Interregional causal influences of brain metabolic activity reveal the spread of aging effects during

normal aging

Xin Di [1, 2], Marie Wölfer [1, 3, 4], Mario Amend [5], Hans Wehrl[5], Tudor M. Ionescu [5], Bernd J. Pichler [5],

Bharat B. Biswal [1, 2, *], the Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging Initiative [#]

1. Department of Biomedical Engineering, New Jersey Institute of Technology, Newark, NJ, 07029, USA

2. School of Life Sciences and Technology, University of Electronic Science and Technology of China,

Chengdu, China

3. Clinical Affective Neuroimaging Laboratory (CANLAB), Otto-von-Guericke-University Magdeburg,

Magdeburg, Germany

4. Department for Behavioral Neurology, Leibniz Institute for Neurobiology, Magdeburg, Germany

5. Werner Siemens Imaging Center, Department of Preclinical Imaging and Radiopharmacy, Eberhard

Karls University Tuebingen, Germany

* Corresponding author:

Bharat B. Biswal, PhD

607 Fenster Hall, University Height

Newark, NJ, 07102, USA

bbiswal@yahoo.com

Data used in preparation of this article were obtained from the Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging

Initiative (ADNI) database (adni.loni.usc.edu). As such, the investigators within the ADNI contributed to

the design and implementation of ADNI and/or provided data but did not participate in analysis or writing

of this report. A complete listing of ADNI investigators can be found at: http://adni.loni.usc.edu/wp-

content/uploads/how_to_apply/ADNI_Acknowledgement_List.pdf

Funding acknowledgements

This study was funded by (US) National Institute of Health grants: R01AT009829 and R01DA038895.

Running headline: Causal brain metabolic connectivity in aging

Abstract

During healthy brain aging, different brain regions show anatomical or functional declines at different

rates, and some regions may show compensatory increases in functional activity. However, few studies

have explored interregional influences of brain activity during the aging process. We proposed a

causality analysis framework combining high dimensionality independent component analysis (ICA),

Granger causality, and LASSO (least absolute shrinkage and selection operator) regression on

longitudinal brain metabolic activity data measured by Fludeoxyglucose positron emission tomography

(FDG-PET). We analyzed FDG-PET images from healthy old subjects, who were scanned for at least

five sessions with an averaged intersession interval of about one year. The longitudinal data were

concatenated across subjects to form a time series, and the first order autoregressive model was used to

measure interregional causality among the independent sources of metabolic activity identified using ICA.

Several independent sources with reduced metabolic activity in aging, including the anterior temporal

lobe and orbital frontal cortex, demonstrated causal influences over many widespread brain regions. On

the other hand, the influenced regions were more distributed, and had smaller age related declines or even

relatively increased metabolic activity. The current data demonstrated interregional spreads of aging on

metabolic activity at the scale of a year, and have identified key brain regions in the aging process that

have strong influences over other regions.

Keyword: aging, anterior temporal lobe, Granger causality, LASSO regression, metabolic connectivity,

orbitofrontal cortex.

1. Introduction

The human brain undergoes development and aging across the entire life-span. Neuroimaging studies have demonstrated that different brain regions develop and age in different rates. The global gray matter volume decreases linearly after 20s of age, but some regions such as the bilateral insula, superior parietal gyri, central sulci, and cingulate sulci show faster volumetric declines as measured by voxel-based morphometry (Good et al., 2001). Cortical thickness measures show more widespread cortical thinning patterns during aging (Salat et al., 2004). In contrast, results from functional MRI studies (fMRI) are more complex with some brain regions show increased activations in certain tasks rather than declined activations accompanied with anatomical declines (Di, Rypma, & Biswal, 2014; Spreng, Wojtowicz, & Grady, 2010). In addition, the functional alterations in aging may depend on the task domains and behavioral performances (Spreng et al., 2010), making it difficult to conclude a region to be functionally increased or decreased in aging. A complementary approach is to study brain activity during a state without specific behavioral involvement, i.e. resting-state. Studies have been performed earlier using positron emission tomography (PET) (Kuhl, Metter, Riege, & Phelps, 1982; Martin, Friston, Colebatch, & Frackowiak, 1991; Zuendorf, Kerrouche, Herholz, & Baron, 2003), and later using resting-state fMRI (Biswal et al., 2010). Using a large sample of over 1,000 subjects, Biswal and colleagues have showed reduced resting-state activity in aging mainly in the default model network and increased activity in the visual, motor, and subcortical regions (Biswal et al., 2010).

Functionally related brain regions typically show similar co-development (Alexander-Bloch, Raznahan, Bullmore, & Giedd, 2013) or co-decline, therefore yielding cross-subject interregional covariances. This has been shown as early as 1980s using regional cerebral blood flow data (Prohovnik, Håkansson, & Risberg, 1980) and regional metabolic activity data (Horwitz, Duara, & Rapoport, 1984; Metter, Riege, Kuhl, & Phelps, 1984) measured using PET. Later, more sophisticated methods, such as independent component analysis (ICA) and graph theory based analysis, have been applied to PET data to study the brain metabolic covariance networks (Di et al., 2017; Di & Biswal, and Alzheimer's Disease

Neu, 2012). Correlated metabolic activity or blood flow was typically found between left/right

homotopic regions, and between some within hemisphere regions that are functionally related, e.g.

language related regions in the left hemisphere. However, different connectivity patterns have been found

between this metabolic covariance connectivity and the resting-state connectivity that has been typically

observed from fMRI data (Di et al., 2017; Di & Biswal, and Alzheimer's Disease Neu, 2012). The inter-

subject covariance patterns have also been shown using other imaging modalities, such as brain volumes

(Di & Biswal, 2016; Douaud et al., 2014; Mechelli, Friston, Frackowiak, & Price, 2005), cortical

thickness (Lerch et al., 2006), and different resting-state fMRI indices (P. A. Taylor, Gohel, Di, Walter, &

Biswal, 2012; Zhang et al., 2011).

Given the different rates of declines or relative preservations of different brain regions in aging,

and large scale brain networks working in synchrony during both task execution and resting-state

(Bullmore & Sporns, 2009, 2012; Di, Gohel, Kim, & Biswal, 2013), it is likely that the regions that are

working together affect each other during the aging process. Specifically, a region that declines faster

may influence another region during functional interactions in everyday basis; therefore would cause the

other region to decline or show a compensatory increase of functional activity. So, it is critical to study

the causal interregional influences between regions rather than the simple covariance, especially at the

time scale of months to years when brain aging could be observed. Although regional brain aging is

generally assumed to be linear in trend, the observed regional brain measures might showed fluctuation

along the linear trend (Figure 1). The causal influence between regions could then be captured by

causality analysis methods such as Granger causality (Granger, 1969). By using Granger causality we

could examine whether the brain activity in a brain region at time points of months or years earlier can

predict the activity of another brain region at the current time point. Granger causality at the similar time

scales has been studied on brain morphological progressions in epilepsy (Zhang et al., 2017) and

schizophrenia (Jiang et al., 2018) based on anatomical MRI data. However, both of these studies are

cross-sectional. Large-scale multi-site longitudinal open access dataset, such as Alzheimer's Disease

Neuroimaging Initiative (ADNI), has made it possible to examine causal influences during aging in a

within-subject manner. Extending our previous work on metabolic covariance networks using

Fludeoxyglucose (FDG) PET images (Di et al., 2017; Di & Biswal, and Alzheimer's Disease Neu, 2012),

we sought in the current study to examine the interregional causal influences of metabolic activity during

aging.

Figure 1 An illustration of interregional causal effects during aging. Regions A and B both show linear

declines during aging at different rates, with additional fluctuations along the linear trends. The

fluctuations of region A influences those in region B, so that an event in A can be observed one time point

111   later in B (e.g. the marked peak at age 66 and 67 in A and B, respectively).

The aim of the current study is to explore the causal interregional influences of metabolic activity

during normal aging at the time scale of a year. We leveraged the longitudinal FDG-PET data from the

ADNI dataset, where there were at least five sessions of FDG-PET scans for each subject at a time step of

approximately one year. First, we examined age effects of metabolic activity to identify regions with

accelerated declines, with no apparent age effects, and with relative increases. Second, we performed

whole brain Granger causality analysis to identify causal influences, where the metabolic activity in a

region at a certain time point can be predicted by the metabolic activity in another region at the previous

time point. We predict that the regions that show accelerated declines during aging will cause other

regions to decline, thus showing interregional spreads of age effects.

2. Materials and methods

2.1 ADNI data

Data used in the preparation of this article were obtained from the ADNI database (ADNI - Alzheimer's

Disease Neuroimaging Initiative: RRID:SCR_003007; adni.loni.usc.edu). The ADNI was launched in

2003 as a public-private partnership, led by Principal Investigator Michael W. Weiner, MD. The primary

goal of ADNI has been to test whether serial magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), positron emission

tomography (PET), other biological markers, and clinical and neuropsychological assessment can be

combined to measure the progression of mild cognitive impairment (MCI) and early Alzheimer's disease

(AD). For up-to-date information, see www.adni-info.org.

Only data from healthy participants were included in the current analysis. All participants

showed no signs of depression, mild cognitive impairment, or dementia, with Mini-Mental State Exam

(MMSE) scores between 24 and 30 and Clinical Dementia Rating (CDR) score of 0. We manually

selected longitudinal FDG-PET images from the ADNI database, with participants who had at least five

sessions of FDG-PET images available. As a result, 72 subjects (25 females) were included in the current

analysis with a total of 432 PET scan sessions. The numbers of available sessions ranged from 5 to 9

(Figure 2A). The average age at the first session was 75.8 years (62 to 86 years). For each session, we

calculated a mean image or adopted the only image to represent the session. The main analysis focused

on the changes and causal influences over the time scale of sessions. The intersession interval with a

subject varied from 3 months to up to 8 years for a few rare cases (Figure 2B). The mean and median of

the intersession intervals were 1.02 and 0.98 years, respectively.

Figure 2 Histograms of the numbers of sessions for each subject (A) and the intersession intervals for all

the sessions and subjects (B). The participants were typically studied at 0, 6, 12, 24, 36 months, and

yearly follow-ups. Therefore, the intersession intervals are likely to be around six months or one year.

148   The FDG-PET images were acquired from multiple sites with different PET imaging protocols.

However, the imaging parameters were mostly similar across different sessions within a subject. Since

the current analyses were all within-subject, the impacts of different imaging parameters from different

sites can be effectively minimized. More information about the PET protocol can be found in (Jagust et

al., 2010). All the images and subjects included in the current analysis can be found at:

https://osf.io/4a3vt/?view_only=74b5ca53938c4dda9eb51ee338f9a0ab.

2.2. PET data preprocessing

The PET data were preprocessed using SPM12 (SPM: RRID:SCR_007037;

https://www.fil.ion.ucl.ac.uk/spm/) under MATLAB R2017b. For each subject, if there were more than

one PET image in a session, all the PET images in the session were realigned to the first image and one

mean image of a session was calculated. The mean images (or the only image) across all the sessions of a

subject were then realigned to the image obtained in the first session. The cross-session mean image was

normalized directly to the PET template in SPM in standard Montreal Neurological Institute (MNI) space,

and then all the images were normalized to MNI space using the same set of parameters. We chose the

direct normalization approach rather than using an anatomical MRI as a mediator, because the spatial

resolutions of the PET images were adequate and the direct normalization has its own advantage

compared with the anatomical MRI mediated method (Vince D. Calhoun et al., 2017). The images were

then spatially smoothed using a Gaussian kernel with 8 mm FWHM (full width at half maximum). Lastly,

each image was divided by its mean signal within an intracranial volume mask.

2.3. Independent component analysis

We first performed spatial ICA to separate the whole brain metabolic maps into independent sources of

local metabolic variations (Di & Biswal, and Alzheimer's Disease Neu, 2012). We extracted a relatively

high number of ICs, so that the resulting ICs could represent more local variations than large scale

networks (Fu et al., 2018, 2019; Smith et al., 2013). This data-driven approach is an alternative to atlas-

based parcellation, and may be more representative to local variations of metabolic activity. The ICA was

performed using Group ICA of fMRI Toolbox (GIFT: RRID:SCR_001953;

http://mialab.mrn.org/software/gift) (V D Calhoun, Adali, Pearlson, & Pekar, 2001). The preprocessed

FDG-PET images from different sessions and subjects were concatenated into a single time series, and

fed into the ICA analysis. Eighty one components were recommended by the minimum description

length (MDL) algorithm implemented in GIFT. After IC extraction of the 81 components, the ICs were

visually inspected and grouped into eight domains (Supplementary materials) as well as 21 noise

components. There were in total 60 ICs included in the following analysis. For each IC, the associated

time series were obtained to represent metabolic activity of this source in different subjects and sessions.

The 81 IC maps are available at: https://osf.io/4a3vt/?view_only=74b5ca53938c4dda9eb51ee338f9a0ab.

2.4. Regional age effects

For each subject, a general linear model (GLM) was built to examine the linear aging effect. The GLM

included two regressors, a constant term and a linear age effect. The GLM analysis was performed on

each IC, and the β values of the age effect were obtained. Group level analysis was then performed on

each IC using a one sample t test model to examine the group averaged effect of age. A FDR (false

discovery rate) corrected $p < 0.05$ was used to identify ICs that had significant age effects after correcting

for all the 60 comparisons. Thereafter, the ICs were sorted into three groups, with significant (relative)

increased metabolic activity, with no significant changes, and with significant decreased metabolic

activity in aging.

2.5. Interregional causality analysis

We adopted Granger causality like method to examine the interregional causal influence of metabolic

activity. Specifically, we treated the longitudinal FDG-PET data as time series, and used autoregressive

model to predict the value of time point t in a region y by the previous time points of another region x,

when controlling for its own previous time points of y. In the current data, the time step is approximately

one year. To account for the variability of intersession interval, the intervals between time points t and t –

1 were added as a covariate or regressed out in the analysis (see below for details). Another consideration

is the order of the model, i.e. how many previous time points are used to predict the current time point. In

this study, we used only the first order model to measure the causal influence of only one previous time

point, which represents a time step of about one year. The limited number of time points in a subject

prevents us to use higher order models. The advantage of using only the first order model is that the sign

information of the beta estimate enables us to differentiate positive and negative prediction effects. The

model can be expressed in the following form:

$$y_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \cdot y_{t-1} + \beta_2 \cdot x_{t-1} + \varepsilon$$

where y represents the predicted time series in one brain region, and x represents the predicting time series

of another brain region. y_{t-1} represent the time series of y_t which moved one time point ahead, thus

representing a autoregression model of time series y_t. The effect of interest is the predicting value of x_{t-1},

which is β_2.

We concatenated the time series across all the subjects to form a long time series for analysis

(Figure 3). Therefore, the model is considered fixed effect model. The first to m_i time series of a subject

were first z transformed to minimize inter-subject variation, where m_i represents the total number of time

points in a subject i. For each subject, we included the time points 2 to m of a region as the predicted

variable y_t. The autoregressive variable y_{t-1} of the same region included the time points 1 to m - 1. The

predicting variable x_{t-1} was the time points 1 to m – 1 from another region x. After concatenation, there

were in total 360 data points in the time series.

Figure 3 Illustration of the construction of the variables used in the causality analysis. X represents the

predicting region, and y represents the predicted region. The superscript represents different subjects,

with a total number of n. The subscript represents the scan session in a subject, with a total number of mi

220   for a subject i.

The model could be applied to each pair of the ICs from the 60 ICs. The intersession interval

between time t and time $t – 1$ were included in the model as a covariate. We first performed such analysis

on each pair of ICs to obtain the predicting effect (β_2) and corresponding p values, which formed a 60 x

60 matrix of causal effects. FDR correction at $p < 0.05$ was used to correct for multiple comparisons of

the in total 3,540 (60 x 59) effects, where autoregressive effects along the diagonal were not tested.

This pair-wise approach may identify influences from different regions with shared variance

although maybe only one region has direct influence with the tested region. To overcome this, when

predicting a region x^i_t, one can add all the other ICs to identify which region can predict x^i_t. The model is

then as following for a predicted region x^i:

$$x^i_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \cdot x^1_{t-1} + \beta_2 \cdot x^2_{t-1} + \beta_3 \cdot x^3_{t-1} + ... + \beta_p \cdot x^p_{t-1} + \varepsilon$$

Since all the ICs were included in the model, there was no need to differentiate the variables of x and y.

Therefore, we use x to denote all the time series variables. The superscripts of x now represent different

ICs, where p represents the total number of the IC. Before entering in to the model, a time series

representing the intersession interval between time point t and t – 1 were regressed out from all the x_{t-1}

time series to account for the intersession interval variability. Estimating the multivariate model may be

challenging, especially when some of the IC time series may be highly correlated. It can be assumed that

only a small number of ICs may influence the predicted IC. In this scenario, one can use regularization

method to estimate the sparse influence effects, such as using LASSO (least absolute shrinkage and

selection operator) (Tang, Bressler, Sylvester, Shulman, & Corbetta, 2012; Tibshirani, 1996). The

motivation of choosing LASSO over other regularization methods is that the LASSO regularization can

force some parameters in the model to be zero thus resulting in only a small number of non-zero

parameters. This is important in the current context, because the aim is to identify a small number of

interregional influences. Since this model examines the prediction of the time series of one IC by the

time series of all the other ICs, the analysis only needed to be performed for 60 times (compared with 60

x 59 times in the pair-wise analysis) to cover all the ICs.

The LASSO regression was performed using the lasso function implemented in MATLAB. To

determine an optimal regularization factor λ, we used a set of λ from 0 (no regularization) to 0.5 with a

step of 0.001. The identified non-zero influences dropped dramatically as the increase of λ. We identify

the λ where the number of non-zero influences were the closest to the number of significant effects when

using FDR correction in pair-wise analysis, and reported all non-zero influencing effects.

The resulting 60 x 60 influencing matrix can be treated as a directed network graph, where the

ICs represent the nodes and the causal influences represent directed edges of the graph. We calculated in-

degree and out-degree of the 60 nodes to characterize the importance of an IC in the whole brain

influencing graph. To ensure that the degree calculation was not affected by arbitrary defined threshold,

we also explored the graphs from other λ values to verify the identified hub regions are still present. To

visualize the network topology, we identified the giant component where all the nodes in the component

were somehow connected (without considering the direction of the influences). The giant components

were visualized using the force layout.

3. Results

3.1. Age effect on regional metabolic activity

We first examined the age effects on the regional metabolic activity for the 60 ICs. Statistical significant

ICs at $p < 0.05$ after FDR correction are shown in Figure 4. Eighteen ICs showed significant reduced

metabolic activity, including one IC that covered the inferior portion of the cerebellum (IC 1), three ICs

that coved visual cortex (IC 17, 32, and 53), three ICs that covered the posterior parietal cortex (IC 21, 27,

and 28), five ICs that covered the anterior portion of the temporal lobe and insula (IC 24, 44, 63, 66, and

77), one IC that covered the thalamus and basal ganglia (IC 23), two ICs that covered the orbital frontal

cortex and frontal pole (IC 3 and 48), and three ICs that covered the cingulate cortex and neighboring

midline cortical regions (IC 7, 37, and 46). The left panel of Figure 5 illustrates the age effects of an

example IC (IC 48) with negative age effect. It can be seen that there is a general linear trend of decrease

of metabolic activity. But each subject showed fluctuations of metabolic activity along the linear trend.

In contrast, 6 ICs showed increased metabolic activity. It should be noted that due to the nature of PET

imaging, the global signal for each PET image has to be normalized. Therefore, it is difficult to say

whether the positive age effect represents increased metabolic activity, or a relative increase with

reference to the global effect. The ICs with relative increased metabolic activity during aging included

one IC covering the inferior and posterior portion of the cerebellum (IC 13), two subcortical ICs covering

the basal ganglia, insula, amygdala, and thalamus (IC 19 and 52), and three ICs of sensorimotor regions

(IC 36, 50, and 68). The right panel of Figure 5 illustrates the age effects of an example IC (IC 19) with

positive age effect. There were 36 ICs that did not show statistically significant age effects at $p < 0.05$

after FDR correction. The middle panel of Figure 5 illustrates the age effects of an example IC (IC 56)

with no statistical significant age effect.

Figure 4 The independent components (ICs) that showed statistically significant decreased (blue) and

increased (red) metabolic activity during aging after controlling for global effect at p < 0.05 with false

discovery rate (FDR) correction.   The numbers to the bottom right represent the IC number.

Figure 5 Examples of aging effects of metabolic activity of three ICs that had the negative, no-significant,

and positive aging effects. T and p values represent group-level analysis one sample t test statistics. A.u.,

arbitrary unit.

3.2. Interregional causal influences of metabolic activity

We first applied pairwise autoregressive model to obtain a 60 x 60 matrix of the interregional causal

influences of metabolic activity between each pair of the ICs (Figure 6A). When using a statistical

threshold of $p < 0.05$ of FDR correction, 14 positive and 13 negative causal influences were identified

(Figure 6B). We next performed LASSO regression with x_t of an IC as the predicted variable and x_{t-1} of

all the ICs as the predicting variables using a range of λ. We identified the λ value where the number of

non-zero effects was the closest to the number of significant effects in the pairwise analysis. The

resulting influencing effects at $\lambda = 0.162$ (Figure 6C) look in general similar to the significant effects

identified by the pairwise analysis, although some subtle differences can be noted. There were 15

positive and 13 negative causal influences identified using the LASSO regression method (Table 1).

Figure 6 A, Pairwise matrix of interregional causal influence of metabolic activity. The columns

represent influencing ICs, while the rows represent influenced ICs. B, Ternary matrix of significant

positive or negative interregional causal influences thresholded at $p < 0.05$ after false discovery rate (FDR)

correction. C, Ternary matrix of positive or negative interregional causal influences identified at $\lambda = 0.16$

using LASSO (least absolute shrinkage and selection operator) regression.

Among the 28 causal influences from the LASSO regression analysis, the first giant component

was comprised of 26 causal influences involving 25 ICs (Figure 7). The IC maps were color coded based

on their regional age effects to illustrate the relationships between regional metabolic activity changes and

the signs of causal influences. It can be seen that the influences between two decreased regions or two

increased regions in aging were in general positive, but the influences between one increased and one

decreased regions were in general negative. For example, the bilateral anterior temporal IC (IC# 63 in

Figure 6) positively influenced the medial parietal IC (IC# 27), but negatively influenced the basal

ganglia IC (IC# 19). It is consistent with the direction of the spread of age effects. There were also ICs

that without apparent age effects, where the signs of causal influences with other regions did not show

clear pattern.

Figure 7 The first giant component of interregional causal influences network at λ of 0.162. The colors

of the independent component maps represent increased (red), decreased (blue), and non-significant

effects (green) of metabolic activity with age. The colors of the arrows represent positive (red) and

negative (blue) interregional influences, respectively. The maps highlighted with yellow circle represent

325   hub regions in the network.

327   To better illustrate the topology of the interregional influencing network and to highlight the

regions that are more influencing or influenced to other regions, we plotted the first giant components of

the interregional influencing network using force layout at $\lambda = 0.162$, and also at more liberal thresholds

of $\lambda = 0.142$ and $\lambda = 0.122$ (Figure 8). The node sizes represent the out-degree or in-degree of a node in

the network in the upper and middle panels, respectively. It can be seen that the nodes with large out-

degree were in general the regions with decreased metabolic activity (blue nodes). And the red arrows

highlighted the two nodes that had 5 out-degrees at $\lambda = 0.162$ and remained among the highest out-degree

nodes at the lower λ values. These two nodes were also highlighted in Figure 7, which covered bilateral

orbitofrontal cortex (IC# 48) and the bilateral anterior temporal lobe (IC# 63). While in terms of in-

degree, there were no clear regions that had exceptionally high in-degree compared with other nodes. The

node with high in-degree had no apparent age effects (green nodes) or had increased metabolic activity

with age (brown nodes). The distributions of nodal out- and in-degree confirmed that the out-degree

distributions had heavy tailed distributions compared with the in-degree distributions (lower panels in

Figure 8).

Figure 8 The giant component of the causal interregional influencing network of metabolic activity at different λ levels with the sizes of the nodes reflecting out-degree (top row) and in-degree (middle row). The bottom row shows the degree distributions of the whole influencing network at the three λ levels. Brown and blue arrows indicate positive and negative influences identified using LASSO regression. Blue, green, and brown regions indicate positive, none, and negative age effects on regional metabolic activity. The red arrows highlight the two influencing nods at different λ levels.

4. Discussion

By applying autoregressive model on longitudinal FDG-PET data, the current study demonstrated causal interregional influences of metabolic activity during normal aging. Several ICs with significant reduced metabolic activity in aging, including the orbital frontal cortex and anterior temporal lobe, causally

influenced many other ICs. In contrast, the influenced ICs were more widespread and with less local

aging effects or even with relatively increased metabolic activity. To the best of our knowledge, this is

the first study to demonstrate longitudinal interregional causal influences of brain activity during aging at

the time scale of a year.

Consistent with our prediction of interregional spreads of age effects, the influencing ICs usually

had decreased metabolic activity. On the other hand, the influenced regions were not restricted to the

regions with reduced metabolic activity in aging. Indeed, the ICs that had relatively greater in-degree

values than other ICs were usually without apparent age effects, or even with relatively increased

metabolic activity, e.g. the basal ganglia and thalamus. Therefore, the causal interregional influences in

general reflected the spread of age effects from brain regions that had already declined to regions that are

declining or relatively preserved. We note that the absence of regional age effects should be interpreted

with caution, because the removal of global effects during calculation of regional age effects could have

removed significant age effects that were similar to the global effects.

The interpretation of the causal influences need to consider both the sign of the causal influences

and the regional age effects. A positive influence indicates that the metabolic activity in region A at the

current time point positively predicts the metabolic activity in region B at the next time point. While a

negative influence indicates a negative prediction. If the two regions are both decreasing during aging,

then a positive influence may indicate a spread of metabolic activity decline between the two regions. On

the other hand, if region A decreases but region B shows relatively increased metabolic activity, and there

is a negative influence between A and B, then it may indicate a compensation of region B that is resulted

from the declined function of region A. A close look at the patterns of the directions of the local and

interregional effects indicated that most of the effects observed were consistent with the spatial spread or

compensation interpretations. That is, the influences between two decreased regions were all positive,

and the influences between one decreased region and one increased regions were all negative.

The current analysis identified several hubs that influenced other brain regions, most prominently

the anterior temporal lobe and orbital frontal cortex. The anterior temporal lobe (IC 63) is connected to

several major white matter tracts such the cingulum, inferior longitudinal fasciculus, and uncinate

fasciculus (Catani & Thiebaut de Schotten, 2008), which could support its influencing role to other

regions such as the subcortical regions, inferior frontal cortex, and left temporal cortex. To better

characterize its functional correlates, we submitted the IC map into NeuroVault (NeuroVault,

RRID:SCR_003806; https://neurovault.org), and decoded the functions of these maps using large-scale

meta-analytic data from Neurosynth (NeuroSynth, RRID:SCR_006798; http://neurosynth.org/) (Rubin et

al., 2017). The first five functional terms are all about language and semantic processing (See

Supplementary Table S2). Studies also showed that electrical stimulation of the anterior temporal lobe

can improve proper name recalls in aging (Ross, McCoy, Coslett, Olson, & Wolk, 2011), and

bilingualism can protect the integrity of anterior temporal lobe in aging (Abutalebi et al., 2014). Taken

together, the results suggest that language process might be an important factor modulating brain aging.

The orbital frontal cortex (IC 48) is connected to the uncinate fasciculus and inferior fronto-

occipital fasciculus (Catani & Thiebaut de Schotten, 2008), which could support its influences to the

posterior visual regions. The functional words related to the orbitofrontal IC were mainly about

emotional processing (Supplementary Table S2). In older population, smaller orbitofrontal volumes are

shown to be associated with depression (Lai, Payne, Byrum, Steffens, & Krishnan, 2000; W. D. Taylor et

al., 2003). Taken together, emotional process might also be an important factor modulating brain aging.

However, although previous studies have shown associations between resting-state brain activity and task

activations (Di, Kannurpatti, Rypma, & Biswal, 2013; Yuan et al., 2013), the extent to what resting-state

brain activity can reflect certain brain functions are still largely unknown. Further studies might need to

design proper tasks to better link functions to brain activations.   A limitation of the current analysis is the

potential confounding effect due to partial volume (Bonte et al., 2017; Rousset, Ma, & Evans, 1998), i.e.

whether an observed effect is due to the changes of *bona fide* metabolic activity or the changes of

underlying gray matter volume. However, the following reasons make the partial volume confounding

less problematic. First, the current analysis adopted within subject comparison, which has already

minimized the partial volume effects due to inter subject anatomical variability. Second, we applied ICA

analysis to identify independent sources of metabolic variability. Some components that were likely due

to enlargement of ventricle may be spatially overlapped with the included ICs, have been already

removed. For example, there was an IC largely located in ventricle area (IC 79 in supplementary Figure

S9) but with substantial overlaps with the ICs of the thalamus and basal ganglia (supplementary Figure

S5). The IC 79 had the second strongest negative age effect among all the ICs. The included ICs that had

spatial overlap with this IC showed no age effects or even positive age effects, suggesting that the partial

volume effects associated with enlarged ventricle have been minimized in these ICs. Third, even though

the observed causal influences may still somehow contributed by the residual partial volume effects, the

causal influences of volumetric reductions may still be important findings for understanding brain aging.

The structural MRI images are available in the ADNI dataset, but were not always acquired at the same

time point as the PET images, making the implementation of MRI images in the model difficult. Future

studies should certainly consider taking into account of anatomical information in the analysis. Indeed, it

may be theoretically more important to study the interaction or causal influences between brain anatomy

and functions in aging. According to the compensation model, the reduction of gray matter will lead to

elevated functional responses, which then give rise to less affected behavioral performances (Gregory et

al., 2018; Reuter-Lorenz & Park, 2014; Shafto & Tyler, 2014). A direct examination of causal influences

among local gray matter structures, functions, and behavioral performances may provide more insight to

the dynamic of compensation process in aging.

One strength of the current analysis approach is that we adopted multivariate methods and

LASSO to include all the ICs in the predicting models, which in theory can prevent identifying ICs that

have indirect predicting effects to the target (Smith et al., 2011; Tang et al., 2012). On the other hand,

there are also several simplifications of the Granger causality analysis, such as the inclusion of only the

first order model and the assumption of equal time steps. Since the current study is the first to explore the

causality in the aging process, the time lag of the aging progression is still largely unknown and bear

further studies. But practically due to the limited availability of longitudinal data, this question is difficult

to solve at the current stage. Regarding the variable time steps of the time series, we added the

intersession interval as a covariate to minimize the effects, which is similar to a previous work (Jiang et

al., 2018). More sophisticated models, such as generative model and differential equation based method

(G. Ziegler, Penny, Ridgway, Ourselin, & Friston, 2015; Gabriel Ziegler, Ridgway, Blakemore,

Ashburner, & Penny, 2017), may be used in future to better characterize the causal effects.

5. Conclusion

By applying Granger causality analysis on longitudinal FDG-PET images of healthy old participants at a

time step of one year, the current analysis revealed interregional causal influences during aging. Several

regions with reductions in local metabolic activity during aging, including the bilateral anterior temporal

lobe and orbitofrontal cortex, showed causal influences to other regions, supporting an interregional

spread of age effects in the brain. The current analysis and results could add new insights to the

neurocognitive aging literature about interregional interactions during the aging process.

Acknowledgements

Data collection and sharing for this project was funded by the Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging

Initiative (ADNI) (National Institutes of Health Grant U01 AG024904) and DOD ADNI (Department of

Defense award number W81XWH-12-2-0012). ADNI is funded by the National Institute on Aging, the

National Institute of Biomedical Imaging and Bioengineering, and through generous contributions from

the following: AbbVie, Alzheimer's Association; Alzheimer's Drug Discovery Foundation; Araclon

Biotech; BioClinica, Inc.; Biogen; Bristol-Myers Squibb Company; CereSpir, Inc.; Cogstate; Eisai Inc.;

Elan Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Eli Lilly and Company; EuroImmun; F. Hoffmann-La Roche Ltd and its

Author contributions:

X.D. conceived the idea, developed and performed the data analysis. All authors discussed the results, and

contributed to the final manuscript.

Conflict of interest statement:

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest regarding the publication of this article.

Supplemental materials:

Supplemental materials include one word file containing nine supplementary Figures and two

supplementary Tables. Other supporting information can be found at

https://osf.io/4a3vt/?view_only=74b5ca53938c4dda9eb51ee338f9a0ab.

Reference:

Abutalebi, J., Canini, M., Della Rosa, P. A., Sheung, L. P., Green, D. W., & Weekes, B. S. (2014).

Bilingualism protects anterior temporal lobe integrity in aging. *Neurobiology of Aging*, *35*(9), 2126–

2133. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neurobiolaging.2014.03.010

Alexander-Bloch, A., Raznahan, A., Bullmore, E., & Giedd, J. (2013). The convergence of maturational

change and structural covariance in human cortical networks. *The Journal of Neuroscience : The*

Official Journal of the Society for Neuroscience, *33*(7), 2889–99.

http://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.3554-12.2013

Biswal, B. B., Mennes, M., Zuo, X.-N., Gohel, S., Kelly, C., Smith, S. M., … Milham, M. P. (2010).

Toward discovery science of human brain function. *Proceedings of the National Academy of*

Sciences of the United States of America, *107*(10), 4734–9. http://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0911855107

Bonte, S., Vandemaele, P., Verleden, S., Audenaert, K., Deblaere, K., Goethals, I., & Van Holen, R.

(2017). Healthy brain ageing assessed with 18F-FDG PET and age-dependent recovery factors after

partial volume effect correction. *European Journal of Nuclear Medicine and Molecular Imaging*,

44(5), 838–849. http://doi.org/10.1007/s00259-016-3569-0

Bullmore, E., & Sporns, O. (2009). Complex brain networks: graph theoretical analysis of structural and

functional systems. *Nature Reviews. Neuroscience*, *10*(3), 186–98. http://doi.org/10.1038/nrn2575

Bullmore, E., & Sporns, O. (2012). The economy of brain network organization. *Nature Reviews*

Neuroscience, *13*(5), 336–349. http://doi.org/10.1038/nrn3214

Calhoun, V. D., Adali, T., Pearlson, G. D., & Pekar, J. J. (2001). A method for making group inferences

from functional MRI data using independent component analysis. *Human Brain Mapping*, *14*(3),

140–51. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/11559959

Calhoun, V. D., Wager, T. D., Krishnan, A., Rosch, K. S., Seymour, K. E., Nebel, M. B., … Kiehl, K.

(2017). The impact of T1 versus EPI spatial normalization templates for fMRI data analyses. *Human*

Brain Mapping, *38*(11), 5331–5342. http://doi.org/10.1002/hbm.23737

Catani, M., & Thiebaut de Schotten, M. (2008). A diffusion tensor imaging tractography atlas for virtual

in vivo dissections. *Cortex; a Journal Devoted to the Study of the Nervous System and Behavior*,

44(8), 1105–32. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.cortex.2008.05.004

Di, X., & Biswal, and Alzheimer's Disease Neu, B. B. (2012). Metabolic Brain Covariant Networks as

Revealed by FDG-PET with Reference to Resting-State fMRI Networks. *Brain Connectivity*, *2*(5),

275–283. http://doi.org/10.1089/brain.2012.0086

Di, X., & Biswal, B. B. (2016). Similarly Expanded Bilateral Temporal Lobe Volumes in Female and

Male Children With Autism Spectrum Disorder. *Biological Psychiatry: Cognitive Neuroscience and*

Neuroimaging, *1*(2), 178–185. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.bpsc.2015.11.006

Di, X., Gohel, S., Kim, E. H., & Biswal, B. B. (2013). Task vs. rest-different network configurations

between the coactivation and the resting-state brain networks. *Frontiers in Human Neuroscience*, *7*,

493. http://doi.org/10.3389/fnhum.2013.00493

Di, X., Gohel, S., Thielcke, A., Wehrl, H. F., Biswal, B. B., & Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging

Initiative. (2017). Do all roads lead to Rome? A comparison of brain networks derived from inter-

subject volumetric and metabolic covariance and moment-to-moment hemodynamic correlations in

old individuals. *Brain Structure & Function*, *222*(8), 3833–3845. http://doi.org/10.1007/s00429-

017-1438-7

Di, X., Kannurpatti, S. S., Rypma, B., & Biswal, B. B. (2013). Calibrating BOLD fMRI Activations with

Neurovascular and Anatomical Constraints. *Cerebral Cortex (New York, N.Y. : 1991)*, *23*(2), 255–

63. http://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhs001

Di, X., Rypma, B., & Biswal, B. B. (2014). Correspondence of executive function related functional and

anatomical alterations in aging brain. *Progress in Neuro-Psychopharmacology & Biological*

Psychiatry, *48*, 41–50. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.pnpbp.2013.09.001

Douaud, G., Groves, A. R., Tamnes, C. K., Westlye, L. T., Duff, E. P., Engvig, A., … Johansen-Berg, H.

(2014). A common brain network links development, aging, and vulnerability to disease.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, *111*(49), 17648–17653.

http://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1410378111

Fu, Z., Tu, Y., Di, X., Du, Y., Pearlson, G. D., Turner, J. A., … Calhoun, V. D. (2018). Characterizing

dynamic amplitude of low-frequency fluctuation and its relationship with dynamic functional

connectivity: An application to schizophrenia. *NeuroImage*, *180*, 619–631.

http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2017.09.035

Fu, Z., Tu, Y., Di, X., Du, Y., Sui, J., Biswal, B. B., … Calhoun, V. D. (2019). Transient increased

thalamic-sensory connectivity and decreased whole-brain dynamism in autism. *NeuroImage*, *190*,

191–204. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2018.06.003

Good, C. D., Johnsrude, I. S., Ashburner, J., Henson, R. N., Friston, K. J., & Frackowiak, R. S. (2001). A

voxel-based morphometric study of ageing in 465 normal adult human brains. *NeuroImage*, *14*(1 Pt

1), 21–36. http://doi.org/10.1006/nimg.2001.0786

Granger, C. W. J. (1969). Investigating Causal Relations by Econometric Models and Cross-spectral

Methods. *Econometrica*, *37*(3), 424. http://doi.org/10.2307/1912791

Gregory, S., Long, J. D., Klöppel, S., Razi, A., Scheller, E., Minkova, L., … Orth, M. (2018). Testing a

longitudinal compensation model in premanifest Huntington's disease. *Brain*.

http://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awy122

Horwitz, B., Duara, R., & Rapoport, S. I. (1984). Intercorrelations of Glucose Metabolic Rates Between

Brain Regions: Application to Healthy Males in a State of Reduced Sensory Input. *Journal of*

Cerebral Blood Flow & Metabolism, *4*(4), 484–499. http://doi.org/10.1038/jcbfm.1984.73

Jagust, W. J., Bandy, D., Chen, K., Foster, N. L., Landau, S. M., Mathis, C. A., … Koeppe, R. A. (2010).

The Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging Initiative positron emission tomography core. *Alzheimer's*

& Dementia, *6*(3), 221–229. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.jalz.2010.03.003

Jiang, Y., Luo, C., Li, X., Duan, M., He, H., Chen, X., … Yao, D. (2018). Progressive Reduction in Gray

Matter in Patients with Schizophrenia Assessed with MR Imaging by Using Causal Network

Analysis. *Radiology*, *287*(2), 633–642. http://doi.org/10.1148/radiol.2017171832

Kuhl, D. E., Metter, E. J., Riege, W. H., & Phelps, M. E. (1982). Effects of Human Aging on Patterns of

Local Cerebral Glucose Utilization Determined by the [18 F] Fluorodeoxyglucose Method. *Journal*

of Cerebral Blood Flow & Metabolism, *2*(2), 163–171. http://doi.org/10.1038/jcbfm.1982.15

Lai, T.-J., Payne, M. E., Byrum, C. E., Steffens, D. C., & Krishnan, K. R. R. (2000). Reduction of orbital

frontal cortex volume in geriatric depression. *Biological Psychiatry*, *48*(10), 971–975.

http://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3223(00)01042-8

Lerch, J. P., Worsley, K., Shaw, W. P., Greenstein, D. K., Lenroot, R. K., Giedd, J., & Evans, A. C.

(2006). Mapping anatomical correlations across cerebral cortex (MACACC) using cortical thickness

from MRI. *NeuroImage*, *31*(3), 993–1003. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2006.01.042

Martin, A. J., Friston, K. J., Colebatch, J. G., & Frackowiak, R. S. J. (1991). Decreases in Regional

Cerebral Blood Flow with Normal Aging. *Journal of Cerebral Blood Flow & Metabolism*, *11*(4),

684–689. http://doi.org/10.1038/jcbfm.1991.121

Mechelli, A., Friston, K. J., Frackowiak, R. S., & Price, C. J. (2005). Structural covariance in the human

cortex. *The Journal of Neuroscience␣: The Official Journal of the Society for Neuroscience*, *25*(36),

8303–10. http://doi.org/10.1523/JNEUROSCI.0357-05.2005

Metter, E. J., Riege, W. H., Kuhl, D. E., & Phelps, M. E. (1984). Cerebral Metabolic Relationships for

Selected Brain Regions in Healthy Adults. *Journal of Cerebral Blood Flow & Metabolism*, *4*(1), 1–7.

http://doi.org/10.1038/jcbfm.1984.1

Prohovnik, I., Håkansson, K., & Risberg, J. (1980). Observations on the functional significance of

regional cerebral blood flow in "resting" normal subjects. *Neuropsychologia*, *18*(2), 203–17.

http://doi.org/10.1016/0028-3932(80)90066-4

Reuter-Lorenz, P. A., & Park, D. C. (2014). How Does it STAC Up? Revisiting the Scaffolding Theory of

Aging and Cognition. *Neuropsychology Review*, *24*(3), 355–370. http://doi.org/10.1007/s11065-014-

9270-9

Ross, L. A., McCoy, D., Coslett, H. B., Olson, I. R., & Wolk, D. A. (2011). Improved Proper Name

Recall in Aging after Electrical Stimulation of the Anterior Temporal Lobes. *Frontiers in Aging*

Neuroscience, *3*. http://doi.org/10.3389/fnagi.2011.00016

Rousset, O. G., Ma, Y., & Evans, A. C. (1998). Correction for partial volume effects in PET: principle and validation. *Journal of Nuclear Medicine⬚: Official Publication, Society of Nuclear Medicine*, *39*(5), 904–11. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/9591599

Rubin, T. N., Koyejo, O., Gorgolewski, K. J., Jones, M. N., Poldrack, R. A., & Yarkoni, T. (2017). Decoding brain activity using a large-scale probabilistic functional-anatomical atlas of human cognition. *PLOS Computational Biology*, *13*(10), e1005649. http://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1005649

Salat, D. H., Buckner, R. L., Snyder, A. Z., Greve, D. N., Desikan, R. S. R., Busa, E., … Fischl, B. (2004). Thinning of the cerebral cortex in aging. *Cerebral Cortex*, *14*(7), 721–730. http://doi.org/10.1093/cercor/bhh032

Shafto, M. A., & Tyler, L. K. (2014). Language in the aging brain: The network dynamics of cognitive decline and preservation. *Science*, *346*(6209), 583–587. http://doi.org/10.1126/science.1254404

Smith, S. M., Miller, K. L., Salimi-Khorshidi, G., Webster, M., Beckmann, C. F., Nichols, T. E., … Woolrich, M. W. (2011). Network modelling methods for FMRI. *NeuroImage*, *54*(2), 875–891. Retrieved from http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1053811910011602

Smith, S. M., Vidaurre, D., Beckmann, C. F., Glasser, M. F., Jenkinson, M., Miller, K. L., … Van Essen, D. C. (2013). Functional connectomics from resting-state fMRI. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, *17*(12), 666–682. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tics.2013.09.016

Spreng, R. N., Wojtowicz, M., & Grady, C. L. (2010). Reliable differences in brain activity between young and old adults: A quantitative meta-analysis across multiple cognitive domains. *Neuroscience & Biobehavioral Reviews*, *34*(8), 1178–1194. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2010.01.009

Tang, W., Bressler, S. L., Sylvester, C. M., Shulman, G. L., & Corbetta, M. (2012). Measuring Granger Causality between Cortical Regions from Voxelwise fMRI BOLD Signals with LASSO. *PLoS Computational Biology*, *8*(5), e1002513. http://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1002513

Taylor, P. A., Gohel, S., Di, X., Walter, M., & Biswal, B. B. (2012). Functional covariance networks:

obtaining resting-state networks from intersubject variability. *Brain Connectivity*, *2*(4), 203–17.

http://doi.org/10.1089/brain.2012.0095

Taylor, W. D., Steffens, D. C., McQuoid, D. R., Payne, M. E., Lee, S.-H., Lai, T.-J., & Krishnan, K. R. R.

(2003). Smaller orbital frontal cortex volumes associated with functional disability in depressed

elders. *Biological Psychiatry*, *53*(2), 144–149. http://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3223(02)01490-7

Tibshirani, R. (1996). Regression Selection and Shrinkage via the Lasso. *Journal of the Royal Statistical*

Society B. http://doi.org/10.2307/2346178

Yuan, R., Di, X., Kim, E. H., Barik, S., Rypma, B., & Biswal, B. B. (2013). Regional homogeneity of

resting-state fMRI contributes to both neurovascular and task activation variations. *Magnetic*

Resonance Imaging, *31*(9), 1492–500. http://doi.org/10.1016/j.mri.2013.07.005

Zhang, Z., Liao, W., Xu, Q., Wei, W., Zhou, H. J., Sun, K., … Lu, G. (2017). Hippocampus-associated

causal network of structural covariance measuring structural damage progression in temporal lobe

epilepsy. *Human Brain Mapping*, *38*(2), 753–766. http://doi.org/10.1002/hbm.23415

Zhang, Z., Liao, W., Zuo, X.-N., Wang, Z., Yuan, C., Jiao, Q., … Liu, Y. (2011). Resting-state brain

organization revealed by functional covariance networks. *PloS One*, *6*(12), e28817.

http://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0028817

Ziegler, G., Penny, W. D., Ridgway, G. R., Ourselin, S., & Friston, K. J. (2015). Estimating anatomical

trajectories with Bayesian mixed-effects modeling. *NeuroImage*, *121*, 51–68.

http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2015.06.094

Ziegler, G., Ridgway, G. R., Blakemore, S.-J., Ashburner, J., & Penny, W. (2017). Multivariate

dynamical modelling of structural change during development. *NeuroImage*, *147*, 746–762.

http://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2016.12.017

Zuendorf, G., Kerrouche, N., Herholz, K., & Baron, J.-C. (2003). Efficient principal component analysis

for multivariate 3D voxel-based mapping of brain functional imaging data sets as applied to FDG-

PET and normal aging. *Human Brain Mapping*, *18*(1), 13–21. http://doi.org/10.1002/hbm.10069

Table 1 List of interregional causal influences of metabolic activity identified at λ = 0.162 using LASSO (least absolute shrinkage and selection operator) regression.

| From | | → | To | |
IC #	Label	Sign	IC #	Label
52	Thalamus, brainstem	-	27	Precuneus
36	Supplementary motor area, paracentral lobule	+	52	Thalamus, brainstem
44	Insula, inferior frontal gyrus, superior temporal pole	+	77	Temporal pole, medial orbitofrontal cortex
63	Temporal pole	+	40	Left middle temporal gyrus
63	Temporal pole	+	27	Precuneus
44	Insula, inferior frontal gyrus, superior temporal pole	-	20	Right inferior and middle frontal gyrus
63	Temporal pole	-	38	Left thalamus, caudate, lingual gyrus
44	Insula, inferior frontal gyrus, superior temporal pole	-	16	Superior and middle frontal gyrus
39	Superior parietal lobule, precuneus	+	20	Right inferior and middle frontal gyrus
19	Basal ganglia, amygdala, insula	-	46	Posterior cingulate cortex, precuneus, lingual gyrus
63	Temporal pole	-	19	Basal ganglia, amygdala, insula
63	Temporal pole	-	34	Inferior frontal gyrus
81	Lobule VII crus, Lobule VI hemisphere, vermis	-	6	Lobule VII crus
39	Superior parietal lobule, precuneus	+	19	Basal ganglia, amygdala, insula
19	Basal ganglia, amygdala, insula	-	17	Lingual gyrus, calcarine sulcus, cuneus
48	Orbitofrontal cortex, superior temporal pole	+	39	Superior parietal lobule, precuneus
28	Inferior parietal lobule, precuneus	+	17	Lingual gyrus, calcarine sulcus, cuneus
48	Orbitofrontal cortex, superior temporal pole	+	47	Postcentral gyrus, inferior parietal lobule
48	Orbitofrontal cortex, superior temporal pole	+	56	Superior and middle occipital gyrus
28	Inferior parietal lobule, precuneus	+	56	Superior and middle occipital gyrus
28	Inferior parietal lobule, precuneus	+	43	Lobule VII and VIII, hemisphere
48	Orbitofrontal cortex, superior temporal pole	+	11	Lingual gyrus, calcarine sulcus, cuneus
48	Orbitofrontal cortex, superior temporal pole	+	69	Inferior occipital and fusiform gyrus
80	Inferior parietal lobule	-	56	Superior and middle occipital gyrus
5	Left inferior frontal gyrus, left middle occipital gyrus	-	28	Inferior parietal lobule, precuneus
78	Postcentral gyrus	-	12	Superior and middle occipital gyrus
5	Left inferior frontal gyrus, left middle occipital gyrus	+	80	Inferior parietal lobule

	Left inferior frontal gyrus, left middle			
5	occipital gyrus	-	66	Left inferior temporal gyrus