Infection of *Plasmodiophora brassicae* changes the fungal endophyte community of tumourous

stem mustard roots as revealed by high-throughput sequencing and culture-dependent methods

Xueliang Tian [1], Diandong Wang [2*], Zhenchuan Mao [3], Limei Pan [2], Jingjing Liao [2], Zhaoming Cai [2]

Xueliang Tian

[1]Henan institute of science and technology, Xinxiang, Henan China

e-mail: tianxueliang1978@163.com

Corresponding author: Diandong Wang

[2]Yangtze normal university, Fuling, Chongqing, China

e-mail: ddwangwill@163.com

Zhenchuan Mao

[3]Institute of Vegetable and Flowers, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences, Beijing, China

e-mail:maozhenchuancaas@163.com

Limei Pan

[2]Yangtze normal university, Fuling, Chongqing, China

e-mail:good2094@yeah.net

Jingjing Liao

[2]Yangtze normal university, Fuling, Chongqing, China

e-mail:691048257@qq.com

Zhaoming Cai

[2]Yangtze normal university, Fuling, Chongqing, China

e-mail:65293749@qq.com

Abstract

Diverse fungal endophytes live in plants and are shaped by some abiotic and biotic stresses. Plant

disease as particular biotic stress possibly gives an impact on the communities of fungal endophytes. In

this study, clubroot disease caused by an obligate biotroph protist, *Plasmodiophora brassicae*, was

considered to analyze its influence on the fungal endophyte community using an internal transcribed

spacer (ITS) through high-throughput sequencing and culture-dependent methods. The results show

that the diversity of the endophyte community in the healthy roots was much higher than the clubroots.

Ascomycota was the dominant group of endophytes (including *Phoma*, *Mortierella*, *Penicillium*, etc.)

in the healthy roots while *P. brassicae* was the dominant taxon in the clubroots. Hierarchical clustering,

principal component analysis (PCA) and principal coordinates analysis (PCoA) indicated significant

differences between the endophyte communities in the healthy roots and clubroots. Linear discriminant

analysis effect size (LefSe) analysis showed that the dominant genera could be regarded as potential

biomarkers. The endophyte community in the healthy roots had a more complex network compared

with the clubroots. Also, many plant pathogenic *Fusarium* were isolated from the clubroots by the

culture-dependent method. The outcome of this study illustrates that *P. brassicae* infection may change

the fungal endophyte community associated with the roots of tumourous stem mustard and facilitates

the entry of soil pathogen into the roots.

Introduction

Fungal endophytes have a close relationship with the host plants and they live in their tissues [1,2].

They provide many ecological and physiological advantages to their hosts, such as growth promotion

[3], resistance to plant pathogens and adaptability to various abiotic stresses such as temperature, pH,

and osmotic pressure as well as biotic stresses [4-6]. Similarly, the fungal endophyte communities are

also affected by abiotic and biotic stresses [7]. Plant disease as particular biotic stress results in

significant changes in the physiology of the plant. These changes and pathogen itself may affect the

diversity and composition of the fungal endophyte inhabiting the plant tissues and their interactions

with their host plant [8-10].

Clubroot is a severe disease of cruciferous crops such as cabbage and cauliflower, which is caused

by the biotrophic *Plasmodiophora brassicae* Woronin [11]. The infected root cells undergo abnormal

cell division and enlargement resulting in the formation of spindle-like, spherical, knobby or

club-shaped swellings [12]. The root galls significantly alter the morphology, development, and

physiology of the diseased plants [13]. Moreover, *P. brassicae* consumes carbohydrates from the viable

cells in gall, and make gall into a sink for nutrient substances [14,15].

Tumourous stem mustard (*Brassica juncea* var. *tumida*) is an economical and nutritionally

important vegetable crop widely grown in Fuling County, a district in Chongqing Municipality, China.

Clubroot is one of the most harmful diseases of tumourous stem mustard causing substantial economic

damage [16]. The diseased tumourous stem mustard shows small plants and swollen roots and finally

dies due to root rot during the late plant growth stage in the field, although *P. brassicae* is an obligate

parasite. Moreover, many pathogenic fungi such as *Fusarium* sp. are isolated from the clubroots, which

indicates that the community of fungal endophyte may change during the infection of *P. brassicae*.

However, the specific alteration in the community of fungal endophyte is still unclear.

In this context, the objectives of this study are, (1) to examine the diversity and composition of the

fungal endophyte community in the roots of tumourous stem mustard (2) to demonstrate the changes in

the community of fungal endophyte in the clubroots of tumourous stem mustard caused by *P. brassicae*

compared to healthy roots .

Materials and methods

Sample collection

P. brassicae-infected tumourous stem mustard roots were obtained from three fields (February 2, 2017)

in Fuling (29.21° N, 106.56° E) where clubroot disease was observed during the last 20 years. Roots

were collected from the plants at the harvest-stage. The roots were classified as either R (healthy roots,

no clubroot symptoms) or C (diseased roots, swollen clubroot symptoms). From one field, 30 plants

including 15 R and 15 C samples were randomly selected and formed as one group. By this, three

groups contained 90 plants from three fields and were referred to R1, C1, R2, C2, R3, and C3. The

roots were washed with tap water to remove the soil particles. The healthy roots with a diameter of 0.5

cm from undiseased plants and clubroot galls with a diameter of 1 cm from diseased plants were cut off,

and then sterilized by 70 % (v/v) ethanol for 40 s, followed by 4 % (w/v) sodium hypochlorite for 60 s,

and finally washed three times using sterile distilled water. The surface sterilized healthy roots and

galls peeled with a sterilized razor were divided into three portions. One portion was used to extract

genomic DNA by cetyltrimethylammonium ammonium bromide (CTAB) DNA extraction method. The

concentration and purity of DNA were monitored on 1% agarose gel. One portion was made into

paraffin section, dyed with sarranine and observed under an optical microscope. Another portion was

used to isolate endophytic fungi by the culture-dependent method.

Isolation of endophytic fungi and its taxonomic identification

Three types of media, i.e. potato dextrose agar (BD Difco), rose bengal medium (BD Difco), and

Czapek medium (BD Difco) were used for the isolation of endophytic fungi. The surface sterilized

healthy roots, or clubroot samples were cut into tissue blocks of 5 mm x 5 mm, and were planted on a

medium at 25 ∘C in the dark. When mycelia appeared, they were transferred into another medium for

purification. A total of 156 fungal isolates were then identified based on the ITS sequence data.

Mycelia of the fungal isolates were ground with liquid nitrogen in a sterile mortar, and Genomic DNA

from all the fungal isolates was extracted using DNA extraction kit (TIANGEN Co. Ltd., Beijing, PR

China). The internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region was amplified with universal primers (ITS1 and

ITS4) [17]. PCR mixture contained 12 μL of 2× Taq PCR Mix (TIANGEN Co. Ltd., Beijing, PR

China), 1 μL DNA template, 1 μL of each primer and 8 μL double distilled water. The PCR reaction

conditions were as follows: initial pre-heating at 94 ∘C for 3 min, 30 cycles of 94 ∘C for 30 s, 58 ∘C for

30 s, 72 ∘C for 30 s, and a final extension at 72 ∘C for 10 min. PCR products were sequenced by 3730

sequencer (Majorbio Tech Co. Ltd., Beijing, PR China). The ITS sequence was aligned in the NCBI

database (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) using the BLAST program. The highest hits (identity values

higher than 97%) were regarded as the taxonomy of fungal isolates. The relative abundances were

calculated according to the taxonomy of fungal isolates.

High-throughput ITS Sequencing

ITS fragments were used as marker genes for high-throughput sequencing, and the primers of ITS

fragments target most fungal groups, as well as other eukaryotes. The ITS fragments were amplified by

PCR for barcoded pyrosequencing using the primers ITS1 and TS2 [18]. The employed PCR

conditions were: 95 °C for 2 min (one cycle), 95 °C for 30 s, 55 °C for 30 s, and 72 °C for 30 s (25

cycles), and 72 °C for 5 min (one cycle). The sequencing was performed using an Illumina MiSeq

sequencer (Asbios Technology Co., Ltd, China).

Processing of Bioinformatics and Data Analysis

For diversity analyses, the bioinformatics analysis pipeline was conducted on the free online platform,

Majorbio I–Sanger Cloud Platform (http://www.i-sanger.com). First, the raw sequences were processed

using the QIIME package (v1.8) [19]. The low-quality sequences, such as primer and barcode sequence

mismatch, and PCR-based or sequencing errors and chimeras, were removed. The taxonomy of each

operational taxonomic unit (OTU) representative sequence was performed using Unite (Release 7.2)

and ITS of *P. brassicae* under the threshold of 97% identity [20,21]. The Shannon index, Simpson

index, and rarefaction curves were calculated to evaluate the α-diversity. Relative abundance of

endophyte was calculated at phylum, genus and OTU levels. Analysis of variance (ANOVA) of the

Shannon and Simpson indices was obtained by SPSS 16.0 and the relative abundance was used to

assess the differences in the endophyte communities between the healthy roots and clubroots. For the

evaluation of β-diversity, hierarchical cluster dendrograms (Bray-Curtis distance dissimilarities) were

constructed according to the composition of OTU [22]. An unweighted UniFrac principal component

analysis (PCA) and Principal coordinates analysis (PCoA) were performed using R 3.1.1 statistical

software [23]. The differentially abundant genera between the healthy roots and clubroots were

identified for finding the biomarker by Discriminant Analysis Effect Size (LEfSe) software [24].

Co-occurrence network analysis was conducted to reveal the relationship among the top 30 OTUs

within the endophyte communities by Networkx software [25]. Pearson's rank correlation coefficients

between OTUs were calculated, and only the correlations with r > 0.5 were selected to construct the

network.

Results

Symptoms of Clubroot and Detection of *P. brassicae*

Healthy roots were not swollen, and the lateral roots appeared normal, whereas clubroots were swollen

and few lateral roots were observed (Fig. 1A). Abundant resting spores were found to be in the cells of

clubroots (Fig. 1B), but no resting spores were observed in the healthy roots (Fig. 1C).

Analysis of α-diversity

High-quality sequences of ITS were produced by the Miseq platform. The raw sequencing data for ITS

sequencing were deposited at the Sequence Read Archive (SRA, https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/sra)

under an accession number, SRP136514. The statistical formation of the sequences is shown in Table

S1. According to the taxonomy of the sequence and abundance (Table S2), the composition of the

endophyte communities was analyzed. Rarefaction curves analysis confirmed that the number of

observed OTUs increased asymptotically with an increase in the reads (Fig. 2A). Both a higher

Shannon index and Simpson index of the endophyte community were observed in the healthy roots

than that in the clubroots (Fig. 2B), suggesting a higher diversity of the endophyte community in the

healthy roots.

Ascomycota was the dominant taxon (a relative abundance ranging from 76.3 to 78.5%) of the

endophyte community in the healthy roots followed by Zygomycota (RA, 15.5 to 19.9%), while

Cercozoa (RA, 92.0 to 94.3%) was the most dominant taxon of the endophyte community in the

clubroots followed by Ascomycota (RA, 5.6 to 7.6%) (Fig. 3A). The abundance of Basidiomycota and

unclassified endophytic fungi was higher in the healthy roots compared to clubroots.

At the genus level, a total of 40 and 27 genera were detected in the healthy roots and clubroots,

respectively. In the healthy roots, *Phoma* was the dominant genus with an RA of 19.15%, followed by

Mortierella (17.09%), *Penicillium* (11.49%), *Pseudallescheria* (10.75%), *Tetracladium* (9.98%), and

Fusarium (7.88%) (Fig. 3B). In the clubroots, *Plasmodiophora* was the dominant taxon (93.28 %)

followed by *Fusarium* (5.52 %) (Fig. 3B). Circos figure confirmed that *Plasmodiophora* was the most

abundant and was found only in the clubroots, whereas *Phoma*, *Mortierella*, and *Penicillium* were

predominant in the healthy roots (Fig. 3C).

A total of 66 and 40 OTUs were observed in the healthy roots and clubroots, respectively. Heatmap

showed that OTU268 was dominant in the endophyte community associated with clubroots, whereas

OTU106, OTU153, OTU192, OTU197, OTU114, OTU126, and OTU185 dominated the healthy roots

(Fig, S1).

Analysis of β-diversity

Hierarchical clustering analysis based on Bray-Curtis distance dissimilarities revealed that the

endophyte communities in the healthy roots and clubroots clustered in the two branches (Fig. 4A).

UniFrac-weighted PCA based on the composition of OTU showed variations between the healthy roots

and clubroots with the first two axes indicating 81.08 and 11.71 % of the total variation (Fig. 4B).

PCoA plot also clearly demonstrated similar results of PCA with the first two axes showing 99.34 and

0.62% of the total variation (Fig. 4C). The endophyte community in the healthy roots was clustered on

the right side of the PCA and PCoA plot while the endophyte community in the clubroots was clustered

on the left side, indicating a clear separation between the endophyte community in R and C samples.

From the results of LEfSe, a significantly different taxa were found out between the two

communities. At the genus level, *Phoma*, *Mortierella*, *Penicillium*, unclassified Pleosporales, etc. were

enriched in the healthy root samples (Fig. 5A) and abundant *Plasmodiophora* in the clubroot samples

possessed high values of linear discriminant analysis (LDA) (Fig. 5B). These taxa with different

abundance can be regarded as potential biomarkers (LDA>3, P<0.05). Furthermore, 15 most abundant

genera of the two endophyte communities were compared by Student's t-test, where significant

differences were observed (Fig. S2). For instance, *Plasmodiophora* was significantly more abundant in

the clubroots while all other genera except *Fusarium* were significantly more abundant in the healthy

roots.

Network Analysis

The endophyte community in the healthy roots had two centers with a complex network structure (28

nodes and 336 edges) (Fig. 6A) while the endophyte community in the clubroots had three centers with

a less complex network structure (18 nodes and 161edges) (Fig. 6B). Most of the nodes belong to

Ascomycota in both the healthy roots and clubroots networks and had the highest number of

correlations with other taxa. The node of the Cercozoa (i.e., *Plasmodiophora*) only appeared in the

clubroot network and had the highest percentage. When the relationship between *Plasmodiophora* and

other fungi was analyzed, it was found that 10 OTUs had a significant correlation with

Plasmodiophora (3 OTUs had a positive correlation, and 7 OTUs had negative correlation) (Table S3).

Culturable endophytic fungi

The same samples for Miseq sequencing were also used to isolate endophytic fungi by the

culture-dependent method. At the genus level, *Mortierella*, *Sarocladium*, *Phoma*, *Penicillium*,

Plectosphaerella, and *Fusarium* were obtained (Fig. 7A). *Fusarium* (a relative abundance of 81.4%)

was the predominant group in the clubroots, among which the following were present: *F. graminearum*

(RA, 5.5 %), *F. oxysporum*   (RA, 28.8 %), *F. solani*   (RA, 24.0 %), *F. asiaticum*   (RA, 8.2 %),

and *Fusarium* sp.   (RA 14.4 %). In the healthy roots, *Mortierella* was the main group with an RA of

36.2% followed by *Phoma*, *Penicillium*, *Fusarium,* etc. (Fig. 7B).

Discussion

In this study, a high diversity of fungal endophyte in the healthy roots of tumourous stem mustard

has been found out using high-throughput sequencing. Our results agree with the early reports that the

plants can harbor a diversity of endophytic fungi in their healthy tissues, especially in the root system

which is considered to be the most suitable habitat for endophytic fungi [26,27]. Ascomycota is

reported to be the most common group of endophytic fungi [28], suggesting that they are suitable for

the ecological niche of plant tissue. Zhao also reported Ascomycota as the dominant group of

endophytic fungi in the roots of oilseed rape (*Brassica napus*) [29]. Also in this study, Ascomycota has

been found to be the dominant taxon in the healthy roots of tumourous stem mustard. In the phylum

Ascomycota, *Phoma*, *Mortierella*, *Penicillium,* and *Fusarium* were the common fungal genera in the

healthy roots of tumourous stem mustard. Arie et al. reported that *Phoma glomerata* produces

epoxydon and inhibits clubroot disease, demonstrating that *Phoma* in the healthy roots of tumourous

stem mustard may perform a similar function [30,31]. *Mortierella* was also detected in the roots of

oilseed rape using high-throughput sequencing [29]. Melo et al. confirmed that the endophytic *M.*

alpina in the moss Schistidium antarctici produces antibiotics, antioxidant substances, and

polyunsaturated fatty acids, which improve the environmental suitability of the plant host [32]. Wani et

al. also found that endophytic *M. alpina* promotes the biosynthesis of Crocus apocarotenoid and

enhances environmental stress tolerance [33]. These results reflect that the endophytic *Mortierella* is a

benefit to the plant, which indicates that *Mortierella* in tumourous stem mustard is profitable to the host.

Marinho et al. and Lin et al. both reported that endophytic *Penicillium* produces active polyketides

[34,35], reflecting that *Penicillium* in tumourous stem mustard may produce similar substances.

Worldwide *Fusarium* is considered to be one of the most ubiquitous groups of fungi which can

survive in a wide range of plants, environments, and climates [36]. In this study, some OTUs identified

as *Fusarium* had a relatively high abundance in both the healthy roots and clubroots, reflecting the

dominant presence of *Fusarium* in tumorous stem mustard. Previous studies show that most of the

Fusarium species are nonpathogenic while only a small number are pathogenic [37]. Some OTU

identified as *Fusarium* in the healthy roots perhaps were nonpathogenic because of the absence of wilt

symptoms. OTU244 and OTU287 assigned as *F. solani*, a common soil-borne pathogen, were only and

mainly found in the clubroots and these populations may be pathogenic. Moreover, *F. solani* is the most

fungal isolate obtained by the culture-dependent method (Fig. 7A). Also, other pathogenic *Fusarium*

such as *F. graminearum*, *F. oxysporum,* and *F. asiaticum* also isolated from the clubroots rather than the

healthy roots, suggesting that *Plasmodiophora* infection many facilitate *Fusarium* to enter into the

diseased roots. The presence of a plenty of pathogenic *Fusarium* in the clubroots maybe the reason for

the death of tumourous stem mustard during the late plant growth stage in the field. In clubroots,

Plasmodiophora was the extremely abundant genus, although not belonging to fungi, amplified by

PCR with ITS primers for fungi and other eukaryotes. Zhao et al. also found that *Plasmodiophora*

mainly enriched in the clubroots of *Brassica napus* by high throughput sequencing using the same

primers [29].

In general, the healthy plant tissues harbor a more diverse community of endophytic fungi than

diseased plant tissues [29,38]. Also, the endophyte community in the healthy roots of tumourous stem

mustard had significantly higher Shannon and Simpson indices compared with the clubroots. Also, a

higher number of genera and OTUs were obtained from the healthy roots than from the clubroots. The

endophyte communities in the healthy roots and clubroots also differed in the α- and β-diversity. The

marked difference in the composition of the endophyte community at the genus level between the

healthy roots and clubroots as revealed by LEfSe and Student's t-test showed that the dominant genera

as biomarkers caused differences in the two communities. These substantial discrimination in the

dominant genera was derived from the infection of *P. brassicae*. Pathogens may compete with the

endophytic fungi for space and nutrients in the same niche within the plant tissue [39]. We presume that

a decrease in the diversity of the fungal endophyte community in the clubroots of tumourous stem

mustard has two causes. First, the physiological changes and the formation of clubroots induced by *P.*

brassicae may affect the availability of nutrients for endophytes. Second, in clubroots, the resting

spores of *P. brassicae* are produced in the galls of diseased plants and may fill the gall cells. This may

restrict the available space for the endophytes. The phenomenon of a decrease in the diversity of

endophytic fungi has been observed in many diseased plant species [29,40,41].

In this study, some plant pathogenic fungi were detected from the clubroots, such as *F. solani*, but

not from the healthy roots of tumourous stem mustard. Similarly, Zhao et al. isolated many soil-borne

pathogenic fungi, including *Fusarium*, *Gibberella*, *Alternaria*, *Sclerotinia*, *Leptosphaeria,* and

Cylindrocarpon, from the oilseed rape roots infected with *P. brassicae* [29]. This multi-species

aggregation involving *P. brassicae* and other pathogenic fungi is similar to disease complexes

containing plant-parasitic nematodes and soil-borne pathogens [42]. The cuticle of clubroots is cracked,

thereby providing entry points for pathogens, even for opportunistic pathogens. Additionally, the

cracked cuticle aggravates the leaking of nutrients, such as amino acids and carbohydrates, into the

rhizosphere soil which may attract soil-borne pathogens and increase the risk of infection by these

pathogens [43]. Root-knot nematodes may form disease complexes with *Fusarium* species such as *F.*

oxysporum and *F. solani* [44]. In this study, the abundant presence of *F. solani* in the clubroots indicates

that this pathogen and *P. brassicae* may form a disease complex, which may make it more difficult to

control the clubroot disease. Further studies are necessary to clarify the potential existence of this

disease complex. Besides, fungi such as *C. cupreum*, *Phoma* sp. *Pochonia* sp. and *Myrmecridium*

schulzeri were harvested and were reported as biocontrol fungi [45-47], reflecting that these fungi may

help the host to resist the infection of *P. brassicae*.

Endophytic fungi in the plants must deal with many interactions and build a balanced network [48].

In this study, the endophyte community network in the healthy roots of tumourous stem mustard was

observed to be more complicated than in the clubroots, indicating a balanced network of interactions

among the fungal endophyte community in the healthy roots. In the clubroots, *P. brassicae* dominated

the endophyte community which was out of balance showing a weak network of interactions. In

general, endophytes are more diverse and abundant than the pathogens in a healthy plant microbiome,

and *vice versa* in a diseased plant microbiome [49].

Conclusions

In conclusion, the obtained data from this study showed that the fungal endophyte community in the

clubroots are markedly different from the healthy roots in terms of alpha and beta diversity, suggesting

that the infection of *P. brassicae* changes the fungal endophyte community in tumourous stem mustard

roots. Future work should involve identifying the pathogenicity of *F. oxysporum* and *F. solani* on

tumourous stem mustard. Moreover, some endophytic fungi with biocontrol activity against *P.*

brassicae could also be considered in the evaluation.

Fig 1. **Healthy roots and clubroots of tumourous stem mustard caused by the infection of _P._**

brassicae (A) roots of a healthy plant (left) and a diseased plant (right) (B) resting spores (pots) in the

root cells of cluboorts coloured with fast green (C) the cell of healthy roots.

Fig 2. **Rarefaction curves (A) and diversity indices (B) of the endophyte communities associated**

with the healthy roots and clubroots of tumourous stem mustard infected with _P. brassicae_. R,

healthy roots. C, clubroots. ** differences at 0.01 level.

Fig 3. **Relative abundance (%) of the endophyte at phylum (a), genus (B) and Circos figure at the**

genus level (C) in the healthy roots and clubroots of tumourous stem mustard infected with _P._

brassicae. R, healthy roots. C, clubroots.

Fig 4. **Hierarchical clustering analysis (a) UniFrac-weighted PCA (B) and PCoA (C) of the**

endophyte communities associated with the healthy roots and clubroots of tumourous stem

mustard infected with _P. brassicae_. R, healthy roots. C, clubroots.

Fig 5. **LefSe analysis (A) The cladogram diagram shows the taxas with marked differences in the**

two endophyte communities. Red and green indicate different groups, with the classification of taxas

at the level of phylum, class, order, family, and genus shown from inside to the outside. The red and

green nodes in the phylogenetic tree represent taxas that play an important role in the two endophyte

communities, respectively. Yellow nodes represent taxas with no significant difference. (B) Species

with the significant difference that have an LDA score higher than the estimated value; the default

score is 3.0. The length of the histogram represents LDA score; i.e., the degree of influence of taxas

with a significant difference between different groups. R, healthy roots. C, clubroots.

Fig 6. **Co-occurrence network analysis of the two endophyte communities within the healthy roots**

and clubroots of tumourous stem mustard infected with *P. brassicae* (A) Healthy roots (B)

Clubroots. Each node represents taxa affiliated at the OTU level, and the size of the nodes represent an

average abundance of OTU. The lines represent the connections between each OTU. A red line

indicates a positive correlation. whereas a green line indicates a negative correlation.

Fig 7. The endophytic fungi isolated from the clubroots (A) and healthy roots (B) by the

culture-dependent method.

Supporting information

Table S1 Sequence information of each sample. R, healthy roots. C, clubroots.

Table S2 Taxonomy and distribution of the OTUs. Taxonomy at Phylum, Class, Order, Family,

Genus, Species, and OTU level. R, Healthy roots. C, Clubroots. The number in the table cell is the

number of sequences of each OTU.

Table S3 Pearson's correlation relationships between *Plasmodiophora* and OTUs showed in the

network.

Fig S1Heatmap of the 50 most abundant OTU from R and C samples. R, healthy roots; C,

clubroots.

Fig S2 Student's t-test bar plot of the endophyte communities at the genus level in the healthy

roots and clubroots of tumourous stem mustard infected with *P. brassicae*. $p<0.05^*$, $p<0.01^{**}$,

$p<0.001^{***}$. R, healthy roots. C, clubroots.

a

81.4%

8.3%

2.1%

6.2%

1.4%

1.4%

5.5 %

14.4 %

8.2 %

28.8 %

24.0 %

■ Mortierella   ■ Sarocladium   ■ Phoma

■ Penicillium   ■ Plectosphaerella   ■ Fusarium

■ Fusarium graminearum
■ Fusarium oxysporum
■ Fusarium solani
■ Fusarium asiaticum
■ Fusarium sp.

b

1.3%

7.9%

12.5%

13.8%

21.1%

3.9%

3.3%

36.2%

■ Penicillium   ■ Fusarium   ■ Mortierella   ■ Pochonia

■ Chaetomium   ■ Phoma   ■ Myrmecridium   ■ Pleosporales