Generating a sequence map of the pig pan-genome

Xiaomeng Tian[1*], Ran Li[1*], Weiwei Fu[1*], Yan Li[2*], Xihong Wang[1], Ming Li[1], Duo Du[1], Qianzi Tang[2], Yudong Cai[1], Yiming Long[1], Yue Zhao[1], Mingzhou Li[2#], Yu Jiang[1#]

[1]Key Laboratory of Animal Genetics, Breeding and Reproduction of Shaanxi Province, College of Animal Science and Technology, Northwest A&F University, Yangling 712100, China.

[2]College of Animal Science and Technology, Sichuan Agricultural University, Chengdu 611130, China.

[*]These authors contributed equally to this work.

[#]Corresponding author. E-mail: yu.jiang@nwafu.edu.cn (Y.J.) and mingzhou.li@sicau.edu.cn (M.L.).

Abstract

Pigs (*Sus scrofa*) exhibit diverse phenotypes in different breeds shaped by the combined effects of virous local adaptation and artificial selection. To comprehensively characterize the genetic diversity of pigs, we constructed a pig pan-genome by comparing 11 representative pig breeds of genome assemblies with the reference genome. Approximately 72.5 Mb non-redundant sequences were identified as "pan-sequences". On average, 41.7 kb of spurious heterozygous SNPs per individual were removed and 12.9 kb novel SNPs per individual were recovered using pan-genome, thereby providing enhanced resolution for genetic diversity of different pig populations. Analysis using Hi-C, RNA-seq data and homolog annotation indicates that these pan-sequences contain protein-coding exons and regulatory elements. Our supplied pan-sequences can further improve the interpretation of local 3D genomes. This pan-genome as well as the accompanied web-based repository will serve as a primary resource for genetic diversity exploration to promote agricultural production and biomedical research.

Introduction

Sus scrofa (i.e., pig or swine) is of enormous agricultural significance and an attractive biomedical model. Pigs were domesticated from wild boars independently in Anatolia and East Asia approximately 10,000 years ago following long-term gene flow from their local wild counterparts(Larson, et al. 2005; Groenen, et al. 2012; Frantz, et al. 2015). From domestication to modern breeding practices, the combined effects of local adaptation and human-driven artificial selection have shaped the genomes of domestic pigs. Genetic differences between diverse pig breeds underlie these extensive phenotypic variations, and to date, these variations have been interpreted largely in the context of the annotated reference genome by sequencing individual genomes and comparing reads to the reference. Guided by the most contiguous reference genome of the European domestic Duroc pig (the last assembly of Sscrofa11.1 is 2.50 Gb in length, with gaps of 29.86 Mb and 592 unplaced

scaffolds of 66.6 Mb) **(Supplementary Fig. 1)**, considerable effort has been devoted

to unravelling the genetic control of phenotypes by sequencing individual genomes

and comparing reads to the reference. Nonetheless, resequencing is limited in terms of

capturing genetic variations and assessing variations in 'missing pieces' (i.e., gap or

mis-assigned regions) of the reference genome. Alternatively, comparisons of

independently *de novo*-assembled genomes and a reference genome sequence promise

a more accurate and comprehensive understanding of genetic variation within a

species(Li, et al. 2014).

Most recently, the pan-genome, the non-redundant collection of all genomic

sequences of a species, has emerged as a fundamental resource for unlocking natural

diversity in eukaryotes. Intraspecific comparisons in plants (e.g., soybean(Li, et al.

2014), Brassica oleracea(Golicz, et al. 2016), Brachypodium distachyon(Gordon, et al.

2017) and rice(Zhao, et al. 2018)) and in animals (e.g., mosquitoes(Neafsey, et al.

2015), macaques(Yan, et al. 2011) and humans(Li, et al. 2010; Maretty, et al. 2017))

have revealed surprisingly large amounts of variation within a single genome. To

build a high-quality pan-genome, a number of individual genomes are required(Li, et

al. 2014; Monat, et al. 2017; Wong, et al. 2018); which remains an obstacle for most

mammalian species. Our previous studies generated *de novo* assemblies of ten

geographically and phenotypically representative individual pig genomes from

Eurasia with contig N50 from 57 kb to 102 kb(Li, et al. 2013; Li, et al. 2017).

Together with a previously assembled genome of one Chinese Wuzhishan boar with a

contig N50 size of 32 kb(Fang, et al. 2012), the availability of 11 individual pig

genomes has provided an unprecedented opportunity to investigate detailed genetic

differences at the individual, ethnic/breed or continental level.

To construct the pig pan-genome, we carry out an in-depth comparison between

11 *de novo* assemblies and the reference genome using an assembly-versus-assembly

approach. Furthermore, we depict the three-dimensional (3D) spatial structure of the

pan-genome using Hi-C data and reveal the characteristics of pan-sequences in A/B

compartment (generally euchromatic and heterochromatic regions) and TAD levels.

We also build a publicly available database (PIGPAN,

http://animal.nwsuaf.edu.cn/code/index.php/panPig) combined all these analysis

results for the swine community, which will serve as a fundamental resource for

unlocking variations within diverse pig breeds.

Results

Initial characterization of pan-sequences in the pig genome

To construct the pig pan-genome, we first aligned 11 assemblies from 11 diverse

breeds (five from Europe, and six from China) against Sscrofa11.1 using BLASTN to

collect the unaligned sequences **(Fig. 1a and Supplementary Fig. 2)**. The sizes of the

unaligned sequences in the Chinese pigs were clearly larger than those in the

European pigs **(Fig. 1a)**. As expected, the Wuzhishan assembly had the highest

number of sequences because this sample is the only male individual among all the 11

assemblies and can provide many Y chromosome-linked sequences. **(Fig. 1a and**

Supplementary Table 2). After removing redundant sequences, we obtained 39,744

sequences with a total size of 72.5 Mb **(Fig. 1b)**, these sequences were absent from

the reference genome and were thus defined as pan-sequences. The proportion of

repetitive elements in these sequences (45.91%) were slightly higher than that of

Sscrofa11.1 **(Fig. 1a)**. Additionally, the GC level (44.61%) was higher than that of

Sscrofa11.1 (41.5%) **(Supplementary Table 3).** We further identified 44% of the

pan-sequences as being specific to a single assembly, highlighting the limitations of

using single assemblies **(Fig. 1b)**. Most of the pan-sequences were relatively short

ranging from 300 bp to 5 kb. Nonetheless, 57.87% of the pan-sequence bases

originated from sequences that are over 5 kb in length **(Fig. 1c)**.

To validate the authenticity of the pan-sequences, we first compared these

sequences to ten mammalian genomes and found that the majority (67.5%) of the

pan-sequences had homologs in these genomes (E-value < 1e-5) **(Fig. 2a and**

Supplementary Table 4). The number of best hits between the pan-sequences and the

ten mammalian genomes were consistent with their evolutionary relationships with

most best hits identified in Cetacea **(Fig. 2a)**. To explore the potential presence or

absence of protein-coding genes within the pan-sequences, we aligned the
pan-sequences to Refseq proteins from pig, cattle, goat, human, sheep and sperm
whale using TBLASTN (e-value < 1e-5). The most significantly abundant hits were
members of the olfactory receptor family (12.4%), which is the largest gene
superfamily in vertebrates(Zhang and Firestein 2002; Nguyen, et al. 2012) followed
by other highly variable families (typically, O-methyltransferase domain-containing
proteins) **(Fig. 2b)**. Especially, 18 new and complete olfactory receptor genes were
identified (**Supplementary Fig. 3**), implying that our pan-sequences can ensure an
enriched repertoire of highly divergent gene families.

To explore whether the presence or absence of pan-sequences exhibited
population-specific characteristics, we retrieved 87 publicly available pig genomes
and aligned them to all pan-sequences. The presence of each sequence in 87
individuals from China and Europe was determined by calculating their normalized
read depth (NRD). Based on the presence of pan-sequences in the populations, all
individuals were clustered into three distinct groups corresponding to their
geographical distribution, including southern Chinese, northern Chinese and European
pigs (> 10× coverage depth) (**Fig. 2c and Supplementary Table 5**), consist with the
previously reported genetic architecture of domestic pigs(Ai, et al. 2015).

Furthermore, of the 87 pig genomes, 42 represented males, enabling us to
determine whether the pan-sequences belonged to Y chromosome-linked sequences
(Supplementary Table 5). We identified 10.43 Mb of putative Y chromosome-linked
sequences that were present in more than 90% of male individuals but absent in
females **(Supplementary Table 6)**. The distribution pattern of these Y
chromosome-linked pan-sequences revealed an Asian haplogroup which is confined
to Asia and a Eurasian haplogroup which is distributed across Eurasia. This finding is
concordant with previous reports(Guirao-Rico, et al. 2018), thus showing that we
found a substantial number of novel Y chromosome-linked sequences that are absent
in the present reference genome **(Fig. 2d)**.

To determine the potential genomic positions of the pan-sequences, we aligned

the pan-sequences to Sscrofa11.1 using their flanking sequences. Only 19.00% (7,554) of the pan-sequences could be anchored in this way (**Supplementary Table 7**). By providing pan-sequences with refined positions, the genomic annotation could be enriched and improved. A pan-sequence of 14.3 kb containing the complete genic region of *RARRES3* was revealed and validated by resequencing and expression data (**Fig. 2e**). *RARRES3* acts as a tumour suppressor or growth regulator(Shyu, et al. 2003). Another pan-sequence of 18.6 kb included six coding exons of ZNF622 that are missing in Sscrofa11.1 (**Fig. 2e**). *ZNF622* played a role in embryonic development by activating the DNA-bound *MYBL2* transcription factor(Arumemi, et al. 2013). Based on whole-genome resequencing data, this sequence showed presence/absence variations, which in turn resulted in alternative splicing variants, as evidenced by the RNA-seq data.

Constructing a more comprehensive sequence map for genomic and transcriptomic analysis

Compared with Sscrofa11.1, the genomic mapping ratio of the six samples we chose was increased by 0.29-0.43% in the pan-genome (**Fig. 3a and Supplementary Table 8**). In contrast, the mapping ratio of Sscrofa11.1 in the pan-genome was decreased by approximately 1.43%, indicating that many reads had been adjusted to better positions in the pan-sequences (**Fig. 3a**). The adjustment of many reads from Sscrofa11.1 to pan-sequences will result in better SNP calling efficacy. An average of 41,729 heterozygous SNPs per sample were depressed (**Supplementary Table 9**). Furthermore, 12,888 novel SNPs per individual were recovered using the pan-genome. The average read-mapping quality was significantly increased, and the read depth was also adjusted to the whole-genome average in the regions where spurious SNPs were removed (**Fig. 3b, c, d and Supplementary Fig. 4**).

In addition, the transcriptomic mapping quality and mapping rate were also improved based on the RNA-seq data of 92 samples (**Supplementary Figs. 5 and 6**). In total, 897 sequences containing exonic regions showed appreciable expression (FPKM ≥ 1 in at least one sample). To further assess the protein-coding potential of

pan-sequences, a total of 607 out of the 897 pan-sequences were predicted to have

coding potential by Coding Potential Calculator (CPC)(Kong, et al. 2007). For the

gene expression of pan-sequences, more expression differences were found among

tissues (Pearson's r = 0.84) than within tissues (Pearson's r = 0.91), consistent with

previous findings(Tang, et al. 2017) **(Fig. 3e and Supplementary Fig. 7)**.

Hi-C based analysis revealing the characteristics of pan-sequences regarding 3D

structures and their potential function

Adjacent loci generally demonstrated frequent interaction as determined by the

high-throughput Hi-C analysis(Dong, et al. 2017); this enabled us to anchor the

pan-sequences to Sscrofa11.1 based on the mutual interactions. Here, we generated 12

Hi-C data from 10 individuals to anchor the pan-sequences to Sscrofa11.1 by inferring

their special interactions with adjacent regions **(Supplementary Tables 10 and 11)**.

To evaluate the robustness and accuracy of Hi-C based localization, we

comprehensively investigated the anchored results from five liver Hi-C samples

digested by the MboI enzyme and another seven samples digested with HindIII

enzyme (see methods). The result indicates that the Hi-C-based localization has high

consistency and higher sequencing coverage could lead to higher localization rate

(Supplementary Fig. 8 and 9). A total of 7,554 sequences (19.0%) can be anchored

to Sscrofa11.1 by flanking sequences. Using Hi-C based approach, another 3447

sequences can be further anchored. Based on this result, at 100-kb resolution, we

found the pan-sequences are uniformly distributed in A/B compartment which are

generally euchromatic and heterochromatic regions, respectively(Dogan and Liu 2018)

(Fig. 4b). At 20-kb resolution, we found that pan-sequences were more enriched at

TAD boundary regions **(Figs. 4c)**. Notably, we found that genomic variations (SNPs

and CNVs) occurred more frequently at TAD boundary regions than at the TAD

interior regions **(Supplementary Figs. 10, 11,12 and 13),** indicating that the

occurrence of pan-sequences could be associated with genomic variations.

Based on the high read coverage of this sample (~300×), we identified 201 (5.4%)

pan-sequences which were anchored to genomic regions harbouring putative enhancer

elements. Furthermore, 47 pan-sequences were shown to contain enhancers by

demonstrating enhancer-promoter interactions with high confidence (**Supplementary**

Fig. 14). The sequences were significantly enriched in KEGG pathways including

retinol metabolism, olfactory transduction, arachidonic acid metabolism and fatty acid

degradation **(Supplementary Table 12)**. We also found that some pan-sequences

could be divergent alleles in pig genome, resulting in genomic regions of low

interaction when only the counterpart of the reference genome is provided. When the

corresponding regions of low interaction were replaced with pan-sequences, the 3D

spatial structure of the genome was significantly improved **(Fig. 4d)**. Thus,

replacement with pan-sequences will help to depict the 3D structures of the whole

genome.

Pig pan-genome database

To facilitate the use of the pig pan-genome by the scientific community, a pig

pan-genome database (PIGPAN) was constructed. PIGPAN is a comprehensive

repository of integrated genomics, transcriptomics and regulatory data. The system

diagram is shown in **Fig. 5a**. In our local UCSC Genome Browser server (Gbrowse),

17 tracks were released against the pig pan-genome (**Fig. 5b**). Users can search the

database using a gene symbol or chromosome location to obtain results in terms of

four aspects: (i) the reference genome and pan-sequence annotations, (ii) the gene

expression in 20 corresponding tissues, seven types of regulation signals

(**Supplementary Table 13**) and the conserved elements of a 20-way mammalian

alignment, (iii) the chromosome localization of pan-sequences, and (iv) the haploid

copy number of 87 pigs. We also provided basic search functions to retrieve basic

gene information, GO annotation and KEGG pathways. Here, we present one case

using PIGPAN showing the copy number difference of KIT between European and

Chinese pigs (**Fig. 5c**). Moreover, users can download data from

http://animal.nwsuaf.edu.cn/panPig/download.php. As the functions and associated

traits of more genes in the pig genome are determined in the future, our browser will

be updated regularly to meet the various needs of the scientific community.

Discussion

In this study, we have applied an assembly-versus-assembly approach utilizing twelve independent *de novo* assemblies(Fang, et al. 2012; Li, et al. 2013; Li, et al. 2017) and a large amount of whole-genome resequencing data to build a sequence map of the pig pan-genome. The *de novo* assemblies in the present study cover a wide range of diverse breeds across Eurasia and thus ensure a comprehensive discovery of the missing pan-sequences. These pan-sequences as well as the accompanied genomic variation and expression information will be a valuable resource for depicting the complete genetic makeup of porcine phenotypic and genomic diversity.

With the rapid decrease in the cost of generating high-quality *de novo* assemblies, the pan-genome strategy is becoming increasingly affordable and will soon become applicable for many other animal species. The importance of pan-genomes has been widely accepted in the field of plant genomics(Hirsch, et al. 2014; Schatz, et al. 2014; Golicz, et al. 2016; Gordon, et al. 2017; Sun, et al. 2017; Zhao, et al. 2018). The high genomic plasticity of plants can result in the complete gain/loss of a large number of genes within a species(Golicz, et al. 2016; Gordon, et al. 2017; Zhao, et al. 2018). In contrast, animal genomes are much more conserved and have longer genes with complex splicing events, which means that, generally, only intergenic or fragmented genic regions are involved in the gain/loss of genomic sequences in animals. Nonetheless, this difference does not mean that animal pan-genomes are less important. For instance, the pan-sequences that we recovered demonstrated population-specific patterns, indicating that they are potentially associated with adaptations to various environmental conditions(Li, et al. 2010; Gordon, et al. 2017). Furthermore, our research suggests that these pan-sequences can act as enhancers of some genes that regulate metabolic activity in different breeds. We also found a large number of SNPs residing in the pan-sequences, which can lead to an accurate assessment of true variations, thereby providing enhanced resolution for genetic diversity of different pig populations. The enriched genomic sequence repertoire can help in identifying causal mutations that were previously unrecognized by linkage,

association and copy-number-variation studies.

In conclusion, our study has shown that the pan-genome, when used as a reference,

can ensure a more comprehensive repertoire of genomic variations and can facilitate

downstream genomic, transcriptomic and even 3D genome analyses(Rao, et al. 2014;

Dong, et al. 2017). Therefore, we highlight the transition from the current reference

genome to the pan-genome.

Fig. 1 Construction of the pig pan-genome and the characterization of pan-sequences. a
Maximum likelihood phylogenetic tree, sequence length, GC content and repeat composition
of missing sequences identified in each individual assembly as compared with Sscrofa11.1. **b**
The total sequence length and breed-specific sequence length of each breed for non-redundant
pan-sequences. **c** Length distribution of all pan-sequences. (Wuzhishan pigs had the largest
number of sequences because this individual is the only male among all the 11 assemblies and
the sequencing platform of this individual differed from that used for other samples).

Fig 2. Pan-sequences validation and population-specific pattern. a Homolog identification

of pan-sequences in ten mammalian genomes. Only the best hit was retained for each

pan-sequence. **b** Number of hits in pan-sequences to Refseq protein families. **c** An 87 × 87

matrix showing the number of shared pan-sequences among all the individuals by pairs. Each

cell represents the number of shared pan-sequences by two individuals. See Supplemental

table 8 for the classification of each group. **d** The normalized read depth (NRD) of Y

chromosome-linked pan-sequences in each male. See Supplemental table 8 for the

classification of each group. (Only the sequences with the frequency ranging from 0.5 to 0.9

were shown.) **e** Genes contained in the pan-sequences. One pan-sequence of 14.3 kb harbour

257 the complete genic region of RARRES3, and another covers partial genic regions of ZNF622,

258 representing a new splicing event. The four tracks at the bottom represent the reads mapping

259 of whole-genome resequencing data of two samples (1-2) and the inferred exons as well as

260 their splicing isoforms based on RNA-seq (3-4).

Fig. 3 Improvements of genomic and transcriptomic analyses by using the pan-genome.

a Comparison of the mapping ratio of resequencing data using the pan-genome versus

Sscrofa11.1. **b** Comparison of read-mapping quality using the pan-genome versus Sscrofa11.1.

c Comparison of corrected read-mapping depth using the pan-genome versus Sscrofa11.1. **d**

Improved read mapping using the pan-genome versus Sscrofa11.1 as viewed with IGV. **e**

Transcriptional potential of the pan-sequences

Fig. 4 The 3D spatial structure of the pan-genome. a The distributions of the A/B

compartment, TAD and telomere the anchored pan-sequences. **b** The relative proportion of A

compartment over B compartment in length in the pig genome (left), and the relative

proportion of pan-sequences located in A compartment over those located in B compartment

in length (right).**c** The relative proportion of TAD boundary regions over TAD interior regions

in length in Sscrofa11.1 (left) and the relative proportion of pan-sequences located in TAD

boundary regions over TAD interior regions in length (right). **d** An example of improving a

3D spatial structure after replacing the weakly interacting sequences with the non-reference

pan-sequences.

Fig. 5. The processing pipeline used to construct PIGPAN. PIGPAN integrated genomics,

transcriptomics and regulatory data. Users can search a gene symbol or a genomic region to

obtain results in the form of an interactive table and graph.

Acknowledgements

284 This work was supported by research grants from the National Natural Science

285   Foundation of China (No. 31572381) to Y.J and the Science & Technology Support

286   Program of Sichuan (2016NYZ0042 and 2017NZDZX0002) to M.Z.L. We thank the

287   High Performance Computing platform of Northwest A&F University for their

288   assistance with the computing.

Author contributions

290 Y.J. and M.Z. L. conceived the project and designed the research. X.T., Y.L and M.L.

291 analysed the Hi-C data. X.T., R.L., W.F., M.L. and D.D. performed the analysis. X.T.,

292 R.L. and W.F. wrote the manuscript. Y.J, M.Z.L., X.W. revised the manuscript.

Competing interests

294 The authors declare that no competing interests exist.

Methods

Construction of the pan-genome

We downloaded the publicly available pig genome assemblies of ten female and one male individuals from 11 diverse breeds (five originated in Europe and six originated in China) **(Supplementary Fig. 2 and Table 2)**(Fang, et al. 2012; Li, et al. 2013; Li, et al. 2017). To identify the sequences which cannot align to the reference genome, we split the 11 assemblies by gap region and iteratively aligned them to the reference pig genome assembly (Sscrofa11.1) using the BLASTN(Camacho, et al. 2009). Sscrofa11.1 was masked by WindowMasker(Morgulis, et al. 2006) before alignment to speed up the alignment process. The sequences with < 90% identity and ≥ 300 bp in length were retained. After that, these low-identity sequences were aligned to each other to remove redundancy. Finally, a non-redundant set of 72.5 Mb of sequences from 11 assemblies was obtained; these sequences were defined as pan-sequences. The Duroc genome (Sscrofa11.1) plus these 72.5 Mb pan-sequences made up the pan-genome.

Characteristics of the pan-sequences

To explore whether the pan-sequences have homologous regions across species and are potential to be functional, we aligned these sequences to ten mammalian reference genomes (i.e., *Homo sapiens*, *Camelus bactrianus*, *Equus caballus*, *Canis lupus familiaris*, *Capra hircus*, *Bos Taurus*, *Orcinus orca*, *Physeter catodon*, *Balaenoptera acutorostrata scammoni*, *Tursiops truncates*) to search for any matches (*E*-value ≤ 1e-5) using BLASTN(Camacho, et al. 2009)**(Supplementary Table 4)**. Only the best hit was remained for each query.

To validate the authenticity of these pan-sequences and identify assembly-specific sequences, we aligned all of them to the each of the 11 *de novo* pig assemblies to search for any matches (≥90% coverage and ≥95% identity) using BLASTN(Camacho, et al. 2009). If the sequence of an assembly does not have a high similarity with other assemblies, this sequence is considered as the assembly-specific sequences.

Population-based resequencing and CNV calling

We downloaded the whole genome resequencing data for 71 domestic pigs and 16

wild boars for population analysis of pan-sequences. The sequences data were retrieved

from NCBI under the Bioproject PRJNA213179, PRJNA281548, PRJNA309108 and

PRJEB9922(Ai, et al. 2015; Frantz, et al. 2015; Jeong, et al. 2015; Li, et al.

2017)**(Supplementary Table5)**. After alignment using BWA (version

0.7.15-r1140)(Li and Durbin 2009) with default parameters, we used

CNVcaller(Wang, et al. 2017) to calculate the normalized read depth (NRD) of each

sequences. The presence and absence of each pan-sequence were then determined by

NRD.

ChIP-seq short-read alignment and peak calling

To confirm the content of regulatory elements in pan-sequences, we downloaded

seven ChIP-seq data from NCBI Bioproject PRJNA152995, including H3K27me3,

H3K4me1, H3K4me3, H3K9me3, NANOG, PPARD AntiX and TAF1 signals **(table**

S13)(Xiao, et al. 2012). Sequencing reads were aligned to pig pan-genome using

BWA (version 0.7.17-r1188)(Li and Durbin 2009) with default parameters.

Low-quality and multiple-mapping reads were removed using SAMtools(Li, et al.

2009) with option "-q 20". Enriched regions (or peaks) were called ($p < 1e-5$; no

filtering on fold enrichment or FDR correction) using MACS (version 2.1.1)(Zhang,

et al. 2008) with total DNA input as control.

Male-specific sequences identification

There are 42 males and 45 females in our whole genome resequencing data

(Supplementary Table 8). We compared the normalized read depth (NRD) between

females (NRD < 0.1, sample size=42) and males (0.2< NRD< 0.7, sample size=45) to

identify the putative male-specific pan-sequences. Thus, we identified 1,638

male-specific scaffolds (table S9) which were present in most all of male

individuals(frequency $\geqslant$ 50%) but absent in females(frequency = 0) with a

combined length of 10,432,972bp **(Supplementary Table 6)**.

Gene annotation and functional enrichment analysis

Homology-based and *de novo* prediction were used to annotate protein-coding genes.

For homology-based prediction, pan-sequences were aligned onto the repeat-masked

assembly using TblastN(Camacho, et al. 2009) with an *E*-value cutoff of 1e-5.

Aligned sequences as well as corresponding query proteins were then filtered and

passed to GeneWise to search for accurately spliced alignments(Doerks, et al. 2002).

For *de novo* prediction, GenScan(Burge and Karlin 1998), Augustus, and geneid were

then used to predict genes.

Annotated genes of novel sequences were analysed for Kyoto Encyclopedia of

Genes and Genomes (KEGG) terms and pathway enrichment using KOBAS(Xie, et al.

2011).

SNP calling

To verify whether using the pan-genome as reference could improve SNP calling

efficacy, we randomly selected six pig samples (ranging from 10 to 30× coverage)

(Supplementary Table 8) and mapped their clean reads to the pan-genome and

Sscrofa11.1 for comparison. Duplicate reads were removed using Picard Tools. Then,

the Genome Analysis Toolkit (GATK, version 3.6)(McKenna, et al. 2010) was used to

detect SNPs. The following criteria were applied to all SNPs: (1) Variant

confidence/quality by depth (QD) > 2; (2) RMS mapping quality (MQ) > 30.0.

RNA-seq analysis and noncoding RNA prediction

The 92 stand-specific RNA-seq data (7-10 tissue libraries for each of 10 individuals)

were downloaded from the NCBI database (Bioproject :PRJNA311523)(Li, et al.

2017). All reads were mapped to the pan-genome by HISAT2(Kim, et al. 2015).

Transcripts including novel splice variants were assembled using StringTie version

1.2.2(Pertea, et al. 2015) and the FPKM (Fragments Per Kilobase per Million mapped

reads) values for these transcripts and genes in each sample were determined using

Ballgown(Frazee, et al. 2015). Finally, transcripts with FPKM ≥ 1 in at least one

sample were retained. After assembling and quantifying all transcripts, the transcripts

of pan-sequences were used for identification of high confidence coding RNA by

Coding Potential Calculator (CPC)(Kong, et al. 2007) online.

Materials for Hi-C experiment

Liver of BH-33, BH-34, BH-35, and BH-36 were collected from four female

2-years-old Bama minipigs. Liver of F2 were collected from a 90-days-old female

fetus of Bama minipig. Ear skin fibroblasts DB-2 and DB-3 were established by using

two 12-days-old female Large White pigs. Ear skin fibroblasts XYZ were established

by using a 2-years-old female Wild Bore. Embryonic fibroblasts RC-7 and RC-8 were

established by using two 40-days-old female fetus of Chinese Rong Chang pig.

Mature adipocytes DB-2-Y and DB-3-Y were derived from pre-adipocytes which

were established by using the same pigs of Ear skin fibroblasts DB-2 and DB-3, by

inducing adipogenic differentiation.

All of the fibroblasts were grown in DMEM Dulbecco's Modified Eagle Medium

(DMEM, 11995-065, Gibco) containing 10% Fetal Bovine Serum (FBS, 10099-141,

Gibco) and 1× penicillin/streptomycin (P/S,15140-122, Gibco), incubated at 37℃ in

5% CO2.

Pre-adipocytes were cultured in 10%FBS/DMEM-F12 (11330-032, Gibco) with

1×P/S until confluence and induced to differentiation as previously described. Briefly,

two days' post-confluence, cells were exposed to differentiation medium containing

0.5 mmol/L isobutylmethylxanthine (I5879, Sigma), 1 µmol/L dexamethasone

(D2915, Sigma), 850 nmol/L insulin (I6634, Sigma), 1 µmol/L rosiglitazone (R2408,

Sigma) and 10% FBS for three days. At the end of day 3, the differentiation medium

was replaced into maintenance medium with only 850 nmol/L insulin, 1 µmol/L

rosiglitazone and 10% FBS, and replenished every other day. After the differentiation

process, at least 90% of the cells had accumulated lipid droplets at day 15, and were

used as mature adipocytes (DB-2-Y and DB-3-Y).

Hi-C experimental method

Hi-C experiment on cells were performed according to the previously published Hi-C

protocol with some minor modifications(Lieberman-Aiden, et al. 2009). Briefly, 25

million (M) cells were resuspended in 45 ml serum free DMEM, and 37%

formaldehyde was added to obtain a final concentration of 2% for chromatin

cross-linking. Cells were incubated at room temperature (20−25 °C) for 5 minutes,

then glycine was added to obtain a final concentration of 0.25 mol/L to quench the

formaldehyde. The mixture was incubated at room temperature for 5 minutes, and

subsequently on ice for at least 15 minutes. Fixed cells were lysed using a Dounce

homogenizer in the presence of cold lysis buffer (10 mmol/L Tris-HCl, pH 8.0, 10

mmol/L NaCl, 0.2% IGEPAL CA-630, and 1× protease inhibitor solution). Chromatin

digestion (restriction enzyme HindIII), labelling, and ligation steps were performed

according to the original protocol(Lieberman-Aiden, et al. 2009). After

deproteinization, removal of biotinylated free-ends, and DNA purification, Hi-C

libraries were controlled for quality and sequenced on an Illumina Hiseq X Ten

sequencer (paired-end sequencing with 150 bp in read length).

Hi-C experiment on liver tissue were performed as previously described using the

MboI restriction enzyme(Rao, et al. 2014), with minor modifications pertaining to

handling flash frozen primary tissues(Leung, et al. 2015). Briefly, 0.5 g flash frozen

liver tissue was pulverized in liquid nitrogen. Then cross-linking by 37%

formaldehyde in a final concentration of 4% and incubated at room temperature for 30

mins. Glycine was added to obtain a final concentration of 0.25 mol/L to quench the

formaldehyde. The mixture was incubated at room temperature for 5 minutes, and

subsequently on ice for at least 15 minutes. Cross-linked liver cells were filtered

through 70-μm and 40-μm nylon cell strainers and spinning down to collect the liver

cells. About 25 mg liver cell precipitate was used for Hi-C library preparation. The

Hi-C library preparation procedure was performed as previously described using the

MboI restriction enzyme(Rao, et al. 2014).

Hi-C reads mapping, filtering, and generation of contact matrices

Pre-processing paired-end sequencing data, reads mapping as well as filtering of

mapped di-tags was performed using the Juicer pipeline (v.1.8.9)(Durand, et al. 2016).

Briefly, short reads were mapped to pan-genome using BWA (version

0.7.15-r1140)(Li and Durbin 2009). Reads of low mapping quality were filtered using

Juicer with default parameters, discarding the invalid self-ligated and un-ligated

fragments, as well as PCR artefacts. Filtered di-tags were further processed with

Juicer command line tools to bin di-tags (10 kb bins) and to normalize matrices with

KR normalization(Knight and Ruiz 2013). Valid Hi-C read pairs should harbor more

intrachromosomal (cis) interactions than inter- (trans) **(Supplementary Table 11)**. To

improve resolution, we combined the Hi-C data from the same tissue of same pig

breed after we randomly extracted 20 Gb data for correlation coefficient test. We

combined Hi-C data from DB-2 and DB-3 (Pearson's r = 0.99); RC-7 and RC-8

(Pearson's r = 0.99); DB-2-Y and DB-3-Y (Pearson's r = 0.96). After combined

samples, all processes were done in all the data. Normalized interaction matrices were

generated at two resolutions of low (100 kb) and high (20 kb) respectively

(Supplementary Figure 15).

Identification of compartment A and B

Identification of compartment A/B was performed as previously described using the

100-kb interaction matrix(Lieberman-Aiden, et al. 2009). Principal component

analysis (PCA) was performed to generate the first principal component (PC1) vectors

of each chromosome, and Spearman's correlation between PC1 and genomic

characteristics (gene density and GC content) were then calculated. GC content (%)

for each bin (100-kb bin sizes) was calculated using SeqKit (v.0.8.0)(Shen, et al.

2016). Gene density (number of genes per bin) was calculated based on the number of

promoters [from -2,000 to +500 bp of transcription start site (TSS)] located in

(namely more than 50% of the region should be overlapped) each bin. Compartment A

and B were determined by the PC1 values. Bins with positive Spearman's correlation

between PC1 values and genomic features were assigned as compartment A,

otherwise B.

Identification of topologically associating domains (TADs) and topological

boundaries

Higher-resolution TAD calls were generated following the previously described

procedure by using the directionality index (DI) metric(Dixon, et al. 2012). DI was

calculated using raw interaction counts between 20-kb bins to capture observed

upstream or downstream interaction bias of genomic regions. A hidden Markov model

(HMM) was then used to predict the states of DI for final TAD generation. The same

criteria 400 kb (distance between two adjacent TADs) was used to distinguish

unorganized chromatin from topological boundaries. That is, the topological

boundaries are less than 400 kb and unorganized chromatin is larger than 400 kb.

Locating pan-sequences on Sscrofa11.1 based on Hi-C

We normalized all Hi-C matrices on the same scale by KR normalization(Knight and

Ruiz 2013), ensuring that any differences between Hi-C are not attributable to

variation in sequence length. The maximum 100-kb bin of each pan-sequence

interacted (Interaction intensity $\geqslant$ 5) was collected as the potential location of

pan-sequences. Starting with the filtered 100-kb resolution bin of pan-sequences, we

get the higher resolution interval of 20 kb by taking the maximus 20-kb bin with each

100-kb bin.

Identification of putative promoter and enhancer interactions

We kept the interactions identified by PHYCHIC(Ron, et al. 2017) with FDR < 0.01

as high confidence interactions and used them to identify promoter-enhancer

interactions (PEI). Promoter segment was determined as a region from −2,000 to

+500 bp of the transcription start site (TSS). When at least half of a promoter segment

was in either one of the two bins which involved in a chromatin interaction, this

interaction was defined as a putative promoter interaction.

The bins which are distal (at least 40 kb upstream or downstream) from the

promoter and demonstrate the strongest interaction with the promoter than other

regions were determined as the enhancer interacting with the corresponding promoter.

This interaction of the two bins corresponding to the promoter and enhancer was

defined as a potential PEI. If our pan-sequences were located on a bin harbouring an

enhancer of a PEI, the pan-sequences could be potentially involved in the regulatory

functions of the enhancer. If the pan-sequences further demonstrate interactions with

the promoter of the same PEI, the involvement of the pan-sequences in the regulatory

functions of the enhancer would be regarded as highly confident and the

pan-sequences could be a potential enhancer itself.

The pig pan-genome web server

The web interface of PIGPAN was built by combining Apache web server, PHP, HTML, JavaScript and relational database MySQL. Users can use all online resources without preregistration. Our browser can be divided into two parts: frontend and backend interfaces. The frontend consists of a home page, a download page and several search pages. The MySQL relational database server stores 16 tables including gap information, GC percent, seven regulatory signals of potential stem cells (H3K27me3, H3K4me1, H3K4me3, H3K9me3, NANOG, PPARD AntiX, TAF1), conserved elements of 20-species mammal, haploid copy number of 87 pigs, gene expression, location of pan-sequences and gene annotation. The appropriate index was built on the corresponding retrieval columns of the table. When a user submits an entry, the backend will respond quickly to execute an SQL statement. PHP and JavaScript manage the data analysis processes and visualize the results. Moreover, we have introduced web-based software such as BLAST(Camacho, et al. 2009), BLAT(Kent 2002) and Gbrowse(Casper, et al. 2018). Accordingly, users can query data with rapid visualization in Gbrowse or enter a query sequence to search for homologous regions in the genome. PIGPAN was tested in all major modern internet browsers, including Firefox, Chrome, Internet Explorer, Safari and Opera. Therefore, PIGPAN is a robust and easy-to-use website to facilitate the search for and visualization of results for pig pan-genome analyses.

Data availability

The sequencing reads of each sequencing library have been deposited at NCBI for Hi-C data (Project ID: PRJNA496307). The assembly of pig pan-genome and subsequent analysis results are available in our PIGPAN website (http://animal.nwsuaf.edu.cn/code/index.php/panPig). All other data supporting the findings of this study are available in the article and its supplementary Information files or are available from the corresponding author on request.

Ai H, Fang X, Yang B, Huang Z, Chen H, Mao L, Zhang F, Zhang L, Cui L, He W, et al. 2015.

Adaptation and possible ancient interspecies introgression in pigs identified by whole-genome

sequencing. Nat Genet 47:217-225.

Arumemi F, Bayles I, Paul J, Milcarek C. 2013. Shared and discrete interacting partners of

ELL1 and ELL2 by yeast two-hybrid assay. Advances in Bioscience and Biotechnology

04:774-780.

Burge CB, Karlin S. 1998. Finding the genes in genomic DNA. Current Opinion in Structural

Biology 8:346-354.

Camacho C, Coulouris G, Avagyan V, Ma N, Papadopoulos J, Bealer K, Madden TL. 2009.

BLAST+: architecture and applications. BMC Bioinformatics 10:421.

Casper J, Zweig AS, Villarreal C, Tyner C, Speir ML, Rosenbloom KR, Raney BJ, Lee CM,

Lee BT, Karolchik D, et al. 2018. The UCSC Genome Browser database: 2018 update.

Nucleic Acids Res 46:D762-D769.

Dixon JR, Selvaraj S, Yue F, Kim A, Li Y, Shen Y, Hu M, Liu JS, Ren B. 2012. Topological

domains in mammalian genomes identified by analysis of chromatin interactions. Nature

485:376-380.

Doerks T, Copley RR, Schultz J, Ponting CP, Bork P. 2002. Systematic identification of novel

protein domain families associated with nuclear functions. Genome Res 12:47-56.

Dogan ES, Liu C. 2018. Three-dimensional chromatin packing and positioning of plant

genomes. Nat Plants 4:521-529.

Dong P, Tu X, Chu PY, Lu P, Zhu N, Grierson D, Du B, Li P, Zhong S. 2017. 3D Chromatin

Architecture of Large Plant Genomes Determined by Local A/B Compartments. Mol Plant

10:1497-1509.

Durand NC, Shamim MS, Machol I, Rao SS, Huntley MH, Lander ES, Aiden EL. 2016.

Juicer Provides a One-Click System for Analyzing Loop-Resolution Hi-C Experiments. Cell

Syst 3:95-98.

Fang X, Mou Y, Huang Z, Li Y, Han L, Zhang Y, Feng Y, Chen Y, Jiang X, Zhao W, et al.

2012. The sequence and analysis of a Chinese pig genome. Gigascience 1:16.

Frantz LA, Schraiber JG, Madsen O, Megens HJ, Cagan A, Bosse M, Paudel Y, Crooijmans

RP, Larson G, Groenen MA. 2015. Evidence of long-term gene flow and selection during

domestication from analyses of Eurasian wild and domestic pig genomes. Nat Genet

47:1141-1148.

Frazee AC, Pertea G, Jaffe AE, Langmead B, Salzberg SL, Leek JT. 2015. Ballgown bridges

the gap between transcriptome assembly and expression analysis. Nat Biotechnol 33:243-246.

Golicz AA, Bayer PE, Barker GC, Edger PP, Kim H, Martinez PA, Chan CK, Severn-Ellis A,

McCombie WR, Parkin IA, et al. 2016. The pangenome of an agronomically important crop

plant Brassica oleracea. Nat Commun 7:13390.

Gordon SP, Contreras-Moreira B, Woods DP, Des Marais DL, Burgess D, Shu S, Stritt C,

Roulin AC, Schackwitz W, Tyler L, et al. 2017. Extensive gene content variation in the

Brachypodium distachyon pan-genome correlates with population structure. Nat Commun

8:2184.

Groenen MA, Archibald AL, Uenishi H, Tuggle CK, Takeuchi Y, Rothschild MF,

Rogel-Gaillard C, Park C, Milan D, Megens HJ, et al. 2012. Analyses of pig genomes provide

insight into porcine demography and evolution. Nature 491:393-398.

Guirao-Rico S, Ramirez O, Ojeda A, Amills M, Ramos-Onsins SE. 2018. Porcine

Y-chromosome variation is consistent with the occurrence of paternal gene flow from

non-Asian to Asian populations. Heredity (Edinb) 120:63-76.

Hirsch CN, Foerster JM, Johnson JM, Sekhon RS, Muttoni G, Vaillancourt B, Penagaricano F,

Lindquist E, Pedraza MA, Barry K, et al. 2014. Insights into the maize pan-genome and

pan-transcriptome. Plant Cell 26:121-135.

Jeong H, Song KD, Seo M, Caetano-Anolles K, Kim J, Kwak W, Oh JD, Kim E, Jeong DK,

Cho S, et al. 2015. Exploring evidence of positive selection reveals genetic basis of meat

quality traits in Berkshire pigs through whole genome sequencing. BMC Genet 16:104.

Kent WJ. 2002. BLAT—The BLAST-Like Alignment Tool. Genome Research 12:47-56.

Kim D, Langmead B, Salzberg SL. 2015. HISAT: a fast spliced aligner with low memory

requirements. Nat Methods 12:357-360.

Knight PA, Ruiz D. 2013. A fast algorithm for matrix balancing. Ima Journal of Numerical

Analysis 33:1029-1047.

Kong L, Zhang Y, Ye ZQ, Liu XQ, Zhao SQ, Wei L, Gao G. 2007. CPC: assess the

protein-coding potential of transcripts using sequence features and support vector machine.

Nucleic Acids Res 35:W345-349.

Larson G, Dobney K, Albarella U, Fang M, Matisoo-Smith E, Robins J, Lowden S, Finlayson

H, Brand T, Willerslev E, et al. 2005. Worldwide phylogeography of wild boar reveals

multiple centers of pig domestication. Science 307:1618-1621.

Leung D, Jung I, Rajagopal N, Schmitt A, Selvaraj S, Lee AY, Yen CA, Lin S, Lin Y, Qiu Y, et

al. 2015. Integrative analysis of haplotype-resolved epigenomes across human tissues. Nature

518:350-354.

Li H, Durbin R. 2009. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler

transform. Bioinformatics 25:1754-1760.

Li H, Handsaker B, Wysoker A, Fennell T, Ruan J, Homer N, Marth G, Abecasis G, Durbin R,

Genome Project Data Processing S. 2009. The Sequence Alignment/Map format and

SAMtools. Bioinformatics 25:2078-2079.

Li M, Chen L, Tian S, Lin Y, Tang Q, Zhou X, Li D, Yeung CKL, Che T, Jin L, et al. 2017.

Comprehensive variation discovery and recovery of missing sequence in the pig genome

using multiple de novo assemblies. Genome Res 27:865-874.

Li M, Tian S, Jin L, Zhou G, Li Y, Zhang Y, Wang T, Yeung CK, Chen L, Ma J, et al. 2013.

Genomic analyses identify distinct patterns of selection in domesticated pigs and Tibetan wild

boars. Nat Genet 45:1431-1438.

Li R, Li Y, Zheng H, Luo R, Zhu H, Li Q, Qian W, Ren Y, Tian G, Li J, et al. 2010. Building

the sequence map of the human pan-genome. Nat Biotechnol 28:57-63.

Li YH, Zhou G, Ma J, Jiang W, Jin LG, Zhang Z, Guo Y, Zhang J, Sui Y, Zheng L, et al. 2014.

De novo assembly of soybean wild relatives for pan-genome analysis of diversity and

agronomic traits. Nat Biotechnol 32:1045-1052.

Lieberman-Aiden E, van Berkum NL, Williams L, Imakaev M, Ragoczy T, Telling A, Amit I,

Lajoie BR, Sabo PJ, Dorschner MO, et al. 2009. Comprehensive mapping of long-range

interactions reveals folding principles of the human genome. Science 326:289-293.

Maretty L, Jensen JM, Petersen B, Sibbesen JA, Liu S, Villesen P, Skov L, Belling K, Theil

Have C, Izarzugaza JMG, et al. 2017. Sequencing and de novo assembly of 150 genomes

from Denmark as a population reference. Nature 548:87-91.

McKenna A, Hanna M, Banks E, Sivachenko A, Cibulskis K, Kernytsky A, Garimella K,

Altshuler D, Gabriel S, Daly M, et al. 2010. The Genome Analysis Toolkit: a MapReduce

framework for analyzing next-generation DNA sequencing data. Genome Res 20:1297-1303.

Monat C, Pera B, Ndjiondjop MN, Sow M, Tranchant-Dubreuil C, Bastianelli L, Ghesquiere

A, Sabot F. 2017. De Novo Assemblies of Three Oryza glaberrima Accessions Provide First

Insights about Pan-Genome of African Rices. Genome Biol Evol 9:1-6.

Morgulis A, Gertz EM, Schaffer AA, Agarwala R. 2006. WindowMasker: window-based

masker for sequenced genomes. Bioinformatics 22:134-141.

Neafsey DE, Waterhouse RM, Abai MR, Aganezov SS, Alekseyev MA, Allen JE, Amon J,

Arca B, Arensburger P, Artemov G, et al. 2015. Mosquito genomics. Highly evolvable malaria

vectors: the genomes of 16 Anopheles mosquitoes. Science 347:1258522.

Nguyen DT, Lee K, Choi H, Choi MK, Le MT, Song N, Kim JH, Seo HG, Oh JW, Lee K, et al.

2012. The complete swine olfactory subgenome: expansion of the olfactory gene repertoire in

the pig genome. BMC Genomics 13:584.

Pertea M, Pertea GM, Antonescu CM, Chang TC, Mendell JT, Salzberg SL. 2015. StringTie

enables improved reconstruction of a transcriptome from RNA-seq reads. Nat Biotechnol

33:290-295.

Rao SS, Huntley MH, Durand NC, Stamenova EK, Bochkov ID, Robinson JT, Sanborn AL,

Machol I, Omer AD, Lander ES, et al. 2014. A 3D map of the human genome at kilobase

resolution reveals principles of chromatin looping. Cell 159:1665-1680.

Ron G, Globerson Y, Moran D, Kaplan T. 2017. Promoter-enhancer interactions identified

from Hi-C data using probabilistic models and hierarchical topological domains. Nat

Commun 8:2237.

Schatz MC, Maron LG, Stein JC, Wences AH, Gurtowski J, Biggers E, Lee H, Kramer M,

Antoniou E, Ghiban E, et al. 2014. Whole genome de novo assemblies of three divergent

strains of rice, Oryza sativa, document novel gene space of aus and indica. Genome Biology

15.

Shen W, Le S, Li Y, Hu F. 2016. SeqKit: A Cross-Platform and Ultrafast Toolkit for FASTA/Q

File Manipulation. PLoS One 11:e0163962.

Shyu RY, Jiang SY, Chou JM, Shih YL, Lee MS, Yu JC, Chao PC, Hsu YJ, Jao SW. 2003. RARRES3 expression positively correlated to tumour differentiation in tissues of colorectal adenocarcinoma. Br J Cancer 89:146-151.

Sun C, Hu Z, Zheng T, Lu K, Zhao Y, Wang W, Shi J, Wang C, Lu J, Zhang D, et al. 2017. RPAN: rice pan-genome browser for approximately 3000 rice genomes. Nucleic Acids Res 45:597-605.

Tang Q, Gu Y, Zhou X, Jin L, Guan J, Liu R, Li J, Long K, Tian S, Che T, et al. 2017. Comparative transcriptomics of 5 high-altitude vertebrates and their low-altitude relatives. Gigascience 6:1-9.

Wang X, Zheng Z, Cai Y, Chen T, Li C, Fu W, Jiang Y. 2017. CNVcaller: highly efficient and widely applicable software for detecting copy number variations in large populations. Gigascience 6:1-12.

Wong KHY, Levy-Sakin M, Kwok PY. 2018. De novo human genome assemblies reveal spectrum of alternative haplotypes in diverse populations. Nat Commun 9:3040.

Xiao S, Xie D, Cao X, Yu P, Xing X, Chen CC, Musselman M, Xie M, West FD, Lewin HA, et al. 2012. Comparative epigenomic annotation of regulatory DNA. Cell 149:1381-1392.

Xie C, Mao X, Huang J, Ding Y, Wu J, Dong S, Kong L, Gao G, Li CY, Wei L. 2011. KOBAS 2.0: a web server for annotation and identification of enriched pathways and diseases. Nucleic Acids Res 39:W316-322.

Yan G, Zhang G, Fang X, Zhang Y, Li C, Ling F, Cooper DN, Li Q, Li Y, van Gool AJ, et al. 2011. Genome sequencing and comparison of two nonhuman primate animal models, the cynomolgus and Chinese rhesus macaques. Nat Biotechnol 29:1019-1023.

Zhang X, Firestein S. 2002. The olfactory receptor gene superfamily of the mouse. Nat Neurosci 5:124-133.

Zhang Y, Liu T, Meyer CA, Eeckhoute J, Johnson DS, Bernstein BE, Nusbaum C, Myers RM, Brown M, Li W, et al. 2008. Model-based analysis of ChIP-Seq (MACS). Genome Biol 9:R137.

Zhao Q, Feng Q, Lu H, Li Y, Wang A, Tian Q, Zhan Q, Lu Y, Zhang L, Huang T, et al. 2018.

674   Pan-genome analysis highlights the extent of genomic variation in cultivated and wild rice.

675   Nat Genet 50:278-284.