### 1 Trends and projections of universal health coverage indicators in Ghana, 1995-

### 2 2030: A national and subnational study

- 3 Cherri Zhang<sup>1</sup>, Md. Shafiur Rahman<sup>1</sup>, Md. Mizanur Rahman<sup>1,2</sup>, Alfred E Yawson<sup>3</sup>, Kenji
- 4 Shibuya<sup>1,4</sup>
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Global Health Policy, The University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan
- 6 <sup>2</sup>Department of Population Science and Human Resource Development, University of Rajshahi,
- 7 Rajshahi, Bangladesh
- 8 <sup>3</sup>Department of Community Health, School of Public Health, University of Ghana, Accra, Ghana
- <sup>9</sup> <sup>4</sup>Institute for Global Health Policy Research, Tokyo, Japan
- 10 \*Corresponding author
- 11 Department of Global Health Policy
- **12** The University of Tokyo
- 13 Tokyo, Japan
- 14 E-mail: toki.cherri.zhan28@gmail.com
- 15 Acknowledgements: The author thank the Department of Global Health Policy at The
- 16 University of Tokyo, School of Public Health at the University of Ghana, professors, assistant
- 17 professor, and fellow lab mate for their assistance. The author also thanks the Ghana Statistical
- 18 Service for surveys and data.

1	q
-	

### Abstract

20 Ghana has made significant stride towards universal health coverage (UHC) by implementing the 21 National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) in 2003. This paper investigates the progress of UHC 22 indicators in Ghana from 1995 to 2030 and makes future predictions up to 2030 to assess the 23 probability of achieving UHC targets. National representative surveys of Ghana were used to 24 assess health service coverage and financial risk protection. The analysis estimated the coverage 25 of 13 prevention and four treatment service indicators at the national level and across wealth 26 quintiles. In addition, this analysis calculated catastrophic health payments and impoverishment 27 to assess financial hardship and used a Bayesian regression model to estimate trends and future 28 projections as well as the probabilities of achieving UHC targets by 2030. Wealth-based 29 inequalities and regional disparities were also assessed. At the national level, 14 out of the 17 30 health service indicators are projected to reach the target of 80% coverage by 2030. Across wealth quintiles, inequalities were observed amongst most indicators with richer groups 31 32 obtaining more coverage than their poorer counterparts. Subnational analysis revealed while all 33 regions will achieve the 80% coverage target with high probabilities for prevention services, the 34 same cannot be applied to treatment services. In 2015, the proportion of households that suffered 35 catastrophic health payments and impoverishment at a threshold of 25% non-food expenditure 36 were 1.9% (95%CrI: 0.9-3.5) and 0.4% (95%CrI: 0.2-0.8), respectively. These are projected to 37 reduce to less than 0.5% by 2030. Inequality measures and subnational assessment revealed that 38 catastrophic expenditure experienced by wealth quintiles and regions are not equal. Significant 39 improvements were seen in both health service coverage and financial risk protection as a result 40 of NHIS. However, inequalities across wealth quintiles and at the subnational level continue to 41 be cause of concerns. Further efforts are needed to narrow these inequality gaps.

### 42 Introduction

Universal Health Coverage (UHC) is a concept in which all people receive the quality, essential 43 44 services they need without experiencing financial hardship [1,2]. The First Global Monitoring Report formulated by World Health Organizations (WHO) and World Bank identified three 45 46 dimensions: population, health services, and financing through risk pooling mechanism to track 47 UHC progress [1]. Since its integration into the recently adopted Sustainable Development Goal 48 (SDG) 3, member countries of the United Nations (UN) have committed to achieve UHC by 49 2030 [3]. This commitment consists of two targets: a minimum of 80% essential health service 50 coverage for all people, regardless of socioeconomic status, and 100% financial risk protection 51 from out-of-pocket (OOP) payments for health care [1]. UHC is a key mechanism to ensure 52 affordability and equity as well as to guarantee resilient health system, which many countries 53 have embraced in order to achieve better health for all [1].

54 Achieving UHC in Sub-Saharan Africa should be of utmost priority as countries in this region 55 trail significantly behind in achieving health outcomes especially the Millennium Development 56 Goals (MDGs) formulated by the WHO. Moreover, millions of Africans fall into poverty 57 annually due to OOP payment as a result of lack of health insurance in health financing system 58 [4,5]. Ghana, being one of the few Sub-Saharan African countries advocating for UHC, 59 implemented the National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) in 2003, in an attempt to remove 60 financial barriers, protect Ghanaians from catastrophic expenditure, and improve access for 61 everyone [6]. NHIS is mainly funded by three sources: 70% of National Insurance Levy (NIL), 62 17.4% of Social Security and National Insurance Trust (SSNIT), and 4.5% of premium payments 63 [7]. NIL is a 2.5% tax on selected goods and services; SSNIT is a 2.5% contribution paid by 64 those in the formal sectors, and premium is set at an annual flat rate of \$4.8 USD to \$32 USD

depending on districts for those in the informal sectors [8]. Pregnant women and those under the
age of 18 years or over 70 years of age are exempt from premium and makes up 60% of the
enrollees [8].

Services covered under the insurance include outpatient and inpatient care, oral health, eve care, 68 69 maternity care, and emergencies with no copayment upon receipt of service. It excludes cosmetic 70 services, HIV antiretroviral drugs, orthopedics, and organ transplant etc. [9]. Despite enrollment into NHIS being mandatory, overall enrollment remains low at 40% as of 2016 since majority of 71 72 the population belongs to the informal sector, and there is a lack of formal tracking regulations 73 [7]. Although Ghana made significant stride towards health financing in recent years; however, 74 Gross Domestic Product (GDP) spending on health and total government expenditure allocated 75 to health has dropped since 2010 to 3.6% and 6.8%, respectively in 2014 [10]. Furthermore, other challenges such as funding and sustainability persist as overall enrollment has decreased in 76 77 recent years and many citizens find paying for premiums difficult. In addition, as the incidence 78 of poverty is around 25% with some regions such as Upper East and Upper West experiencing 79 more than 70% incidence of poverty, inequality remains a prominent issue especially across 80 regions [9]. Inadequate funding for health can lead to unstable health insurance scheme and an 81 increase in OOP payments pushing people further into poverty and resulting in worse health 82 outcomes.

Most studies conducted in Ghana thus far assessed the impact of NHIS either on health service
access or protection against financial catastrophe; therefore, this paper offers a comprehensive
glimpse into Ghana's progress towards both UHC components, along with future trajectories. It
will provide a thorough examination on the proportion of health service utilization as well as

- 87 catastrophic health expenditures at the national and subnational level as well as across wealth
- 88 quintiles using nationally representative survey data.

### 89 Methods

90 Data source

91 Analysis on health service coverage was carried out using five consecutive Demographic and 92 Health Surveys (1993, 1998, 2003, 2008, and 2014). These are nationally representative 93 household surveys covering all 10 regions of Ghana. Information mainly on housing and 94 household characteristics, education, maternal and child health, fertility, family planning, and 95 nutrition were collected The analysis of financial risk protection was conducted using Ghana Living Standard Surveys (1991-1992, 1998-1999, 2005-2006, and 2012-2013), which are 96 97 nationwide household surveys constructed to gather information on living conditions in Ghana. 98 The surveys collected detailed information on household demographics, education, health, 99 employment, migration, housing conditions, agriculture, and access to financial services and 100 asset ownership. Both national surveys involved two-staged random sampling design with high 101 response rates (Table in S11 Table).

### 102 Measurement of health service indicators

In accordance with WHO and World Bank's framework [1], 17 health service indicators (Table in S1 Table) were chosen to cover a full range of prevention and treatment services based on data availability. In all, 13 indicators were classified as prevention services while four indicators were classified as treatment services. The chosen indicators were grouped into: 1) composite prevention index and 2) composite treatment index. These were estimated as the mean value of prevention and treatment service indicators to trace the overall progress of prevention and

109	treatment coverage [11]. Due to incomplete data for some of the indicators in certain survey
110	years, only nine out of the 13 prevention indicators (four antenatal care visits, exclusive
111	breastfeeding, needs for family planning satisfaction, improved water, adequate sanitation, BCG,
112	measles, DPT3 and Polio3 immunizations) were included to estimate the composite prevention
113	index. Furthermore, a Composite Coverage Index (CCI) was estimated to assess access to
114	maternal and child health services as it frequently represents frontline measurement of health
115	service coverage and produce the most immediate picture of accessibility [11,12]. It was
116	calculated based on eight interventions from four specialties (family planning, maternity care,
117	child malnutrition, and case management) using a formula developed by Boerma and colleagues
118	[12].

### 119 Measurement of financial hardship

120 Incidence of catastrophic health expenditure (CHE) and impoverishment due to OOP health 121 payments were approximated for financial hardship assessment. Several thresholds can be 122 considered according to World Bank's guideline [13]. In this analysis, a threshold of 25% non-123 food consumption expenditure was used; therefore, a household's health expenditure was 124 deemed catastrophic if its total OOP health payments exceeded that threshold. Consistent with 125 WHO's guideline [14], the incidence of impoverishment was derived using poverty line and 126 subsistence spending. A household was considered poor if its total per capita expenditure was 127 less than its subsistence spending after paying for healthcare, and thus a household's health 128 expenditure was considered impoverishing if its total per capita spending after paying for health 129 care was below the poverty line [14]. The poverty line was determined using average food expenditure of households with food expenditure share within 45<sup>th</sup> and 55<sup>th</sup> percentile of the 130 131 sampled households [14]. A household was deemed to be experiencing hardship if it encountered

- 132 either CHE or impoverishment. All household consumption calculations were performed
- 133 following Living Standard Measurement Study guideline [13].

### 134 Statistical analysis

135 All trends and projections for health service coverage and financial risk protection components 136 were estimated based on proportions estimated from original survey data with 95% confidence 137 interval (CI). The composite prevention and treatment indices were developed based on random-138 effects meta-analysis [15]. For equity analysis, households were divided into five wealth 139 quintiles (Q1-Q5) to assess socio-economic status. Due to the lack of information on income as 140 most Ghanaians belong to the informal sector, household economic status was measured based 141 on the level of consumption or asset-based wealth index. The index was constructed from 142 household asset data using principle components analysis and a wealth score was generated for 143 each household. This information was provided for households in the Demographic and Health 144 Surveys as well as Ghana Living Standard Measurement Surveys. Households were ranked 145 based on wealth scores and divided into quintiles, starting from the poorest quintile (lowest 20%) 146 to the richest quintile (highest 20%). The slope index of inequality (SII) and relative index of 147 inequality (RII) were calculated to provide an absolute and relative measure of inequality, 148 respectively. SII measures the absolute difference between the extremes of wealth quintiles and 149 reflects the difference in percentage points in each indicator, while RII is a measure of ratio 150 signifying the degree of inequality [11]. SII and RII were calculated by regressing outcomes of 151 health service and financial indicators against household's relative rank in the cumulative 152 distribution of wealth position. All aforementioned analyses were performed using Stata (version 153 15.0/MP, StataCorp).

154 A Bayesian linear regression model with a non-informative prior was developed, considering 155 year as the covariate, to estimate the trends in indicators over time and its posterior predictive 156 distribution. All proportions were logit transformed before the analysis, and all calculations were 157 conducted as such. The Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) algorithm was applied to obtain 158 1000 samples from the posterior distribution of the parameter of interest using two chains. For 159 each of the chain, the first 5000 iterations were discarded as burn-ins and the number of 160 iterations increased until the MCMC outputs converged. These posterior predictive distributions 161 were used to obtain projections and credible intervals up to year 2030. They were also utilized to 162 calculate the annual rate of change and the probability of achieving UHC targets for all included 163 indicators. Another wealth quintile adjusted model with non-informative prior was fitted to 164 estimate the predicted coverage of all indicators for different socio-economic groups. 165 Convergence of MCMC outputs was assessed by visually examining trace plots. Posterior 166 samples were considered to have converged when outputs from two chains adjoined. 167 Additionally, Gelman-Rubin diagnostic statistics were applied as a quantifiable measure of 168 convergence. A potential scale reduction factor (PSRF) was used in the Gelman diagnostic, 169 where a PSRF value close to 1 signified convergence, and a PSRF value greater than 1.02 170 indicated convergence failure. To further assess the accuracy of the model, a deviance 171 information criterion (DIC) was calculated for each indicator at the wealth quintile and subnational level in the case that quintiles or regions also acted as covariates. For every single 172 173 estimate of trend and projection in health service coverage, a DIC value was calculated for model with and without interaction. The model with smaller penalized deviance was integrated into the 174 analysis (Table in S2 Table). Bayesian regression models were developed in JAGS and 175 176 implemented in R.

### 177 Results

### 178 *Health service coverage*

179	Table 1 lists the predicted coverage of 17 chosen health service indicators, grouped into
180	prevention and treatment categories along with 95% credible intervals (CrI), the probability of
181	achieving the target of 80% coverage by the year 2030, as well as the annual rate of change from
182	1995 to 2030. The results are very promising amongst most prevention service indicators as they
183	are estimated to have more than 90% probability of achieving the target except need for family
184	planning satisfied, adequate sanitation, and non-use of tobacco. Amongst the treatment
185	indicators, care seeking for pneumonia among children is the least reassuring with a low
186	probability of 5.1% of reaching the target while access to institutional delivery and use of skilled
187	birth attendance will have more than 85% probability. In 2015, family planning demand satisfied
188	and care seeking for pneumonia were deemed to have the lowest national coverage at 46.3%
189	(95% CrI: 38.5-54.3) and 49.9% (95% CrI: 33.8-64.0), respectively, followed by insecticide
190	treated bed nets for pregnant women and children at around 60%.

Indicators -	Predicted coverage in year (95% CrI)					A
	1995	2005	2015	2030	y <sup>a</sup>	Annual % change <sup>b</sup>
Prevention indicators						
Needs for family planning satisfied	36.6 (30.5-42.7)	41.4 (37.2-45.7)	46.3 (38.5-54.3)	53.7 (38.4-68.9)	0.9%	1.1 (-0.2-2.3)
At least four antenatal care visits	57.9 (49.6-63.5)	73.7 (69.3-77.8)	84.9 (78.3-89.4)	93.9 (87.5-97.5)	99.9%	1.4 (0.9-2.0)
Postnatal care for mothers	0.4 (0.1-1.3)	10.6 (5.6-17.6)	79.9 (61.7-91.3)	99.8 (99.0-100.0)	100%	18.6 (13.5-23.9)
Exclusive breastfeeding	16.6 (9.6-25.2)	40.7 (31.2-50.5)	70.1 (52.3-83.2)	92.6 (77.1-98.5)	96.3%	5.3 (3.4-7.1)
Insecticide treated bed nets for children	-	10.5 (5.9-17.0)	62.7 (42.7-80.4)	98.1 (91.1-99.9)	99.5%	10.4 (7.5-13.2)
Insecticide treated bed nets for mothers	-	6.7 (3.8-10.7)	56.7 (37.2-74.4)	98.3 (91.8-99.9)	99.6%	12.2 (9.2-15.1)

 Table 1: National health service coverage with probability of achieving the target and rate of change, 1995-2030

BCG immunization	84.9 (80.4-88.6)	93.4 (92.1-94.7)	97.2 (95.9-98.2)	99.2 (98.4-99.7)	100%	0.5 (0.3-0.7)
DPT3 immunization	67.4 (59.9-75.0)	82.1 (78.0-85.6)	90.9 (86.3-94.3)	96.8 (93.2-98.8)	100%	1.1 (0.6-1.5)
Polio3 immunization	67.9 (58.9-76.2)	79.6 (75.1-83.9)	87.6 (81.8-92.4)	94.2 (87.3-98.0)	100%	1.0 (0.5-1.5)
Measles immunization	69.5 (60.6-77.9)	83.8 (79.9-87.5)	92.0 (87.5-95.1)	97.3 (93.4-99.1)	100%	1.0 (0.6-1.5)
Improved water	60.9 (50.9-70.4)	77.0 (71.7-82.0)	87.6 (80.9-92.6)	95.3 (88.7-98.5)	100%	1.4 (0.7-2.0)
Adequate Sanitation	24.6 (18.7-32.8)	43.2 (37.8-49.4)	64.1 (53.3-73.7)	86.0 (72.4-94.1)	88.4%	3.8 (2.6-4.8)
No-use of tobacco	_	91.5 (87.6-94.4)	91.1 (85.3-95.2)	88.8 (62.9-98.3)	87.5%	-0.1 (-1.0-0.6)
Treatment indicators						
Institutional delivery	40.3 (31.2-50.8)	56.7 (49.6-63.2)	71.5 (59.3-81.6)	86.3 (69.9-95.1)	86.2%	2.3 (1.1-3.3)
Skilled birth attendance	41.3 (31.6-52.0)	57.5 (50.4-63.8)	72.1 (61.0-81.4)	86.6 (70.7-95.2)	88.1%	2.2 (1.2-3.2)
Oral rehydration therapy	39.5 (27.8-51.6)	55.6 (46.9-64.0)	70.5 (55.8-82.1)	85.2 (63.4-95.9)	79.5%	2.3 (0.8-3.5)
Care seeking for pneumonia	35.9 (25.9-46.6)	42.7 (34.6-50.2)	49.9 (33.8-64.0)	59.9 (30.1-83.6)	5.1%	1.5 (-0.6-3.3)

Note: <sup>a</sup>The probability of meeting the target of 80% health service coverage by 2030 for the entire population, regardless of economic status, gender, or place of residence according to WHO's universal health coverage target. <sup>d</sup> The annual rate of change for the period 1995-2030. Trends and projections for all the year from 1993-2030 at the national level and across wealth quintiles for all indicators are shown in appendix (p13-21). CrI= credible interval; DPT3= three doses of DPT immunization; Polio3= three doses of polio immunization.

191 A notable achievement is that national coverage of the four childhood vaccinations (BCG,

measles, three doses of DPT and polio vaccination) had already reached the target in 2015. In

addition, coverage for maternal postnatal care increased from 10.6% (95%CrI: 5.6-17.6) in 2005

to 79.9% (95% CrI: 61.7-91.3) in 2015. The lowest coverage among the poorest quintile was

observed in adequate sanitation at 6.5% (95% CrI:3.4-11.1) in 2015. This is followed by need for

family planning demand satisfied at 38.1% (95%CrI: 31.1-45.1) and access to skilled birth

197 attendance at 38.9% (95% CrI: 25.3-53.7). All quintiles will fail to achieve the 80% coverage

198 target for family planning demand satisfied and care seeking for pneumonia. Besides the two

aforementioned indicators, the richest quintile is highly likely to reach the target for most

200 indicators except polio vaccination and insecticide treated bed nets use by children under five. A

201 detailed breakdown of coverage by wealth quintile for each indicator can be found in Tables in

202 S3-S6 Table and Figures in S2-S10 Figure.

203 In order to provide a broader picture regarding the coverage of prevention and treatment 204 services, the composite prevention and treatment indices (Figure 1 and 2) illustrate that overall 205 national coverage of prevention and treatment services are expected to reach 92.2% (95% CrI: 206 85.4-96.5) and 80.3% (95% CrI: 67.7-89.4) by 2030 and all quintiles other than the two poorest 207 quintiles in treatment index will have high probabilities of achieving the 80% coverage target. 208 Trends and projections in CCI related to reproductive, maternal and child health indicators 209 between 1993 and 2030 states that overall national coverage will increase to 80.7% (95%CrI: 210 77.3-83.9) by 2030 (Table in S7 Table and Figure in S1 Figure); however, only the middle class 211 and the richer quintile are predicted to achieve the target. Detailed quintile-specific coverage of 212 all three composite indices with probabilities of reaching the 80% coverage target by 2030 is 213 presented in Table is S7 Table.

### Figure 1: Trends in and projections of overall prevention coverage in Ghana, 1993-2030 Figure 2: Trends in and projections of overall treatment coverage in Ghana, 1993-2030

214 Figure 3 and 4 presents the trends and projections of prevention and treatment indices across the 215 10 regions in Ghana from 1995 to 2030. All coverage are shown to have increased and are 216 predicted to continue up to 2030. In 2015, the lowest overall prevention and treatment service 217 coverage were observed in Northern at 71.5% (95%CrI: 67.7-75.2) and 43.9% (95%CrI: 33.2-218 55.1) respectively, while the highest overall coverage for prevention services was in Greater 219 Accra at 88.5% (95%CrI: 86.5-90.2) and highest overall treatment coverage in Upper East at 220 79.8% (95%CrI: 71.7-86.4). All regions are predicted to achieve the 80% coverage by 2030 with 221 100% probabilities for composite prevention index; however, the same cannot be applied to 222 composite treatment index as four out of the 10 regions will fail to reach the target, given 223 probabilities less than 80% (Table in S9 Table).

# Figure 3: Trends and projections of overall prevention coverage across regions in Ghana, 1993-2030

Figure 4: Trends and projections of overall treatment coverage across regions in Ghana, 1993-2030

224 Inequality in service coverage

225 Table 2 depicts the absolute difference or percentage point difference in the proportion of health 226 service coverage between the extremes of wealth quintiles represented by SII values along with 227 95% CrI. Overall, absolute inequalities have drastically decreased across most indicators except 228 for use of skilled birth attendance, institutional delivery, and adequate sanitation in which SII 229 only slightly decreased for skilled birth attendance and even increased and will remain so for 230 institutional delivery and adequate sanitation. These three indicators have the biggest inequalities 231 in 2015 and will prevail up to 2030. Adequate sanitation has a SII of 87.7 (95% CrI: 79.4-93.4), 232 followed by institutional delivery at 87.4 (95% CrI: 77.9-93.6) and skilled birth attendance at 233 69.9 (95% CrI: 56.6-81.1). These numbers signify that the richest quintile had 69.9 to 87.7 234 percentage points higher coverage compared to the poor. Although inequalities in indicators 235 related to maternal care such as antenatal and postnatal care have decreased, but persistent 236 inequalities are predicted to exist up to 2030. Similar to absolute inequalities, decreasing trends 237 are also predicted for relative inequalities, represented by RII values, to a lesser degree. By 238 examining current values, it is evident that for most indicators, the richer groups had one to three 239 times more coverage than their poorer counterparts in 2015. Detailed RIIs from 1995 to 2030 is 240 presented in Table in S8 Table.

## Table 2: Slope index of inequality (SII) in health service indicators, 1995-2030IndicatorsSII (95% CrI) (Q5-Q1)<sup>a</sup>

	1995	2005	2015	2030
Prevention indicators				
Needs for family planning satisfied	20.3 (14.6-27.0)	13.3 (9.7-17.7)	8.8 (4.1-16.4)	5.0 (1.0-15.5)
At least four antenatal care visits	52.2 (45.4-59.5)	40.5 (36.0-45.6)	29.9 (23.1-38.3)	17.8 (9.6-30.9)
Postnatal care for mothers <sup>c</sup>	-	75.9 (57.1-89.6)	54.2 (35.8-70.2)	25.6 (1.4-77.8)
Exclusive breastfeeding	61.5 (40.5-79.5)	13.3 (8.7-18.9)	1.6 (0.4-4.4)	0.1 (0.0-0.5)
Insecticide treated bed nets for children <sup>b</sup>	-	-	-	-
Insecticide treated bed nets for mothers <sup>b</sup>	-	_	-	_
BCG immunization	28.0 (19.8-38.4)	11.2 (8.4-14.7)	4.1 (2.1-7.3)	0.9 (0.2-2.6)
DPT3 immunization	40.7 (30.4-52.2)	14.3 (10.6-18.6)	4.0 (2.1-6.9)	0.6 (0.1-1.6)
Polio3 immunization	39.6 (28.6-51.3)	9.0 (5.8-13.7)	1.6 (-0.5-4.0)	0.1 (0.0-0.6)
Measles immunization	38.4 (29.8-48.2)	15.8 (12.5-19.7)	5.5 (3.2-8.6)	1.1 (0.3-2.7)
Improved water	78.7 (71.6-85.8)	57.4 (39.8-75.0)	32.5 (16.9-48.1)	10.5 (4.2-16.7)
Adequate sanitation	71.0 (59.5-80.5)	80.9 (79.4-93.4)	87.7 (79.4-93.4)	93.4 (81.4-98.4)
No-use of tobacco <sup>c</sup>	-	18.2 (4.4-31.9)	10.5 (2.0-18.9)	4.4 (0.7-8.2)
Treatment indicators				
Institutional delivery	70.9 (58.7-87.1)	80.7 (73.9-85.9)	87.4 (77.9-93.6)	93.0 (79.0-98.5)
Skilled birth attendance	72.5 (62.0-80.9)	71.4 (64.4-77.5)	69.9 (56.6-81.1)	67.0 (40.6-87.7)
Oral rehydration therapy	23.5 (17.8-29.6)	15.3 (12.6-18.4)	9.8 (6.4-14.5)	5.1 (1.9-11.0)
Care seeking for pneumonia	37.0 (26.5-47.8)	26.9 (21.1-32.8)	19.0 (11.4-29.0)	11.3 (3.3-27.9)

Note: <sup>a</sup>SII= slope index of inequality; Q5 indicates the richest quintile, and Q1 indicates the poorest quintile. <sup>b</sup>unable to obtain accurate trends due to huge variations in SII values from raw data between survey years. <sup>c</sup>No data before year 2000. CrI= credible interval; DPT3= three doses of DPT immunization; Polio3= three doses of polio immunization.

### 241 Financial hardship

Both incidence of CHE and impoverishment drastically decreased from 1995 to 2030 with an

annual rate of reduction at 10.2% (95% CrI: 5.9-14.2) (Table 3). In 1995, 15.0% (95% CrI: 9.6-

- 244 22.6) of households suffered financial catastrophe as a result of OOP health care payments;
- however, that proportion will reduce to 0.4% (95%CrI: 0.1-1.3) in 2030. The probability of
- achieving 100% financial risk protection is estimated to be 96.2%. Proportion of households that
- experienced impoverishment was 1.7% (95%CrI: 1.1-2.6) in 1995 and is predicted to reduce to

- 248 0.2% (95%CrI: 0.0-0.5) by 2030. Inequality in CHE also decreased from 1995 to 2030 as shown
- in table 4. In 1995, the poorest quintile was suffering 5.4 percentage points more CHE in
- comparison to the richest quintile. By 2030, that difference will reduce to 0.1 percentage point.

Year	Catastrophic health expenditure <sup>a</sup> (95% CrI)	Impoverishment (95% Crl)	Financial hardship <sup>b</sup> (95% CrI)
1995	15.0 (9.6-22.6)	1.7 (1.1-2.6)	15.5 (10.1-22.9)
2000	9.0 (6.4-12.7)	1.2 (0.8-1.7)	9.7 (7.0-13.6)
2005	5.4 (3.8-7.3)	0.9 (0.6-1.2)	5.9 (4.2-8.5)
2010	3.2 (2.0-4.9)	0.6 (0.4-0.9)	3.6 (2.2-5.6)
2015	1.9 (0.9-3.5)	0.4 (0.2-0.8)	2.2 (1.1-3.8)
2020	1.1 (0.4-2.4)	0.3 (0.1-0.7)	1.3 (0.5-2.7)
2030	0.4 (0.1-1.3)	0.2 (0.0-0.5)	0.5 (0.1-1.4)
Annual rate of reduction <sup>c</sup>	-10.2 (-14.2 to -5.9)	-6.7 (-10.7 to -2.7)	-9.7 (-13.6 to -6.0
Probability <sup>d</sup>	96.2%	100%	99.7%

 Table 3: Trends and projections of the incidence of catastrophic health expenditure and impoverishment in Ghana, 1995-2030

Note: <sup>a</sup>Catastrophic health expenditure was calculated based on the 25% threshold of nonfood consumption; <sup>b</sup>Financial hardship indicates the incidence of catastrophic health expenditures and/or impoverishment; <sup>c</sup>The annual rate of change for the period 1995-2030; <sup>d</sup>Probability= the probability of meeting the target of 100% financial risk protection by 2030 according to WHO's universal health coverage target; CrI= credible interval.

Year	Catastrophic health expenditure <sup>a</sup> (95% Crl)		Inequality in catastrophic health expenditure		
rear	Poorest (Q1)	Richest (Q5)	RII (95% CrI)	SII (95% CrI)	
1995	16.4 (11.4-23.7)	11.7 (7.8-16.3)	0.7 (0.6-0.8)	-5.4 (-8.1 to -2.7)	
2000	10.0 (7.0-14.2)	7.0 (4.7-9.7)	0.7 (0.5-0.8)	-3.5 (-5.2 to -1.8)	
2005	5.9 (4.0-8.4)	4.1 (2.7-5.7)	0.7 (0.5-0.8)	-2.1 (-3.2 to -1.1)	
2010	3.4 (2.2-5.0)	2.4 (1.5-3.5)	0.7 (0.5-0.8)	-1.3 (-1.9 to -0.6)	
2015	2.0 (1.2-3.0)	1.4 (0.8-2.1)	0.6 (0.5-0.8)	-0.7 (-1.0 to -0.4)	
2020	1.1 (0.6-1.8)	0.8 (0.4-1.3)	0.6 (0.5-0.8)	-0.4 (-0.6 to -0.2)	
2030	0.4 (0.2-0.7)	0.3 (0.1-0.5)	0.6 (0.5-0.8)	-0.1 (-0.2 to -0.0)	

### Table 4: Inequality in catastrophic health expenditure in Ghana, 1995-2030

	Probability	99.6%	99.7%	_	-
			ative index of inequality; a 25% threshold of nonfo		nequality; <sup>a</sup> Catastrophic health
251	At the subnat	tional level as repr	resented in table 5, pr	oportion of house	holds suffering CHE
252	displays a de	creasing trend and	l all regions are estim	ated to have extre	emely low incidence by
253	2030 with re-	markably high pro	babilities of achievin	g 100% financial	risk protection. In 2015,
254	Central regio	on incurred the hig	hest incidence at 2.3%	% (95% CrI: 1.4-3	8.5), followed by Volta at
255	2.1% (95%C	rI: 1.3-3.2). At the	e same time, Brong-A	hafo and Upper H	East had the highest
256	incidence of	impoverishment a	t 0.8%. Details regard	ling the incidence	e of impoverishment for a
257	regions can b	e found in Table i	n S10 Table.		

 Table 5: Incidence of catastrophic health expenditure at the subnational level in Ghana, 1995-2030

Design	Catast	Duchahltah			
Region	1995	2005	2015	2030	- Probablity <sup>b</sup>
Ashanti	16.1 (10.5-22.5)	5.9 (3.8-8.6)	2.0 (1.2-3.1)	0.4 (0.2-0.7)	99.5%
Brong-Ahafo	14.6 (9.5-20.3)	5.3 (3.4-7.6)	1.8 (1.1-2.8)	0.4 (0.2-0.6)	100%
Central	17.9 (11.9-24.7)	6.7 (4.3-9.5)	2.3 (1.4-3.5)	0.5 (0.2-0.8)	99.7%
Eastern	15.0 (10.2-21.2)	5.5 (3.6-7.9)	1.9 (1.1-2.9)	0.4 (0.2-0.7)	99.9%
Greater Accra	9.5 (6.2-13.7)	3.3 (2.2-4.9)	1.1 (0.7-1.7)	0.2 (0.1-0.4)	100%
Northern	13.0 (8.6-18.5)	4.7 (3.0-6.8)	1.6 (1.0-2.5)	0.3 (0.2-0.6)	100%
Upper East	9.1 (5.9-13.4)	3.2 (2.1-4.7)	1.1 (0.6-1.7)	0.2 (0.1-0.4)	100%
Upper West	8.4 (5.3-12.5)	2.9 (1.8-4.4)	1.0 (0.6-1.5)	0.2 (0.1-0.3)	100%
Volta	16.3 (11.2-22.9)	6.0 (4.0-8.7)	2.1 (1.3-3.2)	0.4 (0.2-0.7)	99.6%
Western	13.8 (9.1-19.9)	5.0 (3.2-7.2)	1.7 (1.0-2.7)	0.3 (0.2-0.6)	99.9%

Note: <sup>a</sup>Catastrophic health expenditure was calculated based on 25% threshold of nonfood expenditure; <sup>b</sup>The probability of achieving 100% financial risk protection; CrI: credible interval

### 258 Discussion

259 This paper provides a comprehensive picture of Ghana's progress towards UHC, as it extensively 260 examined both health service coverage and financial risk protection components at the national, 261 subnational, and wealth quintile levels. There have been tremendous improvements in increasing 262 access to various health services with upward trends in coverage accompanied by decreasing 263 trends in the proportion of households suffering CHE. Even though Ghana implemented the 264 NHIS in 2003 as an attempt to remove barriers to cost and increase health service utilization 265 especially among the poor [16], inequalities still exist for both UHC components throughout the 266 nation. Similarly, subnational disparities were apparent as well with some regions faring better 267 than others.

268 Findings from the analyses indicate that most of the maternal health indicators such as more than 269 four antenatal care visits, postnatal care for mothers, institutional delivery, and use of skilled 270 birth attendance have already reached the 80% target in 2015 at the national level, most likely 271 due to the implementation of NHIS as this insurance allows pregnant women to be exempt from 272 premium with maternity care coverage [17]. In addition, following enrollment into NHIS, the 273 Maternal Health Program, granted to women upon confirmation of pregnancy, completely 274 eliminates OOP payments for six antenatal care visits, delivery care, two postnatal care visits, 275 and infant care up to three months of age [17]. This could be a reason why postnatal care for 276 mothers increased by eight-fold in the span of 10 years from 2005 to 2015 and high coverage of 277 childhood vaccinations. Countries such as Rwanda and Indonesia have also proved that pregnant 278 women who are enrolled into insurance are more likely to utilize various maternal care services 279 such as prenatal care, institutional delivery, skilled birth attendants, postnatal care, and seek 280 vaccinations for their children [16-18]. Therefore, continuous efforts must be made to encourage 281 pregnant women to enroll into NHIS and to utilize maternal care services.

282 At the national level, family planning demand satisfied showed the least likelihood of reaching 283 its target and the reason could be attributed to the fact that this service is not covered under NHIS 284 but implemented through a government vertical program [19] and this pattern is consistent with a 285 previous study [20]. The low uptake of family planning can be explained by many facets such as 286 misconception, stigma, lack of knowledge, religious abhorrence, spousal disapproval, and 287 inaccessibility [21]. To increase the uptake of family planning, national efforts to include it as a 288 component of the maternal health care package under the NHIS, and education and involvement 289 of male partners should be considered. Community health workers (CHWs) can greatly improve 290 access to contraceptives and provide education on their correct use [22]. 291 Similarly, care seeking for the treatment of pneumonia also had a low coverage and unlikely to 292 reach the target because a past study conducted in rural Ghana found significant knowledge 293 deficit among residents regarding pneumonia [23]. In that study, only one-third of the studied 294 population ever heard of the disease name and among those, only half sought treatment for their 295 children [23]. It is imperative to increase people's knowledge of childhood illnesses and perhaps 296 the Ministry of Health and Ghana Health Service need to strengthen the health promotion unit to 297 provide structured and targeted community educational programs. Enrolling into NHIS can 298 potentially improve treatment-seeking behavior since parents who are enrolled are more likely to 299 seek curative and preventive care for their children [24].

We also found that utilization of institutional delivery and access to skill birth attendance were among the top three indicators with the biggest absolute and relative inequalities in 2015. Several studies have found that wealthier and more educated women are more likely to enroll into NHIS and seek maternal care services [17-19]. Many women from poor households lack the basic knowledge about insurance system such as not being aware of the fact that their children and

305 maternal health services are exempt from insurance premium; some simply did not know how to 306 register themselves or their children [17]. This further highlight the need for more community 307 based education on the NHIS targeting especially women from poorer households to enroll. 308 Community health workers (CHWs) have proven to be effective in improving health care access 309 and overall health status [25,26]; therefore, they can also be used to educate and encourage 310 enrolment of caregivers and mothers onto the NHIS. These health workers can act as channels in 311 reaching out to the poor women and educate them on the benefits package for maternal health 312 under the NHIS and encourage them to enroll.

313 The study found wealth quintile based differences in coverage among most health service 314 indicators, which indicated that enrollment into insurance maybe concentrated among the rich. 315 This observation is consistent with findings in previous studies [18,27,28]. Furthermore, a study 316 done in rural Ghana found that enrollment into NHIS is 2.5 times more among the rich than the 317 poor [29]. This deviates from NHIS' original equity goal, which was to increase affordability and 318 utilization of health services especially among the poor and vulnerable population [19]. If the 319 poor are not insured, there is an increased likelihood of illnesses resulting in worse health status 320 and further impoverishment. This will not only widen inequality gap but also drifts away from 321 UHC goals. In addition to quintile-based differences, inequality also prevailed at the subnational 322 level with Northern region lagging significantly behind all other regions in prevention and 323 treatment coverage. This could be explained by the fact that this region occupies about a third of 324 the land-size of Ghana, and has the lowest doctor-to-population and nurse-to-population ratios, 325 making health services more difficult to obtain [17]. Furthermore, this region is the biggest 326 contributor to poverty in Ghana [30]. Overall, regional specific strategies (administrative and 327 social policy) will be needed. Some policy measures such as budgeting of CHWs, and promoting

328 current partnership with One Million CHW Campaign [25] will be keys. Wealth, education,

329 employment, and location play critical roles in health service coverage, thus national and sub-

national efforts are needed to increase all aspects in order to improve coverage [31].

Financial catastrophe decreased by almost eight-fold from 1995 to 2015, proving that NHIS have

aided in reducing OOP health payments across the nation. During the same period,

impoverishment witnessed a four-fold decrease. Although inequality gaps have narrowed as

difference in the incidence of financial catastrophe between rich and poor groups reduced, the

poor is still suffering more CHE as a result of OOP payment. This finding is in congruence with

previous studies from other Sub-Saharan African countries [32-34]. Moreover, benefits received

from health care services are also unequal among those paying for it. In Ghana, benefits from the

338 public sector and private services tend to be pro-rich despite more health care needs by the poor

[33]. A study found that 23% of those indicated having poor health in the poorest quintile only

received less than 13% of total health care benefits compared to 16% of those in the richest

quintile obtaining over 24% benefits [6]. At a threshold of 25% non-food expenditure, incidence

of CHE was 1.8% in 2015 and 0.4% of households were pushed into poverty. These results were

343 still worse compared to earlier studies done in South Africa and Tanzania in which

impoverishment were only 0.045% and 0.37%, respectively in 2008 [33]. On a positive note,

Ghana's progress was shown to be better than Rwanda and Nigeria [34-36].

346 From these results, it is evident that NHIS has contributed to Ghana moving one step closer to

347 realizing UHC with great improvement seen in both components of the UHC. However,

348 persistent inequalities between rich and poor were apparent at all levels in health service

349 coverage and financial risk protection. Insurance premiums and registration fees remain as

350 obstacles to enrolment for the poor, many are simply left unattended without any form of

protection [27]. For people in the poorest quintile, premium imposes a heavy burden as it takes
up 11.4% of their non-food expenditure while it only takes up 5.9% for general households [28].
A recent study done in Ghana revealed that as share of OOP payment for healthcare in total
household expenditure increases, impoverishment deepens [37]. Reducing OOP payment for
healthcare, especially for the poor, is essential as it is a determining factor of impoverishment.

356 UHC policy has proven to greatly contributes to the reduction of catastrophic payments [38].

357 Regardless of NHIS' shortcomings, it is still considered an accomplishment for Ghana, making 358 the country one of the few in Sub-Saharan Africa to implement a nationwide insurance scheme. 359 Previous studies conducted in Ghana regarding the protective effect of NHIS revealed that 360 incidence and intensity of CHE were greatly reduced in insured individuals especially for the 361 poor [29,39]. It proved to have protective mechanism against financial shocks with a 67% 362 reduction in OOP and reduces the likelihood of foregoing other subsistent needs for health care 363 [29]. It is recommended that Ghana to continue with its current progress by further enrolling all 364 citizens into the scheme. There is a need to explore other funding options to ensure sustainability 365 of NHIS as well as to further lower premium for the poor and vulnerable population. Thailand 366 sets a great example in establishing equity through its insurance scheme by subsidizing tax for 367 the poor instead of premium contribution [40]. It is believed that free health care for all is 368 achievable and affordable in Ghana via cost savings, progressive taxation, and high quality 369 transparent aid [41].

### 370 Strengths and limitations

One of the major strengths of this study is that it comprehensively examined both health servicecoverage and financial risk protection. It also provided trends and future projections for chosen

373 indicators. Furthermore, subnational analysis yielded further detailed assessment. Few

accompanied limitations include missing information prior to 2000 for some of the indicators,

the inability to make projections for NCD and HIV related indicators, and the inability to capture

information for those that are too poor to utilize healthcare.

### 377 Conclusion

378 Ghana with its strenuous efforts in making health care more equitable and affordable has made 379 tremendous improvements in health service coverage along with reducing out-of-pocket (OOP) 380 payment owing to the enforcement of NHIS. The establishment of NHIS was also an attempt to 381 achieve MDGs, especially in the area of maternal and child health in which significant 382 improvements were observed. However, apparent inequalities were evident at the national and 383 subnational level since the poor were suffering more catastrophic health expenditure (CHE) and 384 had less access to health services. These inequalities were observed in many studies conducted in 385 Ghana thus far. Policy makers need to have stronger commitments in achieving equity as many 386 health care interventions, aimed at the poor, do not reach them. Several options to be considered 387 are equitably distribute funds to regions according to needs, reduce copayment by exempting or 388 heavily subsiding premium for the poor, and enhance Community-based Health Planning and 389 Service programme to improve access to hard-to-reach population. Ghana serves as an 390 exemplary example for other Sub-Saharan African countries in implementing a health insurance 391 at the national level. Its achievement in improving health care utilization for its citizens and 392 reducing financial burdens is praiseworthy. It is recommended that Ghana to continue with its 393 current progress by further enrolling all its citizens into the scheme. By doing so, UHC will no 394 longer be a distant dream.

### 395 References

- World Health Organization. Tracking universal health coverage: first global monitoring
   report. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2015.
- Boerma JT, Eozenou P, Evans D, Evans T, Kieny M-P, Wagstaff A. Monitoring progress
  towards universal health coverage at country and global levels. *PLoS Med* 2014; 11:
  e1001728.
- 401 3 UN General Assembly. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable
  402 Development. New York: United Nations, 2015.
- 403 4 World Bank. Universal Health Coverage (UHC) in Africa: a framework for action.
  404 Washington, DC: World Bank Group, 2016.
- 405 5 Carapinha JL, Ross-Degnan D, Desta AT, Wagner AK. Health insurance systems in five
  406 Sub-Saharan African countries: medicine benefits and data for decision making. *Health*407 *Policy* 2011; 99: 193–202.
- Akazili J, Garshong B, Aikins M, Gyapong J, McIntyre D. Progressivity of health care
  financing and incidence of service benefits in Ghana. *Health Policy Plan* 2012; 27:13-22.
- Alhassan RK, Nketiah-Amponsah E, Arhinful DK. A review of the national health
  insurance scheme in Ghana: what are the sustainability threats and prospects? *PLoS One*2016; 11: 1–16.
- Amporfu E. Equity of the premium of the Ghanaian National Health Insurance Scheme
  and the implications for achieving universal coverage. *Int J Equity Health* 2013; 12: 4.
- Aryeetey GC, Westeneng J, Spaan E, Jehu-Appiah C, Agyepong IA, Baltussen R. Can
  health insurance protect against out-of-pocket and catastrophic expenditures and also
  support poverty reduction? Evidence from Ghana's National Health Insurance Scheme. *Int J Equity Health* 2016; 15: 116.
- 419 10 World Bank. Data Bank: World Development Indicators.
- 420 http://databank.worldbank.org/data/reports.aspx?source=world-development-indicators.
  421 Accessed November 2, 2017.
- 422 11 Barros AJ, Victora CG. Measuring coverage in MNCH: determining and interpreting
  423 inequalities in coverage of maternal, newborn, and child health interventions. *PLoS Med*424 2013; 10(5): e1001390.
- 425 12 Boerma JT, Bryce J, Kinfu Y, Axelson H, Victora CG. Mind the gap: equity and trends in coverage of maternal, newborn, and child health services in 54 countdown countries.
  427 Lancet 2008; 371: 1259–67.
- 428 13 Deaton A, Zaidi S. Guidelines for constructing consumption wggregates for welfare
  429 analysis. Living Standards Measurement Study Working Paper No 135. Washington, DC:
  430 World Bank, 2002.
- 431 14 Xu K. Distribution of health payments and catastrophic expenditures methodology.
  432 Geneva: World Health Organization, 2005.
- 433 15 Nyaga VN, Arbyn M, Aerts M. Metaprop: a Stata command to perform meta-analysis of
  434 binomial data. *Arch Public Heal* 2014; 72: 39.
- How Blanchet NJ, Fink G, Osei-Akoto I. The effect of Ghana's National Health Insurance
  Scheme on health care utilization. *Ghana Med J* 2012; 46(2): 9.
- 437 17 Singh K, Osei-Akoto I, Otchere F, *et al.* Ghana's National Health insurance scheme and
  438 maternal and child health: a mixed methods study. *BMC Health Serv Res* 2015; 15: 108.

Wang W, Temsah G, Mallick L. The impact of health insurance on maternal health care

439

18

440 utilization: evidence from Ghana, Indonesia and Rwanda. Health Policy Plan 2017; 441 32(3): 366-375. 442 19 Bonfrer I, Breebaart L, Van de Poel E. The effects of Ghana's National Health Insurance 443 Scheme on maternal and infant health care utilization. PLoS One 2016; 444 11(11):e0165623. 445 20 Nyonator F, Ofosu A, Segbafah M, d'Almeida S. Monitoring and evaluating progress 446 towards Universal Health Coverage in Ghana. PLoS Med 2014; 11(9): e1001691. 447 21 Enuameh YA, Okawa S, Asante KP, Kikuchi K, Mahama E, Ansah E, et al. Factors 448 influencing health facility delivery in predominantly rural communities across the three 449 ecological zones in Ghana: a cross-sectional study. PLoS One 2016; 11(3):e0152235. 450 22 Foreit J, Raifman S. Increasing access to family planning and reproductive health services 451 through task-sharing between community health workers and community mid-level 452 professionals in large-scale public-sector programs: a literature review to help guide case 453 studies. 2011; 1–31. 454 Abbey M, Chinbuah MA, Gyapong M, Bartholomew LK, van den Borne B. Community 23 455 perceptions and practices of treatment seeking for childhood pneumonia: a mixed 456 methods study in a rural district, Ghana. BMC Public Health 2016; 16: 848. 457 Gajate-Garrido G, Owusua R. The National Health Insurance Scheme in Ghana: 24 458 implementation challenges and proposed solutions. International Food Policy Research 459 Institute, 2013. 460 25 Baatiema L, Sumah AM, Tang PN, Ganle JK. Community health workers in Ghana: the 461 need for greater policy attention. BMJ Glob Heal 2016; 1: e000141. Yeji F, Shibanuma A, Oduro A, et al. Continuum of care in a maternal, newborn and 462 26 child health program in Ghana: low completion rate and multiple obstacle factors. PLoS 463 464 One 2015; 10: 1–23. 27 465 Jehu-Appiah C, Aryeetey G, Spaan E, de Hoop T, Agyepong I, Baltussen R. Equity 466 aspects of the National Health Insurance Scheme in Ghana: Who is enrolling, who is not 467 and why? Soc Sci Med 2011; 72: 157-65. 468 28 Kusi A, Enemark U, Hansen KS, Asante FA. Refusal to enrol in Ghana's National Health 469 Insurance Scheme: is affordability the problem? Int J Equity Health 2015; 14: 2. 470 29 Nguyen HTH, Rajkotia Y, Wang H. The financial protection effect of Ghana National Health Insurance Scheme: evidence from a study in two rural districts. Int J Equity 471 Health 2011; 10: 4. 472 473 30 Ghana Statistical Services, Ghana Health Service, ICF International, Ghana Demographic 474 and Health Survey 2014. Rockville, Marvland, 2015. 475 Onarheim KH, Taddesse M, Norheim OF, Abdullah M, Miljeteig I. Towards universal 31 476 health coverage for reproductive health services in Ethiopia: two policy 477 recommendations. Int J Equity Health 2015; 14: 86. Akazili J, McIntvre D, Kanmiki EW, et al. Assessing the catastrophic effects of out-of-478 32 479 pocket healthcare payments prior to the uptake of a nationwide health insurance scheme 480 in Ghana. Glob Health Action 2017; 10. Mills A, Ataguba JE, Akazili J, et al. Equity in financing and use of health care in Ghana, 481 33 South Africa, and Tanzania: Implications for paths to universal coverage. Lancet 2012; 482 483 380: 126-33. Onwujekwe O, Hanson K, Uzochukwu B. Examining inequities in incidence of 484 34

485		catastrophic health expenditures on different healthcare services and health facilities in
486		Nigeria. PLoS One 2012; 7: 1–6.
487	35	Lu C, Chin B, Lewandowski JL, et al. Towards universal health coverage: an evaluation
488		of Rwanda Mutuelles in its first eight years. PLoS One 2012; 7.
489	36	Onoka CA, Onwujekwe OE, Hanson K, Uzochukwu BS. Examining catastrophic health
490		expenditures at variable thresholds using household consumption expenditure diaries.
491		<i>Trop Med Int Heal</i> 2011; 16: 1334–41.
492	37	Akazili J, McIntyre D, Kanmiki EW, et al. Assessing the impoverishment effects of out-
493		of-pocket healthcare payments prior to the uptake of a nationwide health insurance
494		scheme in Ghana. Glob Health Action 2017; 10: 1-8.
495	38	Somkotra T, Lagrada LP. Payments for health care and its effect on catastrophe and
496		impoverishment: Experience from the transition to Universal Coverage in Thailand. Soc
497		<i>Sci Med</i> 2008; 67: 2027–35.
498	39	Kusi A, Hansen KS, Asante FA, Enemark U. Does the National Health Insurance Scheme
499		provide financial protection to households in Ghana? BMC Health Serv Res 2015; 15:
500		331.
501	40	Prakongsai P, Limwattananon S. The equity impact of the universal coverage policy:
502		lessons from Thailand. 2009; 21.
503	41	Apoya P, Marriott A. Achieving a shared goal: free universal health care in Ghana.
504		Oxford, U.K: Oxfam International, 2011

- 505 Supporting information
- 506 S1 Table: Health service indicators
- 507 S2 Table: Deviance information criteria for health service indicators
- 508 S3 Table: Quintile-specific coverage of reproductive, maternal, and child health services in
- 509 Ghana, 1995-2030
- 510 S4 Table: Quintile-specific vaccination coverage in Ghana, 1995-2030
- 511 S5 Table: Quintile specific coverage of disease prevention and environmental health
- 512 indicators in Ghana, 1995-2030
- 513 S6 Table: Quintile specific coverage of treatment services for delivery care and childhood
- 514 illnesses in Ghana, 1995-2030
- 515 S7 Table: Quintile-specific coverage of composite indices for health services in Ghana,
- 516 **1995-2030**
- 517 S8 Table: Relative index of inequalities (RII) in health service indicators, 1995-2030
- 518 S9 Table: Overall prevention and treatment service coverage at the subnational level in
- 519 Ghana, 1995-2030
- 520 S10 Table: Impoverishment at the subnational level in Ghana, 1995-2030
- 521 S11 Table: Survey characteristics
- 522 S1 Figure: Trends and projections of composite coverage index in Ghana, 1993-2030

- 523 S2 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of insecticide treated bed nets for
- 524 children under five and pregnant women in Ghana, 2003-2030
- 525 S3 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of antenatal and postnatal care for
- 526 women in Ghana, 1993-2030
- 527 S4 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of family planning needs satisfied and
- 528 exclusive breastfeeding in Ghana, 1993-2030
- 529 S5 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of delivery care services in Ghana,
- 530 **1993-2030**
- 531 S6 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of measles and polio vaccination in
- 532 Ghana, 1993-2030
- 533 S7 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of BCG and DPT vaccination in Ghana,
- 534 **1993-2030**
- 535 S8 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of treatment services for childhood
- 536 illnesses in Ghana, 1993-2030
- 537 S9 Figure: Trends and projections of the coverage of environmental health indicators in
- 538 Ghana, 1993-2030
- 539 S10 Figure: Trends and projections of non-tobacco users in Ghana, 2003-2030







