High functional diversity among *Nitrospira* populations that dominate rotating biological contactor microbial communities in a municipal wastewater treatment plant

Emilie Spasov[1*], Jackson M. Tsuji[1*], Laura A. Hug[1], Andrew C. Doxey[1], Laura A. Sauder[1],

5   Wayne J. Parker[2], Josh D. Neufeld[1#]

[1]Department of Biology, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

[2]Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

10   *These authors contributed equally

#Corresponding author: Department of Biology, University of Waterloo, 200 University Avenue West, Waterloo, Ontario, N2L 3G1, Canada. Tel. +1 519-888-4567; Fax +1 519-746-0614. E-mail: jneufeld@uwaterloo.ca

15   Running title: Comammox *Nitrospira* dominate wastewater biofilm

Keywords: complete ammonia oxidation, comammox, ammonia-oxidizing archaea, wastewater, nitrification, biofilm, cyanate, metagenomics

Abstract

20   Nitrification, the oxidation of ammonia to nitrate via nitrite, is an important process in municipal wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs). Members of the *Nitrospira* genus that contribute to complete ammonia oxidation (comammox) have only recently been discovered and their relevance to engineered water treatment systems is poorly understood. This study investigated distributions of *Nitrospira*, ammonia-oxidizing archaea (AOA), and ammonia-

25   oxidizing bacteria (AOB) in biofilm samples collected from tertiary rotating biological contactors (RBCs) of a municipal WWTP in Guelph, Ontario, Canada. Using quantitative PCR (qPCR), 16S rRNA gene sequencing, and metagenomics, our results demonstrate that *Nitrospira* species strongly dominate RBC biofilm samples and that comammox *Nitrospira* outnumber all other nitrifiers. Genome bins recovered from assembled metagenomes reveal multiple

30   populations of comammox *Nitrospira* with distinct spatial and temporal distributions, including several taxa that are distinct from previously characterized *Nitrospira* members. Diverse functional profiles imply a high level of niche heterogeneity among comammox *Nitrospira*, in contrast to the sole detected AOA representative that was previously cultivated and characterized from the same RBC biofilm. Our metagenome bins also reveal two cyanase-encoding

35   populations of comammox *Nitrospira*, suggesting an ability to degrade cyanate, which has not been shown previously for *Nitrospira* that are not strict nitrite oxidizers. This study demonstrates the importance of RBCs as model systems for continued investigation of environmental factors that control the distributions and activities of AOB, AOA, comammox *Nitrospira*, and other nitrite oxidizers.

Introduction

Municipal wastewater contains ammonium that is removed by wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs) to prevent eutrophication, oxygen depletion, and toxicity to aquatic animals in receiving waters. Nitrification involves the sequential oxidation of ammonia to nitrate, via nitrite, and these two enzymatic steps were historically thought to be mediated by distinct microorganisms, with aerobic ammonia oxidation conducted by ammonia-oxidizing bacteria (AOB) or ammonia-oxidizing archaea (AOA), and nitrite oxidation catalyzed by nitrite-oxidizing bacteria (NOB) [1–3]. Microorganisms capable of oxidizing both ammonia and nitrite via complete ammonia oxidation (comammox) were predicted over a decade ago to be slow growing and to inhabit biofilms exposed to relatively low ammonium concentrations [4]. These predictions were confirmed by the discovery of *Nitrospira* members capable of catalyzing comammox [5, 6], and all known comammox *Nitrospira* belong to lineage II of the genus *Nitrospira*. Although two major clades of comammox *Nitrospira* have been described (i.e., clades A and B), based on ammonia monooxygenase (*amoA*) gene phylogeny, all enriched and cultivated species of comammox *Nitrospira* belong to clade A [5, 6].

Compared to AOA and AOB, very little is known about the abundance and diversity of comammox *Nitrospira* in engineered aquatic environments. Consistent with a low ammonium niche, comammox *Nitrospira* have been detected in drinking water systems [7–14]. First identified from water treatment system metagenome sequences [5, 6], most wastewater-associated comammox *Nitrospira* belong to clade A [5, 7, 12, 14–18], albeit with abundances generally lower than those reported for AOA and AOB [7, 18–21]. Nonetheless, *amoA* gene abundances of comammox *Nitrospira* may outnumber those of AOB in activated sludge samples in some WWTPs [12, 18, 22], and comammox *Nitrospira* have been enriched in wastewater

treatment reactors with low dissolved oxygen conditions [15, 17]. Additionally, the high

abundance of *amoA* transcripts from comammox *Nitrospira* detected in activated sludge suggests

an active role in nitrification [23, 24]. Previous studies examining comammox *Nitrospira* in

WWTPs focused primarily on activated sludge secondary treatment systems and sequencing

batch reactors [12, 15–23, 25–28]. To our knowledge, no studies have investigated comammox

Nitrospira in biofilm-based tertiary wastewater treatment systems.

The current study examined full scale tertiary rotating biological contactors (RBCs;

Figure 1A) treating municipal waste from ~132,000 residents of Guelph, Ontario, Canada.

Comprising a total biofilm surface area of 440,000 m^2 and processing ~53,000 m^3 of wastewater

daily, the RBCs are organized into four "trains" that are each composed of eight individual RBC

"stages" (Figure 1B). The RBC-associated AOA and AOB communities were characterized

previously, demonstrating that the sole detectable AOA population increased in abundance along

the RBC flowpath [29]. This AOA species was enriched, characterized, and named *Candidatus*

Nitrosocosmicus exaquare [30]. However, inconsistent *in situ* activity data obtained using

differential inhibitors for AOB, which showed differing inhibition patterns for AOB with two

different AOB inhibitors, as well as an abundance of MAR-positive *Nitrospira* cells, as viewed

by fluorescence *in situ* hybridization microautoradiography (FISH-MAR), raised the possibility

that some of the detected *Nitrospira* may contribute to comammox [30]. Due to the predicted low

ammonium niche and biofilm growth of comammox bacteria [4, 5], we hypothesized that

comammox *Nitrospira* would dominate the RBC biofilm and that the relative abundance of

comammox *Nitrospira* would increase as ammonium concentrations decrease along the RBC

flowpath, as demonstrated previously for *Ca.* N. exaquare [29]. To test these hypotheses, we

assessed the relative abundance, diversity, and temporal stability of comammox *Nitrospira*, in

relation to AOA and other AOB, throughout the tertiary treatment system, using a combination

of quantitative PCR (qPCR), 16S rRNA gene sequencing, and metagenomics.

Materials and Methods

Sampling

90   Using ethanol-cleaned spatulas, biofilm was sampled from the RBC trains in Guelph,

Ontario, Canada (Figure 1A, Figure 1B). Samples were stored on dry ice until delivered to the

lab and were kept at -70°C until analyzed. All RBCs from all four trains were sampled in

October 2016, except for RBC 1 of the southeast (SE) train and RBC 2 of the southwest (SW)

train, which were not operational at the time of sampling (Table S1). We included biofilm

95   samples that were collected previously for temporal comparison [29]. These reference samples

were collected in February, June, and September 2010 from RBCs 1 and 8 of the northeast (NE)

train (Table S1). Water samples were collected in 2016 from RBC 1 and RBC 8, kept on ice, and

then frozen at -20°C until chemical analysis.

Water chemistry

100   Ammonium was measured fluorometrically using orthophthaldialdehyde (OPA) reagent

[31] as described previously [32] and nitrite/nitrate was assessed colorimetrically with the Griess

reagent [33]. Measurements represent total ammonium as nitrogen, and nitrite and nitrate as

nitrogen; details are described in the supplemental methods. Based on data obtained from

WWTP operators, monthly and yearly ammonium concentrations (measured as total ammonia as

105   nitrogen) of secondary effluent (i.e., RBC influent) and water from the southeast RBC train were

compiled for the years 2010 to 2017. Plant influent and effluent data were retrieved from Guelph

WWTP annual reports for 2010 to 2017

(https://guelph.ca/living/environment/water/wastewater/).

DNA extractions

110   Extractions were performed from 0.25 g (wet weight) of biofilm with the PowerSoil

DNA Isolation Kit (Mo Bio, Carlsbad, CA, USA) as described previously [30]. Total isolated

DNA was visualized on a 1% agarose gel and quantified using the NanoDrop 2000 (Thermo

Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA) and Qubit dsDNA HS Assay kit (Thermo Scientific).

Extracted DNA from RBC 1 and 8 biofilm samples of the NE train from 2010 was used

115   for quantitative PCR (qPCR) and metagenome sequencing (Table S1). The 2010 biofilm samples

were those collected and analyzed by qPCR previously [29], but DNA extractions were repeated

while processing the 2016 samples. The DNA extracts from all RBCs within the four trains

sampled in 2016 were analyzed with qPCR, whereas DNA from RBCs 1 and 8 alone were used

for 16S rRNA gene and metagenome sequencing (Table S1).

120   *Quantitative PCR*

Thaumarchaeotal and bacterial 16S rRNA genes were quantified using the primers

771F/957R [34] and 341F/518R [35], respectively (Table S2). Quantification of AOB *amoA*

genes was carried out using the primers amoA1F/amoA2R [36] (Table S2). Comammox

Nitrospira clade A and clade B *amoA* genes were amplified using equimolar primer mixes of

125   comaA-244f (a-f) and comaA-659r (a-f), and comaB-244f (a-f) and comaB-659r (a-f),

respectively [7] (Table S2). Primers for each of comammox *Nitrospira* clades A and B *amoA*

genes were initially tested in end-point PCR to check for a single dominant band in all

amplifications, but subsequent qPCR was performed with clade A primers only because clade B

primers produced no amplicons (data not shown). All qPCR amplifications were carried out as
130   technical duplicates on a CFX96 Real-Time PCR Detection System (Bio-Rad, Hercules, CA,

USA). Additional thermal cycling conditions and standards are described in the supplemental

methods.

16S rRNA gene amplicon sequencing

The V4-V5 regions of 16S rRNA genes were amplified using primers 515F [37] and
135   926R [38] with Illumina adapters. The sequence data were produced by the US Department of

Energy Joint Genome Institute (JGI) using standard operating procedures. Triplicates were

combined, quantified, and sample amplicons were then pooled equally. The pooled library was

sequenced on a MiSeq (Illumina) with 2x300 base reads. Sequence analysis was performed with

QIIME2 version 2019.1.0 [39]. Sequences were trimmed to remove primer and adapter
140   sequences with cutadapt [40]. Quality trimming, denoising, error-correction, paired-end read

merging, chimera removal, and dereplication was performed with DADA2 [41], producing an

amplicon sequence variant (ASV) table with 80,180-125,219 assembled sequences per sample

(Supplemental file 1). The ASVs were taxonomically classified according to the SILVA database

release 132 [42] using the scikit-learn classifier [43].

145   *Metagenome sequencing and analysis*

Shearing of DNA, library preparation, and sequencing were performed at The Centre for

Applied Genomics (TCAG) in Toronto, Ontario. Extracted DNA was quantified using the Qubit

dsDNA HS Assay kit (Thermo Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA), and 500 ng of input DNA was

sheared into ~550 bp fragments using a LE220 Focused-ultrasonicator (Covaris, Woburn, MA,
150   USA). Library preparation was performed using the TruSeq PCR-free Library Prep Kit

(Illumina). Paired-end sequencing (2x250 bases) was performed on a HiSeq 2500 (Illumina) using the HiSeq Rapid SBS Kit v2 (500 cycle; Illumina), resulting in a total of ~250 million paired-end reads with an average of 18.1 million paired-end reads per sample (Table S3).

155   Quality trimming and removal of adapter sequences were performed using AdapterRemoval version 2.2.2 [44] and the quality of the reads was checked with FastQC version 0.11.5 [45]. Reports were combined using MultiQC version 1.0 [46]. Open reading frames (ORFs) were predicted on the unmerged and unassembled trimmed forward reads using FragGeneScan-Plus [47]. Profile hidden Markov models (HMMs) for taxonomic marker (i.e., *rpoB*) and functional genes (i.e., *amoA*_AOA, *amoA*_AOB, and *nxrB*), downloaded from

160   FunGene [48], were used to quantify the relative abundances and taxonomic affiliations of nitrifiers from the unassembled reads using MetAnnotate [49]. The HMM e-value threshold used by MetAnnotate for gene detection was 10^{-3}, and the e-value threshold used for the USEARCH-based taxonomic classification step was 10^{-6}. Within MetAnnotate, the database used for taxonomic classification was RefSeq release 80 (March 2017). MetAnnotate results were

165   analyzed using the custom R script *metannotate_barplots.R* version 0.9 (available at https://github.com/jmtsuji/metannotate-analysis). To allow for approximate between-sample and between-HMM comparisons, hits for each HMM were normalized both to HMM length and total number of length-normalized HMM hits for *rpoB* (for more details, see the Github README).

Assembly and binning of metagenome sequence reads

170   Sequence reads were processed through the ATLAS pipeline (version 2.0.6), which includes quality control, assembly, annotation, binning, bin dereplication, and read mapping [50, 51]; for further details, see supplemental methods. Taxonomy was assigned to bins according to the Genome Taxonomy Database [52] release 86, version 3, using the Genome Tree Database

Toolkit version 0.2.2 [53]. Relative abundances of genome bins in metagenome sequence data were approximated by calculating the number of mapped reads to genome bins, normalized to the total number of assembled reads per metagenome. Each read required a minimum alignment score ratio of 0.908 (i.e., ~95% sequence identity to the aligned region) to be considered and was mapped to up to 10 best aligned sites across the full genome set. Principal coordinate analysis (PCoA) ordination of samples used Bray-Curtis dissimilarities of relative abundance data using a custom R script.

Analysis of genome bins

Average nucleotide identity (ANI) was calculated for the dereplicated AOA bin and *Nitrospira* bins compared to reference genomes using FastANI version 1.1 [54]. The *Nitrospira* bins were further searched for functional genes using reciprocal BLASTp [55] using the BackBLAST pipeline [56], version 2.0.0-alpha2 (doi:10.5281/zenodo.3465955). A concatenated core protein phylogeny, using a set of 74 core bacterial proteins, was generated to assess the phylogenetic placement of *Nitrospira* genome bins. The phylogenetic tree was constructed using IQ-TREE version 1.6.9 [57]. All predicted protein sequences from assembled contigs were compiled and clustered into 99% identity threshold groups within ATLAS; an HMM was used to identify AmoA sequences. *Nitrospira* AmoA were aligned along with reference sequences using MUSCLE [58] and a phylogenetic tree was built using MEGA7 [58]. Cyanase protein sequences (CynS) identified via BackBLAST were further analyzed phylogenetically as described further in the supplemental methods.

Data availability

195   Amplicon sequence data are available on the JGI genome portal under sequencing project

ID 1137811. Metagenome sequencing data and high completeness, low contamination genome

bins classified to the *Nitrospirota* phylum were deposited in the European Nucleotide Archive

under study accession number PRJEB30654.

Results and Discussion

200   Prior to sequence-based analysis of RBC nitrifying biofilm sample communities,

ammonia oxidizer cohort sizes were assessed using quantitative PCR (qPCR; Figure 2). The

results showed distinct nitrifying community compositions, both along the treatment train

(spatially; RBC 1 versus RBC 8) and between sampling time points (temporally; 2010 and

2016). Within each RBC train, the measured relative abundance of comammox *Nitrospira* genes,

205   as well as the proportion of comammox *Nitrospira* within the total community, were consistently

higher in RBC 1 than RBC 8 (Figure 2, Table S5), as were ammonium concentrations in water

samples collected from below the sampled RBCs (Figure 1C, Table S4). Comammox *Nitrospira*

amoA genes were more abundant than those of other ammonia oxidizers for most samples and

time points (Figures 2, Figure S1, Table S5). In addition to comammox *Nitrospira*, the qPCR

210   data also indicated a higher relative abundance of thaumarchaeotal 16S rRNA genes (inferred to

represent AOA *Thaumarchaeota* based on other data) in RBC 8 than RBC 1 in the 2010 samples.

In contrast, in 2016, thaumarchaeotal 16S rRNA gene abundances were higher in RBC 1 than

RBC 8 for all four trains and were roughly equivalent in relative abundance to comammox

Nitrospira (Figure 2). Although the abundances of AOB *amoA* genes were higher in RBC 1 than

215   RBC 8 in both sampling years, the abundances of these genes were one to two orders of

magnitude lower in 2016 than in 2010. Higher resolution sampling of all 2016 RBC stages

showed the general trend of a decrease in *amoA* gene abundances across all four RBC flowpaths (Figure S1).

Although 16S rRNA genes cannot be used to differentiate between comammox *Nitrospira* and strict nitrite oxidizers [7], the overall relative abundance patterns of *Nitrospira* amplicon sequence variants (ASVs; Figure 3) were consistent with observations from qPCR data (Figure 2), showing higher relative abundances of *Nitrospira* in RBC 1 compared to RBC 8 for each sample pair. Eight ASVs present at ≥1% relative abundance were classified as *Nitrospira* (Figure 3, Supplemental file 1) and, taken together, these ASVs dominated all other populations detected in the RBC biofilm samples. In addition to *Nitrospira*, five ASVs present at ≥1% relative abundance were classified into the *Nitrosomonadaceae* family (Figure 3), and four corresponding to the genus *Nitrosomonas* affiliated only with the 2010 samples. The fifth *Nitrosomonadaceae* ASV affiliated with 2016 samples (ASV ID 4), but subsequent metagenome analysis suggested that this was not an ammonia oxidizer due to lack of a detectable *amo* gene system in the corresponding genome bin and phylogenetic distance from canonical AOB (data not shown). Thus, qPCR data were consistent with ASV data, with fewer AOB detected in 2016 samples overall. We detected a single thaumarchaeotal ASV that affiliated with the known AOA population within the RBCs (*Nitrosocosmicus* genus; [30]), and this ASV was present in all samples (Supplemental file 1) but at highest relative abundance (i.e., >1%) for 2016 samples (Figure 3), as expected based on qPCR data (Figure 2).

Single copy taxonomic marker gene analysis of unassembled metagenome sequence data was consistent with qPCR and 16S rRNA gene sequence data, revealing that *Nitrospira* sequences dominated all samples and comprised between 8 and 32% of the total *rpoB* gene sequences among RBC samples from the two sampling years (Figure 4). The *Nitrospira-*

240   affiliated *rpoB* gene relative abundances were higher in RBC 1 than RBC 8 for each train

sampled. In addition, the normalized relative abundances of comammox *Nitrospira amoA* genes

correlated well with the relative abundances calculated from qPCR data for the proportion of

their *amoA* genes within the RBC biofilm communities (Spearman's rank correlation, $r_s = 0.79$, p

< 0.001).

245   Normalized relative abundances of functional genes detected in unassembled read data

allowed us to further estimate the relative community contributions of nitrifying community

members. Assuming one *amoA* gene copy per genome, comammox *Nitrospira* represented

between ~5-30% of the total microbial community for all samples based on normalized *amoA*

HMM hits (Figure 5B). *Nitrospira*-associated *rpoB* and normalized *amoA* gene abundances were

250   similar (Figures 4, 5B), suggesting that the majority of *Nitrospira* present in the RBCs were

comammox bacteria. The HMM search for *nxrB/narH* revealed that sequences affiliated with

this model were also prevalent in RBC biofilm metagenomes, with combined hits at over 50%

abundance normalized to total *rpoB* hits (Figure 5C). Based on phylogenetic placement of

assembled genes in our metagenome sequence data that were detected using the *nxrB/narH*

255   HMM, the majority of non-*Nitrospira* HMM hits likely represent denitrifying organisms

encoding *narH* (data not shown), whereas *Nitrospira* HMM hits likely represent *nxrB*-encoding

nitrifiers. The closest BLASTP search result for some non-*Nitrospira* affiliated *nxrB/narH* HMM

hits was to a related protein (e.g., dimethyl sulfoxide reductase; data not shown), meaning that

the normalized relative abundance we detected may be an overestimate of the true community

260   contribution of *nxrB/narH*. Nevertheless, the high relative abundance of *Nitrospira*-affiliated

nxrB gene sequences, which were more abundant in RBC 1 than RBC 8 metagenome sequences

across all samples (Figure 5C), is further evidence for the dominance of comammox or NOB

Nitrospira in the RBCs. Normalized relative abundances of *Nitrospira*-affiliated *nxrB* sequences that exceed the corresponding relative abundances of *Nitrospira*-affiliated *rpoB* sequences may

265   be due to multiple copies of *nxrB* common to *Nitrospira* genomes [59], in contrast to single copies common for *rpoB* genes [60], or may be due to known biases that occur during HMM hit count normalization.

        Consistent with qPCR data, *Nitrosomonas*-affiliated *rpoB* gene sequences were detected at ≥1% in the 2010 samples only. The *rpoB* gene of AOA was not detected at ≥1% relative

270   abundance in any of the samples but ranged from 0.01-0.3% across all samples (data not shown). The HMM search for the *amoA* gene of AOA similarly revealed low relative abundance in the metagenome dataset (<2% relative to *rpoB* for all samples; Figure 5A). For 2010 samples, *amoA* gene sequences affiliated with *Thaumarchaeota* were more abundant in RBC 8 than RBC 1 samples, whereas in 2016 they were more abundant in RBC 1 than RBC 8 samples, except in the

275   NE 2016 sample. The HMM hits for AOA *amoA* genes in the unassembled metagenome sequences were low, with only 64 hits to this HMM for all samples combined, but the AOA *amoA* normalized relative abundance pattern was nevertheless correlated with the corresponding proportion of AOA 16S rRNA genes within the total community determined via qPCR (Spearman's rank correlation, $r_s = 0.67$, $p = 0.009$). The *amoA* HMM for AOB detected

280   sequences of both comammox *Nitrospira* and AOB. Overall, the relative abundances of AOB *amoA* genes were higher in RBC 1 than RBC 8 of the corresponding sample pairs, in both sampling years (Figure 5B). In 2010, *Nitrosomonas* spp. and *Nitrospira* spp. were at roughly equal relative abundances, whereas *Nitrospira* spp. were the dominant ammonia oxidizers detected in 2016 metagenome sequences. The *amoA* genes of the AOB *Nitrosospira* were also

285   detected, but always at <1% relative abundance. Overall, the relative abundance patterns for

AOB *amoA* genes correlated well with their corresponding relative abundances determined by qPCR for the proportion of their *amoA* genes within the total community (Spearman's rank correlation, $r_s = 0.97$, $p < 0.001$).

Metagenome-assembled genomes (MAGs) obtained from RBC metagenome sequence

290   data were also examined for the temporal and spatial distributions of *Nitrospira* populations. Summed together, *Nitrospira* MAGs (see taxonomic classification description below) had a higher relative abundance in RBC 1 than RBC 8 for each sample pair (Figure 6). This pattern was also the case for the bins classified as clade A comammox *Nitrospira*, which comprised a majority of recruited reads to *Nitrospira* MAGs across most samples. At the same time,

295   individual *Nitrospira* MAGs displayed distinct temporal and spatial distributions. Several of the comammox MAGs had different abundance patterns in 2010 than in 2016. Specifically, RBC035, RBC100, and RBC069 were present at higher relative abundances in 2010 samples than in 2016 samples, and relative abundances of RBC001 and RBC083 were generally higher in 2016 than 2010 samples (Figure 6, Supplementary file 2). Multiple comammox *Nitrospira*

300   populations were found in the same RBC, and this high diversity of comammox *Nitrospira* contrasts with the observed low AOA diversity (i.e., only one *Nitrosocosmicus* species; see below) for all RBCs sampled. Although 0.5-3.1% (median 1.1%) of assembled reads associated with *Nitrospira* MAGs were mapped to more than one MAG (data not shown), this level of crossover read mapping is insufficient to explain the high observed diversity of comammox

305   *Nitrospira* for most RBCs, meaning that the high observed diversity is likely not an artefact of read mapping. Using all of the dereplicated bins, the overall microbial communities of the samples group by year and RBC number (Figure S2B), similar to an ordination prepared from

16S rRNA gene sequence data (Figure S2A). This demonstrates that distinct microbial communities were present in each of the two sampling years and along the RBC flowpaths.

310   The dominance of comammox *Nitrospira* in biofilm samples collected from RBCs treating municipal wastewater of Guelph, Ontario, Canada is in contrast to several previous studies of full-scale activated sludge WWTPs that report comammox *Nitrospira* at lower relative abundances than AOA and other AOB [7, 18–21], albeit for systems with ammonium concentrations and operational parameters distinct from those in the RBCs. This current study,

315   along with other recent studies [12, 15, 17, 18, 22], shows that comammox *Nitrospira* can dominate municipal wastewater treatment systems. Although previous analyses of the Guelph WWTP did not test for these newly discovered ammonia oxidizers [29, 30], the presence of comammox *Nitrospira* was predicted previously from activity data and an abundance of *Nitrospira* cells that actively assimilated labelled bicarbonate when incubated with ammonium

320   [30]. The current discovery of abundant comammox *Nitrospira* communities in Guelph RBCs suggests a correspondingly important role for comammox within the 440,000 m^2 of RBC biofilm associated with this full-scale wastewater treatment system.

        High relative abundances of comammox *Nitrospira* have been reported for other engineered environments with relatively low ammonium levels, such as drinking water treatment

325   systems. For example, comammox *Nitrospira* were found in a drinking water treatment plant [8] and distribution systems [10], and they were more abundant than other ammonia oxidizers in a groundwater well studied previously [7]. Associated with drinking water treatment plants, comammox *Nitrospira* were the most abundant nitrifiers in groundwater fed rapid sand filters [13]. In those filters, clade B comammox *Nitrospira* dominated, in contrast to clade A members

330   that we detected in the sampled RBCs. A study examining recirculating aquaculture system

biofilters found that comammox *Nitrospira* were more abundant than AOA and AOB [61].

Along with these other studies, the dominance of comammox *Nitrospira* in the RBCs suggests

that they compete well in engineered environments with relatively low ammonium

concentrations. At the Guelph WWTP, the RBCs are located downstream of activated sludge

335   aeration basins. Ammonium concentrations entering this tertiary treatment system are

approximately two orders of magnitude lower than within aeration basins. For example, on the

day of sampling in 2016, the ammonium concentration in aeration basin influents averaged 2.5

mM NH_3-N, which is typical of aerobic secondary aeration basin conditions reported elsewhere

[e.g. 20–22, 62]. A large surface area for attached growth may be an important factor explaining

340   the dominance of comammox bacteria, given their high prevalence in wastewater treatment

systems with attached growth components [18]. The predicted low ammonium niche and

biofilm-specific growth of comammox *Nitrospira* [4, 5] may help explain the dominance of these

nitrifiers in the tertiary treatment system RBCs in Guelph, Ontario.

Although relatively low ammonium concentrations likely contribute to the overall

345   success of comammox *Nitrospira* within the RBC biofilm samples, a gradient of decreasing

ammonium along the RBC flowpaths could also account for relative abundance changes of

nitrifying microbial communities, both temporally and spatially. We predicted initially that

comammox *Nitrospira* abundances in RBC 8 samples would exceed those in RBC 1 samples due

to the predicted low ammonium niche of comammox *Nitrospira* [4], but the opposite trend was

350   observed for both sample years (Figures 2, 5, 6). However, ammonium concentrations below

RBC 1 were already relatively low (e.g., <18 μM for all 2016 samples; Figure 1C), and it may be

that ammonium concentrations in RBC 8 influent (e.g., <4 μM for all 2016 samples; Figure 1C)

were below the optimum for comammox *Nitrospira*. Consistent with an "oligotrophic lifestyle",

Kits *et al*. [63] reported a high apparent affinity of *Ca.* Nitrospira inopinata for ammonium

355   ($K_{m(app)}$ of 0.65 to 1.1 µM total ammonium), and V_{max} reached by ammonium concentrations of

~5 µM, which would be similar to ammonium concentrations observed for water samples

collected from RBCs sampled in this study, especially for RBC 1 stages. The affinities for

ammonium of the comammox *Nitrospira* detected in the RBCs are unknown but may be similar

those reported for *Ca.* N. inopinata.

360   Ammonium concentrations alone may not explain comammox *Nitrospira* abundances,

however. In contrast to published studies reporting low abundances of comammox *Nitrospira* in

activated sludge flocs [7, 19–21], a recent PCR-based study found that comammox *Nitrospira*

amoA genes were more abundant than those of AOB in activated sludge samples from eight

separate WWTPs, despite relatively high ammonium concentrations [22]. This suggests that, as

365   seen for AOA, [e.g. 64–68], the abundances of comammox *Nitrospira* vary among WWTPs.

More studies are needed to identify factors that affect comammox *Nitrospira* abundances, such

as substrate range, oxygen requirements, growth rates, growth yields, and biofilm formation

capabilities [69].

        In addition to targeting nitrification-associated genes to identify comammox *Nitrospira* in

370   extracted DNA or unassembled metagenome sequences, we explored *Nitrospira* diversity within

assembled and binned metagenome sequence data. From a final dereplicated dataset with 101

genome bins (Supplementary file 2), 15 MAGs were classified within the *Nitrospirota* phylum.

These MAGs all had high completeness (≥75%) and low contamination (<5%; Table S6). All but

one of these *Nitrospirota* MAGs were classified under the Genome Taxonomy Database (GTDB)

375   taxonomy within the *Nitrospira* or *Nitrospira* A genera of the *Nitrospiraceae* family; the final

MAG (*Nitrospira* bin RBC003) was classified within the uncultured UBA8639 lineage (genus

and family name) of the *Nitrospirales* order. Using a concatenated set of 74 core bacterial proteins, these MAGs were further classified according to traditional *Nitrospira* phylogeny (Figures 7, S3). A majority (10 of 15) of the *Nitrospirota* MAGs clustered within clade A
380 comammox *Nitrospira*, four clustered within sublineage I (strict nitrite-oxidizing bacteria), and one (which was classified to the UBA8639 lineage according to GTDB taxonomy) clustered within sublineage IV (strict nitrite-oxidizing bacteria) of the *Nitrospira*. Thus, the set of 15 *Nitrospirota* MAGs will be referred to as *Nitrospira* MAGs for conciseness. This high diversity of *Nitrospira* MAGs is consistent with multiple *Nitrospira* ASVs detected with 16S rRNA gene
385 amplicon sequencing (Figure 3). Using average nucleotide identity (ANI) analysis, the 15 *Nitrospira* MAGs were compared to one another and to *Nitrospira* genomes from enrichment cultures and metagenomic surveys (Figure S3). Only one MAG, RBC035, had ≥95% ANI to previously recovered comammox genomes (*Nitrospira* bin UW_LDO_01 [27] and *Candidatus* Nitrospira nitrosa [6]); all other comammox *Nitrospira* MAGs had <95% ANI to other reference
390 genomes. This suggests that these MAGs represent distinct comammox *Nitrospira* species from most other previously described comammox species.

Based on 99% identity clustering of amino acid sequences, all assembled *amoA* genes of *Nitrospira* spp. grouped phylogenetically within comammox *Nitrospira* clade A (Figure S4), aside from RBC group F (a truncated sequence which was dropped from phylogenetic analysis).
395 This is consistent with other studies reporting comammox *Nitrospira* in WWTPs [7, 12, 14–18]. Clade B comammox *Nitrospira* were not detected and the factors affecting the presence and absence of clades A and B remain unknown. Relatedness of *Nitrospira* bins based on *amoA* phylogeny (Figure S4) was similar to that obtained with the concatenated protein set, but not identical (Figures 7, S3). Recently, Xia *et al.* [14] proposed that clade A could be further

400   subdivided into clade A.1, which includes the cultivated comammox *Nitrospira*, and clade A.2,

which contains only uncultivated comammox *amoA* sequences, including those from drinking

water systems (OQW38018 and OQW37964) [10]. The *Nitrospira amoA* gene sequences

detected in the RBCs were classified into both of these clade A subdivisions (Figure S4).

Translated sequences of clade A.2 *amoA* genes from the RBCs were most closely related to

405   *amoA* sequences obtained from metagenome sequences of drinking water systems [10] or to a

clone library sequence from a rice paddy (Genbank accession AKD44274). Several comammox

Nitrospira related to the rice paddy clone have been detected in other full-scale WWTPs, and this

clade was described as a new clade A cluster by the authors [22].

Using a reciprocal BLASTP analysis, the *Nitrospira* MAGs were further evaluated for

410   the presence of *amo, hao,* and *nxr* genes to assess potential contributions to nitrification [5, 6].

Nitrospira bin RBC047 contained all the genes necessary to perform complete ammonia

oxidation, although it was missing an ammonium transporter gene (Figure 7). *Nitrospira* bins

RBC069, RBC001, and RBC044 were missing *nxrB* genes but contained the other genes for

ammonia and nitrite oxidation and had a Rh50 type ammonium transporter. In total, there were

415   five clade A comammox MAGs that contained the *amoA* gene, which is used as a marker gene

for comammox *Nitrospira*. The other five MAGs that clustered phylogenetically within clade A

comammox *Nitrospira* contained other genes for ammonia oxidation, supporting their

phylogenetic placement on the tree. The other *Nitrospira* MAGs contained genes only expected

in NOB, except bin RBC026, which had genes for hydroxylamine oxidation. These genes had

420   >90% amino acid identity to hydroxylamine oxidation genes from known *Nitrosomonas* spp.,

implying that the genes were present in bin RBC026 due to mis-binning of the associated ~4.3

kb contig. Also, the high (93%) ANI between bin RBC026 and comammox bin RBC083

suggests that cross-contamination of these bins may be possible (Figure S3). Overall, one *Nitrospira* MAG contained the entire gene pathway required for comammox, four bins contained

425   only genes expected for NOB, and nine bin clusters could potentially represent comammox *Nitrospira* but lacked the complete gene pathway. Cells of *Nitrospira* within RBC biofilm samples were previously demonstrated to assimilate labelled bicarbonate in the presence of ammonium [30], indicating autotrophic activity of these bacteria and suggesting the possibility of ammonia oxidation.

430   High functional diversity was observed in the RBC *Nitrospira* MAGs. In the current study, the presence of a nearly complete *ure* operon (Figure 7) indicates that comammox *Nitrospira* of the RBCs could hydrolyze urea to ammonia, which they could then use for ammonia oxidation. The presence of these genes is consistent with clade A comammox *Nitrospira* genomes and enrichment cultures that use urea [5, 6, 69, 70]. Because the comammox

435   *Nitrospira* bins did not contain any *fdh* genes for formate dehydrogenase (Figure 7), these RBC populations likely cannot use formate as an alternative electron donor, which can be used by NOB *Nitrospira* and most clade B comammox bacteria [70–73]. Most clade A comammox bacteria described so far lack the genes for formate dehydrogenase [70], with the exception of *Nitrospira* bin RCA [74]. Also consistent with previous findings [18, 70], several of our

440   comammox *Nitrospira* MAGs contained partial pathways for group 3b [Ni-Fe] sulfur-reducing hydrogenase genes (*hyb* and *hyd* genes; Figure 7), which indicates that hydrogen may serve as an alternative electron acceptor for some of these comammox *Nitrospira*. Although several of these MAGs also encoded genes for a putative group 4 hydrogenase (*hyf*), the amino acid sequences of the putative large subunit hydrogenase genes (*hyfG*) did not contain the two CxxC motifs needed

445   for ligating the NiFe center, implying a potential alternative function of these genes other than

hydrogen oxidation, as has been suggested previously for other bacteria [75].

Multiple clade A comammox *Nitrospira* MAGs contained genes for accessory proteins

for hydrogenases (*hyp*) but none of the *Nitrospira* MAGs contained group 2a [Ni-Fe]

hydrogenase genes (*hup*), as seen in the NOB *Nitrospira moscoviensis* [76]. All of the

450   comammox *Nitrospira* MAGs lacked the gene for assimilatory nitrite reduction (*nirA*).

Surprisingly, two clade A comammox *Nitrospira* bins (RBC069 and RBC093) that

contained genes for ammonia oxidation also encoded the cyanase gene (*cynS*; Figures 7, 8). Prior

to this observation, only canonical NOB *Nitrospira* were known to possess this gene [70, 73, 74,

77, 78]. The *cynS* genes were on long contigs (i.e., 182 kb and 121 kb, RBC069 and RBC093,

455   respectively), and the primary sequences of most genes adjacent to the *cynS* genes, when queried

against RefSeq using BLASTP, were most similar to genes belonging to known comammox

Nitrospira. This implies that the presence of *cynS* in RBC comammox MAGs was not caused by

an error in genome binning. Both cyanase genes were distinct from those of other strict NOB

Nitrospira, sharing <75% identity (blastn) to *Nitrospira* homologues in the non-redundant

460   nucleotide database. Nevertheless, the predicted primary sequences of the *cynS* genes contained

the key active site residues for cyanases (Arg96, Glu99 and Ser122) proposed previously [79],

further supporting the functional role of the enzymes (Figure 8A).

Interestingly, the phylogenetic placement of the comammox cyanases was basal to all

other known cyanases among canonical NOB *Nitrospira* (Figure 8A). This basal placement does

465   not match housekeeping gene phylogenies of *Nitrospira* (e.g., Figure 7), indicating the potential

for lateral gene transfer for cyanase acquisition. Indeed, we detected two toxin-antitoxin genes in

the vicinity of the cyanase gene for RBC093, supporting the potential for a recent lateral gene

transfer event [27]. Bins containing *cynS* together represent a substantial proportion of the RBC

microbial community (i.e., ~10-30%; Figure 8B). If these genes are expressed and produce

470 functional gene products, our results indicate that *Nitrospira*, including novel *cynS*-containing

comammox *Nitrospira*, dominate cyanate degradation to ammonia within RBC biofilm for a

direct supply of ammonia (in the case of comammox *Nitrospira*) or for supplying ammonia to

other nitrifiers through reciprocal feeding [77].

The comammox *Nitrospira* in the RBCs lack traditional cyanate transporters (*cynABD*),

475 though one cyanate transporter gene (*cynD*) seemed to have moderate homology to another non-

orthologous ABC transport gene, as indicated by the low amino acid identity hits to *cynD* among

certain *Nitrospira* (Figure 7). These hits may represent another ABC transport protein, a

nitrate/sulfonate/bicarbonate ABC transporter (accession number WP_121988621). If the

comammox *Nitrospira* are unable to transport cyanate, our results may suggest that these

480 *Nitrospira* degrade cyanate generated internally, for example from the degradation of carbamoyl

phosphate or from a spontaneous isomeric conversion of urea to cyanate [80–84]. However, it is

also possible that alternate transporters could be used for uptake of cyanate, such as nitrate

permease [85], or the nitrite/nitrate transporter NarK, which is proposed to also transport cyanate

[77]. If confirmed, this would represent an undescribed method of nitrogen uptake and utilization

485 for comammox bacteria.

Multiple populations of comammox *Nitrospira* within the same RBC system suggests

that these nitrifiers do not compete directly but instead occupy unique niches within the RBCs as

a result of encoded functional diversity, for example because of distinct energy sources (e.g.,

hydrogen, urea, cyanate) or microenvironments within the biofilm that vary in oxygen or

490 ammonium concentrations. Indeed, the abundances of sequences that recruited to comammox

Nitrospira (based on read recruitment to bins) varied temporally and spatially among RBCs (Figure 6), implying that complex physicochemical factors govern comammox in the RBCs. Several RBC comammox *Nitrospira* MAGs may even represent closely related strains (Figure S3), adding further interest to understanding the factors influencing the distribution and ecology

495 of these bacteria.

Genome bins of other ammonia oxidizers were also recovered. Following dereplication, four bins were classified as *Nitrosomonas* (Supplementary file 2). These populations were present at a higher relative abundance in 2010 samples than 2016 samples. A single dereplicated *Nitrosocosmicus* (AOA) bin was detected (RBC071; Supplementary file 2), which indicates the

500 presence of a single *Thaumarchaeota* population and matches previous data from the RBCs [29, 30]. In 2010, this species was present at a higher relative abundance in RBC 8 than RBC 1, with the opposite pattern occurring in 2016 samples. Classified as *Ca.* N. exaquare under GTDB taxonomy, the AOA bin had an ANI of 96.1% between it and the *Ca.* N. exaquare genome (GenBank accession number CP017922.1), which indicated that this AOA MAG corresponded

505 to the same archaeon enriched and characterized from an RBC biofilm sample.

The observed pattern of AOA *amoA* abundances for 2010 samples analyzed in this study (Figure 2, Figure 5A) was consistent with previous data obtained from separate DNA extractions of the same samples [29], demonstrating that AOA were indeed more abundant in RBC 8 than RBC 1 samples in 2010. Although AOA in 2016 samples were at a lower relative abundance in

510 RBC 8 compared to RBC 1, this matches data from more recent samples collected from the RBCs in December 2015 [30]. Lower ammonium concentrations in recent years (Figure S5) may have shifted the *Ca*. N. exaquare AOA population toward RBC 1, and cleaning of the RBC trains in 2014 would have impacted the microbial communities. Lower ammonium concentrations

beneath RBCs and RBC cleaning may have impacted AOB populations as well. Both qPCR

515 (Figure 2) and metagenome sequence data (Figure 5B) indicated an overall decrease in AOB

amoA gene relative abundances in the 2016 samples compared to 2010. Most AOB have a

relatively low ammonia affinity [63, 86, 87] and may be outcompeted when ammonium

concentrations are low by ammonia oxidizers with higher ammonia affinities (i.e., comammox

Nitrospira and AOA).

520 *Conclusions*

This study used complementary methods to demonstrate that comammox *Nitrospira*

dominate microbial communities in biofilms from this engineered WWTP system. Detected

comammox *Nitrospira* exhibited a high level of taxonomic and functional diversity, in contrast

to the single population of AOA found in the same systems. The evolutionary history of

525 comammox *Nitrospira* prior to establishing within the WWTP, perhaps within heterogeneous

soil or sediment samples, may be a factor that contributed to the high diversity observed within

RBCs. There is some phylogenetic evidence that the AOA selected within the RBCs may have

originated on skin surfaces [30, 88], which would offer relatively low habitat heterogeneity.

Additionally, other studies have found the coexistence of closely related *Nitrospira* in WWTPs

530 [17, 89, 90], suggesting that *Nitrospira* may be able to occupy many different niches in

engineered nitrifying environments. Although comammox *Nitrospira* were numerically

dominant, their contributions to nitrification in the RBC environment remain unclear. Future

studies using differential inhibitors, isotope tracer studies, and laboratory cultivation may be

useful for elucidating the contributions of comammox *Nitrospira* to nitrification in the RBC

535 biofilms. In addition, the comammox *Nitrospira* that fall within the newly proposed clade A.2

that lacks cultured representatives [14], along with the *cynS*-containing comammox populations, would be ideal targets for cultivation.

The Guelph WWTP RBCs represent a unique and useful system to study the ecology of comammox *Nitrospira* as a result of inbuilt environmental gradients and the combined presence

540 of comammox *Nitrospira*, AOA, AOB, and NOB. Tertiary treatment systems such as these RBCs can be used to produce high quality effluents, which may be particularly important when WWTPs discharge into environments that have low assimilative capacities or are ecologically sensitive. A longer-term study of the microbial community and operating parameters (e.g., hydraulic retention time, oxygen concentration, organic loading) would help elucidate the factors

545 that affect the microbial community, with a focus on the ammonia oxidizing microbial community. Linking the performance of the RBCs (measured by ammonia removal) to the ammonia oxidizing microbial community would help determine which members of this community have important roles in the ammonia removal process. The activity of the nitrifiers could be further assessed with differential inhibitor and isotope labelling experiments.

550 Understanding the microorganisms that are present within water treatment systems is an important step towards optimizing operational practices for improved effluent quality in municipal, industrial, and aquaculture-associated water treatment systems.

Acknowledgements

555 We thank the operators and staff at the Guelph WWTP for access to their facility and for providing plant data and the Joint Genome Institute for sequencing support. We also thank L. H. Bergstrand for assistance in utilizing the BackBLAST pipeline. This research was supported by

Discovery Grants to LAH, ACD, WJP, and JDN from the Natural Sciences and Engineering

Research Council of Canada (NSERC).

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

References

565   1.   Daims H, Lücker S, Wagner M. A new perspective on microbes formerly known as

nitrite-oxidizing bacteria. *Trends Microbiol* 2016; **24**: 699–712.

2.   Könneke M, Bernhard AE, de la Torre JR, Walker CB, Waterbury JB, Stahl DA. Isolation

of an autotrophic ammonia-oxidizing marine archaeon. *Nature* 2005; **437**: 543–546.

3.   Purkhold U, Pommerening-Röser A, Juretschko S, Schmid MC, Koops HP, Wagner M.

570   Phylogeny of all recognized species of ammonia oxidizers based on comparative 16S

rRNA and *amoA* sequence analysis: Implications for molecular diversity surveys. *Appl*

Environ Microbiol 2000; **66**: 5368–5382.

4.   Costa E, Pérez J, Kreft J-U. Why is metabolic labour divided in nitrification? *Trends*

Microbiol 2006; **14**: 213–219.

575   5.   Daims H, Lebedeva E V., Pjevac P, Han P, Herbold C, Albertsen M, et al. Complete

nitrification by *Nitrospira* bacteria. *Nature* 2015; **528**: 504–509.

6.   van Kessel MAHJ, Speth DR, Albertsen M, Nielsen PH, Op den Camp HJM, Kartal B, et

al. Complete nitrification by a single microorganism. *Nature* 2015; **528**: 555–559.

7.   Pjevac P, Schauberger C, Poghosyan L, Herbold CW, Kessel MA van, Daebeler A, et al.
580   *AmoA*-targeted polymerase chain reaction primers for the specific detection and
      quantification of comammox *Nitrospira* in the environment. *Front Microbiol* 2017; **8**:
      1508.

8.   Pinto AJ, Marcus DN, Ijaz Z, Bautista-de los Santos QM, Dick GJ, Raskin L.
      Metagenomic evidence for the presence of comammox *Nitrospira*-like bacteria in a
585   drinking water system. *mSphere* 2015; **1**: e00054-15.

9.   Palomo A, Fowler SJ, Gülay A, Rasmussen S, Sicheritz-Ponten T, Smets BF.
      Metagenomic analysis of rapid gravity sand filter microbial communities suggests novel
      physiology of *Nitrospira* spp. *ISME J* 2016; **10**: 2569–2581.

10.   Wang Y, Ma L, Mao Y, Jiang X, Xia Y, Yu K, et al. Comammox in drinking water
590   systems. *Water Res* 2017; **116**: 332–341.

11.   Palomo A, Dechesne A, Smets BF. Genomic profiling of *Nitrospira* species reveals
      ecological success of comammox *Nitrospira*. *bioRxiv* 2019; 612226.

12.   Zhao Z, Huang G, Wang M, Zhou N, He S, Dang C, et al. Abundance and community
      composition of comammox bacteria in different ecosystems by a universal primer set. *Sci
595   Total Environ* 2019; **691**: 146–155.

13.   Fowler SJ, Palomo A, Dechesne A, Mines PD, Smets BF. Comammox *Nitrospira* are
      abundant ammonia oxidizers in diverse groundwater-fed rapid sand filter communities.
      Environ Microbiol 2018; **20**: 1002–1015.

14.   Xia F, Wang J-G, Zhu T, Zou B, Rhee S-K, Quan Z-X. Ubiquity and diversity of complete

600   ammonia oxidizers (comammox). *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2018; **84**: e01390-18.

15.   Beach NK, Noguera DR. Design and assessment of species-level qPCR primers targeting

       comammox. *Front Microbiol* 2019; **10**: 36.

16.   Annavajhala MK, Kapoor V, Santo-Domingo J, Chandran K. Comammox functionality

       identified in diverse engineered biological wastewater treatment systems. *Environ Sci*

605   *Technol Lett* 2018; **5**: 110–116.

17.   Roots P, Wang Y, Rosenthal AF, Griffin JS, Sabba F, Petrovich M, et al. Comammox

       Nitrospira are the dominant ammonia oxidizers in a mainstream low dissolved oxygen

       nitrification reactor. *Water Res* 2019; **157**: 396–405.

18.   Cotto I, Dai Z, Huo L, Anderson CL, Vilardi KJ, Ijaz U, et al. Long solids retention times

610   and attached growth phase favor prevalence of comammox bacteria in nitrogen removal

       systems. *Water Res* 2020; **169**: 115268.

19.   Chao Y, Mao Y, Yu K, Zhang T. Novel nitrifiers and comammox in a full-scale hybrid

       biofilm and activated sludge reactor revealed by metagenomic approach. *Appl Microbiol*

       Biotechnol 2016; **100**: 8225–8237.

615 20.   Fan X-Y, Gao J-F, Pan K-L, Li D-C, Dai H-H. Temporal dynamics of bacterial

       communities and predicted nitrogen metabolism genes in a full-scale wastewater treatment

       plant. *RSC Adv* 2017; **7**: 56317–56327.

21.   Pan KL, Gao JF, Fan XY, Li DC, Dai HH. The more important role of archaea than

       bacteria in nitrification of wastewater treatment plants in cold season despite their

620   numerical relationships. *Water Res* 2018; **145**: 552–561.

22.   Wang M, Huang G, Zhao Z, Dang C, Liu W, Zheng M. Newly designed primer pair revealed dominant and diverse comammox *amoA* gene in full-scale wastewater treatment plants. *Bioresour Technol* 2018; **270**: 580–587.

23.   Zheng M, Wang M, Zhao Z, Zhou N, He S, Liu S, et al. Transcriptional activity and diversity of comammox bacteria as a previously overlooked ammonia oxidizing prokaryote in full-scale wastewater treatment plants. *Sci Total Environ* 2019; **656**: 717–722.

24.   Yang Y, Pan J, Zhou Z, Wu J, Liu Y, Lin J-G, et al. Complex microbial nitrogen-cycling networks in three distinct anammox-inoculated wastewater treatment systems. *Water Res* 2020; **168**: 115142.

25.   Gonzalez-Martinez A, Rodriguez-Sanchez A, van Loosdrecht MCM, Gonzalez-Lopez J, Vahala R. Detection of comammox bacteria in full-scale wastewater treatment bioreactors using tag-454-pyrosequencing. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 2016; **23**: 25501–25511.

26.   Fan X-Y, Gao J-F, Pan K-L, Li D-C, Zhang L-F, Wang S-J. Shifts in bacterial community composition and abundance of nitrifiers during aerobic granulation in two nitrifying sequencing batch reactors. *Bioresour Technol* 2018; **251**: 99–107.

27.   Camejo PY, Santo Domingo J, McMahon KD, Noguera DR. Genome-enabled insights into the ecophysiology of the comammox bacterium "*Candidatus* Nitrospira nitrosa". *mSystems* 2017; **2**: e00059-17.

28.   Metch JW, Wang H, Ma Y, Miller JH, Vikesland PJ, Bott C, et al. Insights gained into activated sludge nitrification through structural and functional profiling of microbial community response to starvation stress. *Environ Sci Water Res Technol* 2019; **5**: 884–

896.

29.   Sauder LA, Peterse F, Schouten S, Neufeld JD. Low-ammonia niche of ammonia-
oxidizing archaea in rotating biological contactors of a municipal wastewater treatment
plant. *Environ Microbiol* 2012; **14**: 2589–2600.

30.   Sauder LA, Albertsen M, Engel K, Schwarz J, Nielsen PH, Wagner M, et al. Cultivation
and characterization of *Candidatus* Nitrosocosmicus exaquare, an ammonia-oxidizing
archaeon from a municipal wastewater treatment system. *ISME J* 2017; **11**: 1142–1157.

31.   Holmes RM, Aminot A, Kérouel R, Hooker BA, Peterson BJ. A simple and precise
method for measuring ammonium in marine and freshwater ecosystems. *Can J Fish Aquat
Sci* 1999; **56**: 1801–1808.

32.   Poulin P, Pelletier É. Determination of ammonium using a microplate-based fluorometric
technique. *Talanta* 2007; **71**: 1500–1506.

33.   Miranda KM, Espey MG, Wink DA. A rapid, simple spectrophotometric method for
simultaneous detection of nitrate and nitrite. *Nitric Oxide* 2001; **5**: 62–71.

34.   Ochsenreiter T, Selezi D, Quaiser A, Bonch-Osmolovskaya L, Schleper C. Diversity and
abundance of Crenarchaeota in terrestrial habitats studied by 16S RNA surveys and real
time PCR. *Environ Microbiol* 2003; **5**: 787–797.

35.   Muyzer G, de Waal EC, Uitterlinden AG. Profiling of complex microbial populations by
denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis analysis of polymerase chain reaction-amplified
genes coding for 16S rRNA. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 1993; **59**: 695–700.

36.   Rotthauwe JH, Witzel KP, Liesack W. The ammonia monooxygenase structural gene

amoA as a functional marker: Molecular fine-scale analysis of natural ammonia-oxidizing

665   populations. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 1997; **63**: 4704–4712.

37.   Parada AE, Needham DM, Fuhrman JA. Every base matters: assessing small subunit

rRNA primers for marine microbiomes with mock communities, time series and global

field samples. *Environ Microbiol* 2016; **18**: 1403–1414.

38.   Quince C, Lanzen A, Davenport RJ, Turnbaugh PJ. Removing noise from pyrosequenced

670   amplicons. *BMC Bioinformatics* 2011; **12**: 38.

39.   Bolyen E, Rideout JR, Dillon MR, Bokulich NA, Abnet C, Al-Ghalith GA, et al. QIIME

2: Reproducible, interactive, scalable, and extensible microbiome data science. *PeerJ*

Prepr 2018; **6**: e27295v2.

40.   Martin M. Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from high-throughput sequencing reads.

675   *EMBnet.journal* 2011; **17**: 10.

41.   Callahan BJ, McMurdie PJ, Rosen MJ, Han AW, Johnson AJA, Holmes SP. DADA2:

High-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. *Nat Methods* 2016; **13**:

581–583.

42.   Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, et al. The SILVA ribosomal

680   RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools. *Nucleic Acids*

Res 2012; **41**: D590–D596.

43.   Pedregosa F, Varoquaux G, Gramfort A, Michel V, Thirion B, Grisel O, et al. Scikit-learn:

Machine learning in Python. *J Mach Learn Res* 2011; **12**: 2825–2830.

44.   Schubert M, Lindgreen S, Orlando L. AdapterRemoval v2: rapid adapter trimming,

685    identification, and read merging. *BMC Res Notes* 2016; **9**: 88.

45. Andrews S. FastQC: a quality control tool for high throughput sequence data.

   http://www.bioinformatics.babraham.ac.uk/projects/fastqc. .

46. Ewels P, Magnusson M, Lundin S, Käller M. MultiQC: summarize analysis results for

   multiple tools and samples in a single report. *Bioinformatics* 2016; **32**: 3047–3048.

690 47. Kim D, Hahn AS, Wu SJ, Hanson NW, Konwar KM, Hallam SJ. FragGeneScan-plus for

   scalable high-throughput short-read open reading frame prediction. *2015 IEEE Conf.*

   Comput. Intell. Bioinforma. Comput. Biol. CIBCB 2015. 2015. IEEE, pp 1–8.

48. Fish JA, Chai B, Wang Q, Sun Y, Brown CT, Tiedje JM, et al. FunGene: the functional

   gene pipeline and repository. *Front Microbiol* 2013; **4**: 291.

695 49. Petrenko P, Lobb B, Kurtz DA, Neufeld JD, Doxey AC. MetAnnotate: function-specific

   taxonomic profiling and comparison of metagenomes. *BMC Biol* 2015; **13**: 92.

50. White RAI, Brown J, Colby S, Overall CC, Lee J-Y, Zucker J, et al. ATLAS (Automatic

   Tool for Local Assembly Structures) -a comprehensive infrastructure for assembly,

   annotation, and genomic binning of metagenomic and metatranscriptomic data. *PeerJ*

700   *Prepr* 2017; **5**: e2843v1.

51. Kieser S, Brown J, Zdobnov EM, Trajkovski M, McCue LA. ATLAS: a Snakemake

   workflow for assembly, annotation, and genomic binning of metagenome sequence data.

   bioRxiv 2019; 737528.

52. Parks DH, Chuvochina M, Waite DW, Rinke C, Skarshewski A, Chaumeil P-A, et al. A

705   standardized bacterial taxonomy based on genome phylogeny substantially revises the tree

of life. *Nat Biotechnol* 2018; **36**: 996–1004.

53. Chaumeil P-A, Hugenholtz P, Parks DH. GTDB-Tk: a toolkit to classify genomes with the Genome Taxonomy Database. *Bioinformatics* 2019; doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btz848.

54. Jain C, Rodriguez-R LM, Phillippy AM, Konstantinidis KT, Aluru S. High throughput ANI analysis of 90K prokaryotic genomes reveals clear species boundaries. *Nat Commun* 2018; **9**: 5114.

55. Camacho C, Coulouris G, Avagyan V, Ma N, Papadopoulos J, Bealer K, et al. BLAST+: architecture and applications. *BMC Bioinformatics* 2009; **10**: 421.

56. Bergstrand LH, Cardenas E, Holert J, van Hamme JD, Mohn WW. Delineation of steroid-degrading microorganisms through comparative genomic analysis. *MBio* 2016; **7**: e00166.

57. Nguyen LT, Schmidt HA, Von Haeseler A, Minh BQ. IQ-TREE: A fast and effective stochastic algorithm for estimating maximum-likelihood phylogenies. *Mol Biol Evol* 2015; **32**: 268–274.

58. Edgar RC. MUSCLE: Multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high throughput. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2004; **32**: 1792–1797.

59. Pester M, Maixner F, Berry D, Rattei T, Koch H, Lücker S, et al. *NxrB* encoding the beta subunit of nitrite oxidoreductase as functional and phylogenetic marker for nitrite-oxidizing *Nitrospira*. *Environ Microbiol* 2014; **16**: 3055–3071.

60. Dahllof I, Baillie H, Kjelleberg S. *rpoB*-based microbial community analysis avoids limitations inherent in 16S rRNA gene intraspecies heterogeneity. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2000; **66**: 3376–3380.

61.   Bartleme RP, Mclellan SL, Newton RJ. Freshwater recirculating aquaculture system operations drive biofilter bacterial community shifts around a stable nitrifying consortium of ammonia-oxidizing archaea and comammox *Nitrospira*. *Front Microbiol* 2017; **8**: 101.

730   62.   Park H-D, Wells GF, Bae H, Criddle CS, Francis CA. Occurrence of ammonia-oxidizing archaea in wastewater treatment plant bioreactors. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2006; **72**: 5643–5647.

63.   Kits KD, Sedlacek CJ, Lebedeva E V., Han P, Bulaev A, Pjevac P, et al. Kinetic analysis of a complete nitrifier reveals an oligotrophic lifestyle. *Nature* 2017; **549**: 269–272.

735   64.   Bai Y, Sun Q, Wen D, Tang X. Abundance of ammonia-oxidizing bacteria and archaea in industrial and domestic wastewater treatment systems. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 2012; **80**: 323–330.

65.   Roy D, McEvoy J, Blonigen M, Amundson M, Khan E. Seasonal variation and ex-situ nitrification activity of ammonia oxidizing archaea in biofilm based wastewater treatment processes. *Bioresour Technol* 2017; **244**: 850–859.

66.   Gao J-F, Luo X, Wu G-X, Li T, Peng Y-Z. Quantitative analyses of the composition and abundance of ammonia-oxidizing archaea and ammonia-oxidizing bacteria in eight full-scale biological wastewater treatment plants. *Bioresour Technol* 2013; **138**: 285–296.

67.   Zhang T, Ye L, Tong AHY, Shao MF, Lok S. Ammonia-oxidizing archaea and ammonia-oxidizing bacteria in six full-scale wastewater treatment bioreactors. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 2011; **91**: 1215–1225.

68.   Limpiyakorn T, Sonthiphand P, Rongsayamanont C, Polprasert C. Abundance of *amoA*

genes of ammonia-oxidizing archaea and bacteria in activated sludge of full-scale wastewater treatment plants. *Bioresour Technol* 2011; **102**: 3694–3701.

750   69.   Lawson CE, Lücker S. Complete ammonia oxidation: an important control on nitrification in engineered ecosystems? *Curr Opin Biotechnol* 2018; **50**: 158–165.

70.   Palomo A, Pedersen AG, Fowler SJ, Dechesne A, Sicheritz-Pontén T, Smets BF. Comparative genomics sheds light on niche differentiation and the evolutionary history of comammox *Nitrospira*. *ISME J* 2018; **12**: 1779–1793.

755   71.   Koch H, Lücker S, Albertsen M, Kitzinger K, Herbold C, Spieck E, et al. Expanded metabolic versatility of ubiquitous nitrite-oxidizing bacteria from the genus *Nitrospira*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2015; **112**: 11371–11376.

72.   Lücker S, Wagner M, Maixner F, Pelletier E, Koch H, Vacherie B, et al. A *Nitrospira* metagenome illuminates the physiology and evolution of globally important nitrite-

760   oxidizing bacteria. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2010; **107**: 13479–13484.

73.   Ushiki N, Fujitani H, Shimada Y, Morohoshi T, Sekiguchi Y, Tsuneda S. Genomic analysis of two phylogenetically distinct *Nitrospira* species reveals their genomic plasticity and functional diversity. *Front Microbiol* 2018; **8**: 2637.

74.   Poghosyan L, Koch H, Lavy A, Frank J, Kessel MAHJ, Jetten MSM, et al. Metagenomic

765   recovery of two distinct comammox *Nitrospira* from the terrestrial subsurface. *Environ Microbiol* 2019; E-pub DOI 10.1111/1462-2920.14691.

75.   Coppi M V. The hydrogenases of *Geobacter sulfurreducens*: a comparative genomic perspective. *Microbiology* 2005; **151**: 1239–1254.

76. Koch H, Galushko A, Albertsen M, Schintlmeister A, Gruber-Dorninger C, Lücker S, et al. Growth of nitrite-oxidizing bacteria by aerobic hydrogen oxidation. *Science* 2014; **345**: 1052–1054.

77. Palatinszky M, Herbold C, Jehmlich N, Pogoda M, Han P, von Bergen M, et al. Cyanate as an energy source for nitrifiers. *Nature* 2015; **524**: 105–108.

78. Koch H, van Kessel MAHJ, Lücker S. Complete nitrification: insights into the ecophysiology of comammox *Nitrospira*. *Appl Microbiol Biotechnol* 2019; **103**: 177–189.

79. Walsh MA, Otwinowski Z, Perrakis A, Anderson PM, Joachimiak A. Structure of cyanase reveals that a novel dimeric and decameric arrangement of subunits is required for formation of the enzyme active site. *Structure* 2000; **8**: 505–14.

80. Marier JR, Rose D. Determination of cyanate, and a study of its accumulation in aqueous solutions of urea. *Anal Biochem* 1964; **7**: 304–314.

81. Dirnhuber P, Schütz F. The isomeric transformation of urea into ammonium cyanate in aqueous solutions. *Biochem J* 1948; **42**: 628–32.

82. Anderson PM, Sung Y, Fuchs JA. The cyanase operon and cyanate metabolism. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 1990; **87**: 247–252.

83. Purcarea C, Ahuja A, Lu T, Kovari L, Guy HI, Evans DR. *Aquifex aeolicus* aspartate transcarbamoylase, an enzyme specialized for the efficient utilization of unstable carbamoyl phosphate at elevated temperature. *J Biol Chem* 2003; **278**: 52924–34.

84. Kamennaya NA, Post AF. Characterization of cyanate metabolism in marine *Synechococcus* and *Prochlorococcus* spp. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 2011; **77**: 291–301.

790   85.   Muñoz-Centeno MC, Paneque A, Cejudo FJ. Cyanate is transported by the nitrate

permease in *Azotobacter chroococcum*. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 1996; **137**: 91–94.

86.   Lehtovirta-Morley LE. Ammonia oxidation: Ecology, physiology, biochemistry and why

they must all come together. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 2018; **365**: fny058.

87.   Prosser JI, Nicol GW. Archaeal and bacterial ammonia-oxidisers in soil: The quest for

795   niche specialisation and differentiation. *Trends Microbiol* 2012; **20**: 523–531.

88.   Probst AJ, Auerbach AK, Moissl-Eichinger C. Archaea on human skin. *PLoS One* 2013;

8: e65388.

89.   Daims H, Nielsen JL, Nielsen PH, Schleifer KH, Wagner M. In situ characterization of

Nitrospira-like nitrite-oxidizing bacteria active in wastewater treatment plants. *Appl*

800   *Environ Microbiol* 2001; **67**: 5273–5284.

90.   Gruber-Dorninger C, Pester M, Kitzinger K, Savio DF, Loy A, Rattei T, et al.

Functionally relevant diversity of closely related *Nitrospira* in activated sludge. *ISME J*

2015; **9**: 643–655.

 Figure legends

Figure 1 Rotating biological contactors (RBCs) of the Guelph wastewater treatment plant
(WWTP). (A) External view of the RBCs and (B) schematic of the RBC trains. Arrows indicate
the direction of water flow. (C) Ammonium (NH_4^+-N), nitrite (NO_2-N), and nitrate (NO_3-N)
concentrations in RBC influent water sampled at the same time as biofilm collection in October
810   2016. Error bars indicate standard deviation of technical duplicates. NE, Northeast train; NW,
Northwest train; SE, Southeast train; SW, Southwest train.

Figure 2 Bacterial 16S rRNA, comammox *Nitrospira* (*amoA*), AOB (*amoA*), and
thaumarchaeotal 16S rRNA gene abundances for samples paired with metagenome sequencing.
815   Error bars indicate standard deviation of technical qPCR duplicates. Pie charts show gene
abundances as a proportion of all ammonia oxidizing prokaryotes. Numbers above the pie charts
indicate the proportion (%) of the total community that all ammonia oxidizing prokaryotes
represent. Gene copies were calculated based on the amount of DNA present in the original
extractions but were not standardized to account for expected gene copy number per genome.
820   NE, northeast train; NW, northwest train; SE, southeast train; SW, southwest train.

Figure 3 Relative abundances of amplicon sequence variants (ASVs) based on 16S rRNA gene
amplicon sequencing, for samples paired with metagenome sequencing. Only taxa detected at ≥
1% relative abundance are shown. The lowest level of informative taxonomic rank is given.
825   Numbers after the underscore are the ASV number. The numbers inside the circles represent the
relative abundance, in percent. *Nitrospira* ASVs are highlighted in orange, AOB ASVs are
highlighted in green, and the AOA ASV is highlighted in blue.

Figure 4 Taxonomic profiling of rotating biological contactor (RBC) microbial community by the hidden Markov model (HMM) for the RNA polymerase beta subunit (*rpoB*). Stacked bars represent the relative abundance of unassembled *rpoB* metagenome sequence reads classified at the genus level. Genera at greater than or equal to 1% relative abundance are shown. Dark orange and green shaded bars represent nitrifiers. *Nitrospira* species include both strict nitrite-oxidizing and comammox *Nitrospira*, because they cannot be distinguished at the genus level. NE, northeast train; NW, northwest train; SE, southeast train; SW, southwest train.

Figure 5 Functional gene profiling of nitrifiers in rotating biological contactor (RBC) microbial communities by hidden Markov models (HMMs). Stacked bars represent the normalized abundances of functional genes, relative to *rpoB*, from unassembled metagenome sequence reads. Genera at ≥1% normalized relative abundance are shown with taxa labels, along with genera at <1%, which are marked as "Other" at the uppermost grey bar. Blue, green, and orange bars represent nitrifiers. Other genera at ≥1% normalized relative abundance are collapsed to the phylum level for clarity and are shown in grey. (A) HMM search for the *amoA* gene of ammonia-oxidizing archaea, which are grouped at the phylum level (*Thaumarchaeota*) for clarity. No HMM hits were found for sample NE1 June 2010. (B) HMM search for the *amoA* gene of ammonia-oxidizing bacteria and comammox *Nitrospira*. (C) HMM search for the *nxrB* gene of *Nitrospira* and other NOB. This HMM also may have detected genes for nitrate reductase (*narH*). NE, northeast train; NW, northwest train; SE, southeast train; SW, southwest train; *amoA*, ammonia monooxygenase subunit A gene; *nxrB*, nitrite oxidoreductase; *narH*, nitrate reductase.

Figure 6 Relative abundance of *Nitrospira* bins across samples based on total recruited reads. The size of the bubbles indicates the proportion (%) of assembled reads from each sample that mapped to each genome bin. Stacked bars summarize the total proportions of assembled metagenomic reads recruited to the genome bins.

Figure 7 Phylogeny and gene pathways in *Nitrospira* bins and reference genomes. The bins recovered from this study are indicated in bold, an asterisk indicates that the genome is from an enrichment or pure culture. Phylogenomic analysis was performed using a concatenated set of 74 core bacterial proteins. All bootstrap values are 100% except those shown, and the scale bar represents the proportion of amino acid change. Gene annotation was determined using reciprocal BLASTP against four reference *Nitrospira* genomes (*Ca.* N. inopinata, *Nitrospira moscoviensis*, *Nitrospira lenta, Nitrospira japonica*), and amino acid identity to the reference gene is indicated in the heatmap. Abbreviations: *amo*, ammonia monooxygenase; *Rh50*, ammonia transporter; *amt*, ammonia transporter; *hao,* hydroxylamine oxidoreductase; *cyc*, cytochrome c; *nxr*, nitrite oxidoreductase; *ure*, urease; *urt*, urea transporter; *nrf,* cytochrome c nitrite reductase; *nirK*, dissimilatory nitrite reductase; *nirA*, assimilatory nitrite reductase; OCC, octaheme cytochrome c; *narK*, nitrite/nitrate transporter; *nirC*, nitrite transporter; *cynABD,* cyanate transporter; *cynS*, cyanate hydratase; *hup*, group 2a [Ni-Fe] hydrogenase; *hyp*, hydrogenase accessory protein; *hyf,* putative group 4 hydrogenase; *hyb* and *hyd*, group 3 [Ni-Fe] sulfur-reducing hydrogenase; *fdh*, formate dehydrogenase.

Figure 8 Phylogeny and relative abundances of cyanases (CynS) detected in RBC metagenome sequencing data. (A) Maximum likelihood phylogeny of CynS primary sequences detected in *Nitrospira* genome bins from this study compared to reference sequences from NCBI. Sublineages of the *Nitrospira* clade are highlighted by the coloured vertical bar, including potential clade A comammox bacteria, which are highlighted in orange. Genome bins recovered from the RBCs are bolded, and an asterisk appears after the names of genomes of cultivated organisms. Bootstrap values over 50% are shown, and the scale bar represents the proportion of amino acid change. To the right of the phylogeny, a portion of the CynS primary sequence alignment is shown along with overall sequence similarity based on the BLOSUM62 metric. Residues with 100% conservation are marked with an asterisk. Blue asterisks are used to mark known catalytic residues of CynS, namely Arg96, Glu99, and Ser122. (B) Relative abundances of all RBC genome bins containing *cynS* among RBC metagenomes. Genome bins are collapsed at the genus level into stacked bars, and relative abundances are based on the proportion (%) of mapped assembled reads to genome data.

Figure 1

Figure 2

Figure 3

Figure 4

Figure 5

940   **Figure 6**

Figure 7

Figure 8