1 **Title:**
2
3 Genomic evidence of a widespread southern distribution during the Last Glacial
4 Maximum for two eastern North American hickory species
5
6 **Running title:**
7
8 Phylogeography of North American *Carya*
9
10 **Authors and affiliations:**
11

12 Jordan B. Bemmels[1,*] and Christopher W. Dick[1,2]
13
14 [1] Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor,
15 MI 48109, USA
16 [2] Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Apartado 0843–03092, Balboa, Ancon,
17 Panama; orcid.org/0000-0001-8745-9137
18
19 [*] Corresponding author: jbemmels@umich.edu
20   orcid.org/0000-0001-9996-6996
21

22 **Acknowledgements:**
23

24 The authors thank B.J. Belcher, P. Cousineau, R. D'Andrea, J. Fiske, J. Ronson, D.
25 Saenz and P. Tichenor for assistance with fieldwork, and A.T. Thomaz for assistance
26 with genetic analyses. Graduate student support and research funding was provided to
27 J.B.B. by the National Science Foundation (GRFP fellowship; DDIG 1501159), and the
28 University of Michigan EEB Department and Rackham Graduate School.
29

Aim
Phylogeographic studies of temperate forest taxa often infer complex histories involving
population subdivision into distinct refugia during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM).
However, temperate forests may have been broadly distributed in southeastern North
America during the LGM. We investigate genome-wide genetic structure in two
widespread eastern North America tree species to determine if range expansion from a
contiguous area or from genetically isolated refugia better explains the postglacial
history of trees and forests from this region.
38
39 **Location**
40 Eastern North America (ENA).
41
42 **Taxa**
43 Bitternut hickory (*Carya cordiformis* (Wangenh.) K.Koch) and shagbark hickory (*Carya*
44 *ovata* (Mill.) K.Koch).
45
Methods
Genetic diversity and differentiation indices were calculated from >1,000 nuclear SNP
loci genotyped in ca. 180 individuals per species sampled across ENA. Genetic
structure was investigated using principle component analysis and genetic clustering
algorithms. As an additional tool for inference, areas of suitable habitat during the LGM
were predicted using species distribution models (SDMs).
52
Results
Populations across all latitudes showed similar levels of genetic diversity. Most genetic
variation was weakly differentiated across ENA, with the exception of an outlier
population of *Carya ovata* in Texas. Genetic structure in each species exhibited an
isolation-by-distance pattern. SDMs predicted high LGM habitat suitability over much of
the southeastern United States.
59
Main conclusions
Both hickory species likely survived the LGM in a large region of continuous habitat and
recolonized northern areas in a single expanding front that encountered few migration
barriers. More complex scenarios, such as forest refugia, need not be invoked to
explain genetic structure. The genetically distinct Texas population of *Carya ovata* could
represent a separate glacial refugium, but other explanations are possible. Relative to
that of other temperate forest regions, the phylogeographic history of ENA may have
been exceptionally simple, involving a northward range shift but without well defined
refugia.
69
70 **Keywords**
71 eastern North America, forest refugia, isolation by distance, Last Glacial Maximum,
72 phylogeography, range expansion, temperate trees
73

Introduction

Temperate forest ecosystems have long served as models for understanding how historical forces give rise to population genetic structure in terrestrial organisms (Hewitt, 1999, 2000; Petit et al., 2003; Soltis et al., 2006; Shafer et al., 2010; Qiu et al., 2011; Gavin et al., 2014; Lumibao et al., 2017). Migrational responses to Pleistocene glaciation often left large impacts on the genetic structure of temperate species, but the severity and effects of glaciation varied in different regions of the world (Hewitt, 2000; Shafer et al., 2010; Qiu et al., 2011; Lumibao et al., 2017). In Europe, where many classic phylogeographic paradigms were first established (Lumibao et al., 2017) and where glaciation during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM, ca. 21.5 ka; Jackson et al., 2000) was particularly severe, widespread temperate taxa typically retreated to distinct glacial refugia in Mediterranean regions (Hewitt, 1999, 2000; Petit et al., 2003). Genetic diversity was progressively lost due to founder effects as populations recolonized northern areas following glacial retreat (Hewitt, 1999, 2000), except in mid-latitude areas where admixture of lineages from distinct refugia has often led to elevated genetic diversity (Petit et al., 2003).

In other temperate regions of the world, phylogeographic patterns were structured by very different geographies and glacial histories. In eastern North America (ENA), early studies tended to emphasize genetic breaks between populations separated by rivers and mountain ranges (Soltis et al., 2006; Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009). In western North America, major refugia existed in the Pacific Northwest and Beringia, with smaller refugia on offshore islands and between continental ice sheets

(Shafer et al., 2010). In East Asia, responses to glaciation included not only latitudinal

migration, but also elevational and longitudinal migration and *in situ* persistence (Qiu et

al., 2011). The complexity of these classic paradigms has recently been expanded in all

four northern hemisphere regions to include small, low-density cryptic refugia in areas

previously thought unsuitable for habitation by temperate species (Stewart & Lister,

2001; Willis & Van Andel, 2004; McLachlan et al., 2005; Soltis et al., 2006; Provan &

Bennett, 2008; Qiu et al., 2011). However, the molecular and fossil evidence supporting

the existence of cryptic refugia is not universally accepted (Tzedakis et al., 2013).

Compared to the other three northern hemisphere temperate forest regions, ENA

is phylogeographically unique for at least three reasons. Firstly, its geography is

relatively simple, characterized by a large contiguous landmass with only a single north-

south mountain range of modest height (i.e., the Appalachians), and generally gradual

transitions between ecosystem types. Secondly, latitudinal temperature gradients during

the LGM were particularly steep, with warm areas located in close proximity to glaciers

(Tzedakis et al., 2013). Thirdly, despite numerous phylogeographic studies, well-

delineated glacial refugia generally shared by most species have not conclusively been

identified. Proposed refugial locations include the Gulf Coast, the Atlantic Coast, Florida,

Texas, the Ozark Plateau, the Lower Mississippi River Valley, the Appalachians, and

interior areas near ice sheets (Griffin & Barrett, 2004; Magni et al., 2005; Soltis et al.,

2006; Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009; Morris et al., 2010; Barnard-Kubow et al., 2015;

McCarthy & Mason-Gamer, 2016; Peterson & Graves, 2016), which together sum to

nearly the entire unglaciated region of eastern North America. While some species may

have survived in one or more of these distinct refugia, fossil and genetic evidence

suggests that some temperate taxa were widespread over vast areas of the

southeastern United States during the LGM (Bennett, 1985; Magni et al., 2005;

McLachlan et al., 2005; Peterson & Graves, 2016; Lumibao et al., 2017).

Given the diversity of hypotheses that have been evoked to explain

phylogeographic patterns in ENA taxa, studies assessing genome-wide patterns of

genetic variation in widely distributed model species would provide valuable insight into

the history of temperate forests from the region as a whole. Surprisingly, we are aware

of no such studies (but Eckert et al. (2010) and Nadeau et al. (2015) have conducted

studies of more narrowly distributed tree species). Here, we use genome-wide genetic

variation to examine the phylogeographic history of two widespread, ENA tree species:

bitternut hickory (*Carya cordiformis* (Wagenh.) K.Koch) and shagbark hickory (*Carya*

ovata (Mill.) K.Koch). We construct and analyze single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP)

datasets from nearly rangewide collections of each species and build paleodistribution

models in order to characterize geographic patterns of genetic diversity and

differentiation across ENA. In particular, we aim to determine if genetic structure is best

explained by recolonization from distinct forest refugia (and if so, where these refugia

where located), or by a single expansion from a large, continuous forest region.

Methods

Study species

Carya cordiformis and *Carya ovata* are wind-pollinated, animal-dispersed trees

co-distributed from southern Quebec to eastern Texas (Fig. 1). Their ranges roughly

correspond to the overall geographic distribution of temperate deciduous forests in ENA,

making them excellent model taxa to study the phylogeography of eastern deciduous

forests as a whole. *Carya ovata* additionally occurs in several small, disjunct

populations in the Sierra Madre Oriental of northern Mexico (Little, 1971). In the

northern half of temperate ENA, *C. cordiformis* occupies many habitats but occurs most

frequently on mesic soils and bottomlands (Smith, 1990), whereas *C. ovata* is common

on a wider variety of sites (Graney, 1990). In southern areas both species are less

common and typically restricted to wet, fertile soils (Graney, 1990; Smith, 1990).

Phylogeographic knowledge is completely lacking in *C. cordiformis*. In *C. ovata*,

analysis of cpDNA haplotypes has revealed no clear pattern, as some haplotypes are

widespread throughout the entire range and others are more spatially restricted,

including in formerly glaciated areas (Lumibao et al., 2017). *Carya* pollen is not typically

distinguished to the species level, but LGM-age pollen of *Carya* has been found at low

density over large areas of the southeastern USA (Prentice et al., 1991; Jackson et al.,

2000). *Carya* macrofossils dating to the LGM have been found in southern Tennessee

(35ºN; Jackson et al., 2000), and trace amounts of pollen as far north as southern

Illinois (39ºN; Grüger, 1972). However, the presence of small amounts of pollen in

northern areas is not necessarily indicative of local presence, as pollen can be reworked

from layers representing different time periods, or transported by wind over long

distances (Tzedakis et al., 2013).

Many of the ca. 13 North American *Carya* species readily hybridize with one

another (Fralish & Franklin, 2002). Geographically structured hybridization may impact

phylogeographic inferences in tree species (Saeki et al., 2011; Thomson et al., 2015),

and one limitation of our analyses is that we are unable to assess patterns of

hybridization with other *Carya*. However, no stable hybrid zones exist in our species and

we consider it unlikely that occasional hybridization would systematically bias genetic

structure in a similar way across thousands of loci.

DNA sampling and SNP genotyping

Silica-dried leaf tissue was collected from 182 individuals of each species from

populations across ENA (Fig. 1; Tables S1.1-S1.2). Sampled individuals within each

population were separated by a minimum of 50 m (but sometimes up to dozens of km)

in order to minimize the chance of sampling siblings and other close relatives. Sample

size varied greatly among populations depending on the number of individuals meeting

these requirements that could be located (mean N = 7.8; Tables S1.1-S1.2). A

representative voucher specimen from each population was deposited in the University

of Michigan Herbarium (MICH; DOI: XXXXX).

DNA samples were extracted using Nucleospin Plant II extraction kits (*Macherey-*

Nagel; Düren, Germany), and libraries were prepared using a modified double digest

Restriction Associated DNA (ddRAD) sequencing protocol following Peterson et al.,

(2012), with restriction enzymes *EcoRI* and *MseI.* Full details of extraction methods and

library preparation are provided in Appendix S1 in Supporting Information. Seven

libraries of 72 samples each were sequenced at The Hospital for Sick Children (Toronto,

ON) on an *Illumina HiSeq* (Illumina; San Diego, CA) using single-end 50-bp sequencing.

In order to ensure adequate depth of coverage, at least one million raw reads per

sample were required to process a sample, and individuals not meeting this target were

resequenced in subsequent libraries.

Loci were identified and single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) were

genotyped using STACKS v.1.44-v.1.46 (Catchen et al., 2011, 2013). Full details of SNP

discovery are provided in Appendix S1. After SNPs were successfully identified, one

SNP genotype per locus was exported from STACKS using the *populations* tool, retaining

only SNPs with a minimum genotyping rate of 75% (-r 0.75) and a minimum minor allele

frequency (MAF) of 3.3% (--min_maf 0.033), the lowest detectable MAF in at least one

population of each species, following Massatti & Knowles (2014). Minimum MAF is an

important parameter to consider because it can impact inference of genetic structure

(De la Cruz & Raska, 2014). We therefore explored preliminary analyses with minimum

MAF = 1% and 5%, but found that using the higher minimum MAF (5%) made little

qualitative difference in preliminary results. With the lower minimum MAF (1%), broad-

scale patterns were overwhelmed by local-scale signatures, likely due to rare variants

shared among closely related individuals (De la Cruz & Raska, 2014). These results

suggested that our choice of minimum MAF = 3.3% was appropriate.

In order to retain only putatively nuclear SNPs, we removed any SNPs from loci

that aligned with a maximum of two mismatches (-v 2) to the *Juglans regia*

(Juglandaceae) chloroplast genome (Genbank accession NC_028617.1) or the

Cucurbita pepo (Cucurbitaceae) mitochondrion genome (NC_014050.1) using BOWTIE

v.1.2 (Langmead et al., 2009). Extremely variable loci were also excluded as these may

represent locus assembly errors; we defined these loci as those with values of θ

(Watterson, 1975) above the 95th percentile, with θ calculated for each locus individually

using the *R* package 'pegas' v.0.10 (Paradis, 2010). Individual samples with unusually

high levels of missing data across all loci (based on visual inspection) were also

excluded.

Genetic diversity and divergence

Three genetic diversity parameters were calculated overall and for each

population: observed and expected heterozygosity (H_o and H_e, respectively), and

nucleotide diversity (π). Genetic differentiation (F_{ST}) (Nei, 1987) was calculated overall

and pairwise between each pair of populations. H_o, H_e, and F_{ST} were calculated in the *R*

package 'hierfstat' v.0.04-22 (Goudet, 2005), while π was calculated using *populations*

in STACKS v.1.46 (Catchen et al., 2011, 2013). Genetic diversity and differentiation

measures are not reported for populations represented by a single individual.

Population genetic structure

In order to test for isolation by distance (IBD), Mantel tests (Mantel, 1967) were

performed to assess the relationship between population pairwise F_{ST} values and

geographic distances. Principal component analysis (PCA) was used to investigate

genetic relationships among individuals and populations using the *dudi.pca* function in

the *R* package 'adegenet' v.2.0.1 (Jombart, 2008; Jombart & Ahmed, 2011). The NC_e

population (Table S1.1) was excluded for *C. cordiformis* because some, but not all

individuals from this population formed a distinct genetic cluster, which suggests that

several closely related individuals were unintentionally sampled and the high genetic

similarity between these individuals could have biased initial PCA results.

Genetic clusters were characterized using FASTSTRUCTURE v.1.0 (Raj et al.,

2014), with all populations and individuals included, using the recommended procedure

for detecting subtle genetic structure. Initially, the simple prior model was used and the

number of clusters (K) was varied from 1 to 6 for each species, and K was selected

using the *chooseK* tool in FASTSTRUCTURE. Then, FASTSTRUCTURE was rerun 100

times using the logistic prior model for the optimal value(s) of K, and final estimates of

genetic membership of individuals in each genetic cluster were obtained as the average

membership from the five runs with the highest likelihood, following Raj et al. (2014).

After investigating the broadest level of structure within each dataset, we reran

FASTSTRUCTURE on individual genetic clusters in order to test for substructure within

clusters.

Paleodistribution modelling

Species distribution models (SDMs) were constructed in order to predict the

potential distribution of each species during the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM; 21.5 ka).

Complete details of SDM construction and data sources are given in Appendix S1.

Briefly, occurrence records were obtained from the US Forest Service Forest Inventory

Analysis Database (O'Connell et al., 2012), while environmental variables were

obtained at 2.5-arcminute resolution from the WORLDCLIM v.1.4. (Hijmans et al., 2005)

and ENVIREM (Title & Bemmels, 2017) databases, for both current and LGM conditions.

SDMs were constructed using MAXENT v.3.4.1 (Phillips et al., 2004, 2006, 2017) in the *R*

package 'dismo' (Hijmans et al., 2015), with models optimized according to best

practices, following Title & Bemmels (2017).

Results

Genetic diversity and differentiation

The final genetic datasets for *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* contained 177

individuals genotyped at 1,046 SNPs, and 180 individuals genotyped at 1,018 SNPs,

respectively. The overall genotyping rate for both species was 89%.

While some populations were represented by very few individuals (Tables S1.1-

S1.2), very small sample sizes are typically sufficient to obtain accurate population

genomic measures of genetic diversity and differentiation if calculated across thousands

of SNPs (Willing et al., 2012; Nazareno et al., 2017). Furthermore, genetic diversity

estimates were generally uncorrelated with population sample size (Fig. S1.1), except

that a negative relationship was found between H_o and sample size in *C. ovata* (R^2 =

0.21, p = 0.035). However, as H_o is computed on a per-individual basis, there is no

theoretical reason to expect that sample size might bias estimates of H_o and we suspect

that this correlation is spurious.

Genetic diversity showed little variation among populations for both species (Fig.

2). A significant decline in genetic diversity with increasing latitude was not observed for

any genetic diversity measure (H_o, H_e, π) for either species. Instead, a significant

increase in H_o with increasing latitude was observed in *C. cordiformis* (R^2 = 0.23, p =

0.021), as was a marginally non-significant increase in H_o with increasing latitude in *C.*

ovata (R^2 = 0.19, p = 0.051). Although genetic variation was fairly uniform across

latitudes, far northern and far southern populations sometimes showed slightly lower

values of H_e and π than typical of mid-latitude populations (Fig. 2), as expected for

range-edge populations (Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009). Among-population genetic

differentiation (F_{ST}) is low in both species overall (*C. cordiformis*: 0.047; *C. ovata*: 0.038),

and among most pairs of populations (Tables S1.3-S1.4).

Spatial genetic structure

Spatial genetic structure in both species is very weak and dominated by a pattern

of isolation by distance (IBD). Mantel tests of IBD were statistically significant in both

species (*C. cordiformis*: r = 0.36, p = 0.0017; *C. ovata*: r = 0.47, p = 8.1 x 10^{-5}; Fig. 3).

Principal component analysis (PCA) also revealed an IBD-like pattern, without

clearly defined, distinct genetic clusters (Fig. 4). One exception to this pattern is that in

C. ovata, the Texas population (TX; bright pink dots, Fig. 4b) forms a separate cluster

that does not overlap with any other populations. However, the relative position of TX

along PC axes is still closest to that of geographically proximate western and southern

populations, consistent with an IBD pattern.

Lack of strong genetic structure was also suggested by FASTSTRUCTURE

results. Under the model with simple priors, the optimal number of genetic clusters was

K = 1 for both species. Under the model with logistic priors, which is more useful for

detecting subtle structure (Raj et al., 2014), optimal K ranged from 1-6. However, the

logistic priors model is prone to overfitting (Raj et al., 2014) and K > 2 did not produce

results that were biologically interpretable. We therefore note that K = 1 or 2 is likely the

optimal model complexity to explain genetic structure. In both species with K = 2,

genetic structure was weak and similar to an IBD-like pattern (Figs. 5, S1.2). In *C.*

cordiformis, a gradual north-south transition between clusters was evident. In *C. ovata*,

the transition between clusters was primarily from east to west. No substructure was

evident within any genetic cluster for any species, except that within the western cluster

for *C. ovata*, optimal *K* = 2 and the Texas population (TX) forms a distinct subcluster

relative to the other four populations (AR, IA, ON, WI; data not shown). However, the

grouping of these four populations into a distinct subcluster may be only a statistical

artifact reflecting the substantial additional membership of each these four western

populations in the main eastern cluster.

Paleodistribution modelling

The same four climatic variables were coincidentally retained in the SDMs for

both species: maximum temperature of the coldest month, potential evapotranspiration

of the warmest quarter, mean annual precipitation, and climatic moisture index (Table

S1.5). For both species, models were able to predict the current species distribution (Fig.

1) very well along the northern and western range edges, but performed more poorly at

delineating the southern range edge (Fig. 5). This poorer performance may reflect the

fact that both species are rare in the southern portion of their ranges, where presence

and absence may be determined more by soil type and topography (Graney, 1990;

Smith, 1990) than by broad-scale climatic differences among sites. For both species, a

large, continuous area of high LGM habitat suitability is predicted to have extended over

much of the southeastern US, from central Texas to exposed continental shelf off the

coast of North Carolina, and south to northern Florida (Fig. 5).

Discussion

Carya cordiformis and Carya ovata likely survived the LGM in a large, contiguous

forest region covering much of the southeastern United States, and recolonized

northern areas in a single expanding front. This scenario is supported by our genetic

results showing weak genetic structure and an isolation-by-distance (IBD) pattern, and

by our paleodistribution models and the fossil record. Genetic differentiation is

continuous across ENA, except that a Texas population of C. ovata is more genetically

distinct than other populations. The cause of this distinctiveness remains unclear.

Insights from both species are likely applicable to understanding the phylogeographic

history of temperate forests from ENA as a whole, and suggest that ENA may lack the

complex refugial dynamics characteristic of other temperate forest regions of the world.

Weak genetic structure

In both species, genetic structure is weak and geographic patterns of genetic

variation are primarily characterized by IBD, rather than sharp genetic breaks among

regions. Although some geographic structure was detected with FASTSTRUCTURE, IBD

is known to bias tests of hierarchical genetic structure (Frantz et al., 2009; Meirmans,

2012). In particular, such tests are susceptible to incorrect inference of multiple genetic

clusters when populations are geographically subsampled from within a single larger

cluster subject to IBD (Frantz et al., 2009; Meirmans, 2012). We note that a rangewide

IBD pattern is present in our datasets (Fig. 3), and genetic structure is weak in both

species (optimal K = 1 to 2), with only gradual geographic transitions between inferred

genetic clusters (Fig. 1). Similarly, substantial overlap among populations exists along

the first and second principal component axes (Fig. 4), with the exception of the Texas

population of *C. ovata* (see below). Rather than indicating the true presence of

biologically meaningful genetic clusters, our FASTSTRUCTURE results are likely a

statistical artifact of underlying IBD and suggest that over the majority of the species

range, genetic differentiation is continuous.

In addition to lack of phylogeographic breaks, there are no identifiable regions of

elevated genetic diversity (Fig. 2). Similar to many other temperate tree species from

ENA (Lumibao et al., 2017), *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* do not exhibit declines in

genetic diversity with increasing latitude, and population genetic diversity (H_e, π) is

relatively uniform across the species range. The absence of regions of elevated

diversity suggests either historical recolonization in a single, slowly expanding migration

front experiencing little loss of diversity during migration, or else very high gene flow

among populations (Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009). Both of these situations are likely

applicable to our study species. In particular, low population genetic differentiation (*C.*

cordiformis, F_{ST} = 0.047; *C. ovata*, F_{ST} = 0.038) provides further evidence that gene flow

among populations is likely high. Low population differentiation is commonly observed in

widespread, wind-pollinated forest trees, due to their large population sizes and

capacity for long-distance pollen-mediated gene flow (Hamrick et al., 1992; Savolainen

et al., 2007; Alberto et al., 2013).

Despite generally uniform genetic diversity across populations in terms of H_e and

π, observed heterozygosity (H_o) increases with increasing latitude in both species (Fig.

2). Higher genetic diversity in northern regions might reflect the effects of larger

populations in the north that are less subject to genetic drift (Griffin & Barrett, 2004), but

genetic drift would be expected to simultaneously affect H_e and π (not only H_o). A more

likely explanation is that decreased H_o in the south reflects an increase in homozygotes

due to inbreeding in generally smaller, more isolated southern populations, but that this

effect has not yet led to a loss of overall genetic diversity at the population level (H_e, π).

We also note that far northern and far southern populations of both species

sometimes exhibit slightly lower population genetic diversity (H_e, π) than mid-latitude

populations (Fig. 2). In this case, we do suspect that this pattern reflects reduced gene

flow between core and peripheral populations and loss of diversity due to genetic drift in

generally smaller, more isolated peripheral populations (Hampe & Petit, 2005; Jaramillo-

Correa et al., 2009). However, in some European taxa, elevated mid-latitude genetic

diversity is believed to instead reflect historical secondary contact and admixture of

lineages from distinct southern refugia (Petit et al., 2003). Nonetheless, we find no

evidence of distinct refugia or mid-latitude admixture among lineages, making

secondary contact a less likely explanation for the patterns we observe.

Temperate forests in ENA during the LGM

The phylogeographic history of both *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* is best

characterized by simple latitudinal range shifts. Our genetic data and species

distribution models suggest that both species inhabited large areas of the southeastern

United States during the Last Glacial Maximum and gradually expanded northward to

occupy their current distribution as glaciers retreated. We find no evidence of highly

genetically distinct geographic regions or of strong phylogeographic breaks that would

suggest population fragmentation into multiple refugia (except possibly range-edge *C.*

ovata from Texas; see below). We also find no evidence that postglacial recolonization

of northern areas has occurred via multiple routes or been impeded by major landscape

barriers. LGM survival over large areas of the southeastern United States and gradual

northward recolonization is also compatible with the fossil record for the genus *Carya*

(Prentice et al., 1991; Jackson et al., 2000).

While we do not detect any signatures of complex refugial dynamics or multiple

postglacial recolonization routes, an alternative scenario we must consider is that one or

both species might have experienced a more complex phylogeographic history, the

signatures of which have been subsequently obscured by extensive contemporary gene

flow (e.g., He et al., 2013). Low population genetic differentiation and an IBD pattern

suggest that gene flow among populations is indeed fairly high. However, both species

are slow growing and long lived, with peak reproduction occurring in *C. cordiformis* from

ages 50 to 125 (Smith, 1990), and in *C. ovata* from ages 60 to 200 (Graney, 1990).

Relatively few generations have therefore passed since the LGM, meaning that there

has likely been insufficient time for gene flow to erode genetic signatures of postglacial

expansion from multiple refugia.

Given that *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* are common, widespread tree species

with a geographic distribution roughly matching that of temperate forests in ENA, we

consider them to be model taxa for understanding the phylogeographic history of

temperate forests from this region as a whole. Both species occupy a variety of habitat

sites, but do show relevant differences in their ecology (Graney, 1990; Smith, 1990). In

particular, *C. ovata* is a habitat generalist, and phylogeographic patterns for this species

are likely to be broadly representative of those for ENA forest taxa in general. In

contrast, *C. cordiformis* is a more mesic, bottomland species in many parts of its range,

and thus would be expected to be particularly susceptible to fragmentation into refugia

and therefore exhibit strong phylogeographic structure. However, low genetic structure

and lack of any evidence of distinct refugia in *C. cordiformis* provide particularly strong

evidence that temperate forests in ENA during the LGM were not highly fragmented.

Several other widespread woody plant species from ENA are also believed to

have expanded from a large area covering much of the southeastern United States,

including *Acer rubrum* (McLachlan et al., 2005), *Dirca palustris* (Peterson & Graves,

2016), *Fagus grandifolia* (Bennett, 1985; McLachlan et al., 2005), and *Quercus rubra*

(Magni et al., 2005). The presence of climatic conditions able to support temperate trees

over large areas of the southeastern United States during the LGM is also well

supported by pollen records (Prentice et al., 1991; Jackson et al., 2000; Williams, 2002).

Despite these sources of phylogeographic concordance, more complex scenarios

involving divisions into distinct refugia or multiple recolonization routes have been

proposed for many other plant species, especially those that are less geographically

widespread (e.g., Griffin & Barrett, 2004; Gonzales et al., 2008; Eckert et al., 2010;

Barnard-Kubow et al., 2015; Nadeau et al., 2015; Zinck & Rajora, 2016). In addition,

many forest communities with no modern analogue were present in ENA during the

LGM (Jackson et al., 2000), suggesting that not all taxa responded to glaciation in the

same way. It is therefore unclear whether any general migrational responses to

glaciation are applicable to ENA forests, or whether most taxa exhibited species-specific,

idiosyncratic responses.

441 One possible explanation for different responses among species is that suitable

442 habitat for species adapted to a narrower range of climatic or edaphic conditions could

443 have been more geographically fragmented during the LGM than for more widespread

444 species. In particular, ENA taxa with a strictly southern, warm-temperate distribution

445 may have become fragmented into distinct far-southern refugia in Florida, Texas, or

446 along the Gulf or Atlantic Coasts (e.g., Gonzales et al., 2008; Eckert et al., 2010). In

447 contrast, more widespread species such as *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* could have

448 survived in more expansive inland areas of cool-temperate conditions that extended

449 farther north (e.g., Fig. 5). As model taxa, *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* may be most

450 appropriate for understanding the phylogeographic history of temperate forests as a

451 whole, and may be less representative of taxa with widely differing habitat requirements

452 and narrower ecological amplitudes.

453 Nonetheless, our results suggest that temperate forests from ENA may have

454 experienced a relatively simple phylogeographic history. Previous phylogeographic

455 studies have established that major rivers and the Appalachian Mountains are important

456 phylogeographic barriers for some ENA taxa, but these findings are not universal and

457 are typically found in small animals with limited dispersal ability (Soltis et al., 2006). In

458 contrast, rivers are unlikely to present substantial dispersal barriers to large trees, and

459 the phylogeographic impact (or lack thereof) of the Appalachians on tree populations

460 remains unclear (Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009). Overall, there are few topographic or

461 climatic barriers likely to lead to complex phylogeographic histories for ENA forest trees,

462 especially in comparison to other temperate regions of the world (Hewitt, 2000; Shafer

463 et al., 2010; Qiu et al., 2011).

Genetic distinctiveness of Texas shagbark hickory

Although an IBD pattern characterizes genetic structure throughout most of ENA

in both species, the Texas population (TX) of *C. ovata* presents an exception to this

general pattern. TX forms its own PCA genetic cluster that does not overlap with any

other population (pink dots; Fig. 4b), and it is the only population with membership

almost exclusively in the western cluster identified by FASTSTRUCTURE.

There are several possible interpretations of these results. One possibility is that

TX may be derived from a separate glacial refugium. Glacial refugia have previously

been inferred in Texas and northern Mexico for several southern *Pinus* and *Prunus*

species (Schmidtling & Hipkins, 1998; Schmidtling, 2003; Shaw & Small, 2005;

Jaramillo-Correa et al., 2009; Eckert et al., 2010). Alternatively, ancestors of the TX

population may have experienced gene flow with *C. ovata* populations in the mountains

of northern Mexico (Little, 1971). Although we have not included any high-elevation

Mexican populations in our genetic analyses or paleodistribution models, we cannot

exclude the possibility that these populations may have migrated to lower elevations

and come into contact with other populations during the LGM or at another time during

the Pleistocene.

However, we do not necessarily need to invoke a separate refugium or contact

with Mexican populations to explain the genetic distinctiveness of the range-edge TX

population, because our results could also merely reflect low gene flow between TX and

other populations. There is likely very little gene flow between TX and populations we

sampled further to the east due to the absence of *C. ovata* in the Lower Mississippi

River Valley (Fig. 1). In addition, the Ozark and Ouachita Mountains could conceivably

reduce gene flow with populations sampled to the north. Denser population sampling

across the southwestern portion of the species range could help fill in geographic gaps

in our PC analyses, in order to determine whether TX is truly a distinct gene pool, or

represents the extreme end of a rangewide IBD pattern, but is subject to greater genetic

isolation than other populations.

Given the uncertain origin of the Texas population of *C. ovata*, we suggest that

any conservation efforts in this species should ensure inclusion of populations from

Texas and surrounding regions. Genetically distinct southern populations of temperate

species have often been identified as high conservation priority (Petit et al., 2003;

Hampe & Petit, 2005; Médail & Diadema, 2009). However, across most of the range of

C. cordiformis and *C. ovata*, we see little reason to prioritize conservation of southern

populations, due to their lack of genetic distinctiveness and lack of elevated genetic

diversity. On the other hand, most temperate tree species exhibit geographically

structured climatically adaptive genetic variation (Savolainen et al., 2007; Aitken &

Bemmels, 2016) unlikely to be captured by the putatively neutral SNP markers we

employed. Conserving populations from a variety of climates across the species range

would therefore likely maximize conservation of adaptively relevant genetic diversity.

Conclusions

Genome-wide patterns of genetic variation, predictions of paleodistibution

models, and the fossil record all suggest that *C. cordiformis* and *C. ovata* recolonized

postglacial ENM from a single, continuous region of temperate forest that likely covered

much of the southeastern United States during the LGM. We generally find no evidence

of distinct glacial refugia or strong phylogeographic breaks. However, as an exception to

this overall pattern, it is unclear whether the higher genetic distinctiveness of a Texas

population of *C. ovata* relative to other populations reflects the effects of a separate

Texas refugium, historical contact with Mexican populations, or contemporary patterns

of gene flow. The two *Carya* species we have studied represent excellent model taxa for

understanding the phylogeographic history of eastern deciduous forests as a whole.

Whereas complex refugial dynamics must be invoked to explain genetic structure in

other temperate regions of the world, our results suggest that the phylogeographic

history of temperate forests from ENA can largely be explained by simple latitudinal

range shifts, without division into distinct refugia.

References

References

Aitken, S.N. & Bemmels, J.B. (2016) Time to get moving: assisted gene flow of forest

trees. *Evolutionary Applications*, **9**, 271–290.

Alberto, F.J., Aitken, S.N., Alía, R., González-Martínez, S.C., Hänninen, H., Kremer, A.,

Lefèvre, F., Lenormand, T., Yeaman, S., Whetten, R., & Savolainen, O. (2013)

Potential for evolutionary responses to climate change - evidence from tree

populations. *Global Change Biology*, **19**, 1645–1661.

Barnard-Kubow, K.B., Debban, C.L., & Galloway, L.F. (2015) Multiple glacial refugia

lead to genetic structuring and the potential for reproductive isolation in a

herbaceous plant. *American Journal of Botany*, **102**, 1842–1853.

Bennett, K.D. (1985) The spread of *Fagus grandifolia* across eastern North America

during the last 18 000 years. *Journal of Biogeography*, **12**, 147–164.

Catchen, J., Hohenlohe, P.A., Bassham, S., Amores, A., & Cresko, W.A. (2013)

STACKS: an analysis tool set for population genomics. *Molecular Ecology*, **22**, 3124–

3140.

Catchen, J.M., Amores, A., Hohenlohe, P., Cresko, W., & Postlethwait, J.H. (2011)

STACKS: building and genotyping loci de novo from short-read sequences. *G3:*

Genes, Genomes, Genetics, **1**, 171–182.

Eckert, A.J., Van Heerwaarden, J., Wegrzyn, J.L., Nelson, C.D., Ross-Ibarra, J.,

González-Martínez, S.C., & Neale, D.B. (2010) Patterns of population structure and

environmental associations to aridity across the range of loblolly pine (*Pinus taeda*

L., Pinaceae). *Genetics*, **185**, 969–982.

Fralish, J.S. & Franklin, S.B. (2002) *Taxonomy and Ecology of Woody Plants in North*

American Forests. John Wiley & Sons, New York.

Frantz, A.C., Cellina, S., Krier, A., Schley, L., & Burke, T. (2009) Using spatial Bayesian

methods to determine the genetic structure of a continuously distributed population:

Clusters or isolation by distance? *Journal of Applied Ecology*, **46**, 493–505.

Gavin, D.G., Fitzpatrick, M.C., Gugger, P.F., et al. (2014) Climate refugia: joint inference

from fossil records, species distribution models and phylogeography. *New*

Phytologist, **204**, 37–54.

Gonzales, E., Hamrick, J.L., & Chang, S.M. (2008) Identification of glacial refugia in

south-eastern North America by phylogeographical analyses of a forest

understorey plant, *Trillium cuneatum*. *Journal of Biogeography*, **35**, 844–852.

Goudet, J. (2005) HIERFSTAT, a package for R to compute and test hierarchical F-

statistics. *Molecular Ecology Notes*, **5**, 184–186.

Graney, D.L. (1990) *Carya ovata* (Mill.) K. Koch. *Silvics of North America: 2. Hardwoods.*

Agricultural Handbook 654 (ed. by R.M. Burns and B.H. Honkala), US Department

of Agriculture, Forest Service, Washington, DC.

Griffin, S.R. & Barrett, S.C.H. (2004) Post-glacial history of *Trillium grandiflorum*

(Melianthiaceae) in eastern North America: inferences from phylogeography.

American Journal of Botany, **91**, 465–473.

Grüger, E. (1972) Late quaternary vegetation development in south-central Illinois.

Quaternary Research, **2**, 217–220.

Hampe, A. & Petit, R.J. (2005) Conserving biodiversity under climate change: the rear

edge matters. *Ecology Letters*, **8**, 461–467.

Hamrick, J.L., Godt, J.W., & Sherman-Broyles, S.L. (1992) Factors influencing levels of

genetic diversity in woody plant species. *New Forests*, **6**, 95–124.

He, Q., Edwards, D.L., & Knowles, L.L. (2013) Integrative testing of how environments

from the past to the present shape genetic structure across landscapes. *Evolution*,

67, 3386–3402.

Hewitt, G. (1999) Post-glacial re-colonization of European biota. *Biological Journal of*

the Linnean Society, **68**, 87–112.

Hewitt, G. (2000) The genetic legacy of the Quaternary ice ages. *Nature*, **405**, 907–913.

Hijmans, R.J., Cameron, S.E., Parra, J.L., Jones, P.G., & Jarvis, A. (2005) Very high

resolution interpolated climate surfaces for global land areas. *International Journal*

of Climatology, **25**, 1965–1978.

Hijmans, R.J., Phillips, S., Leathwick, J., & Elith, J. (2015) Package "dismo". R package.

http://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/dismo/index.html.

Jackson, S.T., Webb, R.S., Anderson, K.H., Overpeck, J.T., Webb III, T., Williams, J.W.,

& Hansen, B.C.S. (2000) Vegetation and environment in Eastern North America

during the Last Glacial Maximum. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **19**, 489–508.

Jaramillo-Correa, J.P., Beaulieu, J., Khasa, D.P., & Bosquet, J. (2009) Inferring the past

from the present phylogeography structure of North American forest trees: seeing

the forest for the genes. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **39**, 286–307.

Jombart, T. (2008) ADEGENET: a R package for the multivariate analysis of genetic

markers. *Bioinformatics*, **24**, 1403–1405.

Jombart, T. & Ahmed, I. (2011) ADEGENET 1.3-1: new tools for the analysis of genome-

wide SNP data. *Bioinformatics*, **27**, 3070–3071.

De la Cruz, O. & Raska, P. (2014) Population structure at different minor allele

frequency levels. *BMC proceedings*, **8**, S55.

Langmead, B., Trapnell, C., Pop, M., & Salzberg, S.L. (2009) Ultrafast and memory-

efficient alignment of short DNA sequences to the human genome. *Genome*

Biology, **10**, R25.

Little, E.L. (1971) *Atlas of United States trees, volume 1. Conifers and important*

hardwoods. USDA Miscellaneous Publication 1146, Washington, DC.

Lumibao, C.Y., Hoban, S.M., & McLachlan, J. (2017) Ice ages leave genetic diversity

"hotspots" in Europe but not in Eastern North America. *Ecology Letters*, in press.

Magni, C.R., Ducousso, A., Caron, H., Petit, R.J., & Kremer, A. (2005) Chloroplast DNA

variation of *Quercus rubra* L. in North America and comparison with other

Fagaceae. *Molecular Ecology*, **14**, 513–524.

Mantel, N. (1967) The detection of disease clustering and a generalized regression

approach. *Cancer Research*, **27**, 209–220.

Massatti, R. & Knowles, L.L. (2014) Microhabitat differences impact phylogeographic

concordance of codistributed species: genomic evidence in montane sedges

(*Carex* L.) from the Rocky Mountains. *Evolution*, **68**, 2833–2846.

McCarthy, D.M. & Mason-Gamer, R.J. (2016) Chloroplast DNA-based phylogeography

of *Tilia americana* (Malvaceae). *Systematic Botany*, **41**, 865–880.

McLachlan, J.S., Clark, J.S., & Manos, P.S. (2005) Molecular indicators of tree

migration capacity under rapid climate change. *Ecology*, **86**, 2088–2098.

Médail, F. & Diadema, K. (2009) Glacial refugia influence plant diversity patterns in the

Mediterranean Basin. *Journal of Biogeography*, **36**, 1333–1345.

Meirmans, P.G. (2012) The trouble with isolation by distance. *Molecular Ecology*, **21**,
2839–2846.

Morris, A.B., Graham, C.H., Soltis, D.E., & Soltis, P.S. (2010) Reassessment of
phylogeographical structure in an eastern North American tree using Monmonier's
algorithm and ecological niche modelling. *Journal of Biogeography*, **37**, 1657–1667.

Nadeau, S., Godbout, J., Lamothe, M., Gros-Louis, M.-C., Isabel, N., & Ritland, K.
(2015) Contrasting patterns of genetic diversity across the ranges of *Pinus*
monticola and *P. strobus*: a comparison between eastern and western North
American postglacial colonization histories. *American Journal of Botany*, **102**,
1342–1355.

Nazareno, A.G., Bemmels, J.B., Dick, C.W., & Lohmann, L.G. (2017) Minimum sample
sizes for population genomics: an empirical study from an Amazonian plant species.
Molecular Ecology Resources, in press.

Nei, M. (1987) *Molecular Evolutionary Genetics*. Columbia University Press, New York.

O'Connell, B.M., LaPoint, E.B., Turner, J.A., Ridley, T., Boyer, D., Wilson, A.M.,
Waddell, K.L., & Conkling, B.L. (2012) *The Forest Inventory and Analysis*
Database: database description and users manual version 5.1.4 for Phase 2. Gen.
Tech. Rep., US Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Washington, DC.

Paradis, E. (2010) Pegas: an R package for population genetics with an integrated-
modular approach. *Bioinformatics*, **26**, 419–420.

Peterson, B.J. & Graves, W.R. (2016) Chloroplast phylogeography of *Dirca palustris* L.
indicates populations near the glacial boundary at the Last Glacial Maximum in
eastern North America. *Journal of Biogeography*, **43**, 314–327.

Peterson, B.K., Weber, J.N., Kay, E.H., Fisher, H.S., & Hoekstra, H.E. (2012) Double

digest RADseq: an inexpensive method for de novo SNP discovery and genotyping

in model and non-model species. *PLoS ONE*, **7**, .

Petit, R.J., Aguinagalde, I., de Beaulieu, J.-L., Bittkau, C., Brewer, S., Cheddadi, R.,

Ennos, R., Fineschi, S., Grivet, D., Lascoux, M., Mohanty, A., Müller-Starck, G.,

Demesure-Musch, B., Palmé, A., Martín, J.P., Rendell, S., & Vendramin, G.G.

(2003) Glacial refugia: hotspots but not melting pots of genetic diversity. *Science*,

300, 1563–1565.

Phillips, S.J., Anderson, R.P., Dudík, M., Schapire, R.E., & Blair, M.E. (2017) Opening

the black box: an open-source release of Maxent. *Ecography*, **40**, 887–893.

Phillips, S.J., Anderson, R.P., & Schapire, R.E. (2006) Maximum entropy modeling of

species geographic distributions. *Ecological Modelling*, **190**, 231–259.

Phillips, S.J., Dudík, M., & Schapire, R.E. (2004) A maximum entropy approach to

species distribution modeling. *Proceedings of the Twenty-First International*

Conference on Machine Learning, **2004**, 655–662.

Prentice, C., Bartlein, P.J., & Webb III, T. (1991) Vegetation and climate change in

eastern North America since the Last Glacial Maximum. *Ecology*, **72**, 2038–2056.

Provan, J. & Bennett, K.D. (2008) Phylogeographic insights into cryptic glacial refugia.

Trends in Ecology and Evolution, **23**, 564–571.

Qiu, Y.X., Fu, C.X., & Comes, H.P. (2011) Plant molecular phylogeography in China

and adjacent regions: tracing the genetic imprints of Quaternary climate and

environmental change in the world's most diverse temperate flora. *Molecular*

Phylogenetics and Evolution, **59**, 225–244.

Raj, A., Stephens, M., & Pritchard, J.K. (2014) FASTSTRUCTURE: variational inference

of population structure in large SNP data sets. *Genetics*, **197**, 573–589.

Saeki, I., Dick, C.W., Barnes, B. V., & Murakami, N. (2011) Comparative

phylogeography of red maple (*Acer rubrum* L.) and silver maple (*Acer saccharinum*

L.): impacts of habitat specialization, hybridization and glacial history. *Journal of*

Biogeography, **38**, 992–1005.

Savolainen, O., Pyhäjärvi, T., & Knürr, T. (2007) Gene flow and local adaptation in trees.

Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics, **38**, 595–619.

Schmidtling, R.C. (2003) The southern pines during the Pleistocene. *Acta Horticulturae*,

615, 203–209.

Schmidtling, R.C. & Hipkins, V. (1998) Genetic diversity in longleaf pine (*Pinus*

palustris): influence of historical and prehistorical events. *Canadian Journal of*

Forest Research, **28**, 1135–1145.

Shafer, A.B.A., Cullingham, C.I., Côté, S.D., & Coltman, D.W. (2010) Of glaciers and

refugia: a decade of study sheds new light on the phylogeography of northwestern

North America. *Molecular Ecology*, **19**, 4589–4621.

Shaw, J. & Small, R.L. (2005) Chloroplast DNA phylogeny and phylogeography of the

North American plums (*Prunus* subgenus *Prunus* section *Prunocerasus*,

Rosaceae). **92**, 2011–2030.

Smith, H.C. (1990) *Carya cordiformis* (Wangenh.) K. Koch. *Silvics of North America: 2.*

Hardwoods. Agricultural Handbook 654 (ed. by R.M. Burns and B.H. Honkala), US

Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Washington, DC.

Soltis, D.E., Morris, A.B., McLachlan, J.S., Manos, P.S., & Soltis, P.S. (2006)

Comparative phylogeography of unglaciated eastern North America. *Molecular*

Ecology, **15**, 4261–4293.

Stewart, J.R. & Lister, A.M. (2001) Cryptic northern refugia and the origins of the

modern biota. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, **16**, 608–613.

Thomson, A.M., Dick, C.W., & Dayanandan, S. (2015) A similar phylogeographical

structure among sympatric North American birches (*Betula*) is better explained by

introgression than by shared biogeographical history. *Journal of Biogeography*, **42**,

339–350.

Title, P.O. & Bemmels, J.B. (2017) ENVIREM: An expanded set of bioclimatic and

topographic variables increases flexibility and improves performance of ecological

niche modeling. *Ecography*, in press.

Tzedakis, P.C., Emerson, B.C., & Hewitt, G.M. (2013) Cryptic or mystic? Glacial tree

refugia in northern Europe. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, **28**, 696–704.

Watterson, G.A. (1975) On the number of segregating sites in genetical models without

recombination. *Theoretical Population Biology*, **7**, 256–276.

Williams, J.W. (2002) Variations in tree cover in North America since the last glacial

maximum. *Global and Planetary Change*, **35**, 1–23.

Willing, E.M., Dreyer, C., & van Oosterhout, C. (2012) Estimates of genetic

differentiation measured by F_{ST} do not necessarily require large sample sizes when

using many SNP markers. *PLoS ONE*, **7**, 1–7.

Willis, K.J. & Van Andel, T.H. (2004) Trees or no trees? The environments of central

and eastern Europe during the Last Glaciation. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **23**,

2369–2387.

Zinck, J.W.R. & Rajora, O.P. (2016) Post-glacial phylogeography and evolution of a

wide-ranging highly-exploited keystone forest tree, eastern white pine (*Pinus*

strobus) in North America: single refugium, multiple routes. *BMC Evolutionary*

Biology, **16**, 56.

Data accessibility

SNP datasets and species occurrence records are available for download from the

Dryad Digital Repository (DOI: XXXXX).

Biosketches

Jordan Bemmels is interested in biogeography of temperate and tropical trees and this

work is part of his PhD thesis. Christopher Dick is his thesis advisor, and is broadly

interested in tropical tree biogeography and evolution.

Author contributions: J.B.B. and C.W.D. conceived the project; J.B.B. performed

fieldwork and labwork, and analyzed the data; J.B.B. wrote the manuscript with input

from C.W.D.

Figure 1. Membership of (a) *Carya cordiformis* and (b) *Carya ovata* populations in

genetic clusters (different colours on pie charts; *K* = 2) identified using FASTSTRUCTURE

(Raj et al., 2014)*.* The geographic distribution of each species is shown in grey (Little,

1971), and the sample size (n) of each population is proportional to the size of the pie

chart. Note that optimal *K* = 1-2, but *K* = 1 is not shown as all individuals of each

species would belong to the same genetic cluster.

Figure 2. Genetic diversity vs. latitude for populations of *Carya cordiformis* (a-c) and

Carya ovata (d-f). Statistically significant relationships are portrayed as solid lines, and

marginally significant relationships as dashed lines.

Figure 3. Mantel test showing isolation by distance in (a) *Carya cordiformis* and (b)

Carya ovata. Each dot represents a pair of populations and the y-axis is a measure of

genetic differentiation between populations.

Figure 4. Clustering of individuals along the first and second principal component (PC)

axes of genetic variation in (a) *Carya cordiformis* and (b) *Carya ovata.* Each dot

represents a single individual, and colours correspond to the geographic location of the

individual (shown in the inset map of eastern North America). Note that the Texas

population (TX) of *C. ovata* discussed in the manuscript is represented by the pink dots

in the upper left corner of (b).

Figure 5. Species distribution models showing predicted habitat suitability (grey to

green colour scale) for (a, c) *Carya cordiformis* and (b, d) *Carya ovata*, in both (a-b) the

current time period and (c-d) the Last Glacial Maximum (ca. 21.5 ka). Glaciated areas

are shown in blue.