGCs) that

synthesize cyclic di-GMP and phosphodiesterases (PDEs) that degrade it (Jenal et al., 2017).

High cellular levels of cyclic di-GMP are associated with surface attachment and biofilm

production, while low levels are associated with increased motility, solitary behavior, and

bacterial dispersal (Laventie, Benoit-Joseph, 2020). Mutations in the *wsp*, *yfiBNR*, and *morA*

pathways lead to constitutive activation of a DGC, which results in overproduction of cyclic di-

GMP (Malone et al., 2007; McDonald et al., 2009), and, ultimately, increased biofilm formation

through increased production of acetylated cellulose (Spiers et al., 2002, 2003). In contrast,

fuzzy phenotypes are a result of mutations in *fuzY*, which encodes a β-glycosyltransferase

predicted to modify LPS O-antigens. Mutations in *fuzY* are thought to promote cell-cell contact

but the mechanistic benefit of mutations in this gene are less well understood (Ferguson et al.,

2013).

P. fluorescens populations evolved by high school students with our EvolvingSTEM

evolution-in-action experiment often exhibit diverse colony morphologies within and among

populations that resemble those seen under selection in static culture conditions (Cooper et al.,

2019). We wondered if the phenotypic similarities of mutants adapted to static culture and those

in our bead model are caused by the same underlying genetic changes, so we sequenced 70

clones from populations almost entirely evolved by high school students. We found that *P.*

fluorescens adapts to form biofilms on surfaces through mutations in some of the same genetic

pathways as those used to form pellicles in unshaken vials and also uncovered novel biofilm

adaptations. We then sought to identify what drives evolutionary dynamics in our bead model

and whether these dynamics differ when bacteria are grown in subinhibitory levels of the

common antimicrobial triclosan, which was used to prevent fungal and bacterial contamination

at some schools. This led to the discovery that biofilm adaptation in our model is primarily driven

by lineages that do not change colony appearance but acquire loss-of-function mutations in

PFLU0185, a highly conserved gene across pseudomonads encoding a DGC and dominant

PDE (Cai et al., 2022, 2022; Eilers et al., 2022; Eilers, Yam, et al., 2024; Wei et al., 2019).

Although PFLU0185 mutants share the same colony morphology as their ancestor, further

phenotyping revealed adaptations in biofilm formation and motility. We therefore suggest

renaming this locus *bmo,* for biofilm and motility regulator. Population sequencing, microscopy,

and multi-genotype competition experiments suggest that *bmo* mutants coexisted with their

ancestor and with rarer, genetically diverse lineages producing wrinkly and fuzzy colonies in

dynamics that can be explained by multi-niche selection (Brisson, 2018).

RESULTS

Student-led experiments rapidly uncover diverse phenotypes

Our EvolvingSTEM evolution-in-action experiment allows students to observe bacterial

populations evolving and diversifying within days as they adapt to a daily selection regime to

complete the entire biofilm life cycle of dispersal, surface attachment, and biofilm maturation.

Students work with a harmless plant probiotic bacterium, *P. fluorescens* strain SBW25. As the

populations evolve, students can observe at least two types of phenotypic change. First, as high

biofilm-forming mutants increase in frequency in the population, students often see a more

robust layer of biofilm form in their test tubes at the air-liquid interface. Second, students can

observe changes in the colony morphologies of bacteria grown on agar plates. While the

ancestral population produces only smooth, circular colonies, evolved populations often exhibit

diverse, conspicuous colony morphologies within and among populations (Fig. 1).

Students from three high schools – Winnacunnet High School (WHS, Hampton, NH,

N=~250), Pittsburgh Science and Technology Academy (Pittsburgh, PA, N=25), and Allderdice

High School (Pittsburgh, PA, N=24) – conducted experiments under slightly different conditions.

Changes to the experimental protocol were made to accommodate class requirements and

increase the accessibility of EvolvingSTEM in varied classroom settings (our updated protocol

can be found in supplemental materials). While WHS used standard aseptic technique, in other

schools, we added the commonly used antimicrobial compound triclosan to the media and agar

plates to broadly inhibit bacterial and fungal contamination. *Pseudomonas* species are known to

tolerate or resist triclosan (Schweizer, 2001; McFarland et al., 2021), and this eliminates the

need to use a flame in schools that do not have access to Bunsen burners and/or do not feel

comfortable having students work near an open flame. Another difference was that WHS

aerated growing bacterial cultures on a roller drum, which was not available in most classrooms,

so we switched to using orbital shakers to aerate growing cultures.

Students plated samples of their bead-attached bacterial populations on agar at the

beginning and end of the experiment. Ancestral *P. fluorescens* clones produce only smooth,

round colonies, and this was the only morphology identified on the early plating day. Most bead-

adapted populations contained wrinkly colony variants on the final plating day, and some had

fuzzy and small colony variants (Fig. 1). Wrinkly and fuzzy colony variants had a similar

appearance to those identified when *P. fluorescens* is under selection for the formation of

biofilm mats in static culture conditions (Koza et al., 2017). While our experimental design also

selects for biofilm-adapted mutants, it differs from static selection experiments in that bacteria

must colonize a new surface each day, completing the entire biofilm life cycle of dispersal,

attachment, biofilm assembly, and matrix building. We therefore explored if the convergent

colony phenotypes we identified in these experiments was the result of convergent mutational

targets by sequencing the genomes of wrinkly and fuzzy clones from independent populations.

In addition, we sequenced the genomes of smooth colonies, which were identical in appearance

to the ancestor, and small colony variants, which were the only other unique morphology noted

in these experiments (Fig. 1).

203   Biofilm adaptations include mutations affecting cyclic di-GMP production, LPS O-antigen

204   structure, and periplasmic protein folding

Two remarkable properties of this collection of mutant genomes deserve highlighting

before we explore the genes affected or their functional implications. First, in 55 of 70 mutants,

only one mutation was identified, meaning that this single mutation experienced strong selection

to rise to a detectable frequency and, in most cases, change the colony morphology (Table 1,

Table S1). Consequently, the biofilm bead model serves as a potent forward genetic screen for

single mutations that influence biofilm-related fitness. Of the remaining 15 mutants, 13 had two

mutations and one had three mutations. Second, the extent of site-specific parallelism in these

mutants is extraordinary: 13 individual mutations occurred more than once in different clones.

Although it is possible that a few instances of parallel mutations were not entirely independent,

e.g. from the same school and year, most clearly arose independently from different schools

and years. Exceptional examples include one SNP in *wspF* that was observed in six clones and

another 33bp deletion in *yfiR* observed five separate times (Table 1). This observation suggests

extremely strong selection for certain mutations, a locally higher mutation rate, or both. Overall,

23 unique genes became mutated and were affected by a roughly equal mix of small

insertion/deletions (indels) and SNPs with fewer larger deletions. This spectrum of mutations

demonstrates that *P. fluorescens* experiences strong selection for a narrow set of traits in the

biofilm bead model that often favors identical mutations in independent experiments.

The genomes of 57 clones with wrinkly phenotypes were sequenced from 50

independently evolved biofilm populations. In agreement with previous studies on biofilm

formation in static culture conditions, causative mutations were identified in the *wsp*, *yfiBNR*,

and *morA* pathways (Fig. 2, Table 1), which supports a critical role for these pathways in biofilm

regulation under diverse selective regimes. Mutations in the *wsp* pathway were the most

common cause of wrinkly phenotypes across all sequenced clones, with approximately 70%

having a single causative mutation in this pathway. Mutations were primarily found in *wspF*

(PFLU1224, 33 clones), followed by *wspA* (PFLU1219, 6 clones). In addition, a single clone had

a 335 base-pair deletion that overlapped the coding regions of *wspC* (PFLU1221) and *wspD*

(PFLU1222), resulting in a WspC-WspD fusion protein. The *yfiBNR* pathway was the second

most common cause of wrinkly phenotypes, with approximately 16% of clones having a single

causative mutation in *yfiR* (PFLU5211, 9 clones). Mutations in *morA* (PFLU5329, 5 clones) were

the least common cause of wrinkly phenotypes, with approximately 9% of clones having a single

causative mutation. Surprisingly, all three clones isolated at Allderdice had mutations in two

pathways. These clones contained a single, nonsynonymous SNP in the PDE domain of *morA*.

One clone had an additional nonsense mutation in *wspF*; one had an additional missense

mutation in *wspA*; and one had an additional deletion in the linker region between the DGC and

PDE domains of *morA*. These mutants indicate that the sequential acquisition of multiple

mutations in pathways influencing cyclic-di-GMP metabolism can be beneficial.

Fuzzy mutants were identified in evolved populations at several schools, although less

frequently than wrinkly mutants. While we did not sequence any fuzzy mutants from high school

experiments, two fuzzy mutants isolated in the laboratory had predicted loss-of-function

mutations in *fuzY* (PFLU0478) (Fig. 3). In addition, we sequenced the genomes of five small

colony variants isolated by students and in the laboratory. These mutants contained single

mutations in a predicted two-component system sensor histidine kinase, *dsbS* (PFLU4380), or

in the operon it is predicted to regulate, *dsbD* (PFLU4382)-*dsbG* (PFLU4384) (Fig. 3). Three

clones had an in-frame deletion in the N-terminal region of *dsbS*, one clone had a 110 base-pair

deletion that overlapped the coding regions of *dsbE* (PFLU4383) and *dsbG*, resulting in a DsbE-

DsbG fusion protein, and one clone had a mutation in the intergenic region upstream of *dsbR*

(PFLU4381) and *dsbD* (Fig. 3). Lastly, we also sequenced clones from five evolved populations

that retained the ancestral smooth morphology. Although one smooth clone had no mutations,

four clones had a mutation in a gene encoding both DGC and PDE domains, PFLU0185, and

this was the only mutation identified in three clones (Fig. 3). We have named this gene *bmo* for

its roles in biofilm formation and motility, which are further described below.

Strong selection for mutations in *bmo* during adaptation to the experimental biofilm life

cycle

We were intrigued by the discovery of mutations in a DGC-PDE encoding gene that did

not change the mutant colony phenotype. Although an objective of the EvolvingSTEM program

is to visually demonstrate adaptation by natural selection by observing novel colony phenotypes

after selection for improved biofilm formation, in fact, most populations have a majority of

colonies that retain the smooth appearance of the ancestor after one week of passage. This

suggests that focusing only on colony variants may miss biofilm adaptations. To address this

limitation, we conducted a 15-day evolution experiment in which we used whole-population,

whole-genome sequencing to identify all mutations reaching appreciable frequency in biofilm

populations regardless of whether they alter colony appearance. We also replicated this

comparison in media containing triclosan, which we use in classrooms to guard against

contamination and which appears to accelerate rates of diversification. Specifically, four

replicate biofilm populations were propagated with and without 25µg/mL triclosan for 15 days.

We plated the bead-attached portion of each population after 4, 8, 11, and 14 transfers to

observe phenotypic changes to population colony morphologies over time and performed

whole-population, whole-genome sequencing after 2 and 14 transfers (Table S2, Fig. 4). We

noted three distinct colony morphologies, wrinkly, fuzzy, and small, in addition to the ancestral,

smooth phenotype. Populations grown in triclosan had moderately increased diversity on the

earliest plating day, but this diversity decreased over the course of the experiment, with all

populations having over 95% smooth colonies by the final plating. Populations that were grown

without triclosan maintained slightly higher diversity over time, and all populations had between

90-95% smooth colonies by the final plating (Fig. 4).

Surprisingly, mutations in the *bmo* locus were the only gene-level parallel genetic

change in all biofilm populations, and they rose to detectable frequencies by the third day of the

experiment in media containing triclosan, but not in media without triclosan (Fig. 4, Table S2).

Multiple independent mutations in *bmo* were present within each of the three biofilm populations

with added triclosan at day 3 at 16.7%, 42.3%, and 50% cumulative frequency, and by day 15

all eight biofilm-adapted populations had *bmo* mutants at >16% cumulative frequency. The only

other notable biofilm-related mutation that we observed was in *fuzY*, which reached a frequency

of 11.2% in one population that was grown without triclosan. Furthermore, three of the four

populations grown with added triclosan gained mutations in a transcription factor, *anr*

(PFLU4570), and one of the genes it regulates, *hemN* (PFLU4568). These mutations may be

adaptations to growth in triclosan and will be the subject of future study.

Mutants are differentiated in biofilm phenotypes including attachment, assembly, and

motility

We predicted that mutations in *bmo* achieved the highest frequencies and repeatedly

evolved in our biofilm selection model because they are best adapted to the cyclical

requirements to attach to the plastic bead, assemble biofilms, and then disperse to colonize a

new bead. We therefore characterized the motility, biofilm production, and cyclic di-GMP

production for a representative *bmo* loss-of-function mutant with a single nucleotide insertion

that results in a premature stop codon truncating both the DGC and PDE domains (Table 1). We

compared its biofilm associated phenotypes to a representative wrinkly (*wspF* Q185*) and fuzzy

(*fuzY* Q11*) mutant, along with the *P. fluorescens* SBW25 ancestor from which these mutants

evolved.

We first compared three common types of bacterial motility – swarming, swimming, and

twitching. All biofilm-adapted mutants had reduced swarming and swimming motility in

comparison to the ancestor (Fig. 5A, 5B). *wspF* mutants were the least motile, while *fuzY* and

bmo mutants had intermediate phenotypes. Twitching motility was not displayed by any biofilm-

adapted mutants or the ancestor, confirmed by comparison to *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* PAO1

which possesses twitching motility (Fig. S1).

To estimate biofilm production by each mutant, we adapted the traditional crystal violet

96-well plate assay (O'Toole & Kolter, 1998) to better align with how bacteria form biofilms in

our bead model. Bacteria were cultured for 24 hours in test tubes containing media and two

plastic beads. We quantified total biofilm production by staining one bead with crystal violet,

removing excess stain by washing the bead in water, and solubilizing biofilm-bound crystal

violet by vortexing the bead in solvent. We quantified biofilm population size by vortexing and

dilution-plating from the second bead. When grown in QB medium, *bmo* and *wspF* mutants

have the highest total biofilm production and population size (Fig. 5C, 5D). One caveat to note is

that *wspF* mutant populations often acquire compensatory, suppressor mutations that can rise

to high frequencies in overnight cultures, so between 20%-40% of the colonies counted had a

smooth, ancestral phenotype. When grown in media with added triclosan, total biofilm

production is doubled in *bmo*, *fuzY*, and the ancestor and quadrupled in *wspF* (Fig. 5C, 5D).

Moreover, the population size of all genotypes is less than half that observed in triclosan-free

media (Fig. 5C, 5D). Planktonic growth is also slower when triclosan is included in the media

and final population sizes are smaller (Fig. S2).

To determine how these biofilm-adapted mutations affect cyclic di-GMP metabolism, we

used a GFP reporter plasmid that responds to the intracellular concentration of cyclic di-GMP to

estimate these changes. Levels of cyclic di-GMP differed significantly among *P. fluorescens*

mutants following 24 hours of growth in QB media (Fig. 5E). Cyclic di-GMP concentrations were

highest for *bmo* and *wspF* mutants, with *wspF* producing nearly double the amount of cyclic di-

GMP as *bmo*. Surprisingly, the *fuzY* mutant produced approximately half as much cyclic di-GMP

as the ancestor, although this gene is not reported to have a role in the regulation of cyclic di-

GMP. Taken together, these results demonstrate that *bmo* regulates biofilm formation and

motility and loss-of-function mutations in this gene allow for the optimization of biofilm

production and planktonic growth in our bead model.

We sought to understand how the different macroscopic and regulatory phenotypes of *P.*

fluorescens mutants generated distinct microscopic biofilm phenotypes. We therefore used

confocal microscopy to image biofilms produced by our representative *bmo*, *wspF*, and *fuzY*

mutants as well as the ancestor that contained a constitutively active fluorescent reporter

inserted at a neutral site on the chromosome. Both the ancestor and *bmo* formed relatively

confluent biofilms of even thickness and their similar appearances suggest that they would

compete for the same niche space on the bead (Fig. 6). In contrast, the *fuzY* biofilm was more

clumped and uneven in thickness and coverage, whereas the *wspF* biofilm was surprisingly

sparse, with small, dense clusters (Fig. 6). It is notable that we imaged biofilms on glass slides

rather than on the polystyrene beads on which these mutants evolved, and that the supernatant

of the *wspF* cultures contained large aggregates that did not adhere well to glass. To explore

how these mutants interact in a diverse biofilm, we imaged mutants with different fluorescent

markers that were co-cocultured in pairs (Fig. S3). Overall, the observed patterns of biofilm

assembly agreed with predictions from mutant growth alone, with interspersed and confluent

growth by *bmo* and the ancestor but fewer discrete patches of different sizes and forms

produced by *wspF* and *fuzY*. Taken together, these images indicate that biofilm mutants in

different pathways are ecologically distinct and produce clusters or coatings of varying biomass

and form, both alone and in mixture.

Genetic diversity during biofilm selection is maintained by competition and niche

differentiation

An important and unusual finding from these studies is that *P. fluorescens* populations

grown in the biofilm bead model rapidly and repeatedly diversify into multiple phenotypes and

genotypes that coexist, with no genotype ever reaching 100%. This observation implies that

selection acts strongly on mutants that inhabit different niches of varied capacity. This leads to

the prediction that if putative niche specialists are mixed in equal amounts and propagated, their

frequencies should equilibrate according to the capacity of each niche and the relative

competitiveness of each mutant in conditions of niche overlap (e.g., growth on a common

carbon source). We created a mixed population of the three, representative biofilm-adapted

mutants *bmo*, *wspF*, and *fuzY* and their *lac*-marked ancestor. We used this mixed population to

inoculate six replicate cultures grown in our bead model of biofilm growth for four days without

triclosan and plated daily to determine the frequency of each genotype on newly colonized

beads (Fig. 7). As predicted, all genotypes coexisted within each population, with *wspF* and

fuzY mutants generally at low frequencies and the *bmo* mutant and ancestor at intermediate

frequencies. In addition, frequencies of *bmo* and WT were anticorrelated in half of the replicates,

which suggests they occupy differentiated but overlapping niches, as the microscopy indicated

and ecological literature supports (Fig. 6) (Caplat et al., 2008; Chesson, 2000). We used linear

regression to test this hypothesis for all genotype combinations and found a significant, negative

relationship for the *bmo* mutant frequency with frequencies of all other genotypes, which is

consistent with competition (Table 2, Fig. S4). In summary, our model of the biofilm life cycle

exerts strong, parallel selection for different phenotypes that balance biofilm production, growth,

dispersal, and reattachment in different ways. Mutants adapted to different aspects of these

traits can coexist by invading in conditions in which they are more fit, while declining in

conditions where they are less competitive.

DISCUSSION

Student experiments discover new genetic pathways of adaptation to the biofilm life

cycle

Involving secondary school students in distributed scientific experiments in their own

science classrooms offers complementary promises, including: 1) a high level of replication that

can broadly test a common hypothesis, and 2) developing a community of teachers and

learners who are connected by a common set of research skills, experiences and findings.

Here, we not only report evidence that both promises can be met, but also that students

contributed to expanding our knowledge of the genetics of adaptation to the biofilm life cycle.

Their experiments with the biofilm bead model selected for phenotypes that excel during daily

cycles of dispersal, recolonization, and biofilm assembly. By picking many representative clones

with these phenotypes and then genotyping them by whole-genome sequencing, we use

experimental evolution as a powerful forward genetic screen. This approach identified mutants

that support previous findings from pellicle selection experiments and also uncovered novel

adaptive pathways within the biofilm lifestyle. These findings support the hypothesis that biofilm

selection acts on traits governed by a few central regulators, leading to strong parallel evolution

across experiments. They also reveal that different selective environments, for example

associated with varied implementation in classrooms, can uncover alternative adaptations in

novel pathways to biofilm formation. Because most of these mutants contain only one mutation

in their genome, the relationships between genotype and phenotype are direct. In this section,

we discuss predicted molecular and biochemical effects of these mutants in detail, several of

which strengthen or modify existing models of *Pseudomonas* biofilm gene regulation. We begin

by analyzing mutations producing the well-known wrinkly and fuzzy colony morphologies and

follow with discussion of the potential causes of beneficial small colony variants.

Student-selected colony variants support previous findings of genetic pathways

important for biofilm formation

The most common cause of wrinkly phenotypes was mutations in the *wsp* pathway, a

chemotaxis-like system composed of 7 genes: *wspA-R*, under the control of a single promoter

(Fig. 2) (Bantinaki et al., 2007). WspA is a methyl-accepting chemotaxis protein that is anchored

at the cytoplasmic membrane by the scaffolding proteins WspB and WspD. Upon sensing an

environmental signal, conformational changes in the WspA-B-D complex result in WspA being

methylated by WspC, a constitutively active methyltransferase. This begins a signaling cascade

that activates WspE, a histidine kinase response regulator. WspE goes on to activate WspR, a

DGC, through phosphorylation, increasing levels of cyclic di-GMP and ultimately leading to

increased biofilm formation through increased cellulose production (Spiers et al., 2002, 2003).

WspE also phosphorylates WspF, a methylesterase that negatively regulates the system by

demethylating WspA. In general, the Wsp pathway mutations we identified are predicted to

cause constitutive production of cyclic di-GMP and, consequently, increased biofilm formation.

We identified deletions in *wspA* that have been shown *in P. aeruginosa* to lock the pathway on

in a methylation-independent manner (A. Xu et al., 2021), whereas nonsynonymous mutations

in the *wspA* signaling domain likely disrupt the stability of its trimer-of-dimer interactions,

increasing WspE activation (O'Connor et al., 2012; Kessler et al., 2021). The mutation

producing a WspC-WspD fusion protein likely leads to hypermethylation of WspA because it

physically links WspC to the WspA-B-D complex (Kessler & Kim, 2022). The many different

mutations in *wspF* include nonsynonymous substitutions, many of which occurred at the same

site repeatedly, insertions, and deletions, including frameshift and nonsense mutations that

introduced premature stop codons (Fig. 2). These mutations almost certainly interfere with

WspF activation and/or its ability to demethylate WspA (O'Neal et al., 2022; A. Xu et al., 2021).

The second most common cause of wrinkly phenotypes were mutations in the *yfiBNR*

pathway, which is composed of three genes under the control of a single promoter (Fig. 2). YfiN

is a DGC that is localized to the cytoplasmic membrane and negatively regulated by the

attachment of the periplasmic YfiR protein (Malone et al., 2010, 2012). In response to

membrane stress, YfiB, a lipoprotein located at the outer membrane (Malone et al., 2012),

adopts an elongated conformation, which allows it to bind to and sequester YfiR (Li et al., 2018;

M. Xu et al., 2016). YfiN is therefore released from its negative regulation and able to catalyze

cyclic di-GMP production, promoting biofilm formation (Fig. 2). The C-terminal region of *P.*

aeruginosa YfiR is predicted to contain the attachment site to YfiN (Malone et al., 2012; Yang et

al., 2015); therefore, the *yfiR* missense and nonsense mutations we discovered in this region

may eliminate YfiR's ability to bind to YfiN. *P. aeruginosa* YfiR forms a dimer in its active form

via salt bridges formed by R98 and D80 and hydrogen bonds between T76 (Yang et al., 2015).

Notably, five *yfiR* mutants experienced the same 33bp deletion from T75 to T85 in *P.*

fluorescens that removes these homologous regions involved in dimerization. In addition, both

this deleted region and the downstream 33bp deletion contain or are located close to conserved

cysteine residues that in *P. aeruginosa* form disulfide bonds important for proper protein folding

(Yang et al., 2015). Deletions in these regions are therefore likely to lead to protein misfolding

that inhibits YfiR's ability to bind YfiN, thereby derepressing the DGC which promotes a biofilm

lifestyle.

Mutations in *morA* were the third most likely cause of wrinkly phenotypes. MorA is a

single protein localized to the cytoplasmic membrane that contains two PAS sensor domains as

well as active DGC and PDE domains, so it can catalyze both production and degradation of

cyclic di-GMP (Fig. 2) (McDonald et al., 2009; Phippen et al., 2014). We identified two identical

nonsynonymous substitutions in the DGC, three mutations affecting the linker region between

DGC and PDE domains that likely cause conformational changes that increase DGC activity

(Mhatre et al., 2020), and three identical mutations in the PDE that appear to disrupt its activity

(Fig. 2). The elevated biofilm of all these mutants indicates that their effects increase cyclic di-

GMP levels.

Fuzzy colony phenotypes are caused by loss-of-function mutations in *fuzY* (Fig. 3). In *P.*

fluorescens SBW25, *fuzY* is part of a five-gene operon that was predicted to encode a β-

glycosyltransferase that plays a role in modifying lipopolysaccharides (LPS) O-antigens, the

outermost portion of the LPS (Ferguson et al., 2013). The reciprocal best match of *fuzY*

homologs in *P. aeruginosa* strain PAO1 is *wapH*, which participates in synthesis of the LPS core

(Lam et al., 2011). In either case, in addition to roles in pathogenesis and symbiosis, O-antigen

structure plays an important role in bacterial adhesion and cohesion (Lerouge & Vanderleyden,

2002). In *P. aeruginosa*, O-antigen mutants exhibit increased cell-cell cohesion and increased

adhesion to glass surfaces (Lau et al., 2009). In our bead selection experiment, we expect that

mutations in *fuzY* are beneficial because they increase both cell-cell and cell-surface contact,

which would provide an advantage in adhering to the surface of the bead.

Student findings uncover new pathways to biofilm adaptation predicted to disrupt

periplasmic protein folding

Biofilm evolution experiments with our bead model often select for small colony variants

with increased Congo Red binding, which is consistent with higher cellulose production (Fig. 1;

Fig. S5). These phenotypes were consistently caused by mutations in a pathway that regulates

the formation of disulfide bonds, *dsbRS* and *dsbDEG*, which is critical for some proteins to be

properly folded into their active state conformation (Fig. 3). Most knowledge of enzymes

involved in the formation of disulfide bonds comes from studies in *Escherichia coli* (J. C. A.

Bardwell et al., 1991; J. C. Bardwell et al., 1993). In *E. coli*, the periplasmic oxidoreductase

DsbA catalyzes formation of disulfide bonds but is thought to perform this reaction

indiscriminately by introducing bonds between neighboring cysteines (Bader et al., 2000; J. C.

A. Bardwell et al., 1991). Proteins that require disulfide bond formation between nonconsecutive

cysteines undergo further processing through the activity of disulfide isomerases (DsbC and

DsbG) that rearrange these bonds (Berkmen et al., 2005; Hiniker & Bardwell, 2004; Manta et

al., 2019).

In *P. aeruginosa*, homologs of the regulatory two-component system *dsbRS* have been

shown to regulate the activation of *dsbDEG* homologs partly by binding copper ions (Yu et al.,

2022). Based on this study, we predict that evolved *dsbS* mutants lead to altered

phosphorylation of *dsbR* which interferes with its regulation of *dsbDEG*. The evolved intergenic

mutation is found in the predicted DsbR binding site and would therefore reduce *dsbDEG*

transcription. The evolved DsbE-DsbG fusion mutant likely interferes with the ability of these

proteins to fold properly, with the downstream consequence of misfolded periplasmic proteins.

Taken together, we predict that all mutations in this pathway result in misfolded periplasmic

proteins, although the exact proteins that are affected are unknown. Interestingly, in *P.*

aeruginosa, deletion of *dsbA* led to a small colony variant phenotype that was hypothesized to

be a result of YfiR misfolding due to its cysteine residues that contribute to dimerization,

resulting in constitutive activation of YfiN and elevated cyclic-di-GMP (Malone et al., 2012).

However, the small colonies produced by *dsb* mutations differ from the wrinkly mutants of

caused by *yfiR* mutations, suggesting different effects on biofilm requiring further study.

Discovery of frequent mutations in phosphodiesterase *bmo* that do not change colony

morphology

Clones retaining the ancestral, smooth colony phenotype at the end of evolution

experiments often acquired a mutation in *bmo*, a gene with both DGC and PDE domains that is

highly conserved in the genus *Pseudomonas* and predicted to function primarily as a PDE (Fig.

3) (Eilers, Hoong Yam, et al., 2024; Wei et al., 2019). A representative mutant showed

intermediate levels of both biofilm production and motility, leading us to name this gene *bmo* for

its role in balancing both biofilm and motility. We predict that our model selects for *bmo* mutants

because they act as biofilm generalists that have improved attachment and biofilm formation

compared to their ancestor, while also maintaining the ability to disperse from the old bead to

recolonize the new bead. Characterization of multiple biofilm-associated phenotypes supports

this hypothesis. Compared to the ancestor and the hyper-biofilm *wspF* mutant, *bmo* has

intermediate motility, cyclic di-GMP, and overall biofilm attachment phenotypes, whereas its

cellular attachment to the bead is as high as *wspF* (Fig. 5). Moreover, *bmo* biofilm phenotypes

are nearly identical to the LPS mutant *fuzY*, although *bmo* has somewhat improved motility,

attachment, and overall biofilm formation, along with significantly greater cyclic di-GMP levels. It

is also notable that *bmo* mutants appear to be selected more frequently in media containing

triclosan, suggesting the stress imposed by this compound interacts with the *bmo* regulatory

pathway that remains to be defined.

P. aeruginosa bmo homologs have been shown to influence biofilm formation and
regulate basal levels of cyclic di-GMP. A deletion mutant of the *P. aeruginosa* PA14 homolog
(PA14_03720) had reduced swimming motility and increased twitching motility in comparison to
wild-type PA14 (Ha et al., 2014). Deletion mutants of the *P. aeruginosa* PAO1 homolog
(PA0285, *pipA*) have increased biofilm formation, aggregation, Psl production, and cyclic di-
GMP production, and decreased swimming motility (Cai et al., 2022; Eilers et al., 2022; Wei et
al., 2019). A recent study that compared deletion mutants of *bmo* homologs in *P. aeruginosa*
strains PA01, PAK, and PA14, and *P. putida* strain KT2440 found that these mutants had
increased early attachment (at 4, 6, and 8 hours) in comparison to their wild-type counterparts
and that the magnitude of these differences depended on strain background (Eilers, Hoong
Yam, et al., 2024). Among the 22 unique mutants detected by deep sequencing populations
evolved in the bead biofilm model, most are predicted to (1) cause loss-of-function by
introducing premature stop codons or (2) negatively affect PDE function or PAS domain
signaling through nonsynonymous SNPs (Sup. Table 1). We predict these mutants resemble
the representative mutant clone we studied (Fig. 5) by having a higher basal level of cyclic di-
GMP that improves their attachment to the bead surface and biofilm formation.
546
Phenotypic differentiation among mutants reflects niche differentiation that enables
coexistence
The spectrum of biofilm phenotypes arising in these experiments suggests that they
exploit different ecological conditions, which could explain both their rapid emergence and
subsequent coexistence. This model was well supported by confocal microscopy of biofilms
produced by individual mutants and mixed pairs (Fig. 6, Fig. S3) but these measurements were
on glass rather than polystyrene and did not allow mutants to reach equilibrium frequencies.
Therefore, we mixed representative mutants of each morphology and tracked their frequencies
over a week of passage. The *bmo* mutant and the ancestor appeared to compete as their
intermediate frequencies oscillated, whereas *wspF* and *fuzY* mutants rapidly declined but were
maintained at low (~5-10%) frequencies (Fig. 7). The cycling between the *bmo* mutant and the
ancestor can be explained by their occupying overlapping but distinct niches (Brisson, 2018;
Chesson, 2000), whereas the persistence of *wspF* and *fuzY* at lower frequencies suggests they
inhabit more differentiated biofilm niches but are outcompeted by the other genotypes under
most conditions (Fig. 6, Fig. S3, Table 2). These dynamics agreed with the phenotypic

dynamics from the 15-day evolution experiment (Figure 4), in which biofilm-adapted mutants

with distinct wrinkly and fuzzy colony morphologies rapidly arose and persisted at low

frequencies while ancestral colony morphologies consistent with persistence of the ancestor

and biofilm-adapted *bmo* mutants predominated. These overall interactions conform to a model

known as multi-niche selection (Levins, 1963), which requires that each species has a selective

advantage in some habitats while others are superior in other habitats, with areas of niche

overlap. We suggest that the repeated emergence and maintenance of genotypes with

differentiated niches within the biofilm life cycle provides a clear example of how variable

environments can favor balanced polymorphisms (Martin et al., 2016; Poltak & Cooper, 2011).

Given the ubiquity of microbial biofilms undergoing regular cycles of attachment, aggregation,

dispersal, and reattachment, we can expect genetic and phenotypic heterogeneity like that

shown here to be widespread. This diversity may therefore be expected in biofilms produced by

natural populations of *P. fluorescens* in and around plants or in those produced by its relative *P.*

aeruginosa in the built environment or when establishing opportunistic infections.

Building a community of learners studying biofilm evolution who understand its

biomedical relevance

We began the EvolvingSTEM project in 2013 with the aim of teaching evolution and

genetics in high school classrooms through an authentic bacterial evolution experiment. Our

rationale was that the predominant way of teaching natural selection through passive, historical

examples of speciation would be less effective than the experience of seeing evolution in action

in student-led experiments. We showed that high school students achieved greater learning of

content meeting Next Generation Science Standards (States, 2013) in a prior study (Cooper et

al., 2019). But this work also held promise for expanding our understanding of mechanisms of

biofilm adaptation, given the increasing speed and economy of genotyping mutants by whole-

genome sequencing. As we collected these mutants and identified their genetic causes, we

added these discoveries into our curriculum materials and emphasized how these mutants

reinforced and extended our understanding of how *P. fluorescens* and its pathogenic relative *P.*

aeruginosa adapt when biofilm formation is advantageous. Mutations in the *wsp* cluster, in

yfiBNR, and in *morA* are commonly recovered in infections caused by *P. aeruginosa* (Gloag et

al., 2019; Malone et al., 2010; Marvig et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2006), and their recovery here

indicates their centrality to this lifestyle switch. In addition, our discovery of mutants in *fuzY* adds

to evidence that LPS alterations enhance aggregation and potentially alter susceptibility to

bacteriophage (Ferguson et al., 2013), and mutants in the *dsb* pathway and *bmo* highlight less

understood genetic pathways to biofilm production that warrant more research into how

Pseudomonas senses surfaces and initiates attachment.

The experience of offering this curriculum in subsequent years at more than 30 middle

and high schools suggests broader and potentially more potent benefits, including improved

student attitudes towards science and technology and greater student confidence as science

learners, which we have and will report elsewhere (Quigley et al., 2025). One reason that

students may begin to see themselves as scientists is the peer reinforcement from collaborating

in small groups to conduct the experiments and as an entire class to discuss their findings.

Likewise, often multiple classes per school participate in EvolvingSTEM, and within Pittsburgh

Public Schools, twelve different schools conducted these experiments in 2024. This article

synthesizes their discoveries and we hope encourages greater sharing of student discoveries

among more than 2500 students annually who learn about the medical and natural relevance of

microbial biofilms from our curriculum. They complete their experiments knowing that the

mutants they identify may contribute to a greater understanding of how bacteria evolve in

biofilms and ultimately how to manage these evolving communities.

MATERIALS & METHODS

School bacterial growth conditions

Students cultured *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain SBW25, a plant-colonizing bacteria that was isolated in 1989 from the leaf surface of a sugar beet plant grown at the University Farm (Whytham, Oxford, UK) (Bailey & Thompson 1992; Rainey & Bailey 1996 Molecular Microbio). Students cultured bacteria in test tubes that contained 5mL of Queen's B growth media (Cooper et al. 2019, 20g Proteose Peptone No. 3, 1.5g Potassium Phosphate Dibasic, 25mL Glycerol, and 6mL 1M Magnesium Sulfate per liter) and a polystyrene bead and plated their bead-attached bacterial populations on Half-Strength Tsoy-Agar plates (15g Tsoy and 15g Agar per liter) at the beginning and end of the experiment. In addition, 25µg/mL of the broad-spectrum antimicrobial triclosan was added to the media and agar plates used in the experiments at SciTech and Allderdice to inhibit bacterial and fungal contamination. *Pseudomonas* species are naturally resistant to triclosan, and this concentration was chosen because it is used in *Pseudomonas* isolation agar (e.g., Cat# 17208 Pseudomonas Isolation Agar from Millipore Sigma).

WHS students grew *P. fluorescens* cultures for 13 days at 28 °C on a roller drum under biofilm selection conditions, which included 7 bead transfers. SciTech and Allderdice students grew cultures for 4 days on an orbital shaker at 150rpm under biofilm selection conditions, which included 3 bead transfers. SciTech students grew their cultures at 28 °C, while Allderdice students grew their cultures at room temperature because they did not have an available incubator.

Genome sequencing and identification of mutants

Clones were selected from the final plating day of the EvolvingSTEM classroom experiment and grown overnight in 5mL QB media. DNA was extracted from 1mL of the overnight culture with the DNeasy Blood and Tissue Kit (Qiagen). Illumina whole-genome sequencing was performed by our laboratory to a minimum depth of 40x coverage on an Illumina NextSeq500 using the methods described in Baym et al. 2015. Trimmomatic (Bolger et al. 2014) was used to remove sequence adaptors, along with low-quality sequence fragments. We identified mutations by comparing evolved clones to the published genome of *P. fluorescens*

SBW25 (NCBI Reference Sequence: NC_012660) using breseq (Deatherage and Barrick

2014). All sequencing data are available at NCBI Bioproject PRJNA1284392.

The ancestral *P. fluorescens* SBW25 populations all exhibited a smooth colony

morphology phenotype. In comparison to the published genome sequence, the ancestor used

by all student populations had three intergenic mutations present in their ancestral populations:

(1) +G at position 45,881; (2) +C at position 985,333; and (3) $C_{5 \to 3}$ at position 3,447,984. The

ancestor used by WHS in 2015 also had a 129bp deletion at position 360,368 and an 132bp

deletion at position 6,223,020.

Experimental evolution and longitudinal whole-population sequencing

Populations were initiated with a single *P. fluorescens* SBW25 ancestral clone and

evolved for 15 days (14 transfers) in 2mL Queen's B growth medium at 28°C on an orbital

shaker at 150rpm. Four replicate lineages were propagated under two biofilm conditions: biofilm

selection + 25µg/mL triclosan and biofilm selection without triclosan. Biofilm lineages were

propagated using four beads each (following the methods of (Santos-Lopez et al., 2019;

Scribner et al., 2020). After 24 hours growth, one bead was transferred to a new test tube with

three new beads.

To perform whole-population sequencing, we collected bead-attached bacteria on days

3 and 15 by transferring two beads from each population to a tube with 1.2mL PBS, which was

vortexed for 2 minutes to release bacteria from the beads. 500uL was immediately centrifuged

for 10 minutes at 14,000rpm, the supernatant was removed, and pellets were stored at -20C for

DNA extraction. Sequencing libraries were prepared to a minimum read depth of 150x coverage

and analyzed as above with the additional "-p" polymorphism flag in breseq to characterize all

reliable mutations at intermediate frequencies in these populations.

Motility Assays

Assays were performed as described in Filloux and Ramos (2014). Images were

analyzed with FIJI (Schindelin et al., 2012). For swarming motility, we grew 6-hour cultures in

LB-Lennox Broth (10g Tryptone, 5g Yeast Extract, 5g NaCl per L) at 28°C, 150rpm, then

inoculated Swarming Motility Agar Plates (0.6% agar, 1x M8 solution, 0.2% glucose, 0.5%

casamino acids, 1mM $MgSO_4$) with 2.5µL culture pipetted onto the center of the plate, at the

surface of the agar. Plates were incubated upright at room temperature (~22°C) for 16-24 hours

and photographed. For swimming motility, we grew 6-hour cultures of *P. fluorescens* in LB-

Lennox Broth at 28C, 150rpm, transferred 100μL to a 1.5mL microcentrifuge tube, dipped a

200uL pipette tip into the culture and used this to stab into the center of Swimming Motility Agar

Plates (same recipe as Swarming Motility Plates, but with 0.3% agar). Plates were incubated

upright at room temperature (~22°C) for 16-24 hours and photographed. For twitching motility,

we stabbed a match-head sized inoculum from a 2-day old streak plate into the center of an LB-

Lennox Agar Plate (10g Tryptone, 5g Yeast Extract, 5g NaCl, 10g Agar, 0.5g Tetrazolium Red,

per L) all the way down to the plastic. Plates were inverted and stored in stacks of 3 or less in a

plastic box lined with wet paper towels at 28°C with box lid slightly ajar for 24 hours and

photographed.

Biofilm assays

Our biofilm assay is based on the bead model developed by our lab for studying biofilm

formation and evolution. Bacterial cultures were inoculated in triplicate in 2 mL of Queen's B

media and two plastic beads (Cospheric, Polystyrene Spheres, 7.00mm +/- 0.025mm) and

grown overnight at 150 rpm on an orbital shaker at 28°C. Each culture was sonicated for 10

seconds at 30% amplitude and used to inoculate two new cultures at a 1:100 dilution in QB both

with and without 30 μg/mL triclosan and two polystyrene beads. Cultures were then grown for

24 hours on an orbital shaker at 28°C, 150 rpm, serial diluted, and plated. Biofilm formation was

quantified by transferring one of the two beads to a single well of a 24-well plate with 1.5mL of

an 0.1% crystal violet solution and incubated at room temperature for 15 minutes. The bead was

then washed three times in water for one minute each time to remove excess crystal violet.

Biofilm-bound crystal violet was then solubilized by vortexing the bead for 2 minutes in a 2mL

tube filled with 1mL solubilization solution: 95% ethanol, 4.95% water, 0.05% Triton X-100. The

concentration of crystal violet was measured at an absorbance wavelength of 590 nm (OD590).

Total colony forming units per bead were determined by serial diluting and plating bacteria

attached to the second bead. We adopted this method to (1) more accurately represent the

conditions in which we grow biofilms in our experiments and (2) allow us to differentiate

between total biofilm production and bacterial attachment to the bead. As an indicator of EPS

production, we plated mutants on half-strength T-Soy Agar plates (15g Tsoy, 15g Agar, 0.02g

Congo Red, 0.0075g Brilliant Blue per liter) and visually assessed dye uptake, where dark red

colonies indicate EPS overproduction.

Intracellular cyclic di-GMP Assay

The *P. fluorescens* ancestor and biofilm-adapted mutants were transformed with the

cyclic di-GMP reporter plasmid, pCdrA-gfpC (Addgene plasmid #111614) (Rybtke et al., 2012).

The reporter transcriptionally fuses the *P. aeruginosa* PA01 *cdrA* promoter, which is responsive

to cyclic di-GMP, to genes encoding green fluorescent protein. Starter cultures of each

transformed *P. fluorescens* genotype and an untransformed ancestor control were grown in their

own cultures of 2 mL of Queen's B media at 28°C on an orbital shaker at 150 rpm for 24 hours.

Following this, experimental cultures containing 4 mL of Queen's B media were inoculated with

10 μL of a given starter culture and incubated at 28°C on an orbital shaker at 180 rpm for 24

hours. After incubation, a 100 μL sample of each experimental culture was used to capture

fluorescence intensity and OD_{600}. Cyclic di-GMP levels at 24 hours were calculated by

$\ln(RFI)/\ln(ROD_{600})$, where RFI is relative fluorescence intensity (the ratio of absolute

fluorescence intensity of experimental to control culture), and ROD_{600} is relative optical density

(the ratio of absolute optical density at a wavelength of 600 nm of a bacterial culture to fresh

media).

Construction of fluorescently tagged *P. fluorescens* strains

A single colony of *P. fluorescens* was inoculated into 5 ml QB and grown overnight to stationary

phase. One mL of culture was pelleted by centrifugation and washed twice with 300 mM

sucrose. After resuspending the pellet in 100 uL of 300 mM sucrose, 5 uL pTNS3 and 5 uL of

the desired pBT plasmid (Table S3) were added and the suspension was incubated at room

temperature for 5 minutes. The suspension was then transferred to an electroporation cuvette (2

mm gap) and pulsed at 2.5 kV. Cells were recovered in 1 mL LB and transformants were

selected on LB agar + 30 ug/mL gentamicin at 28°C.

Confocal microscopy

P. fluorescens strains expressing eGFP or mCherry were pre-cultured for 24 hours in

glass-bottom plates containing 2 mL of Queen's B media and shaken on an orbital shaker at a

speed of 125 rpm. Biofilms generated by *P. fluorescens* were expected to attach to the surface

of the glass. After pre-culture, the old media in the plates were removed by pipetting, and the biofilms were washed twice with 1 mL of PBS to remove excess planktonic bacterial cells. Following the washing step, 1 mL of fresh PBS was added to each glass-bottom plate to maintain the survival and limit the growth of bacterial cells within the biofilm. Images were captured at 400× magnification in both eGFP and mCherry channels on an Olympus FV-1000 confocal microscope. Z-stack images spanned from the bottom to the top of the biofilms. Image processing was conducted using ImageJ (Schindelin et al., 2012) and BiofilmQ (Hartmann et al., 2021).

Multi-genotype competition assay

We created mixed populations of bacteria by combining a representative mutant of *bmo* (PFLU0185) (with a single nucleotide insertion resulting in a premature stop codon truncating both the DGC and PDE domains), wrinkly (*wspF* Q185*) and fuzzy (*fuzY* Q11*) mutants, along with a lac-marked *P. fluorescens* SBW25 ancestor. All four clones were used to inoculate cultures containing 2mL QB and 2 beads and grown overnight at 28°C on an orbital shaker at 150rpm. Both beads were then transferred to 1.5mL QB in small glass tubes and vortexed for 2 minutes and this mixture was used to make freezer stocks. Bacteria from a portion of one freezer stock was diluted in QB and 50uL of this dilution was transferred to 6 replicate populations containing 2mL QB and 4 beads. Starting frequencies of each mutant and ancestor were determined by diluting a spread-plating from each starting culture. Populations were then evolved for 4 days (3 transfers) in 2mL Queen's B growth medium at 28°C on an orbital shaker at 150rpm. Every 24 hours, one bead was transferred to a new test tube with three new beads and all newly colonized beads were vortexed for 2 minutes, diluted, and spread-plated to count changes in colony phenotypes over time.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Tyler McAloon and Erin Nawrocki for technical support. We appreciate the commitment of dozens of teachers and thousands of students to implement this curriculum, isolate these mutants, and inspire this research. This work was supported by SEPA R25AI180989 from the NIH, by BIORETS DBI-2147075 from the NSF, and by the Dean's office from the University of Pittsburgh, School of Medicine.

772 **Table 1.** Genotypes of *P. fluorescens* mutants determined by WGS that were isolated based on
773 colony phenotype by students in different schools (ST, WHS, A, or Lab = our research lab).
774 *denotes presence of secondary mutations, see Table S2 for details. #denotes representative
775 mutant used in phenotypic studies
776

School (count)	Phenotype	Position (nt)	Mutation	Annotation	Gene
ST#	smooth	210,961	+T	coding (565/1989 nt)	*PFLU0185 (bmo)*
ST	smooth	211,021	C→T	Q209* (C<u>A</u>G→<u>T</u>AG)	*PFLU0185 (bmo)*
ST*	smooth	211,277	+A	coding (881/1989 nt)	*PFLU0185 (bmo)*
ST	smooth	212,132	Δ210 bp	coding (1736-1945/1989 nt)	*PFLU0185 (bmo)*
ST / WHS*	wrinkly	1,353,115	Δ84 bp	coding (846-929/1623 nt)	*PFLU1219 (wspA)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,353,408	T→C	V380A(GTG→GCG)	*PFLU1219 (wspA)*
ST / WHS (2)	wrinkly	1,353,411	C→T	A381V (GC<u>C</u>→G<u>T</u>C)	*PFLU1219 (wspA)*
ST	wrinkly	1,355,373	Δ335 bp	fusion of 2 predicted ORFs	*[PFLU1221(wspC)] –[PFLU1222(wspD)]*
WHS	wrinkly	1,358,709	G→C	A32P (G<u>C</u>C→<u>C</u>CC)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (3)*	wrinkly	1,358,766	Δ15bp	coding(151-165/1011nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (3)	wrinkly	1,358,780	(CTGATGG ACCTGATC)$_{1\rightarrow2}$	coding (165/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,358,846	Δ18bp	coding(231-248/1011nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,358,893	Δ27 bp	coding (278-304/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (3)	wrinkly	1,358,989	+A	coding (374/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,085	G→T	G157V (G<u>G</u>C→G<u>T</u>C)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
ST# / WHS (2)*	wrinkly	1,359,168	C→T	Q185* (C<u>A</u>G→<u>T</u>AG)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,234	+G	coding (619/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,292	Δ150bp	coding (677-826/1011nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,330	G→C	A239P (G<u>C</u>C→<u>C</u>CC)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (6)	wrinkly	1,359,364	G→C	R250P (C<u>G</u>G→C<u>C</u>G)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS*	wrinkly	1,359,370	C→T	S252L (T<u>C</u>G→T<u>T</u>G)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
ST	wrinkly	1,359,446	Δ1 bp	coding (831/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (2)	wrinkly	1,359,495	A→C	T294P (<u>A</u>CC→<u>C</u>CC)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS (3)	wrinkly	1,359,538	C→T	P308L(C<u>C</u>C→C<u>T</u>C)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,552	(GCG)$_{4\rightarrow3}$	coding (937-939/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*
WHS	wrinkly	1,359,554	(GCG)$_{4\rightarrow5}$	coding (939/1011 nt)	*PFLU1224 (wspF)*

ST (3)	small	4,830,895	(GCAGGC)$_{2\rightarrow1}$	coding (8-13/1323 nt)	*PFLU4380 (dsbS)*
ST	small	4,834,252	Δ110 bp	fusion of 2 predicted ORFS	*[PFLU4383]– [PFLU4384 (dsbG)]*
ST	wrinkly	5,707,197	G→A	Q157* (CAA→TAA)	*PFLU5211 (awsX/YfiR)*
ST	wrinkly	5,707,256	A→C	I137S (ATC→AGC)	*PFLU5211 (awsX/YfiR)*
WHS*	wrinkly	5,707,317	Δ33bp	coding (317-349/573nt)	*PFLU5211 (awsX/YfiR)*
WHS	wrinkly	5,707,334	G→T	A111E (GCG→GAG)	*PFLU5211 (awsX/YfiR)*
ST/WHS (5)*	wrinkly	5,707,411	Δ33 bp	coding (223-255/573 nt)	*PFLU5211 (awsX/YfiR)*
ST (2)	wrinkly	5,857,638	G→A	M992I (ATG→ATA)	*PFLU5329 (mwsR/morA)*
ST (3)	wrinkly	5,857,733	Δ9 bp	coding (3071-3079/3852 nt)	*PFLU5329 (mwsR/morA)*
A (3)*	wrinkly	5,858,369	C→T	A1236V (GCC→GTC)	*PFLU5329 (mwsR/morA)*
Lab#	fuzzy	541,214	C→T	Q11* (CAG→TAG)	*PFLU0478 (fuzY)*
Lab	fuzzy	541,772	Δ13 bp	coding (589-601/1149 nt)	*PFLU0478 (fuzY)*

778   **Table 2**. Linear regressions of frequencies of *bmo* (PFLU0185) between the ancestor (Afreq),

779   *wsp* mutant (Wfreq), and *fzy* mutant (Ffreq), as shown in Figure S4. The significant negative

780   slopes indicate competition.

Model Equation	Std. Error	t value	R-squared	p-value
Pfreq = (-0.99)Afreq + 0.91	0.07	-14.69	0.79	<0.0001
Pfreq = (-0.7)Wfreq + 0.46	0.32	-2.22	0.08	<0.05
Pfreq = (-1.84)Ffreq + 0.48	0.58	-3.14	0.15	<0.001

786   **Table S1.** Complete details of mutant genotypes, including secondary mutations (XLS).

788   **Table S2**. Details of mutations detected during the evolution experiment using population-wide

789   whole-genome sequencing (XLS)

791   **Table S3.** Plasmids used in this study

Name	Plasmid	Source/Reference
pTNS3	Helper plasmid for site-specific Tn7 transposition	Choi et al. (Choi et al., 2008)
pBT270	pUC18-mini-Tn7T2-PA1/04/03-Gm-GFP	Zhao et al. (Zhao et al., 2013)
pBT277	pUC18-mini-Tn7T2-PA1/04/03-Gm-mCherry	Zhao et al. (Zhao et al., 2013)

FIGURE LEGENDS

       Fig. 1. Biofilm growth patterns and colony morphologies of *P. fluorescens* SBW25

and evolved biofilm-adapted mutants. Evolved populations often have a distinct ring of

biofilm at the air-liquid interface (A). The *P. fluorescens* ancestor (lac+) has blue, smooth-edged

circular colonies (pink circle), the *bmo* (PFLU0185) mutant has yellow, smooth-edged circular

colonies (orange circle), the *fuzY* mutant has large, yellow, irregular colonies (yellow circle), and

the *wspF* mutant has small, white, irregular colonies (purple circle) (B). Small colony variants

(green circle) can be distinguished from their ancestor (pink circle) by their significantly smaller

size (B).

Fig. 2. Wrinkly colony phenotypes are caused by mutations in the *wsp*, *yfiBNR*,

and *morA* pathways. Mutations are shown as black bars below the gene diagrams. When

multiple independent mutations occurred, their counts are in parentheses. Mutations in *wspF*

(31 in total) are too numerous to display. DGC domains are indicated with diagonal hatching;

PDE domains are indicated with cross hatching. Genome positions of the beginning and end of

each operon/gene are indicated above the gene diagrams. Table 1 and Table S1 contain a

complete list of mutations. All mutations are predicted to cause constitutive activation of a DGC,

increasing cyclic di-GMP synthesis.

Fig. 3. Biofilm adaptations caused by mutations in LPS, disulfide bond formation,

and a novel regulator of cyclic-di-GMP. Mutations are shown as black bars below the gene

diagrams. When multiple independent mutations occurred, their counts are in parentheses.

DGC domains are indicated with diagonal hatching; PDE domains are indicated with cross

hatching. Genome positions of the beginning and end of each operon/gene are indicated above

the gene diagrams. Mutations in *bmo* (PFLU0185) are predicted to increase basal levels of

cyclic di-GMP (A). Mutations in *fuzY* are predicted to modify LPS O-antigens (B). Mutations in

dsb genes are predicted to cause misfolded periplasmic proteins. Table 1 and Table S1 provide

mutation details.

Fig. 4. Dynamics of evolved phenotypes and genotypes during 15 days of

experimental biofilm selection. Populations were grown for 15 days in QB media with or

without triclosan with four plastic beads and passaged every 24 hours by transferring one bead

into fresh media with three new beads. Bead-attached populations were plated on days 4, 8, 11,

and 15 and contained colonies with fuzzy, small, smooth, and wrinkly phenotypes (A). Whole-

genome, whole-population sequencing was performed on days 3 and 15. Points include the

cumulative frequency of mutations identified in each gene (B). A complete list of mutations can

be found in Supplemental Table 1.

Fig. 5. Biofilm-related phenotypes of *P. fluorescens* mutants. Swarming motility (A)

and swimming motility (B) show reduced levels compared to the ancestor. Biofilm production

measured by attached colony forming units (C) and by crystal violet absorbance at 590nm (D).

Points are the average of three measurements recorded for each replicate. Results in QB media

are similar but more pronounced with the addition of triclosan. Relative cyclic di-GMP production

from a fluorescent reporter (E) is reported as ln(RFI)/ln(ROD600), where RFI is relative

fluorescence intensity and ROD600 is relative optical density. In all panels, mean values are

indicated by diamonds, and outliers are indicated by an open circle. Statistical comparisons

were conducted by one-way ANOVA with a Games-Howell post hoc test with p = 0.05, with

letters at the top of each panel indicating statistically distinct groupings.

Fig. 6. Confocal microscopy of representative *P. fluorescens* mutants shows

differentiated biofilm phenotypes.. Ancestor (a), *fuzY* (c) and *wspF* (d) are tagged with eGFP

and *bmo* (b) is tagged with mCherry. Both Ancestor and *bmo* exhibit uniform biofilm structure.

The *fuzY* biofilm is composed of many aggregates. The *wspF* biofilm was in small clusters and

was not spatially contiguous on the glass surface, but generated large aggregates in liquid

media that were more likely to attach on plastic surfaces (not shown). Mixtures of these mutants

were also imaged and are reported in Fig S3.

Fig. 7. Ecological dynamics of constructed communities indicate multi-niche

selection. Six populations containing equal volumes of representative, biofilm-adapted loss-of-

function mutants in *bmo* (PFLU0185), *fuzY*, and *wspF* were propagated in the biofilm bead

model and plated daily to assess frequencies. All mutants persisted, with *fuzY* and *wspF*

declining rapidly in frequency and *bmo* and the ancestor fluctuating at intermediate frequencies

and opposite trajectories.

Fig. S1. *Pseudomonas fluorescens* **lacks twitching motility**. Twitching motility was

measured on LB-Lennox Agar Plates after 24 hours of growth. PA01 (A) exhibits a twitching

phenotype, indicated by the halo surrounding the dark red colony in the center of the plate

where inoculation occurred. *P. fluorescens* ancestor (B), *pflu0185* mutants (C), *fuzY* mutants

(D), and *wspF* mutants (E) show no signs of twitching motility as all four genotypes lack a halo

surrounding the inoculation point.

Fig. S2. Planktonic growth is inhibited by triclosan.

876
877

878   **Fig. S3. Confocal microscopy of representative *P. fluorescens* mutants mixed in**
879 **pairs shows differentiated biofilm phenotypes**. Methods replicate those of Fig 6. Text color
880 of labels indicates fluorescent marker in that genotype; red = mCherry, green = eGFP.

881
882

883 **Fig. S4. Linear regressions of *bmo* frequencies, as compared to ancestor (A),**
884 ***wspF* (B), and *fuzY* (C).**

885
886

Fig. S5. Colony morphology of small colony variants with mutations in *dsb* genes

and their differential uptake of Congo Red dye.

PFLU4380 &
PFLU4383-dsbG
(PFLU4384)

SciTech19

SciTech20

4 SCVs from evolved bead populations
1. SciTech 2019 10: $(GCAGGC)_{2\rightarrow1}$ coding (8-13)
2. SciTech 2019 16: $(GCAGGC)_{2\rightarrow1}$ coding (8-13)
3. SciTech 2019 19: $(GCAGGC)_{2\rightarrow1}$ coding (8-13)
4. SciTech 2019 20: **Δ**110bp

two-component sensor histidine kinase CDS

response regulator CDS

protein-disulfide reductase DsbD CDS

His Kinase A (phospho-acceptor) domain   two-component sensor kinase, N-terminal

Hist kinase/HSP90-like ATPase

Prolipoprotein diacylglyceryl transferase

protein-disulfide reductase DsbD CDS

Redoxin

Thioredoxin-like fold domain

thiol:disulfide interchange protein DsbG CDS

TlpA family protein disulfide reductase CDS

REFERENCES

Bader, M. W., Xie, T., Yu, C.-A., & Bardwell, J. C. A. (2000). Disulfide Bonds Are Generated by

Quinone Reduction *. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, *275*(34), 26082–26088.

https://doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M003850200

Bantinaki, E., Kassen, R., Knight, C. G., Robinson, Z., Spiers, A. J., & Rainey, P. B. (2007).

Adaptive Divergence in Experimental Populations of Pseudomonas fluorescens. III.

Mutational Origins of Wrinkly Spreader Diversity. *Genetics*, *176*(1), 441–453.

https://doi.org/10.1534/genetics.106.069906

Bardwell, J. C. A., McGovern, K., & Beckwith, J. (1991). Identification of a protein required for

disulfide bond formation in vivo. *Cell*, *67*(3), 581–589. https://doi.org/10.1016/0092-

8674(91)90532-4

Bardwell, J. C., Lee, J. O., Jander, G., Martin, N., Belin, D., & Beckwith, J. (1993). A pathway for

disulfide bond formation in vivo. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*,

90(3), 1038–1042. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.90.3.1038

Berkmen, M., Boyd, D., & Beckwith, J. (2005). The Nonconsecutive Disulfide Bond of

Escherichia coli Phytase (AppA) Renders It Dependent on the Protein-disulfide

Isomerase, DsbC *. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, *280*(12), 11387–11394.

https://doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M411774200

Brisson, D. (2018). Negative Frequency-Dependent Selection Is Frequently Confounding.

Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution, *6*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fevo.2018.00010

Cai, Y.-M., Yu, K.-W., Liu, J.-H., Cai, Z., Zhou, Z.-H., Liu, Y., Wang, T.-F., & Yang, L. (2022).

The c-di-GMP Phosphodiesterase PipA (PA0285) Regulates Autoaggregation and Pf4

Bacteriophage Production in Pseudomonas aeruginosa PAO1. *Applied and*

Environmental Microbiology, *88*(12), e00039-22. https://doi.org/10.1128/aem.00039-22

Caplat, P., Anand, M., & Bauch, C. (2008). Symmetric competition causes population

oscillations in an individual-based model of forest dynamics. *Ecological Modelling*,

211(3), 491–500. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.10.002

Chesson, P. (2000). Mechanisms of Maintenance of Species Diversity. *Annual Review of*

Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics, *31*(Volume 31, 2000), 343–366.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.31.1.343

Choi, K.-H., Mima, T., Casart, Y., Rholl, D., Kumar, A., Beacham, I. R., & Schweizer, H. P.

(2008). Genetic Tools for Select-Agent-Compliant Manipulation of Burkholderia

pseudomallei. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, *74*(4), 1064–1075.

https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02430-07

Cooper, V. S., Staples, R. K., Traverse, C. C., & Ellis, C. N. (2014). Parallel evolution of small

colony variants in Burkholderia cenocepacia biofilms. *Genomics*, *104*(6, Part A), 447–

452. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygeno.2014.09.007

Cooper, V. S., Warren, T. M., Matela, A. M., Handwork, M., & Scarponi, S. (2019).

EvolvingSTEM: A microbial evolution-in-action curriculum that enhances learning of

evolutionary biology and biotechnology. *Evolution: Education and Outreach*, *12*(1), 12.

https://doi.org/10.1186/s12052-019-0103-4

Eilers, K., Hoong Yam, J. K., Liu, X., Goh, Y. F., To, K.-N., Paracuellos, P., Morton, R., Brizuela,

J., Hui Yong, A. M., Givskov, M., Freibert, S.-A., Bange, G., Rice, S. A., Steinchen, W., &

Filloux, A. (2024). The dual GGDEF/EAL domain enzyme PA0285 is a *Pseudomonas*

species housekeeping phosphodiesterase regulating early attachment and biofilm

architecture. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, *300*(2), 105659.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbc.2024.105659

Eilers, K., Kuok Hoong Yam, J., Morton, R., Mei Hui Yong, A., Brizuela, J., Hadjicharalambous,
C., Liu, X., Givskov, M., Rice, S. A., & Filloux, A. (2022). Phenotypic and integrated
analysis of a comprehensive Pseudomonas aeruginosa PAO1 library of mutants lacking
cyclic-di-GMP-related genes. *Frontiers in Microbiology, 13*.
https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2022.949597

Eilers, K., Yam, J. K. H., Liu, X., Goh, Y. F., To, K.-N., Paracuellos, P., Morton, R., Brizuela, J.,
Yong, A. M. H., Givskov, M., Freibert, S.-A., Bange, G., Rice, S. A., Steinchen, W., &
Filloux, A. (2024). The dual GGDEF/EAL domain enzyme PA0285 is a Pseudomonas
species housekeeping phosphodiesterase regulating early attachment and biofilm
architecture. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, *300*(2).
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbc.2024.105659

Ellis, C. N., Traverse, C. C., Mayo-Smith, L., Buskirk, S. W., & Cooper, V. S. (2015). Character
displacement and the evolution of niche complementarity in a model biofilm community.
Evolution; International Journal of Organic Evolution, *69*(2), 283–293.
https://doi.org/10.1111/evo.12581

Ferguson, G. C., Bertels, F., & Rainey, P. B. (2013). Adaptive Divergence in Experimental
Populations of Pseudomonas fluorescens. V. Insight into the Niche Specialist Fuzzy
Spreader Compels Revision of the Model Pseudomonas Radiation. *Genetics*, *195*(4),
1319–1335. https://doi.org/10.1534/genetics.113.154948

Flemming, H.-C., & Wuertz, S. (2019). Bacteria and archaea on Earth and their abundance in
biofilms. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, *17*(4), 247–260. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41579-
019-0158-9

Flynn, K. M., Dowell, G., Johnson, T. M., Koestler, B. J., Waters, C. M., & Cooper, V. S. (2016).
Evolution of Ecological Diversity in Biofilms of Pseudomonas aeruginosa by Altered

Cyclic Diguanylate Signaling. *Journal of Bacteriology*, *198*(19), 2608–2618.

https://doi.org/10.1128/JB.00048-16

Gloag, E. S., Marshall, C. W., Snyder, D., Lewin, G. R., Harris, J. S., Santos-Lopez, A., Chaney,

S. B., Whiteley, M., Cooper, V. S., & Wozniak, D. J. (2019). <span class="named-

content genus-species" id="named-content-1">Pseudomonas aeruginosa

Interstrain Dynamics and Selection of Hyperbiofilm Mutants during a Chronic Infection.

mBio, *10*(4), e01698-19. https://doi.org/10.1128/mBio.01698-19

Ha, D.-G., Richman, M. E., & O'Toole, G. A. (2014). Deletion Mutant Library for Investigation of

Functional Outputs of Cyclic Diguanylate Metabolism in Pseudomonas aeruginosa

PA14. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, *80*(11), 3384–3393.

https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00299-14

Habets, M. G. J. L., Rozen, D. E., Hoekstra, R. F., & de Visser, J. A. G. M. (2006). The effect of

population structure on the adaptive radiation of microbial populations evolving in

spatially structured environments. *Ecology Letters*, *9*(9), 1041–1048.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2006.00955.x

Hall-Stoodley, L., Costerton, J. W., & Stoodley, P. (2004). Bacterial biofilms: From the Natural

environment to infectious diseases. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, *2*(2), 95–108.

https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro821

Harris, K. B., Flynn, K. M., & Cooper, V. S. (2021). Polygenic Adaptation and Clonal

Interference Enable Sustained Diversity in Experimental Pseudomonas aeruginosa

Populations. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*, msab248.

https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msab248

Hartmann, R., Jeckel, H., Jelli, E., Singh, P. K., Vaidya, S., Bayer, M., Rode, D. K. H.,

Vidakovic, L., Díaz-Pascual, F., Fong, J. C. N., Dragoš, A., Lamprecht, O., Thöming, J.

G., Netter, N., Häussler, S., Nadell, C. D., Sourjik, V., Kovács, Á. T., Yildiz, F. H., &

Drescher, K. (2021). Quantitative image analysis of microbial communities with BiofilmQ.

Nature Microbiology, *6*(2), 151–156. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41564-020-00817-4

Henriksen, N. N. S. E., Hansen, M. F., Kiesewalter, H. T., Russel, J., Nesme, J., Foster, K. R.,

Svensson, B., Øregaard, G., Herschend, J., & Burmølle, M. (2022). Biofilm cultivation

facilitates coexistence and adaptive evolution in an industrial bacterial community. *Npj*

Biofilms and Microbiomes, *8*(1), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41522-022-00323-x

Hiniker, A., & Bardwell, J. C. A. (2004). In Vivo Substrate Specificity of Periplasmic Disulfide

Oxidoreductases *. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, *279*(13), 12967–12973.

https://doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M311391200

Jenal, U., Reinders, A., & Lori, C. (2017). Cyclic di-GMP: Second messenger extraordinaire.

Nature Reviews Microbiology, *15*(5), 271–284. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro.2016.190

Kassen, R., & Rainey, P. B. (2004). The Ecology and Genetics of Microbial Diversity. *Annual*

Review of Microbiology, *58*(Volume 58, 2004), 207–231.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.micro.58.030603.123654

Kessler, C., & Kim, W. (2022). Identification of Cyclic-di-GMP-Modulating Protein Residues by

Bidirectionally Evolving a Social Behavior in Pseudomonas fluorescens. *mSystems*, *7*(5),

e00737-22. https://doi.org/10.1128/msystems.00737-22

Kessler, C., Mhatre, E., Cooper, V., & Kim, W. (2021). Evolutionary Divergence of the Wsp

Signal Transduction Systems in Beta- and Gammaproteobacteria. *Applied and*

Environmental Microbiology. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01306-21

Koza, A., Kuśmierska, A., McLaughlin, K., Moshynets, O., & Spiers, A. J. (2017). Adaptive

radiation of Pseudomonas fluorescens SBW25 in experimental microcosms provides an

understanding of the evolutionary ecology and molecular biology of A-L interface biofilm

formation. *FEMS Microbiology Letters*, *364*(12), fnx109.

https://doi.org/10.1093/femsle/fnx109

Lam, J. S., Taylor, V. L., Islam, S. T., Hao, Y., & Kocíncová, D. (2011). Genetic and Functional

Diversity of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Lipopolysaccharide. *Frontiers in Microbiology*, *2*.

https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2011.00118

Lau, P. C. Y., Lindhout, T., Beveridge, T. J., Dutcher, J. R., & Lam, J. S. (2009). Differential

Lipopolysaccharide Core Capping Leads to Quantitative and Correlated Modifications of

Mechanical and Structural Properties in Pseudomonas aeruginosa Biofilms. *Journal of*

Bacteriology, *191*(21), 6618–6631. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.00698-09

Laventie, Benoit-Joseph, J., Urs. (2020). Surface Sensing and Adaptation in Bacteria. *Annual*

Review of Microbiology, *74*(1), 735–760.

Lerouge, I., & Vanderleyden, J. (2002). O-antigen structural variation: Mechanisms and possible

roles in animal/plant–microbe interactions. *FEMS Microbiology Reviews*, *26*(1), 17–47.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6976.2002.tb00597.x

Levins, R. (1963). Theory of Fitness in a Heterogeneous Environment. II. Developmental

Flexibility and Niche Selection. *The American Naturalist*, *97*(893), 75–90.

https://doi.org/10.1086/282258

Li, S., Li, T., Teng, X., Lou, X., Xu, Y., Zhang, Q., & Bartlam, M. (2018). Structural analysis of

activating mutants of YfiB from Pseudomonas aeruginosa PAO1. *Biochemical and*

Biophysical Research Communications, *506*(4), 997–1003.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbrc.2018.10.190

Malone, J. G., Jaeger, T., Manfredi, P., Dötsch, A., Blanka, A., Bos, R., Cornelis, G. R.,

Häussler, S., & Jenal, U. (2012). The YfiBNR Signal Transduction Mechanism Reveals

Novel Targets for the Evolution of Persistent Pseudomonas aeruginosa in Cystic

Fibrosis Airways. *PLOS Pathogens*, *8*(6), e1002760.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1002760

Malone, J. G., Jaeger, T., Spangler, C., Ritz, D., Spang, A., Arrieumerlou, C., Kaever, V., Landmann, R., & Jenal, U. (2010). YfiBNR Mediates Cyclic di-GMP Dependent Small Colony Variant Formation and Persistence in Pseudomonas aeruginosa. *PLOS Pathogens*, *6*(3), e1000804. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1000804

Malone, J. G., Williams, R., Christen, M., Jenal, U., Spiers, A. J., & Rainey, P. B. 2007. (2007). The structure–function relationship of WspR, a Pseudomonas fluorescens response regulator with a GGDEF output domain. *Microbiology*, *153*(4), 980–994. https://doi.org/10.1099/mic.0.2006/002824-0

Manta, B., Boyd, D., & Berkmen, M. (2019). Disulfide Bond Formation in the Periplasm of Escherichia coli. *EcoSal Plus*, *8*(2). https://doi.org/10.1128/ecosalplus.ESP-0012-2018

Martin, M., Hölscher, T., Dragoš, A., Cooper, V. S., & Kovács, Á. T. (2016). Laboratory Evolution of Microbial Interactions in Bacterial Biofilms. *Journal of Bacteriology*, *198*(19), 2564–2571. https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.01018-15

Marvig, R. L., Sommer, L. M., Molin, S., & Johansen, H. K. (2015). Convergent evolution and adaptation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa within patients with cystic fibrosis. *Nature Genetics*, *47*(1), 57–64. https://doi.org/10.1038/ng.3148

McDonald, M. J., Gehrig, S. M., Meintjes, P. L., Zhang, X.-X., & Rainey, P. B. (2009). Adaptive Divergence in Experimental Populations of Pseudomonas fluorescens. IV. Genetic Constraints Guide Evolutionary Trajectories in a Parallel Adaptive Radiation. *Genetics*, *183*(3), 1041–1053. https://doi.org/10.1534/genetics.109.107110

McFarland, A. G., Bertucci, H. K., Littman, E., Shen, J., Huttenhower, C., & Hartmann, E. M. (2021). Triclosan Tolerance Is Driven by a Conserved Mechanism in Diverse

1060   Pseudomonas Species. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*.

1061   https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02924-20

1062 Mhatre, E., Snyder, D. J., Sileo, E., Turner, C. B., Buskirk, S. W., Fernandez, N. L., Neiditch, M.

1063   B., Waters, C. M., & Cooper, V. S. (2020). One gene, multiple ecological strategies: A

1064   biofilm regulator is a capacitor for sustainable diversity. *Proceedings of the National*

1065   *Academy of Sciences*, *117*(35), 21647–21657. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2008540117

1066 Nadell, C. D., Drescher, K., & Foster, K. R. (2016). Spatial structure, cooperation and

1067   competition in biofilms. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, *14*(9), 589–600.

1068   https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro.2016.84

1069 Oakley, J. L., Weiser, R., Powell, L. C., Forton, J., Mahenthiralingam, E., Rye, P. D., Hill, K. E.,

1070   Thomas, D. W., & Pritchard, M. F. (2021). Phenotypic and Genotypic Adaptations in

1071   Pseudomonas aeruginosa Biofilms following Long-Term Exposure to an Alginate

1072   Oligomer Therapy. *mSphere*, *6*(1), 10.1128/msphere.01216-20.

1073   https://doi.org/10.1128/msphere.01216-20

1074 O'Connor, J. R., Kuwada, N. J., Huangyutitham, V., Wiggins, P. A., & Harwood, C. S. (2012).

1075   Surface sensing and lateral subcellular localization of WspA, the receptor in a

1076   chemosensory-like system leading to c-di-GMP production. *Molecular Microbiology*,

1077   *86*(3), 720–729. https://doi.org/10.1111/mmi.12013

1078 O'Neal, L., Baraquet, C., Suo, Z., Dreifus, J. E., Peng, Y., Raivio, T. L., Wozniak, D. J.,

1079   Harwood, C. S., & Parsek, M. R. (2022). The Wsp system of Pseudomonas aeruginosa

1080   links surface sensing and cell envelope stress. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*

1081   *Sciences*, *119*(18), e2117633119. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2117633119

O'Rourke, D., FitzGerald, C. E., Traverse, C. C., & Cooper, V. S. (2015). There and back again:

Consequences of biofilm specialization under selection for dispersal. *Frontiers in*

Genetics, *6*, 18. https://doi.org/10.3389/fgene.2015.00018

O'Toole, G. A., & Kolter, R. (1998). Initiation of biofilm formation in Pseudomonas fluorescens

WCS365 proceeds via multiple, convergent signalling pathways: A genetic analysis.

Molecular Microbiology, *28*(3), 449–461. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-

2958.1998.00797.x

Phippen, C. W., Mikolajek, H., Schlaefli, H. G., Keevil, C. W., Webb, J. S., & Tews, I. (2014).

Formation and dimerization of the phosphodiesterase active site of the Pseudomonas

aeruginosa MorA, a bi-functional c-di-GMP regulator. *FEBS Letters*, *588*(24), 4631–

4636. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.febslet.2014.11.002

Poltak, S. R., & Cooper, V. S. (2011). Ecological succession in long-term experimentally

evolved biofilms produces synergistic communities. *The ISME Journal*, *5*(3), 369–378.

https://doi.org/10.1038/ismej.2010.136

Quigley, C. F., Zhao, Z., Cho, N., Matela, A., Siatkowski, C., Thiagarajan, S., & Cooper, V.

(2025, January). *EvolvingSTEM: Exploring Authentic Research Experiences Effects on*

STEM Occupational Identity Development for Grades 6-12. The Association for Science

Teacher Education (ASTE) Meeting, Long Beach, CA.

Rainey, P. B., & Travisano, M. (1998). Adaptive radiation in a heterogeneous environment.

Nature, *394*(6688), 69–72. https://doi.org/10.1038/27900

Røder, H. L., Sørensen, S. J., & Burmølle, M. (2016). Studying Bacterial Multispecies Biofilms:

Where to Start? *Trends in Microbiology*, *24*(6), 503–513.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2016.02.019

Rybtke, M. T., Borlee, B. R., Murakami, K., Irie, Y., Hentzer, M., Nielsen, T. E., Givskov, M.,

Parsek, M. R., & Tolker-Nielsen, T. (2012). Fluorescence-based reporter for gauging

cyclic di-GMP levels in Pseudomonas aeruginosa. *Applied and Environmental*

Microbiology, *78*(15), 5060–5069. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00414-12

Santos-Lopez, A., Marshall, C. W., Scribner, M. R., Snyder, D. J., & Cooper, V. S. (2019).

Evolutionary pathways to antibiotic resistance are dependent upon environmental

structure and bacterial lifestyle. *eLife*, *8*, e47612. https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.47612

Schindelin, J., Arganda-Carreras, I., Frise, E., Kaynig, V., Longair, M., Pietzsch, T., Preibisch,

S., Rueden, C., Saalfeld, S., Schmid, B., Tinevez, J.-Y., White, D. J., Hartenstein, V.,

Eliceiri, K., Tomancak, P., & Cardona, A. (2012). Fiji: An open-source platform for

biological-image analysis. *Nature Methods*, *9*(7), 676–682.

https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.2019

Schweizer, H. P. (2001). Triclosan: A widely used biocide and its link to antibiotics. *FEMS*

Microbiology Letters, *202*(1), 1–7. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6968.2001.tb10772.x

Scribner, M. R., Santos-Lopez, A., Marshall, C. W., Deitrick, C., & Cooper, V. S. (2020). Parallel

Evolution of Tobramycin Resistance across Species and Environments. *mBio*, *11*(3),

e00932-20. https://doi.org/10.1128/mBio.00932-20

Smith, E. E., Buckley, D. G., Wu, Z., Saenphimmachak, C., Hoffman, L. R., D'Argenio, D. A.,

Miller, S. I., Ramsey, B. W., Speert, D. P., Moskowitz, S. M., Burns, J. L., Kaul, R., &

Olson, M. V. (2006). Genetic adaptation by Pseudomonas aeruginosa to the airways of

cystic fibrosis patients. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *103*(22),

8487–8492. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0602138103

Spiers, A. J. (2014). Getting Wrinkly Spreaders to demonstrate evolution in schools. *Trends in*

Microbiology, *22*(6), 301–303. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2014.03.007

Spiers, A. J., Bohannon, J., Gehrig, S. M., & Rainey, P. B. (2003). Biofilm formation at the air–

liquid interface by the Pseudomonas fluorescens SBW25 wrinkly spreader requires an

acetylated form of cellulose. *Molecular Microbiology*, *50*(1), 15–27.

https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2958.2003.03670.x

Spiers, A. J., Kahn, S. G., Bohannon, J., Travisano, M., & Rainey, P. B. (2002). Adaptive

Divergence in Experimental Populations of Pseudomonas fluorescens. I. Genetic and

Phenotypic Bases of Wrinkly Spreader Fitness. *Genetics*, *161*(1), 33–46.

https://doi.org/10.1093/genetics/161.1.33

States, N. L. (2013). *Next Generation Science Standards: For States, By States.* National

Academies Press.

Stewart, P. S., & Franklin, M. J. (2008). Physiological heterogeneity in biofilms. *Nature Reviews*

Microbiology, *6*(3), 199–210. https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro1838

Taylor, M. B., Warwick, A. R., Skophammer, R., Boyer, J. M., Geck, R. C., Gunkelman, K.,

Walson, M., Rowley, P. A., & Dunham, M. J. (2024). yEvo: A modular eukaryotic

genetics and evolution research experience for high school students. *Ecology and*

Evolution, *14*(1), e10811. https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.10811

Trampari, E., Holden, E. R., Wickham, G. J., Ravi, A., Martins, L. de O., Savva, G. M., &

Webber, M. A. (2021). Exposure of Salmonella biofilms to antibiotic concentrations

rapidly selects resistance with collateral tradeoffs. *Npj Biofilms and Microbiomes*, *7*(1),

1–13. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41522-020-00178-0

Traverse, C. C., Mayo-Smith, L. M., Poltak, S. R., & Cooper, V. S. (2013). Tangled bank of

experimentally evolved Burkholderia biofilms reflects selection during chronic infections.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, *110*(3), E250–E259.

https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1207025110

Trubenová, B., Roizman, D., Moter, A., Rolff, J., & Regoes, R. R. (2022). Population genetics,

biofilm recalcitrance, and antibiotic resistance evolution. *Trends in Microbiology*, *30*(9),

841–852. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tim.2022.02.005

Turner, C. B., Marshall, C. W., & Cooper, V. S. (2018). Parallel genetic adaptation across

environments differing in mode of growth or resource availability. *Evolution Letters*, *2*(4),

355–367. https://doi.org/10.1002/evl3.75

Wei, Q., Leclercq, S., Bhasme, P., Xu, A., Zhu, B., Zhang, Y., Zhang, M., Wang, S., & Ma, L. Z.

(2019). Diguanylate Cyclases and Phosphodiesterases Required for Basal-Level c-di-

GMP in Pseudomonas aeruginosa as Revealed by Systematic Phylogenetic and

Transcriptomic Analyses. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, *85*(21), e01194-19.

https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01194-19

Xu, A., Wang, D., Wang, Y., Zhang, L., Xie, Z., Cui, Y., Bhamse, P., Yu, H., Zhang, X.-X., Li, D.,

& Ma, L. Z. (2021). Mutations in surface-sensing receptor WspA lock the Wsp signal

transduction system into a constitutively active state. *Environmental Microbiology*,

n/a(n/a). https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.15763

Xu, M., Yang, X., Yang, X.-A., Zhou, L., Liu, T.-Z., Fan, Z., & Jiang, T. (2016). Structural insights

into the regulatory mechanism of the Pseudomonas aeruginosa YfiBNR system. *Protein*

& Cell, *7*(6), 403–416. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13238-016-0264-7

Yang, X., Yang, X., Xu, M., Zhou, L., Fan, Z., & Jiang, T. (2015). Crystal structures of YfiR from

Pseudomonas aeruginosa in two redox states. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research*

Communications, *461*(1), 14–20. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbrc.2015.03.160

Yu, L., Cao, Q., Chen, W., Yang, N., Yang, C.-G., Ji, Q., Wu, M., Bae, T., & Lan, L. (2022). A

novel copper-sensing two-component system for inducing Dsb gene expression in

bacteria. *Science Bulletin*, *67*(2), 198–212. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scib.2021.03.003

Zhao, K., Tseng, B. S., Beckerman, B., Jin, F., Gibiansky, M. L., Harrison, J. J., Luijten, E.,

Parsek, M. R., & Wong, G. C. L. (2013). Psl trails guide exploration and microcolony

formation in Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms. *Nature, 497*(7449), 388–391.

https://doi.org/10.1038/nature12155

1181