A catalog of microbial genes from the bovine rumen reveals the determinants of herbivory

Junhua Li[1, 2, 3], Huanzi Zhong[1, 2], Yuliaxis Ramayo-Caldas[4, 5], Nicolas Terrapon[6, 7], Vincent Lombard[6, 7], Gabrielle Potocki-Veronese[8], Jordi Estellé[4], Milka Popova[9], Ziyi Yang[1, 2], Hui Zhang[1, 2], Fang Li[1, 2], Shanmei Tang[1, 2], Weineng Chen[1], Bing Chen[1, 2], Jiyang Li[1], Jing Guo[1, 2], Cécile Martin[9], Emmanuelle Maguin[10], Xun Xu[1, 2], Huanming Yang[1, 11], Jian Wang[1, 11], Lise Madsen[1,12, 13], Karsten Kristiansen[1, 13*], Bernard Henrissat[6, 7, 13], Stanislav D. Ehrlich[14, 15*], Diego P. Morgavi[9*]

[1]BGI-Shenzhen, Shenzhen 518083, China. [2]China National GeneBank, BGI-Shenzhen, Shenzhen 518120, China. [3]School of Bioscience & Bioengineering, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou, China. [4]INRA, Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique, Génétique Animale et Biologie Intégrative, AgroParisTech, Université Paris-Saclay, 78350, Jouy-en-Josas, France. [5]Animal Breeding and Genetics Program, Institute for Research and Technology in Food and Agriculture (IRTA), Torre Marimon, Caldes de Montbui, 08140, Spain. [6]CNRS UMR 7257, Aix-Marseille University, 13288 Marseille, France. [7]INRA, USC 1408 AFMB, 13288 Marseille, France. [8]LISBP, Universite de Toulouse, CNRS, INRA, INSA, 31077, Toulouse, France. [9]INRA, UMR Herbivores, Université Clermont Auvergne, VetAgro Sup, F-63122 Saint-Genès Champanelle, France. [10]INRA, Micalis Institute, AgroParisTech, Université Paris-Saclay, 78350, Jouy-en-Josas, France. [11]James D. Watson

22   Institute of Genome Sciences, Hangzhou 310058, China. [12]Laboratory of Genomics and

Molecular Biomedicine, Institute of Marine Research (IMR), Postboks 1870 Nordnes, 5817

24   Bergen, Norway. [13]Laboratory of Genomics and Molecular Biomedicine, Department of

Biology, University of Copenhagen, 2100 Copenhagen Ø, Denmark. [13]Department of

26   Biological Sciences, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia. [14]MGP

MetaGenoPolis, INRA, Université Paris-Saclay, 78350 Jouy en Josas, France, [15]Centre for

28   Host Microbiome Interactions, Dental Institute, King's College London, UK.

30   *Corresponding authors:

Diego Morgavi (diego.morgavi@inra.fr); Stanislav Ehrlich (stanislav.ehrlich@inra.fr);

32   Karsten Kristiansen (kk@bio.ku.dk)

34   **Running title**: Gene catalog of the rumen microbiome

Keywords: rumen; metagenome; herbivory; carbohydrate-active enzymes

ABSTRACT

The rumen microbiota is a unique feature of ruminants and thorough knowledge of the genetic potential of rumen symbiotic microbes provides opportunities for improving the sustainability of ruminant production systems. Using deep metagenome sequencing we identified 13,825,880 non-redundant prokaryote genes from the bovine rumen and constructed 324 high quality metagenomic species. These metagenomic species were prevalent in the rumen of 77 cattle fed different feeds whereas previously identified rumen microbial genomes were less abundant. Compared to human, pig and mouse gut metagenome catalogs, the rumen is richer in functions and microbial species associated to the degradation of plant cell wall material and production of methane. Genes coding for enzymes that deconstruct plant polysaccharides showed a particularly high richness that is otherwise impossible to infer from available genomes or shallow metagenomics sequencing. These data bring new insights on functions, enzymes and microbes of the rumen, critical to understand phenotypes and biological processes.

INTRODUCTION

Ruminant production contributes to livelihood and to food and nutritional security in many regions of the world. Milk and meat from ruminants are important sources of protein and micronutrients in the human diet but often criticized as unsustainable because of the low conversion efficiency of plant feeds into animal foods (Aiking 2014) and also due to their high environmental footprint. However, when the feed conversion efficiency of protein and energy contained in milk and meat is calculated based on the ingestion of human-inedible protein and energy the output is higher that the input, particularly in forage-based production systems (Gill et al. 2010; Ertl et al. 2016). The transformation of feeds, not suitable for human consumption, into highly nutritious protein and energy products is carried out by gastrointestinal symbiotic microbes, particularly those residing in ruminants' forestomach –

62   the rumen. Rumen microbes are essential for ruminants allowing them to thrive in agricultural

land not suitable for crops and to consume agricultural byproducts unfit for other livestock

64   species. The enhanced functions provided by the microbiome are key for the characteristic

adaptability and robustness of ruminants to cope with nutritional and climatic stresses

66   (Morgavi et al. 2013). Improving our understanding of the rumen microbiome provide

opportunities for knowledge-based strategies aiming at enhancing efficacy in ruminant

68   production while minimizing its negative effect on the environment. In this study, we

established a catalog of rumen prokaryotes genes that enabled us to decipher functions of the

70   microbiome, in particular the capacity to deconstruct structural carbohydrates from forages,

and we explored the effect of feed on the microbiome composition and functions.

72   ## RESULTS

Constitution of the bovine rumen prokaryotic gene catalog

74   To build a bovine rumen prokaryotic gene catalog, we collected total rumen content samples

from five Holstein cows and five Charolais bulls. To reduce the ecosystem complexity and to

76   improve metagenome assemblies, rumen ciliated protozoa were depleted from the samples

before microbial DNA extraction. A total of 1,206 Gb of raw metagenomic sequencing data

78   were generated with an average 111 Gb clean data for each animal. This sequencing depth,

much greater than that used for other gene catalogs (5-10 Gb per sample (Li et al. 2014; Xiao

80   et al. 2015; Xiao et al. 2016)) was necessary to enable the assembly of the more complex

rumen microbiome. After *de novo* assembly, open reading frames (ORF) prediction and

82   removal of redundancy, 13,825,880 non-redundant genes were obtained with an average

length of 716 base pairs (bp) and 39% of these genes were complete ORFs (Supplementary

84   Table 1).

Figure 1. (a) Identity of current study genes compared to Hess et al. (2011). (b) Differences in gene length between studies. Green, the length of genes is longer in the current study; Blue, the length of genes is similar; Red, the length of genes is shorter in the current study. (c) Percentage of total reads in the current study (n=77 samples) in four different diet groups that could be mapped to current study gene catalog and JGI 2011 gene catalog. (d) Percentage of total reads in unrelated studies of 8 UK cattle samples that could be mapped to the current study gene catalog and JGI 2011 gene catalog.

Compared to the largest rumen gene catalog published to date by Hess et al. (2011), the

86   number of non-redundant genes discovered in this study is more than 5 fold larger; shared

genes were in most cases also longer (Figure 1a & b and Supplementary Table 2). Thus, the

88   mapping reads from 77 additional rumen samples obtained in this study and eight published

rumen samples from UK cattle (Wallace et al. 2015) increased from ~10% using the previous

90   catalog(Hess et al. 2011) to ~40% (11-51%) (Figure 1 c & d). This confirms that the

representativeness of the rumen catalog has been greatly improved, even if the mapping

92   efficiency was relatively low, as compared to 80% for the human gut microbiome (Li et al.

2014).

94   **Comparison of gastrointestinal microbiomes: bovine rumen versus Human, pig and**

mouse

96   Genes were taxonomically classified using CARMA3 (Gerlach and Stoye 2011) and

compared to genes from human, mouse and pig gut catalogs (Li et al. 2014; Xiao et al. 2015;

98   Xiao et al. 2016). Up to 42.7% of rumen genes could be annotated to known phyla. This

value is similar to pig gut (41.3%) but lower than the human (55.9%) and mouse gut

100   metagenomes (59.6%) (Supplementary Figure 1 and Supplementary Table 3). Firmicutes and

Bacteroidetes were predominant in all catalogs representing 84-94% of assigned genes and in

102   accord with the expected gastrointestinal-associated microbial communities in mammals. For

the rumen, however, the proportion of Firmicutes and that of Bacteroidetes was lower and

104   higher, respectively, than for the other three catalogs. Other enriched phyla (>2%) in the

rumen catalog were the Spirochaetes, Proteobacteria, Euryarchaeota, Actinobacteria and

106   Fibrobacteres that, with the exception of Proteobacteria, were more abundant in the rumen

than in the other catalogs (Supplementary Figure 2). At the genus level, only 8.7% of rumen

108   genes could be annotated; a value similar to that of the other two animal catalogs but lower

than that of human (16.8%), reflecting a more extensive characterization of human-associated

110   microbes. However, the top 10 enriched genera in the rumen showed distinct abundance

patterns compared with the same genera in other catalogs (Supplementary Figure 3 and

112   Supplementary Table 3 & 4). These differences in symbiotic microbial genera likely reflect

dissimilarities in dietary lifestyles, anatomical localization of the gut fermentation

114   compartment and are indicative of predominant functions, i.e. methane production and plant

fiber degradation for ruminants. *Prevotella* was the most abundant rumen genus with 39% of

116   genus-annotated genes assigned. Other abundant genera were *Treponema*, *Butirivibrio*,

      Methanobrevibacter and *Ruminococcus* that were absent or at lower proportions in other

118   catalogs, particularly in human.

      Based on abundance profiles and clustering methods we identified 324 metagenomic

120   species (MGS), with an average size of 1.8 Mbp (minimum threshold of 1 Mbp; see Methods

      for more information on these MGSs). More than half (173) were medium-quality and 23

122   were high-quality drafts (>90% completion, <5% contamination) (Bowers et al. 2017). These

      rumen MGSs were also compared to pig and mouse MGSs. For the rumen, 314 were

124   annotated to the Bacteria domain and one to Archaea. For the bacterial MGSs, 44.4% could

      be annotated to the order level but only 3.7% (12 MGSs) to the genus level; 10 of these

126   belonged to *Prevotella*. The 324 MGSs were present in all four diets groups from our

      validation cohort; about 10% of reads from the 77 cattle dataset mapped to these MGSs. For

128   genomes from the Hungate 1000 project (Kelly), which are representative of the diversity of

      cultured rumen bacteria and archaea, mapping rate was 5.4%. In contrast, only 0.1% of reads

130   mapped to the metagenomic species described by Hess et al. (2011) (Supplementary Figure

      4). Only 23 MGS were similar to genomes from the Hungate 1000 project, highlighting the

132   novelty represented by our MGS as more than 90% have no close cultured representative

      (Supplementary Table 5).

134   **Carbohydrate active enzymes in the bovine rumen metagenome**

      The efficient deconstruction of structural plant polysaccharides by symbiotic gastrointestinal

136   microbes is what sets ruminants apart from other livestock species. We have therefore

      analyzed carbohydrate active enzymes (CAZymes) in the rumen ecosystem to obtain insights

138   into this important function for nutrition and health of cattle.

Glycoside hydrolases (GHs) and polysaccharide lyases (PLs) are the most relevant classes

140   of CAZymes as they orchestrate the breakdown of plant material and of diverse

polysaccharides which are encountered in the rumen ecosystem, i.e. host, fungal, and bacterial

142   glycans. GHs and PLs are classified into sequence-based families (145 GH and 26 PL

familes; www.cazy.org accessed in June 2017) that display a pronounced specificity for a

144   glycan category, thereby offering a functional readout of the degradative power of an

ecosystem. The rumen catalog reported here encodes ~290,000 GHs (97.4%) and PLs (2.6%)

146   modules, which belong to 114 distinct GHs families and 18 PLs families. In the rumen

catalog, the substrate specificity of the most abundant GH families reflects the prominent

148   glycan sources of herbivores: starch (GH13, GH77 and GH97, by decreasing abundance),

pectins and hemicelluloses (GH43, GH28, GH10, GH51, GH9 and GH78, by decreasing

150   abundance). In contrast, only one of the 15 most abundant families, namely GH25

lysozymes, targets a non-plant substrate (peptidoglycan). Additionally, three of the five most

152   abundant families (GH3, GH2 and GH5) represent enzymes active on a wide range of

substrates, not necessarily from plant origin. Two of these families (GH2 and GH3) contain

154   exo-glycosidases that act on the oligosaccharides produced by depolymerases, a broad

function that may explain their abundance.

156   Dockerins domains (DOCs) are key building blocks of cellulosomes and amylosomes

complexes. The DOC sequences are found in modular proteins and help the protein to which

158   they are appended to bind cohesin domains (COHs) found as repeats in large proteins named

scaffoldins. This system allows the spatial grouping of numerous binding and enzymatic

160   modules into large assemblies for a synergistic action of their components in the immediate

vicinity of the bacterial cell. In the rumen catalog, more than 12,000 dockerin modules were

162   identified. Intriguingly, some proteins harbored many dockerin modules, up to 13 modules in

a single sequence, without any other recognizable functional module. The function of such

164   polydockerin proteins is unknown, and polydockerin proteins were not observed in

reconstructed MGS (max. of two DOCs in a protein). In the literature, dockerin modules

166   initially detected in cellulosomes, have been investigated in relation to their co-occurrence

with CAZymes in these cellulosome complexes (Brulc et al. 2009; Turnbaugh et al. 2010).

168   Surprisingly, our analysis of the rumen catalog reveals that only ~24% of the DOC-containing

proteins carry a CAZyme domain. The remaining DOC-containing proteins were subjected to

170   a Pfam domain annotation, which identified proteases (4%) and some lipases (<0.3%), while a

third of DOC-containing proteins are attached to non-catalytic modules, likely involved in the

172   binding of these non-carbohydrate substrates. More importantly, the last third did not have

any match to any Pfam domain (Supplementary Figure 5).

174   The CAZyme profile in the rumen catalog was compared to the mouse, pig and human

reference gut catalogs (Li et al. 2014; Xiao et al. 2015; Xiao et al. 2016). Despite important

176   differences in the size of these catalogs, similar trends could be observed on, for example, the

ratio of DOCs or GHs plus PLs over the catalog size, or the most abundant GH families

178   (Supplementary Table 6). The number of distinct GHs/PLs is also very similar, and a detailed

analysis highlighted 101 GHs families common to all four catalogs, while only five GH

180   families were specific to a single catalog (Supplementary Figure 6). These specific families

were closely related to hosts' diets. In accord with herbivory, 305 GH45 cellulase modules

182   were found in the rumen catalog against none in human, mouse catalogs, and only 12 for the

pig. In contrast, we identified families GH70 and GH68, transglycosidases acting on sucrose,

184   and GH47, processing N-glycan, that are absent in the rumen but present in other catalogs.

For instance, 94, 24 and 6 GH70 modules were found in the human, pig and mouse catalogs,

186   respectively, whereas the rumen had zero occurrence.

        The specific adaptation of the rumen catalog to herbivory was confirmed by comparing its

188   GH+PL family counts against the human catalog after normalization (Figure 2). The most

enriched GH families in the rumen are involved in the degradation of plant polysaccharides

190   while the more depleted families of GHs are those degrading animal (host) glycans. These

observations are not only in accord with cattle normal diet but they are also in agreement with

192   the absence of a glycoprotein-rich mucus lining the rumen as opposed to the lower

gastrointestinal tract. Finally, we also observed that multiple DOC module duplications seem

194   to be more frequent and intense in the rumen as up to 13 DOC repeats in a single protein were

found for the rumen catalog, compared to only six in the human, four in the pig and two in the

196   mouse catalogs.

Figure 2. Enrichment or depletion of glycoside hydrolases and polysaccharide lyases in the bovine rumen as compared to human gut. Human counts were normalized to rumen catalog size before comparison.

198   CAZyme-encoding genes were also annotated in the 324 MGSs. Remarkably the most

abundant families in the MGSs are for plant cell wall breakdown and correspond closely to

200   the most abundant families in the non-redundant catalog. The CAZyme profiles of each

generated MGS were thus determined and subjected to a hierarchical clustering analysis

202   (Supplementary Figure 7) that revealed that MGSs group together roughly to their predicted

taxonomy, even despite large differences in repertoire size within each phylum. Hereafter, we

204   detailed several strategies for carbohydrate foraging that evolved in the different bacterial

phyla. Among the predicted Firmicutes, MGSs encoding cellulosomes and amylosomes

206   displayed a readily recognizable profile characterized by the presence of several DOC and

COH domains along with several GHs families containing cellulases (GH5, GH44, GH48,

208   and GH124) and amylases (GH13 with associated CBM26), respectively. We also identified

Bacteroidetes MGSs that contained a few DOC domains but, interestingly, none of these

210   MGSs appeared to contain a recognizable COH domain. The presence of dockerin domains

not associated to cohesins in Bacteroidetes MGSs was recently reported in the moose rumen

212   microbiome (Svartstrom et al. 2017). The role of the dockerins in Bacteroidetes is unclear but

the conspicuous absence of cohesins suggests that they may not be for the assembly of a *bona*

214   *fide* cellulosome or that the Bacteroidetes cohesins are so distantly related from their

clostridial counterparts that they cannot be recognized.

216   Confirming previous reports in the literature (Kaoutari et al. 2013), the largest CAZyme

repertoires dedicated to plant degradation were found among the predicted Bacteroidetes,

218   which represent the majority of the 324 reconstructed genomes. In Bacteroidetes, CAZymes

are often grouped in distinct *Polysaccharide Utilization Loci* (PULs) around *susC* and *susD*

220   marker genes to build up specific depolymerization machineries capable of deconstructing in

a synergistic manner even the most complex polysaccharides (White et al. 2014; Ndeh et al.

222   2017). In this context, it is interesting to note the clustering of families GH137 to GH143

recently shown to catalyze the breakdown of type II rhamnogalacturonan (Ndeh et al. 2017) in

224   the CAZyme profile heatmap (Supplementary Figure 7). Inspection of the predicted PULs in

the Bacteroidetes MGSs revealed the presence of degradation machineries dedicated to pectin

226   (type II rhamnogalacturonan), starch, or barley β-glucan (Supplementary Figure 8).

Other MGSs with distinctive CAZymes were those assigned to Proteobacteria and

228   Fibrobacteres that despite their small number (eight and six respectively) form tight groups.

Predicted Proteobacteria were characterized by the presence of families GH84 and GH103

230   along with an important diversity of GH13 subfamilies. In contrast, the Fibrobacteres show

the presence of several families known to degrade cellulose and β-glucans (*e.g.* GH5, GH45,

232   and GH55). Focusing on CAZymes from *Fibrobacter* spp. present in the catalogue revealed

an astonishingly strain-level diversity for this genus. We compared the CAZymes present in

234   *Fibrobacter succinogenes* type species (Suen et al. 2011) against all Fibrobacter CAZymes in

the catalog. There were 1262 hits with ≥ 90% identity to 135 of the 175 *Fibrobacter*

236   *succinogenes* CAZymes whereas only 19 of them had a 100% identity with the type strain.

Up to 465 and 375 of these genes were differentially abundant in the Holstein and Charolais

238   groups, respectively (Supplementary Table 7). Zooming on a particularly important

endoglucanase enzyme, i.e. GH45, reveals its presence in all 77 animals receiving different

240   diets. Animals harbored between 4 to 13 GH45 variants and each gene was present in 25 to

up 99% of all animals; however, the type strain, at 79%, was not the variant most commonly

242   present.

Common functions and Influence of diet on the bovine rumen microbiome

244   To investigate how different feeds affected the rumen microbiota in beef and dairy cattle we

examined beef Charolais bulls fed either a fattening diet high (n=16) or low (n=18) in starch

246   and lipids and Holstein cows fed a corn silage and concentrate diet (n=23) or grazed a natural

prairie (n=20). By using this 77-sample dataset, differences in α-diversity were observed

248   between diets at the gene level. Animals fed fresh grass had the highest α-diversity and

richness compared to other diets containing conserved feeds. Particularly, animals on

250   fattening diets had a lesser α-diversity. In contrast, the fattening diet rich in starch and PUFA

had the highest β-diversity and/or had the highest disparity in interquartile range (box in the

252   boxplot) for all indices (Figure 3). The rumen microbiome of animals fed this diet also

exhibited the highest dispersion on ordination analyses at the gene level (Supplementary

254   Figure 9). Such changes, akin to the described Anna Karenina principle (Zaneveld et al.

2017) for microbiomes, probably reflected divergences in individual microbiomes (and hosts)

256   reaction to PUFAs and may underlie a stress response to the diet.

Genes were annotated to known functions (KEGG and CAZy) and taxonomical

258   information. For functions, there were 43.3% of genes could be classified into KEGG

orthology and 2.1% assigned to feed carbohydrate degradation. A total of 5,893 unique

260   KEGG orthologs (KOs) and 45,683 unique CAZy enzymes and binding modules were

identified. Comparing the annotated genes for KEGG and CAZy functions showed a large

262   overlap among groups with 91% and 94% of shared genes, respectively (Supplementary

Figure 10). In contrast with overall gene abundance, the highest α-diversity was observed for

264   the corn silage diet group (Figure 3). To assess the functions encoded by the minimal rumen

metagenome we identified genes and KOs that were shared by all individuals in the group of

266   77 cattle. We found common sets of non-redundant genes, functions, genera and MGSs that

were shared by all 77 rumen samples (Figure 4 and Supplementary Figure 11). The core gene

268   set shared by all animals represented only <0.1% (6051 to 12075 depending on the calculation

method) of the nearly 14 M non-redundant genes in the catalog, whereas about 63% of the

270   KO functions (~3700) were shared indicating the high redundancy of genes for similar

functions. Compared to all annotated KO, this minimal KO set was significantly enriched in

272   pathways related to metabolism (amino acids, carbohydrate, nucleotides and metabolism of

cofactors and vitamins), cellular processes (motility), and genetic information processing

274   (translation) (Supplementary Figure 11b). Concerning the diversity of genera found in the

Figure 3. Effect of diet on diversity indexes of the bovine rumen microbiome. Comparison of Alpha diversity, Beta diversity and Richness at Gene (A), KO (B), CAZy (C), Genera (D) and antibiotic resistance gene (E) levels among cattle fed: dairy (red, n=23), fattening high-start (dark blue, n=16) fattening low-starch (light blue, n=18) and grazing (green, n=20) diets. * indicates P<0.05.

different groups, there was also a relatively large overlap. Out of 242 genera identified by the

278 taxonomic analysis described above, 182 (75%) were present in all four groups but only 67

(27%) were shared by all animals (Figure 4 and Supplementary Figure 10). This overlap was

280 maximal for MGSs identified in this study, which were present in virtually all individuals

(Figure 4). The presence of common functions may explain the plasticity of the microbiota

282 and adaptability of ruminants to digest various types of feeds even after sudden dietary

changes. To get a better understanding of the functional changes induced by diet in these

284 microbial communities we analyzed the abundance of genes in the 77-sample dataset for

functions, genera and MGS. To avoid possible confounding effect of breed and sex, the

286 differential abundance analysis was performed within each breed. For Holstein, greater

changes in the relative abundance of genes were observed; ~43% difference in KEGG and

288 CAZy functions (Supplementary Table 8 and Supplementary Figure 12 a & b). For CAZy,

146 catabolic families exhibited indeed differences in abundance between the corn silage and

290 grazing groups (Supplementary Figures 12a and 13, Supplementary Table 9). Most of the

differences related to functions were due to increases in the relative abundance of genes in

292 cows fed the corn silage diet rather than the presence of different genes. Notwithstanding, the

greatest contrast was observed for families targeting fructans and sucrose that were more

294 abundant in the grazing group. Particularly for family GH32 ($P = 7.6E-12$) whose higher

abundance could be related to the high contents of sucrose and fructans in grasses

296 (Ghasempour et al. 1998; Vijn and Smeekens 1999) included in the grazing diet. The other

CAZy families differing in abundance were all more abundant in the corn silage-diet group.

298 Interestingly, these results highlight the ability of ruminal bacteria to be equally capable of

using glycans from plants as well as from microbial origin such as bacterial peptidoglycans,

300 bacterial exopolysaccharides and fungal cell walls. Corn silage, the main constituent of the

diet, is a fermented feed with an abundant epiphytic microbiota composed of

Figure 4. Size of the shared microbiome features among cattle (n= 77) fed four different diets for the number of genes (black), genera (orange), phyla (purple), MGSs (blue), KEGG pathways (red), and CAZy (green). The percentages of shared items and animals are represented on the y and x axes, respectively. The absolute numbers for each item are indicated at the intercept between the percentages of items and animals at the thresholds of 50, 90 and 100%. Only ~1% of genes were shared by 90% of the cattle, whereas close to 80% of KO and CAZy functions were shared by 90% of the cattle, suggesting gene redundancy for similar functions. To note the presence of most MGSs assembled in this work in 90% of the cattle.

302   exopolysaccharide-producing lactic acid bacteria, fungi and yeasts (Storm et al. 2010; Cheli et

al. 2013). Accordingly, the CAZome of the corn silage-diet group was oriented towards

304   degradation of starch, a nutrient abundant in corn silage and practically absent in the grazing

diet. Forty-two CAZy families targeting plant cell wall polysaccharides were also

306   overabundant in the corn silage-diet group. This could reflect the diversity of fiber structures

that ruminal bacteria have to face when cows are fed with such a diversified diet in terms of

308   plant fractions and botanical origins (whole corn plant and soybean meal in the corn silage

diet against a natural prairie, composed predominantly of grasses in the grazing diet). Finally,

310   the overabundance of CAZy families targeting animal glycans in the silage-fed cohort was

striking since no glycoprotein-rich mucus is secreted in the bovine rumen as opposed to the

312   lower gastrointestinal tract (Hoorens et al. 2011). It is possible that this difference reflects

that CAZy families targeting animal glycans harbor numerous enzymes that are not fully

314   characterized and may be able to act on plant or even fungal glycans, which contain a panel of

osidic constituents that are very similar to that of animal glycans. Enzyme promiscuity may

316   indeed confer metabolic flexibility and an ecological advantage to certain microbes in the gut

ecosystem.

318   For genera and MGSs, up to 44% (106 genera) and 58% (188 MGSs) of the total detected

were differently abundant in the microbial communities of the two cows' groups

320   (Supplementary Table 10). *Fibrobacter* and *Ruminoccocus* were more abundant in the corn

silage diet group whereas *Prevotella*, *Butyrivibrio* and *Methanobrevibacter* were more

322   abundant in the grazing group.

For Charolais on fattening diets differing in starch content, less than 5% differences were

324   observed in the abundance of genes for functions or genera. Only eight CAZy families

exhibited differences in abundance between the two Charolais groups, the differences in

326   abundances being less significant than for the Holstein groups ($p > 0.004$) (Supplementary

Figures 12a and 13, Supplementary Table 9). The absence of marked variations in the

328   abundance of glycoside-degrading enzymes between the two fattening diets reflects indeed

their similar composition. The differences in starch content was not great enough to

330   drastically impact the carbohydrate harvesting functions of the ruminal microbiota, at least at

the gene level. Similarly, smaller differences in the abundance of genera and MGSs were

332   detected between these two diets (Supplementary Table 8, Supplementary Figure 12d).

Metadata collected on the Holstein and Charolais animals were analyzed using a vector

334   fitting method on the top of the bidimensional NMDS ordination (Supplementary Table 11).

Diet had a significant effect on metagenome gene distribution, particularly in the Holstein

336   group ($r^2 = 0.68$, P = 0.0001), but also variables such as live weight, feed intake and rumen

volatile fatty acids were significant. Protozoal numbers were also a significant variable

338   explaining the distribution of genes in the metagenome of animals, underpinning their

importance as key members of the rumen ecosystem and modulators of the prokaryotic

340   community.

Antibiotic resistance genes

342   We evaluated the presence of antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) in the rumen gene catalogue

as previously reported (Xiao et al. 2016). Forty-two ARGs encoding resistance to 27

344   antibiotics were detected in the catalog. The most abundant resistances were to tetracycline

and bacitracin with Charolais animals harboring globally a higher proportion of these genes

346   (Supplementary Figure 14). It is noted that antibiotics as growth promoters were never used

on these animals. In both the bovine rumen and the porcine gut (Xiao et al. 2016), the most

348   abundant ARGs confer resistance to tetracycline and bacitracin. The diversity of ARG is low

compared to pig feces where resistance to up to 52 antibiotics was reported, even in farms

350   with no use of growth promoting antibiotics (Xiao et al. 2016).

DISCUSSION

352   Ruminants are extraordinary bioreactors, engineered by nature to use recalcitrant plant

biomass—a renewable resource— as feedstock for growth and for production of useful

354   products. This ability is a microbial attribute that was important in domestication and that

today has a renewed interest due to human population increases, resource scarcity and climate

356   change issues. The reference gene catalog from the rumen microbiota reported here is a

useful resource for future metagenomics studies to decipher the functions and interactions of

358   this complex ecosystem with feeds and the host animal. Comparison with human, mouse and

pig gut catalogs shows the distinct character and potential of the rumen ecosystem. As

360   opposed to the microbiome of single-stomached animals including humans, the rumen

microbiome harbors a plethora of genes coding for glycoside hydrolases (CAZymes) that

362   degrade structural polysaccharides. Information on these enzymes that deconstruct biomass

plant material and are essential for transforming recalcitrant feeds into meat and milk is also

364   useful for the design of improved processes for the biofuel industry (Weimer et al. 2009; Liao

et al. 2016).

366   The type of diet modulated as expected the abundance of genes and the metagenome profile

of individuals. However, more than 90% of genes coding for functions (KO and CAZy) were

368   shared among animals receiving different diets. This large functional diversity might be the

key that allows ruminants to feed on a variety of dietary sources and to adapt to seasonal or

370   production-imposed dietary changes. The 13.8M genes catalog produced in this work, despite

being significantly larger than gut bacterial catalogs from other species (Li et al. 2014; Xiao et

372   al. 2015; Xiao et al. 2016) does only partially cover the diversity present in the rumen

microbiome indicating the higher complexity of this ecosystem. The catalog needs to be

374   expanded with additional data, particularly the inclusion of ciliated protozoa and fungi to

reflect the overall diversity. Nevertheless, this catalog and the 324 uncultured assembled

376   genomes are an important instrument to characterize and understand the biological functions

of the rumen microbiome. This information is essential to enhance the sustainability of

378   ruminant production.

METHODS

380   This study was conducted using the animal facilities at the French National Institute for

Agricultural Research (INRA) in Theix and Bourges, France. Procedures on animals used in

382   this study complied with the guidelines for animal research of the French Ministry of

Agriculture and all other applicable National and European guidelines and regulations.

Rumen Sampling

Total rumen content samples from 10 animals used for deep sequencing metagenome were

386   taken at the experimental slaughterhouse of the INRA Centre Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes. Total

rumen content samples from 77 animals were also collected. These 77 animals, from two

388   different genetic stocks, were fed diets characteristics of beef and milk production systems.

Beef cattle, represented by Charolais breed were fed fattening diets high (n=16) and low

390   (n=18) in starch and lipids; whereas Holstein dairy cows were fed a corn silage and

concentrate diet (n=23) or grazed a natural prairie (n=20) (Supplementary Table 12). Rumen

392   samples from these animals were also collected at the experimental slaughterhouse except for

the grazing group. Cows from this latter group were fitted with rumen cannula and samples

394   were taken from live animals.

Sample handling and DNA extraction

396   The 10 rumen samples used for deep sequencing were depleted from eukaryotes using

washing and centrifugation steps. Rumen contents were filtered through a 400 µm nylon

398   monofilament mesh. The filtrate was centrifuged at 300 g, 5 min to decant protozoa and the

supernatant (fraction A) was stored at 4 °C. Fifty grams from the filtered rumen content

400   retentate were mixed with 100 ml of anaerobic phosphate saline buffer (PBS), mixed

manually for 5 min by gentle inversion, centrifuged at 300 g, 5 min to decant protozoa and the

402   supernatant, passed through a 100-µm filter (fraction B), was stored at 4 °C. The pellet was

mixed with 75 ml anaerobic, ice-chilled 0.15% Tween 80 in PBS and incubated on ice for 2.5

404   h to detach microbes attached to feed particles. At the end of the incubation, contents were

vortexed for 15 s and centrifuged at 500 g, 15 min. The supernatant (fraction C) was mixed

406   with fraction B and 50 ml of fraction A and centrifuged at 20,000 g, 20 min, 4 °C. The

supernatant was decanted and the microbial pellet was exposed to an osmotic shock to lyse

408   any remaining eukaryote (mainly protozoal) cells followed by an endonuclease treatment.

Briefly, the pellet was suspended in water (Millipore Waters Milli Q purification unit) and

410   incubated for 1 h at room temperature followed by DNase treatment (Benzonase, Novagen) as

described (Hunter et al. 2011). The suspension was filtered through a 10 µm monofilament

412   textile, collected by centrifugation as before, suspended in an appropriate volume of PBS and

stored at -80 °C until DNA extraction. DNA was extracted following the method described

414   by Yu and Morrison (2004). Samples from 77 animals were extracted directly from whole

rumen contents using the same extraction method.

416   **DNA library construction and sequencing**

Paired-end (PE) metagenomic libraries were constructed and sequenced following Illumina

418   HiSeq2000's instruction. Quality control and bovine DNA removal (by aligning reads to *Bos*

taurus genome Btau_4.0 (Elsik et al. 2016)) for each sample were independently processed

420   using MOCAT pipeline as previously described (Kultima et al. 2012). On average, 111.3 Gb

of high-quality bases was generated for each of the 10 deep sequencing samples and 3.43 Gb

422   (median ~2.5 Gb) for each of the 77 samples (Supplementary Table 12). The averaged

proportion of high-quality bases among all raw bases from each sample was 92.29%.

424   **Public data use**

Three public rumen microbial datasets used in this study include: (i) a cow rumen microbiome

426   sequenced at DOE's Joint Genome Institute (JGI) in 2011 (JGI 2011), which consists of

268 Gb of metagenomics sequences, 2,547,270 predicted genes and 15 uncultured microbial

428   genomes assembled from the cow rumen (Hess et al. 2011) (NCBI accession number

SRA023560), (ii) 8 rumen metagenomics samples from beef steers (Wallace et al. 2015)

430   (European Bioinformatics Institute (EBI), PRJEB10338), (iii) 409 reference rumen microbial

genome sequences and one rumen metagenomic dataset from the Hungate1000 Project

432   (Kelly) (Supplementary Table 13) (Integrated Microbial Genomes (IMG), JGI Proposal Id:

        612 / 300816).

434   Three public gut microbial gene datasets from human[1] (GigaDB, doi:10.5524/100064),

        mouse (Xiao et al. 2015) (GigaDB, doi:10.5524/100114) and pig (Xiao et al. 2016) (EBI,

436   PRJEB11755) were also collected.

Construction of the rumen microbial gene catalog

438   High quality reads from 10 deep sequenced samples were processed in MOCAT toolkit

        (Kultima et al. 2012) including de novo individual assembly (SOAPdenovo v1.06 (Li et al.

440   2010), -K 47). The assembled contigs with length equal to or greater than 100 bp were

        followed by gene prediction (MetaGeneMark (Zhu et al. 2010), –M 100 –A) and redundant

442   genes were removed (CD-HIT (Li and Godzik 2006), $\geq$ 95% identity and $\geq$ 90% overlap),

        resulting in a non-redundant rumen microbial gene catalog containing 13,825,880 genes

444   (Supplementary Table 1).

Evaluation of current rumen microbial gene catalog

446   To assess the representative of our rumen gene catalog, we used the largest rumen gene

        catalog published to date by Hess, et al.(Hess et al. 2011). First, the genes with gaps were

448   filtered as follows: genes were broken when meet '*N*' base, a subset for each interrupted gene

        was obtained, retaining only the longest sub-gene as representative of the original gene. A

450   total of 2.46 M genes without gaps were obtained, termed 'JGI-2011-gene-catalog' and used

        for following analysis (Supplementary Table 2).

452   Further, 13.83 M genes from current study and 2.46 M genes from JGI were pooled

        together to identify shared genes using CD-HIT (Li and Godzik 2006). The comparison of

454   gene length between the two catalogs was conducted as previously described (Li et al. 2014).

Gene catalog annotation

456   Taxonomic assignments of genes from rumen, mouse, pig and human guts were performed

using CARMA3(Gerlach and Stoye 2011) on the basis of BLASTP (Altschul et al. 1990) (

458   V2.2.24) against the NCBI-NR database (v20130906 for rumen, mouse, pig guts; v20160219

for human gut) (Supplementary Table 3). Microbiotas from these four species were compared

460   at different taxonomic levels. Functional annotation based on Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes

and Genomes (KEGG) database was performed using an in-house pipeline (Li et al. 2014).

462   Annotation of the carbohydrate-active enzymes (CAZymes) of each catalog was performed by

comparing the predicted protein sequences to those in the CAZy database and to Hidden

464   Markov models (HMMs) built from each CAZy family (Lombard et al. 2014), following a

procedure previously described for other metagenomics analyses (Svartstrom et al. 2017). In

466   order to allow a direct comparison of the results, annotation of antibiotic resistance genes

(ARGs) was done as previously reported in the pig metagenome catalogue (Xiao et al. 2016)

468   by using the ARDB database (Liu and Pop 2009).

Construction relative abundance profiles of genes, KOs, ARG and CAZY enzymes

470   The gene profiles of 77 rumen samples were generated by aligning high-quality clean reads to

the current 13.83M gene catalogue (SOAP2, ≥95% identity) (Qin et al. 2012). Gene relative

472   abundance was estimated as described previously (Qin et al. 2010). The relative abundance

of each KEGG orthologous group (KO), ARGs and CAZy enzyme was calculated from the

474   abundance of its genes (Li et al. 2014).

Characterization of total and minimal metagenome

476   We computed the total and shared number of genes, KO and CAZy functions present in

random combinations of n individuals (with n=2 to 77, 100 replicates per bin) (Qin et al.

478   2010). Furthermore, we used a permutation test to identify the second-level KEGG functions

that were significantly enriched or depleted in the minimal KO set compared with the total

480   KO set. We first calculated the contribution of second-level functions using the following

formula:

482    $p_{ij} = \frac{f_{ij}}{\sum_j f_{ij}}, P_j = \frac{\sum_i p_{ij}}{N}$

Where f_{ij} is the number of second level function j from the KO i ; p_{ij} is the relative

484   contribution of second level function j in the KO i ; N is the number of KO in the KO set; P_j is

the relative contribution of function j in the KO set.

486   Randomly sampling 999 times in all annotated KO set, simulated the distribution of each

function. Calculating the position of this function contribution ratio of minimal KO set under

488   the distribution of all annotated KO set. A p value of less than 0.01 was regarded as

significant (Supplementary Figure 11b).

490   **Construction of metagenomic species (MGS) and taxonomic assignment**

To recover the draft bacterial and archaeal genomes from the 10 deep sequenced samples, we

492   developed an in-house pipeline that comprises three steps as indicated in **Supplementary**

Figure 18 and described below.

494   *1. Construction of Scaftig-Linkage Groups (SLGs)*

We generated a scaftig abundance profile by aligning high-quality clean reads from 77

496   rumen samples to assembled scaftigs from samples (Qin et al. 2012). Scaftig relative

abundance was determined using the same method for gene abundance (Qin et al. 2012). The

498   highly co-abundance correlated scaftigs from each deep sequencing sample were binned into

scaftig-linkage groups (SLGs) using the previous pipeline (Qin et al. 2012) with modified

500   parameters as follows, an edge was assigned between two scaftigs sharing Pearson correlation

coefficient > 0.7 and the minimum edge density between a join was set as 0.99. A total of

502   745 preliminary SLGs with length > 1Mbp were generated for further analysis.

2. Filtering of Preliminary SLGs based on GC content and assembly outputs

504   For all preliminary SLGs, we then examined their specificity by plotting the GC content

versus reads aligned depth of each scaftig. In this step, 520 SLGs containing sole GC cluster

506   were treated as 'qualified' and retained for the step 3. For the remaining 225 SLGs, 184

presented a scattered GC distribution and were discarded whereas the 41 SLGs containing

508   two or more GC clusters were further processed. First, those SLGs with scaftig N50 <2000bp

were considered as too fragmented and discarded. Then, multiple GC clusters in remaining

510   SLGs were separated by DBSCAN(M. Ester et al. 1996) (Eps<=0.10, MinPts>=49). After

splitting and filtering, we retained 55 'qualified' SLGs that had a coverage depth greater than

512   20×.

3. Reconstruction of metagenomic species

514   In order to improve the completeness and remove the redundancy of multiple metagenome

assemblies from 10 deep sequencing samples, we performed hierarchical clustering for these

516   575 qualified SLGs based on their scaftigs nucleotide identity calculated by MUMi (Deloger

et al. 2009). The MUMi distance between two SLGs (a and b) was defined as:

518
$$\text{MUMi} = \frac{1 - \dfrac{L_{unmap\ length\ of\ a} + L_{unmap\ length\ of\ b}}{L_{total\ length\ of\ a} + L_{total\ length\ of\ b}}}{M}$$

Where $M = 2 \times \min(L_{total\ length\ of\ a}, L_{total\ length\ of\ b})/(L_{total\ length\ of\ a} +$

520    $L_{total\ legnth\ of\ b})$, $L_{total\ length\ of\ a}$ is the length of SLG a, and $L_{unmap\ length\ of\ a}$ is the length

of unmapped sequence compared with SLG b. The threshold for generating a species level

522   metagenomic species (MGS) at 0.54 for MUMi as previously suggested (Backhed et al.

2015). Two hundred and eighteen qualified SLGs could not be clustered with other SLGs and

524   were defined as singleton-MGSs. The remaining 357 qualified SLGs were clustered into 105

candidate-MGSs. We performed overlap-based assembling on the scaftigs for each of these

526 105 candidate-MGSs respectively, using Phrap with default parameters. To get reliable

contiguous sequences for each candidate-MGS, the overlaps between two scaftigs less than

528 500bp were considered as unreliable and re-broken.

The 105 reconstructed candidate-MGSs were further examined using GC patterns using the

530 same method mentioned in step 2 above. Eighty out of the 105 candidate-MGSs containing

sole GC cluster were retained as combined-MGS. The remaining 25 candidate-MGSs

532 containing two or more clusters were split into sub-MGSs using the same method mentioned

in step 2 above. In order to preserve the most comprehensive genomic information for these

534 sub-MGSs, sequences from each sub-MGS was aligned back to its original SLGs. If the sub-

MGS covered 90% or more sequences of its original SLG, it would be retained as a revised-

536 MGS. Otherwise, its original SLG will replace the corresponding sub-MCs and be considered

as a revised-MGS. This splitting step finally obtained 31 revised-MGSs.

538 After filtering the total sequence size of 218 singleton-MGSs, 80 combined-MGSs and 31

revised-MGSs with the criterion of > 1Mbp, we finally obtained 324 MGSs for rumen

540 microbiota including 224 singleton-MGSs and 100 combined-MGSs (Supplementary Table

14). We used the same pipeline described above for the gene catalog for the ORF prediction

542 and taxonomic annotation of MGS genes. We used CheckM (Parks et al. 2015) to estimate of

the completeness, contamination and heterogeneity of metagenomic species (Supplementary

544 Table 14). MGSs were assigned a taxonomic level annotation if more than 50% of its genes

were assigned at a given taxonomic level (including genes with no match) (Supplementary

546 Table 15). The MGS relative abundance of 77 rumen samples was calculated from the

relative abundance of its aligned genes.

Quality assessment and taxonomic annotation of MGSs

CheckM software (Parks et al. 2015) was used to calculate the completeness and

550 contamination of these MGSs. The median percentage of completeness was high at 62.5%

with a low, 2.6% contamination. The combined-MGSs showed higher completeness but also

552 slightly higher levels of contamination and strain heterogeneity than singleton-MGSs

(Supplementary Figures 15, Supplementary Figures 16). Taxonomic annotation for rumen

554 MGSs was performed using CARMA3 on the basis of BLASTP against the NCBI-NR

database (v20130906) and compared with MGSs from pig and mice (Supplementary Table

556 14, Supplementary Figure 17).

Cluster distribution by diet at species level

558 The relative MGS abundance profile (matrix of 324 × 77) obtained above was analyzed to

highlight differences induced by diet. As we found when coverage of a MGS is less than 0.1

560 the depth of this MGS is close to 0 (Supplementary Figure 19). This result is caused by the

noise and non-conducive to the MGS clustering. Therefore, when the coverage value was less

562 than this threshold value, then we set the value of depth equal to 0.

Ordination and differentially abundance analyses

564 Breed and diet distribution were visualized in ordination analyses based on two-dimensional

non-metric multidimensional scaling (Shepard 1962). Dissimilarity between pairs of samples

566 was calculated using Bray–Curtis dissimilarity index (Bray and Curtis 1957). Vegan R

package (Oksanen et al. 2016) was also employed to estimate the diversity indexes

568 corresponding to richness, alpha (Shannon index) and beta diversity (Whittaker). The '*envfit*'

function of Vegan was used to determine whether phenotype information corresponding to the

570 77 samples contribute to the overall pattern of the rumen microbiome structure. The

significance of the environmental factors was assessed after 9999 permutations.

572   The relative abundance of the 13,825,880 non-redundant genes was collapsed into

taxonomic (Phylum and Genus) and functional levels (KEEG and CAZy). Procrustes rotation

574   analysis was performed to compare the ordinations obtained at different levels. Identified

KOs were mapped to KEGG and visualized using the Interactive Pathway Explorer (iPath2.0)

576   web-based tool (Yamada et al. 2011). To estimate a core, the overlapping number of Genus,

CAZy and KOs between Holstein and Charolais breeds was compared.

578   To avoid confounding factors such as: sex, breed and age, the differentially abundance

analysis was performed within breeds. Therefore, for each breed, diet comparison was done

580   based on a Zero-Inflated Gaussian mixture model as implemented in the fitZig function of the

metagenomeSeq R package (Paulson et al. 2013). Correction for multiple testing was done,

582   and the cut-off of the differential abundance was set at FDR $\leq$ 0.05.

DATA ACCESS

584   Metagenomic sequencing data generated in this study have been deposited in EBI database

under the accession code PRJEB23561. The data of assembled scaftigs, the rumen gene catalog,

586   the rumen MGS catalog, and the abundance profile tables generated in this study have been

deposited in *GigaScience Database* (doi: to be completed).

588   Note: accession numbers are in process.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

590   This work had the financial support of Animal Physiology and Livestock Systems Division of

INRA, the INRA metaprogramme Meta-omics of Microbial Ecosystems (MEM), and BGI-

592   Shenzhen. This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China

(No.31601073), the Shenzhen Municipal Government of China (No.

594   JSGG20160229172752028), the Shenzhen Key Laboratory of Human commensal

microorganisms and Health Research (No.CXB201108250098A). The work on CAZy was supported by a European Union's Seventh Framework Program (FP/2007/2013)/European Research Council (ERC) Grant Agreement 322820 to BH. Work by Metagenopolis was supported from grant ANR-11-DPBS-0001. YRC's salary was funded by the European Union, in the framework of the Marie-Curie FP7 COFUND People Programme, through the award of an AgreenSkills' fellowship (grant number 267196) linked to the MEM METALIT project.

The authors acknowledge technical support for animal care, sampling and analytical measures on live animals provided by the personnel at INRA's experimental units of Herbipôle (P. Faure and D. Roux) and Bourges, and the Herbivores research unit (Y. Rochette, F. Anglard, and B. Sepchat). Particular thanks to D. Graviou for DNA extraction and biochemical analysis.

We thank the direction of INRA divisions Microbiology and Food Chain, Animal Genetics, and Science for Food and Bioproduct Engineering for their support. We also thank E. Forano, and M. Naves (INRA) for helpful discussions during the setup of the project.

Author contributions

JL, HZ, SDE, and DPM designed the work and managed the project. JL and HZ designed the analyses, and analyzed and interpreted the sequencing data. JL, HZ, SDE, GPV, BH, NT, VL, YRC, JE, and DPM wrote the manuscript. GPV, BH, NT, and VL conducted data analysis on CAZy and were involved in the interpretation of data. YRC and JE conducted integrative data analysis, implemented ARG analysis and were involved in the interpretation of data. MP and CM were involved in the implementation of animal studies, samples and metadata collection. ZY, HZ, ST, and FL performed data analyses, constructed and annotated the MGS catalog. WC, BC, and JLI performed data analyses, constructed and annotated the

gene catalog. JG contributed to the experimental development and discussion for filtering

620   rumen samples. MP, EM, XX, HY, LM, and JW contributed to text revision and discussion.

KK interpreted the data, revised the paper. DPM coordinated the project. All authors

622   approved the submitted versions and agree to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

DISCLOSURE DECLARATION

624   The authors declare no competing financial interests.

REFERENCES

626   Aiking H. 2014. Protein production: planet, profit, plus people? *Am J Clin Nutr* **100**: 483S-489S.

628   Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. 1990. Basic local alignment search tool. *J Mol Biol* **215**: 403-410.

630   Backhed F, Roswall J, Peng Y, Feng Q, Jia H, Kovatcheva-Datchary P, Li Y, Xia Y, Xie H, Zhong H et al. 2015. Dynamics and stabilization of the human gut microbiome during
632   the first year of life. *Cell Host Microbe* **17**: 690-703.

Bowers RM, Kyrpides NC, Stepanauskas R, Harmon-Smith M, Doud D, Reddy TBK, Schulz
634   F, Jarett J, Rivers AR, Eloe-Fadrosh EA et al. 2017. Minimum information about a single amplified genome (MISAG) and a metagenome-assembled genome (MIMAG)
636   of bacteria and archaea. *Nat Biotech* **35**: 725-731.

Bray JR, Curtis JT. 1957. An ordination of the upland forest communities of southern
638   Wisconsin. *Ecol Monogr* **27**: 325-349.

Brulc JM, Antonopoulos DA, Miller ME, Wilson MK, Yannarell AC, Dinsdale EA, Edwards
640   RE, Frank ED, Emerson JB, Wacklin P et al. 2009. Gene-centric metagenomics of the fiber-adherent bovine rumen microbiome reveals forage specific glycoside hydrolases.
642   *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* **106**: 1948-1953.

Cheli F, Campagnoli A, Dell'Orto V. 2013. Fungal populations and mycotoxins in silages:
644   From occurrence to analysis. *Anim Feed Sci Tech* **183**: 1-16.

Deloger M, El Karoui M, Petit MA. 2009. A genomic distance based on MUM indicates
646   discontinuity between most bacterial species and genera. *J Bacteriol* **191**: 91-99.

Elsik CG, Unni DR, Diesh CM, Tayal A, Emery ML, Nguyen HN, Hagen DE. 2016. Bovine
648   Genome Database: new tools for gleaning function from the Bos taurus genome. *Nucl Acids Res* **44**: D834-D839.

650   Ertl P, Knaus W, Zollitsch W. 2016. An approach to including protein quality when assessing the net contribution of livestock to human food supply. *Animal* **10**: 1883-1889.

652   Gerlach W, Stoye J. 2011. Taxonomic classification of metagenomic shotgun sequences with CARMA3. *Nucl Acids Res* **39**: e91-e91.

654 Ghasempour HR, Gaff DF, Williams RPW, Gianello RD. 1998. Contents of sugars in leaves of drying desiccation tolerant flowering plants, particularly grasses. *Plant Growth*
656 *Regul* **24**: 185-191.

Gill M, Smith P, Wilkinson JM. 2010. Mitigating climate change: the role of domestic
658 livestock. *Animal* **4**: 323-333.

Hess M, Sczyrba A, Egan R, Kim TW, Chokhawala H, Schroth G, Luo S, Clark DS, Chen F,
660 Zhang T et al. 2011. Metagenomic discovery of biomass-degrading genes and genomes from cow rumen. *Science* **331**: 463-467.

662 Hoorens PR, Rinaldi M, Li RW, Goddeeris B, Claerebout E, Vercruysse J, Geldhof P. 2011. Genome wide analysis of the bovine mucin genes and their gastrointestinal
664 transcription profile. *BMC Genomics* **12**: 1-12.

Hunter SJ, Easton S, Booth V, Henderson B, Wade WG, Ward JM. 2011. Selective removal
666 of human DNA from metagenomic DNA samples extracted from dental plaque. *J Basic Microbiol* **51**: 442-446.

668 Kaoutari AE, Armougom F, Gordon JI, Raoult D, Henrissat B. 2013. The abundance and variety of carbohydrate-active enzymes in the human gut microbiota. *Nat Rev*
670 *Microbiol* **11**: 497-504.

Kelly B. The HUNGATE1000. A catalogue of reference genomes from the rumen
672 microbiome. Vol 2016.

Kultima JR, Sunagawa S, Li J, Chen W, Chen H, Mende DR, Arumugam M, Pan Q, Liu B,
674 Qin J et al. 2012. MOCAT: a metagenomics assembly and gene prediction toolkit. *PLoS One* **7**: e47656.

676 Li J, Jia H, Cai X, Zhong H, Feng Q, Sunagawa S, Arumugam M, Kultima JR, Prifti E, Nielsen T et al. 2014. An integrated catalog of reference genes in the human gut
678 microbiome. *Nat Biotech* **32**: 834-841.

Li R, Zhu H, Ruan J, Qian W, Fang X, Shi Z, Li Y, Li S, Shan G, Kristiansen K et al. 2010.
De novo assembly of human genomes with massively parallel short read sequencing. *Genome Res* **20**: 265-272.

Li W, Godzik A. 2006. Cd-hit: a fast program for clustering and comparing large sets of protein or nucleotide sequences. *Bioinformatics* **22**: 1658-1659.

Liao JC, Mi L, Pontrelli S, Luo S. 2016. Fuelling the future: microbial engineering for the production of sustainable biofuels. *Nat Rev Microbiol* **14**: 288-304.

Liu B, Pop M. 2009. ARDB--Antibiotic Resistance Genes Database. *Nucl Acids Res* **37**: D443-447.

Lombard V, Golaconda Ramulu H, Drula E, Coutinho PM, Henrissat B. 2014. The carbohydrate-active enzymes database (CAZy) in 2013. *Nucl Acids Res* **42**: D490-
D495.

M. Ester, H.-P. Kriegel, J. Sander, X. Xu. 1996. A density-based algorithm for discovering
692 clusters in large spatial databases with noise. In *Proceedings of Second International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining,* , pp. 226-231, Portland, OR.

694 Morgavi DP, Kelly WJ, Janssen PH, Attwood GT. 2013. Rumen microbial (meta)genomics and its application to ruminant production. *Animal* **7 s1**: 184-201.

696 Ndeh D, Rogowski A, Cartmell A, Luis AS, Baslé A, Gray J, Venditto I, Briggs J, Zhang X,
        Labourel A et al. 2017. Complex pectin metabolism by gut bacteria reveals novel
698   catalytic functions. *Nature* **544**: 65-70.

Oksanen J, Blanchet FG, Friendly M, Kindt R, Legendre P, McGlinn D, Minchin PR, R. B.
700   O'Hara, Simpson GL, Solymos P et al. 2016. vegan: Community Ecology Package. R
        package version 2.4-1. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=vegan.

702 Parks DH, Imelfort M, Skennerton CT, Hugenholtz P, Tyson GW. 2015. CheckM: assessing
        the quality of microbial genomes recovered from isolates, single cells, and
704   metagenomes. *Genome Res* **25**: 1043-1055.

Paulson JN, Stine OC, Bravo HC, Pop M. 2013. Differential abundance analysis for microbial
706   marker-gene surveys. *Nat Meth* **10**: 1200-1202.

Qin J, Li R, Raes J, Arumugam M, Burgdorf KS, Manichanh C, Nielsen T, Pons N, Levenez
708   F, Yamada T et al. 2010. A human gut microbial gene catalogue established by
        metagenomic sequencing. *Nature* **464**: 59-65.

710 Qin J, Li Y, Cai Z, Li S, Zhu J, Zhang F, Liang S, Zhang W, Guan Y, Shen D et al. 2012. A
        metagenome-wide association study of gut microbiota in type 2 diabetes. *Nature* **490**:
712   55-60.

Shepard RN. 1962. The analysis of proximities: Multidimensional scaling with an unknown
714   distance function. I. *Psychometrika* **27**: 125-140.

Storm IM, Kristensen NB, Raun BM, Smedsgaard J, Thrane U. 2010. Dynamics in the
716   microbiology of maize silage during whole-season storage. *Journal of Applied
        Microbiology* **109**: 1017-1026.

718 Suen G, Weimer PJ, Stevenson DM, Aylward FO, Boyum J, Deneke J, Drinkwater C,
        Ivanova NN, Mikhailova N, Chertkov O et al. 2011. The complete genome sequence
720   of *Fibrobacter succinogenes* S85 reveals a cellulolytic and metabolic specialist. *PLoS
        One* **6**.

722 Svartstrom O, Alneberg J, Terrapon N, Lombard V, de Bruijn I, Malmsten J, Dalin A-M, El
        Muller E, Shah P, Wilmes P et al. 2017. Ninety-nine de novo assembled genomes
724   from the moose (Alces alces) rumen microbiome provide new insights into microbial
        plant biomass degradation. *The ISME journal* **11**: 2538-2551.

726 Turnbaugh PJ, Quince C, Faith JJ, McHardy AC, Yatsunenko T, Niazi F, Affourtit J, Egholm
        M, Henrissat B, Knight R et al. 2010. Organismal, genetic, and transcriptional
728   variation in the deeply sequenced gut microbiomes of identical twins. *Proc Natl Acad
        Sci USA* **107**: 7503-7508.

730 Vijn I, Smeekens S. 1999. Fructan: more than a reserve carbohydrate? *Plant Physiol* **120**:
        351-360.

732 Wallace R, Rooke J, McKain N, Duthie C-A, Hyslop J, Ross D, Waterhouse A, Watson M,
        Roehe R. 2015. The rumen microbial metagenome associated with high methane
734   production in cattle. *BMC Genomics* **16**: 839.

Weimer PJ, Russell JB, Muck RE. 2009. Lessons from the cow: What the ruminant animal
736   can teach us about consolidated bioprocessing of cellulosic biomass. *Bioresour
        Technol* **100**: 5323-5331.

738 White BA, Lamed R, Bayer EA, Flint HJ. 2014. Biomass utilization by gut microbiomes.
        Annu Rev Microbiol **68**: 279-296.

740   Xiao L, Estellé J, Kiilerich P, Ramayo-Caldas Y, Xia Z, Feng Q, Liang S, Pedersen AØ, Kjeldsen NJ, Liu C et al. 2016. A reference gene catalogue of the pig gut microbiome.
742   *Nat Microbiol* **1**: 16161.

Xiao L, Feng Q, Liang S, Sonne SB, Xia Z, Qiu X, Li X, Long H, Zhang J, Zhang D et al.
744   2015. A catalog of the mouse gut metagenome. *Nat Biotech* **33**: 1103-1108.

Yamada T, Letunic I, Okuda S, Kanehisa M, Bork P. 2011. iPath2. 0: interactive pathway
746   explorer. *Nucl Acids Res* **39**: W412-W415.

Yu Z, Morrison M. 2004. Improved extraction of PCR-quality community DNA from digesta
748   and fecal samples. *Biotechniques* **36**: 808-812.

Zaneveld JR, McMinds R, Vega Thurber R. 2017. Stress and stability: applying the Anna
750   Karenina principle to animal microbiomes. *Nat Microbiol* **2**: 17121.

Zhu W, Lomsadze A, Borodovsky M. 2010. Ab initio gene identification in metagenomic
752   sequences. *Nucl Acids Res* **38**: e132.