Multi-Method Characterisation of the Human Circulating Microbiome

- 1 2
- **E. Whittle¹**, M.O. Leonard², R. Harrison¹, T.W. Gant² and **D.P Tonge¹**
- 3 4

⁵ ¹School of Life Sciences, Faculty of Natural Sciences, Keele University, ST5 5BG ²

- 6 Centre for Radiation, Chemical and Environmental Hazards, Public Health
- 7 England, OX11 0RQ
- 8

9 Abstract

The term microbiome describes the genetic material encoding the various microbial 10 populations that inhabit our body. Whilst colonisation of various body niches (e.g. the 11 gut) by dynamic communities of microorganisms is now universally accepted, the 12 13 existence of microbial populations in other "classically sterile" locations, including the 14 blood, is a relatively new concept. The presence of bacteria-specific DNA in the blood has been reported in the literature for some time, yet the true origin of this is 15 still the subject of much deliberation. The aim of this study was to investigate the 16 17 phenomenon of a "blood microbiome" by providing a comprehensive description of 18 bacterially-derived nucleic acids using a range of complementary molecular and 19 classical microbiological techniques. For this purpose we utilised a set of plasma 20 samples from healthy subjects (n = 5) and asthmatic subjects (n = 5). DNA-level analyses involved the amplification and sequencing of the 16S rRNA gene. RNA-21 22 level analyses were based upon the *de novo* assembly of unmapped mRNA reads and subsequent taxonomic identification. Molecular studies were complemented by 23 24 viability data from classical aerobic and anaerobic microbial culture experiments. At 25 the phylum level, the blood microbiome was predominated by Proteobacteria, 26 Actinobacteria, Firmicutes and Bacteroidetes. The key phyla detected were 27 consistent irrespective of molecular method (DNA vs RNA), and consistent with the 28 results of other published studies. In silico comparison of our data with that of the 29 Human Microbiome Project revealed that members of the blood microbiome were 30 most likely to have originated from the oral or skin communities. To our surprise, 31 aerobic and anaerobic cultures were positive in eight of out the ten donor samples investigated, and we reflect upon their source. Our data provide further evidence of a 32 33 core blood microbiome, and provide insight into the potential source of the bacterial 34 DNA / RNA detected in the blood. Further, data reveal the importance of robust 35 experimental procedures, and identify areas for future consideration.

- 36
- 37
- 38

39 Background

40 The term "microbiome" describes the genetic material encoding the various microbial 41 populations that inhabit our body. In contrast, the term "microbiota" refers to the 42 viable organisms that comprise these communities. Cell for cell, bacterial cells 43 outnumber our own cells by a factor of ten, and the bacterial microbiome encodes for 44 one hundred-fold more genes. The microbiome undertakes essential biological processes and thus it is unsurprising that a number of disease states are associated 45 with changes in microbiome composition, termed "dysbiosis". Whilst the colonisation 46 47 of specific body sites in contact with the external environment (such as the 48 gastrointestinal tract, skin and vagina) by microorganisms is both well-described and universally accepted ¹, the existence of microbial populations in other "classically 49 50 sterile" locations, including the blood, is a relatively new concept.

51

52 The presence of bacteria-specific DNA in the blood has been reported in the 53 literature for some time, yet the true origin of this is still the subject of much 54 deliberation. Mounting evidence supports the existence of a blood microbiome (specifically, the presence of bacterial genetic material) in humans ²⁻¹¹ and various 55 other species, including rodents, cats, chickens and cows ¹²⁻¹⁵. This has primarily 56 been determined by amplification and sequencing of the bacterial 16S rRNA gene, or 57 58 via whole genome sequencing. Such studies report the existence of bacteria-derived 59 genetic material (DNA) within the circulation, but do not provide evidence for the presence of viable organisms. 60

61

Convention tells us that the blood is sterile in health, and bacteraemia, even at 1 -62 10 bacterial cells per millilitre whole blood, is potentially life threatening. Despite 63 64 this, several studies have presented evidence of bacteria or bacteria-like structures 65 within the circulation in the absence of overt disease. It should be noted however that Martel and colleagues report that the bacteria-like particles often described 66 following a range of imaging techniques represent non-living membrane vesicles and 67 protein aggregates derived from the blood itself ¹⁶. McLaughlin surveyed the blood of 68 25 healthy donors and observed the presence of pleomorphic bacteria using dark-69 70 field microscopy, electron microscopy, polymerase chain reaction and fluorescent in situ hybridisation, in all samples analysed ¹⁷. Further, Potgieter and colleagues 71 72 described the presence of blood-cell associated bacteria in a range of blood preparations using electron microscopic techniques⁸. Significantly, Damgaard and 73 74 colleagues found viable (culturable) bacteria in 62% of blood donations from donors with no overt disease ¹⁸. This finding is plausible given that various daily activities 75 including chewing, tooth brushing and flossing result in the translocation of oral 76 bacteria into the bloodstream ¹⁹⁻²², however one would expect such organisms to be 77 rapidly targeted and removed with by the immune system in healthy individuals. Kell 78 79 and colleagues provide a detailed hypothesis for the existence of the blood microbiome^{4,8} and suggest that it is likely composed of organisms (or parts thereof) 80 that translocate to the circulation from their usual place of habitation (classical niches 81 82 such as the gastrointestinal tract, oral cavity, skin, vagina) - a process termed 83 atopobiosis. They further describe how this could occur via well-described 84 physiological processes including dendritic cells processes, via micro-fold cells, and 85 in disease, via dysfunctional epithelial junctions. This explanation is supported by studies demonstrating a correlation between gut microbiota dysbiosis and altered microbial signatures detected in the blood ²³⁻²⁵, suggesting that the observed 86 87

disease-associated blood microbiota is a consequence of increased bacterial translocation across the gut barrier. Furthermore, characterisation of the microbial populations in the coronary artery tissues by Lehtiniemi and colleagues ²⁶ identified known members of the oral microbiota, suggesting that bacteria had translocated from the oral cavities into the bloodstream, potentially as a result of damage caused by tooth brushing or by leakage across the mucosal surfaces.

94

Various disease states are associated with blood microbiome dysbiosis 2,6,24,25,27, 95 96 and these changes are likely reflective of dysbiosis at a distant site(s) with well-97 characterised microbial communities, and the result of subsequent translocation. 98 Limited evidence also suggests that these changes may be disease-specific; 99 Alzheimer's disease for example, has been associated with the detection of mostly 100 coccus microbes, whilst Parkinson's disease has been associated with both coccus and bacillus bacteria⁸. Such changes are of significant scientific and medical interest 101 as they offer opportunities for biomarker and therapeutic target development ^{25,27}. 102

103

104 Due to the long-held belief that the bloodstream of healthy individuals is sterile and 105 since the blood is an unfavourable compartment for the microbes due to its bacteriostatic and bactericidal components^{1,13}, it is of principal significance to 106 understand whether and how bacteria may persist in it. Accidental contamination 107 108 during the collection of blood and or during downstream experimental procedures 109 has been proposed as an alternative explanation for the existence of the blood 110 microbiome per se. We support this explanation for the detection of viable bacteria 111 within the bloodstream of healthy individuals, however, suggest that this 112 phenomenon does not adequately explain the existence of the blood microbiome 113 (the presence of bacteria-derived nucleic acids) when one considers the number of 114 studies that demonstrate significant and apparently disease-specific differences in 115 the composition of the blood microbiome. Moreover, examination of the bacterial 116 taxa reported in these studies reveal similar blood microbiota compositions across 117 the different studies, whereby Proteobacteria dominate (relative abundance values typically ranging from 85%-90%), and Firmicutes, Actinobacteria, and Bacteroidetes present to a lesser extent ^{2,7,25,28}. This suggests the existence of a core blood 118 119 120 microbiome profile that persists independent of study environment or analytical 121 methodology.

122

Using a range of complementary molecular and classical molecular biology techniques, here we characterise the human blood microbiome in unparalleled detail; at the DNA level, we amplify and sequence the 16S rRNA gene, at the RNA level, we assemble almost 500,000,000 unmapped mRNA reads and map these to known taxa, and finally, we present viability data from classical aerobic and anaerobic microbial culture experiments. Our experimental approach is detailed in Figure 1.

131 Materials and Methods

132

133 **Donor Samples**

134 Atopic asthmatic individuals (n=5) with physician-diagnosed house dust mite allergy, 135 and gender and age-matched healthy control subjects (n=5) were recruited to the 136 study via SeraLabs Limited in accordance with the following criteria (Table 1). Whole 137 blood was drawn, following alcohol cleansing of the skin surface, into EDTA 138 containing tubes and stored on ice prior to centrifugation at $1000 \times q$ to obtain the 139 plasma component. All samples were analysed anonymously, and the authors 140 obtained ethical approval (Keele University ERP3) and written informed consent to 141 utilise the samples for the research reported herein.

142

143 Table 1 – Donor population characteristics

144

- **Patient Criteria**
- Have a BMI < 30
- Be non-smokers •
- Were diagnosed with atopic asthma • during childhood
- Have severe/ poorly controlled symptoms •
- Are not on current oral steroid treatment •
- Must be allergic to house dust mite •
- Must not have diabetes, COPD, or hypertension
- 145

146

DNA-level: Meta-taxonomic Characterisation 147

148 The circulating microbiome was investigated at the DNA level by amplification and 149 sequencing of the bacterial 16S ribosomal gene using oligonucleotide primers that target variable region 4²⁹ (Table 2). Direct amplification of the V4 region was 150 151 performed using the Phusion Blood Direct kit (Thermofisher scientific) alongside a 152 negative control reaction (in which blood was replaced with molecular biology grade 153 water) that underwent the complete experimental procedure. Amplification was 154 performed in triplicate as 20µl reactions containing; 1.0 µl plasma, 10µl 2X Phusion 155 blood PCR buffer, 0.4µl Phusion Blood II DNA polymerase, 1.0 µl of each forward 156 and reverse oligonucleotide primer (10µM), and 6.6µl of UV-treated molecular 157 biology grade water. Cycling parameters were as follows; an initial 5 minutes 158 denaturation step at 98°C followed by 33 cycles of; denaturation (1 second at 98°C). 159 annealing (5 seconds at 55°C), and extension (15 seconds at 72°C), and a final extension at 72°C for 7 minutes. 160

161

162 Amplicons resulting from triplicate reactions were combined and purified using the 163 MinElute PCR purification kit (Qiagen) prior to a further 7 cycles of PCR using 164 AccuPrime Pfx SuperMix and a pair of V4 oligonucleotide primers we developed to 165 incorporate the Illumina XT adapter in preparation for sequencing (Table 2). Cycling parameters were as follows; initial denaturation for 2 minutes at 95°C followed by 7 166 cycles of; denaturation (15 seconds at 95°C), annealing (30 seconds at 55°C), and 167 168 extension (25 seconds at 68°C), and a final extension at 68°C for 10 minutes. PCR 169 products were purified using the AMPure XP magnetic beads (Agencourt) at a ratio 170 of 0.8 beads to sample (v/v), eluted in 20 μ l molecular biology grade water, and 171 quantified using the Qubit 3.0 high-sensitivity DNA kit. Amplicons were barcoded 172 using the Nextera DNA library kit, multiplexed, and sequenced using the Ilumina 173 MiSeq system with a 250bp paired-end read metric. Bioinformatic analysis was performed using QIIME³⁰ implemented as part of the Nephele 16S paired-end QIIME 174 pipeline using closed reference clustering against the SILVA database ³¹ at a 175 176 sequence identity of 99%. All other parameters remained as default.

177

178 **Table 2** – Oligonucleotide primer sequences

Primer Name	Sequence (5' – 3')	Length
V4_F	GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA	19
V4_R	GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT	20
V4_XT_F	TCGTCGGCAGCGTCAGATGTGTATAAGAGACAGGTGCCAGCMGC CGCGGTAA	52
V4_XT_R	GTCTCGTGGGCTCGGAGATGTGTATAAGAGACAGGGACTACHVG GGTWTCTAAT	54

179

180

181 RNA-level: De-novo Assembly of Unmapped RNA Reads

For the purposes of increasing our understanding of the molecular processes that 182 183 are deregulated in patients with atopic asthma, we previously performed whole 184 transcriptome sequencing on RNA extracted from each donor plasma sample (data 185 currently unpublished). Here, we hypothesised that the non-mapping (likely non-186 human) reads that often result from such analyses would represent microbial 187 community members that were present in the blood at the time of RNA extraction. To 188 this end, RNA reads were mapped to the Homo sapiens genome version hg38 using Tophat with default parameters ³². Reads failing to map to hg38 were identified from 189 190 the resulting BAM file and reads, in fastq format, extracted using bedtools 191 bamtofastq. In order to streamline our strategy, a single de novo transcriptome was 192 produced by concatenating all of the unmapped reads produced from the entire study, and assembling these using Trinity ^{'33} to form features representative of 193 194 candidate non-human genes. To increase computational efficiency, the total read 195 population was subsampled to a depth of 1M, 10M, 25M, and 100M, and the number 196 of reads that these features explained computed by building a bowtie2 index out of 197 each resulting transcriptome, and mapping the unmapped read population from each 198 sample back to it. The transcriptome assembly with the highest mapping rate was 199 used for further analysis as follows; (1) Abundance estimation - the transcriptome 200 was indexed for bowtie2 and the number of reads mapping to each feature determined for each of our donor samples using RSEM ³⁴. (2) A matrix of expression 201 202 values was produced using the abundance estimates to matrix.pl script packaged 203 with Trinity ³⁵. (3) Statistical analysis - a differential expression analysis was 204 conducted to identify candidate non-human genes that were significantly differentially expressed between the disease and disease-free donors using edgeR³⁶. (4) 205

Identification - the taxonomic identity of each assembled feature was determined
 using Kraken ³⁷ and visualised using Pavian ³⁸.

208 Classical Culture: Bacterial Viability

209 Classical microbiological culture, using a range of substrates, was carried out to 210 determine whether the human plasma samples contained any viable bacterial cells, 211 i.e. those capable of proliferation. For each sample, 250µl plasma was inoculated 212 into 9ml of brain heart infusion broth and incubated for 5 days at 37°C. For each 213 culture a negative control was generated, whereby 9ml of brain heart infusion broth 214 was inoculated with 250µl of ultra-violet sterilised distilled water and incubated for 5 215 days at 37° C. The inoculated broth was plated onto agar plates (Columbia agar + 5% 216 horse blood; CLED medium; A.R.I.A + horse blood) and incubated under either 217 aerobic (Columbia blood agar; CLED medium) or anaerobic (A.R.I.A agar) conditions 218 at 37°C for a minimum of three days. Bacterial growth was evaluated by sight, and a 219 selection of individual colonies from each plate were selected for identification by 220 total 16S gene amplification and Sanger sequencing.

223 **Results and Discussion**

224

225 **Donor Characteristics**

The donor population were all female and all "never smokers". The asthmatic population were 39.6 years in age (range 19 - 52) with a mean body mass index of 24.4 (range 21.5 - 27.8) and all had physician-diagnosed atopic asthma resulting from house dust mite allergy. The control population were 39.4 years in age (range 23 - 49) with a mean body mass index of 24.3 (range 21.0 - 26.4) and were disease-free. There were no statistically significant differences in age (P = 0.98) or BMI (P = 0.93) between the two groups **(Table 3)**.

233

Donor	Age (years)	BMI (kg/m ²)	Smoking History	Diagnosis
BRH1017873	50-60	27.8	Never	Atopic Asthma, HDM
BRH1017874	30-40	27.3	Never	Atopic Asthma, HDM
BRH1017875	40-50	23.3	Never	Atopic Asthma, HDM
BRH1017876	10-20	21.5	Never	Atopic Asthma, HDM
BRH1017877	40-50	22.3	Never	Atopic Asthma, HDM
BRH1017878	40-50	26.4	Never	Healthy
BRH1017879	20-30	21	Never	Healthy
BRH1017880	40-50	26.4	Never	Healthy
BRH1017881	40-50	24.9	Never	Healthy
BRH1017882	30-40	22.7	Never	Healthy

234 **Table 3** – Donor Population Characteristics

235

236 **DNA-level Circulating Microbiome – Community Structure**

237 The presence of bacterial DNA within the blood of our study cohort was evaluated by 238 amplification and sequencing of the 16S RNA gene variable region 4. A negative 239 experimental control sample mirrored our study samples through the entire 240 experimental procedure downstream of venepuncture. This involved using ultra-241 violet treated distilled water in replacement of human blood during PCR amplification 242 of the 16S rRNA V4 region. The negative control PCR product was then submitted to 243 all downstream applications that the human blood underwent. This included bead-244 based purification of the 16S rRNA V4 amplicons, agarose gel electrophoresis, XT-245 tagging, library preparation and sequencing of the 16S rRNA V4 amplicons. Despite 246 this control reaction being PCR-negative, it was nevertheless submitted for 247 sequencing.

248

Using QIIME³⁰ implemented as part of Nephele, a total of 243, 853 sequencing reads from the amplified V4 region passed quality assessment (mean = 24,385 reads per sample; range = 10, 742 – 35, 701 reads). The results of our taxonomic classification are shown in (**Figure 2 A-D**) at the phylum and genus levels.

253

Our negative control reaction generated a small number of reads that were identified as the following genera; *Halomonas* (6 reads), *Corynebacterium* (64), *Staphylococcus* (24), *Ralstonia* (1726), *Stenotrophomonas* (460), *Pseudomonas* 257 (276), Escherichia-Shigella (2420) and Ruminococcus (405), but was 258 overwhelmingly composed of reads mapping to the genus Serratia (18000). These 259 genera have been reported previously as contaminants of next generation sequencing experiments ^{39,40} but importantly here, were either distinct from the taxa 260 261 identified within our samples, or present at much lower levels.

At the phylum level, the blood microbiome was predominated by Proteobacteria (88% of all bacterial DNA in the control population, and 80.9% in the asthmatic population) followed by Actinobacteria (control = 7.8%, asthmatic = 7.1%), Firmicutes (control = 3.5%, asthmatic = 9.2%) and Bacteroidetes (control = 0.1%, asthmatic = 2.2%). These findings mirror previous studies 2,7,25,28 and further support the notion of a core blood microbiome predominated by four key phyla.

269

262

270 At the genus level, our blood samples were predominated by the genus Achromobacter⁴¹ which accounted for 51.1% and 45.3% of the total bacterial DNA 271 272 detected in the control and asthma donors respectively. To a lesser extent, the blood samples also comprised members of the Pseudomonas (12.8%, 7.5%) 7,9,18, 273 Serratia* (0.9%, 11.6%) ⁴², Sphingomonas (3.8%, 5.1%) ^{7,25}, Staphylococcus (5.5%, 274 2.8%) ^{7,18,43,44}, Corynebacterium (3.2%, 5.5%) ^{7,9}, and Acinetobacter (3.7%, 2.8%) 275 276 genera. The genus Serratia was excluded from further analysis as the study samples 277 presented with less reads than did the corresponding negative control reaction and 278 thus it was considered a contaminant.

279

Whilst all genera found have been previously described in the blood (see references), the predominance of *Achromobacter*, which is not classically associated with the blood microbiome, warrants further consideration. Indeed, *Achromobacter* has been detected abundantly in the lower respiratory tract of healthy mice ⁴⁵, humans (HPM airway dataset), and in various respiratory conditions ^{46,47}. Furthermore, no *Achromobacter* was detected in our experimental control reactions suggesting that its presence is not the result of experimental contamination.

287

Although differential composition of the blood microbiome in response to pathology was not the main focus of this study, we performed principal coordinates analysis and despite the relatively small sample set, this revealed good separation between the two treatment groups based upon their microbiome profile, suggesting that the blood microbiome community was altered in the asthmatic subjects (**Figure 3**).

293

294

295 **DNA-level Circulating Microbiome – Likely Origins**

296 In accordance with our hypothesis that the blood microbiome exists as a 297 consequence of bacterial translocation from other microbiome niches within the 298 body, we compared the data generated herein with gastrointestinal tract, oral cavity, 299 and skin data made available by the Human Microbiome Project (HMP). In each 300 case, the HMP data and our own were combined, weighted UniFrac distances 301 calculated, and a principal coordinates analysis performed. Figure 4 demonstrates 302 that the blood microbiome of our control and asthmatic donors clustered more 303 closely in PCoA space with the oral cavity and skin HMP data, than it did with the 304 gastrointestinal tract HMP data. This suggests that the blood microbiome community is perhaps more likely to result from the translocation of organisms from the oralcavity and skin, than from organisms that colonise the gastrointestinal tract.

307

Various daily activities including chewing, tooth brushing and flossing have been 308 shown to result in the translocation of bacteria from the oral cavity into the 309 bloodstream ¹⁹⁻²². Further, the skin has a distinct microbial community and is 310 susceptible to injury, and thus represents a large surface area through which such 311 312 organisms may translocate to the bloodstream. It is important here to consider 313 sources of contamination; venepuncture, the process through which the majority of 314 blood samples are obtained, is recognised as a cause of transient bacteraemia ⁴⁸, 315 and despite the use of preventative measures such as alcohol cleansing of the skin 316 prior to breaking the surface, there remains the possibility that organisms entered the 317 sample from the skin via this route.

318

One important, but often overlooked limitation of DNA-based microbiome characterisation is that DNA persists post-mortem, even in the presence of harsh environmental conditions. From such analyses it is therefore impossible to confirm whether an organism is present and viable, is present but non-viable, or whether the organism has since left the environment in question yet it's DNA persists.

- 324
- 325
- 326

327 RNA-level Circulating Microbiome – Community Structure

328 We hypothesise that some of the non-mapping (likely non-human) reads that often 329 result from whole transcriptome analyses (RNA-seq) represent microbial community 330 members that were present (or parts thereof) in the blood at the time of RNA extraction. Furthermore, given the unstable nature of extracellular circulatory RNA⁴⁹ 331 in addition to the presence of circulatory ribonucleases that actively degrade RNA ⁴⁷. 332 333 , we suggest that the detection of bacterial RNA goes further towards confirming the 334 recent presence of these microbes within the blood when compared with DNA-based 335 approaches. From our previous studies of the circulating transcriptome of our donor 336 community, a total of 439,448,931 paired RNA reads failed to map to the human 337 genome. These reads were used for the following analyses as randomly subsampled 338 populations of 1 million, 10 million, 25 million and 100 million read pairs. Mapping the 339 total read population back to the subsampled populations allowed us to assess how 340 well each subsampled population approximated the starting (entire, \sim 440M read) 341 population. Data revealed only marginal improvements in whole community 342 representation as the subsampled population increased (1M, 10M, 25M, 100M 343 represented 65.05, 66.05, 66.81, 64.24% of the total read population). A subsampled 344 population of 25 million reads (25M) provided an acceptable balance between read 345 representation and computational efficiency and was therefore used for 346 transcriptome assembly. The transcriptome comprised 2050 candidate "non-human 347 genes" with a mean GC content of 53%. Ten-percent of these genes were greater than 517bp, and over half were at least 263bp. Taxonomic identification of each 348 assembled feature was determined using Kraken³⁷ and this revealed that 729 of the 349 2050 features were of bacterial origin and 7 features were from archaea (pertaining 350 351 to the taxa Thermoplasmata, which has been previously associated with the human microbiome ⁵⁰) (Figure 5). Although we identified 13 features of apparent viral origin, 352 353 we did not consider these in any further detail given they appeared to pertain to the Moloney murine leukemia virus, a commonly utilised reverse transcriptase used in molecular procedures. It should be noted that the Kraken database does not include fungi, and therefore this kingdom was not represented within our data.

357 At the phylum level, the whole transcriptome data was predominated by assembled 358 Proteobacteria sequences (379 sequences, 52%), followed by Firmicutes (143, 359 19.8%), Actinobacteria (112, 15.5%) and Bacteroidetes (35, 4.8%). In considering 360 the total number of reads mapping to each feature, 379.4M reads mapped to 361 bacterial features (out of a total of 395M reads). Of those reads mapping to bacterial-362 derived sequences, Proteobacteria (74.9%, 47.0%; Control, Asthma) and Firmicutes 363 48.0%) predominated with, Actinobacteria (0.01%, 0.04%) (19.5%) and Bacteroidetes (0.05%, 0.008%) present to a much lesser extent. These findings 364 support our DNA-level phylum data and mirror previous studies ^{2,7,25,28}. 365

366

367 At the genus level, the whole transcriptome data was predominated by the genera Paenibacillus (17.8%, 44.6%; Control, Asthma reads)⁵¹, Escherichia (11.8%, 13.1%) 368 7,9,43,52 , Acinetobacter (0.7%, 0.4%) 7 , Pseudomonas (0.8%, 0.1%) 7,9,18,53 and Propionibacterium (0.5%, 0.2%) 9,18,44,53 . With the exception of Paenibacillus, all 369 370 371 genera detected via *de novo* transcriptome assembly were also present in our DNA-372 level data and all genera found have been previously described in the blood (see 373 references). The fact that *Paenibacillus* was present within our RNA-level analyses 374 yet absent from our DNA-level data led us to consider whether it could have been 375 introduced as a contaminant during the RNA extraction, library preparation or 376 sequencing procedures. Given that negative control reactions are not routinely 377 conducted for RNA-seq type applications, we were unable to experimentally confirm 378 this. However, we did identify from the literature that this genus has been reported as a common reagent and laboratory contaminant, albeit at the DNA level ⁴⁰. 379 380 Nevertheless there appeared to be little consistency in its presence within our 381 sample set (mean % of reads 39.5 ± 40.3 %) and we noted a difference in abundance 382 between our experimental groups despite all preparation procedures being the 383 same. The exact source of this RNA thus remains open to speculation. 384

385

386 **Classical Culture – Presence of Viable Organisms**

387 The presence of viable, proliferating bacteria in the blood was assessed using 388 growth culture assays as previously described. Bacterial cultures were positive for 389 80% of blood samples assayed (8 out of 10 samples; 4 control blood samples and 4 390 asthma blood samples), whilst all negative control plates had no growth as expected. 391 These results are relatively consistent with previous studies, whereby 2-100% of blood samples were positive for bacterial growth ^{18,54-57}. Unexpectedly, bacterial 392 393 growth was observed in aerobic conditions for all culture-positive blood samples, but 394 anaerobic growth was only observed for four of the culture-positive blood samples. 395 This is contradictory to previous studies, where bacterial growth from blood-cultures has predominately been achieved using anaerobic conditions ^{18,55}. 396

397

In all instances, bacterial growth was monoculture on microscopy and thus 16S
colony PCR (amplifying the entire 16S rRNA gene) and Sanger sequencing was
conducted on a three independent colonies per plate for identification purposes.
Bacteria were identified using Sanger sequencing followed by classification with
Kraken. Bacteria isolated from the aerobic cultures included the following genera;

403 Staphylococcus (49 sequences), Micrococcus (12), Kocuria (6), Corynebacterium (6) 404 and Propionibacterium (1). Bacteria isolated from the anaerobic cultures were less 405 variable and included members from the facultatively anaerobic Staphylococcus 406 genus only (Figure 6). These genera belong to the phyla Actinobacteria 407 (Corynebacterium, Kocuria, Micrococcus) and Firmicutes (Staphylococcus) and were 408 all represented in our 16S DNA level data (Figure 4) and detected within our RNA 409 data. Individual sample data is presented in (**Table 4**). It is noteworthy that, with the 410 exception of Kocuria, all bacteria identified displayed some of the highest total 411 relative abundance scores in the 16S sequencing results; Corynebacterium (4.2%), 412 Kocuria (0.2%), Micrococcus (1.30%), and Staphylococcus at 4.3%. Due to the long-413 held belief that the bloodstream of healthy individuals is sterile and since the blood is 414 an unfavourable compartment for the microbes due to its bacteriostatic and 415 bactericidal components; here we consider the likely source of these viable 416 organisms. The skin microbiome is dominated by members of the 417 genera Corynebacterium, Micrococcus, Staphylococcus, and Propionibacterium, the proportions of which vary markedly between individuals ⁵⁸. Furthermore, 418 419 several studies report the presence of the genus Kocuria on the skin of humans and other mammals ⁵⁹⁻⁶¹. We therefore suggest that the organisms detected 420 421 through our microbial culture experiments most likely originate from the skin. 422 Whilst transient bacteraemia due to a breach of the skin barrier is an accepted 423 occurrence, one would expect such organisms to be rapidly targeted and removed 424 by the immune system.

425

426 We therefore suggest that the viable organisms detected through classical 427 microbial culture analysis are the result of venepuncture contamination whereby 428 organisms from the skin are drawn into the vacutainer, contaminating the sample. 429 An alternative hypothesis suggests that these bacteria were present in the blood in 430 a dormant state (i.e. not contaminants), and were somehow revived following pre-431 growth in brain heart infusion broth prior to plating (see Kell et al for a detailed 432 description of this hypothesis ⁸), however, this hypothesis is still under intense 433 investigation. 434

Table 4 – Identification of cultured organisms using 16S colony PCR and Sanger Sequencing. Culture Neg denotes no bacterial

437 growth on the substrates used.

Growth	Control Samples				Asthma Samples				
Conditio	BRH101787 8	BRH101787 9	BRH1017880	BRH1017881	BRH101788 2	BRH1017874	BRH101787 5	BRH1017876	BRH1017877
Aerobic Growth	Kocuria rhizophila	Micrococcu s <i>luteu</i> s	Staphylococcus haemolyticus Staphylococcus epidermidis Propionibacteriu m acnes	Staphylococc us haemolyticus	Culture Neg	Staphylococc us haemolyticus	Culture Neg	Corynebacteriu m <i>halotolerans</i>	Staphylococc us epidermidis
Anaerobi c Growth	Culture Neg	Culture Neg	Staphylococcus epidermidis	Staphylococc us hominis	Culture Neg	Culture Neg	Culture Neg	Culture Neg	Staphylococc us epidermidis

446 **Concluding Remarks**

447

448 This study utilised a range of molecular and classical microbiology approaches to 449 characterise the human blood microbiome in unparalleled detail. Our DNA and RNA-450 based studies revealed a diverse community of bacteria, the main members of which 451 having been described in a range of other studies and therefore providing further 452 evidence of a core blood microbiome. Although disease associated changes in the 453 blood microbiome were not the focus of this study, the fact we identified such 454 changes is encouraging and supports efforts to identify circulating microbiome 455 signatures indicative of disease.

456

457 Whilst we attribute the finding of viable organisms in our plasma samples to 458 venepuncture-associated contamination of the blood sample (and make 459 recommendations to avoid this in future) and or the phenomena of dormancy, the 460 presence of these viable organisms does not undermine our exciting molecular data 461 that reports an abundance of bacteria-associated DNA and RNA within the blood, 462 likely present due to translocation from classical microbiome niches (such as the gut. 463 oral cavity and skin), and with the clear potential to be developed as a biomarker of 464 microbiome status at distant anatomical sites.

465

466 On reflecting upon our experimental approach, we make the following 467 recommendations for future studies;

468

(1) Significant attention should be paid to blood collection procedures as any
contamination occurring at this stage impacts upon all downstream procedures. In
addition to alcohol cleansing of the skin (as performed in this study), we recommend
that the first volume drawn is diverted to a secondary tube, and analysed separately.
This will allow investigation of the contribution that venepuncture-associated
contamination makes, and allow robust analysis of the dormancy hypothesis.

475

476 (2) The inclusion of negative control reactions that are subject to the whole range of
 477 experimental procedures, including library preparation and sequencing, is absolutely
 478 essential.

479

(3) Where possible, RNA-seq studies used for unmapped read assembly should
include negative control samples that are subject to all of the experimental
procedures alongside the study samples. This will allow an appraisal of how
significant reagent / laboratory procedure contamination is in these studies. Often the
use of RNA-seq derived unmapped reads for microbiome characterisation is a
"secondary use", and this is simply not possible.

486

487 (4) Seminal studies are still required to satisfactorily investigate the phenomenon of
 488 bacterial translocation from well-characterised microbiome niches to the blood.

- 489
- 490

491

492 Acknowledgements

- 493 This study used the Nephele platform from the National Institute of Allergy and
- 494 Infectious Diseases (NIAID) Office of Cyber Infrastructure and Computational
- Biology (OCICB) in Bethesda, MD. This article was published as a pre-print with the
- 496 following DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.1101/359760</u> 62
- 497
- 498

499Data Availability

- 500 The sequencing data utilised in this project can be found in the Sequence Read
- 501 Archive, NIH, under the identifier SUB4654957.
- 502

502	References					
503	Rele					
504						
505	1	Markova, N. D. L-form bacteria cohabitants in human blood: significance for health and				
506	2	diseases. <i>Discov Med</i> 23 , 305-313 (2017).				
507	2	Amar, J. et al. Blood microbiota dysbiosis is associated with the onset of cardiovascular				
508		events in a large general population: the D.E.S.I.R. study. <i>PLoS One</i> 8 , e54461,				
509	-	doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0054461 (2013).				
510	3	Bhattacharyya, M., Ghosh, T., Shankar, S. & Tomar, N. The conserved phylogeny of blood				
511		microbiome. <i>Mol Phylogenet Evol</i> 109 , 404-408, doi:10.1016/j.ympev.2017.02.001 (2017).				
512	4	Kell, D. B. & Pretorius, E. On the translocation of bacteria and their lipopolysaccharides				
513		between blood and peripheral locations in chronic, inflammatory diseases: the central roles				
514		of LPS and LPS-induced cell death. <i>Integr Biol (Camb)</i> 7 , 1339-1377, doi:10.1039/c5ib00158g				
515		(2015).				
516	5	Li, Q. et al. Identification and Characterization of Blood and Neutrophil-Associated				
517		Microbiomes in Patients with Severe Acute Pancreatitis Using Next-Generation Sequencing.				
518		Front Cell Infect Microbiol 8 , 5, doi:10.3389/fcimb.2018.00005 (2018).				
519	6	Mangul, S. et al. Total RNA Sequencing reveals microbial communities in human blood and				
520		disease specific effects. <i>bioRxiv</i> , doi:10.1101/057570 (2016).				
521	7	Païssé, S. et al. Comprehensive description of blood microbiome from healthy donors				
522		assessed by 16S targeted metagenomic sequencing. <i>Transfusion</i> 56, 1138-1147,				
523		doi:10.1111/trf.13477 (2016).				
524	8	Potgieter, M., Bester, J., Kell, D. B. & Pretorius, E. The dormant blood microbiome in chronic,				
525		inflammatory diseases. <i>FEMS Microbiol Rev</i> 39 , 567-591, doi:10.1093/femsre/fuv013 (2015).				
526	9	Dinakaran, V. <i>et al.</i> Elevated levels of circulating DNA in cardiovascular disease patients:				
527		metagenomic profiling of microbiome in the circulation. <i>PLoS One</i> 9 , e105221,				
528		doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0105221 (2014).				
529	10	Rajendhran, J., Shankar, M., Dinakaran, V., Rathinavel, A. & Gunasekaran, P. Contrasting				
530		circulating microbiome in cardiovascular disease patients and healthy individuals. Int J				
531		Cardiol 168 , 5118-5120, doi:10.1016/j.ijcard.2013.07.232 (2013).				
532	11	Nikkari, S., McLaughlin, I. J., Bi, W., Dodge, D. E. & Relman, D. A. Does blood of healthy				
533		subjects contain bacterial ribosomal DNA? <i>J Clin Microbiol</i> 39 , 1956-1959,				
534		doi:10.1128/JCM.39.5.1956-1959.2001 (2001).				
535	12	Vientós-Plotts, A. I. et al. Dynamic changes of the respiratory microbiota and its relationship				
536		to fecal and blood microbiota in healthy young cats. <i>PLoS One</i> 12 , e0173818,				
537		doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0173818 (2017).				
538	13	Mandal, R. K. et al. An investigation into blood microbiota and its potential association with				
539		Bacterial Chondronecrosis with Osteomyelitis (BCO) in Broilers. Sci Rep 6, 25882,				
540		doi:10.1038/srep25882 (2016).				
541	14	Sze, M. A. <i>et al.</i> Changes in the bacterial microbiota in gut, blood, and lungs following acute				
542		LPS instillation into mice lungs. PLoS One 9, e111228, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0111228				
543		(2014).				
544	15	Jeon, S. J. <i>et al.</i> Blood as a route of transmission of uterine pathogens from the gut to the				
545		uterus in cows. <i>Microbiome</i> 5 , 109, doi:10.1186/s40168-017-0328-9 (2017).				
546	16	Martel, J., Wu, C. Y., Huang, P. R., Cheng, W. Y. & Young, J. D. Pleomorphic bacteria-like				
547		structures in human blood represent non-living membrane vesicles and protein particles. Sci				
548		<i>Rep</i> 7 , 10650, doi:10.1038/s41598-017-10479-8 (2017).				
549	17	McLaughlin, R. W. <i>et al.</i> Are there naturally occurring pleomorphic bacteria in the blood of				
550	-	healthy humans? J Clin Microbiol 40, 4771-4775 (2002).				
551	18	Damgaard, C. <i>et al.</i> Viable bacteria associated with red blood cells and plasma in freshly				
552		drawn blood donations. <i>PLoS One</i> 10 , e0120826, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0120826 (2015).				

553	19	Forner, L., Larsen, T., Kilian, M. & Holmstrup, P. Incidence of bacteremia after chewing, tooth
554		brushing and scaling in individuals with periodontal inflammation. J Clin Periodontol 33 , 401-
555		407, doi:10.1111/j.1600-051X.2006.00924.x (2006).
556	20	Horliana, A. C. et al. Dissemination of periodontal pathogens in the bloodstream after
557		periodontal procedures: a systematic review. <i>PLoS One</i> 9 , e98271,
558		doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0098271 (2014).
559	21	Parahitiyawa, N. B., Jin, L. J., Leung, W. K., Yam, W. C. & Samaranayake, L. P. Microbiology of
560		odontogenic bacteremia: beyond endocarditis. <i>Clin Microbiol Rev</i> 22 , 46-64, Table of
561		Contents, doi:10.1128/CMR.00028-08 (2009).
562	22	Lockhart, P. B. <i>et al.</i> Bacteremia associated with toothbrushing and dental extraction.
563		Circulation 117 , 3118-3125, doi:10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.107.758524 (2008).
564	23	Ono, S. <i>et al.</i> Detection of microbial DNA in the blood of surgical patients for diagnosing
565		bacterial translocation. <i>World J Surg</i> 29 , 535-539, doi:10.1007/s00268-004-7618-7 (2005).
566	24	Sato, J. <i>et al.</i> Gut dysbiosis and detection of "live gut bacteria" in blood of Japanese patients
567		with type 2 diabetes. <i>Diabetes Care</i> 37 , 2343-2350, doi:10.2337/dc13-2817 (2014).
568	25	Lelouvier, B. et al. Changes in blood microbiota profiles associated with liver fibrosis in obese
569		patients: A pilot analysis. <i>Hepatology</i> 64 , 2015-2027, doi:10.1002/hep.28829 (2016).
570	26	Lehtiniemi, J., Karhunen, P. J., Goebeler, S., Nikkari, S. & Nikkari, S. T. Identification of
571		different bacterial DNAs in human coronary arteries. <i>Eur J Clin Invest</i> 35 , 13-16,
572		doi:10.1111/j.1365-2362.2005.01440.x (2005).
573	27	Ling, Z. <i>et al.</i> Blood microbiota as a potential noninvasive diagnostic biomarker for liver
574		fibrosis in severely obese patients: Choose carefully. <i>Hepatology</i> 65 , 1775-1776,
575		doi:10.1002/hep.28987 (2017).
576	28	Olde Loohuis, L. M. <i>et al.</i> Transcriptome analysis in whole blood reveals increased microbial
577		diversity in schizophrenia. <i>Transl Psychiatry</i> 8 , 96, doi:10.1038/s41398-018-0107-9 (2018).
578	29	Kozich, J. J., Westcott, S. L., Baxter, N. T., Highlander, S. K. & Schloss, P. D. Development of a
579		dual-index sequencing strategy and curation pipeline for analyzing amplicon sequence data
580		on the MiSeq Illumina sequencing platform. <i>Appl Environ Microbiol</i> 79 , 5112-5120,
581		doi:10.1128/AEM.01043-13 (2013).
582	30	Caporaso, J. G. <i>et al.</i> QIIME allows analysis of high-throughput community sequencing data.
583		Nat Methods 7, 335-336, doi:10.1038/nmeth.f.303 (2010).
584	31	Quast, C. <i>et al.</i> The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing
585		and web-based tools. <i>Nucleic Acids Res</i> 41 , D590-596, doi:10.1093/nar/gks1219 (2013).
586	32	Trapnell, C. <i>et al.</i> Differential gene and transcript expression analysis of RNA-seq
587		experiments with TopHat and Cufflinks. <i>Nat Protoc</i> 7 , 562-578, doi:10.1038/nprot.2012.016
588		(2012).
589	33	Haas, B. J. et al. De novo transcript sequence reconstruction from RNA-seq using the Trinity
590		platform for reference generation and analysis. <i>Nat Protoc</i> 8 , 1494-1512,
591	~ .	doi:10.1038/nprot.2013.084 (2013).
592	34	Li, B. & Dewey, C. N. RSEM: accurate transcript quantification from RNA-Seq data with or
593		without a reference genome. <i>BMC Bioinformatics</i> 12 , 323, doi:10.1186/1471-2105-12-323
594	25	
595	35	Grabherr, M. G. <i>et al.</i> Full-length transcriptome assembly from RNA-Seq data without a
596	26	reference genome. <i>Nat Biotechnol</i> 29 , 644-652, doi:10.1038/nbt.1883 (2011).
597	36	Robinson, M. D., McCarthy, D. J. & Smyth, G. K. edgeR: a Bioconductor package for
598		differential expression analysis of digital gene expression data. <i>Bioinformatics</i> 26 , 139-140,
599 600	77	doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btp616 (2010).
600	37	Wood, D. E. & Salzberg, S. L. Kraken: ultrafast metagenomic sequence classification using
601	20	exact alignments. <i>Genome Biol</i> 15 , R46, doi:10.1186/gb-2014-15-3-r46 (2014).
602	38	Breitwieser, F. P. & Salzberg, S. L. Pavian: Interactive analysis of metagenomics data for
603		microbiomics and pathogen identification. <i>bioRxiv</i> , doi:10.1101/084715 (2016).

604	39	Laurence, M., Hatzis, C. & Brash, D. E. Common contaminants in next-generation sequencing
605		that hinder discovery of low-abundance microbes. <i>PLoS One</i> 9 , e97876,
606		doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0097876 (2014).
607	40	Salter, S. J. et al. Reagent and laboratory contamination can critically impact sequence-based
608		microbiome analyses. <i>BMC Biol</i> 12 , 87, doi:10.1186/s12915-014-0087-z (2014).
609	41	Gyarmati, P. et al. Metagenomic analysis of bloodstream infections in patients with acute
610		leukemia and therapy-induced neutropenia. Sci Rep 6, 23532, doi:10.1038/srep23532
611		(2016).
612	42	Moriyama, K. <i>et al.</i> Polymerase chain reaction detection of bacterial 16S rRNA gene in
613		human blood. <i>Microbiol Immunol</i> 52 , 375-382, doi:10.1111/j.1348-0421.2008.00048.x
614		(2008).
615	43	Such, J. et al. Detection and identification of bacterial DNA in patients with cirrhosis and
616		culture-negative, nonneutrocytic ascites. <i>Hepatology</i> 36 , 135-141,
617		doi:10.1053/jhep.2002.33715 (2002).
618	44	Marques da Silva, R., Lingaas, P. S., Geiran, O., Tronstad, L. & Olsen, I. Multiple bacteria in
619		aortic aneurysms. J Vasc Surg 38 , 1384-1389, doi:10.1016/S0741 (2003).
620	45	Singh, N., Vats, A., Sharma, A., Arora, A. & Kumar, A. The development of lower respiratory
621	10	tract microbiome in mice. <i>Microbiome</i> 5 , 61, doi:10.1186/s40168-017-0277-3 (2017).
622	46	Hogan, D. A. <i>et al.</i> Analysis of Lung Microbiota in Bronchoalveolar Lavage, Protected Brush
623	40	and Sputum Samples from Subjects with Mild-To-Moderate Cystic Fibrosis Lung Disease.
624		<i>PLoS One</i> 11 , e0149998, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0149998 (2016).
625	47	Segal, L. N., Rom, W. N. & Weiden, M. D. Lung microbiome for clinicians. New discoveries
626	-17	about bugs in healthy and diseased lungs. Ann Am Thorac Soc 11 , 108-116,
627		doi:10.1513/AnnalsATS.201310-339FR (2014).
628	48	Depcik-Smith, N. D., Hay, S. N. & Brecher, M. E. Bacterial contamination of blood products:
629	40	factors, options, and insights. J Clin Apher 16 , 192-201 (2001).
630	49	Tsui, N. B., Ng, E. K. & Lo, Y. M. Stability of endogenous and added RNA in blood specimens,
631	45	serum, and plasma. Clin Chem 48, 1647-1653 (2002).
632	50	Lurie-Weinberger, M. N. & Gophna, U. Archaea in and on the Human Body: Health
633	50	Implications and Future Directions. <i>PLoS Pathog</i> 11 , e1004833,
634		doi:10.1371/journal.ppat.1004833 (2015).
635	51	Sáez-Nieto, J. A. <i>et al.</i> spp. isolated from human and environmental samples in Spain:
636	51	detection of 11 new species. New Microbes New Infect 19 , 19-27,
637		doi:10.1016/j.nmni.2017.05.006 (2017).
638	E 2	Francés, R. <i>et al.</i> A sequential study of serum bacterial DNA in patients with advanced
639	52	
640	53	cirrhosis and ascites. <i>Hepatology</i> 39 , 484-491, doi:10.1002/hep.20055 (2004). Bhatt, A. S. <i>et al.</i> In search of a candidate pathogen for giant cell arteritis: sequencing-based
641	55	characterization of the giant cell arteritis microbiome. Arthritis Rheumatol 66 , 1939-1944,
642		doi:10.1002/art.38631 (2014).
642 643	54	Domingue, G. J. & Schlegel, J. U. Novel bacterial structures in human blood: cultural
644 644	54	
645	FF	isolation. Infect Immun 15, 621-627 (1977).
646	55	Jiménez, E. <i>et al.</i> Isolation of commensal bacteria from umbilical cord blood of healthy
647		neonates born by cesarean section. <i>Curr Microbiol</i> 51 , 270-274, doi:10.1007/s00284-005- 0020-3 (2005).
648	ГC	
	56	Wilson, W. R., Van Scoy, R. E. & Washington, J. A. Incidence of Bacteremia in Adults Without
649 650	67	Infection. Journal of Clinical Microbiology 2 , 94-95 (1975).
650 651	57	Panaiotov, S. Cultural Isolation and Characteristics of the Blood Microbiome of Healthy
651 652	FO	Individuals. <i>Scientific Research</i> 008 , 406-421 (2018).
652	58	Tett, A. <i>et al.</i> Unexplored diversity and strain-level structure of the skin microbiome
653 654		associated with psoriasis. <i>NPJ Biofilms Microbiomes</i> 3 , 14, doi:10.1038/s41522-017-0022-5
654		(2017).

65559Cosseau, C. *et al.* Proteobacteria from the human skin microbiota: Species-level diversity and656hypotheses. One Health 2, 33-41, doi:10.1016/j.onehlt.2016.02.002 (2016).

65760McIntyre, M. K., Peacock, T. J., Akers, K. S. & Burmeister, D. M. Initial Characterization of the658Pig Skin Bacteriome and Its Effect on In Vitro Models of Wound Healing. *PLoS One* **11**,659e0166176, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0166176 (2016).

- 660 61 Grice, E. A. *et al.* A diversity profile of the human skin microbiota. *Genome Res* **18**, 1043-661 1050, doi:10.1101/gr.075549.107 (2008).
- 662 62 Whittle, E., Leonard, M., Harrison, R., Gant, T. & Tonge, D. Multi-Method Characterisation of 663 the Human Circulating Microbiome. *BioRxiv*, doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1101/359760</u> (2018).
- 664

666 Figure Legends

667

Figure 1 – Schematic representation of the multiple-method circulating microbiome
 characterisation approach implemented herein. NB: Biomarker and mechanistic data are not
 included within the scope of this publication and appear elsewhere.

671

Figure 2 – Relative abundance of the most abundant taxa (>1%) as determined by amplification and sequencing of the 16S rRNA gene variable region 4. Data are mean abundance expressed as a percentage of the total bacterial sequence count. (A) Phylumlevel data grouped by condition, (B) Genus-level data grouped by condition, (C) Phylumlevel individual sample data, (D) Genus-level individual sample data.

677

Figure 3 – Principal coordinates analysis of weighted unifrac distances for control (blue) and
 asthmatic (red) blood microbiome profiles. Each dot represents an individual sample, and
 the microbiome of samples that appear more closely together are more similar.

Figure 4 – Principal coordinates analysis of weighted unifrac distances between variable
region 4 16S sequencing data from our donors and the Human Microbiome Project (A) Gut,
(B) Oral Cavity and (C) Skin data. Each dot represents an individual sample, and the
microbiome of samples that appear more closely together are more similar. In each case,
our control donor samples appear in blue, and our asthmatic donor samples appear in red.
Further sample details are provided beneath each figure, and the number of datasets
representing each anatomic location is provided in brackets.

689

Figure 5 – Taxonomic classification of each feature assembled from unmapped RNA
 sequencing reads using Trinity and identified using Kraken. The numbers present by each
 taxonomic classification refer to the number of features classified as such (e.g. 379
 assembled features were identified as Proteobacteria). D – domain, P – phylum, F – family,
 G – genus, S – species.

695

Figure 6 – Taxonomic classification of total 16S data generated by colony PCR and Sanger
 sequencing. The numbers present by each taxonomic classification indicate the number of
 colonies that were identified with that identity. D – domain, P – phylum, F – family, G –
 genus, S – species.

- 700
- 701