The high persister phenotype of *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* is associated with increased

fitness and persistence in cystic fibrosis airways

Authors

Biljana Mojsoska[1*], David R. Cameron[3*], Jennifer A. Bartell[2*], Janus Anders Juul Haagensen[2],

Lea M. Sommer[1], Kim Lewis[3§], Søren Molin[2], Helle Krogh Johansen[1,4§]

Affiliations:

[1] Department of Clinical Microbiology, Rigshospitalet, Copenhagen, Denmark

[2] The Novo Nordisk Foundation Center for Biosustainability, Technical University of

Denmark, Lyngby, Denmark

[3] Antimicrobial Discovery Center, Northeastern University, Boston, USA

[4] University of Copenhagen, Department of Clinical Medicine, Copenhagen, Denmark

*Contributed equally to the work

§Corresponding authors

BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES: Microbiology

Keywords: persister cells, persistent infection, *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, cystic fibrosis

Abstract

Despite intensive antibiotic treatment of cystic fibrosis (CF) patients, *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* often persists in patient airways for decades, and can do so without the development of antibiotic resistance. Using a high-throughput screening assay of survival after treatment with high concentrations of ciprofloxacin, we have determined the prevalence of high-persister variants (Hip) in a large patient cohort. In a screen of 467 longitudinal clinical isolates of *P. aeruginosa* from 40 CF patients, we classified 25.7% as Hip. Hip were identified in 26 patients, but only a few bacterial lineages were dominated by Hip. Instead, the emergence of Hip increased over time, suggesting that CF airways treated with ciprofloxacin select for Hip with an increased fitness in this environment. We generally observed diverse genetic changes in the Hip isolate population (as many co-occurring routes to increased fitness exist), but interestingly elevated mutation counts in the RpoN gene of 18 Hip isolates suggest that this sigma factor plays a role in shaping levels of antibiotic tolerance. To probe the impact of the Hip phenotype in a CF-similar environment, we tested the fitness properties of otherwise genotypically and phenotypically similar low-persister (Lop) and Hip isolates in co-culture using a specialized flow-cell biofilm system mimicking pharmacokinetic/-dynamic antibiotic dosing. Hip survived ciprofloxacin treatment far better than Lop isolates. The results of this investigation provide novel insights into persister dynamics and fitness contributions to survival in the CF lung, and show that the Hip phenotype of antibiotic susceptible bacteria plays an important role in long-term infections.

Significance

Antibiotic resistance is emphasized as a rapidly increasing health threat, but antibiotic tolerance via the occurrence of persister cells in antibiotic-treated bacterial populations is clinically and publicly neglected. In 40 CF patients representing a well-established human infection model – long-term lung infections by *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* – we show the emergence and accumulation of persister variants in a clinical population heavily reliant on antibiotic therapy. We observe that the high-persister (Hip) phenotype is independent of resistance and likely the consequence of numerous genetic alterations, complicating surveillance and inhibition in the clinic. Furthermore, we find Hip are selected for over time, survive better than 'normal' bacteria, and can outcompete them in CF-similar conditions, ultimately affecting 65% of patients in an early disease cohort.

Introduction

Antibiotic-tolerant persister cells are suspected to be a significant clinical problem that has been seriously neglected in favor of combating antibiotic-resistant bacteria, though persisters were in fact described shortly after the clinical introduction of antibiotics (1). Persisters are distinct from antibiotic-resistant mutants, as they do not grow in the presence of antibiotics. Instead, they remain dormant during antibiotic exposure but retain the capacity to resuscitate and restore the population when antibiotic concentrations drop (2–4). However, our understanding of the physiology and clinical relevance of persister cells is limited, given the difficulty in reliably isolating what is theorized to be a stochastic phenotype *in vitro*, much less monitoring this phenotype in routine clinical care. Thus, few studies have assayed persister formation in clinical scenarios (5, 6). One study of oral carriage (0-19 weeks) of *Candida albicans* isolates from 22 cancer patients undergoing chemotherapy found that patients with carriage of greater than 8 weeks had significantly higher persister levels than those with less than 8 weeks carriage, but did not address the underlying genetic mechanisms of persistence in this pathogen (5). To examine the genetic underpinnings of the persister phenotype in a clinical scenario, both a large, aligned patient cohort that places the bacteria under similar environmental stresses as well as isolate sampling at a resolution that captures the emergence and longevity of the phenotype are needed.

P. aeruginosa is the most frequent cause of chronic airway infections in patients with CF (7, 8). Mutations in the cystic fibrosis transmembrane conductance regulator (*CFTR*) gene often result in inefficient mucociliary clearance of bacteria from the airways, creating opportunities for bacterial colonization (9, 10). Upon entering the host, environmental *P. aeruginosa* adapts to the CF lung environment, ultimately establishing an incurable airway infection (11, 12). Despite intensive antibiotic treatment from the first discovery of the bacterium in the lung, resistance emergence in the first years of infection is surprisingly low (13, 14). In the absence of clinically defined antibiotic resistance, survival of the bacteria is likely supported by small fractions of antibiotic tolerant subpopulations, among which persister cells may be clinically important (6, 15). While persister cells are stochastic phenotypic variants in any bacterial population, genetic changes in bacterial populations can result in a <u>hi</u>gh <u>p</u>ersister (Hip) state, producing increased numbers of antibiotic tolerant cells following exposure to antibiotics (16). A previous investigation of the persister phenotype in young CF patients showed an increase in persister phenotype in early/late infection isolate pairs from 14 patients. In this study, 35 longitudinal *P. aeruginosa* isolates taken from one child over a 96-month period showed

90   increased levels of persister cells over time as well as an accumulation of 68 mutations between
91   the first and last isolate (6). However, the mutations in the single patient resembled those
92   known to accumulate in other CF patients over infection rather than any mutations previously
93   associated with the Hip phenotype in other, non-CF studies.
94

To acquire a high-resolution pan-cohort perspective of persister emergence, genetic
mechanism, and impact in long-term infections, we have screened for Hip variants over a 10-
year period in 40 young CF patients via 467 longitudinal isolates of *P. aeruginosa* collected
from initial colonization onward. This unique isolate collection allows us to determine Hip
prevalence and dynamics during each colonizing strain's transition from environmental isolate
to persistent pathogen. We describe relationships between the Hip phenotype and the age of
the isolate, as well as other adaptive traits in longitudinal infections. We show that the Hip
phenotype is an independent and widespread trait. We further search for genetic changes
associated with the Hip phenotype in independent clonal lineages within distinct patients,
which may suggest adaptive routes to producing this phenotype. Finally, we show that the Hip
phenotype generally accumulates over time in patients via several archetypal patterns, appears
to contribute to long-term persistence of lineages, and increases the fitness of colonizing
populations of *P. aeruginosa* in antibiotic-treated CF patient lungs.
108

Results
The isolate collection
We examined a collection of 467 *P. aeruginosa* airway isolates obtained from 40 young CF
patients over a 10 year period while they were treated at the Copenhagen CF Centre (17). These
patients represent a cohort aligned at the early infection stage and undergoing similar treatment
regimens per CF Centre guidelines, with repeated culture of *P. aeruginosa* from their monthly
sputum sampling within a time frame of 2-10 years (patient inclusion was on a rolling basis
over the study period in order to capture all early colonization cases). Early isolates therefore
represent bacteria that have not been exposed to substantial antibiotic treatment before the
study start excepting rare cases of strain transmission from another patient. The bacterial CF
isolates have been grouped into 53 genetically distinct clone types based on their genome
sequences (17), and while the majority of patients retained a monoclonal infection during the
entire course of infection, half (n=21, 53 %) were infected at least transiently with another
clone type. To effectively account for these multi-clonal infections, clinical isolates are
described by their patient-specific lineage, which is defined by the clone type and the patient

Figure 1. High-throughput screening approach for isolates with a high persister (Hip) phenotype. A large collection of *P. aeruginosa* clinical isolates were grown to stationary phase in quadruplicate wells for 2 experiments (4 technical replicates for each of 2 biological replicates - BRs). Each isolate was treated with 100 μg/ml of ciprofloxacin for 24 hours, while growth was assessed by plating on LB agar. Following antibiotic treatment, isolates were plated via serial dilution and survival was assessed. Each isolate was given a persister score based on consistent replicate survival following treatment. Isolates for which 2-4 replicates survived for each BR were given a score of 2-4, respectively, and were considered high persisters (Hip). Isolates with a respective score of 0-1 were considered low persisters (Lop).

of origin (75 lineages in total). Throughout this paper, we will also refer to 'Time since first

detection' for each isolate, which represents the length of time between first detection of *P.*

aeruginosa and subsequent isolations of the same clone type.

Identification of Hip by high-throughput screening

We screened the collection of *P. aeruginosa* isolates for the propensity to survive in the

presence of high concentrations of ciprofloxacin. This antibiotic was chosen because it is

commonly used to treat early *P. aeruginosa* infections in CF patients, and it is bactericidal

toward stationary phase *P. aeruginosa* (18, 19). Briefly, *P. aeruginosa* subcultures in micro-

titer plates were grown for 48 hours until they reached stationary phase, after which they were

challenged with a high concentration of ciprofloxacin (100 μg/ml) for 24 hours before survival

was assessed (Fig. 1). Each isolate was screened eight times (technical quadruplicates

performed in duplicate biological experiments) and scored based on the capacity to re-grow

after treatment. An isolate was given a score of 0 if it failed to re-grow in any replicate, a score

of 1 if it grew once in both biological duplicates, a score of 2 if it grew in half of the technical

replicates on each plate, a score of 3 if it grew in at least three replicates on each plate, and a

score of 4 if it grew in all replicates. We then defined high persister (Hip) isolates as those

scoring between 2-4, and low persister (Lop) isolates as those scoring between 0-1. Using this

scoring system, 120 isolates (25.7%) of the collection were defined as Hip (Fig. 2A). Isolates

with a score of four made up the largest Hip group, while most of the Lop isolates were scored

as zero, failing to grow in any replicate. To validate our high-throughput screening approach,

we randomly selected 14 Hip isolates and compared their persister phenotypes with 8 Lop

control isolates as well as the laboratory strain PAO1 using standard persister assays. The Hip variants on average produced 1000-fold-more CFU persisters than the Lop isolates (Fig. 2B).

As we were using ciprofloxacin as the antibiotic to identify persister isolates, and most of our patients have been treated with ciprofloxacin, we also wanted to check if we were simply selecting ciprofloxacin resistant isolates as opposed to high persisters. Ciprofloxacin MICs were determined using E-tests for isolates within the collection. Most of the isolates were characterized as susceptible based on the European Committee on Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing (EUCAST) breakpoints (Fig. 2C). Forty-eight susceptible isolates were Hip variants while 92 Lop variants were resistant, confirming that our screening approach identified an antibiotic-resistant phenotype separate from the persister phenotype.

Figure 2. Persister screening results. (A) Distribution of *P. aeruginosa* Hip (blue) and Lop (grey) isolates. **(B)** Validation assays were performed for Hip and Lop isolates. Colony forming units (CFU) per ml were determined following overnight treatment with 100 μg/ml of ciprofloxacin. Each data point represents a single isolate and is the mean of 6 independent experiments. Bars represent SEM. **(C)** Hip and Lop persister isolates were classified as susceptible or resistant to ciprofloxacin according to EUCAST breakpoints (S≤0.5μg/ml, R>0.5μg/ml) based on their MIC obtained via E-test.

The persister phenotype is an independent trait

As illustrated by the comparison between

persister class and response to ciprofloxacin, the

persister phenotype in our collection is not

arising in isolation from other adaptations.

Adaptations accumulate based on a

combinatorial response to both temporal and

fixed environmental factors unique to a given

patient. We and others have previously observed

that CF isolates adapt towards slow growth rates,

increased resistance to antibiotics, and

preference for a biofilm lifestyle (20–22), and it

has also been proposed that there is a specific

association between slowing growth rate and the

Hip phenotype (23). To probe interrelationships

with other phenotypes and compare the adaptive

background of the Hip and Lop variants, we used

a principle component analysis to evaluate the

distribution of Hip (blue diamonds) versus Lop

(gray circles) variants by multiple traits under

selection pressure in the CF lung. In Figure 3A,

we see that Hip variants group with isolates

exhibiting more adapted traits (increased

antibiotic MICs and slowing growth), but they

also appear across the full phenotypic space

alongside Lop isolates. The data ellipses

enclosing the approximated majority of each

population (68% of the population, t

distribution) show that Hip variants (solid blue

ellipse) do not separate from Lop variants (solid

gray ellipse). We also specifically identify the

first Hip variant of each clone type infecting a

given patient (FirstHip – blue triangles, dashed

blue ellipse) in an attempt to assess these isolates'

Figure 3. High persisters in the multi-trait landscape. Lop (grey circle), the earliest Hip (blue triangle) isolate(s) of each lineage, and the rest of the Hip isolates (blue diamond) were analyzed via principle component analysis with respect to their similarity with other infection-linked traits: growth rate (grLB), adhesion (adh), ciprofloxacin MIC (cip) and tobramycin MIC (tob)). FirstHip persisters were highlighted as Hip variants with mitigated effects of other accumulating mutations within the lineage to improve cross-lineage comparison. 438 isolates with complete trait sets are included. **(A)** Isolates exhibiting a persister phenotype do not consistently cluster with any other specific trait, while traits of Lop, FirstHip, and Hip isolates shift slightly from 'naïve' towards 'adapted' levels. We illustrate this using data ellipse enclosing samples approximately within the first standard deviation (t distribution, 68% of the set) for isolate sets characterized as Lop (gray ellipse), FirstHip (dashed blue ellipse), and Hip (blue ellipse). **(B)** Lop and Hip variants co-occur in time when evaluating five lengthy lineages characterized by periods of continuous Hip isolates (see Figure 3 – 'Continuous' set). First isolate (white fill), firstHip (triangle), and last isolate (dark fill) are demarcated by bolded marker outlines for all lineages.

other traits and state of adaptation at first

appearance. These FirstHip isolates overlap substantially with both Lops and Hips, indicating much variation in the adaptive state. This variation could be due to likely lapses of time between the emergence of a Hip variant and its isolation as well as different adaptive trajectories with patients.

We theorized that patients with increased numbers of clustered Hip variants might be easier to interpret from a trait perspective, as Hip variants from the same patient-specific lineages would be both closely related genetically and exposed to the same treatment and immune-related selection pressures. We made a focused plot including only isolates associated with 5 patient-specific lineages that exhibit continuous periods of Hip variants (as classified in association with Figure 5) and have been sampled for more than 2 years since first detection (Figure 3B). Two of 5 lineages evolve in a directed fashion (dashed directional lines) based on time since detection (marker fill color). However, we do not see consistent separation of Hip variants from Lop variants within each lineage by other phenotypes, even within directionally evolving lineages – they co-occur across isolate age and direction of adaptation trajectory.

In a final related assessment, we contrast just the appearance of ciprofloxacin resistance versus Hip variant for all study lineages. In seven lineages (17%), a Hip isolate was detected before resistance emerged. In five lineages, resistance emerged in the absence of the Hip phenotype, and in an additional seven cases, a resistant isolate was detected before a Hip isolate. This supports that Hip and increased ciprofloxacin MIC are two independent phenotypes, which may be concurrently selected for over time as patients undergo treatment.

Genetic evolution of the persister phenotype is not convergent across patient-specific lineages
Sequencing and identification of genetic variations accumulating within each clone type have been previously performed for most of the isolates used in this study; furthermore, genes targeted in convergent evolution were identified by the significant enrichment of observed lineages with mutations in those genes compared to the number of lineages expected to have mutations in the same genes according to genetic drift (derived from a simulated evolution where lineages accumulate an equivalent number of mutations randomly for 1000 independent evolution simulations) (17). We split our dataset into Hip and Lop variants, and then performed this same observed versus expected lineage enrichment analysis for each population (see Materials and Methods for further details). A comparison of the significantly enriched mutated genes for Hip versus Lop populations allowed us to identify 9 candidate '*hip*' genes targeted

236   in Hip variants when compared to Lop variants (Figure 4A). However, a maximum of 4 (15%)

237   Hip-containing lineages accumulated non-synonymous mutations in the same enriched '*hip*'

238   gene, which is a weak signal of convergent evolution within our 26 lineages with Hip variants

239   (hereafter referred to as Hip[+] lineages). Moreover, there was a surprising lack of the most

240   prominent '*hip*' genes identified in *in vitro* studies and screens (Table S1).

A

Locus	Gene	Product	Hip-based Lineage Count	Lineage Enrichment Ratio
PA4462	***rpoN***	**RNA polymerase σ⁵⁴ factor**	**4**	**5.4**
PA4069		Hypothetical protein	3	4.9
PA3257	*algO*	Periplasmic tail-specific protease	3	4.8
PA1380		Transcriptional regulator	3	2.4
PA2685	*vgrG4*		3	2.2
PA2403	*fpvG*	Hypothetical protein	3	2.1
PA0720		Helix destabilizing protein of Pf1	3	2.0
PA0888	*aotJ*	Arginine/ornithine binding protein	3	2.0
PA3467		Putative transporter	3	2.0

Figure 4. Survival following antibiotic treatment for clinical *P. aeruginosa* isolates harboring an intact and inducible copy of *rpoN*. (A) Mutated genes enriched in Hip versus Lop isolates as assessed from a convergent evolution perspective accounting for lineage adaptation. Lineage enrichment ratio was calculated by dividing lineage-based gene mutation enrichment within Hip variants by that within Lop variants for each gene. Top Hip-linked genes were selected via the following criteria: greater than 2 lineages presenting mutations in that gene in the Hip population and a lineage enrichment ratio greater than 2. **(B)** Hip (blue bars) and Lop (grey bar) isolates with *rpoN* null mutations were grown for 24 hours then treated with ciprofloxacin (100 μg/ml). Cultures were plated for survival following 24 hours of treatment, and colony forming units (CFU) were quantified. The expression of intact *rpoN* was induced via the addition of 0.02% arabinose (black bars). Data presented are the mean ± SD, n ≥ 3. Significance was determined using unpaired t-test (** $p<0.01$, * $p<0.05$, ns, not significant).

We experimentally evaluated the contribution of our top '*hip*' gene, the sigma factor encoding

gene *rpoN* (Figure 4B). The gene encodes the RNA polymerase σ⁵⁴ subunit, and is among the

general pathoadaptive genes previously identified in a subset of our clinical isolate collection

(17). The gene was mutated in 19 isolates from five distinct lineages, and of these 18 isolates

were also Hip (of 4 Hip[+] lineages). The specific *rpoN* mutant alleles in these isolates differ, but

in all cases premature translational stop codons were identified. To evaluate the impact of *rpoN*

mutations in affected mutants, two representative Hip variants (from the DK06-P4405 lineage)

with differing ciprofloxacin sensitivities (an MIC of .25 and 4, respectively) and the one Lop

isolate (from the DK32-P8203 lineage, MIC of 4) were selected for further characterization

(see Materials and Methods for more details). Each isolate was transformed with a plasmid

carrying an intact and inducible copy of *rpoN* (p*rpoN*). When RpoN function was restored in

each of the Hip variants, the persister level was reduced for both (which also illustrated the

phenotype's independence from ciprofloxacin sensitivity level). In contrast, the Lop isolate did
not show any changes in persister class when complemented with an intact copy of *rpoN*.
Additionally, a PAO1 *rpoN* deletion mutant did not show a difference in persister phenotype
when compared to wild-type PAO1 (data not shown). This highlights the complex role of
lineage background on the persister phenotype – RpoN contributes to the persister phenotype,
but lineage-based factors such as potentiating mutations and/or background genotypic features
enable this contribution.

Hip variants accumulate in patients over time (via diverse incidence patterns)
The lack of strong genetic signatures differentiating Hip from Lop isolates motivated us to
examine the temporal dynamics of high persister incidence. Our isolate collection is unique
due to the coverage of each patient's initial colonization phase based on the patient's age and
clinical history. In half of the patients, the earliest bacterial isolate is also the first-ever
identified *P. aeruginosa* in the clinic. We can thus estimate the emergence of the Hip phenotype
as *P. aeruginosa* adapts from a wild type-similar naïve state into an adapted persistent
pathogen. Previous findings have indicated that the number of Hip variants from a lineage may
increase over time as the bacteria adapt to the antibiotic pressure in the host, and that once a
Hip isolate is observed, it is assumed to persist in the infecting population of the patient (5, 6).

To illustrate the range of persister dynamics we observe, we grouped each lineage by an array
of descriptors. The lineage descriptors include Hip presence versus absence (Hip$^+$ vs Hip$^-$),
transience of the lineage (whether it appears for less than 2 years and less than half the length
of a patient's infection and is afterwards replaced by another lineage), continuity of Hip
variants (whether Hip variants are consistently present for at least 3 sampling dates in a row),
dominance of Hip variants (whether Hip variants make up at least 2/3 of all collected isolates
of a lineage), and whether a Hip variant initiates the lineage. Figure 5A shows the ordered
distribution of the lineages in 10 different groups based on the distinct sets of descriptors,
illustrating both the complexity of our samples and the diversity of lineage Hip dynamics. An
assessment of the number of lineages in each group shows the following: 1) 29 of 75 lineages
are Hip$^+$, 2) 29 of 46 Hip$^-$ lineages are transient, while 3 Hip$^+$ lineages are transient, 3) 20 Hip$^+$
lineages have Hip variants appear in a seemingly stochastic manner after colonization is
initiated versus 9 lineages that exhibit continuous periods and/or dominance of Hip variants,
and 4) 10 lineages have initiating Hip$^+$ variants. Thus, the fraction (25.7%, Fig. 2) of total
isolates with a Hip phenotype appears to be distributed over a subset of lineages (38.6%) in

both stable (continuous/dominant) and stochastic patterns of incidence, rather than present in
every evolving lineage.
290

Figure 5. Persister incidence patterns from a lineage-based perspective. (A) Lineages were classed according to several nested characteristics: transient versus non-transient lineages, Hip presence, continuous periods of isolated Hips, lineage-initiating Hips, and Hips dominating a lineage. Lineages representing each combination of traits are shown on the left while characteristic sets are identified and enumerated for the entire collection on the right. (B) Hip⁻ (gray circles) and Hip⁺ (blue diamonds) show the continuous patient count of Hip⁻ patients versus Hip⁺ patients for the prior year of colonization, while the accumulating count of Hip⁺ patients from time 0 is shown by black diamonds. (C) Transient lineages (lineages of shorter than 2 years duration, less than 50% of total patient infection length, and which are followed by a new lineage's appearance) are significantly associated with the Hip⁻ phenotype, while non-transient lineages are associated with the Hip⁺ phenotype based on Pearson's chi-squared test. Transience-unclassifiable lineages of shorter than 2 years' duration at the end of a patient's collection period are shown for context.

Given the apparent variability in Hip presence and pattern, we examined the incidence of Hip
variants within patients over time as shown in Figure 5B. Here we plot the continuous counts

of patients exhibiting the Hip phenotype (Hip$^+$) versus no Hip presence (Hip$^-$) within the

previous year (dashed lines), which illustrates both the number of patients assessed at a given

colonization age and the increasing distribution of Hip$^+$ versus Hip$^-$ phenotypes over time. An

inspection of the number of patients that have exhibited a Hip variant at least once by a certain

age of colonization (solid line) shows that the number of patients with Hip variants increases

over time, ultimately affecting 65% of the patients in our study cohort by 7 years of

colonization. Next, we evaluated the relationship between lineage transience and Hip presence.

In addition to our other classifications, we mark as 'New' the lineages present for less than 2

years in a patient at the end of our study period since we cannot classify them as transient or

non-transient without additional samples. Of the 56 remaining lineages, non-transient lineages

are significantly associated with the Hip$^+$ lineage status, while transient lineages are

significantly associated with the Hip$^-$ lineage status (Fig. 5C). Thus, a given patient often has

multiple infecting lineages, but the Hip$^-$ lineages are much more likely to disappear over the

course of infection. In summary, we find that despite variable incidence patterns, a clear

majority of patients are infected by Hip$^+$ lineages, and these lineages have a significant

persistence advantage in comparison to Hip$^-$ lineages over time, suggesting that the Hip

phenotype carries a fitness increase in antibiotic-treated patients.

Hip variants show increased fitness in patient-similar biofilms

Having shown that Hip variants appear at high frequency in *P. aeruginosa* populations

infecting CF airways, and that the Hip phenotype is dissociated from other adapting traits such

as antibiotic resistance, we next asked if Hip variant bacteria are able to survive antibiotic

treatment better than Lop bacteria with similar antibiotic susceptibilities and growth properties.

This fitness test should be carried out in conditions as close as possible to those in which the

Hip variants had been selected. We therefore simulated antibiotic treatment of CF patients in a

recently developed biofilm Pharmacokinetic/Pharmacodynamic system, in which the bacteria

are challenged with antibiotics in much the same way as in patients (24). We chose this model

because *P. aeruginosa* often appears as biofilms in lungs of CF patients (25), because biofilms

have been shown to harbor increased levels of persister cells (26), and because our model

mimics the bacterial exposure to ciprofloxacin treatment as described for CF patients (24, 27).

The isolates were chosen based on the criteria that 1) the respective times of isolation since

their first detection in the CF lungs were similar, 2) they had similar MIC values for

ciprofloxacin, 3) similar growth rates, and 4) belong to the same clone type. Two independent

Hip/Lop pairs were differentially tagged with YFP (Hip) or CFP (Lop). All strains formed

biofilms with comparable biomasses in the flow-cell system (data not shown). Hip and Lop

cells were then mixed 1:1 and allowed to form a biofilm. Representative images of one of the

Hip/Lop biofilms are shown before (Fig. 6A) and after treatment with ciprofloxacin (Fig. 6B).

Figure 6. Fitness comparison of Lop and Hip isolates in biofilm conditions. **(A)** Lop (tagged with CFP) and Hip (tagged with YFP) isolates were cocultured and allowed to form biofilms in a flow-cell model for 72 hours. Mixed biofilms were treated for 24 hours with ciprofloxacin (4 μg/ml). Propidium iodine (PI) was added to visualise dead cells (red). **(B)** Biomass was quantified for each population. Significant differences in biomass following treatment were determined using unpaired t-test (*** p <0.001).

The majority of Lop bacteria were located close to the glass substratum with the Hip population

proliferating at the external surface of the biofilm, facing the liquid flow. The addition of

ciprofloxacin preferentially killed the Lop population leaving the Hip population relatively

unaffected by the antibiotic. COMSTAT analysis confirmed this changed population structure

after ciprofloxacin addition (Fig. 5C). Similar results were observed for the second Hip/Lop

pairing (data not shown). This documentation of a Hip associated fitness increase in an

antibiotic containing environment is all the more striking, as it has been shown previously that

ciprofloxacin treatment of flow-cell biofilms preferentially kills the surface sub-populations of

micro-colonies (28) – yet the Hip cells on the colony surfaces survive much better than the

internal Lop bacteria under treatment with ciprofloxacin.

Discussion

In this communication, we focus our interest on the clinical significance of the persister

phenotype, mapping the prevalence of persisters in a large, aligned cohort of patients under

intensive antibiotic treatment in a 10 year period (17, 27). Of over 450 *P. aeruginosa* isolates

from the airways of 40 young CF patients (75 lineages in total), 26% of the isolates were scored

as Hip using a high-throughput screening approach (Fig. 1). The validity of the screen was

confirmed using traditional persister assays, suggesting our results provide a reliable reflection

of the frequency of occurrence of Hip isolates infecting CF patients (Fig. 2). We show that the

isolates display different levels of persisters, in accordance with the variance of persister levels

previously found between species and within strains (29–31). We have previously shown that

most adaptive changes occur during the first few years of colonization, which matches our

objective of searching for signs of increased fitness of Hip variants in patients treated

continuously with antibiotics (20, 32). Here, we show that in a young CF patient cohort

impacted by early longitudinal colonization by *P. aeruginosa* strains, Hip variants were

sampled from 65% of the patients (N=26) during a 10-year observation window. Our analysis

is a new and important comparative baseline for moving examinations of this clinically

important phenotype towards effective surveillance, impact assessment, and eventual control

in actual clinics.

In the early years of infection since the first detection of *P. aeruginosa*, the Hip phenotype

appeared and disappeared over time (Fig. 5A). However, the number of patients that exhibit

Hip variants increases over time (Fig. 5B), suggesting a selective advantage of this phenotype

during the continuation of antibiotic therapy. In support of this suggestion, the majority of

lineages that showed short-term colonization were made up of only Lop variants, which may

in fact explain why they were unable to establish a persistent infection (Fig. 5C). These in-

patient data support the hypothesis that the Hip phenotype may generally have increased fitness

in the antibiotic containing lung environment. It is, however, very important to note that neither

dominance nor continuous presence of Hip variants is observed very frequently (Fig. 5A). It is

likely that fitness trade-offs and clonal interference impact on the fitness properties and the

persistence level of Hip variants, including other fitness increasing mutations associated with

antibiotics in the lung environment which accumulate in the bacterial populations (13).

Multiple relationships between the Hip phenotype and other phenotypic traits such as growth

rate and antibiotic resistance have been suggested in the literature. Reduced growth rates have

been associated with high persister phenotypes in *E. coli* (23), but other studies point out that

there is no correlation between the mean growth rates of isolates and the observed Hip

phenotype (33–35). In our data, the ratio of Hip to Lop variants increases as traits adapt over

time, and therefore the average growth rate of all Hip variants is reduced versus Lop variants;

however, we did not observe a consistent link between reduced growth rates and Hip phenotype

among the clinical isolates of *P. aeruginosa*. Drug-tolerant cells have also been proposed to

facilitate evolution of true antibiotic resistance in *E. coli in vitro* (36). Intermittent antibiotic

exposure of a batch culture of *E. coli* first selected for mutant clones harboring tolerance mutations that increased the growth lag-time, during which tolerance to killing by ampicillin favored a subsequent selection for mutations that increased the MIC. Though *P. aeruginosa* in the CF lung is also exposed to fluctuating concentrations of antibiotic over the course of infection, we did not observe any obvious contingency in which Hip variants preceed antibiotic-resistant mutants. In contrast, our data suggest that Hip variants and resistant clones evolve independently in patients under antibiotic selection pressure as has been suggested by comparative studies of lab strains (37) and that each of the phenotypes contributes to a continued population survival and hence establishment of long term infection. In general, the results described here suggest that Hip variants arise stochastically in infected patients treated with antibiotics, and that this phenotype is one of several making it possible for the bacteria to persist for extended periods of time. As Hip variants are present in the majority of our young patients by the end of the study period, the persister phenotype may be an early advantageous adaptation in contrast to the adaptive timeline of other traits (20); effective comparisons between stochastic persistence versus more fixed changes such as adjustment of growth rate or antibiotic susceptibility should be pursued in the future.

In many ways, persisters have been investigated in line with previous investigations of antibiotic resistance, which has resulted in a similar parallel search for genetic explanations for large variations in persister levels in bacterial populations treated with antibiotics. In a study of clinical isolates from patients with urinary tract infection, it was shown that a gain-of-function mutation in the HipA toxin is common among *E. coli* Hip isolates (38). The most common mutated genetic target we identified among *P. aeruginosa* Hip in the present study is the RpoN sigma factor. Restoring a functional RpoN in these clinical isolates caused a reduction in persisters, but knocking out this gene in a laboratory strain had no effect. This suggests that the RpoN mutation only confers a persister phenotype in the context of additional mutations acquired by the *P. aeruginosa* Hip strains, underscoring the complexity of evolution occurring in the lungs of CF patients. It is also noteworthy that we do not see the appearance of mutations, which previously have been associated with Hip phenotypes *in vitro*. As the RpoN mutation was present in only 15% of the Hip isolates in our large, longitudinal collection, we conclude that a Hip phenotype may derive from a diverse array of genetic changes, and it is likely that more than one mutation often determines the persister level in the respective bacterial populations. It is possible that this difference reflects the multiple and dynamic selection pressures *in vivo*, which challenge Hip variants in antibiotic-treated populations very

differently from what is the situation in steady state *in vitro* conditions with only one selective

force. Since nearly all published data on persister cells derive from simple *in vitro* experiments,

our results further suggest that extrapolations from such *in vitro* experiments to clinical

scenarios of infection cannot be made.

Many studies have shown the increased survival of persister cells under antibiotic treatment

(23, 39) and leveraged this in screens for genetic determinants of persistence, but few have

evaluated the fitness of Hip versus Lop variants in direct competition experiments. Stepanyan

et al. assessed the fitness tradeoffs of two Hip strains (one hospital strain and one *pilH* mutant)

and two Lop *P. aeruginosa* strains via competitive growth of paired Hip-Lop strains at a 1:1

ratio under periodic treatment with ofloxacin in Mueller-Hinton broth; Hip strains showed

higher fitness under treatment conditions and the reverse in control conditions (29). In our

study, we were able to test genotypically similar isolates from a similar point in infection with

other selected traits in alignment in order to characterize the selective advantage of the Hip

phenotype in a biofilm under clinically-replicating antibiotic exposure (24). In two independent

Lop/Hip strain pairs assessed in a PD/PK flow chamber, we show that Hip cells survived

ciprofloxacin treatment far better than Lop isolates, and we further find that this survival is

potentially reliant on biofilm architecture. While homogeneous monoclonal *P. aeruginosa*

biofilms treated with ciprofloxacin show preferential killing of bacteria in the top layers (13,

28, 40), Lop bacteria are preferentially killed in the deeper layers of the biofilm. This further

supports that the Hip phenotype is associated with increased survival in the presence of

ciprofloxacin under conditions simulating the in-patient environment during antibiotic

treatment. It is a striking observation that the *in vitro* biofilm fitness assessment shows efficient

elimination of the Lop strain in presence of ciprofloxacin, whereas in the patient lungs Hip

variants rarely outcompete Lop strains despite frequent treatments with ciprofloxacin as

indicated by Fig. 3A. This suggests that in the patient, direct competition is limited by the many

separate niches, the influence of the host and the large lung volume, which contrasts the flow-

cell biofilm system. This slow competition explains how fully adapted strains like the DK01

and DK02 strains simultaneously present in a single patient may require many months or even

years to finally outcompete the other (32, 41, 42).

In summary, we have shown that Hip variants of *P. aeruginosa* emerge frequently in younger

CF patients. The Hip phenotype provides a selective advantage for *P. aeruginosa* populations

treated with antibiotics, which may explain how persisters contribute to the establishment of

chronic infection. Ultimately, our results provide the first window into the evolving landscape

of persistence across a whole patient cohort; as pathogens increase their fitness in patients over

time, they clearly deploy the high persister phenotype as an important component in their

survival repertoire and can do so from the earliest stages of infection. It is still premature to

conclude that the high-persister phenotype described here differs from what has been identified

as Hip in *in vitro* experimental conditions, but we find a much broader bacterial repertoire for

survival in antibiotic containing environments than so far anticipated. Hip variants do not seem

to be mutated in genes previously found from *in vitro* experiments to associate with Hip or in

any strongly conserved genetic route. *In vitro*, antibiotic-mediated selection is the only

selective force, whereas, in the patients, antibiotics constitute one among several parallel

selective forces. In support of this concept, Hip variants emerge alongside other beneficial trait

adaptations but association with any single trait is inconsistent. We suggest that the difference

in selection pressure when comparing *in vitro* and *in vivo* environmental conditions including

antibiotics results in highly different evolutionary trajectories. With our investigation, we

provide an important platform for broader clinically based studies and contribute important

new context for monitoring and one day hopefully preventing the high persister phenotype in

the clinic.

Materials and Methods

Strain collection. In total, we analyzed 467 *P. aeruginosa* airway isolates from young CF

patients followed at the Copenhagen CF-clinic after excluding twenty-six isolates that had

acquired mutS and/or mutL mutations resulting in hypermutability. Of these 467 isolates, 388

isolates from 34 patients were described previously in Marvig et. al. (17) and the remaining

isolates were taken from six previously undescribed patients. The isolates were collected and

stored at the Department of Clinical Microbiology at Rigshospitalet, Copenhagen, Denmark,

between 2002 and 2014. Of the patients included in this study, 35% were diagnosed as

chronically infected with *P. aeruginosa* by the end of the study period. We defined chronicity

based on the Copenhagen CF Centre definition, whereby either *P. aeruginosa* has been

detected in six consecutive monthly sputum samples or fewer consecutive sputum samples

combined with observation of two or more *P. aeruginosa*-specific precipitating antibodies (27,

43). Intermittently colonized patients were defined as patients where at least one isolate of *P.*

aeruginosa is detected, and normal levels of precipitating antibiotics against *P. aeruginosa*

were observed. Phenotyping data for 407 isolates of this strain collection (growth rate in LB,

adhesion in LB, and ciprofloxacin MIC) have been previously published (20). We include trait

measurements for 60 additional isolates from the same phenotypic screens conducted as

described below, and all available trait data is provided in Supplementary Dataset 1 along with

the persister classification of each isolate and descriptive data such as patient origin, genotype,

date of sampling, and SRA number.

Minimum Inhibitory Concentrations (MIC) for ciprofloxacin and tobramycin were determined

using E-test methodology according to the manufacturer's recommendations (Liofilchem®,

Italy).

Generation times. Bacteria were grown overnight in LB, diluted to an OD of 0.05 in 96 well

plates containing 150 uL of LB medium, and incubated for 20 hours at 37°C with constant

shaking. OD 630 nm measurements were taken every 20 minutes using a microplate reader

(Holm & Halby, Copenhagen, Denmark/Synergy H1). Generation times (Td) were determined

on the best-fit line of a minimum of 3 points during exponential growth of the bacterial isolate.

Growth rates (hr^{-1}) were calculated using the formula log (2)/ Td x 60.

Adhesion. Adhesion was measured via attachment assays in 96-well plates using NUNC peg

lids and 96 well plates with 150µl Luria broth medium. OD_{600nm} was measured after incubation

for 20 hours at 37°C and subsequently, a "washing microtiter plate" with 180µl PBS was used

to wash the peg lids and remove non-adhering cells. After transfer of the peg lids to a microtiter

plate containing 160µl 0.01% crystal violet (CV), they were left to stain for 15 min. To remove

unbound crystal violet, the lids were then washed again three times in three individual

"washing microtiter plates" with 180µl PBS. Adhesion was measured by detaching adhering

CV stained cells through washing the peg lids in a microtiter plate containing 180µl 99%

ethanol. An ELISA reader was then used to measure the CV density at OD_{590nm}. (Microtiter

plates were bought at Fisher Scientific, NUNC Cat no. 167008, peg lids cat no. 445497).

High-throughput screening for Hip mutants. To determine the frequency at which *P.*

aeruginosa Hip mutants emerge in CF patients, we screened 467 isolates for ciprofloxacin

tolerance. Stock 96-well microtiter plates containing 4 technical replicates of each isolate

stored in glycerol (25 % v/v) were prepared and stored at -80°C. Using a 96-well spot

replicator, bacteria were transferred from the stock plates into sterile 96-well microtiter plates

containing 150 µl of Lysogeny Broth (LB) media. Plates were incubated statically for 48 hours

at 37°C until the bacteria reached the stationary phase of growth. To determine the initial

viability of bacteria in each well, the replicator was used to spot bacteria onto LB agar plates.

Subsequently, 100 µg/ml of ciprofloxacin was added to each well and the microtiter plates were

incubated statically for a further 20-24 hours at 37°C. Serial dilutions were performed in 96

well microtiter plates containing 0.9 % NaCl using an automated fluid handling robot

(Viaflo3844/ Integra Biosciences AG). Each dilution was spotted onto LB agar plates using

the replicator and plates were incubated at 37°C for at least 24 hours. The growth of the bacteria

was compared by counting colonies whenever possible and visually inspecting growth on the

plates before and after antibiotic treatment. The experiment was performed in duplicate.

Persister assay validation. Persister assays were performed on 23 isolates to validate the high

throughput persister screen. *P. aeruginosa* were inoculated in 3 ml of LB media in 10 ml tubes

and incubated for 48 hours at 37°C with shaking at 250 rpm. Following incubation, each culture

was serially diluted using sterile 0.9 % NaCl, plated onto LB agar and incubated at 37°C to

determine the initial colony forming units (CFU). The remaining culture was treated with 100

µg/ml of ciprofloxacin and incubated for a further 24 hours at 37°C with shaking. Following

treatment, cells were washed and diluted in sterile 0.9 % NaCl, spot plated onto LB agar and

incubated for 24 hours at 37°C. Bacteria survival was measured by counting (CFU) per ml.

Pharmacokinetic/Pharmacodynamic (PK/PD) flow chamber biofilm model. For fitness

experiments, we used a PK/PD biofilm model system combined with confocal laser-scanning

microscopy. This system simulates the changing antibiotic concentrations in CF patients during

intravenous dosing in addition to retaining a similar profile of antibiotic decay as the one taking

place in CF patients (24). First, Hip and Lop isolates were differentially tagged with a yellow

fluorescent protein (YFP) or cyan fluorescent protein (CFP) respectively (13). Flow chambers

were inoculated with a 1:1 mixture of Hip and Lop bacteria (each isolate had an initial OD_{600}

of 0.5). Bacteria were incubated for one hour at 30 °C, then nutrient flow was applied to each

chamber (40x diluted LB at a rate of 20 ml/h using a Watson Marlow 205S peristaltic pump).

Biofilms were allowed to form for 72 hours, at which point flow was stopped and medium

containing ciprofloxacin was added. Peak ciprofloxacin concentrations were calculated to be 4

mg/L based on PK parameters generated from healthy patients and CF patients (44). The

medium was pumped from the dilution flask through the antibiotic flask to the flow chambers

at a constant rate calculated to mimic the elimination rate constant of the antibiotic for 24 hrs.

A confocal laser-scanning microscope (Zeiss LSM 510) equipped with an argon/krypton laser

and detectors was used to monitor YFP (excitation 514 nm, emission 530 nm), CFP (excitation

458 nm, emission 490 nm), and dead cells (propidium iodine, excitation 543 nm, emission 565

nm). Multichannel simulated fluorescent projections (SFPs) and sections through the biofilms

were generated using Imaris software (Bitplane AG, Switzerland). The images were later

analyzed using COMSTAT (45). The PK/PD biofilm experiments were performed using two

independent Hip/Lop isolate pairs. Pairs were taken from the same patient at a similar time

since first detection and had similar growth rates and ciprofloxacin MICs (Table S2). The data

presented are from 2 biological experiments with 4 independent images taken from each

experiment.

Lineage-based genetic analysis. To generate a list of mutated genes associated with the Hip

phenotype, we used previously generated whole-genome sequencing data and variant calling

filtered to obtain nonsynonymous mutations that had accumulated within a lineage after the

first isolate (17) to evaluate differential mutation patterns for Lop and Hip variants for 388

sequenced isolates. To identify genes that were mutated more than would have been expected

by drift/random mutation while accounting for lineage-based mutation accumulation over time,

we adapted a statistical analysis of the relative mutation enrichment by lineage. After

separating Lop and Hip variants, we compared the mutated-gene lineage enrichment ratios for

each group - the number of lineages with observed mutation(s) in a given gene divided by the

number of lineages expected to have mutations in that gene according to random mutation.

This enrichment metric was obtained as follows for each group: we determined the observed

number of lineages mutated (sum-obs) in each gene. Then we estimated the average number of

lineages (avg-exp) that would have been mutated in each gene if mutations were spread out

randomly over the PAO1 genome. Using a random-roulette algorithm, the number of genes

that were observed to be mutated in a given lineage was spread out over the PAO1 genome for

1000 iterations, providing a m_{gene} by $n_{iteration}$ matrix of randomly mutated gene profiles for each

lineage. For the same iteration n across all lineages, it was noted whether a given gene was

mutated. This allowed us to determine an average number of lineages expected to be mutated

over 1000 iterations. If a gene was hit by chance more than once in a single iteration, this would

still only be denoted as one hit; this is in alignment with our observed mutation assessment,

where multiple isolates could be hit in the same gene but we only noted whether or not the

lineage was hit by unique mutations in the specific gene. After obtaining the relative

enrichment by lineage, a Poisson distribution was used to calculate the probability of the
observed given random drift (expected). We also divided the lineage enrichment metric for
genes mutated in Hip variants by that for Lop variants to obtain a lineage enrichment ratio to
identify targeted genes particularly impactful in the evolution of the Hip population.

Lineage set analysis and principle component analysis. Analyses were conducted in RStudio
v. 1.0.143 and R v. 3.4.0. Lineage set analysis was performed using UpSetR v. 1.3.3 in R.
Principal component analysis was performed in R using 'prcomp' with centered and scaled
phenotype data (Supplementary Dataset 1).

Genetic manipulation. We selected two Hip variants and one Lop variant with mutations in
rpoN for validation of a *rpoN*-associated Hip phenotype. Each of the *rpoN* Hip variants had a
single nucleotide deletion (T, nucleotide position 4993951 on PAO1 reference genome), which
resulted in a frameshift following the 360th amino acid (aa) and premature truncation of the
protein resulting in a 381aa polypeptide (RpoN has 497aa in the PAO1 reference genome). The
Lop isolate had a single nucleotide polymorphism (C→T at nucleotide 112) producing a
premature stop codon at the 38th aa. An *rpoN* expression plasmid was constructed for gene
complementation experiments. The *rpoN* gene from PAO1 was PCR amplified using primers
rpoN forward (5' GAATTCATGAAACCATCGCTAGTCCTC 3') and *rpoN* reverse
(5'AAGCTTTCACACCAGTCGCTTGCGCTC 3'). The product was cloned into pHERD28T
(46), using EcoRI and HindIII restriction sites and the resulting plasmid (p*rpoN*) was used to
transform *E. coli* OneShot Top10 (Thermo Fisher Scientific). The presence of the plasmid was
verified by PCR and DNA sequencing then introduced into selected clinical *P. aeruginosa*
isolates using biparental conjugation. Trimethoprim (TMP, 300 μg/ml) was used for selection
and arabinose (0.02 %) was used for *rpoN* induction. Each isolate was transformed with empty
pHERD28T and isolates with and without arabinose induction were included as controls.

Acknowledgments
This work was supported by Cystic Fibrosis Foundation Pilot and Feasibility Award to KL.
HKJ was supported by The Novo Nordisk Foundation as a clinical research stipend
(NNF12OC1015920), by Rigshospitalets Rammebevilling 2015-17 (R88-A3537), by
Lundbeckfonden (R167-2013-15229), by Novo Nordisk Fonden (NNF15OC0017444) by
RegionH Rammebevilling (R144-A5287) and by Independent Research Fund Denmark (DFF-

4183-00051). JAB was supported by postdoctoral fellowships from the Whitaker Foundation and the Cystic Fibrosis Foundation. We would like to thank Marilena Falcone, Ph.D. for supplying pHERD28T and technical guidance related to cloning.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Author Contributions

SM and KL designed the study. HKJ collected all the bacterial isolates. BM, DRC, and JH performed all experiments. JAB and LMS performed genetic and lineage analysis. All authors contributed to the writing of the manuscript. All authors approved the final version.

Ethics approval

The local ethics committee at the Capital Region of Denmark (Region Hovedstaden) approved the use of the stored *P. aeruginosa* isolates: registration number H-4-2015-FSP.

Supplementary information

Table S1. Comparison of persister genes identified in previous *P. aeruginosa* studies to mutated genes highlighted by our lineage analysis.

Table S2. Characteristics of Hip/Lop pairs analyzed using the PK/PD biofilm model.

Supplementary Dataset 1. Phenotypic dataset for all isolates.

References

1. Bigger JW (1944) Treatment of staphylococcal infections with penicillin. *Lancet* 2(6320):497–500.

2. Wood TK, Knabel SJ, Kwan BW (2013) Bacterial persister cell formation and dormancy. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 79(23):7116–7121.

3. Rowe SE, Conlon BP, Keren I, Lewis K (2016) Persisters: Methods for Isolation and Identifying Contributing Factors—A Review. *Methods Mol Biol* 1333:17–28.

4. Lewis K (2010) Persister Cells. *Annu Rev Microbiol*. doi:10.1146/annurev.micro.112408.134306.

5. LaFleur MD, Qi Q, Lewis K (2010) Patients with long-term oral carriage harbor high-persister mutants of Candida albicans. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 54(1):39–44.

6. Mulcahy LR, Burns JL, Lory S, Lewis K (2010) Emergence of Pseudomonas aeruginosa strains producing high levels of persister cells in patients with cystic fibrosis. *J Bacteriol*

192(23):6191–9.

7.   Salsgiver EL, et al. (2016) Changing Epidemiology of the Respiratory Bacteriology of Patients
With Cystic Fibrosis. *Chest* 149(2):390–400.

8.   Parkins MD, Somayaji R, Waters VJ (2018) Epidemiology, Biology, and Impact of Clonal
Pseudomonas aeruginosa Infections in Cystic Fibrosis. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 31(4):1–38.

9.   Dalemans W, et al. (1991) Altered chloride ion channel kinetics associated with the ΔF508
cystic fibrosis mutation. *Nature* 354(6354):526–528.

10.   Boucher RC (2007) Cystic fibrosis: a disease of vulnerability to airway surface dehydration.
Trends Mol Med 13(6):231–240.

11.   Folkesson A, et al. (2012) Adaptation of Pseudomonas aeruginosa to the cystic fibrosis airway:
an evolutionary perspective. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 10(12):841–51.

12.   Gibson RL, Burns JL, Ramsey BW (2003) Pathophysiology and management of pulmonary
infections in cystic fibrosis. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 168(8):918–951.

13.   Frimodt-Møller J, et al. (2018) Mutations causing low level antibiotic resistance ensure
bacterial survival in antibiotic-treated hosts. *Sci Rep* 8(1):1–13.

14.   Burns JL, et al. (1999) Effect of Chronic Intermittent Administration of Inhaled Tobramycin
on Respiratory Microbial Flora in Patients with Cystic Fibrosis. *J Infect Dis* 179(5):1190–
1196.

15.   van Gestel J, Vlamakis H, Kolter R (2015) Division of labor in biofilms: the ecology of cell
differentiation. *Microbiol Spectr* 3(2):1–24.

16.   Moyed HS, Bertrand KP (1983) hipA, a newly recognized gene of Escherichia coli K-12 that
affects frequency of persistence after inhibition of murein synthesis. *J Bacteriol* 155(2):768–
75.

17.   Marvig RL, Sommer LM, Molin S, Johansen HK (2015) Convergent evolution and adaptation
of Pseudomonas aeruginosa within patients with cystic fibrosis. *Nat Genet* 47(1):57–64.

18.   Eliopoulos GM, Gardella A, Moellering RC (1984) In vitro activity of ciprofloxacin, a new
carboxyquinoline antimicrobial agent. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 25(3):331–335.

19.   Su HC, et al. (2010) The development of ciprofloxacin resistance in Pseudomonas aeruginosa
involves multiple response stages and multiple proteins. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother*
54(11):4626–4635.

20.   Bartell JA, et al. (2019) Evolutionary highways to persistent bacterial infection. *Nat Commun*
10(1):629.

21.   La Rosa R, Johansen HK, Molin S (2018) Convergent Metabolic Specialization through
Distinct Evolutionary Paths in Pseudomonas aeruginosa. *MBio* 9(2):e00269-18.

22.   Winstanley C, O'Brien S, Brockhurst MA (2016) Pseudomonas aeruginosa Evolutionary
Adaptation and Diversification in Cystic Fibrosis Chronic Lung Infections. *Trends Microbiol*
24(5):327–337.

23.   Balaban NQ, Merrin J, Chait R, Kowalik L, Leibler S (2004) Bacterial persistence as a
phenotypic switch. *Science (80-)* 305(5690):1622–1625.

24.   Haagensen JAJ, Verotta D, Huang L, Spormann A, Yang K (2015) New in vitro model to

study the effect of human simulated antibiotic concentrations on bacterial biofilms. *Antimicrob*
Agents Chemother 59(7):4074–4081.

25. Singh PK, et al. (2000) Quorum-sensing signals indicate that cystic fibrosis lungs are infected
with bacterial biofilms. *Nature* 407:762–764.

26. Spoering AL, Lewis K (2001) Biofilms and planktonic cells of Pseudomonas aeruginosa have
similar resistance to killing by antimicrobials. *J Bacteriol* 183(23):6746–6751.

27. Johansen HK, et al. (2004) Antibody response to Pseudomonas aeruginosa in cystic fibrosis
patients: a marker of therapeutic success? - A 30-year cohort study of survival in Danish CF
patients after onset of chronic P. aeruginosa lung infection. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 37(5):427–432.

28. Pamp SJ, Gjermansen M, Johansen HK, Tolker-Nielsen T (2008) Tolerance to the
antimicrobial peptide colistin in Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms is linked to metabolically
active cells, and depends on the pmr and mexAB-oprM genes. *Mol Microbiol* 68(1):223–240.

29. Stepanyan K, et al. (2015) Fitness trade-offs explain low levels of persister cells in the
opportunistic pathogen Pseudomonas aeruginosa. *Mol Ecol* 24(7):1572–1583.

30. Stewart B, Rozen DE (2011) Genetic variation for antibiotic persistence in Escherichia coli.
Evolution (N Y) 66(3):933–939.

31. Bink A, et al. (2011) Superoxide dismutases are involved in Candida albicans biofilm
persistence against miconazole. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 55(9):4033–4037.

32. Yang L, et al. (2011) Evolutionary dynamics of bacteria in a human host environment. *Proc*
Natl Acad Sci 108(18):7481–7486.

33. Fung DKC, Chan EWC, Chin ML, Chan RCY (2010) Delineation of a bacterial starvation
stress response network which can mediate antibiotic tolerance development. *Antimicrob*
Agents Chemother 54(3):1082–1093.

34. Keren I, Minami S, Rubin E, Lewis K (2011) Characterization and transcriptome analysis of
Mycobacterium tuberculosis persisters. *MBio* 2(3):3–12.

35. Wakamoto Y, et al. (2013) Dynamic persistence of antibiotic-stressed Mycobacteria. *Science*
(80-) 339(6115):91–95.

36. Levin-Reisman I, et al. (2017) Antibiotic tolerance facilitates the evolution of resistance.
Science (80-) 355(6327):826–830.

37. Vogwill T, Comfort AC, Furió V, MacLean RC (2016) Persistence and resistance as
complementary bacterial adaptations to antibiotics. *J Evol Biol* 29(6):1223–1233.

38. Schumacher MA, et al. (2015) HipBA-promoter structures reveal the basis of heritable
multidrug tolerance. *Nature* 524(7563):59–66.

39. Spoering AL, Vulić M, Lewis K (2006) GlpD and PlsB participate in persister cell formation
in Escherichia coli. *J Bacteriol* 188(14):5136–5144.

40. Haagensen JAJ, et al. (2007) Differentiation and distribution of colistin- and sodium dodecyl
sulfate-tolerant cells in Pseudomonas aeruginosa biofilms. *J Bacteriol* 189(1):28–37.

41. Markussen T, et al. (2014) Environmental Heterogeneity Drives Within-Host Diversification
and Evolution of Pseudomonas aeruginosa. 5(5):1–10.

42. Marvig RL, Johansen HK, Molin S, Jelsbak L (2013) Genome Analysis of a Transmissible

Lineage of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Reveals Pathoadaptive Mutations and Distinct
Evolutionary Paths of Hypermutators. *PLoS Genet* 9(9):e1003741.

43.   Høiby N, et al. (1977) Pseudomonas aeruginosa infection in cystic fibrosis - Diagnostic and
prognostic significance of Pseudomonas aeruginosa precipitins determined by means of
crossed immunoelectrophoresis. *Scand J Respir Dis* 58(2):65–79.

44.   Touw DJ, Knox AJ, Smyth A (2007) Population pharmacokinetics of tobramycin administered
thrice daily and once daily in children and adults with cystic fibrosis. *J Cyst Fibros* 6(5):327–
333.

45.   Heydorn A, et al. (2002) Statistical Analysis of Pseudomonas aeruginosa Biofilm
Development: Impact of Mutations in Genes Involved in Twitching Motility, Cell-to-Cell
Signaling, and Stationary-Phase Sigma Factor Expression. *Appl Environ Microbiol*
68(4):2008–2017.

46.   Qiu D, Damron FH, Mima T, Schweizer HP, Yu HD (2008) PBAD-based shuttle vectors for
functional analysis of toxic and highly regulated genes in Pseudomonas and Burkholderia spp.
and other bacteria. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 74(23):7422–6.